

UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

MOLECULAR PHYLOGENY OF MALAYSIAN GROUPERS INFERRED FROM MITOCHONDRIAL (Cytochrome b) AND NUCLEAR (Tmo-4c4 AND Rag-1) GENES

NOR SYAKINA BINTI NOR RAHIM

FP 2017 45



MOLECULAR PHYLOGENY OF MALAYSIAN GROUPERS INFERRED FROM MITOCHONDRIAL (Cytochrome b) AND NUCLEAR (Tmo-4c4 AND Rag-1) GENES



Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Science

May 2017

COPYRIGHT

All material within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Used may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright© Universiti Putra Malaysia

C



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science

MOLECULAR PHYLOGENY OF MALAYSIAN GROUPERS INFERRED FROM MITOCHONDRIAL (Cytochrome b) AND NUCLEAR (Tmo-4c4 AND Rag-1) GENES

By

NOR SYAKINA BINTI NOR RAHIM

May 2017

Chairman: A Faculty: A

Associate Professor Yuzine bin Esa, PhD Agriculture

Groupers are known as one of the important marine and estuarine fishes. They are widely distributed in tropical and subtropical open waters. Difficulty in netting them in wild has increased their demand in the market thus resulting in overexploitation of these fishes. The classification also difficult for most species from this family due to their homology characteristics which is most notably among closely related species which makes the conservation and management of these fishes ambiguous. This study aimed to elucidate the phylogenetic relationship of wild grouper in Peninsular Malaysia. Sample collection was done for nine sites which are from Terengganu (N=24), Kelantan (N=6), Perak (N=9), Pahang (N=10), Perlis (N=1), Perlis (N=1), Kedah (N=5), Selangor (N=26), Pahang (N=10), Malacca (N=3) and Johor (N=2) coastal areas. Samples were identified based on their morphological characteristics. Molecular phylogeny study was done inferred using Mitochondrial Cytochrome b (Cyt b), Nuclear Tmo-4c4 and Recombination activating gene-1 (Rag-1) genes and combined Mitochondrial and Nuclear genes. The results revealed a total 86 individuals belonging to 12 species representing three genera which are *Epinephelus*, *Cephalopholis* and *Plectropomus*. The phylogenetic trees were contructed for Neighbour-Joining (NJ), Maximum Parsimony (MP), Maximum Likelihood (ML), Minimum Evolution (ME), and Bayesian Inference (BI) which were implemented by Molecular Evolution Genetic Analysis 7.01 (MEGA) and MrBayes 3.2.1. One consistent result across all the analyses was the monophyletic status of the subfamily of Epinephelinae. It is revealed that genus Plectropomus sister to the rest genera. Genus *Epinephelus* was clustered into two clades which is constant for all analyses. The separation confidence level between cluster Epinephelus, Cephalopolis and *Plectropomus* were 100% respectively for BI analysis based on combined dataset. Molecular data revealed that combined dataset helps increases the phylogenetic resolution compared to single gene phylogeny where the dataset well resolved the deeper node within genus Epinephelus compared to single gene analyses. Nevertheless, several genetic relationships remain unresolved particularly among morphologically similar species, for instance between Epinephelus fario and E. longispinis and species with limited number of individuals which is E. coioides. This study have aids in giving baseline information regarding groupers particularly in Malaysia which related to the area of taxonomy, phylogeny and genetic diversity which are important for their appropriate sustainable management, for conservation as well as aquaculture purposes



C)

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Sarjana Sains

FILOGENETIK MOLEKUL KERAPU MALAYSIA MENGGUNAKAN GEN MITOKONDRIA (Sitokrom b) DAN NUKLEAR (Tmo-4c4 DAN Rag-1)

Oleh

NOR SYAKINA BINTI NOR RAHIM

Mei 2017

Pengerusi: Professor Madya Yuzine bin Esa, PhD Fakulti: Pertanian

Kerapu terkenal sebagai salah satu ikan penting laut dan juga muara. Ianya boleh didapati secara meluas di kawasan laut terbuka di tropika dan subtropika. Kepayahan untuk menangkap ikan liar ini menjadikan permintaan terhadap ikan ini meningkat dalam pasaran seterusnya menyebabkan ikan ini dieksploitasi secara berlebihan. Klasifikasinya juga sukar disebabkan oleh sifat-sifat homologi mereka terutamanya diantara spesies yang berhubungan kait rapat yang menyebabkan pengurusan dan pemeliharaan ikan-ikan ini menjadi rumit. Kajian ini bertujuan untuk menjelaskan hubungan filogenetik ikan kerapu liar di Semenanjung Malaysia. Sampel telah diambil dari sembilan kawasankawasan laut pantai di Terengganu (N=24), Kelantan (N=6), Perak (N=9), Pahang (N=10), Perlis (N=1), Perlis (N=1), Kedah (N=5), Selangor (N=26), Pahang (N=10), Malacca (N=3) and Johor (N=2). Sampel-sampel ini dikenalpasti berdasarkan ciri-ciri morfologi mereka. Filogeni molekul telah disimpulkan dengan menggunakan gen Mitokondria Cytochrome b (Cyt b), Nuklear Tmo-4c4 dan Penggabungan semula mengaktifkan gen-1 (Rag-1) dan juga gabungan gen mitochondrial dan gen-gen nuklear. Hasil daripada ini sebanyak 86 individu diperolehi tergolong daripada 12 spesies yang mewakili tiga genera iaitu Epinephelus, Cephalopholis dan Plectropomus. Pokok-pokok filogenetik telah dibina untuk Neighbour-Joining (NJ), Maximum Parsimony (MP), Maximum Likelihood (ML), Minimum Evolution (ME), dan Bayesian Inference (BI) dengan menggunakan menggunakan Molecular Evolution Genetic Analysis 7.01 (MEGA) dan MrBayes 3.2.1. Satu keputusan yang konsisten terhasil daripada semua analisis adalah tentang status monofiletik bagi Epinephelinae. Ia juga mendedahkan genus Plectropomus adalah adik beradik kepada genera-genera lain. Genus Epinephelus telah terbahagi kepada dua kelompok yang sama dengan kajian lain yang dijalankan sebelum ini. Data molekular juga membuktikan bahawa dengan gabungan dataset ianya dapat membantu meningkatkan resolusi filogenetik nod dalaman berbanding dengan analisis menggunakan satu gen. Walau bagaimanapun, beberapa hubungan genetik masih kekal tidak dapat dijelaskan terutamnya dalam kalangan spesies morfologi yang serupa misalnya, antara Epinephelus fario dan E. longispinis dan spesies dengan bilangan individunya terhad iaitu E. coioides. Kajian keatas ikan kerapu ini berjaya membantu dalam memberi informasi secara dasar dalam bidang berkaitan dengan taksonomi, filogeni dan kepelbagaian genetik yang mana sangat penting dalam pengurusan mampan yang sesuai untuk ikan ini, sama ada bertujuan untuk pemuliharaan ataupun akuakultur.



