



**UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA**

***DEVELOPMENT OF AN INTEGRATED MODEL FOR SUSTAINABLE  
AQUACULTURE AND OPTIMIZATION OF FISH PRODUCTION IN  
RACEWAY SYSTEMS***

**MOHAMMAD GHOLIZADEH**

**FPAS 2018 24**



**DEVELOPMENT OF AN INTEGRATED MODEL FOR SUSTAINABLE  
AQUACULTURE AND OPTIMIZATION OF FISH PRODUCTION IN  
RACEWAY SYSTEMS**

By

**MOHAMMAD GHOLIZADEH**

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia,  
in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

**October 2017**

## **COPYRIGHT**

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs, and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



## **DEDICATION**

To My Lovely Family

To Human and Needs for Love, Peace, Spirituality and Sustainable Environment



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**DEVELOPMENT OF AN INTEGRATED MODEL FOR SUSTAINABLE  
AQUACULTURE AND OPTIMIZATION OF FISH PRODUCTION IN  
RACEWAY SYSTEMS**

By

**MOHAMMAD GHOLIZADEH**

**October 2017**

**Chairman : Associate Professor Zelina Zaiton Ibrahim, PhD**  
**Faculty : Environmental Studies**

Sustainable aquaculture needs effective fish farm management to balance high yield production with low farm effluent, as well as consider changes in available water resources. The aim of this research is to develop a model to simulate fish growth, total farm production, and effluent load estimation for single and multiple stocking events. Modeling is in a spreadsheet format for the most common system of cold-water fish farming in Iran, that is, the raceway system. Model equations were based on the literature and currently available aquaculture models. In addition, new equations, based on mass-balance considerations, and modification of temperature for conditions of fish growth in above optimum temperatures conditions are proposed. Five main modules, that is, Environment, Individual Fish Weight, Water Quality Effluent, Farm, and Analysis, were developed to cover the main processes and parameters in a fish farm. Multiple-model inference was adopted for estimating fish growth. Water quality parameters included dissolved oxygen, total ammonia nitrogen and phosphorous. Effluent load was estimated based on dissolved oxygen depletion, feed requirement, phosphate and total ammonia nitrogen. Single and multi-stocking events as well as use of multiple species is possible in the model. The model was validated to primary and secondary data. Primary data of water temperature and fish weight was used to validate the fish growth in the Individual Fish Weight module. Secondary data from published data sets and results from other current aquaculture models were used to compare with the simulation results of the model developed. The data were for trout, salmon and Seabream fish. The results for fish growth showed very good correlation ( $R^2 > 0.98$ ) with the measured data of a fish farm at Haraz River, Iran, with mean absolute percentage error (MAPE) of less than 10 percent. Comparison of the model simulation results with other existing models, such as AquaOptima and AquaFarm, also showed very good correlations ( $R^2 > 0.98$ ) except for estimation of feed requirements with the AquaFarm model results ( $R^2 = 0.87$  and  $MAPE = 24\%$ ). In conclusion, the model

developed produced several important results which contribute to improved knowledge for aquaculture modeling. These are the ability to use of a simple tool for complex situations, improved fish growth modeling, proposal for a parameterization of fish growth in temperature conditions which are beyond optimum growth temperature, the possibility to simulate for variable temperature patterns, together with the possibility for fish farm effluent estimation, under single and multiple stocking conditions. The model can be used for planning aquaculture development due to the capability for simulation of multiple scenarios in single integrated aquaculture model. In this way the model will be useful for a wide range of stakeholders as a tool for sustainable management of an aquaculture farm.



Abstrakt tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

## **PEMBANGUNAN MODEL BERSEPADU UNTUK AKUAKULTUR MAPAN DAN PENGOPTIMUM HASIL TERNAKAN DALAM SISTEM PALUNG**

Oleh

**MOHAMMAD GHOLIZADEH**

**Oktober 2017**

**Pengerusi : Profesor Madya Zelina Zaiton Ibrahim, PhD**  
**Fakulti : Pengajian Alam Sekitar**

Akuakultur yang mapan memerlukan pengurusan ladang ikan yang berkesan untuk mengimbangi pengeluaran hasil yang tinggi dengan efluen ladang yang rendah, serta mempertimbangkan perubahan sumber air yang sedia ada. Tujuan penyelidikan ini adalah untuk membangunkan satu model untuk mensimulasikan pertumbuhan ikan, jumlah pengeluaran ladang, dan anggaran beban efluen bagi penggunaan stok tunggal dan berbilang. Pemodelan dilakukan dalam format hamparan untuk sistem penternakan ikan air sejuk yang paling umum di Iran, iaitu, sistem aliran palung. Persamaan model berdasarkan literatur dan model akuakultur yang sedia ada sekarang. Di samping itu, persamaan baharu, berdasarkan pertimbangan imbalan jisim, dan pengubahsuaian suhu bagi keadaan pertumbuhan ikan di dalam keadaan yang melebihi suhu optimum adalah dicadangkan. Lima modul utama, iaitu, Persekitaran, Berat Ikan Individu, Efluen Kualiti Air, Ladang, dan Analisis, telah dibangunkan untuk merangkumi proses dan parameter utama dalam ladang ikan. Inferens pelbagai model telah digunakan untuk menganggar pertumbuhan ikan. Parameter kualiti air termasuk oksigen terlarut, jumlah ammonia nitrogen dan fosforus. Beban efluen dianggarkan berdasarkan pengurangan oksigen terlarut, keperluan makanan, fosfat dan jumlah ammonia nitrogen. Penggunaan stok tunggal dan berbilang serta penggunaan pelbagai spesies boleh dilakukan dalam model. Model ini telah disahkan kepada data primer dan sekunder. Data primer suhu air dan berat ikan digunakan untuk mengesahkan pertumbuhan ikan dalam modul Berat Ikan Individu. Data sekunder dari set data yang diterbitkan dan hasil daripada model akuakultur semasa yang lain digunakan untuk dibandingkan dengan hasil simulasi model yang dibangunkan. Data ini adalah untuk ikan trout, ikan salmon dan Seabream. Keputusan untuk pertumbuhan ikan menunjukkan korelasi yang sangat baik ( $R^2 > 0.98$ ) dengan data yang ukur dari ladang ikan di Sungai Haraz, Iran, dengan peratusan purata ralat mutlak (MAPE) kurang daripada 10 peratus. Perbandingan hasil simulasi model dengan model sedia ada yang lain, seperti AquaOptima dan AquaFarm, juga menunjukkan korelasi yang

sangat baik ( $R^2 > 0.98$ ) kecuali untuk anggaran keperluan bahan makanan dengan hasil model AquaFarm ( $R^2 = 0.87$  dan MAPE = 24%). Sebagai kesimpulan, model yang dibangunkan menghasilkan beberapa hasil penting yang menyumbang kepada penambahan pengetahuan untuk pemodelan akuakultur. Ini adalah keupayaan untuk penggunaan perkakas mudah untuk situasi kompleks, pemodelan pertumbuhan ikan yang lebih baik, cadangan untuk parameterisasi pertumbuhan ikan dalam keadaan suhu yang melebihi suhu pertumbuhan yang optimum, kemungkinan untuk mensimulasikan untuk corak suhu berubah-ubah, bersama dengan kebolehan untuk melakukan anggaran efluen ladang ikan, di bawah keadaan stok tunggal dan berbilang. Model ini boleh digunakan untuk perancangan pembangunan akuakultur kerana kemampuan untuk melakukan simulasi pelbagai senario dengan menggunakan model akuakultur bersepadu tunggal. Dengan cara ini model ini akan berguna untuk pelbagai pihak yang berkepentingan sebagai alat untuk pengurusan mapan ladang akuakultur.



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, praise be to Allah sw.t. for His blessings in giving me the opportunity to complete this thesis.

Special thanks go to Dr Zelina Zaiton Ibrahim, the chairperson of the supervisory committee, whose precise expansive knowledge together with her overwhelming friendliness made the process of research and writing a mere source of pleasure and inspiration. I truly appreciate the time and effort she devoted to completion of my thesis. Her guidance, constant insights, and encouraging words were proven immeasurable to continuation of this process. Thanks surely go to the members of my supervisory committee, Dr. Wan Nor Azmin Sulaiman and Dr Che Roos Saad, who provided me with crucial advice. This thesis work is dedicated to my family, who have always loved me unconditionally and whose good examples have taught me to work hard for the things that I aspire to achieve.

