



**UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA**

***HINDERING FACTORS OF THE HALAL ASSURANCE SYSTEM AMONG  
RESTAURATEURS AND CATERERS IN EAST KALIMANTAN  
INDONESIA***

**SULISTYO PRABOWO**

**IPPH 2016 2**



**HINDERING FACTORS OF THE HALAL ASSURANCE SYSTEM AMONG  
RESTAURATEURS AND CATERERS IN EAST KALIMANTAN INDONESIA**

By

**SULISTYO PRABOWO**

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies,  
Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the  
Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

**January 2016**

## **COPYRIGHT**

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**HINDERING FACTORS OF THE HALAL ASSURANCE SYSTEM AMONG RESTAURATEURS AND CATERERS IN EAST KALIMANTAN INDONESIA**

By

**SULISTYO PRABOWO**

**January 2016**

**Chairman : Assoc. Prof. Azmawani Abd. Rahman, Ph.D.**  
**Institute : Halal Products Research Institute**

International halal business as well as awareness in halal products and services has been growing rapidly for the last few years. However, many industry players have not yet realized those huge potential concepts of halal business. Food service industries such as restaurants and caterings show less concern in putting priority on the issue of halal certification. It is hard to find research paper discussing halal management from Indonesian perspective. This study aims to explore various factors that hamper halal certification in food service industries in East Kalimantan, Indonesia.

This study extends the use of qualitative research in halal management with the perspectives from many stakeholders in food service industries. A consecutive of qualitative data collection technique was employed to gain quality of research. In the beginning it used Nominal Group Technique (NGT), sharpens with in-depth interview and personal observations, and the findings were clarified by focus group discussion (FGD). Four categories of stakeholders participated in this study to represent certifying body, consumers, industry player and government.

The use of combine qualitative method is an appropriate way to achieve the objective of this study efficiently. It provides a relatively new finding from Indonesian point of view. We can draw detailed list of factors hindering restaurant and food catering services in East Kalimantan Indonesia in obtaining halal certificate. These difficulties may result from both internal and external factors. Internal factors are: lack of knowledge and awareness, lack of outcome expectancy, management constraint, facility constraints, financial constraints, and type of product. External factors are: lack of dissemination information, lack of government's role, low of consumer awareness and demand, certification procedure, and limited suppliers of raw materials that meet the requirements, social and culture, constraints from the certifying body, less coordination and job description among the stakeholders, communication, the absence of consultancy, halal credentials, and halal data base availability.

The results of this study reaffirm what was raised in the Roger's theory of innovation adoption. Factors driving the adoption of a new system would not be met if the barriers still experienced by the organization or the industry.

Considering the vast expanse of Indonesia and different level of development in each province, results of this study could not be generalized as Indonesia's situation in general. However practical implication can be drawn. As halal certification in food service industry gains low interest from industries, this research presents hampering factors in various perspectives and offers some suggestions to overcome those issues accordingly.

**Keywords:** food enterprises, catering, Focus Group Discussion FGD, halal, In-depth Interview, Indonesia, Nominal Group Technique NGT, qualitative research, restaurant



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

## **FAKTOR PENCABAR SISTEM JAMINAN HALAL DI ANTARA RESTORAN DAN KATERING DI KALIMANTAN TIMUR INDONESIA**

Oleh

**SULISTYO PRABOWO**

**Januari 2016**

**Pengerusi : Prof. Madya Azmawani Abd. Rahman, Ph.D.**  
**Institute : Institut Penyelidikan Produk Halal**

Perniagaan halal antarabangsa dan kesedaran dalam produk dan perkhidmatan halal telah berkembang pesat sejak beberapa tahun yang lalu. Walau bagaimanapun, ramai penggiat industri masih belum menyedari konsep besar potensi perniagaan halal. Industri perkhidmatan makanan seperti restoran dan katering menunjukkan kurang keprihatinan dalam meletakkan keutamaan dalam isu pensijilan halal. Adalah sukar untuk mencari naskah penyelidikan yang membincangkan pengurusan halal dari perspektif kerajaan Indonesia. Kajian ini bertujuan untuk meneroka pelbagai faktor-faktor yang mencabar pensijilan halal dalam industri perkhidmatan makanan di Kalimantan Timur, Indonesia.

Kajian ini menggunakan penyelidikan kualitatif dalam pengurusan halal dengan perspektif daripada pelbagai pihak dalam industri perkhidmatan makanan. Teknik pengumpulan data kualitatif telah digunakan secara berturutan untuk mendapat kualiti penyelidikan yang memuaskan. Pada mulanya ia digunakan Teknik Kumpulan Nominal (NGT), diteruskan dengan temu bual mendalam dan pemerhatian peribadi, untuk seterusnya penemuan telah dijelaskan melalui perbincangan kumpulan terfokus (FGD). Empat kategori pihak yang berkepentingan terlibat dalam kajian ini untuk mewakili pihak badan pensijil, pengguna, penggiat industri dan kerajaan.

Penggunaan gabungan kaedah kualitatif adalah cara yang sesuai untuk mencapai objektif kajian ini dengan cekap. Ia menyediakan suatu keputusan yang baru dari pandangan Indonesia. Kita boleh membuat senarai terperinci faktor-faktor yang mencabar restoran dan katering di Kalimantan Timur Indonesia dalam mendapatkan sijil halal. Kesulitan disebabkan oleh faktor-faktor dalaman dan luaran. Faktor dalaman adalah: kekurangan pengetahuan dan kesedaran, kekurangan jangka hasil, kekangan pengurusan, kekangan sarana kemudahan, kekangan kewangan, dan jenis produk. Faktor luaran adalah: penyebaran dan pembekal bahan mentah yang memenuhi keperluan terhad, sosial dan budaya, kekangan dari badan pensijil, kurangnya maklumat informasi, kurangnya peranan kerajaan, kesedaran dan permintaan pengguna rendah, prosedur pensijilan, kurang penyelarasan dan penerangan kerja di kalangan pihak berkepentingan, komunikasi, ketiadaan perundingan, kelayakan halal, dan ketersediaan pangkalan data halal.

Hasil kajian ini mengesahkan apa yang telah dibangkitkan dalam teori inovasi adopsi oleh Roger. Faktor-faktor yang mendorong penggunaan sistem baharu tidak akan dipenuhi jika cabaran masih dialami oleh organisasi atau industri.

Memandangkan luas wilayah kerajaan Indonesia dan tahap pembangunan yang berbeza bagi setiap wilayah, hasil kajian ini tidak boleh digeneralisasikan sebagai keadaan di Indonesia secara umum. Walau bagaimanapun implikasi praktikal boleh didapati. Oleh kerana pensijilan halal dalam industri perkhidmatan makanan memperoleh faedah yang rendah daripada industri tersebut, kajian ini mendapati faktor pencabar dalam pelbagai perspektif dan menawarkan beberapa cadangan untuk mengatasi isu-isu tersebut dengan sewajarnya.

**Kata kunci** : Focus Group Discussion FGD, halal, Indonesia, catering, Nominal Group Technique NGT, perusahaan makanan, penyelidikan kualitatif, restoran, temuduga mendalam.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Alhamdulillah, all the praise is to Allah the Most Mighty, Gracious and Merciful. With His guidance all this journey comes to an end and opens a wider window to the other world. A sense of joy and appreciation comes with the completion of this journey. When I decided to fulfill my dreams and venture down the path toward a doctorate, I never knew I would meet many great and inspiring people. I have blessed with friendship, guidance and support of many people, from institutional to personal. There is no possible way to thank everyone who has helped me along the journey, so please allow me start by expressing my eternal gratitude to everyone.

First of all, I am forever grateful to the members of my dissertation committee. I can't thank my committee enough for everything they have done to help me achieve a goal I never thought possible. They have challenged, nurtured and befriended me. Associate Professor Azmawani Abd. Rahman, Ph.D., as a chair, has tirelessly provided her support, patience, insight, provoking spirit and help me defend my study. She has encouraged me with her special treatment for lazy student to keep me focused. Associate Professor Asnarul Khadi B Abu Samah, Ph.D., member of my committee, which has provided new insights on science. For the first time I joined his qualitative class, I fell in love with his method in delivering knowledge. His comment, critic and detail evaluation to my draft is priceless. Associate Professor Dr. Suhaimi Ab Rahman, member of my committee also, for his comments and friendly supervisor. I must also express sincere prayer to my first supervisor Allahyarham Prof. Dr. Dato' Yaacob Che Man, which has paved the way by giving the letter of acceptance as a student of the of Halal Products Research Institute, also gave encouragement and inspiration.

I would like to acknowledge the contribution of The Provincial Government of East Kalimantan Indonesia which has given further study opportunities through Kaltim Cemerlang Scholarships 2011 to make this doctoral program possible for me.

I also wish to thank to the Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (LPDP) the Ministry of Finance the Republic of Indonesia for funding this research through agreement Number PRJ-220/LPDP/2014, and LPPOM MUI East Kalimantan for facilitating this research.

I want to thank all of the people in my academic nuances start from my colleagues at Mulawarman University, Halal Products Research Institute, Persatuan Pelajar Indonesia (PPI UPM), Rumah 619 Jl. 18/7 family, and Universiti Putra Malaysia in general for enriching my life, their endless support and encouragement.

I went through formal education over the years since 1979, and now it has come to the highest stage. Therefore I must also express gratitude to all my teachers start from SDN Karanggedong and SDN Kebonsari Temanggung, SMPN 1 Temanggung, SMAN 1 Temanggung, Department of Agricultural Products Technology Politeknik Semarang,



Faculty of Agricultural Technology Institut Pertanian INTAN Yogyakarta, Food Science & Technology Gadjah Mada University Yogyakarta, and School of Public Health & Tropical Medicine Tulane University New Orleans Louisiana, USA.

Last but not least, I must thank my family. Bapak (Allahyarham) Amir Hardjosumarto / H. Rusli and Ibu Sumarsilah / Masmubbah, you both instilled me the importance of an education. To my lovely wife Muflihah, my beautiful children: Hashifa Kiraamim Bararah, Hanif Dzakiyya Yaqzhah, Sarah Adlina Amal and Hassan Mujibur Rahman for your understanding, love, care, sacrifice, endless emotional and patience being left out often times. To my big family from Banjarmasin and Temanggung as well, thank you for the support and spirit.

May Allah SWT reward all your kindness and help. Amiin



I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 12 January 2016 to conduct the final examination of **Sulistyo Prabowo** on his thesis entitled “Hindering Factors of the Halal Assurance System Among Restaurateurs and Caterers in East Kalimantan Indonesia” in accordance with the Universities and University College Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The committee recommends that the student be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

**Dr. Yuhanis Abdul Azis**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economic and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Dr. Noor Azman b Ali**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economic and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Dr. Mohani binti Abdul**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economic and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Dr. Ir. Rindit Pambayun**

Professor  
Department of Agricultural Technology  
Faculty of Agricultural  
Sriwijaya University Ogan Ilir  
Indonesia  
(External Examiner)

**ZULKARNAIN ZAINAL, Ph.D.**

Professor and Deputy Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 25 May 2016

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Azmawani Abd. Rahman, Ph.D.**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economic and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Suhaimi Ab Rahman, Ph.D.**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economic and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Asnarul Khadi B Abu Samah, Ph.D.**

Associate Professor  
Faculty of Human Ecology  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

---

**BUJANG KIM HUAT, Ph.D.**

Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

## Declaration by graduate student

I hereby confirm that:

- this thesis is my original work;
- quotations, illustrations and citations have been duly referenced;
- this thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any other institutions;
- intellectual property from the thesis and copyright of thesis are fully-owned by Universiti Putra Malaysia, as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- written permission must be obtained from supervisor and the office of Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and Innovation) before thesis is published (in the form of written, printed or in electronic form) including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture notes, learning modules or any other materials as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- there is no plagiarism or data falsification/fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) and the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name and Matric No.: Sulistyo Prabowo GS 31740

## Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee

This is to confirm that:

- the research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervision;
- supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) are adhered to.

Signature :

---

Name of Chairman of Supervisory Committee : Assoc.Prof. Azmawani Abd Rahman, Ph.D.

Signature :

---

Name of Member of Supervisory Committee : Assoc. Prof. Suhaimi Ab Rahman, Ph.D.

