



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

***GAIDAM REGIME'S SOCIAL WELFARE PERFORMANCE IN
ACHIEVING DEMOCRATIC CONSOLIDATION IN YOBE STATE,
NIGERIA***

ALI IBRAHIM ABBAS

FEM 2017 23



**GAIDAM REGIME'S SOCIAL WELFARE PERFORMANCE IN
ACHIEVING DEMOCRATIC CONSOLIDATION IN YOBE STATE,
NIGERIA**

By

ALI IBRAHIM ABBAS

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia,
in Fulfillments of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

August 2017

COPYRIGHT

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs, and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment
of the requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**GAIDAM REGIME'S SOCIAL WELFARE PERFORMANCE IN
ACHIEVING DEMOCRATIC CONSOLIDATION IN YOBE STATE,
NIGERIA**

By

ALI IBRAHIM ABBAS

August 2017

Chairman : Ku Hasnita Binti Ku Samsu, PhD
Faculty : Human Ecology

The study provides analysis of the regime's social welfare performance of Governor Gaidam in achieving democratic consolidation in Yobe state regarded as one of the most underdeveloped states in Nigeria. Since the emergence of democracy in the state, the healthcare situations such as infant mortality, children under-five mortality and maternal mortality rates were all higher than the national average. In the education sector, the situation remained worrisome as student's enrollment; completion rate at both primary and secondary schools in the state was low. Similarly, infrastructural development such as road access linking towns and villages were either absent or in deplorable conditions. Consequently, due to such extreme situations, the state was generally considered impoverished and underdeveloped which continue to pose negative consequences on its democratic consolidation. When Governor Gaidam came into power in 2009, the regime declared to address these social welfare challenges through the democratic process. The objectives of this study, therefore, explored the regime's development objectives in social welfare aspects and assessed the impact the regime's welfare performance on democratic consolidation. Through qualitative research design, the study specifically involved key democratic stakeholders including members of the ruling party, opposition parties as well as civil society groups in Yobe state. Thus, data collection technique involves semi-structured open-ended interviews purposively with key informants and document analysis through the qualitative lenses. Observational data were also converted to field notes for data analysis. The raw data were analysed using transcription and sorting to develop trends, patterns, and themes emerging from expressed view of informants. In essence, this study utilised both primary and secondary sources of data that produced a balanced result. The finding suggests a double-sided phenomenon: on one hand the euphoria of change and improvement; on the other hand; critical view of the regime's social welfare performance deficits in the provision of quality and accessible health care, qualitative and functional education as well as the regime's efforts in road construction and reconstruction across Yobe state. The study further identified reasons for the regime's

success and failures in delivering healthcare, education and road infrastructure in achieving democratic consolidation. As the finding reveals, in spite of the major challenges the regime faced, a nascent democratic government like in Yobe state must perform optimally to respond to citizen's social welfare demands in order to achieve democratic consolidation. Democracy in this sense is thus propagated not only as a goal in itself but is considered as an instrument that brings about social welfare achievements to the fore in democratic consolidation process through better institutions and structures of democratic governance.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk Ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**PRESTASI KEBAJIKAN SOSIAL REJIM GAIDAM DALAM MENCAPAI
PENYATUAN DEMOKRATIK DI NEGERI YOBE, NIGERIA**

Oleh

ALI IBRAHIM ABBAS

Ogos 2017

Pengerusi : Ku Hasnita Binti Ku Samsu, PhD
Fakulti : Ekologi Manusia

Kajian ini menyediakan analisis prestasi kebajikan sosial rejim Gabenor Gaidam ke arah mencapai penyatuan demokrasi di Negeri Yobe yang dianggap sebagai salah satu daripada negeri yang paling mundur di Nigeria. Sejak kemunculan demokrasi di negeri ini, keadaan kesihatan seperti kematian bayi, kematian kanak-kanak di bawah lima tahun dan kadar kematian ibu bersalin kesemuanya adalah lebih tinggi daripada purata negara. Dalam sektor pendidikan, keadaan masih membimbangkan kerana enrolmen pelajar, kadar tamat persekolahan rendah dan menengah negeri ini adalah rendah. Begitu juga dengan pembangunan infrastruktur seperti jalan raya yang menghubungkan bandar-bandar dan perkampungan sama ada tidak wujud atau dalam keadaan yang usang. Oleh itu, disebabkan keadaan melampau, negeri ini secara umumnya dianggap miskin dan kurang membangun dan terus menimbulkan kesan negatif terhadap penyatuan demokrasi. Apabila Gabenor Gaidam memerintah pada tahun 2009, rejim ini mengistiharkan untuk menangani cabaran-cabaran ini melalui proses demokrasi. Justeru itu, objektif kajian adalah untuk meneroka objektif pembangunan dari aspek kebajikan sosial rejim dan menilai impak prestasi kebajikan rejim ke atas penyatuan demokratik. Melalui reka bentuk penyelidikan kualitatif, kajian ini melibatkan khususnya pihak berkepentingan demokratik utama termasuk ahli-ahli parti pemerintah, pihak pembangkang, kumpulan masyarakat sivil di Negeri Yobe. Justeru itu, teknik pengumpulan data melibatkan temu bual terbuka separa berstruktur bersama pemberi maklumat dan penganalisan dokumen melalui kaedah kualitatif. Data pemerhatian juga ditukar kepada nota lapangan untuk dianalisis. Data mentah dianalisis dengan menggunakan transkripsi dan disusun untuk membangunkan trend, corak dan tema hasil daripada sudut pandangan pemberi maklumat. Pada dasarnya, kajian ini menggunakan kedua-dua sumber utama dan sampingan dan menghasilkan keputusan yang seimbang. Dapatan kajian menunjukkan satu fenomena yang menyebelahi kedua-dua pihak: kerancakan dalam perubahan dan penambahbaikan; sebaliknya, pandangan kritikal terhadap prestasi kebajikan sosial rejim yang defisit dari segi kualiti dan penyediaan penjagaan kesihatan yang boleh

diakses, pendidikan berkualiti serta berfungsi dan usaha rejim dalam pembinaan jalan raya dan pembinaan semula di seluruh Negeri Yobe. Kajian ini juga telah mengenal pasti punca-punca kejayaan rejim dan kegagalan dalam menyediakan penjagaan kesihatan, pendidikan dan infrastruktur jalan ke arah mencapai penyatuan demokratik. Dapatan kajian mendedahkan walaupun terdapat cabaran besar yang dihadapi oleh rejim, kerajaan demokratik yang masih baru di Negeri Yobe mesti melaksanakan secara optimum sebagai maklum balas terhadap permintaan warganegara demi mencapai penyatuan demokrasi. Demokrasi dalam pengertian ini bukan sahaja disebarkan sebagai matlamat, tetapi dianggap sebagai instrumen yang membawa kepada kejayaan kebajikan sosial terhadap proses penyatuan demokrasi melalui institusi dan struktur tadbir urus demokrasi yang lebih baik.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All praises are to Allah (SWA), the Most Gracious and Merciful. I thank Him for giving me the life, health and opportunity to carry out this academic journey successfully.

This research work would not have been successful without the concerted efforts of numerous personalities. Firstly, my appreciation goes to the Chairperson of my supervisory committee, Dr Hasnita Binti Ku Samsu whose direction, guidance and insightful opinions aided this outcome. She always provided prompt response to every draft I submitted and made sure my Committee meetings are held regularly. Indeed, she was always there for me just like a mother would for her son despite her tight schedules. I am so honoured to have worked with you.

I am also very thankful to my co supervisors Dr Zatul Himmah Adnan and Associate Professor Adlina Binti AB Halim who took their time to go through my work and offered criticisms, corrections, advice and suggestions from beginning to the end. Dr Zatul always challenged me to think critically and deeply to sharpen my arguments in a more organised, clear and concise manner. Dr Adlina provided many insightful critiques that strengthened my thoughts and arguments throughout. Through such feedbacks, my research experience with them has been exceptionally rewarding. I hope to continue to learn and advance from their academic prowess throughout my academic journey.

I must not forget to mention Associate Professor Ma'rof Redzuan and Associate Professor Lee Yok Fee who as my internal examiners offered their corrections and advice on the final stage of this work. My appreciation also goes to Associate Professor Mariani Mansor who chaired my Thesis Examination Committee. Also worthy of appreciation is Professor Syed Serajul Islam of Lakehead University Canada who served as my external examiner for his constructive comments and suggestions. Overall, words enough cannot express how thankful I am for all your invaluable contributions in making this journey successful.

On a personal note, I am highly indebted to my family and friends, who stood by me through thick and thin, giving me the much needed support through their prayers and phone calls. This goes to my dad Alhaji Ibrahim among several other family members (Rabiatu, Ammi, Abba, Emir, Aishatu, Ummi, etc). To my close friends: Usman, Saleleh, Mustapha, Salis, Hadiza MB, Abdulkarim, Yusuf, etc for their unflinching support. I must also appreciate Dr Goni, Dr Jalo, Dr Goje and Dr Chikaji for convincing me to pursue my PhD in Malaysia and UPM. It's done, here it is and thanks for your support and encouragement.

My deepest appreciation goes to Professor Yakubu Mukhtar, the Vice-Chancellor-YSU for his tremendous supports. I also want to acknowledge all my colleagues at UPM and YSU for their active role in putting this work together. I am equally grateful to the informants and all those whose names are not mentioned here but have contributed to the success of this research. I thank wish them Allah's blessings. Ameen!

On a final note, this PhD thesis is dedicated to the memory of my late mother (Maryam Ibrahim Abbas) and late brother (Bashir Ibrahim Abbas). My special prayer has been and will always be May Allah (SWA) forgive their shortcomings and reward them with Aljannatul Firdaus. Ameen!