G

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Bismillahirrahmanirrahim,

In the name of Allah the Most Gracious and the Most Merciful

Alhamdulillah, all praises to Allah SWT for the strengths and His blessing to me in completing this thesis. Special appreciation and gratitude to my supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Yuzine Bin Esa for giving me opportunity to further my study in Master Degree, by guiding me through assistances, knowledges, times, encouragements from the beginning of this journey untill completing this thesis which is very meaningful for me. I would also like to thank my co-supervisor Prof. Dr. Aziz Bin Arshad for the assistances that have been shared with me throughout my studies. Thank you to all staffs of Department of Aquaculture particularly, Mr. Zawawi, Mrs. Syafika, Mrs. Faridah, Ms. Hafiza and Mr Wan for their assistances while in doing my laboratory work. To my great collegues especially, Ms Nurnadia Marshita Binti Abdul Aziz and Ms Puvaneswari a/p Puvanasundram, thank you so much for their assistances, great ideas and emotionally encouragements towards me during completing this project.

Finally, a special thanks to my parents Mr Nor Rahim Bin Mohd Nor, for courage and believe he gave to me to completing this project. My beloved mother, Late Kamarol Azizah Binti Mohammad, I hope "Mak" will always be in His blesses forever, and I love you. Not forgetting, also to all my siblings, Mr Khairul Akmar, Mrs Nor Azura, Mr Mohd Haris Faruqi, Mrs Nuraihan, Mr Khairul Ridhzuwan, Mr Mohd Yusof and Mrs Nor Suhana, thank you for all the supports, tolerances, understandings and helps you gave to me for all this time. Lots of love, and thank you very much.

I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 9 May 2017 to conduct the final examination of Nor Syakina bte Nor Rahim on her thesis entitled "Molecular Phylogeny of Malaysian Groupers Inferred from Mitochondrial (Cytochrome b) and Nuclear (Tmo-4c4 and Rag-1) Genes" in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the Master of Science.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Mohd Rafii bin Yusop, PhD Professor Institute of Tropical Agriculture & Food Security Universiti Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

Ina Salwany binti Md. Yasin, PhD Senior Lecturer Faculty of Agriculture Universiti Putra Malaysia (Internal Examiner)

Faisal Ali bin Anwarali Khan, PhD Senior Lecturer Universiti Malaysia Sarawak Malaysia (External Examiner)

NOR AINI AB. SHUKOR, PhD Professor and Deputy Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 8 August 2017

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science. The member of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Yuzine Esa, PhD Associate Professor Faculty of Agriculture University Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

Aziz Arshad, PhD Professor Faculty of Agriculture University Putra Malaysia (Member)

> **ROBIAH BINTI YUNUS, PhD** Professor and Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

Declaration by graduate student

I hereby confirm that:

- This thesis is my original work;
- Quotations, illustrations, and citations have been duly referenced;
- This thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any other institutions;
- Intellectual property from the thesis and copyright of thesis are fully-owned by University Putra Malaysia, as according to the Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- Written permission must be obtained from supervisor and the office of Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and Innovation) before thesis is published (in the form of written, printed or in electronic form) including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture motes, learning modules or nay other materials as stated in the University Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- There is no plagiarism or data falsification/ fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld as according to the University Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) and the University Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software.

Signature:	Date:
Name and Matric No.:	

Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee

This is to confirm that:

- The research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervisions;
- Supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (revision 2012-2013) are adhered to.

Signature: ______ Name of Chairman of Supervisory, Committee: <u>Yuzine Bin Esa</u>

Signature: _________ Name of Member of Supervisory, Committee: <u>Aziz Bin Arshad</u>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

			Page
ABSTI	RACT		i
ABSTR	RAK		iii
ACKN	OWL	EDGEMENTS	v
APPR	OVAL		vi
DECL	ARAT	ION	viii
LIST (OF TA	BLES	xii
LIST (OF FIG	JURES	xiv
LIST (OF AB	BREVIATIONS	xvii
СНАР	TER		
1	іліті	ODUCTION	1
1		Reckground of Study	1
	1.1	Lustification	1
	1.2	Aime	2
	1.5	Anns	5
2	ПЛТЕ	RATURE REVIEW	4
-	2.1	Biology of Groupers	4
	2.2	Molecular Phylogenetic in Fisheries and Aquaculture	6
	2.3	Molecular Markers Approaches using Mitochondrial and	7
		Nuclear Genes	
	2.4	Phylogenetic Studies of Groupers	8
		2.4.1 Mitochondrial Markers in Phylogenetic of Grouper	9
		2.4.2 Nuclear Markers in Phylogenetic of Grouper	10
3	МЕТ	THODOLOGY	11
	3.1	Samples Sources	11
	3.2	Laboratory Work	12
		3.2.1 Total DNA extraction	12
		3.2.2 Polymerase chain reaction amplification	13
		3.2.3 Gel electrophoresis	14
		3.2.4 DNA purification and sequencing	15
	3.3	Data Analysis	15
		3.3.1 Sequences alignment and confirmation	15
		3.3.2 Phylogenetic analysis	16
	DECI		10
4	KES	ULIS Mamphalagiaal abamatariatian	18
	4.1	Morphological characteristics	18
	4.2	Wolecular Work	25 25
	4.3 1 1	valuation of the Sequences and Species Identification Mitochondrial Gana Analysis: Cut h Gana	25 26
	4.4	A 1 Societa characteristics	20
6		4.4.2 Phylogenetic analysis	20 31
U	15	4.4.2 I Hylogenetic analysis Nuclear Gene Analysis: Tmo-AcA Gene	37
	+. J	A 5.1 Sequence characteristics	37
		4.5.2 Phylogenetic analysis	<i>31</i> <i>4</i> 1
		1.5.2 I hytogenetie unurysis	1.1

