



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**A PHENOMENOLOGICAL INVESTION OF KNOWING EVENTS
AMONG WOMEN HEADTEACHERS OF GOVERMENT SCHOOLS**

KHUAN WAI BING.

FPP 2005 3



**A PHENOMENOLOGICAL INVESTIGATION OF KNOWING EVENTS
AMONG WOMEN HEADTEACHERS OF GOVERNMENT SCHOOLS**

By

KHUAN WAI BING

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia,
in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

2005



**A PHENOMENOLOGICAL INVESTIGATION OF KNOWING EVENTS
AMONG WOMEN HEADTEACHERS OF GOVERNMENT SCHOOLS**

By

KHUAN WAI BING

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia,
in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

October 2005



With love and gratitude

**to my parents,
brothers,
sisters,**

and

with admiration

**to all women headteachers...
brave and courageous ladies
and a model for us all**

Abstract of this thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in
fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**A PHENOMENOLOGICAL INVESTIGATION OF KNOWING EVENTS
AMONG WOMEN HEADTEACHERS OF GOVERNMENT SCHOOLS**

By

KHUAN WAI BING

October 2005

Chairman: Associate Professor Asma Ahmad, PhD

Faculty: Educational Studies

The main purpose of this study was to understand the nature of knowing for women headteachers in leadership and decision-making. The study was carried out through three research questions. They include: (1) what are the characteristics of knowing events for women headteachers as experienced by them? (2) what are the influences that shape women headteachers' knowing? (3) what are the specific ways of knowing that women headteachers engage in? These questions aimed to determine the characteristics, factors that influence, and structure of the knowing phenomenon among women headteachers in leadership and decision-making.

The phenomenological approach was selected since it was deemed the most appropriate for the study of a phenomenon of this nature. Data were gathered from nine women headteachers in primary and secondary government schools. The participants were selected from excellent and successful women headteachers through purposeful sampling. The data collection methods employed were mainly in-depth interviews with the participants. Each interview was taped recorded, transcribed



verbatim and analyzed. In addition, informal observation and review of accessible official documents were also carried out. The validity of the study was ensured through clarifying the researcher's biases at the outset of the study, triangulation, member checks, peer examination and rich, thick description of results. The reliability was furthered ensured through stating the researcher's position, triangulation and maintaining an audit trail.

The findings yielded characteristics of knowing events as experienced by the women headteachers, influences that shape their knowing, ways of knowing women headteachers engaged in. The knowing events represent the phases that every woman headteacher in the study had passed through from accession or entry into headship to refocusing of values in the securely established state. The influences that shape knowing began in the formation years and occur throughout headship. In addition it also represents the development of knowing from a dependency on authorities to autonomy of self, knowledge as abstract and objective to being relative and subjective, and the cognitive process of receiving knowledge to one of generating knowledge. The study concludes that the knowing practiced among the women headteachers in leadership and decision making is unique to the participants of this study. The findings are conceptualized into a thematic portrayal of knowing. Specific recommendations for further research are also suggested.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia
Sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**KAJIAN FENOMENOLOGIKAL MENGENAI BAGAIMANA SESEORANG
PENTADBIR MENGETAHUI SESUATU PENGETAHUAN
DI KALANGAN PENGETUA WANITA SEKOLAH KERAJAAN**

Oleh

KHUAN WAI BING

Oktober 2005

Pengerusi: Profesor Madya Asma Ahmad, PhD

Fakulti: Pengajian Pendidikan

Kajian ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji fenomena bagaimana seseorang pengetua wanita mengetahui sesuatu pengetahuan dalam proses kepimpinan dan membuat keputusan. Kajian ini telah dijalankan melalui tiga soalan kajian iaitu: (1) apakah ciri-ciri cara mengetahui sesuatu pengetahuan seperti yang dialami oleh pengetua wanita? (2) apakah faktor-faktor yang membentuk pengetahuan pengetua wanita? dan (3) apakah cara menjana pengetahuan khusus yang digunakan oleh pengetua wanita? Soalan-soalan kajian ini bertujuan untuk menentukan atribut, faktor-faktor pembentukan, dan struktur fenomena bagaimana seseorang pengetua wanita mengetahui sesuatu pengetahuan dalam proses kepimpinan dan membuat keputusan.