I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 11 August 2017 to conduct the final examination of Ali Ibrahim Abbas on his thesis entitled "Gaidam Regime's Social Welfare Performance in Achieving Democratic Consolidation in Yobe State, Nigeria" in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Mariani bte Mansor, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Ma'rof bin Redzuan, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Lee Yok Fee, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Syed Serajul Islam, PhD

Professor
Lakehead University
Canada
(External Examiner)



NOR AINI AB. SHUKOR, PhD

Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 26 October 2017

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of the Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Hasnita Binti Ku Samsu, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairperson)

Zatul Himmah Adnan, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Adlina Binti AB Halim, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

ROBIAH BINTI YUNUS, PhD

Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

Declaration by graduate student

I hereby confirm that:

- this thesis is my original work;
- quotations, illustrations and citations have been duly referenced;
- this thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any institutions;
- intellectual property from the thesis and copyright of thesis are fully-owned by Universiti Putra Malaysia, as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- written permission must be obtained from supervisor and the office of Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and innovation) before thesis is published (in the form of written, printed or in electronic form) including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture notes, learning modules or any other materials as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- there is no plagiarism or data falsification/fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) and the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Name and Matric No : Ali Ibrahim Abbas (GS41797)

Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee

This is to confirm that:

- the research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervision;
- supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) were adhered to.

Signature: _____
Name of Chairman
of Supervisory
Committee: Dr. Hasnita Binti Ku Samsu

Signature: _____
Name of Member
of Supervisory
Committee: Dr. Zatul Himmah Adnan

Signature: _____
Name of Member
of Supervisory
Committee: Associate Professor Dr. Adlina Binti AB Halim

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
ABSTRACT		i
ABSTRAK		iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS		v
APPROVAL		vii
DECLARATION		ix
LIST OF TABLES		xiv
LIST OF FIGURES		xv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS		xvii
CHAPTER		
1	INTRODUCTION	1
	1.1 Background of the Study	1
	1.2 Problem Statement	5
	1.3 Research Questions	7
	1.4 Objectives of the Study	8
	1.5 Scope and Limitation of the Study	8
	1.6 Significance and Contribution of the Study	9
	1.7 Conceptual and Operational Definitions	10
	1.8 Organisation of Thesis	12
	1.9 Conclusion	12
2	LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	13
	2.1 Introduction	13
	2.2 Global Overview on Democratic Consolidation	13
	2.3 Socio-economic Development and Democratic Consolidation	20
	2.4 Social Welfare in the Context of Democratic Consolidation in Nigeria	23
	2.5 Regime, Social Welfare and its Measurements in achieving Democratic Consolidation	26
	2.6 Imperative of Good Governance on Regime Performance	33
	2.7 Democratic Consolidation Theory	35
	2.8 Conclusion	38
3	RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	39
	3.1 Introduction	39
	3.2 Research Design	39
	3.3 Study Area: Yobe State, Nigeria	40
	3.3.1 Population and culture	44
	3.3.2 Political Economy of Yobe state	44
	3.3.3 Governance and Administrative Structure	45
	3.4 Data Collection	45
	3.4.1 Key Informants	45

3.4.2	Interview	49
3.4.3	Documents	49
3.4.4	Observation	50
3.4.5	Secondary Sources	50
3.5	Data Analysis	51
3.6	Validity and Reliability	54
3.7	Ethical Consideration	55
3.8	Conclusion	56
4	REGIME'S DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES IN SOCIAL WELFARE ASPECTS IN ACHIEVING DEMOCRATIC CONSOLIDATION	57
4.1	Introduction	57
4.2	Health Development Objectives	57
4.2.1	Responsibilities in the Provision of Healthcare Services	57
4.2.2	Health Priority Development Objectives: Vision, Mission, and Targets	59
4.2.3	Rationales toward providing Basic Health Needs of Citizens	63
4.3	Education Development Objectives	65
4.3.1	Responsibilities in the Provision of Education Services	65
4.3.2	Education Priority Development Objectives: Vision, Mission, and Targets	67
4.3.3	Rationales toward Providing Basic Education Needs of the Citizens	71
4.4	Road Infrastructure Development Objectives	74
4.4.1	Responsibilities in Providing Road Infrastructure	74
4.4.2	Road Infrastructure Priority Development Objectives: Vision, Mission, and Targets	75
4.4.3	Rationales toward Providing Road Infrastructure	79
4.5	Conclusion	82
5	IMPACT OF THE REGIME'S SOCIAL WELFARE PERFORMANCE ON DEMOCRATIC CONSOLIDATION	84
5.1	Introduction	84
5.2	Health Development	84
5.2.1	Healthcare Budget and Financial Expenditure	84
5.2.2	Health Leadership and Governance	88
5.2.3	Human Resource for Health	92
5.2.4	Health Infrastructure and Facilities	97
5.2.5	Healthcare Service Delivery	101
5.2.6	Improved Healthcare Development Outcomes	105
5.3	Education Development	109
5.3.1	Education Budget and Financial Expenditure	110
5.3.2	Human Resource for Education	113
5.3.3	Education Infrastructure and Facilities	117
5.3.4	Girl Child Education	119
5.3.5	Net Enrolment Rate	124
5.3.6	Improved Education Development Outcomes	127

5.4	Road Infrastructure Development	132
5.4.1	Road Infrastructure Budget and Financial Expenditure	132
5.4.2	Construction of Road Infrastructure	135
5.4.3	Maintenance of Road Infrastructure	139
5.4.4	Geo-Politics of Road Infrastructure Development	142
5.4.5	Federal-State Relations on Roads Infrastructure Development	145
5.4.6	Improved Road Infrastructure Development Outcome	148
5.5	Conclusion	152
6	CONCLUSION, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	155
6.1	Introduction	155
6.2	Conclusion of the Findings	155
6.3	Implications of the Findings	159
6.3.1	Theoretical Implications	159
6.3.2	Methodological Implications	160
6.3.3	Policy Implications	160
6.3.4	Suggestion for Future Studies	162
6.4	Conclusion	163
	REFERENCES	164
	APPENDICES	177
	BIODATA OF STUDENT	186
	LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	187

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
3.1	Profile of Key Informants	47
3.2	Categories and Identity Codes for Key Informants	48
5.1	Number of Doctors/Nurses/Midwives by LGAs Population (WHO Standard)	95
5.2	List of Health Facilities in Yobe state	97
5.3	List of Health Facilities offering Free MNCH in Yobe state	103
5.4	Available and Required Number of Furniture in Primary Schools	118
5.5	Enrolment Trends at Basic Education Levels from 2012-2015	124
5.6	Km Length of Key Roads Constructed and Reconstructed in Yobe state	136

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
2.1	Regime's Social Welfare Performance in achieving Democratic Consolidation	36
3.1	Map of Yobe Nigeria showing Neighbouring states	41
3.2	Conceptual Framework of the Study	42
5.1	Health Sector Budget Trend in Yobe state from 2009-2015	85
5.2	Trends of ANC Bookings (1st Visits) in Yobe state from 2013-2015	104
5.3	Key Indicators for Mortality Rates	106
5.4	Education Sector Budget Trend in Yobe state from 2009-2015	110
5.5	Enrolment of Boys versus Girls at the Basic Education Levels in 2015	121
5.6	Net Enrolment Rates at Basic Education Levels from 2012-2015	128
5.7	Enrolment of Boys versus Girls at the Basic Education Levels in 2015	129
5.8	Percentage of Students Passing WAEC Examinations 2011-2015	130
5.9	Road Sector Budget Trend in Yobe state from 2009-2015	132

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix		Page
1	Interview Guide for Key Informants	177
5.1	1.5T Superconducting MR1 at Ultra-modern Hospital Damaturu	180
5.2	Newly Constructed Maternity Ward at GSASH Damaturu	180
5.3	Upgraded General Hospital Damagum	181
5.4	Furnished Living Room for Medical Doctors at GSASH Damaturu	181
5.5	Students sitting on bare floor at Umar Suleiman JSS, Gashua	182
5.6	Typical Classroom at Yobe-Turkish International College Mamudo	183
5.7	Newly Constructed One Story Building (Classroom) at Kafela Primary School, Gaidam	183
5.8	Section of Gashua Township Road (Hospital Road)	184
5.9	Section of Damaturu Ring Road (Bye pass)	184
5.10	Trans-Saharan Road (Bayamari-Yunusari section)	185
5.11	Reconstructed federal government owned Potiskum-Jakusko-Garin Alkali Road by YBSG	185

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ASUU	Academic Staff Union of Universities
ANC	Ante Natal Care
CONHESS	Consolidated Health Salary Scale
CONMESS	Consolidated Medical Salary Scale
CSOs	Civil Society Organisations
EFA	Education for All
ExCo	Executive Council
FCT	Federal Capital Territory
FGN	Federal Government of Nigeria
FMC	Federal Medical Center
FMW	Federal Ministry of Works
FRN	Federal Republic of Nigeria
GCE	Girl Child Education
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GHs	General Hospitals
GNI	Gross National Income
GSASH	General Sani Abacha Specialist Hospital
GSP	Gross State Product
HDI	Human Development Index
HND	Higher National Diploma
HRH	Human Resource for Health
IIAG	Ibrahim Index of African Governance
IDPs	International Development Partners
IGR	Internally Generated Revenue
IMR	Infant Mortality Rates