4.5.2Phylogenetic analysis414.6Nuclear Gene Analysis: Rag-1 Gene47

 \bigcirc

		4.6.1 Sequence characteristics	47
		4.6.2 Phylogenetic analysis	51
	4.7	Concatenated Markers Analysis: Cyt b, Tmo-4c4 and Rag-	57
		1 genes	
		4.7.1 Sequence characteristics	57
		4.7.2 Phylogenetic analysis	63
5	DISC	CUSSION	69
	5.1	Significant Used of Gene Marker	69
	5.2	Genetic Characteristic of Groupers	70
	5.3	Relationship within Subfamily Epinephelinae	70
	5.4	Relationships among Genus Epinephelus	71
6	CON	NCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR	74
	FUT	URE RESEARCH	
	6.1	Conclusion and Recommendation	74
REF	ERENC	ES	75
APP	ENDICI	ES	82
BIO	DATA O	DF STUDENT	92
PUB	LICATI	ION	93

 \bigcirc

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	The primer pairs with their origin, 5'-3' sequence, length and references	Page 13
3.2	The Polymerase chain reaction mastermix	14
3.3	Best model for each gene used in the analysis with their AICs parameters generated from MEGA 7.01	17
4.1	Morphological characteristics of species used in this study	19
4.2	Summary of Ident (%) of each species based on their haplotype from Genbank database for Cyt b gene	26
4.3	Groupers samples that were used in the study with their haplotype code and number of sample (N) for Cyt b gene	27
4.4	Pairwise distance (%) among twelve species of Epinephelinae fishes including outgroup analyzed based on the Cyt <i>b</i> gene. The distances were calculated using Kimura's two-parameter model of nucleotide substitution.	29
4.5	Groupers samples that were used in the study with their haplotype code and number of sample (N) for Tmo-4c4 gene	38
4.6	Pairwise distance (%) among twelve species of Epinephelinae fishes including outgroup analyzed based on the Tmo-4c4 gene. The distances were calculated using Kimura's two-parameter model of nucleotide substitution	39
4.7	Groupers samples that were used in the study with their haplotype code and number of sample (N) for Rag-1 gene	48
4.8	Pairwise distance (%) among twelve species of Epinephelinae fishes including outgroup analyzed based on the Rag-1 gene. The distances were calculated using Kimura's two-parameter model of nucleotide substitution	49
4.9	Grouper samples that were used in the study with their haplotype code, and number of sample (N) for combined genes (Cyt b , Tmo-4c4 and Rag-1)	58

G

- 4.10 Pairwise distance (%) among twelve species of Epinephelinae fishes including outgroup analyzed based on the concatenated (combined Cyt *b*, Tmo-4c4 and Rag-1 genes) datasets. The distances were calculated using Kimura's two-parameter model of nucleotide substitution
- 4.11 A partition-homogeneity test results for combined (mtDNA and nDNA genes)
- 5.1 A summarized support values for major clades recovered in phylogenetic analyses on mtDNA and nDNA gene sequences



73

62

60

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page	
2.1	Classification of the family Serranidae. Three subfamily Epinephelinae were treated in this study including <i>Cephalopolis</i> , <i>Epinephelus</i> and <i>Plectropomus</i> is illustrated to clearly show the genera under this subfamily.	4	
2.3	Parts of the head that can easily recognized the Epinephelinae species by determining the presence of three spines on operculum	5	
2.4	Some species of this subfamily can be identified by observing the appearances marker	6	
3.1	Map of sampling locations for specimens used in this study for nine main locations. Total of 86 samples were collected for this study.	11	
4.1	Two extraction products for species <i>Epinephelus sexfasciatus</i> . Samples were extracted from muscle and tissues area, run approximately 30 minutes at 90V under Ultra-violet light.	23	
4.2	PCR optimization of Cyt <i>b</i> gene for annealing temperature from 43° C – 53° C of <i>Epinephelus fuscoguttatus</i> , run approximately 50 minutes at 90V under Ultra-violet light. The annealing temperature selected for the species was lane 3 (45 °C)	24	
4.3	Eight samples of species <i>Cephalopholis boenak</i> inferred from Tmo-4c4 gene at 55°C. There are only two samples (CB2 and CB4) where no band were obtained, run approximately 30 minutes at 90V under Ultra-violet light.	24	
4.4	Four purified samples with approximately 900 bp to 1,000 bp amplified using Rag-1 gene, run approximately 45 minutes at 90V under Ultra-violet light.	25	
4.5	Plots of transition (x) and transversion (Δ) against divergence using Tamura and Nei (1993) distance method onto the first codon (a), second codon (b) and third codon (c) position, respectively, showing saturation of transition codon of the Cyt <i>b</i> gene	30	
4.6	Neighbour-Joining (NJ) tree (consensus tree) showed relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes represents bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset	32	
4.7	Minimum Evolution (ME) tree (consensus tree) showed the relationships among Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes	33	

represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset

34

35

36

- 4.8 Maximum Parsimony (MP) tree (consensus tree) showed the relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes represents the bootstrap value (%) for 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset
- 4.9 Maximum Likelihood (ML) tree showed relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset
- 4.10 Bayesian Inference (BI) tree showed relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the posterior probabilities (in percentage) of the dataset
- 4.11 Plots of transition (x) and transversion (Δ) against divergence 40 using Tamura and Nei (1993) distance method onto the first codon (a), second codon (b) and third codon (c) position, respectively, showing saturation of transition codon of the Tmo-4c4 gene
- 4.12 Neighbour-Joining (NJ) tree (consensus tree) showing 42 relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset
- 4.13 Minimum Evolution (ME) tree (consensus tree) showing the relationships among Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset
- 4.14 Maximum Parsimony (MP) tree (consensus tree) showed the relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes represents the bootstrap value (%) for 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset
- 4.15 Maximum Likelihood (ML) tree showed relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset
- 4.16 Bayesian Inference (BI) tree showed relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the posterior probabilities (in percentage) of the dataset
- 4.17 Plots of transition (x) and transversion (Δ) against divergence 50 using Tamura and Nei (1993) distance method onto the first codon (a), second codon (b) and third codon (c) position, respectively, showing saturation of transition codon of the Rag-1 gene
- 4.18 Neighbour-Joining (NJ) tree (consensus tree) showed 52 relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes

represents the bootstrap value (%) 1000 based on pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.19 Minimum Evolution (ME) tree (consensus tree) showed the 53 relationships among Epinephelinae. The number at the end of each nodes represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.20 Maximum Parsimony (MP) tree (consensus tree) showed the 54 relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes represents the bootstrap value (%) for 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.21 Maximum Likelihood (ML) tree showed relationships among the 55 Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.22 Bayesian (BI) tree (consensus tree) showed relationships among 56 the Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the posterior probabilities (in percentage) of the dataset 4.23 Plots of transition (x) and transversion (Δ) against divergence 61 using Tamura and Nei (1993) distance method onto the first codon (a), second codon (b) and third codon (c) position, respectively, showing saturation of transition codon of the combined genes (Cyt b, Tmo-4c4 and Rag-1) 4.24 Neighbour-Joining (NJ) tree (consensus tree) showing 64 relationships among the Epinephelinae. Nodes at each branches represents the bootstrap value (%)based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.25 Minimum Evolution (ME) tree (consensus tree) showing the 65 relationships among Epinephelinae. The number at the end of each nodes showing the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.26 Maximum Parsimony (MP) tree (consensus tree) showing the 66 relationships among the Epinephelinae. The number at each nodes indicates the bootstrap value (%) for 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.27 Maximum Likelihood (ML) tree showing relationships among the 67 Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the bootstrap value (%) based on 1000 pseudoreplications of the dataset 4.28 Bayesian Inference (BI) tree showing relationships among the 68 Epinephelinae. The number at each node represents the posterior probabilities (in percentage) of the dataset

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

μL	Microliter
μΜ	Micromolar
ng	nanogram
ml	mililiter
g	gram
Ň	Number of samples
5X	Five times
10X	Ten times
Bp	Base pair
°Ĉ	Degree Celsius
%	Percent
Kb	kilobase
DNA	Deoxyribonucleic acid
mtDNA	Mitochondrial DNA
nDNA	Nuclear DNA
Cvt b	Cytochrome <i>b</i>
Rag-1	Recombination activating gene-1
PCR	Polymerase chain reaction
NJ	Neighbour-Joining
MP	Maximum Parsimony
ME	Minimum Evolution
ML	Maximum Likelihood
BI	Bayesian Inference
IUCN	International Union Conservation of Nature
Blast	Basic Local Alignment Search Tool
Popn	Population
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
PBS	Phosphate-buffered saline
PCR	Polymerase chain reaction
UV	Ultraviolet light
ILD	Incongruence length difference
RFLP	Restriction fragment length polymorphism
RAPD	Random amplified polymorphic DNA
AFLP	Amplified fragment length polymorphism
SNP	Single nucleotide polymorphism
EST	Expressed sequence tag
PSRF	Potential scale reduction factor
AIC	Akaike information criterion



CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of Study

The fisheries and aquaculture sector has improved and has been developed throughtout the years, hence becoming one of the most important sector for economy support of the world. Food and Agriculture Organization of United Nation (FAO) stated that global total capture of marine fishery production was not much different from 2014 to 2015 which are about 80.0 million tonnes to 81.0 million tonnes (FAO, 2016). It is has showed an increases from previous year which was from marine waters. For the world fish production utilization, increment to 146.3 million tonnes was also recorded. Therefore, makes it becomes one of the fastest growing sector supplying food to the world that cater to the rising demand for the fisheries product.

According to Department of Fisheries of Malaysia (Jabatan Perikanan Malaysia, 2016), even though Malaysia have already surpassed the level of self-supply sufficiency of fish resources as a food ever since 2010, however, the fish production indeed needs to be outsourced for fish consumption in this country. Fish consumption indexed also showed an increment from 53.1 kg in 2011 and expected to be 61.1 kg in 2010 (Yusoff, 2015). In 2013, approximately 1, 482, 899 tons (RM8.336b) of marine fish were produced however, the production decreases 1.67% to 1, 458, 128 tons (RM8.785b) mostly because of excessive exploitation of marine fish (Yusoff, 2015). Our marine resource biomass had been decreasing since application of trawling by fisherman were introduced in 1960s.

