

UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

GROWTH PERFORMANCE AND ECONOMIC EVALUATION OF ACACIA MANGIUM WILLD. PLANTED AT DIFFERENT SPACINGS

SINHSAMOUTH PHOUTHAVONG

FH 1998 8

GROWTH PERFORMANCE AND ECONOMIC EVALUATION OF ACACLA MANGIUM WILLD. PLANTED AT DIFFERENT SPACINGS

By

SINHSAMOUTH PHOUTHAVONG

Thesis Submitted in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Science in the Faculty of Forestry Universiti Putra Malaysia

September 1998



Dedicated to My Beloved Father Simounthone Phouthavong and Mother Khampheungchai Phouthavong, Whose dream comes true.



ACKNOWLEGEMENTS

First and foremost I would like to express my profound gratitude to Prof. Dr. Nik Muhamad bin Nik Ab. Majid, the chairman of my supervisory committee, for his continuous guidance, suggestions and encouragement throughout the completion of this thesis. I am also indebted to my supervisory committee members, Dr. Hj. Awang Noor Abd. Ghani and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Rusli Bin Mohd. for their invaluable suggestions and comments on my thesis.

I am greatly thankful to the Lao Government and Lao-Swedish Forestry Programme, for granting me the scholarship and study leave to pursue this master's programme in Malaysia. I also would like to thank Mr. Kampheuane Kingsada, Director General of Lao Forestry Department for his support and encouragement during my study at Universiti Putra Malaysia.

I would like to take this opportunity to express my thanks to the Dean of Faculty of Forestry, Universiti Putra Malaysia for the permission given to undertake this study. My sincere appreciation goes to all lecturers and staff of the Faculty of Forestry for their help during the study period. Thanks are also extended to Mr. Muhzamal Johan for his help during data collection, the laboratory work and to Dr. Bimal Paudyal K. and Mr. Latib during the soil analysis in the laboratory.



My sincere thanks are also due to various individuals who have extended their help and cooperation during my study period; Mr. Mahdan Bin Bongkik, Deputy Head of Plantation Unit Forestry Department Peninsular Malaysia, Mr. Yahaya Bin Mohamood, Senior Research Officer of Plantation Unit, Dr. Wan Razali Wan Mohd., Deputy Director General of Forest Research Institute Malaysia, Mr. Zuhaidi Ahmad Yahya., Senior Research Officer of Forest Research Institute Malaysia, Mr. Md.Yunus Bin Jaffar, Senior Research Officer of Malaysia Agriculture Research Development Institute, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Lim Meng Tsai and Dr. Mohamad Azani Alias at the Faculty of Forestry, Dr. Tse Fau Zia at the Department of Soil Science of Faculty of Agriculture, Ong Kian Huat, a graduate student at the Faculty of Forestry, Universiti Putra Malaysia and Bishwa Bandhu Raj Singh.

My heartfelt thanks are extended to my brothers and sisters for their love throughout my study. My special and deepest thanks and love towards my wife, Phonephet Phouthavong and my children, Vatsana, Athithsavanh, Daravanh and Sirimoungkhoune Phouthavong who are my source of inspiration and also for their love, sacrifice, patience, continuous support and encouragement during the entire study period. Last but not least, I express my gratitude to my parents and God, the invisible power, for providing me continuous energy to undertake this study.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	
LIST OF PLATES	
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	
ABSTRACT	xii
ABSTRAK	xv

CHAPTER

Ι	INTRODUCTION	1
	General Background	1
	Objectives of the Study	7
п	LITERATURE REVIEW	8
	Description and Taxonomy of Acacia mangium Willd	8
	Botanical Description	10
	Natural Distribution and Ecology	11
	Importance of Acacia mangium Willd. in Plantation	12
	Management Practices of Acacia mangium Willd	14
	Nursery Practices	14
	Site Preparation	14
	Silvicultural Treatments	15
	Spacing of Acacia mangium Willd	16
	Growth Rates of Acacia mangium Willd	18
	Yield and Volume of Acacia mangium Willd	21
	Effects of Plantation on Soil Properties	26
	Soil Chemical Properties	27
	Soil Physical Properties	30
	Economic Aspects of Acacia mangium Willd	33
ш	MATERIALS AND METHODS	37
	Experimental Site	37
	Experimental Design and Layout	39
	Data Collection	46
	Survival	46
	Tree Height	46
	Diameter at Breast Height	47
	Volume Estimation	47