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Zelina Zaiton Ibrahim, PhD**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Environmental Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Wan Nor Azmin Sulaiman, PhD**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Environmental Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Che Roos Saad, PhD**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Agriculture  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**ROBIAH BINTI YUNUS, PhD**

Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

## Declaration by graduate student

I hereby confirm that:

- this thesis is my original work;
- quotations, illustrations and citations have been duly referenced;
- this thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any institutions;
- intellectual property from the thesis and copyright of thesis are fully-owned by Universiti Putra Malaysia, as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- written permission must be obtained from supervisor and the office of Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and innovation) before thesis is published (in the form of written, printed or in electronic form) including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture notes, learning modules or any other materials as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- there is no plagiarism or data falsification/fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) and the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name and Matric No: Mohammad Gholizadeh, GS13954

## Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee

This is to confirm that:

- the research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervision;
- supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) were adhered to.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Chairman  
of Supervisory Committee: Associate Professor  
Dr. Zelina Zaiton Ibrahim

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Member  
of Supervisory Committee: Associate Professor  
Dr. Wan Nor Azmin Sulaiman

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Member  
of Supervisory Committee: Associate Professor  
Dr. Che Roos Saad

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
<b>ABSTRACT</b>	i
<b>ABSTRAK</b>	iii
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	v
<b>APPROVAL</b>	vi
<b>DECLARATION</b>	viii
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	xiv
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xv
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	xviii
 <b>CHAPTER</b>	
 <b>1 INTRODUCTION</b>	 1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Problem Statement	1
1.3 Objectives	5
1.4 Thesis Outline	5
 <b>2 LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	 6
2.1 Introduction	6
2.2 Sustainability in Aquaculture	6
2.3 Modeling and Simulation in Aquaculture	8
2.3.1 Purpose of Models	8
2.3.2 Development of Aquaculture Farm Models	10
2.3.3 Deterministic versus Probabilistic Simulation	11
2.3.4 Spreadsheet Modelling	12
2.4 Fish Growth Models	13
2.4.1 Introduction	13
2.4.2 Linear Fish Length Growth	14
2.4.3 Von Bertalanffy Growth	14
2.4.4 Specific Growth Rate	15
2.4.5 Daily Growth Rate	16
2.4.6 Daily Growth Coefficient	17
2.4.7 Growing Degree-Days	17
2.4.8 Thermal Growth Coefficient	18
2.4.9 Lupatsch Model	19
2.4.10 Hernandez Model	20
2.4.11 Bioenergetics Growth Model	20
2.4.12 Temperature Modification	21
2.5 Feed Model	21
2.5.1 Introduction	21
2.5.2 Food Conversion Efficiency	22
2.5.3 Feed Conversion Table	22

2.5.4	Factorial Approach	23
2.6	Effluent and Waste Estimate Model	23
2.6.1	Introduction	23
2.6.2	Total Ammonia Nitrogen	24
2.6.3	Un-Ionized Ammonia	25
2.6.4	Phosphorous	26
2.6.5	Biochemical Oxygen Demand	27
2.6.6	Total Suspended Solids	28
2.6.7	Dissolved Oxygen Consumption Rate	30
2.6.8	Minimum Oxygen Levels	31
2.7	Carrying Capacity	31
2.8	Gaps in Aquaculture Modeling	32
<b>3</b>	<b>METHODOLOGY AND MODEL DEVELOPMENT</b>	<b>34</b>
3.1	Methodological Framework	34
3.2	Model Equations	34
3.3	Model Conceptual Framework	38
3.4	Implementation Limitations	40
3.5	Optimization	41
3.6	Environment Module	41
3.6.1	Introduction and Module Assumptions	41
3.6.2	Water Temperature Prediction	42
3.7	Individual Fish Weight Module	44
3.7.1	Introduction and Assumption of Module	44
3.7.2	Description of Individual Fish Weight Module	45
3.7.2.1	Introduction	45
3.7.2.2	Daily Growth Length Coefficient	46
3.7.2.3	Thermal Growth Coefficient	47
3.7.2.4	Lupatsch Feed Model	47
3.7.3	Dissolved Oxygen Consumption Rate	48
3.7.4	Feed Rate	49
3.8	Water Quality Effluent Module	54
3.8.1	Introduction	54
3.8.2	Calculation Criterion	55
3.8.3	Dissolved Oxygen Depletion	55
3.8.4	Dissolved Oxygen Concentration in Effluent Water	56
3.8.5	Total Ammonia Nitrogen	56
3.8.6	Unionized Ammonia	56
3.8.7	Phosphorous	57
3.8.8	Biochemical Oxygen Demand	58
3.8.9	Total Suspended Solid	60
3.9	Farm Module	61
3.9.1	Introduction	61
3.9.2	Biomass Calculation	62
3.9.3	Harvesting Date Criterion	63
3.10	Analysis Module	63
3.10.1	Introduction	63

3.10.2	Multi- Stocking Calculations	64
3.10.3	Dissolved Oxygen	64
3.10.3.1	Dissolved Oxygen Carrying Capacity	64
3.10.3.2	Minimum Dissolved Oxygen	65
3.10.3.3	Dissolved Oxygen After Weir	66
3.10.4	Total Daily Load	67
3.11	Model Validation and Calibration Approach	69
3.11.1	Introduction	69
3.11.2	Validation	69
3.11.3	Calibration Approach	70
3.11.4	Sensitivity Analysis Method	70
3.11.5	Implementation Limitation	71
3.12	Data Sets Used	71
<b>4</b>	<b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSION</b>	<b>74</b>
4.1	Introduction	74
4.2	Sensitivity Analysis	75
4.3	Verification and Validation	77
4.3.1	Introduction	77
4.3.2	Integrated Fish Farm Production and Effluent Simulation	77
4.4	Assumptions and Limitations	77
4.4.1	Introduction	77
4.4.2	Water	78
4.4.3	Fish	78
4.4.4	Culture System	78
4.5	Growth and Production in Single-Stocking Farm	78
4.5.1	Introduction	78
4.5.2	Simulation With Sinusoidal Temperature Variation	79
4.5.3	Trout Growth Simulation with Variable Temperature	81
4.5.4	Trout Production and Feed Requirement with Constant Temperature	84
4.5.5	Haraz Farm Data for Fish Growth	88
4.6	Integrated Farm Production and Effluent Discharge	90
4.6.1	Introduction	90
4.6.2	Dissolved Oxygen Depletion Simulation	91
4.6.3	Integrated Farm Production and Effluent Simulation	92
4.7	Integrated Fish Production and Effluent in Multi-stocking Farm	97
4.7.1	Introduction	97
4.7.2	Salmon Production with Constant Temperature	97
4.7.3	Gilthead Sea-bream Production with Constant Temperature	99
4.7.4	Gilthead Sea Bream Production with Sinusoidal Temperature and Stocking Rate	101
4.8	Use of AIM for Fish Farm Sustainability	103
4.8.1	More Efficient Resource Use	103
4.8.2	Adaptation to Climate Change	103

<b>5</b>	<b>CONCLUSION</b>	<b>105</b>
5.1	Introduction	105
5.2	Findings	105
5.3	Modeling Fish Farm Sustainability	106
5.4	Model Strengths and Weakness	107
5.5	Conclusion	108
5.6	Potential Future Research	110
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>111</b>
	<b>BIODATA OF STUDENT</b>	<b>124</b>
	<b>LIST OF PUBLICATIONS</b>	<b>125</b>





## LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1.1 Experts consulted on aquaculture issues in Iran between 2005 and 2010	3
2.1 Different growth models	21
2.2 BOD and TSS concentration of flow-through trout farm effluents	28
2.3 BOD concentrations, and feeding levels	28
2.4 Summary of models specifications	33
3.1 Equations used in model development	36
3.2 Statistical techniques for comparison of model results	70
3.3 Data sets used in this study	72
3.4 Data of fish farm at Haraz River, Iran	73
4.1 Summary of model simulation and validation data sets used	75
4.2 Summary of sensitivity analysis of model variables	76
4.3 Conditions for simulation of growth in a single-stocking farm	79
4.4 Statistical comparison of AIM results with Akhan et al. (2010) data set for fish-length and fish-weight	84
4.5 Statistical comparison of AIM results with AquaOptima (2006) for feed rate and feed requirement	88
4.6 Statistical comparison of simulation results for fish growth with variable temperature.	89
4.7 Farm production simulation in a single-stocking farm	90
4.8 Statistical comparison of AIM results with AquaOptima (2006) for $DO_{rate}$ and $DO_{depletion}$	92
4.9 Statistical comparison of AIM results with AquaFarm (2009) for TGC+DGL, Lupatech, Feed Rate and TAN	96
4.10 Summary of simulation conditions for multi-stocking farm	97
4.11 Statistical comparison of AIM results with Colt et al. (2009a)s	99
4.12 Model output for increased water temperatures	104

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
2.1 The overall structure of the modules used to model the environmental impacts of fish farm	9
2.2 A sample of food conversion efficiency diagram	22
2.3 Possible decision tree for the implementation of effluent nutrient reduction strategies in trout farms, dependent on the feeding level	29
3.1 The overall methodology framework of research	35
3.2 A simplified conceptual framework of the model, input and output variables, and calculation modules.	39
3.3 Decomposition scheme of the aquaculture integrated model (AIM)	40
3.4 Parameters in the Environment module	42
3.5 Dissolved oxygen in water	43
3.6 Water temperature ( $T_w$ ) correlation in Haraz River (This study)	44
3.7 The parameters of the Individual Fish module	45
3.8 Oxygen consumption per individual fish, for constant temperatures, 5, 10, 15 and 25 °C. Based on the data set of Klontz, 1991.	49
3.9 Feed and Pollutant in Fish	49
3.10 Feed rate of Barramundi fish, based on Lupatsch equation $FR_{1t}$ for various temperature, 10, 15, 20 and 24 °C as a function of IFW.	50
3.11 Comparison of AIM feedrate and Klontz dataset for salmon fish	52
3.12 Illustration of water temperature modification equation effect	53
3.13 A simplified conceptual framework of the Water Quality Effluent module	54
3.14 $NH_3$ and waterquality.	58
3.15 BOD as a function of feeding level	59
3.16 BOD in the model as a function of biomass and feed	60

3.17	TSS load in the model as a function of feed	61
3.18	Simplified conceptual framework of the Farm module	62
3.19	Simplified conceptual framework of the Analysis modul	63
3.20	Minimum dissolved oxygen for Shasta trout	66
3.21	Weir in serial raceways	66
3.22	Estimation of dissolved oxygen saturation (Sa) after weir	68
4.1	Sensitivity analysis of production variable, based on OFAT method	76
4.2	Fish growth simulation results of AIM with AquaFarm	80
4.3	Fish growth correlation between AIM and AquaFarm	81
4.4	Length-weight relationship based on the Akhan et al. (2010) data set (open circles).	82
4.5	Length-weight relationship based on the Akhan et al. (2010) data set (open circles).	82
4.6	Length-growth simulation results of AIM versus Akhan et al. (2010) data set.	83
4.7	Weight-growth simulation results of AIM compared with Akhan et al. (2010)	83
4.8	AIM fish length and weight simulation results of AIM versus Akhan et al. (2010) dataset	84
4.9	Production simulation of AIM with AquaOptima	85
4.10	Comparison between fish weight and biomass for AIM and AquaOptima	86
4.11	Simulation results of AIM and AquaOptima output	87
4.12	Correlation of feed simulation results of AIM with AquaOptima (2006)	88
4.13	Fish growth simulation on Haraz fish farm	89
4.14	Correlation of TGC and Tm on fish growth	90

4.15	Fish dissolved oxygen consumption, simulation results of AIM and AquaOptima (2006)	91
4.16	Correlation of daily dissolved oxygen between AIM and AquaOptima (2006)	92
4.17	Simulation results of AIM with AquaFarm (Ernst et al., 2000) for sinusoidal temperature conditions	93
4.18	TAN simulation results of AIM and	94
4.19	Comparing AIM with AquaFarm	95
4.20	Comparison of TAN results from AIM with AquaFarm	96
4.21	Integrated IFW, Feed Rate and TAN simulation results of AIM and AquaFarm	96
4.22	Simulation results of AIM with Colt et al. (2009)	98
4.23	Scatter plot of AIM and Colt et al. (2009a) results	99
4.24	Cumulative fish production for AIM and Seginer & Halachmi (2008)	100
4.25	Scatter plot of AIM and Seginer & Halachmi (2008) results	100
4.26	Stocking rate pattern for Seginer & Halachmi (2008) and AIM	101
4.27	Fish production simulation for Seginer & Halachmi (2008) and AIM	102
4.28	Yield production of AIM and Seginer & Halachmi (2008)	102

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BIO	Biomass
BIOE	Bioenergetics Function
BOD	Biochemical Oxygen Demand
CAGR	Constant Absolute Weight Growth Rate
CSGR	Constant Special Weight Growth Rate
DGC	Daily Growth Coefficient
DGR	Daily Growth Rate
DSGR	Double-Logarithmic Specific Growth Rate
DO	Dissolved oxygen
DOCC	Dissolved oxygen carrying capacity
ELV	Water Resource Elevation
EPA	Environmental Protect Agency
FCE	Feed Conversion Efficiency
FCR	Food Conversion Ratio
Feed	Daily Feed Ration (ton)
FFI	Fish Feeding Index
FGI	Fish Growth Index
FMR	Fish Metabolic Rate
FTS	Flow Through System
FR	Feed Rate
Fw	Feed waste
Feed G	Absorbed Phosphorous
GCM	Growth Curve Modeling

GRP	Growth Rate Potential
GDD	Growing Degree-Days
IFG	Individual Fish Growth
IFW	Individual Fish Weight (g)
LCA	Life Cycle Assessment
LWR	Length-Weight Relationship
NEL	No-Effect Limit
NH <sub>3</sub>	Ammonia
NPU	Net Protein Unit
NSF <sub>t</sub>	Count of Survived Fish at each Time step
pK <sub>a</sub>	acidity constant
PP	Particulate Phosphorous (kg.day <sup>-1</sup> )
PRAS	Partition Recirculating Aquaculture System
RAS	Recirculating Aquaculture System
SA	Sensitivity Analysis
SA-OFAT	Sensitivity Analysis One factor at the time
SGR	Specific Growth Rate
SS	Suspended Solid
TSS	Total Suspended Solid
TAN	Total Ammonia Nitrogen (kg/day)
TDL	Total Daily Load of each water quality parameter
TGC	Thermal-unit Growth Coefficient
TP	Total Phosphorous (kg.day <sup>-1</sup> )
VBA	Visual Basic VBA Application
VBGF	Von Bertalanffy growth function

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 Background

Aquaculture fish farming is one of main sources of food. Aquaculture production with a yearly average rate of 9% is one of world's fastest growing industries (Timmons & Ebeling, 2012). Every decade aquaculture production has doubled (Fitwi, et al., 2012). Technological advances have led to these growth (Kumar & Engle, 2016). Aquaculture now provides almost half of all fish for human consumption (FAO, 2016). Fish farmers need to have a good production plan and high health fish (Ghorbani & Mirakabad, 2010). This includes high yield production and high income with less inputs of resources. However, it is evident that water quantity and quality are one of the main resources in a fish farm. Water sources are limited in many countries; however the fish farmers need to have higher production even if they cannot increase their water resource. Farmers and fisheries try to have high production even in dry seasons. The effluents of fish farms will negatively impact on water quality parameters (Kohanestani, et al., 2013). On the other hand, the water authority approach, such as in Iran (Torabi, 2010), is to decrease water demand and effluent discharge. For sustainable aquaculture, there needs to be a good approach for farm production management. There should be a balance between higher yield production, for higher income, but with less farm effluent to the environment.

A fish production plan may be achieved experimentally, manually, or mathematically, by modeling, for instance, the pollutant load or changes in water quality. These can be achieved by computing the carrying capacity of the water resources and the maximum amount of fish that can be reared in the farms. Nowadays, computer software, such as spreadsheet programs and mathematics used as common tools in a modeling of fish production. For instance, scientists and aquaculture farmers have to consider aquaculture effluent impact on receiving waters. They can apply computer programs for water quantity and quality, water availability and water temperature (Handisyde, Ross, & Allison, 2006).