JAMB	Joint Admission and Matriculation Board
JHSU	Joint Health Sector Union
JSS	Junior Secondary School
LGAs	Local Government Areas
MDAs	Ministries, Departments, and Agencies
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MMR	Maternal Mortality Rates
MNCH	Maternal, Newborn, and Child Health
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoW	Ministry of Works
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NANNM	National Association of Nigeria Nurses and Midwives
NBS	National Bureau of Statistics
NCE	Nigerian Certificate in Education
NECO	National Examination Council
NER	Net Enrolment Rate
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
NLC	Nigeria Labour Congress
NMA	Nigeria Medical Association
NPE	National Policy on Education
NPH	National Policy on Health
NSE	Nigeria Society of Engineers
NUJ	National Union of Journalists
NURTW	National Union of Road Transport Workers
NUT	National Union of Teachers

PHCs	Primary Health Centres
PHCMB	Primary Health Care Management Board
PHCUOR	Primary Health Care Under One Roof
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PRRINN	Partnership for Reviving Routine Immunisation in Northern Nigeria
RAWG	Research and Analysis Working Group
SHoA	State House of Assembly
SSA	Sub Saharan Africa
SSCE	Senior Secondary Certificate Examination
SUBEB	State Universal Basic Education Board
TSS	Teachers Salary Scale
U5MR	Under5 Mortality Rates
UBE	Universal Basic Education
UMTH	University of Maiduguri Teaching Hospital
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Education Fund
USAID	United State Agency for International Development
W4H	Women 4 Health
WAEC	West African Examination Council
WB	World Bank
WDI	World Development Indicators
WDR	World Bank Development Report
WHO	World Health Organisation
WMHCP	Ward Minimum Health Care Package
YBAGAR	Yobe State Auditor General's Annual Report

YBSG Yobe State Government

YOSERA Yobe Socio-Economic Reform Agenda



CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

This chapter provides the background of the study, problem statement, research questions, and objectives which the study targets to achieve. Similarly, it covers the scope and limitation of the study, significance, and contribution of the study, conceptual and operational definitions as well as organisation of the study.

1.1 Background of the Study

Many scholars advance that the third wave of democratisation as espoused by Huntington (1991) flowed through the Latin American and African countries from the 1980s to the 1990s (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Diamond, 1999). Some scholars also attributed this sporadic political revolution from autocratic to democratic regimes essentially as a reflection of the changes in the international political scene especially with the collapse of the former Union of Socialist Soviet Republic (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Huntington, 1991; Oo, 2010). In fact, some scholars went further to argue that it is as a result of this “third wave” (Huntington, 1991; Schedler, 1998, 2001; Oo, 2010) that paved way for democracy and its principles to assume a dominant global position in the current political systems of many countries particularly Africa, Caribbean and the Pacific.

In view of the emergence of democracy as a political system of governance in most developing nations, there have been unanimous endorsements of the idea especially by Western scholars as an effective political system for advancement of good governance, political stability, economic growth and development (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Diamond, 1999; Huntington, 1991; Linz & Stepan, 1996; Przeworski, Alvarez, Cheibub & Limongi 2000). Based on this common notion, democracy is thus propagated not only as a goal in itself but considered as an instrument that brings about socio-economic transformation to be achieved through better institutions and structures of democratic governance (Przeworski et al, 2000; Rudebeck, 2016; Zakaria, 2013). With the establishment of new democracies particularly across the African continent, the first challenge for most political regimes was therefore on how to consolidate this nascent democracy. To relate to this Venter (2012) suggest that democratic government in developing nations should provide basic needs of the people thereby preparing them to tackle the challenges of building their nations.

When Nigeria got her independence in 1960, it practiced a parliamentary system of government until its first military coup that interrupted the democratic rule in 1966 (Iheanacho, 2013). From 1966 to 1979, Nigeria was therefore under military rule until it returned to democratic rule with a presidential system of government. Also, just four years after the return to democracy, a yet another military rule cut short the civilian regime in 1983 (Iheanacho, 2013). In fact, by May 29, 1999, when Nigeria returned

to democratic rule with another presidential system government the country had been through successful, as well as unsuccessful coups, which had installed 7 military regimes (Abbas, 2013). Hence, from 1999-2015, the democratic rule, which Nigerians have for long aspired for, can be said to have, at last arrived and consolidated (Abbas, 2013) with 16 years of uninterrupted democratic governance.

Interestingly, in most developing nations and democracies like Nigeria the process of democratic reforms often come with expectations of social welfare improvements (Carbone, 2012; Grassi, 2014; Ojatorotu & Allen, 2009). In fact, in most African nations with poor political, social and economic environments when democracy emerged in 1990's, most citizens expected democracy will deliver social welfare dividends (Carbone, 2012). It is therefore not surprising that when democracy returns in Nigeria in 1999, over the years there were high hopes and anticipation from the citizens (Oluwole, 2014). The expectation was that democratic regimes will provide good governance that may lead to socio-economic and political development and improvements in the standard of living of the citizens (Gilbert & Allen, 2014; Iheanacho, 2013; Jega, 2007; Ogali, 2014; Omodia, 2012; Omotola, 2009) in achieving democratic consolidation in Nigeria.

The euphoria for social welfare improvements since the return of democratic rule in Nigeria like most developing nations is not totally surprising. Supporters of social welfare provision were of the view that a democratic regime that provides such social welfare services indicates level of political commitment (Mwenzwa & Waweru, 2016). In fact, such commitment through regime performance ensures that citizens have a means to livelihood and may therefore reduce the risk of citizens' rebellion against the regime or the democratic system itself. Based on this thinking, regime's social welfare initiatives could be regarded as vital in the maintenance of peace, unity and tranquility in a nation as citizens enjoys better living standards (Mwenzwa & Waweru, 2016). However, some key studies by Diamond (1999), Gilbert and Allen (2014), Ogali (2014) and Ojatorotu and Allen (2009) cautioned that democratic consolidation can only be achieve if there exist good governance which entails its various dimensions such as the capacity and the political commitment of the state apparatus to provide public goods through transparency and accountability.

However, while democratic regimes had never lasted so long in Nigeria (1999-present), this does not suggest democracy in the country is entirely successful as the country is still generally facing social, economic and political challenges. This is in view of the fact that there exists pervasive rate of poverty, unemployment, illiteracy, diseases, etc (NBS, 2010; NPC & ICF Macro, 2008; UNDP, 2015). This is evident in the nation's poor socio-economic services characterised by dilapidated or non-existent infrastructures. In fact, Nigeria's most recent official survey showed that 69% of its population (112,518,507 people) lives in extreme poverty (NBS, 2010). The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Human Development Index of the 2015 report also downgraded Nigeria to 152th out of 188 countries thus placed in lowest levels of its human development indicators such as education, health, youth employment and poverty reduction.

These and many more contradictions identified above made Ojaborotu and Allen (2009) asked two questions; what does democracy do or fail to do about social welfare needs of Nigerians? Does it matter for the performance of democracy? In the case of Yobe state like elsewhere in Nigeria, when casting their votes in elections, citizens do so with high hopes and expectations that their chosen political leaders would serve their common interest in solving their perpetual social, economic and political problems. In fact, for every modern state, its proper management of most be directed towards providing social welfare to the people as it has “become one of the main sources of legitimacy of governments and elections programs” (Ghaffary & Azizimehr, 2015). Despite specific relevance, it is worrisome to note that successive political regimes in the past in Nigeria and Yobe state in particular have not addressed these socio-economic problems that most citizens suffer in common. Similarly, these social welfare issues in Yobe state is not impressive as several reports of National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) (2010) and Millennium Development Goals (MDG) (2010) shows evidence of high level poverty, hunger, diseases, unemployment, illiteracy, insecurity, etc.

Since the return of democracy on 29th May 1999 in Yobe state, there emerged various Executive Governors with Bukar Abba Ibrahim being the first elected Governor who served from 1999-2007. He was later succeeded by Senator Mamman Bello Ali on 29th May 2007 before his death while still serving as the Governor of the state. However, the sudden death of Ali halfway into his first term as the Governor of the state created a vacuum that must be constitutionally filled by Alhaji Ibrahim Gaidam who served in the capacity of Deputy Governor to late Governor Ali for a period of 19 months. The new Governor Alhaji Ibrahim Gaidam who subsequently assumed responsibility of the Governor of Yobe state was until his election as Deputy Governor alongside late Governor in 2007, a typical civil servant who rose through the ranks to the position of a Permanent Secretary in the state. Having assumed duty on his inaugural day, specifically on 27th January 2009 Governor Gaidam stated in clear terms the stand of his regime to address these key social welfare challenges.

To achieve this broad development objective, Governor Gaidam further promised to ponder and persecute social welfare programs that would address poor healthcare, education and basic infrastructure like roads in order to promote the overall process of socio-economic development leading to democratic consolidation. This position remains important as Venter (2012) had earlier advanced that the success and or failure of democracy in any given political community are to some extent dependent on strong political will and the role of its important institutions and key actors. Soludo (2007) also advanced that the point of divergence between good and bad governance centres on the behaviour and attitude of key political leadership segment which influences political, economic and social closure and structure of democratic consolidation. It is in this regard that Ashiru (2008) once advanced this argument and showed that, if democratic governments produce nothing but general hunger, poverty, disease, squalor, unemployment and insecurity, the citizens would become disenchanted and disconnected with democracy thereby begin to question the expected socio-economic and welfare substance of democratic institutions in the country.

