UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

REPRESENTATION OF FOREIGN WORKERS IN MALAYSIAN MAINSTREAM ENGLISH NEWSPAPERS

SIM CHEW SIONG

FBMK 2011 55
REPRESENTATION OF FOREIGN WORKERS IN MALAYSIAN MAINSTREAM ENGLISH NEWSPAPERS

By

SIM CHEW SIONG

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

December 2011
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of
the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

REPRESENTATION OF FOREIGN WORKERS IN MALAYSIAN
MAINSTREAM ENGLISH NEWSPAPERS

By
SIM CHEW SIONG

December 2011

Chair: Associate Professor Washima Che Dan, PhD
Faculty: Modern Languages and Communication

Foreign workers in Malaysia are generally treated negatively by the Malaysian media. They are being represented as threats to public order by way of linking them to criminal activities in news headlines. This negative representation results in stereotyping, which in turn leads to prejudice. Manifestations of this prejudice against foreign workers include being perceived negatively by the public, and worse, being physically abused and/or mistreated by their employers—despite their positive contributions to the Malaysian economy, and accounting for, according to former Inspector-General of Police Musa Hassan, only two per cent of the national crime rate in 2006. Thus, this study aims, in some measure, to negate the power of the media to shape public opinion on the issue of foreign workers, by way of revealing the techniques used by media producers to achieve the desired reading of their media texts.
This study utilises Norman Fairclough’s Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), which states that texts function ideologically and politically in relation to their context. This study will analyse the techniques of grammar and vocabulary usage employed in news reports of foreign workers, to discover the ways in which Malaysian mainstream English newspapers are similar or dissimilar in their general stance on foreign workers. Sample news articles from the three most circulated English newspapers in Malaysia, namely the *New Straits Times* (including the *Sunday Times*), *The Star* (including the *Sunday Star*) and *The Sun*, from 2003 to 2010 will be analysed. In particular, sentence structures and ideologically charged words—insofar as they make readers perceive foreign workers in the manner desired by media producers—will be examined in this study.

This study finds that through the passivation of sentence structure, representation of actors or doers, as well as the use of embedded ideologically charged words, and an *us versus them* binary opposition, the *New Straits Times* and *The Star* consistently attempt to represent foreign workers (as a whole) as a threat to public security, local employment, and public health by way of representing foreign workers as criminals, employment opportunists and as disease carriers. At the same time, these two newspapers also highlight the efficiency of the ruling authorities in dealing with the ‘threat’: the police are described as being effective in their handling of foreign workers who enter the country illegally, while the Home Ministry is represented as humane in their repeated acts of leniency towards them. In other words, the study finds that these two newspapers share the same ideological stance of building a positive image of authority figures *at the expense* of foreign workers.
Pemerhatian pekerja asing di suratkhabar Arus Perdana berbahasa Inggeris Malaysia

Oleh

SIM CHEW SIONG

Disember 2011

Pengerusi: Professor Madya Washima Che Dan, PhD
Fakulti: Bahasa Moden dan Komunikasi

Pekerja asing di Malaysia secara amnya dilayan secara negatif oleh media Malaysia. Mereka dipaparkan sebagai ancaman keselamatan awam dalam tajuk utama berita dengan cara dihubungkaitkan dengan akitiviti jenayah. Pemaparan negatif ini mengakibatkan stereotaip terhadap pekerja asing yang kemudiannya menjurus kepada prejudis. Manifestasi prejudis ini, pekerja asing dilayan buruk secara fizikal dan didera oleh majikan. Orang awam pula bertanggapan negatif terhadap mereka, biarpun golongan ini menyumbang kepada ekonomi Malaysia. Lebih-lebih lagi pada tahun 2006, Ketua Polis Negara ketika itu, Musa Hassan, mengatakan bahawa angka jenayah yang dilakukan oleh pekerja asing hanyalah dua peratus. Oleh yang sedemikian, kajian ini bertujuan untuk mengurangkan kuasa pengaruh media dalam membentuk pendapat umum berkenaan isu pekerja asing dengan cara mendedahkan teknik-teknik wacana yang digunakan oleh pengeluar media untuk membuat orang awam membaca teks media
sebagaimana yang dikehendaki pengeluar media.


Kajian ini mendapati menerusi pembentukan ayat pasif, pemaparan aktor atau pelaku, penggunaan perkataan berideologi dan teknik oposisi binary (binary opposition) kita melawan mereka, *New Straits Times* and *The Star* secara konsisten cuba menggambarkan pekerja asing (secara keseluruhan) sebagai ancaman terhadap keselamatan awam, peluang pekerjaan tempatan dan kesehatan awam dengan cara melabelkan mereka sebagai penjenayah, oportunis pekerjaan dan pembawa penyakit berjangkit. Pada masa yang sama, kedua-dua suratkhabar menyerlahkan keberkesanan dan efisiensi kerajaan pemerintah dalam menangani “ancaman” tersebut: Pihak polis dipaparkan sebagai efektif dalam menangani isu-isu pekerja asing yang masuk ke
Malaysia secara haram sementara Kementerian Dalam Negeri dipaparkan sebagai berperikemanusiaan dengan berulang kali berlembut dengan pekerja asing yang masuk ke Negara ini secara haram. Dalam kata lain, kajian ini menyimpulkan bahawa kedua-dua suratkhabar ini berkongsi pendirian ideologi dalam membina imej positif pihak berkuasa atau kerajaan pemerintah dengan pekerja asing menjadi mangsa.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my thesis supervisory committee chairperson Associate Professor Dr. Washima Che Dan and members Associate Professor Dr. Mardziah Hayati Abdullah and Associate Professor Dr. Noritah Omar for their assistance, guidance, advice and suggestions throughout the duration this study.

