



**UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA**

***CRYSTALLIZATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF STRUVITE  
CRYSTALS THROUGH GEL GROWTH TECHNIQUE***

**AHMAD SALSABILI**

**FK 2017 68**



**CRYSTALLIZATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF STRUVITE  
CRYSTALS THROUGH GEL GROWTH TECHNIQUE**

By

**AHMAD SALSABILI**

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in  
Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

**August 2017**

## **COPYRIGHT**

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



## DEDICATION

Dedicated to my beloved parents, lovely wife and cute daughter.



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

## **CRYSTALLIZATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF STRUVITE CRYSTALS THROUGH GEL GROWTH TECHNIQUE**

By

**AHMAD SALSABILI**

**August 2017**

**Chairman : Associate Professor Mohamad Amran b. Mohd Salleh, PhD**  
**Faculty : Engineering**

Crystal growth or crystallization is defined as controlled phase or state change to solid state. This state transition might happen from any state of matter, liquid, gas or solid to solid state which are crystals. Crystalline materials produced through chemical reaction in any media can readily be controlled in order to increase the crystal size, yield and change the crystals morphology. However, the gel media is known to be one of the best media for investigating the effects of different operational parameters on crystals size, morphology, yield and purity so far.

Magnesium ammonium phosphate hexahydrate ( $\text{MgNH}_4\text{PO}_4 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ) which is better known as struvite, is one of the most fascinating inorganic phosphate compounds. There are several reasons associated with the study of struvite crystals. First of all, it is one of most popular scale deposits in wastewater treatment plants. Second of all, struvite is known as one of the major components of urinary calculi.

Crystallization and characterization of struvite crystals grown in gel media has been carried out in the current study. Struvite crystals were grown in two different gels of gelatin and silica gel using both single and double diffusion crystallization techniques. The pH ranged from 6 to 9 for silica gel and gelatin. Different gel densities were practiced ranging from 1.04 to 1.08 for silica gel and 1.04 to 1.11 for gelatin. Totally the crystals grown in silica gel had more variety of morphologies and the silica gel itself demonstrated less number of limitations compare to gelatin gel. Crystals with prismatic, pyramidal, dendritic, star shaped and branched star shaped morphologies were grown through this technique mainly in silica gel. The grown crystals in both gel media have been characterized by SEM, EDX and FTIR sets. The SEM test revealed the inner morphology, crystal size and the volume of cracks inside the crystals. EDX test proved the existence of comprising elements, namely phosphorous, oxygen and magnesium. The FTIR test revealed the internal chemical bonds of N-H, O-H, P-O, water of crystallization and metal-

oxygen bonds. The FTIR results are presented and compare to other studies carried out formerly.

The harvested struvite crystals grown within different operational conditions were analyzed by powder X-ray diffraction (XRD) set. The crystal size was calculated based on Scherrer equation which ranged from 27.9124 to 32.5919 nm. It has been found that struvite crystallizes in the orthorhombic (single-phase) Pmn21 space group with unit cell parameters:  $a = 6.9550 \text{ \AA}$ ,  $b = 6.1420 \text{ \AA}$ ,  $c = 11.218 \text{ \AA}$  and  $\alpha = \beta = \gamma = 90^\circ$ . Totally, the crystals grown in pH of 8 had larger crystal size. This was also approved by the SEM analysis showing less amount of cracks happening at this pH value.

Struvite crystal habits were analyzed using optical microscopy. All three crystals diaphaneity, transparent, translucent and opaque were noticed in the crystallization of struvite crystals in silica gel. The crystals formed in the acidic pH values (6, 6.5) demonstrated high transparency while the crystals formed at high alkaline pH values had more translucent and opaque diaphaneity. The high alkaline pH value (9) lead to the formation of Liesegang rings which is described in detail in the context.

The solubility of produced crystals were analyzed through solubility test. Proportional portions of the harvested crystals were stirred well for one day at constant rate of 400 RPM and after that dried out in the oven at 35 °C. The solubility results revealed that the minimum solubility happens for the crystals grown in gel with pH of 8 at 392 and 474 mg/l for gel SG of 1.07 and 104 respectively.

An optimization study based on Taguchi model of experiment design has been carried out and the results were announced. The effects of different combination of four process parameters of gel density, gel pH, magnesium molarity and ADP molarity on struvite crystal size were studied and the results were reported. The results of the ANOVA analysis revealed that pH was the most influential parameter in sense of producing bigger crystals with contribution percent of over 65% followed by magnesium dosage (25%), ADP molarity (7%) and gel density (1%).

The kinetics and growth mechanism of struvite crystallization in gel media has been studied in this thesis. For this purpose, both pseudo first and second-order kinetic models were applied to the experimental data. The tests were carried out on the amount of magnesium concentration changes over time and rate of struvite crystals formation assuming equamolar reaction (consumption) of 1:1:1 for Mg:NH<sub>4</sub>:PO<sub>4</sub>. The magnesium concentration was measured at certain intervals and based on the concentration reduction of magnesium, the kinetic rate constants (K<sub>1</sub>, K<sub>2</sub>) and rates of reaction (R) for samples grown in various operational conditions were calculated and reported. Based on the results of the kinetic study the experimental data better fits with second-order kinetic model with minimum and maximum R<sup>2</sup> over 97% and 99% compare to first-order kinetic model with minimum and maximum R<sup>2</sup> of 89% and 95% respectively. The obtained pseudo first and second-order rate constants can be used to explain the struvite crystallization behavior.

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**KAJIAN PENGHABLURAN DAN PENCIRIAN KRISTAL STRUVITE  
DITANAM MELALUI TEKNIK PERTUMBUHAN GEL**

Oleh

**AHMAD SALSABILI**

Ogos 2017

**Pengerusi :. Profesor Madya Mohamad Amran b. Mohd Salleh, PhD**  
**Fakulti : Kejuruteraan**

Pertumbuhan kristal atau penghabluran juga ditakrifkan sebagai fasa kawalan atau perubahan keadaan kepada keadaan pepejal. Peralihan keadaan yang mungkin berlaku dari mana-mana keadaan jirim, cecair, gas atau pepejal kepada keadaan pepejal yang kristal.

Bahan kristal dihasilkan melalui tindak balas kimia dalam mana-mana media dengan mudah boleh dikawal untuk meningkatkan saiz kristal, hasil dan perubahan morfologi kristal. Walau bagaimanapun, media gel dikenali sebagai salah satu media yang terbaik untuk mengkaji kesan parameter operasi yang berbeza pada saiz kristal, morfologi, hasil dan ketulenan setakat ini.

Magnesium ammonium fosfat heksahidrat ( $MgNH_4PO_4 \cdot 6H_2O$ ) yang lebih dikenali sebagai struvite, adalah salah satu sebatian fosfat bukan organik yang paling menarik. Terdapat beberapa sebab-sebab yang berkaitan dengan kajian kristal struvit. Pertama sekali, ia adalah salah satu kapur yang paling popular dalam rawatan loji air sisa. Kedua, struvite dikenali sebagai salah satu komponen utama kalkuli urinari.

Penghabluran dan pencirian kristal struvite ditanam di media gel telah dijalankan dalam kajian ini. Kristal struvite telah ditanam dalam dua gel yang berbeza gelatin dan gel silika menggunakan kedua-dua teknik penyebaran penghabluran tunggal dan berganda. pH adalah di antara 6-9 untuk gel silika dan gelatin. Kepadatan gel yang berbeza telah diamalkan antara 1.04-1.08 untuk gel silika dan 1.04-1.11 untuk gelatin. Secara keseluruhannya, kristal ditanam di gel silika mempunyai morfologi yang lebih pelbagai dan gel silika itu sendiri menunjukkan jumlah kekurangan yang kurang berbanding dengan gel gelatin. Kristal dengan prisma, piramid, dendritik, berbentuk bintang dan morfologi berbentuk bintang bercabang telah ditanam melalui teknik ini terutamanya dalam gel silika. Kristal di kedua-dua media gel telah dicirikan oleh set SEM, EDX dan FTIR. Ujian SEM

mendedahkan morfologi dalaman, saiz kristal dan jumlah retak dalam kristal. Ujian EDX membuktikan kewujudan unsur yang terdiri daripada fosforus, oksigen dan magnesium. Ujian FTIR mendedahkan ikatan kimia dalaman N-H, O-H, P-O, penghabluran air dan bon logam-oksigen. Keputusan FTIR dibentangkan dan dibandingkan dengan kajian lain yang dijalankan sebelum ini.

Kristal struvite dituai ditanam dalam keadaan operasi yang berbeza dianalisis dengan set serbuk pembelauan sinar-X (XRD). Saiz kristal dikira berdasarkan persamaan Scherrer yang iaitu di antara 27.9124-32.5919 nm. Ia telah didapati bahawa struvite menghablur dalam otorombik (fasa tunggal) kumpulan ruang Pmn21 dengan parameter sel unit:  $a = 6.9550 \text{ \AA}$ ,  $b = 6.1420 \text{ \AA}$ ,  $c = 11.218 \text{ \AA}$  dan  $\alpha = \beta = \gamma = 90^\circ$ . Secara keseluruhannya, kristal ditanam di pH 8 mempunyai saiz kristal yang lebih besar. Ini juga telah dibuktikan oleh analisis SEM yang menunjukkan kurang jumlah keretakan berlaku pada nilai pH ini.

Tabiat kristal struvite dianalisis dengan menggunakan mikroskop optik. Diaphaneity, ketelusan, lut dan legap ketiga-tiga kristal telah dikenalpasti dalam penghabluran kristal struvite dalam gel silika. Kristal terbentuk dalam nilai pH berasid (6, 6.5) menunjukkan ketelusan yang tinggi manakala kristal terbentuk pada nilai pH alkali yang tinggi mempunyai diaphaneity lebih lut dan legap. Nilai pH alkali yang tinggi (9) membawa kepada pembentukan cincin Liesegang yang diterangkan secara terperinci dalam konteks.

Kebolehlarutan kristal yang dihasilkan dianalisis melalui ujian kelarutan. Bahagian berkadar kristal dituai telah dikacau dengan baik untuk satu hari pada kadar malar 400 RPM dan selepas itu dikeringkan di dalam ketuhar pada suhu  $35^\circ\text{C}$ . Hasil kelarutan mendedahkan bahawa kelarutan minimum berlaku pada kristal ditanam di gel dengan pH 8 pada 392 dan 474 mg/l untuk gel SG 1.07 dan 104 masing-masing.

Satu kajian pengoptimuman berdasarkan reka bentuk eksperimen model Taguchi telah dijalankan dan keputusan telah diumumkan. Kesan kombinasi yang berbeza daripada empat parameter proses ketumpatan gel, pH gel, kemolaran magnesium dan kemolaran ADP kepada saiz kristal struvite dikaji dan keputusan telah dilaporkan. Keputusan analisis ANOVA menunjukkan bahawa pH adalah parameter yang paling berpengaruh dalam menghasilkan kristal yang lebih besar dengan sumbangan peratus lebih daripada 65% diikuti oleh dos magnesium (25%), kemolaran ADP (7%) dan ketumpatan gel (1%).

Kinetik dan mekanisme pertumbuhan penghabluran struvite dalam media gel telah dikaji dalam tesis ini. Bagi tujuan ini, kedua-dua model kinetik tertib pseudo-pertama dan kedua telah diaplikasikan ke atas data eksperimen. Ujian telah dijalankan ke atas jumlah kepekatan magnesium berubah dari masa ke masa dan kadar pembentukan kristal struvite dengan andaian reaksi sama molar (penggunaan) 1: 1: 1 untuk Mg:NH<sub>4</sub>:PO<sub>4</sub>. Kepekatan magnesium diukur pada tempoh tertentu dan berdasarkan pengurangan kepekatan magnesium, pemalar kadar kinetik (K1, K2) dan kadar tindak balas (R) untuk sampel ditanam dalam pelbagai keadaan operasi telah dikira dan dilaporkan. Berdasarkan hasil kajian kinetik data eksperimen berpadanan lebih baik dengan model kinetik tertib kedua dengan minimum dan maksimum R<sup>2</sup> lebih 97% dan 99% berbanding dengan model



kinetik tertib pertama dengan minimum dan maksimum R2 sebanyak 89% dan 95% masing-masing. Kadar pemalar tertib pseudo-pertama dan kedua yang diperolehi boleh digunakan untuk menerangkan tingkah laku penghabluran struvite.



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost the student is heartily thankful to the Almighty God for the abundant blessings and special providence fell through his work. The student expresses his deep sense of gratitude and sincere thanks to his enthusiastic supervisor Dr. Mohamad Amran Mohd Salleh, Associate Professor, Department of Chemical and Environmental Engineering who introduced me to the field of “Crystallization” particularly, the multidisciplinary research work on urinary type struvite crystals which requires integrating data, theories, methodologies, perspectives, and concepts from multiple disciplines like physics, chemistry and material science. Dr. Amran has not only guided him in the most profound manner with continuous encouragement, but also enlightened the student through his wide knowledge of intelligence and has certainly played a major role to inculcate authors scientific career and in a true sense shaped student as a true researcher.