Signature: :

---

Name of Member of Supervisory Committee : Assoc. Prof. Asnarulkhadi bin Abu Samah, Ph.D.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
<b>ABSTRACT</b>	i
<b>ABSTRAK</b>	iii
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	v
<b>APPROVAL</b>	vii
<b>DECLARATION</b>	ix
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	xiv
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xvi
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	xvii
<b>CHAPTER</b>	
<b>1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. Background of The Study	2
1.3. Justification of The Study	5
1.4. Problem Statement	6
1.5. Research Objective	11
1.6. Contribution of The Study	11
1.7. Chapter Summary	12
<b>2 HALAL INDUSTRY IN INDONESIA</b>	<b>13</b>
2.1. Introduction	13
2.2. Global Halal Market	13
2.3. Indonesia as a Prospect of a Halal Market and Producer of Halal Products	14
2.4. Restaurant and Catering Industry	15
2.4.1. Restaurant and catering industry in Indonesia	16
2.4.2. Importance of restaurant and catering industry in Indonesia	16
2.4.3. Government Policy and Regulation on the Food Service Sector	17
2.5. Halal Restaurant in Practice	18
2.6. Halal Certification	19
2.6.1. Halal Assurance System in The World	20
2.6.2. Halal Sector in Indonesia	22
2.6.3. Procedure to Obtain Halal Certificate in Indonesia	25
2.7. Indonesian Halal Assurance System, HAS23000	26
2.8. Chapter summary	27
<b>3 LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>29</b>
3.1. Introduction	29
3.2. Halal Assurance System and Others Food Quality Systems	29
3.3. Barrier in The New System Implementation	30
3.2.1. Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point (HACCP)	30

3.2.2.	ISO 9000 (Total Quality Management)	33
3.2.3.	Approved Quality Assurance (AQA)	35
3.2.4.	Food Safety Control System (FSCS)	35
3.2.5.	Environmental Management System (EMS)	36
3.4	Driver For Innovation of Halal Concept	37
3.5	The Role of Religiosity	41
3.6.	Practice of Halal Assurance System Implementation	42
3.7.	The Gap on Halal Restaurant Research	46
3.8.	Chapter Summary	49
<b>4</b>	<b>RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>50</b>
4.1.	Introduction	50
4.2.	Location	50
4.3.	Research Design	51
4.4.	The Trustworthiness of Qualitative Inquiry	53
4.5.	Data Collection Protocol	54
4.5.1.	Nominal Group Technique	54
4.5.2.	The In-depth Interview and Personal Observation	58
4.5.3.	Focus Group Discussion (FGD)	60
4.6.	Chapter Summary	63
<b>5</b>	<b>FINDINGS</b>	<b>64</b>
5.1.	Introduction	64
5.2.	Nominal Group Technique (NGT)	64
5.2.1.	NGT with the Certifying Body	64
5.2.2.	NGT with the Industry	65
5.2.3.	NGT with the Consumers	67
5.2.4.	NGT with the Government	70
5.3.	In-depth Interview	70
5.3.1.	Interview with the Caterers	71
5.3.2.	Interview with the Restaurateurs	77
5.4.	Focus Group Discussion	81
5.5.	Chapter Summary	90
<b>6</b>	<b>DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS</b>	<b>91</b>
6.1.	Introduction	91
6.2.	First Research Objective	91
6.3.	Second Research Objective	93
6.3.1.	Internal Factors	94
6.3.2.	External Factors	98
6.4.	Third Research Objective	103
6.5.	Theory Co-creation	109
6.6.	Chapter Summary	111
<b>7</b>	<b>CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>113</b>
7.1.	Introduction	113
7.2.	Thesis overview	113
7.3.	Conclusion	113
7.4.	Theoretical Implication	116

7.5. Recommendation	119
7.6. Limitation and suggestion for future reseach	121
<b>REFERENCES</b>	122
<b>APPENDICES</b>	134
<b>BIODATA OF STUDENT</b>	148
<b>LIST OF PUBLICATIONS</b>	149





## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table</b>	<b>Page</b>
1.1. Halal Certificate Issued By The LPPOM MUI Kaltim	7
2.1. Types of Parties Involved in The Quality Certification	20
3.1. Summary of The Barriers in HACCP Implementation	33
3.2. Comparison of The Barriers in HACCP and ISO 9000 Implementation	37
3.3. Constraints Innovation in The Quality Assurance System	41
3.4. Evolution of Halal Concept	44
4.1. Demand of Halal Certification in The Restaurant and Catering Sector in East Kalimantan (Kaltim)	50
5.1. Priority Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From Certifying Body's Point of View (Group A1)	64
5.2. Priority Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From Industrial Point of View (Group B1)	65
5.3. Priority Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From Industrial Point of View (Group B2)	65
5.4. The Common Themes of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From The Industrial Point of View (Group B1 And B2)	66
5.5. Priority Theme of The Factors Hindering Halal Certification From Consumer's Point of View The (Group C1)	67
5.6. Priority Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From Consumer's Point of View (Group C2)	68
5.7. Priority Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From Consumer's Point of View (Group C3)	68
5.8. The Common Theme of Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From Consumers' Point of View	69
5.9. Priority Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System From The Government's Point of View (Group D1)	70
5.10. Factors Affecting Halal Assurance System Implementation In The Food Service Sector In East Kalimantan Using FGD	82
6.1. Agreement Theme of The Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System Among Different Categories of Participants	92
6.2. Role and Function of Various Institution in Halal Certification in East Kalimantan	108
6.3. Summary of The Research Findings	112
7.1. List of The Hindering Factors of Restaurant and Catering in Implementing Halal Assurance System Comparing To Roger's Adoption Factors	116
7.2. Propose Future Halal Certification Scheme	120
8.1. Profile of Participants in The First Round of NGT With The Certifying Body (Group A1)	134

8.2.	Profile of Participants in the Second Round of NGT with the Industry Players Held in Samarinda (Group B1)	134
8.3.	Profile of Participants in the Second Round of NGT with the Industry Players Held in Balikpapan (Group B2)	135
8.4.	Profile of Participants in the Third Round of NGT with Consumers (Group C1)	135
8.5.	Profile of Participants in the Third Round of NGT with Consumers (Group C2)	136
8.6.	Profile of Participants in the Third Round of NGT with Consumers (Group C3)	136
8.7.	Profile of Participants in the Fourth Round of NGT with the Government (D1)	137
8.8.	Demography of In-depth Interview Participants	138
8.9.	Demography of the Focus Group Discussion Participants	139

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
3.1.	Five Stages in The Innovation Process in Organizations	40
3.2.	Conceptual Framework of Major Stakeholders in Indonesia's <i>Halal</i> Assurance System	48
4.1.	Map of Province of East Kalimantan (Municipality of Samarinda and Balikpapan)	51
4.2.	Research Methodology of Information Gathering	52
4.3.	Diagram of NGT Sessions With Four Different Categories of Participants	56
4.4.	Respondent's Categories in the In-depth Interview and Personal Observation	59
7.1.	Hindering Factors of Halal Assurance System Implementation Facing By Food Industry in East Kalimantan, Indonesia	115
7.2.	Propose Future Halal Certification Scheme	120

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

APII	: Asosiasi Pengusaha Jasaboga Indonesia, the Indonesian Food Service Association
AQA	: Approved Quality Assurance
AQIS	: The Australian Quarantine and Inspection Service
BPOM	: Badan Pengawas Obat dan Makanan, The National Agency of Drug and Food Control (NADFC)
BPS	: Badan Pusat Statistik, Statistics Indonesia
DPRD	: Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah, the Local House of Representatives, the regional assembly
EMS	: Environmental management system
FGD	: Focus Group Discussion
FSCS	: Food Safety Control System
GDP	: Gross Domestic Product
GSC	: Green Supply Chain
HACCP	: Hazard Analysis of Critical Control Point
HAS	: Halal Assurance System
HJE	: Halal Joint Efforts
Humas	: Hubungan Masyarakat, Public Relation
IFANCC	: Islamic Food and Nutrition Council of Canada
ISO	: International Organization for Standardization
JAKIM	: Jabatan Kemajuan Islam Malaysia, The Department of Islamic Development Malaysia
Kaltim	: Kalimantan Timur, East Kalimantan
Kemenag	: Kementerian Agama, Ministry of Religion
LPPOM MUI	: Lembaga Pengkajian Pangan, Obat-obatan dan Kosmetika Majelis Ulama Indonesia, The Assessment Institute for Food, Drugs, and Cosmetics of The Indonesian Council of Ulama
MITI	: Ministry of International Trade and Industry
MoU	: Memorandum of Understanding
MUI	: Majelis Ulama Indonesia, The Indonesian Council of Islamic Scholars
MUIS	: Majlis Ugama Islam Singapura, The Islamic Council of Singapore
NGO	: Non-Government Organization
NGT	: Nominal Group Technique
OIC	: Organization of Islamic Countries
Perda	: Peraturan Daerah, the Local regulation
PHRI	: Perhimpunan Hotel dan Restoran Indonesia, the Indonesian Hotel and Restaurant Association
QAS	: Quality Assurance System
SKPD	: Satuan Kerja Pemerintah Daerah, the Task Force of Regional Government
SMEs	: small medium enterprises
TQM	: Total Quality Management
UAE	: United Arab Emirate
UNWTO	: United Nations World Trade Organization
USD	: United Stated Dollar

YLKI

: Yayasan Lembaga Konsumen Indonesia, the Consumer  
Protection Agency of Indonesia



# CHAPTER 1

## INTRODUCTION

Halal has become an interesting topic in the global world. Halal is no longer limited to the language of religion, especially Islam, but has evolved into academic, business and trade issues (Che Man, 2011). Almost all the Muslim countries began to give attention to the issue of halal products, especially in providing halal assurance to the circulated consumer products. Indonesia as the country with the largest Muslim population in the world can not be separated from this phenomenon. Unfortunately, not much academic research can be found as reference of the halal issue in Indonesia, especially for the food service sector, such as restaurants and catering.

This study is about the hindering factors of the halal assurance system among the restaurateurs and caterers in East Kalimantan, Indonesia. In this chapter, it will outline the background of the study, reason for doing this research and the objectives as well.

### 1.1 Introduction

How food is prepared and the kind of food that is eaten are important considerations for a variety of ethnic, social, cultural and religious reasons. For example, Muslims require food that is halal, Jews insist on kosher, vegetarian is for Hindus and Buddhists and so on (Eliasi and Dwyer, 2002; Dugan, 1994). When food is related to issues of religion, then it becomes something that can be very complicated (Anderson, 2005). Religion is the most influential factor in society in determining what good food is allowed, what type, when and how it is prepared (Bon & Hussain, 2010). Halal for Muslims may not be allowed in other religions, and vice versa. For example, beef is halal for Muslims, but not to the Hindus. Thus, the development of halal food in today's world must be done in such a way that the requirements of halal are not ignored and overwhelmed by purely business interests in order to meet the needs and demand of the target market (Dugan, 1994).

Notwithstanding, the halal industry is getting much attention today, still it requires a lot of thorough study. Until now, halal is often regarded as a problem that merely involves *fiqh* scholars (Wilson, 2012). *Halal* and *haram* is one of the fundamental laws concepts in Islam. For some people who do not speak Arabic, *halal* is usually often associated with a variety of food items which are allowed to be taken based on Islamic Law. Beyond food and drink, the concept of *halal* actually covers a much wider meaning including behavior, action, speech, attitude, cloth, cosmetic, and medicine (Al Jallad, 2008; Kocturk, 2002). In a broader term, *halal* is also seen in Islamic banking and the hospitality industry development (Ab Rahman *et al.*, 2009). In fact, Muslims should put the issue of *halal* and *haram* in every aspect of human life.

## 1.2 Background of The Study

The importance of halal food in a global context is justified by the following statistics. Islam has been growing significantly over decades. In 2010, the global Muslim population was about 1.6 billion and it has been predicted to reach 2.2 billion in 2030 (Pew Research Center, 2011). The economic development of the OIC (Organization of Islamic Cooperation) during the period of 2013 – 2018 is predicted to reach 6.3%, higher than the global GDP, which is only 5.3% (Thompson Reuters, 2013).