Mohammed and Alimba (2010) observes that democracy does not solely rest on political systems and structures put in place but rests on the quality of the performance of those responsible that is meant to operate it. For Cioaba (2014) this remains an “equivalent to relative guarantee of the continuity and stability of the democratic regime” thereby excluding the probability of returning to authoritarian regime. This indicates that the capacity of political regime to utilise resources, determine and implement social welfare policy choices influences the nature and outcome of democratic consolidation in any society. Dahl (1971) and Diamond (1999) have also previously suggested that the institutions of government where democracy exists must work to address the societal problems through effectiveness, responsiveness, and accountability of their political leadership. In essence, in order to deepen democratic consolidation, the current democratic regime in power must, therefore, justify its political legitimacy by producing sufficient positive social welfare policy outcomes towards improving the socio-economic lives and situations of its citizenry.

In Nigeria, each sub-national government particularly the state government which is the second tier of government, the governors are responsible for the steering of political and administrative machinery for expected social welfare through democratic outcomes. In return, this shapes the nature and dynamics of democratic consolidation in those states and the nation at large. The rationale behind such constitutional and political subdivision of powers to all the federating units in Nigeria is basically to improve responsiveness, accountability, and effectiveness in democratic regime’s performance towards the betterment of lives of their respective citizenry (Constitution of Nigeria, 1999). Omodia (2012) like many Nigerian scholars advanced this earlier position and showed that, its relevance lies in the fact that, socio-welfare aspects of democratic consolidation witnessed in Nigeria are consequences of the regime’s social welfare performance provided by the respective governments concerned at all the levels of democratic governance structure in the country.

Since Nigeria is a federal structure of 36 Federal states, every democratic regime is therefore in a position to plan, produce or actualise what they desire in achieving democratic consolidation. Importantly, political leaders while in power are thus expected to make the kind of choices their regime prefers (Errington, 2004). Also relevant is the fact that the formulation of social welfare policies, their implementation and the provision of social welfare services is a political process (Mwenzwa & Waweru, 2016). Since his assumption as Executive Governor of Yobe state on 27th January 2009, Gaidam’s regime is therefore expected to exercise political authority and utilise available resources in order to advance social welfare needs and demands of the citizens as is expected of responsible and accountable democratic regime. It is in this regard that, Gaidam’s regime from 2009 to 2015 served as a focal instrument of democratic consolidation assessed through the lenses of social welfare aspects of development towards understanding the how and why this democratic regime performed and its overall impact on the lives of the ordinary citizens in Yobe state.

1.2 Problem Statement

Democracy has for long time been propagated as an instrument that brings about socio-economic transformation through better institutions and structures of democratic governance (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Ewald, 2011; Huntington, 1991; Linz & Stepan, 1996; Przeworski et al, 2000). Hence, the establishment of new democratic regimes particularly across Nigerian states on May, 29th 1999 brings to fore the relevance of social welfare based on nature of performance at all levels of governance structure in achieving democratic consolidation. In the case of Yobe state, since its return to the fourth republic, Governor Bukar Abba Ibrahim became the first elected Governor whose regime lasted from 1999-2007. Subsequently, Senator Mamman Bello Ali who later became the second elected Governor in 2007 died just two years in his first term. His death therefore prompted the swearing in of his erstwhile deputy, Gaidam by January 2009. However, despite having two previous democratic regimes before Gaidam's and the efforts made to develop the state, its social welfare aspects important for democratic consolidation over the years remain unimpressive.

For instance, before Gaidam's regime could settle down in 2010, local, national and international reports indicated that democratic consolidation in the state was characterised by massive socio-economic deficits. It was evident that infrastructural development such as road access linking towns and villages were either absent or in a deplorable situation (NBS, 2010; UNDP, 2010). Similarly, in health, a significant number of children born in the state were underweight; Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) children under five Mortality Rate (U5MR) and Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) were all high (NBS, 2010; NPC & ICF Macro, 2008; MDG, 2010). In education, the situation also remained the same as student's enrollment, retention, and completion rate at basic education levels were only 10.1% (NBS, 2010; NPC & ICF Macro, 2008). Consequently, due to such extreme situations in its social welfare situation, Yobe state is considered impoverished and underdeveloped in Nigeria posing negative consequences on its nascent democratic consolidation over the years.

On assumption of office in 2009, Governor Gaidam therefore maintained that the development objective of his regime was to provide social welfare programmes that will address the then poor healthcare services, education deficiencies and provide basic infrastructure such as good road networks (YBSG, 2012). Importantly, his experience in the state civil service, closeness to the ordinary people and has served as Deputy Governor for some years was seen to have added value to the regime as it immediately embarked on major social welfare development programmes (YBSG, 2012). Since the regime's political declarations, citizen's expectations became high as the development objective in any social welfare policy is to address societal socio-economic and political challenges like poverty, unemployment, etc. (Mwenzwa & Waweru, 2016). In fact, with such renewed vigour, most of the citizens in Yobe state like elsewhere therefore expected that this democratic regime will serve their common interest in solving their shared social, economic and political problems through the better democratic governance process in achieving democratic consolidation.

However, the first concern of democratic consolidation under Governor Gaidam that can be exemplified in developing democracy is the nature of the regime's social welfare responsibility, accountability and responsiveness especially to its democratic promises earlier made to the citizenry. Although, such declarations made by politicians hardly come into reality as incumbent regimes fail to design any social welfare development agenda for the masses (Jega, 2007). Infact, Jega (2007), Ogali (2014) and Omodia (2012) had earlier observed that most democratic goals in Nigeria are only invoked as a mere sterile and empty slogan during the electioneering without in itself bringing about the needed gains of democracy and social welfare dividends commonly desired by most citizens. Hence, it became important to uncover whether Gaidam's regime only promised on the social welfare service seen as dividends of democracy as lip service or whether indeed there is any democratic and political commitment in terms of democratic outcome driven by competition, contestation and better regime performance (Ewald, 2011; Venter, 2011) in the state.

The second concern lies with the nature of regime performance towards addressing basic social welfare deficits such as poor health conditions of citizens, poor educational system and absent or dilapidated road infrastructure. These problems mostly characterised by diseases, high illiteracy, unemployment and poverty have continued to threaten democratic consolidation in the state over the years. To indicate its importance, since these problems are commonly shared by the citizens, Governor Gaidam on assumption of office promised to address them within available resources and time. Its significance indicates why Diamond (1999) earlier advanced that the institutions of government where democracy exists must work to address societal problems. In essence, any government in power must justify its political legitimacy by producing sufficient positive social welfare policy outcomes towards improving citizen's lives (Dahl, 1971). This justified the earlier assertion that democratic regimes must work hard to create an enabling socio-economic and political environment for sustainable democracy to thrive (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Carbone, 2012; Diamond, 1999; Grassi, 2014; Linz & Stepan, 1996; Rudebeck, 2016; Ojakorotu & Allen, 2009; Venter, 2012; Zakaria, 2013).

The third concern lies on the impact of the regime's social welfare performance on democratic consolidation especially as Yobe state is at the lowest ebb of socio-economic developments due to poor social welfare services (UNDP, 2010). Interestingly, the state remains under the control of an opposition party since the return of democracy in 1999 therefore neglected by the national government. More so even at the state government level, the successive regimes over the years have not been able to generate revenues internally even for the developmental needs of the state. This challenge had continued to make the state rely on monthly allocation from the national government. Furthermore, the dominance of some powerful elites mostly based on personalised interest has led to persisting problems of bad governance, stagnation and overall insecurity in the desert-ravaged state. Six years down the line of Gaidam's regime, it was pertinent to ask; how does the regime's social welfare performance from 2009-2015 affects democratic consolidation in Yobe state, Nigeria?

Generally, while in most developed nations and democracies, several studies have addressed the connection between social welfare and democracy and its consolidation, there is scant literature on such aspects in developing nations (Carbone, 2012). Specifically, investigating democratic consolidation in Nigeria is usually viewed in what Coppedge (1999) described as a “thin way” indicating that only a few most popular indicators were used by previous studies. For instance, some previous studies only detailed the transitional aspects of democratic consolidation (Abbas, 2013; Jega, 2007; Ojatorotu & Allen, 2009; Omotola, 2009) or focused on political parties, electoral system, and political violence (Aleyomi, 2014; Omotola, 2009). Evidently, the previous studies therefore only emphasised democratic deepening and political institutionalisation thereby neglecting regime’s social welfare performance in achieving democratic consolidation despite its currency and significance to most developing nations. It was against these backdrops that, this study explore an important (though not a well-explored area in Nigeria and Yobe state) regime’s social welfare performance at the level of state government and its impact on democratic consolidation.

The imperative of assessing regime’s social welfare performance on democratic consolidation becomes more glaring in developing nations undergoing democratisation simultaneously with issues of political transformation (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Diamond, 1999; Ewald, 2011; Przeworski et al, 2000; Schedler, 2001). Hence, for democracy to be established in developing nations, its political regimes must uphold the basic democratic principles alongside improving the social welfare of the citizens manifested in the ideological and policy positions by political players (Mwenzwa & Waweru, 2016). It is based on this position that Schedler (2001) advanced that political regime preference in terms of providing socio-economic development outcomes matters for democratic survival in developing nations. It is also in similar regard that Jega (2007) once suggested that regime’s social welfare performance in democratic governments should and must serve as the yardstick to either retain or vote political leaders out of office. Gilbert and Allen (2014), Ogali (2014) and Oloruntoba (2009), advanced this this approach and insisted that it is more needed as there is persistent gap between democratic expectations and social welfare realities and the poor conditions of people in Nigeria that continue to influence its democratic consolidation.

1.3 Research Questions

The main question asked in this study was; how does the regime’s social welfare performance from 2009-2015 affects democratic consolidation in Yobe state, Nigeria? Specific questions were:

- 1) What are the regime’s development objectives in social welfare aspects in achieving democratic consolidation?
- 2) How does the regime’s social welfare performance impact on democratic consolidation?