The student is highly indebted to Prof. Robiah Bt. Yunus, Dean of school of graduate studies and one of the supervisory committee for her keen interest and for providing motivation to do research work at the very initial stage and also whole hearted wishes and encouragements during the entire work. I am also grateful to Prof. Azni b. Idris for his sincere advices and for supporting my study.

Finally, Last but not least, student would like to express his love and appreciation to his near and dear family members - a powerful source of inspiration and energy, to whom this thesis is dedicated, for their years of sacrifices and lots of prayers. The student heartily expresses his gratitude to his beloved parents Prof. Dr. Nasser Salsabili and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mansoureh Karimzadeh. Especially a big thanks to my wife Mrs. Sepide Masoudi and daughter Negar who have supported my desire to embark on a Ph.D. and provided unending moral support, great patience at all the times and love, without which it was difficult to culminate this research work.

Completion of this research work and the writing of this thesis on a full time basis has been a real challenge for the student without sacrificing day to day laboratory work research and experiments. Perhaps, if student forgot someone to acknowledge... so, just in case: thank you to whom it concerns...! For any errors or inadequacies that may remain in this work, of course, is the solely responsibility of student.

I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 25 August 2017 to conduct the final examination of Ahmad Salsabili on his thesis entitled "Crystallization and Characterization of Struvite Crystals Through Gel Growth Technique" in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

**Thomas Choong Shean Yaw, PhD**

Associate Professor Ir.  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Luqman Chuah Abdullah, PhD**

Professor  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Mohd Halim Shah bin Ismail, PhD**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Naoya Murakami, PhD**

Professor  
Kyushu Institute of Technology  
Japan  
(External Examiner)



---

**NOR AINI AB. SHUKOR, PhD**  
Professor and Deputy Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 28 September 2017

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Mohamad Amran bin Mohd Salleh, PhD**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Robiah binti. Yunus, PhD**

Professor  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Azni bin. Idris, PhD**

Professor  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

---

**ROBIAH BINTI YUNUS, PhD**

Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

### **Declaration by graduate student**

I hereby confirm that:

- this thesis is my original work;
- quotations, illustrations and citations have been duly referenced;
- this thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any other institutions;
- intellectual property from the thesis and copyright of thesis are fully-owned by Universiti Putra Malaysia, as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- written permission must be obtained from supervisor and the office of Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and Innovation) before thesis is published (in the form of written, printed or in electronic form) including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture notes, learning modules or any other materials as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- there is no plagiarism or data falsification/fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) and the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name and Matric No.: Ahmad Salsabili, GS33299

**Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee**

This is to confirm that:

- the research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervision;
- supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) are adhered to.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of  
Chairman of  
Supervisory  
Committee

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of  
Member of  
Supervisory  
Committee

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of  
Member of  
Supervisory  
Committee

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
	<b>ABSTRACT</b>	i
	<b>ABSTRAK</b>	iii
	<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	vi
	<b>APPROVAL</b>	vii
	<b>DECLARATION</b>	ix
	<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	xiv
	<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xvi
	<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	xix
<b>CHAPTER</b>		
<b>1</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	1
	1.1 Background information	1
	1.2 Problem statement	3
	1.3 Research questions	4
	1.4 Objectives of the study	5
	1.5 Significance of study	6
	1.6 Thesis plan	6
<b>2</b>	<b>LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	9
	2.1 Introduction	9
	2.2 Crystal growth techniques	9
	2.3 Mechanisms of crystallization	11
	2.3.1 Nucleation	11
	2.3.2 Crystal growth	12
	2.4 Factors affecting crystal growth	14
	2.5 Gel-growth technique	14
	2.5.1 Fundamentals of crystallization in gel media	15
	2.5.2 Types of gels	17
	2.5.3 Gelling mechanism	20
	2.5.4 Classification of gel growth methods	21
	2.5.5 Liesegang ring	21
	2.5.6 Advantages and limitations of gel growth technique	22
	2.5.7 Gel growth as a simplified <i>in vitro</i> model	23
	2.5.8 Parameters affecting struvite crystallization process	25
	2.6 Characterization of struvite crystals	27
	2.7 Struvite crystallization through gel-growth technique	27
	2.7.1 Struvite	27
	2.7.2 Struvite chemistry	30
	2.7.3 The history of struvite crystallization in gel media	33
	2.7.4 Struvite as slow release fertilizer	37
	2.7.5 Struvite as a component of urinary calculi	39
	2.7.6 Spontaneous formation of struvite in wastewater treatment plants	40
	2.8 Morphology and crystal size of struvite crystals	42
	2.8.1 Apparent size	43

	2.8.2	Diaphaneity of struvite crystals	43
	2.8.3	Effects of different operational conditions on struvite morphology	44
	2.8.4	Struvite crystals and pellet size	45
2.9		Dissolution	46
	2.9.1	Rate of dissolution	47
	2.9.2	Parameters affecting Dissolution rate	48
	2.9.3	Solubility	49
2.10		Taguchi optimization technique	49
2.11		Kinetics of struvite formation	50
	2.11.1	Nelson model	52
<b>3</b>		<b>MATERIALS AND METHODS</b>	<b>53</b>
	3.1	Process description	53
	3.2	Materials and equipment	53
	3.2.1	Glassware	53
	3.2.2	Gels	54
	3.3	Chemicals	57
	3.3.1	Sodium meta-silicate (SMS)	58
	3.3.2	Ammonium dihydrogen phosphate (ADP)	58
	3.3.3	Magnesium	58
	3.4	Terminology	59
	3.4.1	Specific gravity	59
	3.4.2	Molar ratio	60
	3.4.3	Supersaturation	60
	3.4.4	Equilibrium concentration	60
	3.5	Struvite crystals' harvesting, drying and storage	61
	3.6	Analytical methods and characterization techniques	62
	3.6.1	Magnesium Concentration (AAS)	62
	3.6.2	X-ray diffraction (XRD)	63
	3.6.3	Scanning electron microscopy (SEM)	64
	3.6.4	Energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDX, EDAX or EDS)	64
	3.6.5	Fourier transform infrared spectroscopy (FTIR)	65
	3.7	Solubility study	67
	3.7.1	Struvite solubility test	68
	3.8	Optimization study	68
	3.8.1	Taguchi	68
	3.9	Derivation of model – Kinetic model	71
<b>4</b>		<b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS</b>	<b>73</b>
	4.1	Introduction	73
	4.2	Growth of struvite crystals	73
	4.2.1	Struvite crystallization in gelatin	73
	4.2.2	Struvite crystallization in silica gel	77
	4.2.3	Gelatin versus silica gel	78
	4.2.4	Various growth parameters	79
	4.3	Struvite crystals habits and morphology	79
	4.3.1	Morphology	79
	4.3.2	Diaphaneity	87



4.3.3	Number density	88
4.3.4	Apparent size	90
4.4	Characterization of grown crystals	90
4.4.1	Powder X-ray diffraction study and results	91
4.4.2	SEM/EDX study and results	97
4.4.3	Fourier transform infrared spectroscopy (FT-IR) study and results	101
4.5	Solubility Study	106
4.6	Optimization study	108
4.6.1	Analysis of Variance (ANOVA)	111
4.7	Kinetic model results and discussions	115
4.7.1	First-order kinetic model	115
4.7.2	Second-order kinetic model	120
4.7.3	Effects of gel specific gravity	124
4.7.4	Effects of supersaturation	124
4.7.5	Effects of pH	124
<b>5</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>126</b>
5.1	General conclusions	126
5.2	Recommendations for future studies	127
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>128</b>
	<b>APPENDICES</b>	<b>150</b>
	<b>BIODATA OF STUDENT</b>	<b>153</b>
	<b>LIST OF PUBLICATIONS</b>	<b>154</b>

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table</b>		<b>Page</b>
2.1	Pioneer researches in each category of crystallization	10
2.2	Main phosphates crystalline components of urinary calculi	24
2.3	Different crystals classes and axis systems	29
2.4	Struvite mineralogical properties	33
2.5	Gelatin versus silica gel	35
2.6	Natarajan et al., experiments	36
2.7	Sundaramoorthi and Kalainathan experiments	36
2.8	Chauhan et al., experiments	38
3.1	Operational conditions for struvite crystallization in gelatin	56
3.2	Operational conditions for struvite crystallization in silica gel	57
3.3	Different sources of magnesium used for struvite crystallization	59
4.1	Struvite crystallization in silica gel versus gelatin gel in this study	78
4.2	Various operational conditions used in this study for the of struvite	79
4.3	Comparing struvite crystal sizes between struvite grown through this crystallization technique in this study and other studies	91
4.4	Comparing the unit cell parameters obtained from this study with other studies	93
4.5	Struvite crystal size obtained from Scherrer equation at different operational conditions	96
4.6	SEM/EDX results of struvite crystals grown in silica gel with densities at different gel different zoom levels	99
4.7	Mg:P molar ratios based on EDX results	100
4.8	Assignments of absorption bands in the FT-IR spectrum of struvite	103
4.9	Solubility test results for struvite grown in silica gel at various operational conditions	107
4.10	Experimental layout for the four process conditions using $L_9$ orthogonal array	109
4.11	Struvite crystal size calculated based on Scherrer equation (optimization study)	110
4.12	Analysis of variances (ANOVA) results (optimization study)	112
4.13	Average size of struvite crystals considering different levels of varying operational conditions	112
4.14	Factors total contribution and expected/obtained optimum crystal size	114

4.15	AAS results of magnesium concentration variation over time regarding different operational conditions (Kinetic study)	116
4.16	Sample constant rate and reaction rate calculation table (SG 1.04, pH 7)	119
4.17	Sample constant rate and reaction rate calculation table (SG 1.04, pH 7)	123



## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
2.1	Types of nucleation	11
2.2	Idealization of a growing crystal surface	13
2.3	SEM micrographs of gels from sodium metasilicate solutions at different zoom levels of (a) 26K and (b) 660	16
2.4	Single and double diffusion techniques	17
2.5	Polymerization of mono-silicic acid	19
2.6	Classification of gel growth methods	21
2.7	Parameters affecting the Liesegang ring formation	22
2.8	Various techniques employed for the analysis of urinary type struvite	28
2.9	Sample unit cell	29
2.10	Struvite versus gel growth, search popularity on (a) Google trends. Search-popularity of (b) gel growth, (c) struvite terms by country.	30
2.11	Structural units of struvite crystal	32
2.12	Struvite crystal structure	32
2.13	Struvite mineral photographs.	33
2.14	Struvite type kidney stones	39
2.15	Struvite spontaneous formation in wastewater treatment plant	41
2.16	Different morphology of struvite crystals. (a) pyramidal, (b) star shape poly crystal, (c) Branched dendritic, (d) rectangular platelet and (e) dendritic.	43
2.17	Different diaphaneity of prismatic type struvite crystals. (a) transparent, (b) translucent, (c) opaque	44
2.18	Particle size versus surface area	45
2.19	Dissolution of a particle based on the diffusion layer model by Nernst and Brunner	47
3.1	Flowchart of the methods followed in this study	54
3.2	Gelatin gel preparation with different specific gravities	56
3.3	Drying sheets used after crystals harvesting and rinse	61
3.4	Samples prepared for AAS test (Kinetic study)	63
3.5	Crystals coating set	65
3.6	SEM-EDX set	66
3.7	FT-IR set used for the analysis of the crystals in this study	67
3.8	Solubility test, sample preparation and the oven set used.	69

3.9	Process parameters and their different levels	70
4.1	(a) Struvite crystals in gelatin (SG 1.06) 4 days after Mg addition, pH 7.5; (b) Struvite crystals in gelatin, 10 days after Mg addition pH 6.5.	74
4.2	Magnesium hydroxide formation at the gel-solution interface. (a) pH 8, (b) pH 9, (c) pH 11, all after 10 days of Mg addition	75
4.3	Harvested struvite crystals grown in gelatin (a) single, (b) Double diffusion technique	75
4.4	Struvite crystals pictures grown in gelatin captured by SEM. (a) 35 times bigger; (b) 200 times bigger	77
4.5	EDX results for struvite crystals grown in gelatin through (a) double diffusion and (b) single diffusion	77
4.6	Various morphologies of struvite crystals grown in silica gel. (a) Prismatic, (b) agglomerated pyramidal, (c) dendritic, (d) star shaped dendritic.	80
4.7	Crystal's thickness at different depths. (a) SG 1.07, pH 8.5, Mg 1M, (b) SG 1.05, pH 7, Mg 2M.	80
4.8	Crystal's growth at SG of 1.05, pH of 7.5 and magnesium molarity of (a) 1M, (b) 2M.	81
4.9	Struvite crystals with prismatic and pyramidal morphology formed at pH of 6 and magnesium molarity of 2M with gel density of (a) 1.03, (b) 1.04, (c) 1.07, (d) 1.08.	82
4.10	Recrystallization of struvite crystals in samples with SG of 1.05 and pH of 7 at (a) 7 days (b) 30 days and in samples with SG of 1.08 and pH of 7.5 at (c) 7 days and (d) 30 days after magnesium addition.	83
4.11	Struvite crystals with dendritic and star shape morphology grown at pH value of 7.5, magnesium molarity of 2M and at specific gravity of (a) 1.05, (b) 1.06, (c) 1.07, (d) 1.08.	84
4.12	Struvite crystals grown at SG 1.04, pH 8 with (a) 1M Mg and (b) 2M Mg....	84
4.13	Struvite crystals grown at SG 1.08, pH 8 with (a) 1M Mg and (b) 2M Mg....	84
4.14	Struvite crystals grown at SG 1.06, pH 8.5 with (a) 1M Mg and (b) 2M Mg.	85
4.15	Struvite crystals grown at SG 1.05, pH 9 with (a) 1M Mg and (b) 2M Mg....	86
4.16	Struvite crystals grown at SG 1.06, pH 9 with (a) 1M Mg and (b) 2M Mg....	86
4.17	Liesegang ring formation in U-shaped tubes, with SG 1.06, pH 9.	87
4.18	Differenr struvite crystals' diaphaneity, (a) Transparent, (b) Translucent, (c) Opaque.	88
4.19	Number density vs magnesium dosage in samples formed at gel with density of 1.04 and pH of 8 with (a) 1M magnesium and (b) 2M magnesium solutions	89
4.20	Number density vs magnesium dosage n samples formed at gel with density of 1.07 and pH of 7.5 with (a) 1M magnesium and (b) 2M magnesium solutions	89