	Growth and Yield Prediction	48
	Soil Samples	50
	Statistical Analysis	51
	Economic Analysis	52
	Framework	52
	Identification of Cost and Benefits	53
	Developing of Cash Flow Table	55
	Criteria for Economic Evaluation	56
	Sensitivity Analysis	58
IV	RESULTS	59
	Introduction	59
	Growth	59
	Survival Percentage	60
	Height Growth	61
	Diameter at Breast height Growth	63
	Volume	65
	Growth Prediction	68
	Yield Prediction	76
	Soil Analysis	78
	Physical Properties	78
	Chemical Properties	80
	Relationship between Soil Properties and Tree Growth	85
	Economic Évaluation	87
	Sensitivity Analysis	91
V	DISCUSSION	95
	Growth Performance	95
	Growth and Yield Prediction	97
	Soil Analysis	98
	Relationship between Soil Properties and Tree Growth	99
	Economic Evaluation	100
VI	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	102
	Conclusions	102
	Recommendations	104
REFERENC	ES	106
APPENDICI	ES	117
A	Analysis of Variance on Growth Performance	118
B	Statistics Summary of Growth Modelling	126
Č	Analysis of Variance on Soil Physical and Chemical	120
e	Properties of the Different Spacings	142





for Economic Analysis of Acacia mangium	
Plantation	144
E Cash Flow of <i>Acacia mangium</i> Plantation for the	
Different Spacings	145
F Incremental Net Benefits of <i>Acacia mangium</i> Plantation	
for Spacings (with Project) vs. (Spacing without Project)	157
G Cash Flow of Acacia mangium Plantation for Spacings	
(with Project) vs. Spacing (without Project)	160
H Sensitivity Analysis of Acacia mangium Plantation	
for 2.0 m x 2.0 m Spacing vs. Spacing without Project	165
VITA	169



LIST OF TABLES

Tables		Page
1.	The Silvicultural Treatments Schedule of the Compensatory Forest Plantation Project	16
2.	Mean Diameter and Height Growth of <i>Acacia mangium</i> Spacing Trial at Nahaba, Sabah, Malaysia at 2 Years	18
3.	Dbh, Height and Mean Annual Increment (MAI) of Dbh and Height Values for <i>Acacia mangium</i> of Different Age	20
4.	Volume Estimates of Sample Tree 20 cm Dbh from Different Volume Tables	24
5.	Acacia mangium Yield in Various Locations in Sabah	25
6.	Estimation on Internal Rate of Retum of <i>Acacia mangium</i> from Various Sources	36
7.	Survival Percentage, Mean Total Height, Diameter at Breast height and Merchantable Volume for the Different Spacings of <i>Acacia mangium</i> at 70 Months	60
8.	Gompertz Estimation of the Mean Diameter at breast height and Total Height Growth of <i>Acacia mangium</i> for each Spacing	69
9.	Predicted Mean Values of Dbh, Total Height, Merchantable Volume and Merchantable Volume per Hectare for the Different Spacings	71
10.	Physical and Chemical Properties of Top and Subsoil under the Different Spacings	79
11.	Duncan's New Multiple Range Test on Soil Physical and Chemical Properties for the Different Spacings	84
12.	Coefficient of Correlation between Soil Properties and Tree Growth (R-Value)	86





13.	Results of Economic Analysis with Discount Rate 10 Percent (Base Case) of <i>Acacia mangium</i> Plantated at Different	
	Spacings vs. Spacing without Project	88
14.	Results of Economic Analysis at Different Discount Rate of	
	Acacia mangium Plantated at Spacings with Project vs.	
	Spacing without Project	90
15.	Sensitivity Analysis of NPV at Interest Rate of 10 Percent	
	(Base Case) for S_1 vs. S^{wo}	92
16.	Sensitivity Analysis of B/C Ratio at Interest Rate of 10 Percent	
	(Base Case) for S_1 vs. S^{wo}	93
17.	Sensitivity Analysis of IRR at Interest Rate of 10 Percent	
	(Base Case) for S ₁ vs. S ^{wo}	94