1.4 Objectives of the Study

To answer the research questions of this study, specific objectives were therefore outlined:

- 1) To explore the regime's development objectives in social welfare aspects in achieving democratic consolidation.
- 2) To assess the impact of the regime's social welfare performance on democratic consolidation.

1.5 Scope and Limitation of the Study

This study on democratic consolidation in the regime's social welfare performance of Governor Gaidam was only situated within the right frame and time. While previous studies used particular institutional variables to explain democratic consolidation at the national level, an important scope, particularly at sub-national levels, is missing despite its relevance to overall democratic consolidation in the literature. The sub-national scope in this study was adopted to provide an understanding of regime's social welfare performance on democratic consolidation particularly by its actors at the second level of democratic governance structure, particularly in Nigeria's federal democracy.

In view of the above, this study was particularly interested in the actions and inactions of the regime's social welfare performance in Yobe state Nigeria from 2009 to 2015. Within this frame, the Gaidam's regime was explored against its development objectives in healthcare, education and road infrastructure developments. The issues addressed specifically served as the focal point that provides a deeper understanding of informant's experiences on the regime's social welfare performance in achieving democratic consolidation. In view of this, an effort was only made to understand what the regime's development objectives in social welfare aspects were against the real social welfare performance on ground and its impact on democratic consolidation in the state over the years.

The study is therefore only limited to the understanding the regime's social welfare performance in healthcare, education and road infrastructure developments. The choices of these three social welfare variables were motivated by what some scholars of democratic consolidation referred to as "social and economic arena" (Bratton & Van de Walle, 1997; Diamond, 1999; Ewald, 2011; Huntington, 1991; Linz & Stepan, 1996; Przeworski et al, 2000; Schedler, 2001; Venter, 2011). In this study, the choice of the three particular frames means only the specific issues selected above considering their theoretical and political practical relevance for such developing societies like Nigeria and Yobe state, in particular, undergoing socio-economic transformation served as the yardstick for assessing social welfare performance and democratic consolidation in this study.

However, the first key limitation that confronted this study was that there seems to be no single previous study on regime's social welfare performance in achieving democratic consolidation at sub-national levels in Nigeria. In view of the above, most studies related to in the current study were mostly from other developing democracies and nations that might have had the same or similar experience with Nigeria's nascent democracy and its consolidation challenges. However, by maintaining the perspective that Nigeria and Yobe state in particular are at its nascent stage of democracy, all the issues discussed in the study were carefully treated in tandem with the reality on the ground.

Another limitation is that the data that emerged from the study are only the perceptions of some informants (ruling, opposition party, and civil society members) in the state. This further means that, although, the informants have covered various political, economic and social backgrounds related to social welfare performance in Yobe state's democracy, the study does not intend to generalise its findings. More importantly, there exist different socio-economic development and political dynamics across the Nigerian federal states despite mutual similarities. However, not minding the above limitation, this study could be used as an emergent model for assessing the prospects, opportunities and pitfalls surrounding most democratic regimes at state government's level and its impact on democratic consolidation particularly in Nigeria and other developing nations and democracies.

1.6 Significance and Contribution of the Study

The return of democratic experiment in Nigeria since 1999 has been extensively detailed by scholars leading to micro and macro studies of democracy and democratic consolidation. Hence, numerous books, articles in journals and scores of graduate studies have provided the nature and dynamics of Nigeria's democracy which in the process attracted wide-ranging interpretations. However, despite this valuable contribution, it was observed that previous studies on democratic consolidation so far conducted in Nigeria were investigated without necessarily considering all its important multi-dimensional aspects such as the concentration on particular political regime, regime's social welfare responsibility, performance, impact and even the level of democratic governance structure.

The significance of the current study in the regime's social welfare of Governor Gaidam in Yobe state Nigeria and the explanation for such neglect in the current literature is not only crucial to the advancement of democratic consolidation but will certainly fill the gap in the existing literature. This is imperative as the current study emphasised on the unexplored, emergent nature and dynamics of social welfare performance in achieving democratic consolidation especially in developing democracies undergoing a socio-economic and political transformations. This study particularly uncovered that the role of sub-national democratic regimes in social welfare are considered important since their overall success and failure must not be subsumed and wrongly attributed to national political actors who do not bear such political responsibility in the real political sense in the country.

It should be noted that state governors who pilot the democratic governance structures have their individual social welfare preference that needs assessment within the democratic consolidation frames. In essence, each regime is worth responding to at all levels of democratic governance structure. By making effort to uncover what constitutes the regime's social welfare performance and assessing their official duties and responsibilities at various levels of governments, this study challenged democratic regimes at all levels of governance to deliver better social welfare needs of the citizens. This hopefully will provide purposeful political regimes which are needed for its socio-economic development, better living standards of citizens and democratic consolidation in Nigeria.

As another contribution, an attempt was made to show the connections of the regime's effects of pro-poor social welfare policies in achieving democratic consolidation in Yobe state, Nigeria. This finding is useful to nations that are undergoing a socio-economic development and political transformation as efforts to juxtapose regime's social welfare performance through emergent nature, dynamics and political trends of democratic consolidation are uncovered. Based on this, this study provides better insight of practical perspective and a real understanding of the current social welfare conditions, opportunities and the challenges that exist in developing democracies and how those democracies are consolidated which is much needed in Nigeria, Africa and beyond.

A clearer understanding of the citizen's perception in the social welfare aspect of democratic consolidation is needed by all democratic and political stakeholders. By making efforts to have uncovered and addressed both important contextual and theoretical factors that shape democratic consolidation, this study contributed as an important reference point on regime's social welfare performance in achieving democratic consolidation in developing democracies, especially at the sub-national level. Hence, this study will add value to the existing literature on developmental democracy, social welfare performance, socio-economic transformation and development and generally democratic consolidation especially in most developing democracies as it is attached academic value.

1.7 Conceptual and Operational Definitions

Democratic Consolidation

Democratic consolidation is a process through which new democracy matures, in a way that is unlikely to revert to authoritarianism without any form of external shock. Hence, "consolidation occurs in a democracy when a complex system of institutions, rules, and patterned incentives and disincentives has become the only game in town" (Linz and Stepan, 1996:15). In developing nations, in order to achieve democratic consolidation, the democratic regimes must through its constituted and mandated authorities justify its political legitimacy by producing sufficient policy outcomes towards improving the lives of its citizenry. Hence, democratic consolidation in this study means the process and outcome of socio-economic development provided by

political institutions of democratic government in an attempt to address the pressing societal needs and problems.

Socio-economic development

Socio-economic development is regarded as the positive changes in factors regarded as important and essential for the state's viability and the functioning of economy and the market of the society (Linz & Stepan, 1996). Hence, democracy can survive in areas where there are good health services, affordable education and effective transport system as it improves the quality of life of the citizens (Diamond, 1999; Linz & Stepan, 1996; Przeworski et al, 2000; Zakaria, 2013). Hence, socio-economic development in this study will mean this democratic regime's priority policies, projects and programmes in the areas of public goods such as affordable healthcare services, qualitative educational services and effective transport system through good road infrastructure development. In Yobe state, these basic needs provide the citizens with better social, economic and political opportunities and poverty reduction thereby improving their living standard and wellbeing.

Regime's performance

Regime's performance which is described as "quality of political regime" by Salifu (2014:33) is referred to as the degree to which performance of regime correlates with established procedure and standard behaviours of the political system. In other words, it is a democratic governance system which describes how political actors acts in different interactions. Hence, the functions of democratic regime as applied in this study means the legitimate use of state powers to manage social, political and economic resources through the initiation and implementation of state developmental policies and objectives for the improvement of the lives of the citizenry. Overall, regime performance remains a function that provide some kind of workable actions, solutions to societal problems and results that must be seen, felt and appreciated by the ordinary citizens. To justify its political legitimacy in system, every democratic regime is therefore expected to work and produce sufficient positive and relevant social welfare policy outcomes for the improvement of the lives of the citizenry.

Social welfare

The term welfare generally refers to a series of benefits (social, economic and political) that are enjoyed by individual and communities as their collective rights to public goods (Carbone, 2012; Ghaffary & Azizimehr, 2015; Grassi, 2014). While most studies included transfers, subsidies, compensations, and special services for deserving population (old age, sick, maternity, disability, unemployment and the poor) financed through public expenditure, in this study social welfare is grouped in to regime's specific policy input, process and output (access to basic health services, basic education and road network) for improved socio-economic development of the citizens and their respective communities. In this context, social welfare is simply described as the general well-being of the majority of citizens that is considered most acceptable in that political society (Crowe, 2011). In broad outcomes, social welfare is expected to improve the standard of living of the citizens by the development of human capability, job creation, poverty reduction and lowering of inequality, etc

which is considered positive for the overall development of individual and their communities.

1.8 Organisation of Thesis

The study is divided into six chapters. The first chapter contains the introductory aspect of the study. It explains the background of the study, problem statement and objectives of the study. This chapter also explains the scope it covers and significance of the study. Chapter two provides literature review, conceptual and theoretical frameworks. Chapter three explains the research methodology adopted in this study. Chapter four and five analysed the findings for this study. Chapter six finally draws a conclusion, offer implications and make a recommendation for the study.

1.9 Conclusion

This chapter provides background information about the study as well as covering the main issues it addressed. Specifically, some pertinent research questions were outlined to uncover the regime's development objectives in social welfare aspects in achieving democratic consolidation; the impact of the regime's healthcare; education and road infrastructure developments and its impact on democratic consolidation in Yobe state. Overall, the general objective of the study was to assess the regime's social welfare performance in achieving democratic consolidation in Yobe state, Nigeria from 2009-2015. In the next chapter, literature review, conceptual and theoretical frameworks were provided.