Pendekatan fenomenologi telah dipilih memandangkan pendekatan ini paling sesuai diguna untuk mengkaji fenomena ini. Data telah dikumpul daripada sembilan orang pengetua wanita sekolah rendah dan menengah kerajaan. Partisipan telah dipilih daripada kelompok pengetua wanita cemerlang dan berjaya melalui persampelan bertujuan. Kaedah pengumpulan data yang utama merupakan temuduga secara

mendalam. Setiap temuduga telah dirakamkan, direkodkan secara verbatim, dan dianalisiskan. Selain itu, pemerhatian tidak formal dan kajian dokumen rasmi yang dibenarkan telah dijalankan. Keesahan kajian telah dikenalpasti melalui triangulasi, semakan oleh partisipan; pemeriksaan oleh rakan penyelidikan dan penghuraian dapatan kajian secara terperinci. Kebolehpercayaan kajian juga telah dikenalpasti melalui kenyataan tentang kedudukan pengkaji, triangulasi, dan rekod laluan audit.

Dapatan kajian menghasilkan ciri-ciri bagaimana seseorang pengetua wanita mengetahui sesuatu pengetahuan; faktor yang membentuk pengetahuan; dan cara menjana pengetahuan khusus yang digunakan. Cara mengetahui sesuatu pengetahuan merupakan fasa yang dilalui setiap pengetua wanita dalam kajian dari detik menyandang jawatan pengetua ke pembentukan semula nilai-nilai peribadi dalam peringkat mantap yang stabil. Faktor pembentukan pengetahuan pengetua wanita berlaku dalam tahun-tahun awalan sebelum menyandang jawatan dan berkembang secara berterusan sepanjang memegang jawatan pengetua. Selain itu, cara yang digunakan oleh pengetua wanita untuk menjana pengetahuan juga menggambarkan perkembangan pengetahuan daripada peringkat kebergantungan kepada autoriti ke autonomi diri, pengetahuan sebagai suatu yang abstrak dan objektif ke suatu yang relatif dan subjektif, dan proses kognitif daripada penerimaan pengetahuan kepada penjanaan pengetahuan. Kajian merumuskan bahawa cara mengetahui pengetahuan yang diamalkan oleh pengetua wanita dalam kepimpinan dan membuat keputusan adalah unik kepada partisipan kajian sahaja. Dapatan mengenai cara mengetahui pengetahuan juga dikonsepsikan ke dalam satu gambaran bertema. Cadangan khusus untuk kajian seterusnya juga dirakamkan.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I want to thank many individuals who in different ways contributed to this work. First, I am indebted to the Chairperson and members of the supervisory committee, for their guidance, patience and constant support throughout the course of the study. You have been my best teachers. I have learnt so much from all of you and continue to marvel at my curiosity and productivity while sometimes facing significant barriers and challenges.

Special gratitude and appreciation dedicated to Assoc. Prof. Dr. Asma binti Ahmad for her encouragement and above all her faith and hope in me. To Prof. Dr. Maimunah binti Ismail, I thank you for showing me what women can do. To Prof. Dr. Haji Azimi bin Hamzah, you have shown me that learning can be extremely meaningful and rewarding. Thank you from the bottom of my heart.

In addition I am also very grateful to the nine outstanding and excellent women headteachers who have enormously supported me through their tireless participation in the study. Their generous sharing has provided meaning to this study and friendship for me. Special recognition is accorded to each person whose names unfortunately cannot be disclosed for the purpose of anonymity.

To all the staff and lecturers of the Department of Professional Development and Continuing Education, Faculty of Educational Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, I fondly remember you and truly appreciate your knowledge, assistance, advice, and teaching. I thank the administrators at this institution, the Dean and staff of the



Graduate School for the assistance provided throughout the duration of my study at UPM.

In gratitude, I want to thank my former and current employers, Dato' Dr. Ibrahim Ahmad Bajunid; Dato' Dr. Wan Chik Rahmah Wan Din; Cik Shamsiah Mohd Shahar; Assoc. Prof. Hariri Kamis; and Hj. Nazirmuddin Ahmad for their support and belief in staff development and continuous learning.

I especially want to thank my friends, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Omar Abdull Kareem; Pn. Fatimah Jusoh, En. Azeman Yusoff, Dr. Mazalan Kamis, Pn. Marinah Awang, En. Amer Hamzah Jantan, En. Ridzuan Ng Abdullah, Ms. Esther Lee, Mr. Chua Hong Tam and Dr. Quek Bong Cheang for their ceaseless encouragement. The collegiality experienced in working and interaction with them has stimulated and motivated me to complete this study. Special mention also goes to my fellow graduate students. They certainly helped me keep my sense of humour.