#### 1.2 Problem Statement

Salmonidae are one of the most important cold water cultured fishes in the world. In Iran, farming of this species started in 1960. Now, Iran is one of the important Salmonidae producers in the world (Adeli, & Baghaei, 2013), especially trout fish. The improvement of the aquaculture production plans is important for the Iranian Government because of the local potential for the aquaculture, and the high request by the consumer (Adeli, & Shabanpour, 2007).

Between 2005 through 2010 the issues about aquaculture sustainability, the need of fish farmers and production management modeling, related to the ecology and environment, was discussed informally with key persons and experts in Iran, as listed in Table 1.1. These discussions were made during aquaculture and environment conferences and in the offices of the mentioned experts. From these discussions the main points raised were:

- The need for the aquaculture sustainability approach;
- The need of modeling in trout farm management on flow through system in Iran;
- Modeling of the yield and carrying capacity of springs and rivers with fluctuations in water flow and temperature;
- Modeling of the effluent of fish farms; and
- Modeling for fish farm management based on multi-stocking and multi species for scenario planning.

A recent FAO study report (Hasan, 2013) also identified the need to optimize feed production and on-farm feed management practices in aquaculture. The FAO (2016) stated that the "implications of feed type, formulation and feed management practices on the environmental footprint and economics of the farming operation are important issues that farmers need to consider when planning their activities". They also recommended that there must be simple tools for the farmer to monitor farm production indices such as feed conversion efficiency and growth rate.



**Table 1.1 : Experts consulted on aquaculture issues in Iran between 2005 and 2010**

No.	Title	Last Name	First Name	Position (in 2017)
1	Engr.	Aryannejad	Mohsen	Director, Cold Water Group, IFO
2	Engr.	Bahmanyary	Hussein	Ex Director, Bushehr Providence, IFO
3	Engr.	Esmayely	Mohammad Ebrahim	President, Abzian Asia Aquaculture Consultant Co.
4	Engr.	Hassani	Mohammad Reza	Manager, Peyab Novin Aquaculture Consultant Engineers.
5	Dr.	Hosseinzadeh Sahaf	Homayun	Director, Aquaculture Department, IFRO
6	Engr.	Jedi Rangraz	Mohammad	Ex Director, Tehran Providence, IFO
7	Engr.	Jamalzadeh Fallah	Faryborz	Ex Director, Coastline Office, Iran Department of Environment
8	Dr.	kakolaki	Shahpour	Director, Capture Fisheries, IFO
9	Engr.	Mokarami	Ghobad	Aquaculture Experts in IFO
10	Dr.	Nabizadeh	Arash	Iran Aquaculture Association
11	Engr.	Norbakhsh	Ali Reza	Ex Director, Aquacultural Engineering Department, IFO
12	Dr .	Partabyan	Massod	Trout Farmer; Best Iranian Trout Famer in 2003
13	Dr.	Pirali	Ali	Director, Charmahal Providence Technology Park
14	Dr.	Pourgholam	Reza	Ex Head, Caspian Research Center, IFRO
15	Assoc Prof.	Rafiee	Reza	Head, Fisheries Department, Tehran University
16	Engr.	Roshanro	Ahmad	Aquaculture Experts in Azarbayjan Providence, IFO
17	Dr.	Salehi	Hassan	Iran Agriculture Deputy Minister; President, IFO
18	Dr.	Shakouri	Mehdi	Ex. Director, Aquaculture Department, IFO
19	Dr.	Sharifpour	Issa	Aquatic Health Expert in IFRO
20	Prof.	Soltani	Mehdi	Ex Head, Fish Health Department, Tehran University
21	Dr.	Torabi	Sedigheh	Head, Water Allocation Group, Ministry of Water and Power
22	Dr.	Yazdani Jahromi	Yazdani Jahromi	Private Sector Aquaculture Consultant
23	Engr.	Zolfaghari	Karim	Director, Agriculture Department, Tehran Province
24	Dr.	Zorrieh Zahara	Sayed Ebrahim Jalail	Head, Aquatic Health, IFRO

Note: IFO - Iranian Fisheries Organization ; IFRO - Iranian Fisheries Research Organization

Aquatic health experts also believe that a fish simulation model for water quality monitoring helps to prevent fish disease risk and there are several models of fish growth and effluent, and of aquaculture production simulation. For instance, there is POND DSS (Bolte, Nath, & Ernst, 2000), AquaFarm (Ernst et al., 2000), RTDSS (Wang & Song, 2006) and multiple stock spreadsheet model by Colt, Schuur, Cryer, & Miles (2009).

Colt et al. (2009a) calculated carry capacity by developing a computer program in using FORTRAN language. Ernst, Bolte, & Nath (2000) developed computer software to simulate the operation and facility of the fish farm. Wang & Song (2006) simulated raceway trout farm by using spreadsheet software. Colt et al. (2009b) also applied spreadsheet software to study salmon hatchery planning. All of them reported good results in case of using a computer program as a tool. By introducing carrying capacity models for aquaculture development model the environmental impact effects can be reduced (Ross et al., 2013; White, Phillips, & Beveridge, 2013).

From the literature on aquaculture fish farm models, as mentioned above and presented in Chapter 2, there are some gaps that were identified. Currently, all of the above studies and models are for constant temperature condition. In the AquaOptima, (2006) model, any fluctuation of temperature is needed to be carried out manually. Previous models are for a single stocking and single a species. None include options for multi-stocking and multi-species condition. Several of the experts in Table 1. 1, that is Dr. Nabizadeh from Iran Aquaculture Association, Prof. Soltani, Ex-Head of the Fish Health Department, Tehran University, and Dr Zorrieh Zahara, Head of the Aquatic Health, Iranian Fisheries Research Organization suggested that that this type of simulation model for multi-stocking and multi-species can be useful. Jamalzadeh-Fallah, former Director of the Coastline Office, Iran Department of Environment, also supported that a model for multi-stocking for assessing fish farm impact on the environment is still needed for sustainability assessment. A study carried on recirculating aquaculture system (Kumar & Engle, 214) concluded that feeding and stocking strategies can affect the farm profits made. The recent paper by Valenti et al. (2018) on aquaculture sustainability also stress the environmental parameters of natural resource use and effluents from farms.

A recent review by (Anyadike, et al., 2017) of aquaculture production models found that none of the existing model could be used to model the effects of different management scenario or consider the fish species that they were interested in. They made the conclusion that there was a serious need to develop models that can predict the effects of environment on the performance of fish species in order to help the farmers for different management scenarios.

Currently, there are no models that can run an integrated simulation of fish growth, farm production, and effluent resulting from multi-stocking, multi-species and multi-growth farm condition, which is closer to the real condition for aquaculture farmers. This is also one of the points raised by the Iranian experts consulted. For stakeholders, such as fish farmer, environmental decision maker, fishery and environmental student and researcher, it is a gap in knowledge for promoting sustainable aquaculture.

### **1.3 Objectives**

The aim of this research is to develop a model to simulate fish growth, total farm production, and effluent load estimation for single and multiple stocking events. The focus is on the trout farms with flow-through systems (FTS). The specific objectives are, to:

1. Develop a model for FTS fish farm management by applying multiple-models for fish growth in a spreadsheet format;
2. Develop a simulation model for effluent load estimation from an FTS fish farm; and to
3. Integrate the simulation of fish farm production management by incorporating effluent, multi-stocking and multi-species conditions.

### **1.4 Thesis Outline**

The following chapter, Chapter 2, presents the review of the literature on fish growth, fish production simulation, and fish effluent modeling. Chapter 3 presents an overview of the methodology approach, and the framework for the development of an integrated aquaculture model for fish farm production and effluent simulation. Each module of the model includes the effective parameters, variables, functions, and procedures. The validation and calibration approach, dataset types, and implementation limitations are described in this chapter. In Chapter 4, the model validation results and comparison to similar models is discussed. In Chapter 5, the conclusion and achievements are presented.