The growth of Islam around the globe is in line with the value of its adherence to make “Islam as a way of life”. As a consequence, the huge number of the Muslim population worldwide will drive the business markets in the world. This is clearly illustrated in the significant increase of the halal market and demand in the world. The annual halal market trade value was worth US\$ 2.3 trillion globally and halal food alone was US\$ 693 billion annually (MITI, 2012). Another fact as reported by Thompson Reuters (2013), the global Muslim expenditure for food and non-alcoholic beverages in 2012 was \$1,088 billion (16.6% global expenditure) and is expected to reach \$1,626 billion by 2018.

Indonesia has become the most promising country in terms of the global Islamic economy. Data from the IMF World Bank in 2012, as cited by Thompson Reuters (2013), positioned Indonesia to be the top GDP among ten OIC (Organization of Islamic Countries) members with a value (in billions) of \$878 followed by Turkey (\$794), Saudi Arabia (\$727), Iran (\$549), United Arab Emirates (\$359), Malaysia (\$304), Nigeria (\$269), Egypt (\$257), Iraq (\$213) and Kazakhstan (\$196), respectively. From the same source, Indonesia was also stated as the top Muslim food consumption market (\$197 billion) followed by Turkey (\$100 billion), Pakistan (\$93 billion), Egypt (\$88 billion), and Iran (\$77 billion).

Compared to other countries, however, Indonesia seems to be left behind in catching the huge potential of the halal business. This fact will be explained later in this chapter. But before focusing on Indonesia, it is better to make comparison with some of the countries that are more advanced in facing the global halal business.

Malaysia and Singapore are two countries that are strong enough in Muslim traditions. In these countries, Islamic affairs are under the respective governments who have the power to regulate halal compliance in business. Halal has been introduced for a long time. In Malaysia, along with the starting entry of imported food products in 1970, there were demands from the people who wanted a halal assurance for these products. This was addressed by the introduction of the Trade Description Order of 1975 (the use of the word ‘halal’) and the Trade Description Act 1975 (halal marker) and updated in the 2011 Subject Merchandise. Development of the halal brand in Malaysia is getting stronger with the support of the government in shaping the Islamic Affairs Division under the Prime Minister since 1982 and upgraded to a separate

department with the name *Jabatan Kemajuan Islam Malaysia* (JAKIM, The Department of Islamic Development Malaysia) (Riaz & Chaudry, 2004).

Singapore, a small country with a majority of non-Muslim population was more aggressive in taking care of the halal issue. It started out in 1972 with the Islamic Council of Singapore (MUIS, *Majlis Ugama Islam Singapura*) and the first halal certificate was issued in 1978. MUIS has the full mandate in the regulation of halal business with the passage of amendments to the Administration of Muslim Act (Amla) in 1999 (Riaz & Chaudry, 2004).

The opportunity in the halal business is also targeted by non-Muslim countries. Thailand has set up many halal research centers in many universities and expanded their halal products market. Thailand has taken aggressive steps to ensure that their products are halal certified to strengthen their position as the sixth biggest food exporter in the world with a revenue of US\$5 billion a year. Now they have 8,000 halal certified food industries out of a total of 30,000 players in the food industries. Thailand is still striving to increase this number to reach their goal as the third largest food exporter after Brazil and the US in the next couple of years (Yatim, 2011).

Beyond the Asean countries, many other countries are also looking at the halal concept as a new tool to expand their products and their business (Eum, 2009). This is shown by data cited from *daganghalal.com*: “the Australian Halal meat sales rose by 70% between 1997 and 2002. The annual Australian Halal exports in 2003 were valued at A\$3.7 billion for meat and A\$ 1 billion for dairy produce. The Australian Government has committed A\$100 million over five years to promote their halal food export business. New Zealand lamb exports account for 40% of the world market and 95% of all New Zealand lamb exports are now Halal while non-Halal production is being phased out. In addition, the European Supermarket giants, Carrefour and Auchan are now aggressively pursuing halal food retailing, while in the meantime the Port of Rotterdam is creating a “Halal District Park” to serve 30 million Muslims in Europe. The availability of halal food from fresh meat to value added/processed food is increasingly visible in many EU countries. Butcheries, small stores, supermarkets and hypermarkets are gradually selling halal food products, although this typically started in the Muslim-majority areas” (*Daganghalal*, 2013). Taiwan promotes halal certified restaurants in anticipation of growing Muslim tourists to the country (Halalfocus, 2013).

Many halal exhibitions that have been held around the world have also shown how the global halal market has gained the attention of the trade merchant world. Almost every day we can read of these events in places from Paris, Moscow, Kazakhstan, Chile, Brazil, Malaysia, and Singapore, to Turkey, Dubai-UAE and Iran as shown in their websites. This spread of interest in the halal business has been driven by many factors in the Muslim population: high population growth, increasing income, increasing demand for food that is appropriate with faith, increasing requirement for food diversity and the occurrence of fraudulent halal food. All these factors have led to a



high demand for the authenticity, wholesomeness and halalness of products (Daganghalal, 2013).

In line with the fast growing halal business, Wilson *et al.* (2013) indicated Indonesia as “The Hidden Treasure”. This is supported by the fact that Indonesia is the biggest Muslim country in the world with 87.18% of its population being Muslims. Along with the improvement in economic and political conditions, there is an emerging educated middle class who are easy to adapt to global developments, but are still keen to hold onto traditional Islamic values (Wilson *et al.*, 2013). Muslim consumers' awareness in Indonesia to get products in accordance with their belief was also expressed by Gayatri (2013). Unfortunately, the potential of the halal business in Indonesia has not been fully realized by the industry players, as seen from the low number of halal certificates issued by Majelis Ulama Indonesia (MUI, The Indonesian Council of Islamic Scholars) (Wilson *et al.*, 2013).

In the food service sector for instance to date, according to LPPOM MUI (The Assessment Institute for Food, Drugs and Cosmetics of The Indonesian Council of Ulama), less than 10% of restaurants are halal certified or have adopted the Halal Assurance System (Sari, 2011). Data compiled by the author from a variety of LPPOM MUI Provinces in Indonesia show only a small number of hotels and restaurants that have been halal certified by the MUI. From a total of 1,084 starred hotels, only 15 are halal certified (1%). While, from a total of 2,916 restaurants only 26 are halal certified (7%) (Prabowo *et al.*, 2012). These statistics are also supported by Ahmad (2013) in his observation of 67 restaurants in Jakarta.

Due to the smaller participation of the restaurateurs and caterers in halal certification, it is important to look at what could be the barriers in the implementation of HAS as a prerequisite program for halal certification.

Today, Muslim consumers in Indonesia get the halal assurance from the certification process held by LP POM MUI. Even though halal certification in Indonesia was started in 1991, currently legal food products which have registration numbers and have been halal certified circulating in Indonesia make up only 36.73% of the market. It means that the halal guaranteed status of products in the market through halal certification is still low (Wiyono, 2013).

Discussions on halal regulation in Indonesia mostly focus on the financial burden and liability rather than comparative advantages. Such a situation is a barrier to the spread of halal certification and puts Indonesia behind other countries in respect to halal certification (Wahid, 2012). This current lack of halal certification condition could be viewed as contrary to the aims of government programs that are heavily promoting tourism to the countries which are predominantly Muslim such as those in the Middle East region and Malaysia (Kompas, 2012).

### 1.3 Justification of The Study

The food and beverage industry is a significant contributor to the GDP of Indonesia. In 2008, the industrial production value of food and beverages reached USD 20 billion, and has grown at an average of 16% annually, since thereafter. This industry absorbs the largest labor force among manufacturing industries. In 2010, this industry absorbed a labor force of 3.6 million people, an increase of 3.8% from 2009. From January to August 2010, the food and beverage industry increased its export value by 16% for the food industry and by 13% for the beverage industry relative to the same period in the previous year (Coordinating Ministry For Economic Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, 2011).

In the tourism development program, the services industry has a strategic role to increase the workforce absorption, promote equal employment opportunities and achieve equitable national development. It also contributes to the foreign exchange revenues and poverty alleviation. The increasing number of foreign tourist visits in 2010 has consequently increased the value of tourism to an amount of US\$7.6 billion compared to US\$7.3 billion in 2008. The National Tourism Development Master Plan 2011 - 2025 projects foreign tourist visits to increase to 20 million per annum by 2025 (Ministry of Culture & Tourism, 2012). A recent statement from the president of Indonesia even stressed a target of 10 million tourist arrivals by 2014 (Ratya, 2013).

If it is assumed that all tourists who come were from Muslim majority countries, then it is estimated that around 21.81% of tourists in Indonesia need halal assurance especially on food consumption during their stay in Indonesia (Ministry of Culture & Tourism, 2012). It is also important to note that a high percentage of tourists in Indonesia are local/domestic visitors. In 2010 the local tourists accounted for 121 million (94% of the total tourists in that particular year) (Anonim, 2012). As part of the biggest Muslim populated country, they also need halal food and accommodation during their visits.

In addition, the global economic crisis has reduced the flow of tourists from Europe and America to Indonesia. Realizing this situation, Indonesia had focused on the neighboring market until 2015. The Top four countries were Singapore (16.32% share of Indonesia's total tourist arrivals), Malaysia (13.56%), Australia (11.59%), and China (6.60%). In 2011, Indonesia experienced a significant growth of visitors from Saudi Arabia (21.69%), Australia (21.28%), the Philippines (20.42%), China (19.75%) and India (15.80%) (Anonim, 2012).

In this study, it has been impossible to complete it in a national context. Indonesia, with 34 provinces and 13,487 islands (Hargo, 2014), provides a very large diversity in terms of geographical area, culture, economy and politics of each province there in. Therefore, with limited budget and time, this study only took place in the East Kalimantan (Kaltim) province with justification as follow. First, East Kalimantan is the second largest province in Indonesia after Papua. The capital city of this province is Samarinda. Geographically it shares a common border with Sarawak and Sabah in East

Malaysia. Divided into eight districts namely, Samarinda, Balikpapan, Penajam Paser Utara, Paser, Bontang, Kutai Timur, Kutai Barat, and Kutai Kartanegara, East Kalimantan's tourism has good prospects and there is optimism for continuing growth. This province has many tourist destinations ranging from natural resources to agricultural and cultural heritage attractions. In the year 2009, it was reported that there were as many as 485 tourism destinations and attractions offered in this province. Hotel accommodation was available in 43 starred hotels and 433 non-starred hotels (BPS-Kaltim, 2011).

Second, Kaltim was chosen in this study because the government of this province has urged the stakeholders involved in the food service industry to be *halal* certified (Humas Provinsi Kaltim, 2013a). Since August 2013, Kaltim has become the first province in Indonesia to initiate the local regulation on *halal* products warranty. It is under the decree number 06/2014 dated February 11, 2014. This regulation was legalized as "Management and Monitoring Towards *Halal* and Hygienic Products" (Humas DPRD Provinsi Kaltim, 2013). In addition, the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia also pointed Kaltim as one among five pilot project provinces to disseminate "*Gemar Halal (Gerakan Masyarakat Sadar Halal)*", a movement aimed to encourage people's awareness on *halalness* (Humas Provinsi Kaltim, 2013b).

#### 1.4 Problem Statement

In the *halal* certification process, Majelis Ulama Indonesia MUI has introduced a *halal* assurance system called HAS 23000. Every company which intends to apply for a *halal* certificate from MUI must implement HAS 23000 in advance. This system is an integrated management system which organizes implements and maintains materials, production processes, products, people and procedures in order to ensure the continuity of the *halal* production process according to the requirements imposed by the board of certification through *halal* assurance standard documents. As a standard, the *halal* assurance system also contains a series of documents encompassing the scope, definition, requirements, compliance and so on. Standards are also sorted through consensus, transparency, and openness that refer to the international standard that is allowed. The *halal* assurance system also contains the rules, guidelines and regulations (LPPOM MUI, 2012b). HAS 23000 has been recognized internationally and has become a reference in some other countries (Wilson et al., 2013).

In fact, the obligation to implement the HAS 23000 can be an obstacle for the majority of businesses who are interested to get the *halal* certificate. This is indicated by the low number of *halal* certificates issued by MUI. As of January 2011, only 36.73% of the consumer products were *halal* certified (Wilson et al., 2013). In the ready to eat food sector, such as restaurants and catering, the number is far less than that. In East Kalimantan, not a single hotel has been *halal* certified and only one restaurant has a *halal* certificate and even it did not extend its validity (Prabowo et al., 2012). Table 1.1 shows the data from the LPPOM MUI Kaltim in this current situation.