Approximately about 70 percent of the world's fish species are either fully exploited or has been depleted (FAO, 2015). Higher demand for wild marine fish contribute to the overfishing of certain marine fish. Epinephelinae is a subfamily of Serranidae. Most of the species belongings to this subfamily are being overexploited and it is causes a significant depletion for some of the species. On the other hand, some of them were globally commercialized due to high demand for their meats (Zhu and Yue, 2008; Morris, *et al.*, 2000; Heemstra and Randall, 1993). Due to higher demand compared to other fishes, this subfamily of groupers has been classified as an exclusive and highly price fish in the market. Demand for their wild meat increases gradually throughout the years which is due to the difficulties in catching them because they can only be found in the deep sea.

At least four out of 12 species that were used in this study were under near threated as reported by International Union Conservation of Nature Red List (IUCN Red List) (IUCN, 2017). The species listed as near threatened by IUCN Red List includes *Epinephelus bleekeri*, *E. coioides*, *E. fuscoguttatus* and *Plectropomus leopardus* (Appendix 1). This may be because of coastal areas in Malaysia were listed under marine

waters that had relatively high number of threatened species of groupers (Sadovy *et al.*, 2011). While, others such as *E. corallicola*, *E. erythrurus*, *E. sexfasciatus*, *E. heniochus* does not have sufficient data that available (IUCN, 2017). Based on IUCN Red List, it is showed that many other species under this subfamily are not well discovered, as many species status are still unknown such as *Cephalopholis boenak*, *C. formosa*, *E. longispinis*, *P. maculatus* (IUCN, 2017).

Aquaculture is implemented for many marine fishes that are valued in market. Those commercialized species were cultured to reduce the dependency of catching the fishes from the wild. This is also one of the solution to avoid from overfishing which occurs to many marine fishes that which is could leads towards depletion of the species. Some artificial breeding programs have already been applied in some country such as in Singapore, Thailand, Kuwait and Japan (Tookwinas, 1989). However, the aquaculture programs are difficult to be implement because the source of brood stock for aquaculture programs still depends on the wild population. Moreover, there is still lack of information about the species also makes the program more challengin. Despite these challenges, some grouper species from subfamily Epinephelinae were successfully cultured. This includes E. fuscoguttatus, E. tauvina, and E. coioides. However, the species that are being cultured were chosen based on the popularity of the fishes or most prefered by consumers which is most likely to be different based on the country. Even with the establishment of the culture programs, the trends of population still showed the depletion in population of certain species (IUCN, 2017). This problem is still a concern and many information on this subfamily are required as to give more understanding about this marine fishes to avoid species extinction.

Using molecular approach in taxonomic field enables the data to be fully utilized which it is can give a detailed report on the history of life (Hillis, 1987). Molecular genetic approaches is a powerful tool that can detect genetic uniqueness of individuals, populations or species (Avise, 2004). Markers are used as they can be analytical to study the genetic diversity of the organisms. Organisms subjected to mutation because of the cells within it which interacts with the surrounding that subsequently results in genetic variation which is known as polymorphism. The importance of this polymorphism is that it can gives the species ability to adapt to the changing of environment in order to keep surviving. Other factors which occurs during this process such as selection, genetic drift and genetic variation increases the differentiation at the population level, species and higher order of taxonomic groups. This polymorphism analyses were widely used as it benefits in giving highest resolution of genetic variation (Nguyen *et al.*, 2008; Nguyen *et al.*, 2006; Liu and Chen, 2003; Wang *et al.*, 2000) which can assist in species.

1.2 Justification

The concern on subfamily Epinephelinae arose a few decades back, where the classification of the organisms were still based on morphological traits. As the technology on molecular studies being applied, the taxonomist tried to compare on both methods to find which methods give better resolution. Recently, researchers argue about the classification of organisms under family Serranidae. There are many incongruent in

the classification of taxa under this family when comparing between morphology and genetic data. Due to some characteristics that were not well resolved by using conventional methods of classification.

Latest study also discovered that some groupers are difficult to be identify by using only morphological traits as some of them have intraspecific variation such as color pattern (Govindaraju and Jayasankar, 2004) and some of them also have homogenous morphology (Maggio *et al.*, 2005) and some of them also have different developmental stages especially during larvae to adult (Heemstra and Randall, 1993), thus making morphological classification become difficult. These eventually can contributed to false classification of this subfamily. Thus, this study tried to answer a few questions and help to give insight information on the genetics aspects of groupers as molecular marker based identification is more reliable to be utilized. The following are the research questions;

- 1. Are there any differences between mitochondrial and nuclear genes?
- 2. Which gene between mitochondrial and nuclear gene will better resolve this subfamily?

1.3 Aims

In this study, we aimed to utilize mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) and nuclear DNA (nDNA) to study the phylogenetic relationship of the grouper species in Malaysia. Cyt b, Tmo-4c4 and Rag-1 is used as a molecular marker in order to study the relationship between wild species among subfamily Epinephelinae. This analysis can help to understand the taxonomy as well as the genetic diversity among species as it can give reliable and constant results (Esa *et al.*, 2008; Ryan and Esa, 2006). The objectives of the study are listed as below:

- 1. To reconstruct the phylogenetic relationship of groupers in Malaysia using mitochondrial and nuclear genes.
- 2. To analyze and compare the genetic composition between mitochondrial and nuclear genes.