## REFERENCES

- Abbink, W., Garcia, A. B., Roques, J. A., Partridge, G. J., Kloet, K., & Schneider, O. (2012). The effect of temperature and pH on the growth and physiological response of juvenile yellowtail kingfish *Seriola lalandi* in recirculating aquaculture systems. *Aquaculture*, (330), 130–135.
- Adeli, A., & Shabanpour, B. (2007). The role of packing aquatics and consuming behavior of agricultural families of Tehran city. *Journal of Resources, Sciences and Natural*, 14(1), 27–42.
- Adeli, A. & Baghaei, F., 2013. (2013). Production and supply of rainbow trout in Iran and the world. *Journal of Fish and Marine Sciences*, 5(3), 335–341.
- Akhan, S., Okumuş, I., Sonay, F.D., & Koçak, N. (2010). Growth, slaughter yield and proximate composition of rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) raised under commercial farming condition in Black Sea. *Kafkas Universitesi Veteriner Fakultesi Dergisi*, 16, Suppl. B, S291–S296.
- Akhan, S. S., Delihasan Sonay, F., Okumus, I., Köse, Ö., Yandi, I., Sonay, F. D., Yandi, I. (2011). Inter-specific hybridization between Black Sea trout (*Salmo labrax Pallas, 1814*) and rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss Walbaum, 1792*). *Aquaculture Research*, 42(11), 1632–1638. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2109.2010.02755.x>
- Alabaster, J. S., & Lloyd, R. S. (2013). *Water quality criteria for freshwater fish*. Butterworth-Heinemann, London.
- Anyadike, C. C., Mbajorgu, C. C., & Ajah, G. N. (2017). Aquacultural system management tool II: Analytical and management capability. *Agricultural Engineering International: CIGR Journal*, 19(3), 97–104.
- Anyadike, C., Mbajorgu, C., & Ajah, G. (2016). Review of aquacultural production system models. *Nigerian Journal of Technology*, 35(2), 448. <https://doi.org/10.4314/njt.v35i2.29>
- AquaOptima. (2006). *AquaOptima production plan*. Internal report. Permission to use by courtesy of AquaOptima AS, Norway, via email on July 5 2012 from Mr Idar Schei, CEO (idar.schei@aquaoptima.com)
- Argent, D. G., & Flebbe, P. A. (1999). Fine sediment effects on Brook trout eggs in laboratory streams. *Fisheries Research*, 39(3), 253–262. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0165-7836\(98\)00188-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0165-7836(98)00188-X)
- Arnason, R. (2012). Global warming: New challenges for the common fisheries policy? *Ocean and Coastal Management*, 70, 4–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocecoaman.2012.04.003>

- Asche, F., & Guttormsen, A. G. (2001). Patterns in the relative price for different sizes of farmed fish. *Marine Resource Economics*, 16(3), 235–247.
- Bergheim, A., & Brinker, A. (2003). Effluent treatment for flow through systems and European environmental regulations. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 27(1), 61–77. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(02\)00041-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(02)00041-9)
- Bermudes, M., Glencross, B., Austen, K., & Hawkins, W. (2010). The effects of temperature and size on the growth, energy budget and waste outputs of barramundi (*Lates calcarifer*). *Aquaculture*, 306(1), 160–166.
- Black, K. D. (2001). Mariculture, Environmental, Economic and Social Impacts of. In *Encyclopedia of Ocean Sciences* (pp. 1578–1584). <https://doi.org/10.1006/rwos.2001.0487>
- Bolte, J., Nath, S., & Ernst, D. (2000). Development of decision support tools for aquaculture: The POND experience. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 23(1–3), 103–119. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(00\)00049-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(00)00049-2)
- Brooker, A. (2002). *Development and integration of waste dispersion models for cage aquaculture within the GIS framework*. MSc Thesis, Institute of Aquaculture, University of Stirling, U.K.
- Buentello, J. A., Gatlin, D. M., & Neill, W. H. (2000). Effects of water temperature and dissolved oxygen on daily feed consumption, feed utilization and growth of channel catfish (*Ictalurus punctatus*). *Aquaculture*, 182(3), 339–352.
- Buongiorno, J., & Gilles, J. (2003). *Decision methods for forest resource management*. Academic Press, Amsterdam.
- Buonomo, B., Falcucci, M., Hull, V., & Rionero, S. (2005). A mathematical model for an integrated experimental aquaculture plant. *Ecological Modelling*, 183(1), 11–28.
- Buonomo, B., Falcucci, M., Hull, V., & Rionero, S. (2005). A mathematical model for an integrated experimental aquaculture plant. *Ecological Modelling*, 183(1), 11–28. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2004.07.019>
- Bureau, D. P. (2004). Factors Affecting metabolic waste outputs in fish. *Avances En Nutrición Acuicola VII*, 2–7.
- Byron, C. J., & Costa-Pierce, B. A. (2013). Carrying capacity tools for use in the implementation of an ecosystems approach to aquaculture. *Site Selection and Carrying Capacities for Inland and Coastal Aquaculture*, 87–101. Retrieved from [http://ecologicalaquaculture.org/Byron&Costa-PierceFAO\(2011\).pdf](http://ecologicalaquaculture.org/Byron&Costa-PierceFAO(2011).pdf)



- Campbell, P. J., Galligan, D. T., & Bebak-Williams, J. (2006). Trout farm production optimization: identifying opportunities at a sole-proprietor farm. *Journal of Applied Aquaculture*, 18(2), 1–21.
- Cho, C.Y., Hynes, J., Wood, K., & Yoshida, H. (1994). Development of high-nutrient-dense, low-pollution diets and prediction of aquaculture wastes using biological approaches. *Aquaculture*, 124(1–4), 293–305.
- Cho, C. Y. (1992). Feeding systems for rainbow trout and other salmonids with reference to current estimates of energy and protein requirements. *Aquaculture*, 100(1–3), 107–123.
- Cho, C. Y. (2004). Development of computer models for fish feeding standards and aquaculture waste estimations: A treatise. *Simpósio Internacional De Nutrición Acuicola*, 7(1952), 375–395. Retrieved from [http://www.uanl.mx/utilerias/nutricion\\_acuicola/VII/archivos/20YoungCho.pdf](http://www.uanl.mx/utilerias/nutricion_acuicola/VII/archivos/20YoungCho.pdf)
- Cho, C. Y., & Bureau, D. P. (1998). Development of bioenergetic models and the fish-PrFEQ software to estimate production, feeding ration and waste output in aquaculture. In *Aquatic Living Resources* (Vol. 11, pp. 199–210). [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0990-7440\(98\)89002-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0990-7440(98)89002-5)
- Coggins L.G. Pine, W. E. I. I. I. (2010). Development of a temperature-dependent growth model for the endangered Chub using capture-recapture data. *The Open Fish Science Journal*, 3, 122–131.
- Collins, G. M., Ball, A. S., Qin, J. G., Bowyer, J. N., & Stone, D. A. (2014). Effect of alternative lipids and temperature on growth factor gene expression in yellowtail kingfish (*Seriola lalandi*). *Aquaculture Research*, 45(7), 1236–1245.
- Colt, J. (2006). Water quality requirements for reuse systems. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 34(3), 143–156. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2005.08.011>
- Colt, J., Schuur, A., Cryer, E., & Miles, T. (2009). Modeling of multiple stocks and programs for master planning and feasibility studies. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 40(1), 28–44. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2008.10.004>
- Colt, J., Watten, B., & Rust, M. (2009). Modeling carbon dioxide, pH, and un-ionized ammonia relationships in serial reuse systems. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 40, 176–187. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2009.07.005>
- Czitrom, V. (1999). One-factor-at-a-time versus designed experiments. *American Statistician*, 53(2), 126–131. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00031305.1999.10474445>
- Diewert, E. (2013). Irving fisher and index number theory. *Journal of the History of Economic Thought*. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1053837213000072>