**Table 1.1. Halal Certificate Issued By The LPPOM MUI Kaltim**

Year	Total halal certificates issued	Packaged Food	Restaurant and catering
2010	139	138	1
2011	202	201	1
2012	154	153	1
2013	173	171	2
2014	122	117	5
2015	224	221	3

Source: LPPOM MUI Kaltim (2015)

From the table above, it can be seen that halal certificates are mostly issued for the packaged food. Data from the APJI (*Asosiasi Pengusaha Jasa Boga Indonesia / Indonesian Food Service Association Kaltim*) show that of the 117 members only 6 are halal certified (Setyawati, 2015. The Treasurer of APJI Kalimantan Timur, pers. comm. 10 January 2015). While in the restaurant sector, from 1,086 premises (BPS Kaltim, 2014), no one has the halal certificate. From 2010 to 2015, LPPOM MUI Kaltim only received 21 halal applications from restaurants and catering services (LPPOM MUI Kaltim, 2015).

Given the fact with the data above, the first problem that must be addressed is: **“What are the factors that contribute to the low tendency of the restaurant and catering operators in East Kalimantan to be halal certified?”**

Islam is embraced by 82% of the Kaltim population (Kemenag, 2013). In reality, they have not shown a heightened awareness of the halal issue. Other than the data above, some alarming cases are still even found in Kaltim, such as circulation of illegal meat, the use of harmful chemicals in food processing (Pardede, 2012), meat balls contaminated with pork (Sammy, 2012; Syahputra, 2013), the use of alcoholic beverages in food preparation and also the sale of carrion chicken (Poskota Kaltim, 2011). This situation is of concern since the average expenditure of East Kalimantan people for food consumption has reached 49.51% (BPS Kaltim, 2014).

Increased public welfare causes changes in food consumption patterns around the world, including the increased consumption of processed foods, the consumption of meat and fish sourced products, and the increasing volume of the international food trade. Similarly, with the increasing number of activities outside the home, it has made the need for the provision of fast food also increase, in the workplace, schools and public food vendors. These conditions heighten concern among many consumers as being very dependent on the manufacturer's safety claim in determining the food they consume.

In Indonesia, the MUI's halal certificate is the only guarantee that can be granted by the government to ensure the halalness of products consumed by the public. Hence, the low numbers of businesses which implement the halal assurance system represent the low halal guarantee towards products which have been distributed in the market.

Restaurateurs are obviously aware of the importance of halal certification as evidenced by the incidence of "self-claimed" halal logos, such as "100% halal", "*dijamin halal*" (halal guaranteed), or merely the halal symbol in Arabic to lure Muslim consumers. Of course this self-claimed halal logo is illegal and is no guarantee of halal compliance. There are still many using haram ingredients and materials in their production which is prohibited by Islam, such as *khamr* (liquor, wine) and meat from unknown sources (Sumarsongko, 2014, The Director of LPPOM MUI East Kalimantan, pers. comm. 3 April 2014).

Culturally, Indonesia is known as a religious nation. Since the early days of history, people have brought along their religious traits in performing rituals and social activities. Indonesia puts faith in God as the primary basis in the state ideology which is the belief in one God (Kusasi, 2013). Gallup surveys in 2009 showed that 99% of Indonesian adults were religious and put religion as an important part of their daily lives (Crabtree, 2010).

Interestingly, if indeed the Muslims in Indonesia consider themselves as religious, why do they not use the rules of the religion they believe in, in food matters? This situation reveals the second question to be answered: **"What are the reasons behind those factors (derived from the first question) from the stakeholders (responsible actors) points of view?"** This question is to ascertain the extent of those factors in influencing the practice of the restaurant and catering operators in East Kalimantan for not being halal certified.

The stakeholders of halal businesses should understand the importance of the halal issue and be able to anticipate its development on a global scale. Unfortunately this has not been seen in Indonesia. With a very wide diverse geographical area, ethnically and culturally, Indonesia faces problems that are not simple. Likewise, the development of the halal issue is not distributed equally, some areas are seemingly very prominent and progressive, while, other areas are left untouched (Sumarsongko, 2014).

Bureaucratic reformation in Indonesia is still in the process, and as a result of this, there are some negative impacts on the regional policy. Guidelines for restaurants in Indonesia are still not well integrated in a single institution with the same perception. For example, in the restaurant classification, each region uses different regulations to suit their own convenience, and there is a lack of consistency and standardization. The classification by the Ministry of Finance is intended to facilitate the calculation of taxes that will be charged to businesses, not for training purposes. The training of the restaurant sector is the responsibility of the Ministry of Tourism and Culture. In current practice, there is no policy relating to quality and halal certification. Government efforts towards quality control are actually the responsibility of the Ministry of Health through training and the certification of food hygiene and sanitation. In establishing the

halal certification authority, it has even been a scramble between the ministry of religion and the MUI (BBC Indonesia, 2014).

The obscurity of the authorities in the halal certification in Indonesia could be causing the low interest to apply for halal certification. This case reveals the third question: **“What are the roles of the respective stakeholders (responsible actors) in the halal certification of the restaurant and catering operators in East Kalimantan?”**

This research has focused on the factors that serve as obstacles for restaurants and catering services in Indonesia for not adopting the *halal* assurance system. There is limited studies on the perception of restaurant operators on halal certification. Although studies by Marzuki et al. (2012) and Wan-Hassan and Awang (2009) offer some insights on the perception of restaurant operators on halal certification, they have been set up in Malaysia. While a few studies on this issue have been conducted in other countries, a study that focuses on Indonesia has been needed due to the differences in the level of economics, dynamicity of the industry, and the rules and policies of the government. Other than that fact, this study has focused on Indonesia where the development of the *halal* industry is considered slow (Wilson et al., 2013; Dolan, 2010).

Despite an increasing interest in the halal issue, it is surprising that so little empirical research has actually been conducted on the topic. Previous researches on halal restaurants merely focus on the operator side using quantitative methods or the mixed method, thus, this research has explored new data from other stakeholders, such as the certification body, government and consumers, in this issue as well.

Due to the lack of information regarding the implementation of the halal assurance system in Indonesia, this explanatory study was conducted using qualitative inquiries. As an explanatory method in various academic disciplines, qualitative research is widely used to explore facts that are relatively new and not yet widely known (Hoepfl, 1997). According to Creswell (2007), “qualitative research is needed to study a group or population, identifying variables that can then be measured, or it can listen to silenced voices. These are all good reasons to explore a problem rather than to use predetermined information from the literature or rely on results from other research studies.”

Qualitative research shares advantageous characteristics such as “natural setting, researcher as key instrument, multiple sources of data, inductive data analysis, participants' meanings, emergent design, theoretical lens, interpretive inquiry, and holistic account.” Natural setting means that in a qualitative inquiry, researchers tend to collect data in the field on site where participants experience the issue or problem under study (Creswell, 2007, p. 38). In doing so, researchers are urged to go directly to the field “talking directly with people, going to their homes or places of work, and allowing them to tell the stories unencumbered by what we expect to find or what we have read in the literature. We conduct qualitative research when we want to empower individuals to share their stories, hear their voices, and minimize the power relationships that often exist between a researcher and the participants in a study”

(Creswell, 2007, p. 38). Thereby, data obtained in qualitative research emerges purely from the participants instead of existing literatures. To get the detailed understanding regarding the issue that has been studied, qualitative research encourages the use of multi-sourced data, comprehensively (Creswell, 2007, p. 39). The research process for qualitative researchers is also flexible which means that the initial plan for research and that all phases of the process may change or shift after the researchers enter the field and begin to collect data. The key idea behind qualitative research is to learn about the problem or issue from the participants and to address the research to obtain that information (Creswell, 2007, p. 39).

By using the qualitative method, data will be obtained as deeper, more comprehensive, credible and meaningful in achieving the purpose of this study, which is to find out the barriers in halal assurance system implementation in the food service sectors in East Kalimantan, Indonesia. In comparison, the quantitative method can only study certain variables, so that the whole issue cannot be captured completely. In addition, the quantitative method can not elaborate data with broader and deeper understanding, such as feelings, norm, faith, culture and other human characteristics. The quantitative method can only dig up empirical and measured data, while intangible facts cannot be revealed (Sugiyono, 2014).

As the researcher delved into the literatures, it was found that none of the publications was devoted to the issue of barriers in the halal business in the Indonesian context. This lack of study concerning halal certification in the food industry, in turn, suggested conducting a basic research. Therefore, in this investigation, the important issues to be addressed were the barriers of halal assurance system implementation faced by the food service sector industry.

Obviously, there are four main parties (stakeholders) in the *halal* certification process, namely, the government, *halal* certification bodies, consumers, and industries (Noordin *et al.*, 2009). Researchers who have studied *halal* in the food premises' businesses have merely focused on the view of the restaurant side as a business player. The studies were addressed to the managerial staff, business owners, chefs or other staff in the restaurant as the respondents (Wan-Hassan and Awang, 2009; Marzuki, 2012). Meanwhile, Badrudin *et al.* (2012) evaluated *halal* certification bodies, but also from the consumer's perspective, not directly to that respective institution.

Therefore, it requires various points of view for balanced perspectives on the previous results that some researches accomplished in the sector. To acquire in-depth understanding in halal certification, additional information from every aspect of the business players should be explored. This study has addressed the gaps in the literatures of this field. Even though many studies (Wan-Hassan and Awang, 2009; Marzuki, 2012; and Badrudin *et al.*, 2012) have found that other actor had important roles in the issue of *halal* certification, none of them endeavored to explore more deeply into those particular parties. In addition, no studies which are concerned with the government's role as well as certifying body's roles have been conducted to investigate various factors that might hinder the company being halal certified. Therefore, this study has endeavored to fill this gap.

This study was aimed to be conducted thorough investigation of four different stakeholders, i.e., consumers, producers, government and certifying body in East Kalimantan Indonesia. For the purpose of the qualitative phase of the research, four different sources of data were considered complementary to each other. First, the Nominal Group Technique (NGT) was conducted with four groups of halal stakeholders in order to find out in detail about the barrier in halal certification. Second, a series of in-depth interviews with the restaurateurs and caterers was carried out to better gauge and confirm the list of barriers obtained from the NGT session. The aims of these interviews were also to identify and explore the areas that would be considered for subsequent discussion in the research. Third, personal observation during in-depth interview was also used to enrich the real condition in the field and also confront the participant's statement with their practice. Lastly, the Focus Group Discussion was conducted to balance the findings. This last method was also held in order to get the members to check the information as a way to increase the credibility and reliability of the research findings.

### **1.5 Research Objective**

Considering the dearth of scientific publications on halal certification in Indonesia, this research will provide meaningful input to the development of the halal issue in Indonesia. Through an exploratory study, the main objective of this research has been to identify problems that cause most of the restaurants and catering companies in Indonesia to remain without halal certification, especially in East Kalimantan Province.

Furthermore, this study also has specific objectives which are:

- To identify the factors that contribute to the low tendency of the restaurant and catering operators in East Kalimantan to be *halal* certified.
- To explore the reasons behind those factors from the stakeholders (responsible actors) points of view. This question is to ascertain the extent of those factors in influencing the practice of the restaurant and catering operators in East Kalimantan for not being *halal* certified.
- To explore the role of the respective stakeholders (responsible actors) in the halal certification of the restaurant and catering operators in East Kalimantan

### **1.6 Contribution of The Study**

This study will benefit several stakeholders and help them in achieving a higher penetration of halal certification among the players, particularly in the food industries in East Kalimantan.

To the knowledge of the researcher, this study is the first attempt to explore the halal assurance system in East Kalimantan specifically and Indonesia, in general. No publications have been found on this topic in Indonesia. The result of this study can be a stepping stone to start research and development in halal management system in the



food service industries. This research also contributes a valuable insight for halal management study development.

The trend analysis with regards to the implementation of a halal assurance system within restaurants and catering can be used as a framework for the future by whoever invests, expands the market or creates a new market. This study could be used to overcome some burdens that impede the culinary services sector in implementing the halal assurance system.