4.21	Struvite crystals's apparent size, (a) dendritic shape, (b) prismatic shape and (c) star shaped dendritic.	90
4.22	The XRD spectrum of the biggest crystal size reported.	92
4.23	XRD results of samples grown in silica gel at (a) 1M and (b) 2M Mg molarity	94
4.24	Struvite crystals (a) main peaks and (b), (c) peaks match with standards	95
4.25	Struvite crystal size obtained from Scherrer equation at different operational conditions	96
4.26	SEM picture of struvite crystals grown in gel with SG 1.04 and pH 8	98
4.27	Struvite crystals formed at pH of 6 in (a) silica gel, (b) gelatin	101
4.28	SEM pictures of (a) prismatic, (b) dendritic struvite crystal grown in silica gel at pH of 7.	101
4.29	SEM picture of crack in struvite crystal grown in gel with SG 1.04 and pH of 7.5.	102
4.30	FT-IR spectrum of struvite crystals grown in silica gel at gel with pH of 7.5 and 1.04 density.	104
4.31	FT-IR spectrum of struvite crystals grown in gelatin at gel with pH of 7 and 1.04 density	105
4.32	Struvite solubility at different pH values	108
4.33	Struvite crystals apparent size with SG 1.04 at pH 7.5 and Mg 1M within 10 days	110
4.34	Struvite crystals apparent size with SG 1.04 at pH 7.5 and Mg 2M within 10 days	111
4.35	Significant factor and interaction influences	113
4.36	Multiple graphs of main effects	113
4.37	Average effects of pH as the most influential factor	114
4.38	$\ln(C_t - C_{eq})$ versus time (for determination of kinetic constant (K))	117
4.39	Kinetic constant (K) versus the initial gel pH	118
4.40	Initial and average rate of reaction versus the initial pH	120
4.41	$1/(S_t - 1)$ versus time (for determination of kinetic constant (K <sub>2</sub> ))	121
4.42	Kinetic constant (K <sub>2</sub> ) versus the initial gel pH	122
4.43	Initial and average rate of reaction	123

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

MAP	Magnesium Ammonium Phosphate
XRD	X-ray Powder Diffraction
XRF	X-ray Fluorescence
FTIR	Fourier Transform Infrared Spectroscopy
SEM	Scanning Electron Microscopy
EDX	Energy-dispersive X-ray Spectroscopy
SMS	Sodium meta-silicate
ADP	Ammonium Dihydrogen Phosphate
SG	Specific Gravity
IUPAC	International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry
JCPDS	Joint committee of powder diffraction standards
EDTA	Ethylenediaminetetraacetic Acid
FWHM	Full Width at Half Maximum
SLR	Single-lens Reflex Camera
DSLR	Digital Single-lens Reflex Camera
ASTM	American Society for Testing and Materials
$\theta$	Bragg's angle
b	Full wave half width maximum
t	Crystals size (Calculated based on Scherrer equation)
Å	Angstrom (one hundred-millionth of centimeter, $10^{-10}$ meter)

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 Background information

Crystallization is considered as one of the most important unit operations in chemical industries where solids with desired physical and chemical properties are separated from a solution, gas or even solid (Ariyanto, 2013). Crystal growth techniques are numerous. They range from such simple and inexpensive processes to complicated and expensive processes (Robert S. Feigelson, 2004). The time of crystallization also might take from minutes, hours or days to months and years. The applications of crystallization are so vast from fertilizer industry to pharmaceuticals and catalyst.

Crystal growth or crystallization is also defined as controlled phase or state change to solid state. This state transition might happen from any state of matter, liquid, gas or solid to solid state which are crystals. These crystal growth techniques are named melt growth, vapor growth and solid growth respectively. However, in most systems of interest crystallization is the separation of salt from aqueous solution (Britton, 2002a; Robert S. Feigelson, 2004; Dhakal, 2008) or purification (Botsaris and Toyokura, 1997). Basically, the crystallization process happens in solution mode and means that the concentration of dissolved solid which is called solute exceeds the equilibrium (saturated) solute concentration in the solvent which is the medium in which the process happens (Mullin, 2001a; Le Corre, 2006; Le Corre et al., 2009a; Ariyanto, 2013). This sort of solution is called a supersaturated solution which will be further discussed in the following chapters of this thesis.

Generating non-equilibrium supersaturated conditions in solution can be possibly achieved through the following approaches (Mullin, 2001a):

- Changing the medium temperature
- Solvent evaporation
- Chemical reaction
- Changing the composition of the solvent
- Addition of other solutes

The method in which supersaturation is generated through chemical reaction is called precipitation. In this method, two or more reactants are mixed together in appropriate amounts to form an insoluble solid inside the mixture. Manipulating the mixture pH together with the varying the reactants concentrations are known to be the most influential parameters in both precipitation and crystallization processes.

Crystalline materials produced through chemical reaction in any media can readily be controlled in order to increase the crystal size, yield and change the crystals morphology.



However, the gel media is known to be one of the best media for investigating the effects of different operational parameters on crystals size, morphology, yield and purity so far. Gel growth technique is a technique of chemical reaction method, which enables the researchers to monitor the effects of change of different operational parameters easier and spot the optimum growth conditions. The gel growth technique is one sort of modified version of solution growth technique. In this technique, growth happens due to the reaction between two solutions in a gel medium or through achieving supersaturation by diffusion in gel media. Controlled diffusion of reactants in gel media can mimic the real condition in human body in a broad sense (Chauhan, 2011).

Single and double diffusion gel growth technique are simplified *in vitro* models of highly complex growth of urinary calculi *in vivo* (Natarajan et al., 1997a; Kanchana and Sundaramoorthi, 2008; Chauhan and Joshi, 2013). Crystallization and growing crystals with different morphologies is quite common in bio-crystallization through gel growth technique.

Magnesium ammonium phosphate hexahydrate ( $\text{MgNH}_4\text{PO}_4 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ) which is better known as struvite, is one of the most fascinating inorganic phosphate compounds. There are several reasons associated with the study of struvite crystals. First of all, it is one of the most popular scale deposits in wastewater treatment plants. Second of all, struvite is known as one of the major components of urinary calculi.

Degradation of solids in an anaerobic digestion unit in wastewater treatment plants results in releasing magnesium, ammonium and phosphate ions. These dissolved wastewater constituents can combine and react under certain physio-chemical conditions and form struvite precipitates which is commonly known as a nuisance and the source of scale deposition in wastewater treatment plants. Primarily, struvite was known by wastewater companies as something unwanted. It was known as stiff and hard to remove scale forming at points of high turbulence. Pipe walls, pumps and centrifuges are the major parts prone to fouling by struvite deposition in wastewater treatment plants. At the same time, as struvite is globally known as a slow-release fertilizer (Doyle and Parsons, 2002a; Doyle et al., 2003) which makes it a valuable and marketable byproduct in wastewater treatment industry. Predicting struvite precipitation potential is quite critical for operators and designers. The possibility of struvite removal and recovery and enhancing the struvite recovery yield encourages wastewater treatment companies to further study the struvite crystallization and precipitation. Struvite crystallization would also allow reduction of sludge volumes, hence sludge handling and disposal, compared to other phosphorous removal techniques.

Struvite was later on identified by wastewater treatment companies as a premium slow-release fertilizer (Doyle and Parsons, 2002b; Rahman et al., 2014). In addition to represent an approach of limiting phosphorous mining and representing a novel method of removal and recovery of nutrients (N, P) from wastewater streams. The composition of struvite makes it a potentially valuable and marketable product for the fertilizer industry (Ghosh et al., 1996; Barak and Stafford, 2006; El Diwani et al., 2007; Uysal et al., 2010; Karak and Bhattacharyya, 2011; Latifian et al., 2012; Rahman et al., 2013a;

Rahman et al., 2014). NPK (nitrogen phosphate potash) fertilizer is known globally as a good and reliable fertilizer due to the concurrent presence of nitrogen phosphorous and potassium elements (Saïdou et al., 2003). Struvite as a fertilizer has two of these three elements which are quite vital for the growing plants and crops, nitrogen and phosphorus in the form of ammonium and phosphate respectively. As it contains essential nutrients that plants need, therefore, it can be readily used as fertilizer (Britton, 2009; Rahman et al., 2013b).

Besides the useful fertilizer properties of struvite, there are other reasons associated with the study of struvite crystals. First of all, it is one of most popular scale deposits in wastewater treatment plants. Second of all, in an entirely different scenario struvite is known as one of the major components of urinary calculi. Majority of urinary calculi are composed of phosphates and calcium salts (Terai et al., 1996; Minevich, 2001; Chou et al., 2007; Wisener et al., 2010; Bindhu and Thambi, 2012; Fry, 2013; Komyakov et al., 2013). Struvite is also one of the major components of urinary calculi (Terai et al., 1996; Bernardo and Smith, 2000; Bindhu and Thambi, 2012; Chauhan and Joshi, 2013; Honey et al., 2013). Struvite stones are normally formed inside both human and animals kidneys. It is also known as urine sand or urease stone by physicians. Struvite stones are known as infection stones as they mainly happen due to the urinary tract infections. Growing struvite stones in gel media is suggested as the best technique to mimic the growth conditions occurring in a human body in a simplified approach. C. K. Chauhan et. al. (Chauhan, 2011; Chauhan and Joshi, 2013) declared that the gel growth technique is the best and most suitable technique for the development and study of the struvite crystals in order to simulate the real conditions and environment of kidney tissue (Banks et al., 1973; Kanchana and Sundaramoorthi, 2008; Chauhan et al., 2009b; Chauhan, 2011). As mentioned, Struvite features and characteristics like fertilizer properties, being urinary calculi major components and as scale deposits in the wastewater treatment plant in conjunction with its crystallization in gel media make their study quite precious.

## 1.2 Problem statement

Nowadays, there are plenty of fertilizers known with different characteristics. Ghosh et.al (1996) carried out several comparative studies between struvite as fertilizer and other well-known fertilizers such as urea, formaldehyde, superphosphate and ammonium nitrate. Within his studies he concluded that struvite responded much better (even double) than other fertilizers like superphosphate.

Magnesium ammonium phosphate hexahydrate i.e. struvite, is globally known as a fertilizer (Barak and Stafford, 2006; Latifian et al., 2012; Rahman et al., 2013a; Mukhlesur Rahman et al., 2013). However the rate of leaching loss together with the crystal size of the struvite crystals are the two main factors which determine the final level of suitability of struvite as a fertilizer. The lower the leaching rate means the longer the fertilizer would last (Bizier and DeBarry, 2004; Latifian et al., 2012; Liu et al., 2012; Rahman et al., 2013a; Rahman et al., 2014). The more the crystal last means the longer the plant will receive essential nutrients for growth purposes (Ghosh et al., 1996; Barak and Stafford, 2006; Rahman et al., 2013a).

Besides, struvite crystal size plays an important role in the stability and mechanical strength of the struvite as final product (Mullin, 2001a; Hanhoun et al., 2013; Rudolph, 2015) . The stronger crystals with higher mechanical strength will demonstrate better stability in contact with water as solution medium. Le Corre et al., (2006; 2009b) declared that the tiny crystals are normally washed off during the harvesting step. They concluded that particle (group of crystals) size plays an important role in the final quality of harvested crystals. So far, there is no comprehensive dissolution study of struvite crystals grown through gel growth technique. Subsequently there is no detailed comparison between the solubility results of struvite crystals grown through other techniques and those grown in gel media.

Moreover, surface area has direct relation with dissolution rate, as increasing the effective surface area increases the dissolution rate (Nyvlt et al., 1985; Mullin, 2001a; Myerson, 2002; Ariyanto, 2013).