- Dumas, A., France, J., & Bureau, D. P. (2007). Evidence of three growth stanzas in rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) across life stages and adaptation of the thermal-unit growth coefficient. *Aquaculture*, 267(1), 139–146.
- Encarnação, P., de Lange, C., Rodehutsord, M., Hoehler, D., Bureau, W., Bureau, D.P., 2004. Diet digestible energy content affects lysine utilization, but not dietary lysine requirements of rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) for maximum growth. *Aquaculture* 235, 569–586.
- Engle, C. R., Pomerleau, S., Fornshell, G., Hinshaw, J. M., Sloan, D., & Thompson, S. (2005). The economic impact of proposed effluent treatment options for production of trout *Oncorhynchus mykiss* in flow-through systems. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 32(2), 303–323.
- Ernst, D., Bolte, J., & Nath, S. (2000). AquaFarm: simulation and decision support for aquaculture facility design and management planning. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 23(1–3), 121–179. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(00\)00045-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(00)00045-5)
- Ernst, D. D. H. (2000). *AquaFarm: Simulation and Decision-Support Software for Aquaculture Facility Design and Management Planning*. PhD thesis, Oregon State University, USA.
- Ernst, D. D. H., Bolte, J. P. J. P., & Nath, S. S. S. (2000). AquaFarm: simulation and decision support for aquaculture facility design and management planning. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 23(1–3), 121–179. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(00\)00045-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(00)00045-5)
- Fadaeifard, F. (2012). Evaluation of physicochemical parameters of waste water from rainbow trout fish farms and their impacts on water quality of Koohrang stream – Iran. *International Journal of Fisheries and Aquaculture*, 4(8). <https://doi.org/10.5897/IJFA12.007>
- FallahFaryborz, J. (2013). *No Title*. Tehran: Iranian Fisheries Research Organization. Unpublished report.
- FAO. (2016). Part 1: World Review of Fisheries and Aquaculture. *The State of World Fisheries and Aquaculture (SOFIA) 2014*, 4. <https://doi.org/92-5-105177-1>
- Fasso, A. (2006). Sensitivity Analysis for Monitoring Environmental Networks. In *Proceedings of the iEMSs Third Biennial Meeting: "Summit on Environmental Modelling and Software."* Retrieved from [http://www.iemss.org/iemss2006/papers/s7/268\\_Fasso\\_0.pdf](http://www.iemss.org/iemss2006/papers/s7/268_Fasso_0.pdf)
- Ferreira, J. G., Sequeira, A., Hawkins, A. J. S., Newton, A., Nickell, T. D., Pastres, R., Bricker, S. B. (2009). Analysis of coastal and offshore aquaculture: Application of the FARM model to multiple systems and shellfish species *Aquaculture*, 289, 32–41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2009.03.039>

- Fivelstad, S., & Smith, M. J. (1991). The oxygen consumption rate of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar* L.) reared in a single pass landbased seawater system. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 10(4), 227–235. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0144-8609\(91\)90013-A](https://doi.org/10.1016/0144-8609(91)90013-A)
- Ford, A. (2009). *Modeling the Environment*. Island Press, Washington.
- Frier, J.-O., From, J., Larsen, T., & Rasmussen, G. (1995). Modelling waste output from trout farms. *Water Science and Technology*, 31(10), 103–121.
- Frier, J. O., From, J., Larsen, T., & Rasmussen, G. (1995). Modelling waste output from trout farms. *Water Science and Technology*, 31(10), 103–121. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0273-1223\(95\)00429-Q](https://doi.org/10.1016/0273-1223(95)00429-Q).
- Ghorbani, M., & Mirakabad, H. Z. (2010). Factors influencing on trout production in Khorasan Razavi province. *Trends Agric. Econ*, (3), 19–27.
- Glencross, B. (2008). A factorial growth and feed utilization model for barramundi, *Lates calcarifer* based on Australian production conditions. *Aquaculture Nutrition*, 14(4), 360–373.
- Gröger, J. (2001). Description of growth by simple versus complex models for Baltic Sea spring spawning herring. *Journal of Applied Ichthyology*, 17(1), 14–24.
- Grøttum, J. A., & Sigholt, T. (1998). A model for oxygen consumption of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) based on measurements of individual fish in a tunnel respirometer. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 17(4), 241–251.
- Halachmi, A. (2005). Performance measurement: Test the water before you dive in. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 71(2), 255–266. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020852305053884>
- Hamby, D. M. (1994). A review of techniques for parameter sensitivity analysis of environmental models. *Environmental Monitoring and Assessment*, 32(2), 135–154. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00547132>
- Handisyde, N. T., Ross, L. G., Badjeck, M-C, & Allison, E. H. (2006). *The Effects of Climate change on World Aquaculture: A global perspective*. Department for International Development, UK. 151 pp.
- Hargrave, B. T. (2004). Environmental Studies for Sustainable Aquaculture (ESSA):2004 Symposium Report. Can Tech. Rep. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 2542: vi + 81 p. Department of Fisheries and Oceans, Canada.
- Hasan, M.R. & New, M.B., eds. 2013. On-farm feeding and feed management in aquaculture. FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Technical Paper No. 583. Rome, FAO. 67 pp



- Have, T. Van der, & Jong, G. De. (1996). Adult size in ectotherms: temperature effects on growth and differentiation. *Journal of Theoretical Biology*.
- Hernández, J. M., Gasca-Leyva, E., León, C. J., & Vergara, J. (2003). A growth model for gilthead seabream (*Sparus aurata*). *Ecological Modelling*, 165(2), 265–283.
- Hernández, J., Gasca-Leyva, E., Leon, C., & Vergara, J. (2003). A growth model for gilthead seabream ( *Sparus aurata*). *Ecological Modelling*, 165, 265–283.
- Hernández, J. M., Gasca-Leyva, E., León, C. J., & Vergara, J. M. (2003). A growth model for gilthead seabream (*Sparus aurata*). *Ecological Modelling*, 165(2–3), 265–283. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800\(03\)00095-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-3800(03)00095-4)
- Islam, M. S. (2005). Nitrogen and phosphorus budget in coastal and marine cage aquaculture and impacts of effluent loading on ecosystem: review and analysis towards model development. *Marine Pollution Bulletin*, 50(1), 48–61.
- Iwama, G. K., & Tautz, A. F. (1981). A simple growth model for salmonids in hatcheries. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, 38(6), 649–656.
- Jamu, D. M., & Piedrahita, R. H. (2002). An organic matter and nitrogen dynamics model for the ecological analysis of integrated aquaculture/agriculture systems: II. Model evaluation and application. *Environmental Modelling & Software*, 17, 583–592. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-8152\(02\)00017-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1364-8152(02)00017-8)
- Jobling, M. (1995). Simple indices for the assessment of the influences of social environment on growth performance, exemplified by studies on Arctic charr. *Aquaculture International*, 3(1), 60–65.
- Jobling, M. (2003). The thermal growth coefficient (TGC) model of fish growth: a cautionary note. *Aquaculture Research*, 34(7), 581–584.
- Jorgensen, S., & Gromiec, M. (eds) (2016). Mathematical submodels in water quality Systems. *Developments in Environmental Modelling (Vol. 14)*. (Revised Edition). Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- Jorgensen, S. E. (ed) (1990). Modelling in ecotoxicology. *Developments in environmental modelling (Vol. 14) (Vol. 16)*. Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- Kam, L. E., Leung, P. S., & Ostrowski, A. C. (2003). Economics of offshore aquaculture of Pacific threadfin (*Polydactylus sexfilis*) in Hawaii. *Aquaculture*, 223(1–4), 63–87. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486\(03\)00162-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486(03)00162-5)
- Kaushik, S. J. (1998). Nutritional bioenergetics and estimation of waste production in non-salmonids. *Aquatic Living Resources*, 11(4), 211–217.
- Klontz, G. W. (1991). *A manual for rainbow trout production on the family-owned farm*. Thomas Nelson & Sons, Murray.