A certifying body, like the LPPOM MUI in Indonesia, can conduct a self evaluation of their programs. The low progress of the food service sector to implement the halal assurance system might be caused by the way the LPPOM MUI delivers its policies and programs. So far, there has been no effort made by the certifying body to know what the industries feel regarding the implementation of the halal assurance system.

This study provides recommendations to help the government comply with consumers' needs and demand for halal products. The issue of fraudulent halal claims continues to exacerbate the Indonesian economic landscape. This is because the government has no data from credible research that can guide and support its policy to deal with the problem.

Furthermore, as qualitative inquiries approaches were employed, the results of this study can induce new theories that will enrich the knowledge in the field of halal.

## **1.7 Chapter Summary**

It is clear from this chapter that the potential of the halal trade and business is still very open. Indonesia, with a very large potential muslim market and as an industry player is likely to be the most influential country. However, this potential has not been fully realized. There are so many business areas that have not been well explored, one of which is the food service industry, such as restaurant and catering. Valid research data is needed to convince stakeholders of the halal industry in Indonesia about the importance of halal certification. This study is one of the efforts being made to cover the gap in this field.

This chapter has outlined the initial context of the thesis, such as the importance of halal issues at the international and national level, and narrow down to the scope of East Kalimantan accompanied by the latest data. The problem statement, the research questions, the research objectives and the significance of this study towards the restaurateurs, consumers, policy makers and halal industry as well as to the other academicians and researchers in this area are also discussed. As the research questions are used to ask what factors hinder halal certification and how they impact on restaurateurs and caterers, the argument for using the qualitative inquiry has also been highlighted in this chapter.

## REFERENCES

- Ab. Halim, M.A., Salleh, M.M. (2012). The Possibility of Uniformity on Halal Standards in Organization of Islamic Countries (OIC) Country. *World Applied Sciences Journal* 17 pp 6-10.
- Ab Rahman, I., Saleh, R., Ab Rahman, S., Hashim, D.M. (2011). Factors contributing to non-compliance of the halal standard among restaurant operator in Malaysia. In *Proceedings 2<sup>nd</sup> International conference on Business, Economics and Tourism Management IPEDR* Vol 24. Singapore: IACSIT Press. 88-92
- Ab Rahman, M.N., Manzouri, M., Che Mohd Zain, C.R., (2013) Environmental Concern In Managing Halal Food Supply Chain. *American Journal of Environmental Science* 9 (3): 240-246
- Ab Rahman, S., Che Man, Y., & Wan Zulkifli, W. (2009). "Halal friendly tourism: Capturing the Muslim market." In *Proceedings 3rd IMT-GS International symposium on halal science and management 2009*. P. Hashim, A. Ismail, A. Q. Sazili, N. N. Mohd Zaki, S. Arshad, & N. F. Mokhtar (Ed.), Serdang: HPRI UPM. 176-180
- Abdul, M., Ismail, H., Mustapha, M., Kusuma, H., (2013). Indonesian small medium enterprises (SMEs) and perceptions on Halal food certification. *African Journal of Business Management*. Vol. 7(16), pp. 1492-1500
- Abdullah, A.N., (2006). *Perception And Awareness Among Food Manufacturers And Marketers On Halal Food In The Klang Valley*. Unpublished Master Thesis, Universiti Putra Malaysia, Malaysia
- Abdullah, S., Razak, A.A., Hanafi, M.H., Jaafar, M. (2013) Implementation barriers of ISO 9000 within the Malaysian local government. *International Journal of Quality & Reliability Management* Vol. 30 No. 8, pp. 853-876
- Ahmad, A.N., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., (2015). Assessing Knowledge and Religiosity on Consumer Behavior towards Halal Food and Cosmetic Products. *International Journal of Social Science and Humanity*, Vol. 5, No. 1, pp 10 -14
- Ahmad, M. (2013). "Seharusnya sertifikat halal itu dipajang!" Available at: <http://pusathalal.com/kuliner-halal/wisata-kuliner-halal/wisata-kuliner-halalsub/843-seharusnya-sertifikat-halal-itu-dipajang> (accessed 31 January 2013)
- Al Jallad, N. (2008). "The concepts of al-halal and al-haram in the Arab Muslim culture: a translational and lexicographical study." *Language Design*. 10, 77-86.
- Alam, S., & Sayuti, N. (2011). Applying the theory of planned behavior (TPB) in halal food purchasing. *International Journal of Commerce and Management* , 8-20.
- Alonso-Almeida, M.M., Rodriguez-Anton, J.M., (2011). Organisational behavior and strategies in the adoption of certified management system: an analysis of the Spain hotel industry. *Journal of Cleaner Production*. 19: 1455-1463
- Anderson, E. N. (2005). Food and religion. In *Everyone Eats: Understanding food and culture*. E. N. Anderson, (pp. 154-161). New York: New York University Press.
- Anderson, G., and Ford, L. (1994). "Nominal Group Technique and the formulation of competency standards." *Asia Pacific Journal of Human resources* 32 (1). 61-122

- Anonim. (2012). *Indonesia tourism performance*. Retrieved January 14, 2013, from asia pacific unwto: [http://asiapacific.unwto.org/sites/all/files/pdf/indonesia\\_tourism\\_performance.pdf](http://asiapacific.unwto.org/sites/all/files/pdf/indonesia_tourism_performance.pdf)
- Apriantono, A. (2011). Senior halal auditor. Former Ministry of Agriculture Republic of Indonesia. pers. comm. 23 June 2011
- Aris, A.T., Nor, N.M., Febrianto, N.A., Harivaindaran, K.V., Yang, T.A., (2012). "Muslim attitude and awareness toward istihalah." *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. 3 (3): 244-254
- Armandhanu, D., Darmawan, Z., (2013). *Bagaimana Isu Minyak Babi Menghantam Restoran Solaria*. Retrieved April 14, 2014, from <http://nasional.news.viva.co.id>. Thursday, Agust 15, 2013
- Ateeq-ur-Rehman, Shabbir, M.S., (2010). The relationship between religiosity and new product adoption. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* Vol. 1 No. 1, pp. 63-69
- Azanza, M.P.V., Zamora-Luna, M.B.V., (2005). Barriers of HACCP team members to guideline adherence. *Food Control* 16: 15-22
- Azis, Y.A. and Chok, N.V., (2012). The role of halal awareness, halal certification, and marketing components in determining halal purchase intention among non-muslim in Malaysia: A structural Equation Modeling approach. *Journal of International Food & Agribusiness Marketing*, 25: 1 pp 1-23.
- Badrudin, B., Mohamed, Z., Sharifuddin, J., Rezai G., Abdullah, A.M., Abd Latif, I., Mohayidin, M.G., (2012). "Clients' perception towards JAKIM service quality in Halal certification." *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. 3(1): 59-71
- Bánáti, D., Lakner, Z. (2012). Managerial attitudes, acceptance and efficiency of HACCP systems in Hungarian catering. *Food Control* 25 : 484-492
- Bappedakaltim (2012). Laju Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Kaltim 2008-2012. Retrieved January 14, 2013 from <http://bappedakaltim.com/indikator-pembangunan/460-ekonomi.html>
- Baş, M., Ersun, A.S., Kivanc, G., (2006) Implementation of HACCP and prerequisite programs in food businesses in Turkey. *Food Control* 17: 118-126
- Baş, M., Yüksel, M., Çavuşoğlu, T., (2007). Difficulties and barriers for the implementing of HACCP and food safety systems in food businesses in Turkey. *Food Control* 18: 124-130
- BBC Indonesia (2014). Siapa yang berhak keluarkan sertifikat halal? Retrieved 23 January 2016 from [http://www.bbc.com/indonesia/forum/2014/03/140303\\_forum\\_sertifikat\\_halal](http://www.bbc.com/indonesia/forum/2014/03/140303_forum_sertifikat_halal)
- Beritakaltim (2015) Restoran dan Rumah Makan Perlu Memiliki Sertifikasi Halal. Retrieved 23 January 2016 from <http://beritakaltim.com/?p=17982>. Dec 01, 2015
- Biro Pusat Statistik (2012). "Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Kalimantan Timur Triwulan III Tahun 2012." Berita Resmi Statistik Provinsi East Kalimantan No.39/11/64/Th.XV, 5 November 2012.
- Bolton, D.J., Meally, A., Blair, I.S., Mc Dowell, D.A., Cowan, C. (2008). Food safety knowledge of head chefs and catering managers in Ireland. *Food Control* 19: 291-300
- Bon, M., & Hussain, M. (2010). Tourism in the Muslim World. In *Bridging Tourism Theory and Practice* 2: 47-59.
- Bonne, K., Vermeir, I., Bergeaud-Blackler, F., Verbeke, W. (2007). Determinants of halal meat consumption in France. *British Food Journal*. 109 (5): 367-386

- Bonne, K., Vermeir, I., Verbeke, W., (2009). Impact of Religion on Halal Meat Consumption Decision Making in Belgium. *Journal of International Food & Agribusiness Marketing*, 21:5–26
- Bouma, G.D., Ling, R., Pratt, D. (2010), Religious Diversity in Southeast Asia and the Pacific: National Case Studies, DOI 10.1007/978-90-481-3389-5\_6, New York. *Springer Science*. pp. 59
- BPS-Kaltim. (2013). *Statistik Daerah Provinsi East Kalimantan 2013*. Samarinda: Biro Pusat Statistik Provinsi Kalimantan Timur.
- BPS Kaltim (2014). Development of Tourism in Kalimantan Timur, Year 2009-2012. Retrieved 11 February 2016 from <http://kaltim.bps.go.id/linkTabelStatis/view/id/145>
- Crabtree, S. (2010). Religiosity Highest in World's Poorest Nations. Retrieved January 23, 2012, from <http://www.gallup.com/poll/142727/religiosity-highest-world-poorest-nations.aspx>
- Central-Bureau-of-Statistics. (2010). Biro Pusat Statistik Republik Indonesia. Retrieved February 23, 2012, from Biro Pusat Statistik Republik Indonesia: <http://www.bps.go.id>
- Chan, E.S.W. (2008). “Barriers to EMS in the hotel industry.” *International Journal of Hospitality Management*. 27: 187–196
- Che Man, YB (2011, November). Philosophy of science halal - An overview. Lecture notes. Universiti Putra Malaysia, Malaysia: Halal Products Research Institute.
- Chou, C., Chen, K., Wang, Y. (2012). “Green practices in the restaurant industry from an innovation adoption perspective: evidence from Taiwan.” *International Journal of Hospitality Management*. 31: 703-711
- Clissett, P. (2008). Evaluating qualitative research. *Journal of Orthopaedic Nursing*, 12: 99-105.
- Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs of Republic Indonesia. (2011). *Masterplan Percepatan dan Perluasan Pembangunan Ekonomi Indonesia 2011 - 2015*. Jakarta: Kementerian Koordinator Bidang Perekonomian Republik Indonesia.
- Creswell, J., (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Sage Publications, Inc. California
- Creswell, J.W., Miller, D. L. (2000), Determining Validity in Qualitative Inquiry, *Theory Into Practice*, 39(3): 124-130
- Daganghalal. (2010, March). *Fake Halal Certificates Banned By Malaysian State Government of Selangor*. Retrieved February 10, 2013, from <http://www.daganghalal.com/HalalNews/HalalNewsDtl.aspx?id=1260>
- Daganghalal. (2013, January). *dagang halal.com*. Retrieved January 14, 2013, from <http://www.daganghalal.com/HalalInfo/HalalInfo.aspx>
- Daniels, T. (2009). Muslims and tolerance; Non-Muslim minorities under shariah in Indonesia. In P. U. Tanthowi, *Cont Islam (2009) 3* DOI 10.1007/s11562-009-0083-1 (pp. 317–320). Chiang Mai: Silkworm Books ISBN 978-974-9511-12-1. .
- Dolan, S. (2010). Globalizing Halal: Tracing The Formation Of A Social Concept. (Unpublished Master Thesis). Northern Illinois University. Dekalb, Illinois.
- Dowling, K.L., St. Louis, R.D. (2000) Asynchronous implementation of the nominal group technique: is it effective? *Decision Support Systems* 29 : 229–248
- Dugan, B. (1994). Religion and food service. *The Cornell H.R.A. Quarterly* , 80-85.
- Egan, M.B., Raats, M.M., Grubb, S.M., Eves, A., Lumbers, M.L., Dean, M.S., Adam, M.R., (2007). A review of food safety and food hygiene training studies in the commercial sector. *Food Control* 18: 1180-1190