REFERENCES

- Amos, B. Hoelzel A. R. (1992). Application of molecular genetic techniques to the conservation of small populations. *Biological Conservation*, 61(2): 133-144.
- Atan, Y., Jaafar, H., and Abdul Majid, A. R. (2010). *Ikan Laut Malaysia: Glossari nama sahih spesies ikan*. Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka: Malaysia.
- Avise, J. C. (2000). *Phylogeography: The history and formation of species*. Harvard University Press. Cambridge: Massachusetts.
- Avice, J. C. (2004). *Molecular markers, natural history and evolution*, 2nd ed. Sinauer Associates: Sunderland, Massachusettes.
- Baharum, S. N. and Nurdalila, A. A. (2011). Phylogenetic relationships of *Epinephelus fuscoguttatus* and *Epinephelus hexagonatus* inferred from mitochondrial Cytochrome b gene sequences using bioinformatics tools. *International Journal of Bioscience Biochemistryand bioinformatics* 1(1): 47-52.
- Baharum, S. N. and Nurdalila, A. A. (2012). Application of 16s rDNA and Cytochrome b ribosomal markers in studies of the lineage and fish populations structure of aquatic species. *Molecular Biology Reports* 39: 5225-5232.
- Bailly, N. (2015). Epinephelus fario (Thuberg, 1793). In: Froese, R. and D. Pauly. Editors (2015) FishBase. Accessed through: World Register of Marine Species at http://www.marinespecies.org/aphia on 19 April 2015.
- Campbell, N. A, and Reece, J. B. (2005). *Nucleic acids store and transmit hereditary information: The role of nucleic acids.* Benjamin Cummings: San Francisco
- Chiappone, M., Sluka, R. and Sullivan S. K. (2000). Groupers (Pisces: Serranidae) in fished and protected areas of the Florida Keys, Bahamas and Northern Caribbean. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 198, 261–272.
- Collete, B. B., Potthoff, T., Richards, W. J., Ueyanagi, S., Russo, J. L., and Nishikawa, Y. (1984). Scombroidei: Development and relationships. Pages 591-620 in H.G. Moser, W. J. Richards, D. M. Coben, M. P. Fahay, A. W. Kendall, Jr., and S. L. Richardson, Eds. Ontogeny and systematics of fishes. *American Society of Icthyologist and Herpetologist, Special Publication No.* 1. Allen Press, Lawrences, Kansas
- Craig, M. T., Pondella, D. J., Hafner, J. C., and Franck, J.P.C. (2001). On the status of the serranids fish genus *Epinephelus*: Evidence for paraphyly based upon 16S rDNA sequence. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 19: 121–130.
- Craig, M. T., and Hastings, P. A. (2006). A molecular phylogeny of the groupers of the subfamily Epinephelinae (Serranidae) with a revised classification of the Epinephelini. *Ichthyological Research*, 54: 1-17.

- Craig, M. T., Hastings, P. A., Pondella, D. J. II. (2004). Speciation in the Central American Seaway: The importance of taxon sampling in the identification of geminate speciespairs. *Journal Biogeography*, 3: 1085-1091.
- Govindaraju, G. S. and Jayasankar, P. (2004). Taxonomic relationship among seven species of groupers (Genus *Epinephelus*; Family Serranidae) as revealed by RAPD fingerprinting, *marine*. *Biotechnology*, 6: 229-237.
- Guan, S., Liu, H., Zheng, Y., Yu, D., Nie, A., and Liu, M. (2014). Inference of phylogenetics and evolution of *Epinephelus septemfasciatus* and 48 other species of *Epinephelus* genus using mitochondrial CO1 fragment sequences, *Pakistan Joural Zoological*, 46(1): 67-74.
- Deepti, I. V. A., Shrikanya, K. V. L., and Sujatha, K. (2014). Taxonomic studies and phylogenetic relationship of seven spotted groupers species of genus *Epinephelus* (Pisces: Serranidae) off Visakhapatnam, Middle East coast of India, *Indian Journal of Geo-Marine Sciences*, 43(12): 2254-2268
- Ding, S., Zhuang, X., Guo, F., Wang, J., Su, Y., Zhang, Q., and Li, Q. (2006). Molecular phylogenetic relationship of china seas groupers based on cytochrome b gene fragment sequences. Series C Life Sciences 49(3): 235-242.
- Dolphin, K., Belshaw, R., Orme, C. D. L., and Quicke, D. L. J. (2000). Noise and incongruence: interpreting results of the incongruence length difference test. *Molecular Phylogenetics Evolution* 17: 401-406.
- Erlich, H. A. (1989). *PCR technology: Principles and applications for DNA amplifications*. Stockton Press: New York
- Esa, Y. B., Siraj, S. S., Rahim, K. A. A., Daud, S. K., Ho, G. C., Tan, S. G., Syukri, M. F. (2012). Genetic characterization of two mahseer species (*Tor douronensis* and *Tor tambroides*) using microsatellite markers from other Cyprinids. Sains Malaysiana, 40 (10): 1087-1095.
- Esa, Y. B., Waters, J. M., and Wallis, G. P. (2000). Introgressive hybridization between *Galaxias depressiceps* and *Galaxias* sp D (Teleostei: Galaxiidae) in Otago, New Zealand: Secondary contact mediated by water races. *Conservation Genetics*, 1: 329-339.
- Esa, Y. B., Siraj, S. S., Daud, S.K., Rahim, K. A. A., Japning, J. R. R. and Soon, G. T. (2008). Mitochondrial DNA diversity of *Tor tambroides* Valenciennes (Cyprinidae) from five natural populations in Malaysia. *Zoological Studies* 47(3): 360-367.
- Felsenstein, J. (1985). Confidence limits on phylogenies: An approach using the bootstrap. *Evolution*, 39: 783-791.