The main gap here, which became the main motivation to study the crystallization of struvite crystals in gel media was, firstly the importance of studying and investigating struvite crystallization in gel media, secondly to determine the optimum and most influential operational conditions leading to longer lasting fertilizer (lower solubility) and finally running a comprehensive kinetic study on the struvite crystallization in gel media. Last but not the least, the gel growth technique itself provides a 3-dimensional spatial matrices which enables the single crystals to grow mature enough and reach their optimum size. It provides an ambient which increases crystallization and minimizes the sedimentation and precipitation. Compare to other crystallization techniques, as gel growth technique minimizes or in most cases eliminates the convective transport, better crystalline products are expected.

So far, there is no comprehensive study over the participating process parameters in the crystallization in gel media. Moreover, the level of their effect is not clearly known and subsequently the most effective process parameters are not known yet. Due to the mentioned reasons, it has become important to study the principles of struvite crystals solubility, nucleation and growth to evaluate the effects of various controlling parameters on struvite crystallization.

### **1.3 Research questions**

Throughout this research it has been a struggle to answer fundamental as well as practical questions regarding struvite crystallization in gel media. Struvite is globally known as a slow-release fertilizer which its properties has been studied and characterized by other researcher. However, the effects of different operational parameters on struvite crystals growth rate and size are still missing. The optimum conditions in which the biggest crystals are formed are not known yet. The lack of sufficient studies to determine the most influential parameters are quite sensible.

The majority of researches carried out on the growth of struvite crystals previously discusses the formation of struvite crystals within solution modes. As stated earlier, in the solution state mode of crystal formation, nucleation and growth rate are difficult to monitor due to the high pace of reaction. At the same time evaluating the effects of changes in operational conditions on crystallization process is also difficult to evaluate due to the rapid pace of reaction in solution mode.

There are various advantages associated with the growth of struvite crystals in gel media. For instance, it is suggested to be a suitable ambient for growing urinary type struvite crystals due to its similarities with the human kidney tissue. Moreover, gel acts as a reliable framework holding the crystals and provide them with the chance of 3D growth (in all crystal face). The technique also enables the researchers to step-by-step monitor the crystals growth. Throughout this study, it has been tried to grow struvite crystals in different gel media and characterize the resulting crystals in order to spot the best gel for growing struvite crystals.

It is struggled in this study to determine the key parameters affecting the struvite crystals formation, crystal size and morphology and spot the optimum operational conditions in which the biggest crystals with various morphologies can be grown and harvested. Hopefully, spotting the optimum operational and process conditions which leads to different types, size ranges and morphologies of struvite crystals *in vitro* might be used by other scientists to assess these experienced conditions in order to minimize or inhibit the *in vivo* formation of urinary calculi (including struvite stones).

Furthermore, through the kinetic study carried out in this research, the scientists would be enabled to have a clearer and brighter overview of the kinetics of magnesium diffusion in gel media.

#### **1.4 Objectives of the study**

The purpose of this study is to widen the understanding of struvite crystallization principles in order to improve struvite formation in terms of characteristics (shape, morphology and size). As it was stated earlier, crystal size and morphology plays an important role in fertilizer properties of struvite (Latifian et al., 2012). Moreover, the outcome of this thesis can be used by other researchers researching in the fields related to urinary tract stones. Consequently, the objectives envisaged to be achieved during the course of current study are as follows:

- To evaluate the feasibility of growing struvite crystals through gel growth technique, study and characterize their physico-chemical properties.
- To study the kinetics of struvite formation through magnesium consumption at different operational conditions using Nelson's mathematical model to predict the effluent concentration of magnesium knowing the initial value.

- To study and evaluate the most influential parameters and the optimum operational conditions for struvite crystallization process using Taguchi method.

### 1.5 Significance of study

Struvite crystallization within different media has been studied by several researchers. The resulted crystals have also been characterized for their properties. My study contributes to this literature by considering struvite crystallization in gel media.

The contribution of the current study would be of great interest to scholars in chemical and environmental engineering as well as to researchers studying the urinary calculi, particularly struvite stones formation in human body. Studies on the impacts of different operational conditions on the struvite crystals growth rate, size and morphologies plus spotting the key parameters for struvite crystallization and finding out the most suitable environment to mimic the real situation of struvite crystals' growth *in vitro* plus the kinetic study of magnesium diffusion in gel media, are the core areas of the present research in the field of crystallization and crystallography, to which my study would be significant.

So far, the majority of the researches on struvite crystallization has been carried out in aqueous mode. Throughout this research the struvite crystal size grown in different process conditions in gel media together with kinetic study of magnesium consumption in crystallization process would be investigated and discussed in details. The optimization study will enable the other scientists to have better image of the operational conditions' effects and the optimum combination of process parameters leading to bigger crystals formation. The results of this research would be presented in the form of suggestions for optimum operational conditions in sense of bigger crystal size and longer lasting fertilizer.

### 1.6 Thesis plan

This thesis contains 5 chapters, in which only the fourth chapter presents the experimental work. Each chapter opens with a slightly brief introduction section which states the whole structure and motivation of each individual chapters. Based on the conventional thesis structure set by UPM the main 5 chapters headings are, introduction, literature review, materials and methodology, results and discussions and finally the general conclusions and recommendations.

### Chapter 1: Introduction

This work begins with a brief review of the literature on fundamentals and principles of crystallization followed by struvite precipitation and crystallization. In this chapter the



brief background and purpose of the study together with the objectives, research questions and significance of the study are presented. Some of the terms used in the thesis have been briefly defined which will be discussed in detail in the subsequent chapters.

## **Chapter 2: Literature review**

The aim and purpose of this chapter is to describe the general background of the study which includes the definition of all terms used in this thesis, processes of struvite formation, common wastewater treatment options and wastewater as a novel option, short literature on urinary calculi, detailed explanation about crystallization and mechanism of nucleation and crystal growth. Current methods of phosphorous removal and recovery are named, explained, discussed and compared. Struvite formation and chemistry is discussed and the major operational conditions known to have impacts on struvite crystallization within different media is discussed as well. A detailed description is presented in this chapter on various techniques of crystallization particularly gel growth technique is described in detail. Pros and cons of crystallization in gel media are discussed and struvite crystallization in gel media are explained and its advantages and disadvantages are further discussed. Different crystallization models are introduced and briefly discussed in this chapter.

## **Chapter 3: Materials and methods**

In order to minimize the errors in the results of the crystallization experiments both experimental and analytical phases of the study must be accurately defined. Within this chapter the crystallization technique used in the study together with the whole process of experiments and analysis have been clearly described. Preparation of the reactants, preparation of all glassware, reaction dosage and technique, reaction conditions, crystals harvesting, analytical methods used for characterization of the samples together with a review on literature of each characterization technique was fully introduced and discussed in this chapter. This chapter opens with a flowchart introducing the whole procedure of the study from literature review to experimental analytical phases and finally leads to the conclusion and recommendation part. Models which were already introduced and incorporated in this study are clearly defined.

## **Chapter 4: Results and discussions**

This chapter systematically discusses all the results gained from all experiments carried out during the study. All analytical results are presented in the form of pictures, charts and diagrams and the key features are subsequently discussed. Further discussions are made over the gained results and it has been tried by the author to demonstrate the results in the form of diagrams to make them more understandable. This chapter consists of both pure and analyzed results gained from characterization sets along with the results of modelling part. Validation of results obtained from experimental phase and modelling part is the final part of this chapter. Some of the results are compared to other researchers' results in order to demonstrate the accuracy of the study.

## **Chapter 5: Conclusions and recommendations**

The general conclusions of the study based on the results of carried out experiments and tests plus the model results are presented in this chapter. Further recommendations for future studies in related fields are also presented in this final chapter.



## REFERENCES

- A. A. Chernov (1986). *Modern Crystallography III- Crystal Growth*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin
- Aage, H., Andersen, B. (1997). The solubility of struvite. *Journal of Radioanalytical...*, 223:213–215.
- Abbona, F., Boistelle, R. (1979a). Growth morphology and crystal habit of struvite crystals ( $\text{MgNH}_4\text{PO}_4 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ). *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 46:(3), 339–354.
- Abbona, F., Boistelle, R. (1979b). Growth morphology and crystal habit of struvite crystals ( $\text{MgNH}_4\text{PO}_4 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ). *J. Cryst. Growth* 46:339–354.
- Abbona, F., Christensson, F., Angela, M. F., Madsen, H. E. L. (1993). Crystal habit and growth conditions of brushite,  $\text{CaHPO}_4 \cdot 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$ . *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 131:(3–4), 331–346.
- Abbona, F., Franchini-Angela, M. (1990). Crystallization of calcium and magnesium phosphates from solutions of low concentration. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 104:(3), 661–671.
- Abbona, F., Franchini-Angela, M., Boistelle, R. (1992). Crystallization of Calcium and Magnesium Phosphates from Solutions of Medium and Low Concentrations. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 27:(1), 41–48.
- Abbona, F., Lundager Madsen, H. E., Boistelle, R. (1982a). Crystallization of two magnesium phosphates, struvite and newberyite: Effect of pH and concentration. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 57:(1), 6–14.
- Abbona, F., Lundager Madsen, H. E., Boistelle, R. (1982b). Crystallization of two magnesium phosphates, struvite and newberyite: Effect of pH and concentration. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 57:(1), 6–14.
- Abbona, F., Lundager Madsen, H. E., Boistelle, R. (1988). The final phases of calcium and magnesium phosphates precipitated from solutions of high to medium concentration. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 89:(4), 592–602.
- Abbona, F., Madsen, H. E. L., Boistelle, R. (1986). The initial phases of calcium and magnesium phosphates precipitated from solutions of high to medium concentrations. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 74:(3), 581–590.
- Adnan, A. (2002). Adnad Master Thesis October 9, 2002.
- Adnan, A., Dastur, M., Mavinic, D. S., Koch, F. A. (2004). Preliminary investigation into factors affecting controlled struvite crystallization at the bench scale. 202:195–202.
- Alemán, J. V., Chadwick, A. V., He, J., Hess, M., Horie, K., Jones, R. G., Kratochvíl,



- P., Meisel, I., Mita, I., Moad, G., Penczek, S., Stepto, R. F. T. (2007). Definitions of terms relating to the structure and processing of sols, gels, networks, and inorganic-organic hybrid materials (IUPAC Recommendations 2007). *Pure and Applied Chemistry*, 79:(10), 1801–1829.
- Ali, M. I. (2007). Struvite Crystallization in Fed-Batch Pilot Scale and Description of Solution Chemistry of Struvite. *Chemical Engineering Research and Design*, 85:(3), 344–356.
- Ali, M. I., Schneider, P. A. (2008a). An approach of estimating struvite growth kinetic incorporating thermodynamic and solution chemistry, kinetic and process description. *Chemical Engineering Science*, 63:(13), 3514–3525.
- Ali, M. I., Schneider, P. A. (2008b). An approach of estimating struvite growth kinetic incorporating thermodynamic and solution chemistry, kinetic and process description. *Chemical Engineering Science*, 63:(13), 3514–3525.
- Ali, M. I., Schneider, P. A. (2006a). A fed-batch design approach of struvite system in controlled supersaturation. *Chemical Engineering Science*, 61:(12), 3951–3961.
- Ali, M. I., Schneider, P. A. (2006b). A fed-batch design approach of struvite system in controlled supersaturation. *Chemical Engineering Science*, 61:(12), 3951–3961.
- Ali, M., Schneider, P., Hudson, N. (2005). Thermodynamics and solution chemistry of struvite. *J Indian Inst Sci*, (September), 141–149.
- Amram, K., Ganor, J. (2005). The combined effect of pH and temperature on smectite dissolution rate under acidic conditions. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 69:(10), 2535–2546.
- Andrade, A., Schuiling, R. D. (2001). The chemistry of struvite crystallization. 37–46.
- Appelo, C. A. J., Postma, D. (2004). *Geochemistry, groundwater and pollution*. CRC press
- Ariyanto, E. (2013). *Crystallisation and Dissolution Studies of Struvite in Aqueous Solutions*.
- Ariyanto, E., Sen, T. K., Ang, H. M. (2013). The influence of various physico-chemical process parameters on kinetics and growth mechanism of struvite crystallisation. *Adv Powder Technol*. doi: 10.1016/j.apr.2013.10.014
- B.F.Schwartz, M. L. S. (1999). Nonsurgical management of infection-related renal calculi. *Urol Clin N Am*, 26:765–778.
- BABIC-IVANCIC, V., Kontrec, J., Kralj, D., BRECEVIC, L. (2002). Precipitation diagrams of struvite and dissolution kinetics of different struvite morphologies. *Croatica chemica acta*, 75:(1), 89–106.

