

UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

STUDY ON OPTIMIZATION OF COMPOSITE TUBULAR ENERGY ABSORPTION SYSTEM

HAKIM S. SULTAN ALJIBORI.

FK 2004 55



STUDY ON OPTIMIZATION OF COMPOSITE TUBULAR ENERGY ABSORPTION SYSTEM

By

HAKIM S. SULTAN ALJIBORI

C

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, University Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Science

June 2004



DEDICATION

I am happy to dedicate this work to my country "Iraq". A country is great by the character of its people and not by its number. I adore my country because it is the land of civilizations from the time immemorial.

I would like to express my gratitude to all the people who have been supportive of my endeavor towards my M.Sc. study.

The support of my family has been encouraging me to pursue my M.Sc study. Without their support I could not have achieved thus far. To my mother, brothers and my wife I thank them for their supporting me for so many years. I wish to make both of them proud. I thank my wife for her support, understanding and love. You have been a constant source of strength throughout my M.Sc study whenever I need.



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science

STUDY ON OPTIMIZATION OF COMPOSITE TUBULAR ENERGY ABSORPTION SYSTEM

By

HAKIM S. SULTAN ALJIBORI

June 2004

Chairman: Elsadig Mahdi Ahmad, Ph.D.

Faculty : Engineering

A four-phase program to improve the specific energy absorbed by axially crushed composite collapsible tubular energy absorber devices was undertaken. In the first phase, the effects of trigged tube wall on the crushing behaviour were investigated. At this stage, triggered tubes were fabricated and crushed. The second phase is aimed at obtaining the best position for the triggered wall. The third phase focuses on the effects of material sizing in order to understand the influence of triggered wall length on the responses of composite circular tubes to the axial crushing load. The results from these three phases lead to the fourth phase. The objective of the 4th phases was to optimise the shape geometry of the cross-section area to further improve tube energy absorption capability. The tubes were manufactured from woven roving glass/epoxy fabric and had the same lay-up providing a common laminate for comparison. The failure modes were observed and the specific sustained crushing loads were determined and compared against non-optimized



tubes of the same lay-up. The importance of differentiating between initiation energy and propagation energy is shown, and a new parameter (energy capability index (ECI)) is proposed, as a useful measure for comparing crush behaviour of composite structures. The experimental results demonstrated strong potential benefits of optimizing the material distribution. The sizing and shape optimization of composite collapsible tubes exhibited a pronounced effect on their capability to absorb high specific energy under axial compressive load.

For the effect of triggering it was that tubes (TN) observed to experience catastrophic failure mode during the post crush stage also displayed very poor energy absorption. Triggering a part of tube wall was very efficient in improving the energy absorption capacity of circular composite tubes. Accordingly tubes with triggered wall (T-tubes) exhibited highest energy absorption capacity compared with non-triggered tubes. They also experience stable post-crush region of loaddisplacement curves, which leads to high crashworthiness performance. It is also evident from the experimental results that change in the triggered wall aspect ratio significantly affected the energy absorption capability of tube with middle triggered wall (TM-tubes). Distinct differences were observed between the different aspect ratio, where TM tubes (i.e. tubes with triggered wall aspect ratio of 0.28) exhibited the highest energy absorption capacity. Different failure modes were observed for different triggered wall length ratios (L_{tr}/H). For the core tubes (TMC-), was observed that core presence markedly improved the energy absorption capacity of composite circular tubes. Among TMC- tubes, TMC3 tubes (i.e. tubes with core thickness of 3.35mm) displayed highest energy absorption capacity.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Master Sains

KAJIAN MEGENAI PENGOPTIMUMAN SISTEM PENYERAPAN TENAGA TUBULAR KOMPOSIT

Oleh

HAKIM S. SULTAN ALJIBORI

Jun 2004

Pengerusi: Elsadig Mahdi Ahmad, Ph.D.

Fakulti : Kejuruteraan

Suatu program empat fasa bagi meningkatkan tenaga tentu yang diserap oleh peranti penyerap tenaga bagi komposit boleh-musnah tiub yang dihancurkan secara menegak telah dijalankan. Dalam fasa pertama, kesan dinding tiub berpicu ke atas perlakuan hancur telah dikaji. Untuk ini, tiub berpicu dan tanpa-picu telah difabrikat dan dihancurkan. Fasa yang kedua bertujuan untuk mendapatkan posisi terbaik bagi dinding berpicu tersebut. Fasa ketiga memfokuskan kepada kesan pensaizan bahan, untuk memahami pengaruh panjang dinding berpicu ke atas tindakbalas tiub-tiub komposit membulat kepada beban paksi penghancuran. Keputusan yang dicapai oleh ketiga-tiga fasa ini menyumbang kepada fasa yang keempat, yang mana objektifnya adalah untuk mengoptimumkan bentuk geometri bagi luas keratan rentas tiub untuk lebih peningkatan dalam kebolehserapan tenaga oleh tiub. Tiub-tiub ini diperbuat daripada jalinan pintal kaca/fabrik epoksi dan mempunyai rekabentuk yang sama, ini menyediakan pelapik biasa untuk perbandingan.Mod-mod kegagalan diperhatikan,