REFERENCES

- Abbas, A. I. (2013). Post-military era and the challenges of democratic governance in Nigeria. *Africa Dynamics of Social Science Review*, 4 (1), 56-70.
- Abd Ghani et al. (2016). Analysis of healthcare system in Iraq. *The Social Sciences*, 11 (11): 2877-2884. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3923/sscience.2016.2877.2884>
- Ake, C. (2000). *Feasibility democracy in Africa*. Dakar, Senegal: Council for the Development of Social Science in Africa.
- Ager, A. K., Lembani, M., Mohammed, A., Mohammed Ashir, G., Abdulwahab, A., de Pinho, H., Zarowsky, C. (2015). Health service resilience in Yobe state, Nigeria in the context of the Boko Haram insurgency: a systems dynamics analysis using group model building. *Conflict and Health*, 9(June 2016), 30. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13031-015-0056-3>
- Aleyomi, M.B. (2014). Renewing Nigeria's democracy: The role of political party system viabilities. *The journal of Pan African studies*, 6 (10), 93-110. <http://www.jpanafrican.com/docs/vol6no10/6.10-8-Aleyomi.pdf>
- Andres, L., Biller, D., & Dappe, M. H. (2016). A methodological framework for prioritising infrastructure investment. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 8(2), 111–127. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930616667886>
- Andrew. B. J., Basu, D., & Soyly, C. (2016). The effect of public health expenditure on infant mortality: Evidence from a panel of Indian states, 1983–1984 to 2011–2012. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 0(0), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2016.1241384>
- Anyanwu, J. C. (2016). Accounting for gender equality in secondary school enrollment in Africa. *African Development Review*, 28(2), 170–191. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8268.12188>
- Arthur, F. E. (2016). Budgeting in budget management centres (BMCs) in Sekondi /Takoradi metro health directorate, *Journal of Social Science for Policy Implications*, 7(2), 208–22. <https://doi.org/10.15640/10.15640/jsspi.v4n1a4>
- Ashiru, D. (2008, August). *Youth, political participation and democratic consolidation in Nigeria*. Paper presented at the International Conference on Nigerian Youth and National Development, the Centre for Democratic Research and Training, Kano.
- Babbie, E. (2010). *The practice of social research*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

- Barrett, A. M. (2011). An education millennium development goal for quality: complexity and democracy. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 41(1), 145–148. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2011.534853>
- Barrett, A. M. & Tikly, L. (2011). Social justice, capabilities and the quality of education in low income countries. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 31(1), 3–14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2010.06.001>
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. London: Allen and Bacon.
- Bratton, M. & van de Walle, N. (1997). *Democratic experiments in Africa: Regime transitions in comparative perspective*. Cambridge, U.K: Cambridge University Press.
- Burón, G. C., & Lassibille, G. (2016). Job satisfaction among primary school personnel in Madagascar. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 52(11), 1628–1646. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2016.1187726>
- Carbone, G. (2012). Do new democracies deliver social welfare? Political regimes and health policy in Ghana and Cameroon. *Democratization*, 19(2), 157–183. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2011.572618>
- Carson, L., Noronha, J. V, & Trebilcock, M. J. (2015). Held Back : Explaining the sluggish pace of improvement to basic education in developing democracies – The Cases of India and Brazil. *Journal of Poverty Alleviation and International Development*, 6(2). <http://jpaid.yonsei.ac.kr/>
- Cetorelli, V., & Shabila, N. P. (2014). Expansion of health facilities in Iraq a decade after the US-led invasion, 2003-2012. *Conflict and Health*, 8(1), 16. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1752-1505-8-16>
- Chatterji, M., Mohan, S., & Dastidar, S. G. (2015). Determinants of public education expenditure: evidence from Indian states. *International Journal of Education Economics and Development*, 6(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJEED.2015.068355>
- Cioaba, A. (2014). Democratic consolidation in Romania : Theoretical landmarks. *Pol. Sc. Int. Rel*, XI(2), 60–76. <http://journal.ispri.ro/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/60-76-Cioaba.pdf>
- Conover, T. (2010). *The routes of man: How roads are changing the world and the way we live today*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.
- Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria (1999 as Amended)

- Coppedge, M. (1999, August). *How the large N could complement the small in democratization Research*. A paper presented at the Conference on “Regime and Political Change in Latin America, University of Illinois-Urbana-Champaign.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*. Boston: Pearson Education Inc.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
- Crowe, H. (2011). The impact Of political corruption on social welfare in the Federal Republic of Nigeria. Master’s Thesis University of Central Florida. <http://stars.library.ucf.edu/etd/1913>
- Dahl, R. A. (1971). *Polyarchy*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- De, P. (2013). Does governance matter for infrastructure development? Empirical evidence from Asia. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 4, 153–180. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930612465226>
- Demenge, J. (2015). Development theory, regional politics and the unfolding of the “Roadscape” in Ladakh, North India. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 7(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930615578498>
- Demenge, J., Alba, R., Welle, K., Manjur, K., Addisu, A., Mehta, L., & Woldearegay, K. (2015). Multifunctional roads: The potential effects of combined roads and water harvesting infrastructure on livelihoods and poverty in Ethiopia. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 7(2), 165–180. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930615609482>
- Diamond, L. (1997). Is the third wave over? *Journal of Democracy*, 7 (3), July 1997.
- Diamond, L. (1999). *Developing democracy: Toward consolidation*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Diwakar, V. (2015). The effect of armed conflict on education: Evidence from Iraq. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 51(12), 1702–1718. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2015.1056786>
- Errington, W. (2004, Sept-Oct.). *Kim Dae-Jung and the consolidation of democracy in South Korea*. Paper presented to the Australasian Political Studies Association Conference, University of Adelaide.
- Ewald, J. (2011). *Challenges for the democratisation process in Tanzania. Moving towards consolidation 50 years after independence?* PhD Thesis University of Gothenburg

- FMW. (2013). Compendium report on road infrastructural and related development in Nigeria- An inventors manual. *Federal Ministry of Works, Nigeria*. <http://pwh.gov.ng/download/AninvestorManualFMW,CompendiumReportpdf.pdf>
- Fukuda-Parr, S., Yamin, A. E., & Greenstein, J. (2014). The power of numbers: A critical review of millennium development goal targets for human development and human rights. *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 15(2–3), 105–117. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19452829.2013.864622>
- Ghaffary, G. R., & Azizimehr, K. (2015). Government, civil society and welfare policies in modern Iran, *Journal of Social Science for Policy Implications*, 3(2), 63–82. <https://doi.org/10.15640/10.15640/jsspi.v3n2a4>
- Gilbert, L. D. & Allen, F. (2014). Democracy and good governance: The missing link in Nigeria. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 5 (16), 524–531. Doi:10.5901/mjss.2014.v5n16p524
- Grassi, D. (2014). Democracy, social welfare and political violence: the case of Latin America. *Journal of International Relations and Development*, 17(2), 242–273. <https://doi.org/10.1057/jird.2013.1>
- Haddad, M. A., Freguglia, R., & Gomes, C. (2016). Public spending and quality of education in Brazil. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 0(0), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2016.1241387>
- Haque, I. (2016). Infrastructure development and access to basic amenities in class-I cities of West Bengal, India: Insights from census data. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 8(1), 36–84. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930616640089>
- Heras-Mosteiro, J., Sanz-Barbero, B., & Otero-Garcia, L. (2016). Health care austerity measures in times of crisis: The perspectives of primary health care physicians in Madrid, Spain. *International Journal of Health Services: Planning, Administration, Evaluation*, 46(2), 283–299. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020731415625251>
- Hope, Sr, K. R. (2010). Infrastructure Constraints and Development in Kenya: An Analytical Review. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 2(March), 91–104. <https://doi.org/10.1177/097493061100200201>
- Hota, A. K., & Rout, H. S. (2015). Health infrastructure in Odisha with special reference to Cuttack and Bhubaneswar cities. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 7(2), 151–164. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930615617275>
- Huntington, S. P. (1991). *The third wave: Democratisation in the late twentieth century*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press.