- Banakar, U. V. (1992). Pharmaceutical dissolution testing. New York
- Banks, E., Chianelli, R., Pintchovsky, F. (1973). The growth of some alkaline earth orthophosphates in gelatin gels. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 18:(2), 185–190.
- Barak, P., Stafford, A. (2006). Struvite: A Recovered And Recycled Phosphorus Fertilizer. *Proceedings of the 2006 Wisconsin Fertilizer, ...*, 45:199–204.
- Bartges, J. W., Kirk, C. A. (2006). Nutrition and lower urinary tract disease in cats. *The Veterinary clinics of North America Small animal practice*, 36:(6), 1361–76, viii.
- Battistoni, P., De Angelis, A., Pavan, P., Prisciandaro, M., Cecchi, F. (2001). Phosphorus removal from a real anaerobic supernatant by struvite crystallization. *Water Research*, 35:(9), 2167–2178.
- Baumann, S. O., Schneider, J., Sternig, A., Thomele, D., Stankic, S., Berger, T., Grönbeck, H., Diwald, O. (2015). Size Effects in MgO Cube Dissolution. *Langmuir*, 31:(9), 2770–2776.
- Ben Omar, N., Martínez-Cañamero, M., González-Muñoz, M. T., Maria Arias, J., Huertas, F. (1995). Myxococcus xanthus' killed cells as inducers of struvite crystallization. Its possible role in the biomineralization processes. *Chemosphere*, 30:(12), 2387–2396.
- Bernardo, N. O., Smith, A. D. (2000). CHEMOLYSIS OF URINARY CALCULI. *Urologic Clinics of North America*, 27:(2), 355–365.
- Bhagat, A. C., Popalghat, S. K. The Study of Crystal Growth of Struvite in Gel Media. Bhagat, A. C., Popalghat, S. K., College, J. E. S. (2013). The Study of Crystal Growth of Struvite in Gel Media. 9:(2), 283–286.
- Bhavsar, D. (2011). Growth of gel grown Lead Iodide Single Crystals: A basic study. *Archives of Applied Science Research*, 3:(3), 285–289.
- Bhuiyan, M. I. H. (2007). Investigation into struvite solubility, growth and dissolution kinetics in the context of phosphorus recovery from wastewater. University of British Columbia
- Bhuiyan, M. I. H., Mavinic, D. S., Beckie, R. D. (2008a). Nucleation and growth kinetics of struvite in a fluidized bed reactor. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 310:(6), 1187–1194.
- Bhuiyan, M. I. H., Mavinic, D. S., Beckie, R. D. (2008b). Nucleation and growth kinetics of struvite in a fluidized bed reactor. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 310:(6), 1187–1194.
- Bhuiyan, M. I. H., Mavinic, D. S., Beckie, R. D. (2007a). A solubility and thermodynamic study of struvite. *Environmental technology*, 28:(9), 1015–26.

- Bhuiyan, M. I. H., Mavinic, D. S., Beckie, R. D. (2007b). A solubility and thermodynamic study of struvite. *Environmental technology*, 28:(9), 1015–26.
- Bhuiyan, M. I. H., Mavinic, D. S., Koch, F. A. (2008c). Thermal decomposition of struvite and its phase transition. *Chemosphere*, 70:(8), 1347–56.
- Bichler, K.-H., Eipper, E., Naber, K., Braun, V., Zimmermann, R., Lahme, S. (2002). Urinary infection stones. *International Journal of Antimicrobial Agents*, 19:(6), 488–498.
- Bindhu, B., Thambi, T. A. (2012). Formation and Microanalysis Of Struvite Urinary Calculi. 2:(August), 1480–1485.
- Bisaillon, S., Tawashi, R. (1975). Growth of calcium oxalate in gel systems. *Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences*, 64:(3), 458–460.
- Bizier, P., DeBarry, P. A. (2004). World Water Congress 2003 World Water & Environmental Resources Congress 2003 and related symposia. 1 v. (various pagings) ill. (some col.), col.maps (som).
- Blesa, M. A., Morando, P. J. & Regazzoni, A. E. (1994). Chemical Dissolution of Metal Oxides, Boca Raton. CRC Press
- Boistelle, R., Abbona, F. (1981). Morphology, habit and growth of newberyite crystals ( $\text{MgHPO}_4 \cdot 3 \text{H}_2\text{O}$ ). *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 54:(2), 275–295.
- Boistelle, R., Abbona, F. (1985). Nucleation of struvite ( $\text{MgNH}_4\text{PO}_4 \cdot 6 \text{H}_2\text{O}$ ) single crystals and aggregates. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 20:(2), 133–140.
- Booker, N., Priestley, A., Fraser, I. (1999). Struvite formation in wastewater treatment plants: opportunities for nutrient recovery. *Environmental Technology*, (February 2013), 37–41.
- Borgerding, J. (1972). PHOSPHATE DEPOSITS IN DIGESTION SYSTEMS. *J. Water Pollut. Control Fed.* 44:813–819.
- Botsaris, G. D., Toyokura, K. (1997). Separation and Purification by Crystallization. American Chemical Society
- Bouropoulos, N. C., Koutsoukos, P. G. (2000). Spontaneous precipitation of struvite from aqueous solutions. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 213:(3–4), 381–388.
- Brice (1986). *Crystal Growth Process*. John Wiley, New York
- Brice (1973). *The Growth of Crystals from Liquids*. North Holland Publishing Company, Amsterdam
- Brice (1978). *Crystal Growth from Liquids at High Temperatures*. *Progress in Crystal Growth and Characterization*, I:(3), 255–288.

- Bridger, G. L., Salutsky, M. L., Starostka, R. W. (1962). Micronutrient Sources, Metal Ammonium Phosphates as Fertilizers. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 10:(3), 181–188.
- Britton, A. (2009). Crystal Green® - Struvite fertilizer recovered from wastewater.
- Britton, A. T. (2002a). Pilot scale struvite recovery trials from a full-scale anaerobic digester supernatant at the city of Penticton advanced wastewater treatment plant. (June), 169.
- Britton, A. T. (2002b). Pilot scale struvite recovery trials from a full-scale anaerobic digester supernatant at the City of Penticton Advanced Wastewater Treatment Plant. University of British Columbia
- Bruyere, F., Traxer, O., Saussine, C., Lechevallier, E. (2008). [Infection and urinary lithiasis]. *Progrès en urologie : journal de l'Association française d'urologie et de la Société française d'urologie*, 18:(12), 1015–20.
- Caddeo, G., Mukhtar, B., Ratan, H. L. (2013). E147 Recurrence of uric acid stones in patients on oral alkalinization therapy. *European Urology Supplements*, 12:(3), 79.
- Cahil, A., Šoptrajanov, B., Najdoski, M., Lutz, H. D., Engelen, B., Stefov, V. (2008). Infrared and Raman spectra of magnesium ammonium phosphate hexahydrate (struvite) and its isomorphous analogues. Part VI: FT-IR spectra of isomorphously isolated species. ions isolated in  $MKPO_4 \cdot 6H_2O$  (M=Mg; Ni) and ions isolated in  $MgNH_4AsO_4 \cdot 6H_2O$ . *Journal of Molecular Structure*, 876:(1–3), 255–259.
- Celen, I., Türker, M. (2001). Recovery of ammonia as struvite from anaerobic digester effluents. *Environmental technology*, 22:(11), 1263–72.
- Chauhan, C., Joseph, K. (2008). Growth and characterization of Struvite crystals. *Indian Journal of Pure & ...*, 46:(July), 507–512.
- Chauhan, C., Joshi, M., Vaidya, A. (2009a). Growth Inhibition of Struvite Crystals in the Presence of Herbal Extract *Boerhaavia diffusa* Linn. *American Journal of ...*, 5:(3), 170–179.
- Chauhan, C. K. (2011). Growth and Characterization of struvite and related crystals. Saurashtra University
- Chauhan, C. K., Joshi, M. J. (2008). Growth inhibition of Struvite crystals in the presence of juice of *Citrus medica* Linn. *Urological Research*, 36:(5), 265–273.
- Chauhan, C. K., Joshi, M. J. (2013). In vitro crystallization, characterization and growth-inhibition study of urinary type struvite crystals. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 362:330–337.

- Chauhan, C. K., Joshi, M. J. (2014). Growth and characterization of struvite-Na crystals. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 401:221–226.
- Chauhan, C. K., Joshi, M. J., Vaidya, a. D. B. (2011a). Growth inhibition of struvite crystals by the aqueous root extract of *Rotula aquatica*. *Indian Journal of Biochemistry and Biophysics*, 48:(3), 202–207.
- Chauhan, C. K., Joshi, M. J., Vaidya, a D. B. (2009b). Growth inhibition of struvite crystals in the presence of herbal extract *Commiphora wightii*. *Journal of materials science Materials in medicine*, 20 Suppl 1:S85-92.
- Chauhan, C. K., Vyas, P. M., Joshi, M. J. (2011b). Growth and characterization of Struvite-K crystals. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 46:(2), 187–194.
- Chen, X., Wendell, K., Zhu, J., Li, J., Yu, X., Zhang, Z. (2012). Synthesis of nano-zeolite from coal fly ash and its potential for nutrient sequestration from anaerobically digested swine wastewater. *Bioresource technology*, 110:79–85.
- Chou, Y.-H., Li, C.-C., Wu, W.-J., Juan, Y.-S., Huang, S.-P., Lee, Y.-C., Liu, C.-C., Li, W.-M., Huang, C.-H., Chang, A.-W. (2007). Urinary stone analysis of 1,000 patients in southern Taiwan. *The Kaohsiung journal of medical sciences*, 23:(2), 63–6.
- Clapham, L., McLean, R. J. C., Nickel, J. C., Downey, J., Costerton, J. W. (1990). The influence of bacteria on struvite crystal habit and its importance in urinary stone formation. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 104:(2), 475–484.
- Coe, F. L., Parks, J. H., Asplin, J. R. (1992). The pathogenesis and treatment of kidney stones. *The New England journal of medicine*, 327:(16), 1141–1152.
- Colfen, H. (2010). Biomineralization: A crystal-clear view. *Nat Mater*, 9:(12), 960–961.
- Corre, K. Le, Valsami-Jones, E. (2005). Impact of calcium on struvite crystal size, shape and purity. *Journal of crystal ...*, 283:(October), 514–522.
- D. Elwell, H. J. S. (1975). *Crystal Growth from High-Temperature Solutions*. Academic Press, London
- Dastur, M. B. (2001). Investigation into the factors affecting controlled struvite crystallization at the bench-scale. University of British Columbia
- Demirkiran, N. (2008). A study on dissolution of ulexite in ammonium acetate solutions. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 141:(1–3), 180–186.
- Deng, L., Cai, C., Chen, Z. (2007). The treatment of pig slurry by a full-scale Anaerobic-Adding Raw Wastewater-Intermittent Aeration Process. *Biosystems Engineering*, 98:(3), 327–334.
- Dhakal, S. (2008). A laboratory study of struvite precipitation for phosphorus removal from concentrated animal feeding operation wastewater.



- Doyle, J. D., Oldring, K., Churchley, J., Price, C., Parsons, S. a. (2003). Chemical Control of Struvite Precipitation. *Journal of Environmental Engineering*, 129:(5), 419–426.
- Doyle, J. D., Parsons, S. a (2002a). Struvite formation, control and recovery. *Water research*, 36:(16), 3925–40.
- Doyle, J. D., Parsons, S. A. (2002b). Struvite formation, control and recovery. *Water Research*, 36:(16), 3925–3940.
- Duan, X., Qu, M., Wang, J., Trevathan, J., Vrtiska, T., Williams, J. C., Krambeck, A., Lieske, J., McCollough, C. (2013). Differentiation of calcium oxalate monohydrate and calcium oxalate dihydrate stones using quantitative morphological information from micro-computerized and clinical computerized tomography. *The Journal of urology*, 189:(6), 2350–6.
- El Diwani, G., El Rafie, S., El Ibiari, N. N., El-Aila, H. I. (2007). Recovery of ammonia nitrogen from industrial wastewater treatment as struvite slow releasing fertilizer. *Desalination*, 214:(1–3), 200–214.
- Etter, B., Tilley, E., Khadka, R., Udert, K. M. (2011). Low-cost struvite production using source-separated urine in Nepal. *Water research*, 45:(2), 852–62.
- Fattah, K. P. (2012). Assessing Struvite Formation Potential at Wastewater Treatment Plants. *International Journal of Environmental Science and Development*, 3:(6), 548–552.
- Fattah, K. P. (2004). Pilot scale struvite recovery potential from centrate at Lulu Island Wastewater Treatment Plant. University of British Columbia
- Feng, L., Wang, H., Chen, Y., Wang, Q. (2009). Effect of solids retention time and temperature on waste activated sludge hydrolysis and short-chain fatty acids accumulation under alkaline conditions in continuous-flow reactors. *Bioresource technology*, 100:(1), 44–9.
- Fick, A. (1855). Ueber Diffusion. *Annalen der Physik*, 170:(1), 59–86.
- Frank, F. C. (1972). On the Kinematic Theory of Crystal Growth and Dissolution Processes, II. *Zeitschrift für Physikalische Chemie Zeitschrift für Physikalische Chemie*, 77:(1–6), 84–92.
- Frost, R. L., Weier, M. L., Erickson, K. L. (2004). Thermal decomposition of struvite. *Journal of Thermal Analysis and Calorimetry*, 76:(3), 1025–1033.
- Fry, C. H. (2013). The physiology and pharmacology of the urinary tract. *Surgery (Oxford)*, 31:(7), 329–336.
- G. Dhanaraj, K. Byrappa, V. Prasad, M. D. (2010). Hand book of Crystal Growth. Springer, Heidelberg