- Klontz, G.W. (1995). Care of fish in biological research. *Journal of Animal Science*, 73(11), 3485–3492.
- Kohanestani, Z. M., Hajimoradloo, A., Ghorbani, R., Yulghi, S., Hoseini, A., & Molaei, M. (2013). Seasonal variations in hematological parameters of *Alburnoides eichwaldii* in Zaringol Stream-Golestan Province, Iran. *World Journal of Fish and Marine Sciences*, 5(2), 121–126.
- Kumar, G., & Engle, C.R. (2016). Technological advances that led to growth of shrimp, salmon, and tilapia farming. *Reviews in Fisheries Sciences & Aquaculture* 24 (2), 136-152.
- Kumar, G., & Engle, C.R. (2014). Optimizing catfish feeding and stocking strategies over a two-year planning horizon. *Aquaculture Economics & Management* 18, 169-188. doi.org/10.1080/13657305.2014.903311
- Lawson, S. (1995). Environmental Degradation of Zirconia Ceramics. *Journal of the European Ceramic Society*, 15, 485–502. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0955-2219\(95\)00035-S](https://doi.org/10.1016/0955-2219(95)00035-S)
- Lawson, T. (1995). *Fundamentals of Aquacultural Engineering*. Springer, Boston. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4613-0479-1>
- Lazard, J., Rey-Valette, H., Aubin, J., Mathé, S., Chia, E., Caruso, D., & Clément, O. (2014). Assessing aquaculture sustainability: A comparative methodology. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and World Ecology*, 21(6), 503–511. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504509.2014.964350>
- LeBlanc, L. J., & Galbreth, M. R. (2007). Implementing large-scale optimization models in excel using VBA. *Interfaces*, 37(4), 370–382. <https://doi.org/10.1287/inte.1060.0256>
- Lee, W.-S., Monaghan, P., & Metcalfe, N. B. (2013). Experimental demonstration of the growth rate–lifespan trade-off. *Proc Biol Sci. B* 280, 20122370. doi: 10.1098/rspb.2012.2370.
- Losordo, T. M., & Hobbs, A. O. (2000). Using computer spreadsheets for water flow and biofilter sizing in recirculating aquaculture production systems. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 23(1–3), 95–102. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(00\)00048-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(00)00048-0)
- Losordo, T. M. M., & Westers, H. (1994). System carrying capacity. In M.B. Timmons and T.M. Losordo (eds) *Aquaculture Water Reuse Systems: Engineering Design and Management*. Elsevier, New York.
- Lupatsch, I., & Kissil, G. W. (1998). Predicting aquaculture waste from gilthead seabream (*Sparus aurata*) culture using a nutritional approach. *Aquatic Living Resources*, 11(4), 265–268.

- Lupatsch, I., Kissil, G. W., & Sklan, D. (2001). Optimization of feeding regimes for European sea bass *Dicentrarchus labrax*: a factorial approach. *Aquaculture*, 202(3–4), 289–302. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486\(01\)00779-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486(01)00779-7)
- MacMillan, J. R., Huddleston, T., Woolley, M., & Fothergill, K. (2003). Best management practice development to minimize environmental impact from large flow-through trout farms. *Aquaculture*, 226, 91–99. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486\(03\)00470-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486(03)00470-8)
- Mayer, P., Estruch, V., Blasco, J., & Jover, M. (2008). Predicting the growth of gilthead sea bream (*Sparus aurata* L.) farmed in marine cages under real production conditions using temperature- and time- dependent models. *Aquaculture Research*, 39(10), 1046–1052.
- McIntosh, D., & Fitzsimmons, K. (2003). Characterization of effluent from an inland, low-salinity shrimp farm: What contribution could this water make if used for irrigation. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 27(2), 147–156. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(02\)00054-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(02)00054-7)
- Morgan, M. J., Wright, P. J., & Rideout, R. M. (2013). Effect of age and temperature on spawning time in two gadoid species. *Fisheries Research*, 138, 42–51. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2012.02.019>
- Morrison, J. K., & Piper, R. G. (1986). Effect of reused water on brown trout. *The Progressive Fish-Culturist*, 48(2), 139–141.
- Muller-Feuga, a. (2000). The role of microalgae in aquaculture: situation and trends. *Journal of Applied Phycology*, 12(1998), 527–534. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1008106304417>
- Munro, L. I., Falconer, L., Telfer, T. C., & Ross, L. G. (2010). Review of Environmental Models, SEAT Deliverable Ref:D 4.1, Sustaining Ethical Aquaculture Trade, 54pp. Unpublished report. <http://seatglobal.eu/wp-content/uploads/2009/12/D4.1ReviewofEnvModels.pdf>, April 2016
- Nazar, A. K. A., Jayakumar, R., & Tamilmani, G. (2013). Recirculating aquaculture systems. *CMFRI Manuel Customized training Book*. Mandapam Regional Center of CMFRI, [http://eprints.cmfri.org.in/9712/1/AKA\\_Nazar.pdf](http://eprints.cmfri.org.in/9712/1/AKA_Nazar.pdf)
- Neuheimer, A. B. (2007). *Growth in fishes: size-at-age, temperature and food*. PhD thesis, Dalhousie University, Halifax.
- Neuheimer, A. B., & Grønkjær, P. (2012). Climate effects on size-at-age: Growth in warming waters compensates for earlier maturity in an exploited marine fish. *Global Change Biology*, 18(6), 1812–1822. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2012.02673.x>

- Olsen, Y., & Olsen, L. (2008). Environmental impact of aquaculture on coastal planktonic ecosystems. In *Paper presented at the Fisheries for global welfare and environment. Memorial book of the 5 th World Fisheries Congress 2008*.
- Oluyinka, A. A., Funmilola, A., & Richards, F. O. (2015). Nutrient utilization and growth of *Clarias gariepinus* fed four different commercial feeds. *International Journal of Fisheries and Aquaculture*, 7(7), 107–110.
- Paloheimo, J., & Dickie, L. M. (1966). Food and Growth of Fishes.: III. Relations Among Food, Body Size, and Growth Efficiency. *Journal of the Fisheries Board of Canada*, 23(8), 1209–1248.
- Papatryphon, E., Petit, J., Van Der Werf, H. M. G., Sadasivam, K. J., & Claver, K. (2005). Nutrient-balance modeling as a tool for environmental management in aquaculture: The case of trout farming in France. *Environmental Management*, 35(2), 161–174. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00267-004-4020-z>
- Petit, J. (1990). Water supply, treatment, and recycling in aquaculture. *Aquaculture*, 1, 63–196.
- Piper, R. G., McElwain, I. B., Orme, L. E., McCraren, J. P., Fowler, L. G., & Leonard, J. R. (1986). *Fish hatchery management*.
- Quinn, T. J., Deriso, R. B. (1999). *Quantitative fish dynamics*. Oxford University Press, Abingdon.
- Rosenthal, H., Read, P., Fernandes, T., & Miller, K. (2001). MARAQUA. The Derivation of Scientific Guidelines for the Best Environmental Practice for the Monitoring and Regulation of Marine Aquaculture in Europe. *J. Appl. Ichthyol*.
- Ross, L. G., Telfer, T. C., Falconer, L., Soto, D., & Aguilar-Manjarrez, J. (2013). *Site selection and carrying capacities for inland and coastal aquaculture*. FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Proceedings No. 21. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome.
- Samuel-Fitwi, B., Wuertz, S., Schroeder, J. P., & Schulz, C. (2012). Sustainability assessment tools to support aquaculture development. *Journal of Cleaner Production* 32, 183-192. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2012.03.037>
- Sargent, R. (1998). Verification and validation of simulation models. Proceedings of the 1998 Winter Simulation Conference, Washington, DC, 121–130. doi: 10.1109/WSC.1998.744907
- Sargent, R. (2005). Verification and validation of simulation models. Proceedings of the 2005 Winter Simulation Conference, Washington, DC, 14pp. doi: 10.1109/WSC.2005.1574246