- Huntington, S. P. (1996). *Political order in changing societies*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Heywood, A. (2002). *Politics*, 2nd ed. Hampshire & New York: Palgrave.
- Ibrahim Index of African Governance (2014). *Data report*. www.moibrahimfoundation.org
- Iheanacho, E. N. (2013). Democracy and good governance in Nigeria: Challenges and prospects. *International Journal of Advanced Legal Studies and Governance*, 4 (3), 64-72
- Ivanova, E., & Masarova, J. (2013). Importance of road infrastructure in the economic development and competitiveness, *Economics and Management*, 18(2), 263–274. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5755/j01.em.18.2.4253>
- Jega, A. M. (2007), *Democracy, good governance and development in Nigeria: Critical essays*. Lagos: Spectrum Books Limited
- Jinadu, L. A. (2011, October). *Inter-Party dialogue in Nigeria: Examining the past, present and future*. Lead paper presented at the inaugural DGD Political Parties Dialogue Series, at Bolingo Hotel, Abuja. [web.ng.undp.org/dgd/resources/INTER-PARTY-DIALOGUE-LEAD PAPER.pdf](http://web.ng.undp.org/dgd/resources/INTER-PARTY-DIALOGUE-LEAD-PAPER.pdf)
- Jerome, A. (2012). Infrastructure, economic growth and poverty reduction in Africa. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 3(2), 127–151. <https://doi.org/10.1177/097493061100300203>
- Kang, W. (2014). Inequality, the welfare system and satisfaction with democracy in South Korea. *International Political Science Review*, 0192512114521053-. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0192512114521053>
- Kayode, G. A., Adekanmbi, V. T., & Uthman, O. A. (2015). Risk factors and a predictive model for under-five mortality in Nigeria : evidence from Nigeria demographic and health survey. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth* 2012, 12:10 <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1471-2393/12/10>
- Kinmond, K. (2012). *Coming up with a research question*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Klaiman, T., Chainani, A., & Bekemeier, B. (2016). The importance of partnerships in local health department practice among communities with exceptional maternal and child health outcomes. *Journal of Public Health Management and Practice*, 0(0), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1097/PHH.0000000000000402>
- Lewin, K. M. (2015). Goals and indicators for education and development: Consolidating the architectures. <https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/lewin-goals->

- Lindsay, A. K., & Kongolo, M. (2015). Rural roads and agricultural development in Swaziland. *Journal of Social Science Studies*, 2(1), 209. <https://doi.org/10.5296/jsss.v2i1.6561>
- Linz, J. J. & Stepan, A. (1996). Toward consolidated democracy. *Journal of Democracy* 7 (2) 14-33.
- Linz, J. J. and Stepan, A. (2001). *Toward consolidated democracy: The global divergence of democracies*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Lipset, S. M. (1960). *Political man: The social bases of politics*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday.
- Lunze, K., Higgins-Steele, A., Simen-Kapeu, A., Vesel, L., Kim, J., & Dickson, K. (2015). Innovative approaches for improving maternal and newborn health--A landscape analysis. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth*, 15, 337. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-015-0784-9>
- Madhav, G. (2007, July). *Report of the one man committee on good governance, Human right watch "2007 Election or Selection? Human rights abuse and threats to free and fair elections in Nigeria*. <http://hrw.org/backgrounder/africa/nigeria0407/index.ht>
- Makate, M. (2016). Education policy and under-five survival in Uganda: Evidence from the demographic and health surveys. <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci5040070>
- Marshall, C. & Rossman, G. (2014). *Designing qualitative research*. Sage Publications.
- MDG. (2010). *Nigeria 2010 Millennium Development Goals Report*. MDG: Abuja. http://www.sparcnigeria.com/RC/files/4.2.1_Nigeria_Millennium_Development_Goals_Report_2010.pdf
- MDG. (2013). *Nigeria Millennium Development Goals: 2013 Report*, 1–72. http://www.ng.undp.org/content/dam/nigeria/docs/MDGs/UNDP_NG_MDGsReport2013.pdf%5Cwww.mdgs.gov.ng
- MDG. (2015). *Millennium Development Goals Report*. United Nations, 72. <https://doi.org/978-92-1-101320-7>
- Merriam, S. B. (2014). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. John Wiley & Sons
- Mohammed, K. & Alimba, C.N. (2010, February). *Peace and good governance in Nigeria, 1999-2008*. A paper presented at the 2nd National Conference of the Centre for Peace, Diplomatic & Development Studies, University of

Maiduguri.

- Mohanty, A. K., Nayak, N. C., & Chatterjee, B. (2016). Does infrastructure affect human development? Evidences from Odisha, India. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 8(1), 1–26. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930616640086>
- Moller, U. & Schierenbeck, I. (2014). *Political leadership, nascent statehood and democracy: A comparative study*. New York: Routledge.
- Mottiar, S. (2002). *Democratic consolidation in South Africa*. https://eisa.org.za/pdf/SAdem_cons_mott1.pdf
- Morlino, L. (2011). *Changes for Democracy: Actors, Structures, Processes*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mudi, A., Lowe, J., & Manase, D. (2015). Conceptual framework for public-private financed road infrastructure development in Nigeria, *Journal of Management and Sustainability*, 5(4), 586–590. <https://doi.org/10.5539/jms.v5n4p58>
- Mukanu, M. M., Zulu, J. M., Mweemba, C., & Mutale, W. (2017). Responding to non-communicable diseases in Zambia: a policy analysis. *Health Research Policy and Systems*, 15(1), 34. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12961-017-0195-7>
- Mwenzwa, E. M. Waweru. S. M. (2016). The oscillating state's role in the provision of social welfare services in Kenya. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 6(5), 119–128. http://www.ijhssnet.com/journals/Vol_6_No_5_May_2016/15.pdf
- Nallathiga, R. (2015). Assessing the infrastructure level and growth performance of Indian states. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 7(1), 76–100. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930615581225>
- Nandy, S. N. (2014). Road infrastructure in economically underdeveloped North-east India: A district level study. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 6(2), 131–144. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974930614564648>
- NBS (2010). *Poverty profile for Nigeria*. Abuja: National Bureau of Statistics. <http://www.nigerianstat.gov.ng/pdfuploads/Nigeria%20Poverty%20Profile%202010.pdf>
- Neuman, W. L. (2014). *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches. Relevance of social research* (Vol. 8). <https://doi.org/10.2307/3211488>
- Newman, S. J., & Leep, C. J. (2016). A look at local public health governance. *Journal of Public Health Management and Practice*, 22(6), 609–611. <https://doi.org/10.1097/PHH.0000000000000476>

- Ningi, A. I., Talib, A. T., Bint, L., Paim, H. J., & Gill, S. S. (2016). Insights into an entrenched value element and its socio-economic effects on girl-child education in rural Yobe state, Nigeria. *International Journal of Research in Humanities, Arts and Literature*, 4(3), 5–14.
- NPC & ICF Macro (2008). Nigeria demographic and health survey: Abuja, Nigeria/Calverton, MD USA: National Population Commission and ICF Macro. 2009. http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PNADQ923.pdf
- Ntambue, A. M., Malonga, F. K., Dramaix-Wilmet, M., Ngatu, R. N., & Donnen, P. (2016). Better than nothing? maternal, newborn, and child health services and perinatal mortality, Lubumbashi, democratic republic of the Congo: a cohort study. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth*, 16(1), 89. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-016-0879-y>
- Nwakeze, N. M., & Kandala, N. B. (2011). The spatial distribution of health establishments in Nigeria. *Etude de La Population Africaine*, 25(2), 680–696.
- O' Donnell, G. (1996). Illusions about consolidation. *Journal of Democracy*, 7, 2, April.
- Ogali, M. D. (2014). Leadership, participatory democracy and good governance in Nigeria. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4 (27), 153-162. Retrieved online from www.iiste.org
- Ogundiya, I. S. (2010). Democracy and good governance: Nigeria's dilemma. *African Journal of Political Science and International Relations*, 4 (6), 201-208. <http://www.academicjournals.org/ajpsir>
- Ojajorotu, V. & Allen, F. (2009). From “authoritarian rule” to “democracy” in Nigeria: Citizens' welfare a myth or reality. *Journal of Alternative Perspectives in the Social Sciences*, 1 (2), 152-192. <http://www.japss.org/upload/3allen%26victor.pdf>
- Oliva, J. C. M. 2017. On the road : Connectivity infrastructures in Southeast Asia, *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, 1(1), 98–111. <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v1i1.6>
- Oloruntoba, S. O. (2008, August). *The Role of youth in democratic consolidation in fragile states: The Nigerian experience*. Paper presented at the International Conference on Nigerian Youth and National Development, the Centre for Democratic Research and Training, Kano.
- Oluwole, O. E. (2014). The challenges of democratic consolidation in Nigeria, 1999-2007. *International Journal of Politics and Good Governance*, 5 (5.1) 1-29. <http://www.onlineresearchjournals.com/ijopagg/art/145.pdf>
- Omodia, S.M. (2012). Political leadership and national security in the Nigerian fourth republic: A discourse. *African Journal of Social Sciences*, 2 (4), 90-96.

- Omotola, J. S. (2009). Garrison democracy in Nigeria: The 2007 general elections and the prospects for democratic consolidation. *Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*, 47 (2), 194-220.
- Oo, M. Z. (2010). *From Democratic Transition to Consolidation: The Analysis of 115 Cases of Democratic Transitions in Eighty-six Countries from 1955 to 2007*. PhD Thesis George Mason University. <https://search.proquest.com/docview/288218430?pq-origsite=gscholar>
- Opawole, A., Jagboro, G. O., Babatunde, S. O., & Opawole, M. . (2013). Critical factors in road infrastructure development in Osun state, south western Nigeria. *International Journal of Development and Sustainability*, 2(1), 240–253. <http://isdsnet.com/ijds-v2n1-17.pdf>
- Owino, J. O., & Miruka, C. O. (2014). Towards universal free primary education in Kenya: Challenges and opportunities. *International Journal of Education Economics and Development*, 5(4), 305–318. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJEED.2014.067192>
- Oyedele, O. A. (2012). The challenges of infrastructure development in democratic governance. *Journal of Business Administration and Management Sciences Research*, 2 6-10. https://www.fig.net/resources/proceedings/fig_proceedings/fig2012/papers/ts01c/TS01C_oyedele_6119.pdf
- Oyibocha, E., Irinoye, O., Sagua, E., Ogungide – Essien, O., Edeki, J., & Okome, O. (2014). Sustainable healthcare system in Nigeria: Vision, strategies and challenges. *IOSR Journal of Economics and Finance (IOSR-JEF)*, 5(2), 28–39. <http://www.iosrjournals.org/iosr-jef/papers/vol5-issue2/D0522839.pdf>
- Pennings, P., Keman, H., & Kleinnijenhuis, J. (2006). *Doing research in political science* 2nd ed. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849209038>
- Phuong, M., & Wolfgang, L. (2014). Conceptualizing quality education from the paradigm of recognition. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 5(18), 178–192. <http://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JEP/article/view/13938/14090>
- Prior, L. (2008). *Document analysis. The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods*. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909>
- Przeworski, A. Alvarez, M. E., Cheibub, J. A., & Limongi, F. (2000). *Democracy and development: Political institutions and well-being in the World, 1950-1990*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Przeworski, A. (2006, April). Identifying the causal effect of political regimes on employment. Revised Paper Prepared for a Conference on Method and Substance in Macro Comparative Analysis Amsterdam, 1–26.