- Galbraith, S. C., Schneider, P. A. (2014). Modelling and simulation of inorganic precipitation with nucleation, crystal growth and aggregation: A new approach to an old method. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 240:124–132.
- Galbraith, S., Schneider, P. (2009). A review of struvite nucleation studies.
- García-Ruiz, J. M., Novella, M. L., Otálora, F. (1999). Supersaturation patterns in counter-diffusion crystallisation methods followed by Mach-Zehnder interferometry. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 196:(2–4), 703–710.
- Ge, H., Batstone, D. J., Keller, J. (2013). Operating aerobic wastewater treatment at very short sludge ages enables treatment and energy recovery through anaerobic sludge digestion. *Water research*, 47:(17), 6546–57.
- Gerardo, M. L., Zacharof, M. P., Lovitt, R. W. (2013). Strategies for the recovery of nutrients and metals from anaerobically digested dairy farm sludge using cross-flow microfiltration. *Water research*, 47:(14), 4833–42.
- Ghosh, G. K., Mohan, K. S., Sarkar, A. K. (1996). Characterization of soil-fertilizer P reaction products and their evaluation as sources of P for gram (*Cicer arietinum* L.). *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems*, 46:(1), 71–79.
- Gökçe, E. H., Yurdasiper, A., Korkmaz, E., Özer, Ö. (2013). A Novel Preparation Method for Organogels: High-Speed Homogenization and Micro-irradiation. *AAPS PharmSciTech*, 14:(1), 391–397.
- Green, D. (2002). 8 - Crystallizer mixing: Understanding and modeling crystallizer mixing and suspension flow A2 - Myerson, Allan S. BT - Handbook of Industrial Crystallization (Second Edition). Butterworth-Heinemann, Woburn, pp 181–199
- Griffith, D., Osborne, C. (1987). Infection (urease) stones. *Mineral and electrolyte metabolism*, 13:(4), 278–285.
- Griffith, D. P. (1978). Struvite stones. *Kidney international*, 13:372–382.
- Griffiths, P. R., De Haseth, J. A. (2007). Fourier transform infrared spectrometry. John Wiley & Sons
- Gvozdev, N. ., Petrova, E. ., Chernevich, T. ., Shustin, O. ., Rashkovich, L. . (2004). Growth and dissolution of calcium oxalate monohydrate (COM) crystals. *Journal of Optoelectronics and Advanced Materials*, 6:(1), 261–268.
- H. E. Buckley (1951). *Crystal Growth*. John Wiley, New York
- H.K. HENISCH and J.M. GARCIA-RUIZ (1986). CRYSTAL GROWTH IN GELS AND LIESEGANG RING FORMATION. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 75:195–202.

- Halberstadt, E. S., Henisch, H. K. (1968). Recent experiments on crystal growth in gels. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 3–4:363–366.
- Hanhoun, M., Montastruc, L., Azzaro-Pantel, C., Biscans, B., Frèche, M., Pibouleau, L. (2013). Simultaneous determination of nucleation and crystal growth kinetics of struvite using a thermodynamic modeling approach. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 215–216:903–912.
- Hanhoun, M., Montastruc, L., Azzaro-Pantel, C., Biscans, B., Frèche, M., Pibouleau, L. (2011). Temperature impact assessment on struvite solubility product: A thermodynamic modeling approach. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 167:(1), 50–58.
- Hao, X.-D., Wang, C.-C., Lan, L., van Loosdrecht, M. C. M. (2008). Struvite formation, analytical methods and effects of pH and Ca<sup>2+</sup>. *Water science and technology : a journal of the International Association on Water Pollution Research*, 58:(8), 1687–92.
- Harris, W. G., Wilkie, A. C., Cao, X., Sirengo, R. (2008). Bench-scale recovery of phosphorus from flushed dairy manure wastewater. *Bioresource technology*, 99:(8), 3036–43.
- Harrison, M., Johns, M., White, E., Mehta, C. (2011). Growth rate kinetics for struvite crystallisation. *Chemical Engineering ...*, 1939:3–8.
- Hartel, R. W. (2002). 13 - Crystallization in foods A2 - Myerson, Allan S. BT - Handbook of Industrial Crystallization (Second Edition). Butterworth-Heinemann, Woburn, pp 287–304
- Henisch, H. (1986). Liesegang ring formation in gels. *Journal of crystal growth*, 76:279–289.
- Henisch, H. K. (1971). Crystal Growth in Gels. *Am. J. Phys.* 39:591.
- Henisch, H. K., Dennis, J. (1965). Crystal growth. *Materials Research*, 26:493–500.
- Hesse, A., Heimbach, D. (1999). Causes of phosphate stone formation and the importance of metaphylaxis by urinary acidification: a review. *World journal of urology*, 17:(5), 308–315.
- Hirasawa, I., Nakagawa, H., Yosikawa, O., Itoh, M. (1997). Phosphate Recovery by Reactive Crystallization of Magnesium Ammonium Phosphate: Application to Wastewater. In: *Separation and Purification by Crystallization*. American Chemical Society, pp 22–267
- Honey, R. J. D., Ordon, M., Ghiculete, D., Wiesenthal, J. D., Kodama, R., Pace, K. T. (2013). A prospective study examining the incidence of bacteriuria and urinary tract infection after shock wave lithotripsy with targeted antibiotic prophylaxis. *The Journal of urology*, 189:(6), 2112–7.



- Huang, H., Chen, Y., Jiang, Y., Ding, L. (2014). Treatment of swine wastewater combined with MgO-saponification wastewater by struvite precipitation technology. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 254:418–425.
- Huang, H., Mavinic, D. S., Lo, K. V, Koch, F. a (2006). Production and basic morphology of struvite crystals from a pilot-scale crystallization process. *Environmental technology*, 27:(3), 233–45.
- Hutnik, N., Kozik, A., Mazieniczuk, A., Piotrowski, K., Wierzbowska, B., Matynia, A. (2013). Phosphates (V) recovery from phosphorus mineral fertilizers industry wastewater by continuous struvite reaction crystallization process. *Water research*, 47:(11), 3635–43.
- Iqbal, M., Bhuiyan, H., Mavinic, D. S. (2008). Assessing struvite precipitation in a pilot-scale fluidized bed crystallizer. *Environmental technology*, 29:(11), 1157–67.
- Irusan, T., Arivuoli, D., Ramasamy, P. (1990a). Growth of struvite crystals from gel. *Crystal Research and ...*, 25:(5), 104–107.
- Irusan, T., Arivuoli, D., Ramasamy, P. (1990b). Growth of struvite crystals from gel. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 25:(5), k104–k107.
- Irusan, T., Narayana Kalkura, S., Arivuoli, D., Ramasamy, P. (1993). Dendritic structures of brushite in silica gel. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 130:(1–2), 217–220.
- Jaffer, Y., Clark, T. a, Pearce, P., Parsons, S. a (2002). Potential phosphorus recovery by struvite formation. *Water research*, 36:(7), 1834–42.
- Jayaramaiah, K., Anturlikar, S., Viswanatha, G., Agadihiremath, T., Patki, P., Rafiq, M. (2013). Cystone, a well-known herbal formulation, inhibits struvite crystal growth formation in single diffusion gel growth technique. *Journal of Experimental and Integrative Medicine*, 3:(1), 51.
- Jenkins, H. (2008). Le Chatelier's Principle. *Chemical Thermodynamics at a Glance*, 160–163.
- Jones, A. G. (2002). Crystallization process systems. Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford
- Joshi, V. S., Joshi, M. J. (2003). FTIR spectroscopic, thermal and growth morphological studies of calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 38:(9), 817–821.
- Joshi, V. S., Parekh, B. B., Joshi, M. J., Vaidya, A. B. (2005). Herbal extracts of Tribulus terrestris and Bergenia ligulata inhibit growth of calcium oxalate monohydrate crystals in vitro. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 275:(1–2), e1403–e1408.
- Kabdaszli, I., Parsons, S., Tünaya, O. (2006). Effect of major ions on induction time of struvite precipitation.

- Kalkura, S. N., Vaidyan, V. K., Kanakavel, M., Ramasamy, P. (1993). Crystallization of uric acid. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 132:(3–4), 617–620.
- Kanchana, G., Sundaramoorthi, P. (2008). In vitro studies of calcium mixed minerals growth in different growth faces and semiconductor laser induced suppression of nuclei strategy. *Bulletin of Materials Science*, 31:(7), 981–985.
- Karak, T., Bhattacharyya, P. (2011). Human urine as a source of alternative natural fertilizer in agriculture: A flight of fancy or an achievable reality. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 55:(4), 400–408.
- Kawashima, Y. (2006). Solubility and Dissolution Rate. In: *Powder Technology Handbook*, Third. CRC Press,
- Kazi Fattah (2004). Pilot Scale Struvite Recovery Potential From Centrate At L U L U Island Wastewater Treatment Plant A Thesis Submitted In P A R T I A L F U L F I L M E N T Of The Requirements For The Degree Of Master Of Applied Science In The F A C U L T Y Of G R A D U A.
- Kelly, P. T., He, Z. (2014). Nutrients removal and recovery in bioelectrochemical systems: A review. *Bioresource technology*, 153:351–60.
- Khan, S. R., Glenton, P. A., Byer, K. J. (2007). Dietary oxalate and calcium oxalate nephrolithiasis. *The Journal of urology*, 178:(5), 2191–6.
- Kim, D., Kim, J., Ryu, H.-D., Lee, S.-I. (2009). Effect of mixing on spontaneous struvite precipitation from semiconductor wastewater. *Bioresource technology*, 100:(1), 74–8.
- Kirchhoff, G., Bunsen, R. (1861). LXIV. Chemical analysis by spectrum-observations. *The London, Edinburgh, and Dublin Philosophical Magazine and Journal of Science*, 22:(150), 498–510.
- Kirejczyk, J. K., Porowski, T., Filonowicz, R., Kazberuk, A., Stefanowicz, M., Wasilewska, A., Debek, W. (2014). An association between kidney stone composition and urinary metabolic disturbances in children. *Journal of pediatric urology*, 10:(1), 130–5.
- Klug, H. P., Alexander, L. E. (1954). X-ray diffraction procedures. Wiley New York
- Kofina, a. N., Koutsoukos, P. G. (2005). Spontaneous Precipitation of Struvite from Synthetic Wastewater Solutions. *Crystal Growth & Design*, 5:(2), 489–496.
- Koirtzohann, S. R. (1991). A history of atomic absorption spectroscopy from an academic perspective. *Analytical Chemistry*, 63:(21), 1024A–1031A.
- Komyakov, B., Guliev, B., Sergeev, A. V. (2013). E157 Urolithiasis in patients with neobladder. *European Urology Supplements*, 12:(3), 83.

- Kumashiro, K., H. Ishiwatari, and Y. N. (2001). A pilot plant study on using seawater as a magnesium source for struvite precipitation. *In: second international conference about P-recovery*.
- L. W. Fisher, F. L. S. (1926a). Applications of colloid chemistry to mineralogy - Part one. *American Mineralogist*, 11:124–130.
- L. W. Fisher, F. L. S. (1926b). Applications of colloid chemistry to mineralogy - Part two. *American Mineralogist*, 11:200–206.
- Lahav, O., Telzhensky, M., Zewuhn, A., Gendel, Y., Gerth, J., Calmano, W., Birmhack, L. (2013). Struvite recovery from municipal-wastewater sludge centrifuge supernatant using seawater NF concentrate as a cheap Mg(II) source. *Separation and Purification Technology*, 108:103–110.
- Latifian, M., Liu, J., Mattiasson, B. (2012). Struvite-based fertilizer and its physical and chemical properties. *Environmental Technology*, 33:(24), 2691–2697.
- Le Corre, K. S. (2006). Understanding Struvite Crystallization and Recovery. (October), 194.
- Le Corre, K. S., Valsami-Jones, E., Hobbs, P., Jefferson, B., Parsons, S. a (2007a). Struvite crystallisation and recovery using a stainless steel structure as a seed material. *Water research*, 41:(11), 2449–56.
- Le Corre, K. S., Valsami-Jones, E., Hobbs, P., Jefferson, B., Parsons, S. a (2007b). Agglomeration of struvite crystals. *Water research*, 41:(2), 419–25.
- Le Corre, K. S., Valsami-Jones, E., Hobbs, P., Parsons, S. a. (2009a). Phosphorus Recovery from Wastewater by Struvite Crystallization: A Review.
- Le Corre, K. S., Valsami-Jones, E., Hobbs, P., Parsons, S. a. (2009b). Phosphorus Recovery from Wastewater by Struvite Crystallization: A Review.
- Lee, J. E., Rahman, M. M., Ra, C. S. (2009). Dose effects of Mg and PO<sub>4</sub> sources on the composting of swine manure. *Journal of hazardous materials*, 169:(1–3), 801–7.
- Lee, S. I., Weon, S. Y., Lee, C. W., Koopman, B. (2003a). Removal of nitrogen and phosphate from wastewater by addition of bittern. *Chemosphere*, 51:(4), 265–71.
- Lee, S. I., Weon, S. Y., Lee, C. W., Koopman, B. (2003b). Removal of nitrogen and phosphate from wastewater by addition of bittern. *Chemosphere*, 51:(4), 265–71.
- Li, J., Zhang, Z., Khunjar, W., Zhao, K. (2013). Enhanced nutrient sequestration from swine wastewater using zeolite synthesized from fly ash integrated with surface amendment technique. *Fuel*, 111:57–65.