LIST OF FIGURES

Figures		Page
1.	Map of Peninsular Malaysia showing the Experimental Site	38
2.	Layout of the Experimental Design	40
3.	Framework of Incremental Net Benefits	53
4.	Height Growth of Acacia mangium at Different Spacings	62
5.	Diameter at Breast Height Growth of <i>Acacia mangium</i> at Different Spacings	64
6.	Mean Merchantable Volume of <i>Acacia mangium</i> for the Different Spacings	66
7.	Merchantable Volume of <i>Acacia mangium</i> for the Different Spacings per Hectare	67
8.	Prediction of Mean Dbh for the Different Spacings	73
9.	Prediction of Mean Total Height for the Different Spacings	74
10.	Prediction of Mean Merchantable Volume for the Different Spacings	75
11.	Prediction of Timber Volume for the Different Spacings based on the Number of Trees per Hectare	77



LIST OF PLATES

Plates		Page
1.	Five year and 10 month old <i>Acacia mangium</i> plantation at UPM campus	39
2.	Spacing S ₁ (2.0 m x 2.0 m)	41
3.	Spacing S ₂ (2.5 m x 2.5 m)	42
4.	Spacing S ₃ (3.0 m x 3.0 m)	43
5.	Spacing S ₄ (3.5 m x 3.5 m)	44
6.	Spacing S ₅ (4.0 m x 4.0 m)	45



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

- ANOVA Analysis of Variance
- B/C Ratio Benefit/Cost Ratio
- CFPP Compensatory Forest Plantation Project
- Dbh Diameter at Breast Height
- IRR Internal Rate of Return
- MPTS Multipurpose Tree Species
- NPV Net Present Value
- PNG Papua New Guinea
- RCBD Randomized Complete Block Design
- SAFODA Sabah Forest Development Authority
- SFI Sabah Forest Industries
- SSSB Sabah Softwood Sdn. Bhd.
- UNDP United Nations Development Programme
- UPM Universiti Putra Malaysia



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science

GROWTH PERFORMANCE AND ECONOMIC EVALUATION OF ACACLA MANGIUM WILLD. PLANTED AT DIFFERENT SPACINGS

By

SINHSAMOUTH PHOUTHAVONG

September 1998

Chairman: Professor Nik Muhamad bin Nik Ab. Majid, Ph. D.

Faculty: Forestry

Acacia mangium Willd. is one of the fast-growing timber species planted widely in Malaysia to overcome the expected timber deficit for the wood based industries. However, comprehensive studies on planting distance and economic evaluation of *A. mangium* planted at different spacings have not been well documented.

A trial plot at Universiti Putra Malaysia Serdang, Malaysia planted with A. mangium at five different spacings; namely S_1 (2.0 m x 2.0 m), S_2 (2.5 m x 2.5 m), S_3 (3.0 m x 3.0 m), S_4 (3.5 m x 3.5 m) and S_5 (4.0 m x 4.0 m) was investigated to determine specifically the survival percentage, total height, diameter at breast height, volume, growth and yield prediction up to 15 years, soil physical and chemical properties, and relationship between tree growth and soil properties. Economic analysis of each spacing (with project) vs. 3.0 m x 3.7 m spacing (without project) was also conducted.

The experimental results indicate that spacing S₂ achieved the best survival percentage (81%) and the best mean total height growth (20.40 m). The biggest mean diameter at breast height growth (21.46 cm) was recorded for spacing S₅. The analysis of variance indicated that spacing does not affect total height growth, but affects diameter at breast height. The highest mean volume (0.407 m³) was found in spacing S₅ and the highest wood volume per hectare (585.12 m³) was for spacing S₁ at 70 months old. The growth prediction using Gompertz model showed that spacing S₂ recorded the highest mean total height value (24.77 m) and spacing S₅ had the biggest mean diameter at breast height (26.20 cm). The highest predicted mean merchantable volume (0.581 m³) was for spacing S₅. The yield prediction showed that spacing S₁ produced the highest wood volume (211.44 m³) per hectare at year 15.