<http://econ.as.nyu.edu/docs/IO/2800/amsterdam.pdf>

- Rai, R. K., Singh, P. K., & Singh, L. (2012). Utilization of maternal health care services among married adolescent women: Insights from the Nigeria demographic and health survey, 2008. *Women's Health Issues*, 22(4), e407–e414. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.whi.2012.05.001>
- RAWG (2011). *Poverty and human development Report*. Research and Analysis Working Group, United Republic of Tanzania. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. http://www.repoa.or.tz/documents/Poverty_and_Human_Development_Report_2011.pdf
- Richardson, P. (2008). *Good Governance: The challenge of leadership in Africa*. International Management Conference; Nigeria Institute of Management
- Rudebeck, L. (2016). Democracy and development –A disputed pair, *Africa Development*, Volume XLI, 1, 1-22. <https://www.ajol.info/index.php/ad/article/view/153822/143409>
- Salifu, O. (2014). *Measuring the quality of democracy in Ghana: A comparative assessment of studies conducted by Freedom House, the Economic Intelligence Unit, the Ibrahim Index and the African Peer Review Mechanism (between 2005-2010)*. Master thesis in Political Science, University of Pretoria
- Samuel, K. J. (2010). Infrastructure location: The changing modelling frameworks. *Journal of Infrastructure Development*, 2(1), 71–90. <https://doi.org/10.1177/097493061100200104>
- Santinha, G. (2016). Governance for health: Is the cultural lone ranger behaviour still prevailing? Perspectives from policy-makers in Portugal. *Public Policy and Administration*, 31(2), 147–168. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0952076715595134>
- Sen, G., & Mukherjee, A. (2014). No empowerment without rights, no rights without politics: Gender-equality, MDGs and the post-2015 development agenda. *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 15(2–3), 188–202. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19452829.2014.884057>
- Schedler, A. (1998). What is democratic consolidation? *Journal of Democracy* 9.2 (1998) 91-107.
- Schedler, A. (2001). Measuring democratic consolidation. *Studies in Comparative International Development*, 36 (1): 66-92.
- Scheerens, J., Luyten, H., & Ravens, J. (2011). *Perspectives on educational quality*. SpringerBriefs in Education, DOI: 10.1007/978-94-007-0926-3_2
- Shin, D. C & Wells, J. (2005). Challenge and change in East Asia: Is democracy only game in town? *Journal of Democracy* 16 (2). 88-101. DOI: 10.1353/jod.2005.0036

- Senadza, B. & Hodey, L.S. (2015). Effect of public education expenditure on selected primary education outcomes in Sub-Saharan Africa, *Int. J. Education Economics and Development*, 6(4), 314–330.
- Shabila, N. P., Ahmed, H. M., & Yasin, M. Y. (2014). Women's views and experiences of antenatal care in Iraq: a Q methodology study. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth*, 14, 43. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2393-14-43>
- Shimeles and Verdier-Chouchane (2016). The key role of education in reducing poverty in South Sudan. *African Development Review*, 28, 162–176. <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/1467-8268.12199/epdf>
- Socci, C., Ciaschini, M., Toffoli, L., Ciaschini, M., Socci, C., & Toffoli, L. (2014). Education services and reallocation of government expenditure, *Int. J. Edu Econ & Development*, 6(1), 38–58. <http://www.inderscienceonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1504/IJEED.2015.068359>
- Soludo, C. C. (2007, February). *Creating effective governance and leadership for sustained national prosperity*. Paper presentation delivered at 12th Murtala Muhammed Memorial Lecture, ECOWAS Auditorium, Abuja
- Stifel, D., Minten, B., & Koru, B. (2013). Economic benefits of rural feeder roads: Evidence from Ethiopia, *The Journal of Development Studies*, DOI: 10.1080/00220388.2016.1175555
- Stiftung, K. A. (2011). *Concepts and principles of democratic governance and accountability: A guide for peer educators*. Uganda's action for strengthening good governance and accountability, supported by the European Union
- Stojanova, A. (2013). *Elites or mass-driven democratic consolidation? Western Balkans in comparative perspectives*, PhD Thesis, IMT Institute for Advanced Studies, Luca, Italy
- Susuman, A. S. (2017). HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia: Health view. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 52(3), 302–313. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0021909615570957>
- Tambulasi, R. I. C., & Chasukwa, M. (2015). Holding the brains back in: An assessment of measures against brain drain in the Malawian health. *Africa Review*, 37–41. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09744053.2015.1030867>
- Timothy, N. E. (2016). Bridging the barriers: ICT in the girl-child education in Nigeria. *Developing Country Studies* 6(10), 44–51. <http://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/DCS/article/view/33357/34297>
- Ujoh, F., & Kwaghsende, F. (2014). Analysis of the spatial distribution of health facilities in Benue state, Nigeria. *Public Health Research*, 4(5), 210–218. <https://doi.org/10.5923/j.phr.20140405.09>

- Umar, A. S., & Bawa, S. B. (2016). Determinants of institutional delivery in Yobe state, Nigeria, *American Journal of Public Health Research*, 4(1), 1-7. <https://doi.org/10.12691/ajphr-4-1-1>
- UNDP. (2010). *Nigerian human development report: Achieving growth with equity*. UNDP: Abuja.
- UNDP. (2015). *Human Development Report 2015. Work for Human Development*. Retrieved from http://hdr.undp.org/sites/all/themes/hdr_theme/country-notes/MEX.pdf
- UNESCO. (2012), *World atlas of gender equality in education*. Paris; UNESCO. <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002155/215522E.pdf>
- UNESCO. (2014). *Global Education for All meeting (GEM): Final statement, the Muscat Agreement*. Muscat, Oman: UNESCO.
- UNESCO. (2015). *Education for all 2000-2015: Achievements and challenges*. EFA global monitoring report, <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0023/002322/232205e.pdf>
- Unterhalter, E. (2014). Measuring education for the millennium development goals: Reflections on targets, indicators, and a post-2015 framework. *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*, 15(3–Feb), 176–187. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19452829.2014.880673>
- USAID (2011) Policy brief: The impact of education across sectors: Democracy. http://www.equip123.net/docs/E2_PB_Impact_Education_Across_Sectors_Democracy.pdf
- van de Walle, D. (2009). Impact evaluation of rural road projects. *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 1(1), 15–36. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19439340902727701>
- Veenendaal, W. P. & Corbett, J. (2015). Why small states offer important answers to large question. *Comparative Political Studies*, 48 (4), 527-549. Doi: 10.1177/0010414014554687
- Venter, D. (2012, August). *The imperatives of democracy, governance and leadership in the fight against corruption in Africa: A South African perspective*. Paper presented at the International Conference on Democratic Governance: Challenges in Africa and Asia, University of Pennsylvania.
- Walt, E. (2016). 300 abducted Nigerian school children still missing after one year. <http://theirworld.org/news/300-abducted-nigerian-school-children-still-missing-after-one-year>
- WDI. (2014). *World development indicators*. The World Bank. <http://data.worldbank.org>

- WHO (2014). World health statistics 2014 indicator compendium. <http://public.eblib.com/EBLPublic/PublicView.do?ptiID=1741840>
- Yin, R. K. (2011). *Qualitative research from start to finish*. New York: The Guild Ford Press.
- Yeager, V. A., Wisniewski, J. M., Amos, K., & Bialek, R. (2016). Why do people work in public health? Exploring recruitment and retention among public health workers. *Journal of Public Health Management and Practice : JPHMP*, 22(6), 559–566. <https://doi.org/10.1097/PHH.0000000000000380>
- Yeji, F., Shibanuma, A., Oduro, A., Debpuur, C., Kikuchi, K., Owusu-Agei, S., ... Kamiya, Y. (2015). Continuum of care in a maternal, newborn and child health program in Ghana: Low completion rate and multiple obstacle factors. *PLoS ONE*, 10(12), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0142849>
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2010). Yobe State Strategic Health Development Plan (2010-2015). <http://www.mamaye.org/sites/default/files/evidence/Yobe%20Naration2.pdf>
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2012). Yobe Policy Document for the Implementation of programmes and projects (2011-2015)
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2013). Yobe State Health Sector Medium Term Strategy (MTSS) (2014-2016)
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2014a). Yobe State Education Sector Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF)
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2014b). Yobe State Human Resource for Health Policy (HRFHP)
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2014c). Yobe State Health Sector Performance Review Report (HSPRR)
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2016a). Yobe State Free MNCH Programme 2015 Progress Report
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2016b). Yobe State Primary Healthcare Under One Roof (PHCUOR)
- Yobe State Government (YBSG) (2016c). Yobe State Situational Report on the impact of Boko Haram insurgency in Yobe state
- YOSERA (Yobe Socio-Economic Reform Agenda). Versions I (2004-2008), II (2008-2011); III (2011-2015); IV (2016-2020)
- Zakaria. S.M. (2013). *Democratic consolidation in Bangladesh: A reality check*. IGS working paper series No. 16/2013, Published by the Institute of Governance Studies, BRAC University, July 2013