Finally, I am extremely grateful for the love and support of my family, especially my mother who regularly provided encouragement as she waited patiently for me to finish this study so as to go traveling with me. To my nephew and nieces, this is dedicated to you with the hope that it will inspire you to further your studies.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
	DEDICATION	ii
	ABSTRACT	iii
	ABSTRAK	v
	ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
	APPROVAL	ix
	DECLARATION	xi
	LIST OF TABLES	xvi
	LIST OF FIGURES	xvii
	LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xviii
	CHAPTER	
I	INTRODUCTION	1
	The Problem and its Context	1
	Background of the Inquiry	6
	Women School Leaders' Participation in Knowing	8
	Problems in Knowing for Women Headteachers	13
	Family Constraints	14
	Constraint of Marginality	15
	Internal, Psychological or Self-imposed Constraints	17
	Limitations of Past Studies on Knowing	19
	The Statement of the Problem	23
	Purpose of the Study	25
	Research Questions	26
	Significance of the Study	26
	Scope of the Study	27
	Limitation of the Study	28
	Operational Definition of Terms	29
II	LITERATURE REVIEW	33
	The Phenomenon of Knowing	34
	Influences That Shape Knowing	35
	Experience	35
	Motivation	37
	Intelligence	38
	Meaning Systems	39
	Language and Thought	40
	View of Knowledge and Reading	41
	Cognitive Styles and Preferences	43
	Intellectual Continuum	44
	Piaget's Foundational Work on Cognitive Development	46
	Perry's Cognitive Scheme	46



King and Kitchener's Reflective Judgment Model	48
Epistemological Reflective Model	50
Kohlberg's Moral Reasoning	52
Feminist Epistemology	54
Gilligan's Moral Development	55
Belenky's Women's Ways of Knowing	58
Feminist Emancipatory Model	65
Gender-specified Cognitive Strategies	65
Contextual Factors on Intellectual Development	66
Women as Learners and Knowers	68
Pre-Independence Period	68
Post-Independence Period	72
Women and Leadership Knowing Events	73
Women Headteachers' Socialization	74
Formal and Informal Barriers to Women Headteachers	78
Women and Power	80
Women's Career Advancement as an Educational Administrator	82
Leadership Skill Acquisition	83
Phenomenology	88
History of Phenomenology	89
Principles of Phenomenological Approach	92
Application of Phenomenological Research	96
Phenomenology and Existentialism	97
Schools of Phenomenology	99
Duquesne School of Phenomenology	99
Utrecht School of Phenomenology	104
Heideggerian Hermeneutics	107
Conceptual Framework	108
Summary	112

III	METHODOLOGY	113
	Research Design	113
	The Researcher as an Instrument	115
	Feminist Standpoint	119
	The Phenomenological Approach	121
	Symbolic Interaction	122
	Existential Phenomenology	124
	Phenomenological Assumptions	125
	Selection of Participants	127
	Data Collection	130
	Gaining Entry	130
	Phenomenological Interviews	131
	Critical Incidents	135
	The Interview Guide	137
	Starting the Interview Process	137
	Interview Questions	139
	Hearing About Culture	141



	Informal Observation	142
	Review of Documents	145
	Preliminary Study	146
	Data Management and Analysis	147
	Organizing and Storing Data	149
	File System	149
	Phenomenological Data Analysis and Synthesis Procedure	151
	Focusing on the Research Concern	155
	Making the Text More Manageable	156
	Coding Procedure	157
	Manual Coding	159
	Repeating Ideas	160
	Writing Memos	162
	Coding Using Qualitative Data Analysis Program	163
	Interpreting Data	168
	Additional Analytical Tools	169
	Representing and Visualizing	171
	Concept Mapping	173
	Validity and Reliability	174
	Validity	174
	Reliability	177
	Summary	179
IV	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	180
	Biographical Profile of the Participants	181
	Characteristics of Knowing Events	194
	Entry into Headship	195
	Identity Formation	209
	Making a Difference	251
	Reformulation of Personal Values	289
	Influences that Shape Knowing	317
	Childhood	317
	Love for Reading	326
	Career Histories	330
	Motivation	335
	Family Support	336
	Learning From and Becoming Role Models/Mentors	338
	Cultural Beliefs	342
	Specific Ways of Knowing Women Headteachers Engage In	343
	Watchful Knowing	344
	Procedural Knowing	349
	Interpersonal Knowing	353
	Gender-related Knowing	360
	Visionary Knowing	367
	Contextual Knowing	372
	Conscientious Knowing	375
	Serendipitous Issues	381