- Eliasi, J.R., Dwyer, J.T., (2002) Kosher and Halal: Religious observances affecting dietary intakes. *Journal of The American Dietetic Association*. 101 (7) : 911-913
- Elliott, T.R., and Shewchuk, R.M. (2002 ) Using the Nominal Group Technique to Identify the Problems Experienced by Persons Living With Severe Physical Disabilities *Journal of Clinical Psychology in Medical Settings*, 9(2): 65-76
- Erel, E., and Ghosh, J.B. (1997). ISO 9000 implementation in Turkish industry. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 17 (12): 1233-1246.
- Eum, IkRan. (2009). A Study on Islamic Consumerism from a Cultural Perspective-Intensification of Muslim identity and its impact on the emerging Muslim market. *International Area Review* Vol. 12 (2) pp 3 - 19
- Faradina, C. (2011). Evaluasi Proses Sertifikasi Halal Indonesia Di Lembaga Pengkajian Pangan, Obat-Obatan, Dan Kosmetika Majelis Ulama Indonesia (LPPOM MUI). Unpublished Bachelor Thesis. Institut Pertanian Bogor, Indonesia
- Fischer, J. (2008). Religion, science and market. *EMBO Reports*, 9 (9): 828-831.
- Garayoa, R., Vitas, A.I., Díez-Leturia, M., García-Jalón, I., (2011). Food safety and the contract catering companies: Food handlers, facilities and HACCP evaluation. *Food Control* 22: 2006-2012
- Gayatri, G., Chew, J., (2013). “How do Muslim consumers perceive service quality?”. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics* 25 (3): 472-490
- Girindra, A. (2008). LPPOM MUI, dari sertifikasi menuju labelisasi halal. Jakarta: Pustaka Jurnal Halal.
- Graneheim, U.H. and Lundman, B., (2004). Qualitative Content Analysis in Nursing Research: Concept, Procedures and Measures To Achieve Trustworthiness. *Nurse Education Today* 24: 105-112
- Green, A., (1993). Applying quality assurance principles to food control. *Food Control* 4 (1): 2-6
- Gregory, S., and Kim, J., (2004). Restaurant choice: the role of information. *Journal of Food Service Business Research* 7 (1): 81-95
- Halalfocus (2013) 16 more restaurants in Taiwan obtain Halal certification. <http://halalfocus.net/16-more-restaurants-in-taiwan-obtain-halal-certification/> accessed on July 2, 2014
- Halal Malaysia. (2013). Standard Malaysia Berkenaan Makanan Halal (MS 1500:2009). <http://www.halal.gov.my/v3/index.php/ms/garis-panduan/standard-malaysia> accessed on February 19, 2013
- Hargo, D.U., 2015. Jumlah pulau di Indonesia. [www.dkn.go.id](http://www.dkn.go.id) (Accessed on January 15, 2015)
- Hegedus, D. M. and Rasmussen, R. V. (1986) Task Effectiveness and Interaction Process of a Modified Nominal Group Technique in Solving an Evaluation Problem. *Journal of Management* 12: 545-560
- Henderson, J. C. (2010). Islam And Tourism: Brunei, Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore. In *Tourism in The Muslim World: Bridging Tourism Theory and Practice* 2, (Eds.) N. Scott, & J. J., (pp. 75-89). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Hielm, S., Tuominen, P., Aarnisalo, K., Raaska, L., Maijala, R. (2006). Attitudes towards own-checking and HACCP plans among Finnish food industry employees. *Food Control* 17: 402-407.
- Hoepfl, M. C. (1997). Choosing Qualitative Research: A Primer for Technology

- Education Researchers. *Journal of Technology Education*. Electronic Journal. 9:1. Retrieved September 4, 2014 from <http://scholar.lib.vt.edu/ejournals/JTE/v9n1/hoepfl.html>.
- Hudson, J., Orviska, M., (2012). Firms' adoption of international standards: One size fits all? *Journal of Policy Modeling*, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jpolmod.2012.04.001>
- Humas DPRD Provinsi Kaltim (2013). Kaltim bakal pertama perda-kan jaminan halal. <http://dprd-kaltimprov.go.id/berita/1524/kaltim-bakal-pertama-perda-kan-jaminan-halal.html> Jum'at, 16 Agustus 2013 | Accessed 10 August 2014
- Humas Provinsi Kaltim (2013a). Rumah makan dan hotel perlu sertifikat halal. Retrieved September 3, 2014 from <http://kaltimprov.go.id/berita-142-rumah-makan-dan-hotel-perlu-sertifikat-halal.html>
- Humas Provinsi Kaltim (2013b). Wagub: Masyarakat ingin semua halal. Retrieved September 3, 2014 from <http://www.kaltimprov.go.id/berita-wagub-masyarakat-ingin-semua-halal.html>
- IFANCC (2016) FAQ. Retrieved January 23, 2016 from <http://www.ifancc.org/>
- Ilyia, N.A., Saleh, R., Ab Rahman, Hashim, D.M. (2012). "A review on factors of Non-Compliance of Halal Standard among restaurant operators in Kuala Lumpur." *International Business Management* 6(6): 611-620
- Jefferson, W. K., Zunker, C., Feucht, J. C., Fitzpatrick, S. L., Greene, L. F., Shewchuk, R. M., *et al.* (2010). "Use of the Nominal Group Technique (NGT) to understand the perceptions of the healthiness of foods associated with African Americans." *Evaluation and Program Planning* 33: 343-348.
- Jin, S., Zhou, J., Ye, J., (2008) Adoption of HACCP system in the Chinese food industry: A comparative analysis. *Food Control* 19: 823-828.
- Jirathana, P., (1998). Constraints experienced by developing countries in the development and application of HACCP. *Food Control* vol. 9 No. 2-3, pp. 97-100
- Jurnal Halal (2012). Manajemen resto halal rumitkah.98: 8-11
- Just, D.R., Heiman, A., Zilberman, D., (2007) The interaction of religion and family members' influence on food decisions. *Food Quality and Preference* 18 pp 786-794
- Karaman, A.D., (2012). Food safety practices and knowledge among Turkish dairy businesses in different capacities. *Food Control* 26: 125-132
- Karaman, A.D., Cobanoglu, F., Tunalioglu, R., Ova, G.(2012). "Barriers and benefits of the implementation of food safety management systems among the Turkish dairy industry: A case study." *Food Control* 25: 732-739
- Karipidis, P., Athanassiadis, K., Aggelopoulos, S., Giompliakis, E. (2009). Factors affecting the adoption of quality assurance system in small food enterprises. *Food Control* 20: 93-98
- Keiser, J., DeMicco, F.J., Grimes, R.N., (2000). "Contemporary Management Theory." 4th ed. Prentice-Hall. Upper Saddle River, New Jersey p: 70-71
- Kemenag, (2013). Banyaknya Pemeluk Agama Menurut Golongan Agama dan Kabupaten/Kota 2013. <http://kaltim.kemenag.go.id> Accessed October 27, 2014
- Kemenag (2015) LP POM MUI Kaltim Sosialisasikan Sertifikat Halal di Nunukan. Kamis, 5 Februari 2015. Retrieved Januari 23, 2016 from <http://kaltim.kemenag.go.id/index.php?a=berita&id=237401>
- Kim, D., Kumar, V., Kumar, U., (2011) A performance realization framework for implementing ISO 9000. *International Journal of Quality & Reliability*

- Management* 28 (4): 383-404
- Kimura, A.H., (2010). Between technocracy and Democracy: An experimental approach to certification of food products by Japanese consumer cooperative women. *Journal of Rural Studies* 26: 130-140
- Ko, W., (2010). Evaluating food safety perceptions and practices for agricultural food handler. *Food Control* 21: 450-455
- Koçturk, T. O. (2002). "Food rules in the Koran." *Scandinavian Journal of Nutrition* , 46 (3): 137-139.
- Kohilavani, Zaman, Z., Abdullah, W.W.N., Tajul, A.Y. (2015). Embedding Islamic dietary law into an HACCP approach for application to the poultry slaughtering and processing industry. *International Food Research Journal* 22(6): 2684-2690
- Kompas. (2012, April 29 ). *Indonesia bidik Turis Arab Saudi*. Retrieved Mei 2 , 2012, from <http://travel.kompas.com/read/2012/04/29/0554518/Indonesia.Bidik.Turis.Arab.Saudi>
- Konecka-Matyjek, E., Turlejska, H., Pelzner, U., Szponar, L. (2005) Actual situation in the area of implementing quality assurance systems GMP, GHP and HACCP in Polish food production and processing plants. *Food Control* 16: 1–9
- Korankaltim (2015) Cuma 10 Persen yang Berlabel Halal. 15 November 2015. Retrieved January 23, 2016 from <http://www.korankaltim.com/cuma-10-persen-yang-berlabel-halal/>
- Kusasi, H.M. (2013). Kementerian Agama Wujud Kepedulian Pemerintah Terhadap Kehidupan Beragama di Masyarakat (Tinjauan Historis dan Filosofis). Retrieved January 23, 2016, from <http://kaltim.kemenag.go.id/index.php?a=artikel&id=22449>
- Kwortnik Jr., R.J. (2003). Clarifying "Fuzzy" Hospitality-management Problems with Depth Interviews and Qualitative Analysis. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly*. 44:117-129
- Lada, S., Tanakinjal, G. H., & Amin, H. (2009). Predicting intention to choose halal products using theory of reasoned action. *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management (IMEFM)*, 2 (1) , 66-76.
- Lago, P.P., Beruvides, M.G., Jian, J., Canto, A.M., Sandoval, A., Taraban, R., (2007). Structuring group decision making in a web-based environment by using the nominal group technique. *Computers & Industrial Engineering* 52: 277–295
- Laila, N., H., K., & Mi'raj, D. (2012). The Role Of Islamic Principles In Islamic Hospitality. *E-proceeding International Halal Conference, PWTC, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, 4-5 September 2012*. (pp. 216-255). Kuala Lumpur: UiTM.
- Larson, K., Grudens-Schuck, N., Allen, B.L. (2004). Can you call it a focus group? *Methodology Brief*. Department of Sociology and Agricultural Education and Studies Iowa State University.
- Lever, J. and Miele, M. (2012). The growth of halal meat markets in Europe: an exploration of the supply side theory of religion. *Journal of Rural Studies* 28: 528-537
- LPPOM MUI (2012a). Halal Assurance System 23000 Series. LPPOM MUI. Jakarta.
- LPPOM MUI (2012b). "The 23th LPPOM MUI: Building system to meet the new paradigm." *Jurnal Halal* 93: 10-11.
- LPPOM MUI (2013). "Press Release 24 Tahun LPPOM MUI: Tulus Mengabdikan Untuk Ummat". Retrieved 23 June 2013 from