- Liu, J., Aronsson, H., Ulén, B., Bergström, L. (2012). Potential phosphorus leaching from sandy topsoils with different fertilizer histories before and after application of pig slurry. *Soil Use and Management*, 28:(4), 457–467.
- Liu, Y., Kumar, S., Kwag, J.-H., Ra, C. (2013). Magnesium ammonium phosphate formation, recovery and its application as valuable resources: a review. *Journal of Chemical Technology & Biotechnology*, 88:(2), 181–189.
- Liu, Y., Kumar, S., Kwag, J., Kim, J., Kim, J., Ra, C. (2011a). Recycle of electrolytically dissolved struvite as an alternative to enhance phosphate and nitrogen recovery from swine wastewater. *Journal of hazardous materials*, 195:175–81.
- Liu, Y., Rahman, M. M., Kwag, J.-H., Kim, J.-H., Ra, C.-S. (2011b). Eco-friendly Production of Maize Using Struvite Recovered from Swine Wastewater as a Sustainable Fertilizer Source. *Asian-Australasian Journal of Animal Sciences*, 24:(12), 1699–1705.
- M. M. Faktor, I. G. (1974). *Growth of Crystals from Vapour*. Chapman and Hall, London
- Mandel, N., Mandel, I., Fryjoff, K., Rejniak, T., Mandel, G. (2003). Conversion of calcium oxalate to calcium phosphate with recurrent stone episodes. *The Journal of urology*, 169:(6), 2026–9.
- Masuda, H., Higashitani, K. & Yoshida, H. (2006). *Powder Technology handbook*. CRC Press
- Matsumoto, K., Funaba, M. (2008). Factors affecting struvite ( $\text{MgNH}_4\text{PO}_4 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O}$ ) crystallization in feline urine. *Biochimica et biophysica acta*, 1780:(2), 233–9.
- Maurer, M., Pronk, W., Larsen, T. A. (2006). Treatment processes for source-separated urine. *Water research*, 40:(17), 3151–66.
- Mavinic, D. S., Koch, F. A., Hall, E. R., Abraham, K., Niedbala, D. (1998). Anaerobic Co-Digestion of Combined Sludges from a Bnr Wastewater Treatment Plant. *Environmental Technology*, 19:(1), 35–44.
- Maxwell Meng, M. L. S. (2005). Struvite and Staghorn calculi. In: Website of E-Medicine by WebMD. <http://www.e-medicine.com/MED/topic2834.htm>.
- McMurdie, H. F., Morris, M. C., Evans, E. H., Paretzkin, B., Wong-Ng, W., Zhang, Y., Hubbard, C. R. (1987). Standard X-ray diffraction powder patterns from the JCPDS research associateship. *Powder diffraction*, 2:(1), 41–52.
- Meenakshi Sundaram, N., Girija, E. K., Ashok, M., Anee, T. K., Vani, R., Suganthi, R. V., Yokogawa, Y., Narayana Kalkura, S. (2006). Crystallisation of hydroxyapatite nanocrystals under magnetic field. *Materials Letters*, 60:(6), 761–765.

- Meenan, P. A., Anderson, S. R., Klug, D. L. (2002). 3 - The influence of impurities and solvents on crystallization A2 - Myerson, Allan S. BT - Handbook of Industrial Crystallization (Second Edition). Butterworth-Heinemann, Woburn, pp 67–100
- Mehta, C. M., Batstone, D. J. (2013). Nucleation and growth kinetics of struvite crystallization. *Water research*, 47:(8), 2890–900.
- Mergen, A., Demirhan, M. H. (2009). Dissolution kinetics of probertite in boric acid solution. *International Journal of Mineral Processing*, 90:(1), 16–20.
- Mersmann, A. (2001). Crystallization technology handbook. Marcel Dekker, Inc., New York (N.Y.); Birkhäuser (Suisse)
- Michałowski, T., Pietrzyk, A. (2006). A thermodynamic study of struvite+water system. *Talanta*, 68:(3), 594–601.
- Mijangos, F., Kamel, M., Lesmes, G., Muraviev, D. . (2004). Synthesis of struvite by ion exchange isothermal supersaturation technique. *Reactive and Functional Polymers*, 60:151–161.
- Miller, T. Y., He, X., Carter, D. C. (1992). A comparison between protein crystals grown with vapor diffusion methods in microgravity and protein crystals using a gel liquid-liquid diffusion ground-based method. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 122:(1–4), 306–309.
- Minevich, E. (2001). PEDIATRIC UROLITHIASIS. *Pediatric Clinics of North America*, 48:(6), 1571–1585.
- Mirkin, N., Moreno, A., Química, I. De, Nacional, U., México, A. De, Exterior, C., Coyoacán, C. U. (2005). Advances in Crystal Growth Techniques of Biological Macromolecules. *Mexican Chemical Society*, 49:(1), 39–52.
- Moerman, W., Carballa, M., Vandekerckhove, A., Derycke, D., Verstraete, W. (2009). Phosphate removal in agro-industry: pilot- and full-scale operational considerations of struvite crystallization. *Water research*, 43:(7), 1887–92.
- Moreno, A., Juárez-Martínez, G., Hernández-Pérez, T., Batina, N., Mundo, M., McPherson, A. (1999a). Physical and chemical properties of gels application to protein nucleation control in the gel acupuncture technique. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 205:(3), 375–381.
- Moreno, A., Juárez-Martínez, G., Hernández-Pérez, T., Batina, N., Mundo, M., McPherson, A. (1999b). Physical and chemical properties of gels: Application to protein nucleation control in the gel acupuncture technique. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 205:(3), 375–381.
- Moreno, A., Mendoza, M. E. (2014). Crystallization in Gels, Second Edi. Elsevier B.V.
- Mukhlesur Rahman, M., Salleh, M. A. M., Rashid, U., Ahsan, A., Hossain, M. M., Ra, C. S. (2013). Production of slow release crystal fertilizer from wastewaters



through struvite crystallization- A review. King Saud University

- Mullin (2001a). Crystallization.
- Mullin (2001b). 5 - Nucleation. *In: Mullin, J. W. B. T.-C. (Fourth E. (ed). Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford, pp 181–215*
- Mullin (2001c). 9 - Crystallizer design and operation. *In: Mullin, J. W. B. T.-C. (Fourth E. (ed). Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford, pp 403–477*
- Mullin (1992). Crystallization. Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford
- Mullin (2001d). Nucleation. *Crystallization (Fourth Edition)*, 181–215.
- Mullin (2001e). 3 - Solutions and solubility. *In: Mullin, J. W. B. T.-C. (Fourth E. (ed). Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford, pp 86–134*
- Mullin (2001f). 7 - Recrystallization. *In: Mullin, J. W. B. T.-C. (Fourth E. (ed). Butterworth-Heinemann, Oxford, pp 289–314*
- Münch, E. V, Barr, K. (2001). Controlled struvite crystallisation for removing phosphorus from anaerobic digester sidestreams. *Water research*, 35:(1), 151–9.
- Myerson, A. S. (2002). Handbook of industrial crystallization. Butterworth-Heinemann, Boston
- Nalbant, M., Gökkaya, H., Sur, G. (2007). Application of Taguchi method in the optimization of cutting parameters for surface roughness in turning. *Materials and Design*, 28:(4), 1379–1385.
- Natarajan, S., Rmachandran, E., Suja, D. B. (1997a). Growth of some urinary crystals and studies on inhibitors and promoters. II. X-ray studies and inhibitory or promotory role of some substances. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 32:(4), 553–559.
- Natarajan, S., Rmachandran, E., Suja, D. B. (1997b). Growth of some urinary crystals and studies on inhibitors and promoters. II. X-ray studies and inhibitory or promotory role of some substances. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 32:(4), 553–559.
- Nelson, N. O., Mikkelsen, R. L., Hesterberg, D. L. (2003a). Struvite precipitation in anaerobic swine lagoon liquid: effect of pH and Mg:P ratio and determination of rate constant. *Bioresource Technology*, 89:(3), 229–236.
- Nelson, N. O., Mikkelsen, R. L., Hesterberg, D. L. (2003b). Struvite precipitation in anaerobic swine lagoon liquid: effect of pH and Mg:P ratio and determination of rate constant. *Bioresource Technology*, 89:(3), 229–236.

- Nindiyasari, F., Ziegler, A., Griesshaber, E., Fernández-Díaz, L., Huber, J., Walter, P., Schmahl, W. W. (2015). The effect of hydrogel matrices on calcite crystal growth morphology, aggregate formation, and co-orientation in biomimetic experiments and biomineralization environments. *Crystal Growth & Design*, 150401155601004.
- Nkansah, D. (2003). Kinetics and mechanisms of struvite precipitation. Cranfield University
- Nyvt, J., Sohnel, O., Matuchova, M., Broul, M. (1985). The Kinetics of Industrial Crystallization. Elsevier
- Ohlinger, B. K. N., Member, S., Young, T. M., Member, A., Schroeder, E. D. (1999). KINETICS EFFECTS ON PREFERENTIAL STRUVITE. (August), 730–737.
- Ohlinger, K. (2000). Postdigestion struvite precipitation using a fluidized bed reactor. *Journal of Environmental ...*, (April), 361–368.
- Ohlinger, K., Mahmood, R. (2004). Struvite Scale Potential Determination Using a Computer Model.
- Ohlinger, K. N., Young, T. M., Schroeder, E. D. (1998). Predicting struvite formation in digestion. *Water Research*, 32:(12), 3607–3614.
- Ostwald, W. (1897). Studien über die Bildung und Umwandlung fester Körper. *Z phys Chem*, 22:289–330.
- Otálora, F., Novella, M. L., Gavira, J. A., Thomas, B. R., García Ruiz, J. M. (2001). Experimental evidence for the stability of the depletion zone around a growing protein crystal under microgravity. *Acta Crystallographica Section D*, 57:(3), 412–417.
- Parekh, B., Joshi, M., Vaidya, A. (2008). Characterization and inhibitive study of gel-grown hydroxyapatite crystals at physiological temperature. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 310:1749–1753.
- Patel, A., Rao, A. (1982). Crystal growth in gel media.
- Pérez-García, I., Rivadeneyra, M. A. (1989). The influence of pH on struvite formation by bacteria. *Chemosphere*, 18:(7–8), 1633–1638.
- Pérez-García, I., Rivadeneyra, M. A., Quevedo-Sarmiento, J., Ramos-Cormenzana, A. (1990). Struvite formation by and : the influence of agitation. *Chemosphere*, 20:(1–2), 243–251.
- Plank, C. J. (1947). Differences between silica and silica-alumina gels II. A proposed mechanism for the gelation and syneresis of these gels. *Journal of Colloid Science*, 2:(4), 413–427.
- Plank, C. J., Drake, L. C. (1947). Differences between silica and silica-alumina gels I. Factors affecting the porous structure of these gels. *Journal of Colloid Science*,



2:(4), 399–412.

- Posner, A. M., Alexander, A. E. (1953). The kinetics of adsorption from solution to the air/water interface. Part II. Anionic and cationic soaps. *Journal of Colloid Science*, 8:(6), 585–592.
- Provost, K., Robert, M.-C. (1991). Application of gel growth to hanging drop technique. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 110:(1–2), 258–264.
- Prywer, J., Olszynski, M. (2013). Influence of disodium EDTA on the nucleation and growth of struvite and carbonate apatite. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 375:108–114.
- Quintana, M., Colmenarejo, M. F., Barrera, J., Sánchez, E., García, G., Travieso, L., Borja, R. (2008). Removal of phosphorus through struvite precipitation using a by-product of magnesium oxide production (BMP): Effect of the mode of BMP preparation. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 136:(2–3), 204–209.
- Quintana, M., Sánchez, E., Colmenarejo, M. F., Barrera, J., García, G., Borja, R. (2005). Kinetics of phosphorus removal and struvite formation by the utilization of by-product of magnesium oxide production. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 111:(1), 45–52.
- Raghavan, P. S., Ramasamy, P. (2002). Recent trends in crystal growth technology. *PROCEEDINGS-INDIAN NATIONAL SCIENCE ACADEMY PART A*, 68:(3), 235–250.
- Rahaman, M. S., Mavinic, D. S., Meikleham, A., Ellis, N. (2014). Modeling phosphorus removal and recovery from anaerobic digester supernatant through struvite crystallization in a fluidized bed reactor. *Water research*, 51:1–10.
- Rahman, M. A., Hashem, M. A., Rahman, M. M., Rahman, S. M. E., Hossain, M. M. (2013a). Comparison of Struvite Compost with other Fertilizers on Maize Fodder Production. 6:(2), 227–231.
- Rahman, M. M., Salleh, M. A. M., Rashid, U., Ahsan, A., Hossain, M. M., Ra, C. S. (2013b). Production of slow release crystal fertilizer from wastewaters through struvite crystallization – A review. *Arabian Journal of Chemistry*, 7:(1), 139–155.
- Rahman, M. M., Salleh, M. A. M., Rashid, U., Ahsan, A., Hossain, M. M., Ra, C. S. (2014). Production of slow release crystal fertilizer from wastewaters through struvite crystallization - A review. *Arabian Journal of Chemistry*, 7:(1), 139–155.
- Rajan, R., Raj, N. A. N., Madheswaran, S., Babu, D. R. (2015). Dielectric studies on struvite urinary crystals, a gateway to the new treatment modality for urolithiasis. *Spectrochimica Acta Part A: Molecular and Biomolecular Spectroscopy*, 148:266–270.