- Sargent, R. (2011). Verification and validation of simulation models. Proceedings of the *2011 Winter Simulation Conference, Washington, DC*, 183-198. doi: 10.1109/WSC.2011.6147750
- Seginer, I., & Halachmi, I. (2008). Optimal stocking in intensive aquaculture under sinusoidal temperature, price and marketing conditions. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 39(2-3), 103-112. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2008.09.002>
- Seginer, & Ben-Asher. (2011). Optimal harvest size in aquaculture, with RAS cultured sea bream (*Sparus aurata*) as an example. *Aquacultural Engineering*.
- Selong, J. H., & Helfrich, L. A. (1998). Impacts of trout culture effluent on water quality and biotic communities in Virginia headwater streams. *Progressive Fish-Culturist*, 60(4), 247-262. [https://doi.org/10.1577/1548-8640\(1998\)060<0247:iotceo>2.0.co;2](https://doi.org/10.1577/1548-8640(1998)060<0247:iotceo>2.0.co;2)
- Silvert, W. (1994). Simulation models of finfish farms. *Journal of Applied Ichthyology*, 10(4), 349-352. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1439-0426.1994.tb00176.x>
- Silvert, W., & Moustakas, A. (2011). The impacts over time of marine protected areas: A null model. *Ocean and Coastal Management*, 54(4), 312-317. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ocecoaman.2010.12.011>
- Sindilariu, P.-D. (2007). Reduction in effluent nutrient loads from flow-through facilities for trout production: a review. *Aquaculture Research*, 38(10), 1005-1036. doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2109.2007.01751.x
- Soderberg, R. W. (1992). Linear Fish Growth Models for Intensive Aquaculture. *The Progressive Fish-Culturist*, 54(4), 255-258. [https://doi.org/10.1577/1548-8640\(1992\)054<0255:LFGMFI>2.3.CO;2](https://doi.org/10.1577/1548-8640(1992)054<0255:LFGMFI>2.3.CO;2)
- Solomon, F. (2009). Impacts of copper on aquatic ecosystems and human health. *Mining.com Magazine*, (January), 25-28. Retrieved from [https://yukonwaterboard.ca/registers/quartz/qz08-084/Volumes 9-11/5.0/5.2.1.pdf](https://yukonwaterboard.ca/registers/quartz/qz08-084/Volumes%209-11/5.0/5.2.1.pdf)
- Soon, J. M., Baines, R., & Seaman, P. (2012). Meta-analysis of food safety training on hand hygiene knowledge and attitudes among food handlers. *Food Protection*, 75(4), 793-804.
- Steinarsson, A. (2013). Growth curve modeling (GCM) and possible application in fish stocking assessment. ICES CM 2013/H:42. Paper presented at *ICES Annual Science Conference 2013*. 23-27 September 2013. Reykjavík, Iceland. Retrieved from <http://www.ices.dk/sites/pub/CM%20Documents/CM-2013/Theme%20Session%20H%20contributions/H4213.pdf>

- Stigebrandt, A. (2011). Carrying capacity: general principles of model construction. *Aquaculture Research*, 42, 41–50. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2109.2010.02674.x>
- Stringfellow, W. T., Hanlon, J. S., Borglin, S. E., & Quinn, N. W. (2008). Comparison of wetland and agriculture drainage as sources of biochemical oxygen demand to the San Joaquin River, California. *Agricultural Water Management*, 95(5), 527–538.
- Sun, R., & Chen, L. (2012). How can urban water bodies be designed for climate adaptation? *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 105(1–2), 27–33. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landurbplan.2011.11.018>
- Tabachnick, B. G., & Fidell, L. S. (2001). *Using Multivariate Statistics*. 966 pp. Allyn and Bacon, Needham Heights. <https://doi.org/10.1037/022267>
- Tavakoli, S., Mousavi, A., & Posland, S. (2012). Input Variable Selection in Real-time Knowledge Integration Applications: A Review, Analysis, and Recommendation Paper. *Advanced Engineering Informatics*, 27(4), 519–536. 27(4), 519–536.
- Taylor, T. N. (2016). *Carrying Capacity: A Concept for Guiding Brook Trout stocking on Owhi Lake, WA*. PhD thesis, Washington State University.
- Thilsted, S.H., Thorne-Lyman, A., Webb, P., Bogard, J.R., Subasinghe, R., Phillips, M.J., & Allison E.H. (2016). Sustaining healthy diets: The role of capture fisheries and aquaculture for improving nutrition in the post-2015 era. *Food Policy* 61, 126–131. [doi.org/10.1016/j.foodpol.2016.02.005](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodpol.2016.02.005)
- Thu, T. T. N. ., & Lebailly, P. (2017). On Sustainable Aquaculture. *Oceanography E Fisheries*, 1(3), 1–2.
- Timmons, M. B., & Ebeling, J. M. (2012). Chapter 11 *Recirculating Aquaculture Systems*. *Aquaculture*. In J. H. Tidwell (ed) *Aquaculture Production Systems*. [doi.org/10.1002/9781118250105.ch11](https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118250105.ch11)
- Timmons, M., & Ebeling, J. (2007). *Recirculating aquaculture*. Northeastern Regional Aquaculture Center Publication No. 401-2010. Cayuga Aqua Ventures, Ithaca.
- Timmons, M., Ebeling, J., Wheaton, F., Summerfelt, S., & Vinci, J. (2002). *Recirculating aquaculture systems*. (2<sup>nd</sup> ed). Northeastern Regional Aquaculture Center Publication No. 01-002. Cayuga Aqua Ventures, Ithaca.
- Tisdell, C. (1999). Overview of environmental and sustainability issues in aquaculture. *Aquaculture Economics & Management*, 3(January 2015), 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13657309909380228>

- Tucker, C., & S. L. (1985). Water quality in streams and channel catfish (*Ictalurus punctatus*) ponds in west-central Mississippi. *Forestry Experiment Station Research Report*, (10), 1–4.
- Udeigwe, T. K., & Wang, J. J. (2010). Biochemical oxygen demand relationships in typical agricultural effluents. *Water, Air, and Soil Pollution*, 213(1–4), 237–249. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-010-0381-5>
- Uphoff, C. S., Schoenebeck, C. W., Hoback, W. W., Koupal, K. D., & Pope, K. L. (2013). Degree-day accumulation influences annual variability in growth of age-0 walleye. *Fisheries Research*, 147, 394–398. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2013.05.010>
- Valenti, W.C., Kimpara, J.M., Pretoc, B. de L., & Moraes-Valenti, P. 2018. Indicators of sustainability to assess aquaculture systems. *Ecological Indicators* 88, 402-413.
- Van Der Have, T. M., & De Jong, G. (1996). Adult size in ectotherms: Temperature effects on growth and differentiation. *Journal of Theoretical Biology*, 183(3), 329–340. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jtbi.1996.0224>
- Viadero, R. C., Cunningham, J. H., Semmens, K. J., & Tierney, A. E. (2005). Effluent and production impacts of flow-through aquaculture operations in West Virginia. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 33(4), 258–270. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2005.02.004>
- Wang, Y. (2006). *Model and Software Development for Predicting Fish Growth in Trout Raceways for Predicting Fish Growth in Trout Raceways*. PhD thesis, West Virginia University.
- Wang, Turton, Semmens, & Borisova. (2008). Raceway design and simulation system (RDSS): An event-based program to simulate the day-to-day operations of multiple-tank raceways. *Aquacultural Engineering*, 39(2–3), 59–71. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2008.06.002>
- Westers, H. (1981). *Fish culture manual for the state of Michigan*. Michigan Department of Natural Resources. Lansing, Michigan:
- White, P., Phillips, M., & Beveridge, M. (2013). Review of Environmental Impact, Site Selection and Carrying Capacity Estimation for Small-scale Aquaculture in Asia. *Site Selection and Carrying Capacities for Inland and Coastal Aquaculture*, 231–251. Retrieved from <ftp://ftp.fao.org/fi/Cdrom/P21/root/15.pdf>
- Wu, F. C., Tseng, R. L., & Juang, R. S. (2001). Kinetic modeling of liquid-phase adsorption of reactive dyes and metal ions on chitosan. *Water Research*, 35(3), 613–618. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0043-1354\(00\)00307-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0043-1354(00)00307-9)

- Wu, R. S. S., Shin, P. K. S., MacKay, D. W., Mollowney, M., & Johnson, D. (1999). Management of marine fish farming in the sub-tropical environment: a modelling approach. *Aquaculture*, 174(3–4), 279–298. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486\(99\)00024-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0044-8486(99)00024-1)
- Wurts, W. A. (2000). Sustainable Aquaculture in the Twenty-First Century. *Reviews in Fisheries Science*, 8(2), 141–150. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10641260091129206>
- Yeo, S. E., Binkowski, F. P., & Morris, J. E. (2004). Aquaculture Effluents and Waste By-Products Characteristics, Potential Recovery, and Beneficial Reuse. NCRAC Publications Office, North Central Regional Aquaculture Center, Iowa State University.
- Zhang, S., Li, Y., Zhang, T., & Peng, Y. (2015). An integrated environmental decision support system for water pollution control based on TMDL—A case study in the Beiyun River watershed. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 156, 31–40.
- Zou, R., Carter, S., Shoemaker, L., Parker, A., & Henry, T. (2006). Integrated Hydrodynamic and Water Quality Modeling System to Support Nutrient Total Maximum Daily Load Development for Wissahickon Creek, Pennsylvania. *Journal of Environmental Engineering*, 132(4), 555–566. [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)0733-9372\(2006\)132:4\(555\)](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0733-9372(2006)132:4(555))