- Fennessy, S., Myers, R., and Pollard, D. (2008). *Epinephelus longispinis*. The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. Version 2014.3. Accessed through: IUCN Red List at www.iucnredlist.org on 19 April 2015.
- Fessler, J. L., and Westneat, M. W. (2007). Molecular phylogenetics of the butterflyfishes (Chaetodontidae): Taxonomy and biogeography of a global coral reef fish family.*Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 45:50-68.
- Fisher-Reid, M. C. & Weins, J. J. (2011). What are the consequences of combining nuclear and mitochondrial data for phylogenetics analysis? Lesons from Plethodon salamanders and 13 other vertebrate clades. *BMC Evolutionary Biology*, 11: 300-320.
- Food and Agriculture Organisation of United Nation. (2015). *Global Forest Resources* Assessment 2015. FAO: Rome
- Food and Agriculture Organisation of United Nation. (2016). The State of World Fisheries and Aquaculture 2016. Contributing to food security and nutrition for all. FAO: Rome
- Hasegawa, M., Kishino, H., and Yano, T. (1985). Dating the human-ape split by a molecular clock of mitochondrial DNA. *Journal of Molecular Evolution*, 22: 160-174.
- Heemstra, P. C. and Randall, J. E. (1993). Groupers of the world, FAO species cataloge. FAO: Rome.
- Helfman, G. S., Collette, B. B., Facey, D. E. and Bowen, B. W. (2009). *The diversity* of fishes: *Biology, evolution and ecology* (2nd ed.). West Sussex, UK: Wiley Blackwell.
- Hillis, D. M. (1987). Molecular versus morphological approaches to systematics. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics, 18:23-42.
- Hillis, D. M. and Huelsenbeck, J. P. (1992). Signal, noise and reliability in molecular phylogenetic analyses. *Journal of Heredity*, 83:189-195.
- International Union Conservation of Nature. (2017). The IUCN Red List of Treatened Species. Version 2017-1. Accessed through: http://www.iucnredlist.org. on 10 May 2017.
- Jabatan Perikanan Malaysia, kementerian pertanian & industri Asas Tani Malaysia. (2016). Senario Industri Perikanan Malaysia. Accessed through: http://www.dof.gov.my/index.php/pages/view/42 on 18 August 2016
- Jefri, E., Zamani, N. P., Subhan, B., and Madduppa, H. H. (2015). Molecular phylogeny inferred from mitochondrial DNA of the grouper Epinephelus spp. in Indonesia collected from local fish market. *Biodiversitas*, 16(2): 254-263 Doi: 10.13057/biodiv/dl60221.

- Johnson, G. D. (1986). Scombroid phylogeny: An alternative hypothesis. *Bulletin of Marine Science*, 39: 1–41.
- Kimura, M. (1980). A simple method for estimating evolutionary rate of base substitutions through comparative studies of nucleotide sequences. *Journal of molecular Evolution* 16: 11-120.
- Lambret-Frotté, J., Perini, F. A., and de Moraes Russo, C. A. (2012). Efficiency of Nuclear and Mitochondrial Markers Recovering and Supporting Known AmnioteGroups. *Evolutionary Bioinformatics Online*, 8: 463–473. http://doi.org/10.4137/EBO.S9656
- Larkin, M. A., Blackshields, G., Brown, N. P., Chenna, R., McGettigan, P. A., McWilliam, H., Valentin, F., Wallace, I. M., William, A., Lopez, R., Thompson, J. D., Gibson, T. J. and Higgins, D. G. (2007). Clustal W and Clustal X version 2.0. *Bioinformatics*, 23: 2947-2948.
- Leis, J. M. (1986). Larval development in four species of Indo-Pacific coral trout *Plectropormus* (Pisces, Serranidae: Epinephelinae) with an analysis of relationships of the genus. *Bulletin of Marine Science*, 38: 525-552.
- Lemey, P., Rambaut, A., Drummond, A. J., Suchard, M. A. (2009). Bayesian phylogeography finds its roots, *PLos Computational Biology*, 5(9): e1000520. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1000520.
- Lin, G. N., Zhang, C., & Xu, D. (2011). Polytomy identification in microbial phylogenetic reconstruction. *BMC Systems Biology*, 5(Suppl 3), S2. Doi: http://doi.org/10.1186/1752-0509-5-S3-S2.
- Liu H, Chen, Y. (2003). Phylogeny of the East Asian cyprinids inferred from sequences of the mitochondrial DNA control region. *Canadian Journal of Zoology*, 81: 1938-1946.
- Lovejoy, N. R. and de Araujo, M. L. G. (2000). Molecular systematics, biogeography, and population structure of Neotropical freshwater needle-fishes of the genus *Potamorrhaphis*. *Molecular Ecology*, 9 (3): 259-268.
- Lukhtanov, V. A., Dantchenko, A. V., Vishnevskaya, M. S. and Saifitdinova, A. F. (2015). Detecting cryptic species in sympatry and allopatry: Analysis of hidden diversity in Plyommatus (Agrodiatus) butterflies (Lepidoptera: Lycaenidae). *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society*, 116(2): 468-485. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1111/bij.12596
- Maggio, T., Andaloro, F., Hemida, F. and Arculeo, M. (2005). A molecular analysis of some Eastern Atlantic grouper from the Epinephelus and Myctoperca genus, *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 321: 83-92.
- Morris, A. V., Roberts, C. L. and Hawkins, J. P. (2000). The threatened status of the grouper (Epinephelinae). *Biodiversity and Conservation*, 9: 919-942.