The analysis of variance showed that the soil chemical properties only differed significantly in carbon and iron. The correlation analysis showed that tree growth was not significantly correlated with most of the soil properties.

The results of economic analysis indicated that spacing S_1 was the most viable and profitable activities using IRR (14.01%). The sensitivity analysis showed



that the changes in costs and benefits have low impact on the NPV, B/C ratio and IRR of S_1 . Therefore, S_1 (2.0 m x 2.0 m) could be the most promising spacing in terms of wood production and economic returns.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijizah Master Sains

PRESTASI PERTUMBUHAN DAN PENILAIAN EKONOMI BAGI ACACIA MANGIUM WILLD. PADA JARAK PENANAMAN YANG BERBEZA

Oleh

SINHSAMOUTH PHOUTHAVONG

September 1998

Pengerusi: Profesor Nik Muhamad bin Nik Ab. Majid, Ph. D.

Fakulti: Perhutanan

Acacia mangium Willd. adalah salah satu spesis pokok yang cepat tumbuh yang ditanam secara meluas di Malaysia untuk mengatasi kekurangan bekalan kayu balak bagi industri berasaskan kayu. Bagaimanapun, kajian yang terperinci ke atas jarak tanaman dan penilaian ekonomi bagi *A. mangium* pada jarak berbeza masih belum direkodkan sepenuhnya.

Satu plot percubaan di Universiti Putra Malaysia, Serdang, Malaysia yang merangkumi penanaman *A. mangium* pada lima jarak penanaman yang berbeza; iaitu S_1 (2.0 m x 2.0 m), S_2 (2.5 m x 2.5 m), S_3 (3.0 m x 3.0 m), S_4 (3.5 m x 3.5 m) dan S_5 (4.0 m x 4.0 m) telah dijalankan bagi menentukan peratus kemandiran, tinggi pukal, diameter pada paras dada, isipadu, pertumbuhan dan jangkaan hasil sehingga 15 tahun, ciri fizikal dan kimia tanah, dan perkaitan antara pertumbuhan pokok dan ciri

tanah. Analisa ekonomi bagi setiap jarak (dengan projek) vs. jarak 3.0 m x 3.7 m (tanpa projek) turut dijalankan.

Keputusan telah menunjukkan jarak S₂ mempunyai peratus kehidupan (81%) dan pertumbuhan tinggi pukal (20.40 m) yang terbaik. Pertumbuhan diameter paras dada terbaik (21.46 cm) direkod untuk jarak penanaman S₅. Analisa varian menunjukkan jarak penanaman tidak memberi sebarang kesan keatas pertumbuhan tinggi pukal tetapi membawa kesan keatas diameter paras dada. Putara isipadu terbesar (0.407 m³) ditemui dalam jarak tanaman S₅ dan isipadu kayu per hektar tertinggi (585.12 m³) pada jarak tanaman S₁ pada usia 70 bulan. Jangkaan pertumbuhan ladang *A. mangium* pada usia menggunakan model Gompertz menunjukkan jarak tanaman S₂ merekodkan nilai purata tinggi pukal tertinggi (24.77 m) dan jarak tanaman S₅ mempunyai purata diameter paras dada terbesar (26.20 cm). Jangkaan purata isipadu jadual dagang (0.581 m³) didapati pada jarak tanaman S₅.

Analisa varian menunjukkan ciri kimia tanah hanya mempunyai perbezaan yang nyata dalam karbon dan besi. Keputusan analisa korelasi menunjukkan pertumbuhan pokok adalah tidak menpunyai perkaitan yang rapat dengan hampir keseluruhan ciri tanah. Keputusan analisa ekonomi menunjukkan bahawa jarak S₁ adalah aktiviti yang paling boleh-guna dan menguntungkan menggunakan IRR (14.01%). Keputusan analisa sensitiviti menunjukkan perubahan dalam kos dan keuntungan mempunyai pengaruh yang rendah ke atas NPV, nisbah B/C dan IRR bagi S₁. Oleh demikian, S₁ (2.0 m x 2.0 m) mungkin menjadi jarak tanaman yang terbaik untuk penghasilan kayu dan pulangan ekonomi.



CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

General Background

The world's demand for wood is increasing as the population grows, while the natural forest resources are depleting, particularly in the tropical developing countries. In most tropical countries, large portions of these natural forests have been converted to other alternative land uses, particularly for agricultural development. The conversion of forestlands is also attributed to other activities such as shifting cultivation, development of dam for hydroelectric generation and reservoir, encroachment and illegal logging. These factors led to deforestation, which in turns affect future timber supply and ecological balance.

The World Bank has estimated that the tropical forest areas are cleared at a rate of 15 to 20 million hectares per year. At the level of demand prevailing then, the remaining tropical forest would disappear in 60 to 80 years (Evans *et al.*, 1992). According to Food and Agriculture Organization estimates for the Asia-Pacific region, the rate of annual deforestation for the last 10 years was close to 4.7 million hectares per year (FAO, 1993). The FAO State of the World's Forest reported that



during 1991-1995 there was an estimated net loss of 56.3 million hectares worldwide. The annual rate of loss in developing countries remains high at 0.65 percent; tropical Asia-Oceania has the highest rate at 0.98 percent. However, a comparison of the annual loss of natural forests for the periods 1980-90 and 1990-95 with estimates of 15.5 million hectares and 13.7 million hectares per annum, respectively, indicates that the rate may be slowing (Prebble, 1997). One of the challenges that the world faces today is to sustain future timber supply to meet escalating demand. Therefore, it appears that rehabilitation and reforestation are one of the most promising solutions to solve this problem.

In Malaysia, plantation forestry began as early as in 1950's with the planting of *Tectona grandis* (Teak) in the northern states of Perlis and Kedah. The aim was to produce high quality timber. To date, there are about 1,800 hectares of such plantations being established. Then various trial plots were established with the main objective of selecting suitable tree species for the production of high quality timber and pulpwood on degraded sites (Barnard and Beveridge, 1957). However, in the 1960's, research was focused on the establishment of softwood plantations for the production of pulp and paper industry. The com-mercial plantation began in 1973 in Sabah with the establishment of 60,000 hectares of tropical pines; in 1979 in Sarawak about 10,000 hectares of fast-growing hard-wood species and in Peninsular Malaysia in 1960 about 5,600 hectares of tropical pines.

The first pilot softwood plantation programme was initiated in Peninsular Malaysia in 1967 with the assistance of the United Nations Development Programme



(UNDP), an executing agency for the Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations (Freezailah, 1967). The purpose of the project was to demonstrate suitable techniques for the establishment and management of large-scale softwood planta-tions for pulpwood production. The Ulu Sedili Forest Reserve in Johore and Kemasul Forest Reserve in Pahang were selected for this large-scale forest plantation project. About 5,600 hectares of the softwood plantations were established in these two forest reserves, planted mainly with *Pinus caribeaea* (Johari and Chin, 1986).

The first commercial reforestation project in Peninsular Malaysia, known as the Compensatory Forest Plantation Project (CFPP), was started in 1982 with the main objective of producing general utility sawn timber (Thang and Zulkifli, 1992; Yong, 1985). The sawn-timber produced from this plantation is expected to be comparable to the Light Red Meranti (*Shorea* spp.). In the initial plan, about 188,200 hectares of the unproductive lowland forests had been planned for conversion into forest plantations over a period of 15 years (Harun, 1981; Yong, 1985; Johari, 1987). The project planned to establish about 82,000 hectares of plantations based on 15year rotation of fast-growing hard-wood species such as *Acacia mangium, Gmelina arborea* and *Paraserianthes falcataria*. So far almost 55,000 hectares of such plantations have successfully established throughout Peninsular Malaysia. This was expected to contribute about 35 percent of the total log production of Peninsular Malaysia or about 2.63 million cu m of timber, with the first harvest by 1998 (Johari, 1987).