- [http://www.halalmui.org/newMUI/index.php/main/detil\\_page/8/1254/8/1/0](http://www.halalmui.org/newMUI/index.php/main/detil_page/8/1254/8/1/0)  
LPPOM MUI Kaltim (2015). Laporan Tahunan LPPOM MUI Kaltim (Annual Report 2015)
- Lubis, E.Z. (2009). Hubungan Pencantuman Label Halal Dengan Perlindungan Konsumen. *Moral & Adil* No. 1 Vol. 1 p. 30 - 36
- MacLachlan, M. (1996) Identifying problems in community health promotion : an illustration of the Nominal Group Technique in AIDS education *The Journal of the Royal Society for the Promotion of Health* 116: 143-148
- Mak, A.H.N., Lumbers, M., Eves, A., Chang, R.C.Y. (2012) Factors influencing tourist food consumption. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*. 31: 928-936
- Malterud, K. (2001). Qualitative research: standards, challenges, and guidelines. *Lancet*, 358, 483-488.
- Marzuki, S. Z. (2012). *Understanding restaurant managers' expectations of halal certification in Malaysia*. Unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Canterbury, New Zealand.
- Marzuki, S. Z., Hall, C. M., and Ballantine, P. W. (2012). "Restaurant managers' perspectives on halal certification." *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 3 (1): 47-58.
- Massey, O.T., (2011). A proposed model for the analysis and interpretation of focus groups in evaluation research. *Evaluation and Program Planning* 34: 21-28
- Masternak, T., Kleiner, B.H. (1995). ISO 9000 – What It Means To International Business Today. *Training for Quality*. Vol 3 (4) pp. 15 - 18
- Mensah, L. D., & Julien, D. (2011). Implementation of food safety management systems in the UK. *Food Control* 22: 1216-1225.
- Miller, D., Shewchuk, R., Elliot, T.R., Richards, S. (2000). Nominal Group Technique: A Process for Identifying Diabetes Self-Care Issues Among Patients and Caregivers. *The Diabetes Educator* 26(2): 305-314
- Ministry of Culture and Tourism (2012), Data Kunjungan Wisatawan Mancanegara Bulanan Tahun 2012. Jakarta. Retrieved May 2nd 2012 from <http://www.budpar.go.id/budpar/asp/detil.asp?c=110&id=1312>
- Ministry of Finance of Republik Indonesia (2003). Decree No: KEP-34/PJ/2003 date: 14 February 2003, about the description of economic activities classification. <http://www.pajak.net/info/KLU.pdf>
- Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economic RI (2012), Pusat Data dan Informasi Kementerian Pariwisata dan Ekonomi Kreatif. Jakarta. Available at <http://www.kemenpar.go.id/> (Accessed 21 April 2012)
- Ministry of Tourism, Post & Telecommunication the Republic of Indonesia (1985). SK Menteri Pariwisata, Pos dan Telekomunikasi No. KM.95/HK.103/MPPT-87
- MITI. (2012, May). *Ministry of International Trade and Industry*. Retrieved January 14, 2013, from Ministry of International Trade and Industry: [http://www.miti.gov.my/cms/content.jsp?id=com.tms.cms.article.Article\\_225\\_bb948-c0a81573-78d578d5-e52b8693](http://www.miti.gov.my/cms/content.jsp?id=com.tms.cms.article.Article_225_bb948-c0a81573-78d578d5-e52b8693)
- Mohamed, N., Backhouse, C., (2014) A Framework for the Development of Halal Food Products in Malaysia, Proceedings of the 2014 International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Operations Management Bali, Indonesia, January 7 – 9, 2014
- Mohamed, Z., Shamsudin, M.N., Rezai, G. (2013) The Effect of Possessing Information About Halal Logo on Consumer Confidence in Malaysia, *Journal of International Food & Agribusiness Marketing*, 25:sup1, 73-86
- Mohd Hussain, N.A. (2014). Fake halal cert syndicate found. Retrieved February 10,



- 2016, from <http://www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2014/05/31/fake-halal-cert-syndicate-found-ring-makes-rm100000-per-accreditation-seminar/>
- Moretti, F., Van Vliet, L., Bensing, J., Deledda, G., Mazzi, M., Rimondini, M., Zimmermann, C., Fletcher, I., (2011). A standardized approach to qualitative content analysis of focus group discussions from different countries. *Patient Education and Counseling* 82: 420-428.
- MUI. (2009). Majelis Ulama Indonesia. Available at: [http://www.mui.or.id/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=125:muiancambikotpemerintah&catid=1:berita-singkat&Itemid=50](http://www.mui.or.id/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=125:muiancambikotpemerintah&catid=1:berita-singkat&Itemid=50) (Accessed 15 January 2013)
- Muttaqin, F., (2014) The Politic of Halal Food Certification and Consumption in Indonesia: A Political Ecological Analysis. *Indo-Islamica* Vol 4 No. 2 pp 163 – 181.
- Mukhtar, A., Butt, M.M. (2012). Intention to choose halal products: the role of religiosity. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 3(2): 108-120.
- Mulyaningsih, E. (2004) “*Legalitas label halal dan tingkat kepedulian konsumen di Jakarta terhadap label halal produk olahan*”. Unpublished Thesis. Bogor Agricultural University. Bogor
- Murphy, K.S., DiPietro, R.B., Kock, G., Lee, J., (2011). Does mandatory food safety training and certification for restaurant employees improve inspection outcomes? *Journal of Hospitality Management* 30: 150-156
- Nasir, K. M. & Pereira, A. A. (2008). Defensive dining: notes on the public dining experiences in Singapore. *Cont Islam* 2: 61–73
- Ngah, A.H., Zainuddin, Y., Thurasamy, R. (2014). Adoption of Halal Supply Chain among Malaysian Halal Manufacturers: An exploratory Study. International Conference on Innovation, Management and Technology Research, Malaysia, 22 – 23 September, 2013. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 129: 388 – 395
- Ni, H., Zeng, H., (2009) Law enforcement is key to China’s food safety. *Environmental Pollution* 157 : 1990–1992
- Nik Muhammad, N.M., Md Isa, F., Chee Kifli, B. (2009) Positioning Malaysia as Halal-Hub: Integration Role of Supply Chain Strategy and Halal Assurance System. *Asian Social Science* 5 (7): 44-52
- Noordin, N., Noor, N. L., Hashim, M., & Samicho, Z. (2009). Value Chain Of Halal Certification System: A Case Of The Malaysia Halal Industry. *European and Mediterranean Conference on Information Systems*. Izmir.
- Olver, L., (2013). Restaurants & [catering](http://www.foodtimeline.org/restaurants.html). <http://www.foodtimeline.org/restaurants.html>. (retrieved 27 February 2013)
- Oxford dictionaries (2013). <http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/restaurant> (retrieved 1 March 2013)
- Pardede, D. (2012). MUI Temukan Banyak Daging Ilegal di Perbatasan Friday, November 23, 2012. <http://www.tribunnews.com>. Accessed on January 15, 2015
- Peraturan Walikota Surabaya No. 46 Tahun 2009 tentang Pelaksanaan Peraturan Daerah Kota Surabaya No. 2 Tahun 2008 Tentang Kepariwisata.
- Perry, J., Linsley, S. (2006). The use of the nominal group technique as an evaluative tool in the teaching and summative assessment of the inter-personal skills of student mental health nurses. *Nurse Education Today*. 26: 346–353
- Pew Research Center. (2011). *The Future of the Global Muslim Population, Projections for 2010-2030* . Washington, D.C: Pew Research Center’s Forum

- on Religion & Public Life.
- Poskotakaltim (2011). Wawali Stop Mobil Pick Up Bawa Ayam Mati. <http://www.poskotakaltim.com/> 2011-01-31 07:41:53 Accessed on January 15, 2015
- Potter, M., Gordon, S., Hamer, P. (2004). "The Nominal Group Technique: A useful consensus methodology in physiotherapy research", *New Zealand Journal of Physiotherapy* 32(3): 126-130.
- Powell, D.A., Jacob, C.J., Chapman, B.J., (2011). Enhancing food safety culture to reduce rates of foodborne illness. *Food Control* 22: 817-822h
- Prabowo, S., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., & Abu Samah, A. (2012). Halal Culinary: Opportunity and Challenge In Indonesia. *International Halal Conference INHAC* (pp. 1-10). Kuala Lumpur: UiTM.
- Psomas, E.L., Fotopoulos, C.V., Kafetzopoulos, D.P., (2011) Motives, difficulties and benefits in implementing the ISO 14001 Environmental Management System. *Management of Environmental Quality: An International Journal* 22 (4): 502-521
- Purnomo, D., Gumbira-Sa'id, E., Fauzi, A., Syamsu, K., Tasrif, M. (2011). Analisis Kekuatan Keunggulan Komparatif dan Kompetitif Indonesia dalam Meningkatkan Daya Saing Agroindustri Halal. *Jurnal Teknoltan*. 5 (3), p 596-602.
- Quazi, H.A. and Padibjo, S.R., (1998) A journey toward total quality management through ISO 9000 certification – a study on small- and medium-sized enterprises in Singapore. *International Journal of Quality & Reliability Management*, 15(5): 489-508,
- Rabiee, F., (2004). Focus-group interview and data analysis. *Proceedings of the Nutrition Society*, 63: 655–660
- Ragasa, C., Thornsbury, S., Bernsten, R., (2011). "Delisting from EU HACCP certification: Analysis of the Philippines seafood processing industry." *Food Policy*. 36: 694-704
- Rahayu, E.A. (2012). *Jaminan Kehalalan Berdasarkan Kelompok Bisnis Pangan di Indonesia dan Perbandingan dengan Beberapa Negara*. Unpublished Master Thesis, Bogor Agricultural University, Indonesia
- Rahman, M.S. (2012). Young Consumer's Perception on Foreign Made Fast Moving Consumer Goods: The Role of Religiosity, Spirituality and Animosity. *International Journal of Business and Management Science*, 5(2) pp: 103-118,
- Rajagopal, S., Ramanan, S., Visvanathan, R., Satapathy, S. (2011). Halal certification: implication for marketers in UAE. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 2 (2): 138-153
- Ranasinghe, D. (2013) Where Do the World's Happiest Consumers Live? Published: Wednesday, 1 May 2013. <http://www.cnbc.com/id/100692893>. Accessed 3 May 2013
- Ratya, M.P. (2013). Laporan dari Jerman: SBY Incar 10 Juta Wisman pada 2014 Lewat Pameran Wisata Dunia. *detikTravel* Rabu, 06/03/2013. <http://travel.detik.com>. Accessed 25 March 2013.
- Riaz, N. M., & Chaudry, M. M. (2004). *Halal food production*. Florida: CRC Press LLC.
- Roberts, K.R., and Barret, B.B. (2011). Restaurant managers' belief about food safety training: an application of the theory of planned behavior. *Journal of Food Service Business Research* 14 : 206-225
- Rogers, E.M. (2003), *Diffusion of Innovations*. 5<sup>th</sup> edition, The Free Press, New York,

- NY.
- Saifullah, R., (2008). “*Studi Kebijakan Pangan Halal di Indonesia.*” Unpublished Thesis. Bogor Agricultural University, Bogor. Indonesia
- Salman, F., & Siddiqui, K. (2011). An exploratory study for measuring consumers awareness and perceptions towards halal food in Pakistan. *Interdisciplinary Journal Of Contemporary Research In Business* , 3 (2): 639-652.
- Sammy, A. (2012). Bakso Babi Menyebar ke Kalimantan Timur. <http://www.republika.co.id>. Tuesday, December 18, 2012. Accessed on January 15, 2015
- Sandholm, L. 1998. Section 37: Quality In Developing Countries. In *Juran's quality handbook*. Ed: Joseph M. Juran and A. Blanton Godfrey, 5th ed. Pp. 37.1-37.33. New York. The McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.
- Sandhu, S. (2012). Exploring Different Accounts: Depth Interviews Versus Self-Administered Questionnaires In Strategy And Management Research. In *West Meets East: Toward Methodological Exchange Research Methodology in Strategy and Management*, Volume 7, 307–330. Emerald Group Publishing Limited
- Sari, D. (2011). “*Kuliner Halal Bisa Jadi Daya Tarik Wisata.*” Available at <http://food.detik.com/read/2011/04/06/181544/1610332/901/kuliner-halal-bisa-jadi-daya-tarik-wisata> (Accessed 21 April 2012)
- Sarter, S., Sarter, G., & Gilabert, P. (2010). A Swot analysis of HACCP implementation in Madagascar. *Food Control* 21: 253–259.
- Sekretariat Daerah Kota Samarinda. (2009, June 3). “Lembaran Daerah Kota Samarinda Tahun 2009 Nomor 02 tentang Penyelenggaraan Usaha Kepariwisata di Kota Samarinda.”, available at: <http://jdih.samarindakota.go.id/sites/default/files/perda/> (accessed 8 July 2013)
- Setyawati, N. F. (2015). The Treasurer of APJI Kalimantan Timur, pers. comm. 10 January 2015.
- Shaari, J.A.N, Khalique, M., Aleefah, F. (2014). Halal Restaurant: What makes Muslim In Kuching Confident? *Journal of Economic Development, Management, IT, Finance and Marketing* 6 (1) pp: 23-34
- Shih, K., Wang, W., (2011) Factors influencing HACCP implementation in Taiwanese public hospital kitchens. *Food Control* 22: 496-500
- Shikoh, R. (2012). Global Muslim Lifestyle Travel Market 2012: A joint study by Landscape & Consumer Needs Study For Airlines, Destinations & Hotels/Resorts. Executive Summary. Dinar Standard & Crescentrating. Singapore.
- Soesilowati, E. S. (2010). Business opportunities fo halal products in the global market: Muslim consumer behaviour and halal food consumption. *JISSH* , 151-160.
- Stephenson, B.Y., Michaelsen, L.K., Franklin, S.G., (1982). An Empirical Test of the Nominal Group Technique in State Solar Energy Planning. *Group & Organization Management* 7: 320-334
- Sugiyono (2014). *Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif*. Penerbit Alfabeta. Bandung
- Sumarsongko (2014). The Director of LPPOM MUI East Kalimantan, pers. comm. 3 April 2014
- Sun, Y., Ockerman, H.W., (2005). A review of the needs and current applications of hazard analysis and critical control point (HACCP) system in foodservice areas. *Food Control* 16 : 325–332