- Rawn, A. M. (1931). Multi-Stage Sludge Digestion at Los Angeles County Sanitation Districts' Plant. *Sewage Works Journal*, 3:(4), 570–579 CR–Copyright &#169; 1931 Water Environm.
- Robert, M. C, Provost, K, and Lefaucheu, F. (1992). Crystallization in gels and related methods, in *Crystallization of Nucleic Acids and Proteins, A Practical Approach*. Oxford
- Robert, M. C., Lefaucheu, F. (1988). Crystal growth in gels: Principle and applications. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 90:(1–3), 358–367.
- Robert S. Feigelson (2004). 50 years progress in crystal growth.
- Rödel, E. (1971). Fisher, RA: *Statistical Methods for Research Workers*, 14. Aufl., Oliver & Boyd, Edinburgh, London 1970. XIII, 362 S., 12 Abb., 74 Tab., 40 s. *Biometrische Zeitschrift*, 13:(6), 429–430.
- Roncal-Herrero, T., Oelkers, E. H. (2011). Experimental determination of struvite dissolution and precipitation rates as a function of pH. *Applied Geochemistry*, 26:(5), 921–928.
- Ronteltap, M., Maurer, M., Hausherr, R., Gujer, W. (2010). Struvite precipitation from urine - Influencing factors on particle size. *Water research*, 44:(6), 2038–46.
- Rouff, A. A. (2013). Temperature-dependent phosphorus precipitation and chromium removal from struvite-saturated solutions. *Journal of colloid and interface science*, 392:343–8.
- Rudolph, P. (2015). *Handbook of Crystal Growth: Bulk Crystal Growth*.
- S.C, G., P.a., S. (2010). Areview of struvite nucleation studies. pp 1–10
- Sadowski, R. R., Prywer, J., Torzewska, A. (2014). Morphology of struvite crystals as an evidence of bacteria mediated growth. *Crystal Research and Technology*, 49:(7), 478–489.
- Saha, S., Verma, R. J. (2013). Inhibition of calcium oxalate crystallisation in vitro by an extract of *Bergenia ciliata*. *Arab Journal of Urology*, 11:(2), 187–192.
- Saïdou, A., Janssen, B. H., Temminghoff, E. J. M. (2003). Effects of soil properties, mulch and NPK fertilizer on maize yields and nutrient budgets on ferralitic soils in southern Benin. *Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment*, 100:(2–3), 265–273.
- Salsabili, A., Amran, M., Salleh, M., Idris, A., Yunus, R., Suraya, A. R. (2015a). Investigating the effects of specific gravity on the size and morphology of struvite crystals grown through gel-growth technique in silica gel. In: *The 7th International Conference on Sustainable Agriculture for Food, Energy and Industry in Regional and Global Context*. Kuala Lump, pp 1–10

- Salsabili, A., Mohd, M. A., Idris, A., Yunus, R., Suraya, A. R. (2015b). Formation and characterization of struvite crystals grown through gel- growth technique in gelatin. *Journal of Purity, Utility Reaction and Environment*, 4:(1), 16–26.
- Salsabili, A., Salleh, M., Amran, M., Zohoori, M. (2014). Evaluating the Effects of Operational Parameters and Conditions on Struvite Crystallization and Precipitation with the Focus on Temperature. *Advances in Natural & Applied Sciences*, 8:(April), 175–179.
- Schwartz, B. F., Stoller, M. L. (1999). NONSURGICAL MANAGEMENT OF INFECTION-RELATED RENAL CALCULI. *Urologic Clinics of North America*, 26:(4), 765–778.
- Segura, J. W. (1997). STAGHORN CALCULI. *Urologic Clinics of North America*, 24:(1), 71–80.
- Shan, G., Igarashi, K., Ooshima, H. (2002). Dissolution kinetics of crystals in suspension and its application to L-aspartic acid crystals. *Chemical Engineering Journal*, 88:(1), 53–58.
- Shukla, J., Mohandas, V. P., Kumar, A. (2008). Effect of pH on the Solubility of  $\text{CaSO}_4 \cdot 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$  in Aqueous NaCl solutions and Physicochemical Solution Properties at 35 C. *Journal of Chemical & Engineering Data*, 53:(12), 2797–2800.
- Snoeyink, V.L., and Jenkins, D. (1980). Water chemistry. New York: John Wiley and Sons., New York
- Soares, A., Kampas, P., Maillard, S., Wood, E., Brigg, J., Tillotson, M., Parsons, S. A., Cartmell, E. (2010). Comparison between disintegrated and fermented sewage sludge for production of a carbon source suitable for biological nutrient removal. *Journal of hazardous materials*, 175:(1–3), 733–9.
- Spettel, S., Shah, P., Sekhar, K., Herr, A., White, M. D. (2013). Using Hounsfield unit measurement and urine parameters to predict uric acid stones. *Urology*, 82:(1), 22–6.
- Srinivasan, N., Natarajan, S. (1996). Growth of some urinary crystals and studies on inhibitors and promoters. I. Standardisation of parameters for crystal growth and characterization of crystals. In: *INDIAN JOURNAL OF PHYSICS AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE INDIAN ASSOCIATION FOR THE CULTIVATION OF SCIENCE A*. pp 563–568
- Stefov, V., Cahil, A., Šoptrajanov, B., Najdoski, M., Spirovski, F., Engelen, B., Lutz, H. D., Koleva, V. (2009). Infrared and Raman spectra of magnesium ammonium phosphate hexahydrate (struvite) and its isomorphous analogues. VII: Spectra of protiated and partially deuterated hexagonal magnesium caesium phosphate hexahydrate. *Journal of Molecular Structure*, 924–926:100–106.
- Stefov, V., Šoptrajanov, B., Spirovski, F., Kuzmanovski, I., Lutz, H. ., Engelen, B. (2004). Infrared and Raman spectra of magnesium ammonium phosphate hexahydrate (struvite) and its isomorphous analogues. I. Spectra of protiated

and partially deuterated magnesium potassium phosphate hexahydrate. *Journal of Molecular Structure*, 689:(1–2), 1–10.

- Stratful, I., Scrimshaw, M. ., Lester, J. . (2001). Conditions influencing the precipitation of magnesium ammonium phosphate. *Water Research*, 35:(17), 4191–4199.
- Su, C.-C., Dulfo, L. D., Dalida, M. L. P., Lu, M.-C. (2014). Magnesium phosphate crystallization in a fluidized-bed reactor: effects of pH, Mg:P molar ratio and seed. *Separation and Purification Technology*, 125:90–96.
- Suguna, K., Thenmozhi, M., Sekar, C. (2012). Growth, spectral, structural and mechanical properties of struvite crystal grown in presence of sodium fluoride. *Bulletin of Materials Science*, 35:(4), 701–706.
- Sundaramoorthi, P., Kalainathan, S. (2007). Growth and characterization of struvite crystals in silica gel medium and its nucleation reduction process. *Asian Journal of Chemistry*, 19:(4), 2783–2791.
- Sundaramoorthi, P., Kalainathan, S. (2008). Growth and Characterization of Struvite Crystals in Silica Gel Medium and Its Nucleation Reduction Process. *Asian Journal of Chemistry*, 20:(1), 287–294.
- Suryawanshi, V. B., Chaudhari, R. T. (2014a). Growth and Characterization of Agar Gel Grown Brushite Crystals. *Indian Journal of Materials Science*, 2014:1–6.
- Suryawanshi, V. B., Chaudhari, R. T. (2014b). Synthesis and Characterization of Struvite-k Crystals by Agar Gel. *Journal of Crystallization Process and Technology*, 4:(October), 212–224.
- Syme, H. M. (2012). Stones in cats and dogs: What can be learnt from them? *Arab Journal of Urology*, 10:(3), 230–239.
- Tas, A. C. (2013). The use of physiological solutions or media in calcium phosphate synthesis and processing. *Acta Biomater.* doi: 10.1016/j.actbio.2013.12.047
- Terai, A., Ueda, T., Kakehi, Y., Terachi, T., Arai, Y., Okada, Y., Yoshida, O. (1996). Urinary Calculi as a Late Complication of the Indiana Continent Urinary Diversion: Comparison with the Kock Pouch Procedure. *The Journal of Urology*, 155:(1), 66–68.
- Tiselius, H.-G., Ackermann, D., Hess, B., Boevé, E. (2002). Stone disease: Diagnosis and medical management. *European Urology*, 41:(5), I–XI.
- Torzewska, A., Rozalski, A. (2013). Inhibition of crystallization caused by *Proteus mirabilis* during the development of infectious urolithiasis by various phenolic substances. *Microbiol Res.* doi: 10.1016/j.micres.2013.09.020
- Udert, K. M., Larsen, T. A., Gujer, W. (2003). Estimating the precipitation potential in urine-collecting systems. *Water research*, 37:(11), 2667–77.

- Ueno, Y., Fujii, M. (2001). Three years experience of operating and selling recovered struvite from full-scale plant. *Environmental Technology*, 22:(11), 1373–1381.
- Umer, S. A., Sultan, S., Zafar, M. N., Hussain, I., Ahmed, B., Saulat, S., Taqvi, R., Mehmood, A., Naqvi, A., Rizvi, S. A.-U.-H. (2009). Composition of Renal and Bladder Calculi in Pediatric Stone Formers. *Journal of Pediatric Urology*, 5:S32.
- Uysal, A., Yilmazel, Y. D., Demirer, G. N. (2010). The determination of fertilizer quality of the formed struvite from effluent of a sewage sludge anaerobic digester. *Journal of hazardous materials*, 181:(1–3), 248–54.
- Valarmathi, D., Abraham, L., Gunasekaran, S. (2010). Growth of calcium oxalate monohydrate crystal by gel method and its spectroscopic analysis. *Indian J Pure Appl Phys*, 48:36–38.
- Van Grieken, R., Markowicz, A. (2001). *Handbook of X-ray Spectrometry*. CRC Press
- Vani, R., Girija, E. K., Palanichamy, M., Kalkura, S. N. (2009). Simultaneous crystallization of calcium phosphate and calcium oxalate in the presence of ascorbic acid under physiological conditions. *Materials Science and Engineering: C*, 29:(4), 1227–1232.
- Wang, J., Burken, J. (2005). Engineered struvite precipitation: Impacts of component-ion molar ratios and pH. *Journal of Environmental ...*, (October), 1433–1440.
- Webb, K. M., Ho, G. E. (1991). Struvite ( $MgNH_4PO_4 \cdot 6H_2O$ ) solubility and its application to a piggery effluent problem.
- Weinstein, M., Aime, T., Dennis, J., Henisch, H. K. (1967). Nucleation and Growth of Crystals in Gels. 114:(3), 126–129.
- Whitaker, A., Jeffery, J. W. (1970). The crystal structure of struvite,  $MgNH_4PO_4 \cdot 6H_2O$ . *Acta Crystallographica Section B*, 26:(10), 1429–1440.
- White, E. a D. (2002). Recent advances in crystal growing techniques. *British Journal of Applied Physics*, 16:(10), 1415–1428.
- Wierzbicki, A., Sallis, J. D., Stevens, E. D., Smith, M., Sikes, C. S. (1997). Crystal growth and molecular modeling studies of inhibition of struvite by phosphocitrate. *Calcified tissue international*, 61:(3), 216–222.
- Wilsenach, J. A., Schuurbiens, C. A. H., van Loosdrecht, M. C. M. (2007). Phosphate and potassium recovery from source separated urine through struvite precipitation. *Water research*, 41:(2), 458–66.
- Wisener, L. V, Pearl, D. L., Houston, D. M., Reid-Smith, R. J., Moore, A. E. P. (2010). Spatial and temporal clustering of calcium oxalate and magnesium ammonium phosphate uroliths in dogs living in Ontario, Canada between 1998 and 2006. *Preventive veterinary medicine*, 95:(1–2), 144–51.

- Wrigley, T. J., Webb, K. M., Venkitachalm, H. (1992). A laboratory study of struvite precipitation after anaerobic digestion of piggery wastes. *Bioresource Technology*, 41:(2), 117–121.
- Xu, K., Wang, C., Wang, X., Qian, Y. (2012). Laboratory experiments on simultaneous removal of K and P from synthetic and real urine for nutrient recycle by crystallization of magnesium-potassium-phosphate-hexahydrate in a draft tube and baffle reactor. *Chemosphere*, 88:(2), 219–23.
- Yang, W. H., Tarng, Y. S. (1998). Design optimization of cutting parameters for turning operations based on the Taguchi method. *Journal of Materials Processing Technology*, 84:(1–3), 122–129.
- Zhang, W., Xie, D., Shang, P., Yang, Z. Study on Novel Type Struvite Precipitate for Ammonium Removal from Landfill Leachate. 598–600.