I would also like to thank my family and friends who have always encouraged and supported me. Credit is also going out to everyone who had either directly or indirectly contributed to the completion of this thesis.
This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Washima Che Dan, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Mardziah Hayati Abdullah, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Noritah Omar, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

__________________________________________  

BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD  
Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or at any other institution.

___________________

SIM CHEW SIONG

Date: 22 December 2011
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. News Headlines – <em>New Straits Times</em></td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. News Headlines – <em>The Star</em></td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. News Headlines – <em>theSun</em></td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Word count for terms representing the identity of foreign worker</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Word count for terms associated to crime</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Screenshot**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Screenshot</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Grammatical Analysis Excel worksheet</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Grammatical Analysis Master Excel worksheet</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Grammatical Analysis with Process and Participant Column</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS vii
APPROVAL viii
DECLARATION x
LIST OF TABLES xi

CHAPTER

I. INTRODUCTION
1.1 Overview 15
1.2 Background of the Study 18
  1.2.1 Foreign Workers and Mainstream Newspapers 18
  1.2.2 Foreign Workers and Crime 19
  1.2.3 Media Ownership 19
1.3 Problem Statement 21
1.4 Research Questions 21
1.5 Research Objectives 23
1.6 Limitations and Scopes of Study 24
1.7 Significance of Study 25
1.8 Theoretical Framework 26
1.9 Conclusion 29

II. LITERATURE REVIEW
2.1 Ideology, Discourse and Media 31
  2.1.1 Ideology 31
  2.1.2 Discourse 32
  2.1.3 Media 34
2.2 Ideology in News Reports 38
2.3 Framing in News Media 43
2.4 Co-dependence between Media and Events 48
2.5 Ideology, Racism, Foreign Workers and Immigrants 49
2.6 Identity Construction of Immigrants/Foreign Workers 51
2.7 Critical Discourse Analysis 52
2.8 Local Critical Discourse Analysis Research 56
2.9 Summary 58

III. METHODOLOGY
3.1 Methodology 59
  3.1.1 Word Choice: Vocabulary 60
  3.1.2 Sentence Construction 60
3.2 Sampling 61
  3.2.1 Topic Sampling Criteria 61
3.3 Malaysia’s Mainstream English Newspapers 64
3.3.1 the New Straits Times 64
3.3.2 The Star 65
3.3.3 The Sun 67
3.4 Data Collection 68
3.5 Data Analysis 71
3.5.1 Vocabulary Properties 72
  3.5.1.1 Experiential Values 72
     - Ideologically Contested Words 72
  3.5.1.2 Relational Values 73
     - Euphemistic Expressions 74
     - Metaphors 75
3.5.2 Grammar 76
  3.5.2.1 Experiential Values 76
     - Process and Participant 76
     - Agency 77
  3.5.2.2 Relational Values 78
     - Usage of the pronouns we and you 78
3.6 Summary 82

IV DATA ANALYSIS
4.1 Ideological Similarities and Differences 84
  4.1.1 A Collective Definition of “foreign workers” 84
  4.1.2 Event Representation 86
   4.1.2.1 Crime 86
      - Similarities 86
      - Differences 90
   4.1.2.2 Foreign Workers as a Threat to Public Order 91
      - Similarities 91
      - Differences 92
  4.1.3 Identifying Agency 93
   4.1.3.1 Representing Responsible Agents 93
      - Similarities 93
      - Differences 97
   4.1.3.2 Representing Foreign Workers as doers of Criminal Activity 98
   4.1.3.3 Representing Authority 103
      - Similarities 103
      - Differences 107
  4.1.4 Representation of Public Opinion 112
   4.1.4.1 Foreign Workers as Aggressors 112
   4.1.4.2 Deflecting Accountability 113
   4.1.4.3 Foreign Workers as a risk to Public Health 115
   4.1.4.4 Foreign Workers as a Threat to the Livelihood of the Locals 116
  4.2 Summary 118
V. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

5.1 Media Control 122
5.2 Derogation of Foreign Workers 123
5.2.1 Foreign Workers as Disease Carriers 126
5.3 Segregation of Foreigners 127
5.4 Positive Image Building for the Authorities 127
5.5 Discursive Processes and Social Phenomenon 129
5.6 Conclusions 130
5.7 Contribution of Field of Study 131
5.8 Suggestions for Further Study 132
5.9 Summary and Implications of Study 133

REFERENCES 135
BIODATA OF STUDENT 140
APPENDICES 142

I. THE NEW STRAITS TIMES 142
II. THE STAR 199
III. THE SUN 229