	Doubts That Gender Has Significant Role	381
	Spiritual Sustenance	383
	Servant Leadership	385
	Leader Isolation and Loneliness	387
	Discussion	388
	Characteristics of Knowing Events	388
	Influences that Shape Knowing	392
	Specific Ways of Knowing Women Headteachers Engage in	402
	Serendipitous Issues	417
	Summary	423
V	SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION	426
	Summary	426
	Conclusion	428
	A Thematic Portrayal of Headship Knowing Events	433
	Practical Implications	442
	Theoretical and Methodology Implications	448
	Future Research Recommendations	452
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	456
	APPENDICES	479
	BIODATA OF THE AUTHOR	496



LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1	Comparison of the Three Phenomenological Methods	102
2	Observation Focus of the Participant	144
3	Biographical Profile of Participants	183
4	Categories of Knowing Events and Their Characteristics	195
5	Categories of Influences That Shape Knowing	317
6	Ways of Knowing Women Headteachers Engage In	344
7	Descriptions of Ways of Knowing Women Headteachers Engage In	432
8	Research Questions and Interview Questions	481
9	Sample Interview Notes	486
10	Sample of Meaning Units	487
11	List of Categories	488
12	Sample of Individual Textural Description	490
13	Sample of Individual Structural Description	492
14	Audit Trail	493



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
1	A Conceptual Framework for Exploring Knowing Among Women Headteachers	111
2	A Model of Knowing Among Women Headteachers	436



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BM	Bahasa Melayu
CDC	Curriculum Development Centre
IAB	Institut Aminuddin Baki
EPRD	Educational Planning and Research Department
eTEMS	Teaching of Mathematics & Science in English
HEM	Hal Ehwal Murid (Student Affairs)
HM	Headmaster
HSC	Higher School Certificate
ISO	International Standard Organization
JPA	Jabatan Perkhidmatan Awam
JPN	Jabatan Pendidikan Negeri (State Education Department)
KL	Kuala Lumpur
KPKS	Kursus Pengurusan dan Kepemimpinan Sekolah
KPPM	Ketua Pengarah Pendidikan Malaysia
LCE	Lower Certificate Examination
MC	Medical Chit
MoE	Ministry of Education
MUET	Malaysia University English Test
NUD*IST	Non-numerical Unstructured Data Indexing, Searching and Theorizing
PK	Penolong Kanan (Assistant Headteacher)
PMR	Penilaian Menengah Rendah
PPD	Pegawai Pendidikan Daerah



PTA	Parent Teacher Association
PTK	Penilaian Tahap Kecekapan
QDA	Qualitative Data Analysis
QIT	Quality Improvement Team
SPBT	Skim Pinjaman Buku Teks
SPM	Sijil Pelajaran Malaysia
SSB	Sistem Saraan Baru (New Remuneration System)
STPM	Sijil Tinggi Pelajaran Malaysia
SWOT	Strength Weakness Opportunity Threats
TQM	Total Quality Management
UPM	Universiti Putra Malaysia
UPSR	Ujian Penilaian Sekolah Rendah (Primary School Assessment Test)



CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The Problem and Its Context

The words “to know” or “knowing” are prevalent throughout leadership literature. To know means to be well-informed; have the know-how in leadership decision making; can voice out opinions as well as exchange views with others; and can recognize right from wrong. There is consistent affirmation that knowing is of utmost importance to leaders and in fact, the very essence of leadership (Reinhartz & Beach, 2004). Even the very first study intelligence and dominance, and subsequently, vision was revered as essential traits and personality characteristics of leaders. Intelligence and dominance are also reflections of the intellectual power of the leader (Fennel, 2002). Despite the value placed on acquiring knowledge and intelligence, very little research has been done to substantiate what constitutes the essential structure of a knowing leader. This type of knowledge is referred to as tacit knowledge (Wassink, Slegers & Imants, 2003) what more knowledge from the gender perspective (Coleman, 2003; Rusch, 2004).