dan beban penghancuran berterusan tertentu telah ditentukan dan dibandingkan dengan tiub-tiub tak-teroptimum yang sama rekabentuknya. Kepentingan untuk membezakan di antara tenaga inisiasi dan tenaga propagasi ditunjukkan, dan satu parameter baru (indeks kebolehan tenaga(ECI)) telah dicadangkan sebagai pengukuran yang berguna untuk membandingkan perlakuan hancur struktur-struktur komposit. Keputusan-keputusan eksperimen menunjukkan manfaat yang mungkin diperoleh dalam mengoptimumkan taburan bahan. Pensaizan dan pengoptimuman bentuk tiub komposit boleh-musnah menunjukkan kesan yang ketara dalam kebolehannya untuk menyerap tenaga tentu yang tinggi di bawah beban mampatan paksi .

Bagi kesan penambahan picu, adalah diperhatikan bahawa tiub-tiub dengan dinding tanpa-picu (TN) mengalami mod kegagalan katastrofik semasa tahap pasca-hancur, di samping menunjukkan kapasiti penyerapan tenaga yang amat rendah. Penambahan picu ke atas sebahagian daripada dinding tiub didapati amat berkesan dalam meningkatkan kapasiti penyerapan tenaga bagi tiub-tiub komposit membulat. Dengan itu, tiub-tiub dengan dinding yang berpicu (T-tubes) menunjukkan kapasiti penyerapan tenaga yang amat tinggi jika dibandingkan dengan tiub tanpa-picu. Ia juga mengalami rantau pasca-hancur yang stabil dalam lengkuk beban-peralihan, yang membawa kepada prestasi kebolehtahanan-musnah yang tinggi. Daripada eksperimen juga dapat dibuktikan bahawa pertukaran dalam nisbah aspek dinding berpicu memberi kesan langsung kepada kebolehan penyerapan tenaga bagi TMtubes. Beberapa perbezaan ketara telah dikenalpasti di antara nisbah aspek yang berlainan, di amna tiub TM (iaitu tiub dengan nisbah aspek dinding berpicu



sebanyak 0.28) menunjukkan kapasiti penyerapan tenaga yang tertinggi. Mod-mod kegagalan yang berlainan telah diperhatikan untuk nisbah L_{tr}/H yang berlainan. Bagi tiub-tiub teras (TMC-), adalah didapati bahawa kehadiran teras telah meningkatkan kapasiti penyerapan tenaga untuk tiub-tiub komposit membulat. Di antara tiub-tiub TMC-, tiub TMC3 (iaitu tiub yang mempunyai ketebalan teras sebanyak 3.35mm) menunjukkan kapasiti penyerapan tenaga yang amat tinggi.





ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

IN THE NAME OF ALLAH, GRACIOUS, MERCIFUL

I wish to acknowledge the following individuals whose enormous contributions led to the successful completion of this thesis:

- Dr. El-Sadig Mahdi, thanks for your immense contribution to my academic advancement and your tremendous patience during many challenging moments. A man of limitless patience, I am glad to have been associated with you. Thanks for your friendship and concern. You made the work easier with your caring words and advices.
- Dr. A. M. S. Hammouda, thanks for his ennobling association. Thanks for giving me another dimension to life. Thanks for taking time off your busy schedule to serve on my committee.
- **Dr. Ashraf Ali,** thanks for the tremendous help you offered for this thesis. Your guidance and assistance were priceless. Thanks for your support and vision and for your ennobling association



TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION ABSTRACT ABSTRAK ACKNOWLEDGEMENT DECLARATION LIST OF TABLES LIST OF FIGURES NOMENCLATURE			Page ii vv viii xi xv xvi xvi xix
CHAP	TER		
1	INTR	ODUCTION	1
	1.1	Problem Statement	3
	1.1	Research Objectives	3
	1.2	Significance of the Study	4
	1.3	Thesis Layout	5
2	LITE	RATURE REVIEW	6
	2.1	Crashworthiness Parameters of Collapsible Energy Absorption Devices 2.1.1 Load-Displacement of Axially Crushed Composite Shells 2.1.2 Load-Carrying Capacity 2.1.3 Crush Force Efficiency and Crushed Strain 2.1.4 Energy Absorption Capability Crushing Behaviour of Metallic and Composite Circular tubes	6 7 8 8 9 10
		2.2.1 Metallic Tubes	11
		2.2.2 Composite Tubes	13
	2.3	Compressive Failure Mechanisms of FRP Tubes	15
		2.3.1 Euler Buckling	16
		2.3.2 Progressive Folding	16
		2.3.3 Brittle Fracture	17
	2.4	Factors Affecting the Energy Absorption Capability of	20
		Composite Tubes	22
		2.4.1 Effect of Matrix Types	22
		2.4.2 Effect of Matrix Types	20 27
		2.4.5 FIDE Architecture	27 20
		2.4.5 Effect of Processing Conditions	27 31
		2.4.6 Effect of Fibre Volume Fraction	34
		2.4.7 Effect of Crushing Speed	35
	2.5	Discussion	35



G

3 METHODOLOGY

	HODOLOGY	36
3.1	Introduction	36
3.2	Mandrel Preparation	38
3.3	Composite Constituents	39
3.4	Fabrication Process of Specimens	41
3.5	Crushing Process	46
3.6	Discussion	48

4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1	Desig	n Parame	ters	49
4.2	Crash	worthine	ss Parameters	50
	4.2.1	Crush F	Force Efficiency-Crush Strain Relation	50
	4.2.2	Initial F	ailure Indicator	51
	4.2.3	Energy	Absorption Capability	52
1.3	Result	ts		54
	4.3.1	Tubes Placed a	with Non-Triggered and Triggered Wall at Different Positions (T-tubes)	54
		4.3.1.1	Load-Displacement Relationship	55
		4.3.1.2	Load Carrying Capacity	61
		4.3.1.3	Energy Absorption Capabilities	62
		4.3.1.4	Failure Modes	66
		4.3.1.5	Effect of Triggered Wall Position on Crashworthiness Parameters	67
		4.3.1.6	Conclusion	69
	4.3.2	Tubes w	with Different Triggered Wall Aspect	0)
		Ratio L	-/H (TM-Tubes)	70
		4.3.2.1	Load –Displacement and Crushing	70
		4.3.2.2	Load Carrying Capacity	74
		4.3.2.3	Energy Absorption Canabilities	75
		4.3.2.4	Failure Modes	78
		4.3.2.5	Effect of L ₄ /H Ratio on the	70
			Crashworthiness Parameters	80
		4.3.2.6	Conclusion	83
	4.3.3	Core-Tu	ibes (TMC)	05
	11010	4.3.3.1	Load-Displacement and Crushing	
			History	84
		4332	Load Carrying Capacity	89
		4333	Energy Absorption Canabilities	90
		4334	Failure Mode	93
		4 3 3 5	Effect of Core on Crashworthiness	15
			Parameters	93
		4.3.3.6	Conclusion	96
				20



4.4	Energy Dissipation Mechanisms	97
	4.4.1 Pre-Initial Crush Failure Stage	97
	4.4.2 Post-Crush Failure Stage	106
4.5	Energy Capability Index	109
4.6	Conclusion	111
	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	112
5.1	General Conclusion	112
5.2	Triggering of Tube Wall (TN tubes)	112
5.3	Triggered Wall Position (T-tubes)	113
5.4	Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio (TM-tubes)	113
5.5	Core-Tubes (TMC)	113
5.6	Suggestion for Further Work	114
REFE	CRENCES	115
APPE	INDICES IN THE INTERNATION OF TH	121
BIOD	ATA OF THE AUTHOR	130

5

C



LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
3.1	Constituent materials	40
3.2	characteristics of the Dimensions Composite Tubes	47
4.1	Summarized Results of the Energy Absorption Capabilities for (T-) Tubes	65
4.2	Measured Crashworthiness Parameters of (T-) tubes	69
4.3	Results of the Energy Absorption Capabilities for TM- Tubes	77
4.4	Measured Crashworthiness Parameters of TM- Tubes	83
4.5	Summarized Results of Energy Absorption Capabilities of Tubes with TM and TMC	91
4.6	Measured Crashworthiness Parameters of TM and TMC Tubes	96
4.7	Energy Absorption Analysis of Axially crushed composite tubes	111