Initially, five species of fast growing hardwood species, namely *A. mangium* Willd., *Gmelina arborea* Roxb., *Paraserianthes falcataria* Nielsen (synonym with *Albizia falcataria*), *Maesopsis eminii* Engl., and *Eucalytus deglupta* Blume had been proposed for CFPP (Sheik Ali, 1982). Nevertheless, the last two species were not selected due to wood utilization problems. *M. eminii* has inherent growth stress which causes the sawn timber to warp and distort, while *E. deglupta* trees were found to be infected by heart rot fungi that made the logs hollow.

Reforestation projects have also been initiated in Sabah and Sarawak to ameliorate extensive degraded forestland resulting from shifting cultivation and logging activities.

In Sabah, three private and state agencies have participated in the reforestation project. These are Sabah Softwood Sdn. Bhd. (SSSB), Sabah Forestry Develop-ment Authority (SAFODA), and Sabah Forest Industries (SFI). The objectives of the reforestation project vary between agencies. SAFODA was established in 1976 to afforest 200,000 hectares of shifting cultivation areas. The agency was formed for the rehabilitation of degraded lalang grassland and poor forests with fast growing timber trees on west coast of Sabah. At the same time the agency is also responsible for the resettlement of rural population who resides in the project area. SSSB and SFI on the other hand, are companies established for the development of commercial forest plantations for industrial wood production. SSSB started as early as 1973 to establish 60,000 hectares of tropical pines in Tawau. SFI, which establishes the first pulp and paper mill in the country, involved in the



reforestation programme in 1980's. The total area of forest plantations established by these three agencies by the end of 1994 was 90,000 hectares (Thai and Mahdan, 1995). Unlike Peninsular Malaysia, forest plantations in Sabah are managed for pulpwood production. As of 1997, the total plantation established in Sabah was about 112,679 hectares, of which 90,026 hectares (79.9 %) are under fast growing species such as *A. mangium*, 2,049 hectares of Teak and 20,602 hectares of Rattan (Lim, 1997).

In Sarawak, about 60,000 ha of natural forest are destroyed annually due to shifting cultivation practices constituting an annual loss of 2.7 million cu m of logs (Lau, 1979). Programmes have been initiated to reforest the degraded forestland in the state with suitable timber species, but forest plantation development in this timber-rich state is rather slow. The reforestation programme which started in 1979 managed to establish about 10,000 hectares of forest plantations until the end of 1996 (Lim, 1997). The species planted were *A. mangium, Araucaria cunninghamii, Gmelina arborea, Swietenia macrophylla, Shorea* spp. (illipe nut), and *Durio zibethinus*.

Since the beginning of the plantation programme in Peninsular Malaysia, A. mangium has been grown more widely than the other two species, Gmelina. arborea and Parasieranthes falcataria. This was due of its rapid initial growth rate, less site demanding and competes well with weeds (Tham, 1979; Johari and Chin, 1986). Hence, more than 80 percent of the CFPP area had been planted with this species.



The goal in plantation forestry is often to produce high quality timber in the shortest possible time (Dale and Sonderman, 1984). Since spacing and hence stand density affect both quality and growth of tree, it is important to carry out spacing trials in order to determine the most suitable spacing to be adopted for any species in plantation forestry.

In Peninsular Malaysia *A. mangium* trees are planted at 3.0 m x 3.7 m spacing, which is considered as the most appropriate planting distance. However, different planting distances might be necessary, depending on the kind of timber needed for the manufacture of the final product. For instance, trees planted for pulp would not necessarily require straight bole and may require closer planting distance. However, the trees are planted for sawn timber production, it is necessary that they should have straight bole and produce high volume of wood, which require different planting distance than trees planted for pulp. Thus, the relationship between timber volume and spacing is important to achieve optimum economic returns in the long run.

Despite of its impressive initial growth performance, the planting of A. mangium has been based on only one spacing interval, that is 3.0 m x 3.7 m. This planting distance was based on experience in other countries and it might not be the best spacing in Malaysia because of differences in environmental and climatic factors.