In Malaysia, the headteacher is generally considered to be the single most important element in achieving school effectiveness (Mortimore, 1993; 1995). Since headteachers are pivotal players in improving the quality of teaching and learning in schools, any significant contribution towards improvement would require that headteachers exercise their intellectual power. Furthermore, school leader’s lives are marked by frequent and a myriad changes in responsibilities and expectations (Day,



2003; Dorman & D'Arbon, 2003). All these directions require alert, active knowing and continued learning. Broadening and deepening perspectives, understanding staff, making sense of work problems and solving them are inextricably tied to thinking and knowing. On a daily basis, headteachers often have to struggle with moral and ethical dilemmas when dealing with the great diversity of people, cultures, beliefs, and behaviors daily encountered in the school environment. The ability to make sound decisions in respecting human differences and to deal effectively with different individuals has become integral to the mission of the school headteacher (Newton, Giesen, Freeman, Bishop & Zeitoun, 2003). Sound judgment, reasoning and wise decisions are the hallmarks of a knowing person and the characteristics that the Government hopes to develop in its headteachers. In such challenging decision tasks, who then fits such a role?

Although there is no formal distinction made between the headteacher job in terms of intellectual power required for men and women, there is a fairly clear segmentation of the headteacher post in Malaysia. A report by the Educational Planning and Research Division (2003) indicated that at present, roughly 75% of the headteacher and headmasters positions in Malaysia go to men and only 25% to women. Evidence concerning the number of women at the top illustrated that women have not made a significant impact on top positions. Out of the 1612 headteachers in secondary schools, only 607 of them are women whereas in the primary school setting, only 1570 out of 7065 head teachers are women (EPRD, 2003). This scenario is not reflective of the huge number of women teachers (169,837 as compared to 97,921 male teachers) the Ministry of Education Malaysia has in its service. There is an



imbalance between the number of women and men as headteachers. There is a need to address this imbalance in order to promote the most capable men and women as headteachers for greater school efficiency and effectiveness.

Teaching is one of the few professions which girls are expected to follow. Female teachers far outnumber male teachers at all educational levels in schools but female educational administrators are very few. Since women appear to dominate the teaching profession, viewing them as thinkers, inquirers and as people who possess a vast store of knowledge makes them valued members of the educational team within the school organization (Reinhartz & Beach, 2004). As such they are then suitable 'material' to be made leaders as encouraged and stipulated in the 8th Malaysian Plan (EPU, 2001; MoE, 2001). On 26 August 2004, the Prime Minister Datuk Seri Abdullah Ahmad Badawi said that the Government is committed to seeing 30% women participating in policy and decision making processes in the public sector in future (The Malay Mail, 2004). Although no time frame was set, the Government believes that the inclusion of qualified and capable women in the decision-making process is of utmost importance in view of the development and advancement of women in various fields at a rapid pace. There is no doubt of their capability.

Unfortunately, there is still a low level of participation by females in management and leadership. Women account for about 12.4 million of the country's population, a sizeable number that they should not be overlooked as a major source of human capital, yet only less than 15% are involved in decision-making (The Malay Mail, 2004). To achieve progress, the country must pool its resources and to make women



development a success, there is a need to increase the number of women in both the public and private sectors. Women should not be regarded as not being able to do the job.

Indeed, the literature relating to how women, in general, perceive and often view their world, differently from men is increasing (Gilligan, 1982; Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger & Tarule, 1986; Brunner, 1998). In addition, they also represent a different voice than men (Barrett, 1995; Kaplan, 1995; Fitzgerald, 2003), one which is generated from different experiences and alternative ways of thinking (Gilligan, 1982; Belenky et al., 1986; Haring-Hidore & Freeman, 1990). Knowing took on new dimensions when women entered traditionally male domains for instance learning and careers. Research focused on women in leadership provides evidence that women are equally capable as men although they employ different leadership styles (Coleman, 2001; McLay & Brown, 2001; Van Engen & Van der Leeden, 2001). Unfortunately, most existing research still assumes that the headteacher positions are filled by men (Ozga, 1993; Enomoto, 2000; Coleman, 2001) or does not directly address issues of gender (McLay & Brown, 2001).

Women can be viewed as mothers, sisters, secretary and assistant headteachers but are less likely to be viewed as leaders (Morriss, Low & Coleman, 1999; Hogue, Yoder & Ludwig, 2002). Although the social, political and national contexts have changed, the issue of gender is still very much considered a non issue. Women were generally considered suitable to fulfill their biological function rather than be motivated to achieve any intellectual or professional career or leadership role (Richardson & King,