- Nagelkerken, W. P. (1979). Biology of the grysby, *Epinephelus cruentatus* of the coral reef of curacao. *Studies Faun Curacao*, 60: 1-118.
- Nguyen, T. T. T., Uthairat, N. N., Srijanya, S. and Chen, Z M. (2008). A study on phylogeny and biogeography of mahseer species (pieces: Cyprinid) using sequences of three mitochondrial regions. *Molecular Phylogenetic Evolution* 48: 1223-1231.
- Nguyen, T.T.T., Ingram, B.A., Sungan, S., Gooley, G., Sim, S.Y., Tinggi, D., and De Silva, S.S. (2006). Mitochondrial DNA diversity of broodstock of two indigenous mahseer species, *Tor tambroides* and *T. douronensis* (Cyprinidae) cultured in Sarawak, Malaysia. *Aquaculture*, 253: 259–269.
- Oettinger, M.A., Schatz, D.G., Gorka, C., and Baltimore, D. (1990). RAG-1 and RAG-2, adjacent genes that synergistically activate V(D)J recombination. *Science*, 248: 1517–1523.
- Patwardhan, A., Ray, S. and Roy, A. (2014). Molecular markers in phylogenetic studies-A review. *Journal Phylogenetics and Evolution Biology* 2(2): 1-9 Doi: 10.4172/2329-9002.1000131.
- Rocha, L. A., Linderman, K. C., Rocha, C. R. and Lessios, H. A. (2008). Historical biogeography and speciation in the reef fish genus *Haemulon* (Teleostei: Haemulidae). *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, Doi 10.1016/j.ypev.2008.05.024
- Russell, P. J. (2006). Non-Mendelian inheritance. Benjamin Cummings: San Francisco
- Ryan, J. R. J. and Esa, Y. B. (2006). Phylogenetic analysis of Hampala fishes (subfamily Cyprinidae) in Malaysia inferred from partial mitochondrial Cytochrome b DNA sequences. Zoological Sciences, 23: 893-901.
- Sachithanandam, V., Mohan, P. M., Muruganandam, N., Chaaithanya, I. K., Dhivya, P. and Baskara, R. (2012). DNA barcoding, phylogenetic study of *Epinephelus spp*. from Andaman coastal region, India. *Indian Journal of Geo-Marine Sciences*, 41(3): 203-211.
- Sadovy, D. M. Y., Craig, M. T., Bertoncini, A. A., Carpenter, K. E., Cheung, W. W. L., Choat, J. H. (2011). Fishing groupers towards extinction: A global assessment of treats and extinction risks in a billion dollar fishery. *Fish and Fisheries*: 1-18.
- Sambrook, J., Frotsch, E. and Maniatis, T. (1989). Molecular Cloning: A Laboratory Manual. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press: New York
- Stepien, C. A., and Kocher, T. D. (1997). Molecular and morphology in studies of fish evolution. In T. D. Kocher and C. A. Stepein, eds. Molecular systematics of fishes. Academic Press: San Diego, California.

- Streelman, J. T. and Karl, S. A. (1997) Reconstructing labroid evolution with single copy nuclear DNA. *Proceeding of the Royal Society of London*, 264: 1011-1020
- Sujatha, K., kantimahanti, V. L., Shrikanya, and Iswarya, D. V. A. (2015). Species diversity and some aspects of reproductive biology and life history of groupers (Pisces: Serranidae: Epinephelinae) off the central eastern coast of India. *Marine Biology Research*, 11 (1): 18-33, DOI 10.1080/17451000.2014.949271.
- Sunnuc, P. (2000). Efficient genetic markers for population biology. *Trends in Ecology* and Evolution, 15: 199-203.
- Taberlet, P. A., Meyer, A. and Bouvet, J. (1992). Unsually large mitochondrial variation in populations of blue tit, Parus caereleus. *Molecular Ecology* 1: 27-36.
- Tamura, K., Stecher, G., Peterson, D., Filipski, A. and Kumar, S. (2013). MEGA6: Molecular Evolutionary Genetics Analysis Version 6.0. *Molecular Biology* and Evolution, 30: 2725-2729.
- Tobe, S. S., Kitchener, A. C. and Linacre, A. M. T. (2010). Reconstructing mammalian phylogeny: A detailed comparison of the cytochrome b and cytochrome oxidase subunit 1 mitochondrial genes. *PLos One* 5(11): e14156. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0014156.
- Tookwinas, S. (1989). Review of knowledge on grouper aquaculture in Southeast Asia. Advances in Tropical Aquaculture. 20-Feb- Mac, Tahiti.
- Wang, Y., Y. Cui, Y. Yang, and Cai, F. (2000). Compensatory growth in Oreochromis mossambicus x O. niloticus, reared in seawater. Aquaculture, 189: 101-108.
- Willett, C. E., Cherry, J. J. and Steiner, L. A. (1997). Characterization and expression of the recombination activating genes (rag1 and rag2) of zebrafish. *Immunogenetics*, 45: 394-404
- Wink, M, El-Sayed, A. A., Sauer-Gürth, H., and Gonzalez, J. (2009). Molecular phylogeny of owls (strigiformes) inferred from DNA sequences of the mitochondrial Cytochrome b and the nuclear RAG-1 gene. In: Johnson, D. H., an Nieuwenhuye D. and Duncan, J. R. (eds) proc. Fourth World Owl Conf. Oct-Nov 2007, Groningen, The Netherlands. Ardea 97(4): 581-591
- Xia, X., Z. Xie, M. Salemi, L. Chen, Y. Wang. (2003). An index of substitution saturation and its application. *Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution*, 26:1-7.
- Xia, X. and Lemey, (2009). Assessing substitution saturation with DAMBE. In: Lemey, P., Salemi, M., Vandamme, A. M., editors. The phylogenetic handbook. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

- Yusoff, A. (2015). Status of resource management and aquaculture in Malaysia. In M. R. R. Romana-Eguia, F. D. Parado-Estepa, N. D. Salayo, & M. J. H. Lebata Ramos (Eds.), Resource Enhancement and Sustainable Aquaculture Practices in Southeast Asia: Challenges in Responsible Production of Aquatic Species: Proceedings of the International Workshop on Resource Enhancement and Sustainable Aquaculture Practices in Southeast Asia 2014 (RESA) (pp. 53-65). Tigbauan, Iloilo, Philippines: Aquaculture Dept., Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center.
- Zhang, A. B., Kubota, K., Takami, Y., Kim, J. L., Kim, J. K., and Sota, T. (2005). Species status and phylogegeography of two closely related *Captolabrus* species (Coleoptera: Carabidae) in South Korea inferred from mitochondrial and nuclear gene sequences. *Molecular Ecology*, 14: 3823-3841.
- Zhu, Z. Y. and Yue, G. H. (2008). The complete mitochondrial genome of red grouper *Plectropomus leopardus* and its applications in identification of grouper species. *Aquaculture*, 276 (1-4): 44-49.
- Zardoya, R. And Meyer, A. (1996). Phylogenetic performance of mitochondrial protein-coding genes in resolving relationships among vertebrates. *Molecular Biolology Evolution*, 13: 933–942.