- Swasono, M.F.H. (2003). *Kebudayaan Nasional Indonesia: Penataan Pola Pikir. Konggres Kebudayaan V. 20– 22 October 2003.* Bukittinggi
- Syahputra, T. (2013). 13 pedagang bakso terindikasi berdagang babi. <http://www.korankaltim.com>. Accessed on January 15, 2015
- Symons, M. (1998). *A History of Cooks and Cooking.* Universtiy of Illinois Press: Urbana IL. (p. 289-293; 315-318)
- Talib, H.H.A., Ali, K.A.M., Jamaludin, K.R. (2008). Quality Assurance in Halal Food Manufacturing in Malaysia: A Preliminary Study. *Proceedings of International Conference on Mechanical & Manufacturing Engineering (ICME2008)*, 21– 23 May 2008, Johor Bahru, Malaysia
- Tanner, B., (2000) Independent assessment by third-party certification bodies. *Food Control* 11: 415-417
- Taylor, E. (2001). HACCP in small companies: benefit or burden? *Food Control* 12: 217-222
- Taylor, E.A., and Taylor, J.Z. (2004). Using qualitative psychology to investigate HACCP implementation barriers. *International Journal of Environmental Health Research* 14(1): 53-63
- Thompson Reuters (2013). *State of The Global Islamic Economy 2013 Report.*
- Tieman, M. (2011). The application of halal in supply chain management: in-depth interviews. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 2 (2): 186-195
- Tieman, M., Van der Vorst, J.G.A.J., Ghazali, M. (2012). Principles in halal supply chain management. *Journal of Islamic Marketing.* 3 (3): 217-243
- Tieman, M., Van Nistelrooy, M., (2014). Perception of Malaysian Food Manufacturers Toward Halal Logistics, *Journal of International Food & Agribusiness Marketing*, 26:3, 218-233
- Van der Spiegel, M., Van der Fels-Klerx, H.J., Sterrenburg, P., Van Ruth, S.M., Scholtens-Toma, I.M.J., Kok, E.J. (2012). Halal assurance in food supply chains: Verification of halal certificates using audits and laboratory analysis. *Trends in Food Science & Technology.* 27: 109-119
- Van Hooft, E.A.J., Born, M.P., Taris, T.W., Van der Flier, H. (2006). The cross-cultural generalizability of the theory of planned behavior: a study on job seeking in the Netherlands. *Journal of Cross-cultural Psychology.* 37 (2): 127-135
- Vela, A. R., Fernandez , J. M., (2003) . Barriers for the developing and implementation of HACCP plans: results from a Spanish regional survey. *Food Control* 14: 333–337
- Viadiu, F.M., Fransi, E.C., (2005) A study of the ISO 9000 certification process: consultant profiles and company behavior. *Managing Service Quality* Vol. 15 No. 3, pp. 290-305
- Wahid, N. (2012). “Melihat produk halal dari perspektif keunggulan komparatif.” *Jurnal Halal.* 98: 30-31
- Walker, E., Pritchard, C., Forsythe, S., (2003). Food handlers’ hygiene knowledge in small food business. *Food Control* 14: 339-343
- Walsh, D., & Downe, S. (2006). Appraising the quality of qualitative research. *Midwifery* 22: 108-119.
- Wan-Hassan, W. M. (2007). Globalising Halal Standards: Issues and Challenges. *The Halal Journal* , 38-40.
- Wan-Hassan, W. M., & Awang, K. W. (2009). Halal Food in New Zealand Restaurants: An Exploratory Study. *Int. Journal of Economics and Management*, 3(2): 385-402.

- Wikipedia (2013). <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Restaurant>. retrieved 1 March 2013
- Wilcock, A., Ball, B., Fajumo, A., (2011). "Effective implementation of food safety initiatives managers', food safety coordinators' and production workers' perspective." *Food Control*. 22: 27-33.
- Williams, P.L., White, N., Klem, R., Wilson, S.E., Bartholomew, P., (2006). "Clinical education and training: Using the nominal group technique in research with radiographers to identify factors affecting quality and capacity." *Radiography*. 12: 215-224.
- Wilson, J.A.J and Liu, J. (2010), "Shaping the Halal into a brand?", *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 1 (2): 107-123.
- Wilson, J. (2011). The challenges of Islamic branding: navigating emotions and halal. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. 2 (1): 28-42
- Wilson, J.A.J., (2012). "Charting the rise of the halal market-Tales from the field looking forward." *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. 3(3).
- Wilson, J.A.J. (2013), "The Halal Value System", Changing world, new relationships [report] 9th World Islamic Economic Forum (WIEF), October, PricewaterhouseCoopers (PwC) Malaysia, <http://read.pwc.com/i/190845/68> pp.68-72.
- Wilson, J.A.J. (2014), "Islamic Economics 2.0 – Creating a Halal wealth and knowledge economy", [whitepaper], Thomson Reuters, 7/5/2014. [http://www.zawya.com/story/Islamic\\_Finance\\_Gateway\\_Islamic\\_Economics\\_20\\_Creating\\_a\\_Halal\\_Wealth\\_and\\_Knowledge\\_Economy\\_By\\_Dr\\_Jonathan\\_AJ\\_Wilson\\_070514-pdf\\_080514073608/](http://www.zawya.com/story/Islamic_Finance_Gateway_Islamic_Economics_20_Creating_a_Halal_Wealth_and_Knowledge_Economy_By_Dr_Jonathan_AJ_Wilson_070514-pdf_080514073608/)
- Wilson, J.A.J. and Liu, J. (2011), "The Challenges of Islamic Branding: navigating Emotions and Halal", *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, Vol.2 Iss.1, pp.28-42.
- Wilson, J.A.J., (2012). "Charting the rise of the halal market-Tales from the field looking forward." *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. 3(3).
- Wilson, J.A.J., Belk, R.W., Bamossy, G.J., Sandikci, Ö., Kertajaya, H., Sobh, R. Liu, J., Scott, L., (2013). "Crecent marketing, Muslim geographies and brand Islam. Reflections from the JIMA Senior Advisory Board." *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. 4 (1): 22-50
- Wiyono, E. (2013). *Sertifikasi Halal Haruskah Diwajibkan?* Harian Republika. 19 April.
- Wu, Su-Ling (2012). Factors influencing the implementation of food safety control systems in Taiwanese international tourist hotels. *Food Control* 28: 265-272
- Yatim, N. (2011, August 3). *Contohi industri halal Thailand*. Retrieved January 14, 2012, from Utusan Online: <http://www.utusan.com.my>

## BIODATA OF STUDENT

Sulistyo Prabowo was born on June 23, 1972 in Temanggung, Central Java, Indonesia, grew up in Karanggedong village where he attended elementary school until his 5<sup>th</sup> grade. He moved to Kebonsari Temanggung to finish his 6<sup>th</sup> grade and continued his junior and senior high school in the Capital of Temanggung Regency. His higher education was started in 1990 at the Polytechnic Semarang in the Department of Agricultural Products Technology and graduated in 1993. He then continued at the Institut Pertanian INTAN Yogyakarta to obtain his B.S. degree in the Department of Agricultural Technology and Food Science and completed in March 1997. Since March 1999 he joined the Faculty of Agriculture, University of Mulawarman Samarinda, East Kalimantan, Indonesia as a junior lecturer. His expertise is in food quality management, food safety, and food nutrition. In September 2000 he was awarded Post Graduate Scholarship from the Ministry of Education the Republic of Indonesia to pursue his MSc in Food Science and Technology at the University of Gadjah Mada Yogyakarta and finished on January 2003. In July 2007 he was awarded the International Fellowship Program from the Ford Foundation to study his MPH in the field of Nutrition Program in the School of Public Health & Tropical Medicine (SPHTM), Tulane University, New Orleans, USA. After many-many years dealing with hard science, he got the new insight of soft science during his practicum, one of mandatory program for MPH student at SPHTM. In August 2011 he got Kaltim Cemerlang Scholarship to study a PhD. To satisfy his interest in soft science, he enrolled in Halal Products Management at the Halal Products Research Institute Universiti Putra Malaysia. In January 2014 he was selected as a recipient of the research grants from Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (LPDP) the Ministry of Finance the Republic of Indonesia to do this qualitative research. On March 2016 he got a scholarship from The Netherlands Government to take a short course on Governance and Food Safety in International Food Chains at Wageningen University where he got an opportunity to present "Understanding Halal: The Ultimate Food Safety Concept" at information market session.

## LIST OF PUBLICATION

The articles that were published and submitted by the author during his PhD study are as follows:

### Seminar & Conference

1. Prabowo, S., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., & Abu Samah, A. (2012). Halal Culinary: Opportunity and Challenge In Indonesia. In *Proceeding International Halal Conference INHAC* (pp. 1-10). Kuala Lumpur: UiTM.
2. Prabowo, S., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., & Abu Samah, A. (2012). Development of Halal hotel in Indonesia. In *Proceeding The 2nd International Seminar on Halalness and Safety of Food and Pharmaceutical Products*, 17-18 October 2012. Halal Research Center Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
3. Prabowo, S., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., & Abu Samah, A. (2014). Constraints Experienced by Restaurateurs and Caterers in Indonesia for Halal Certification. *Malaysia International Halal Research and Education Conference MIHREC 2014*. Putrajaya, Malaysia, December 2-4, 2014

### Book Chapter

1. Prabowo, S., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., & Abu Samah, A., Fadzillah, N.A., (2014). Pensijilan Halal: Cabaran Penggiat Industri Halal Sejagat. In *Isu Halal Kontemporari*, Ed: Russly, A., Deuraseh, N., Jamaludin, M.A., ISBN 978-967-344-393-2. Penerbit UPM, Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia. p 246-264

### Journal

1. Prabowo, S., Abd Rahman, A., Ab Rahman, S., & Abu Samah, A., (2014). Revealing Factors Hindering Halal Certification in East Kalimantan Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 6 (2): 268-291



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**STATUS CONFIRMATION FOR THESIS / PROJECT REPORT  
AND COPYRIGHT**

ACADEMIC SESSION : \_\_\_\_\_

TITLE OF THESIS / PROJECT REPORT :

**HINDERING FACTORS OF THE HALAL ASSURANCE SYSTEM AMONG  
RESTAURATEURS AND CATERERS IN EAST KALIMANTAN INDONESIA**

NAME OF STUDENT : **Sulistyo Prabowo**

I acknowledge that the copyright and other intellectual property in the thesis/project report belonged to Universiti Putra Malaysia and I agree to allow this thesis/project report to be placed at the library under the following terms:

1. This thesis/project report is the property of Universiti Putra Malaysia.
2. The library of Universiti Putra Malaysia has the right to make copies for educational purposes only.
3. The library of Universiti Putra Malaysia is allowed to make copies of this thesis for academic exchange.

I declare that this thesis is classified as:

\*Please tick (√)

**CONFIDENTIAL**

(Contain confidential information under Official Secret Act 1972).

**RESTRICTED**

(Contains restricted information as specified by the organization/institution where research was done).

**OPEN ACCESS**

I agree that my thesis/project report to be published as hard copy or online open access.

This thesis is submitted for:

**PATENT**

Embargo from \_\_\_\_\_ until \_\_\_\_\_  
(date) (date)





**Approved by:**

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Signature of Student)

New IC No/ Passport No.: **A 1004873**

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Signature of Chairman  
of Supervisory Committee)

Name: **Assoc. Prof. Azmawani  
Abd Rahman, Ph.D.**

Date :

Date :

**[Note : If the thesis is CONFIDENTIAL or RESTRICTED, please attach with the letter from the organization/institution with period and reasons for confidentiality or restricted. ]**