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
2.1	Schematic Presentation of The Load-Displacement Curve of Composite Tube Subjected to Axial Crushing	7
2.2	Axial collapse of metallic tube	12
2.3	General Failure Mechanisms And Load-Displacement Characteristic of a Progressive Folding, FRP Tube	17
2.4	Schematic Representation of Load-Displacement Characteristic for an FRP Tube Failing by Stable Brittle	18
2.5	Schematic Representation of the Formation of the Splaying / Lamina Bending Mode	19
2.6	Schematic Representation of the Formation of Fragmentation / Transverse Shearing Mode	20
3.1	Flow Chart Describes the Experimental Work	37
3.2	Schematic diagrams of mandrel with T- Tubes	38
3.3	Schematic Diagrams of Mandrel for TM- Tubes	39
3.4	Schematic Diagrams of Developed Woven Roving Glass Fibres	40
3.5	Schematic Diagrams of Woven roving Winding Process	41
3.6	Triggered Wall Distribution of T-, TM and TMC Tubes	42
3.7	Typical Sketch of TM Tubes with Ltr/H	43
3.8	Typical Sketch of Core-Tubes	44
3.9	Typical Photographic of T-Tubes	45
3.10	Typical Photographic of TM Tubes with L_{tr}/H	45
3.11	Typical Photographic of TMC Tubes	45
3.12	Composite Tube under Axial Crushing	46
4.1	Typical Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TN Tube	56



6

4.2	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TI Tube	57
4.3	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TO Tube	59
4.4	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TM Tube	60
4.5	Typical Load-Displacement Relations of Composite Circular Tubes with Non-Triggered (TN) Inner (TI), Outer (TO) and Middle (TM)	61
4.6	Energy-Displacement Relations of T- Tubes	62
4.7	Energy Absorption as a Function of Triggered Wall Aspect ratio r/t	64
4.8	Crushing Loads as a Function of Aspect Ratio r/t	68
4.9	Typical Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio (L _{tr} /H) of 0.42 (TM1)	71
4.10	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of Triggered Wall with Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio (L _{tr} /H) of 0.57	72
4.11	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of Triggered Wall Aspect Ration (L _{tr} /H) of 0.71 (TM3)	74
4.12	Typical Load-Displacement Relations of TM- Tubes	75
4.13	Energy-Displacement Relations of TM- Tubes	76
4.14	Energy <mark>Absorption Capabilities as a Function o</mark> f Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio (L _{tr} /H)	77
4.15	Crushing Loads as a Function of Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio (L _{tr} /H)	81
4.16	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TMC1 Tube	86
4.17	Typical Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TMC2 Tube	87
4.18	Load-Displacement Curve and Deformation Histories of TMC3 Tube	89
4.19	Load-Displacement Relations for TMC- and TM Tubes	90
4.20	Energy-Displacement Relations for TMC- and TM Tubes	91
4.21	Energy Absorption capabilities as a Function of Core Thickness (t_c) for TMC- and TM Tubes	92



4.22	Crushing Loads as a Function of Core Thickness (t_c) for TMC- and TM Tubes	95
4.23	Optical Micrographs (100µ) of TI-Tubes	101
4.24	Optical Micrographs (100 μ) of TO and TM Triggered Wall Tubes	102
4.25	Optical Micrographs (100 μ) of TM Tubes with Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio (L _{tr} /H)	103
4.26	Optical Micrograph (100µ) of TMC1 Tubes	104
4.27	Optical Micrograph (100µ) of TMC3 Tubes	105





NOMENCLATURE

FRP	Fibre Reinforced Plastic
H	Total Height of Tube (mm)
L _{tr}	Triggered Wall Length (mm)
(L _{tr} / H)	Triggered Wall Aspect Ratio
TN	Non-Triggered Tube
TI 🔲	Tube with Triggered Wall Placed at Inner Position
ТО	Tube With Triggered Wall Placed at Outer Position
ТМ	Tube with Triggered Wall at Middle Position and (L_{tr}/H) of 0.28
TM1	Tube with TM and (L_{tr}/H) of 0.42
TM2	Tube with TM and (L_{tr}/H) of 0.57
TM3	Tube with TM and (L_{tr}/H) of 0.71
ТМС	Tube with TM and Core
TMC1	Tube with TM and Core Thickness of 2.1mm
TMC2	Tube with TM and Core Thickness of 2.75mm
TMC3	Tube with TM and Core Thickness of 3.35mm
u	Crushed Distance (mm)
t	Thickness of the Triggered Wall (mm)
t _c	Thickness of the Core (mm)



D.,	Mean Top Diameter of Tube (mm)
М	Mass of the Tube (kg)
171	Mass of the Tube (kg)
А	Cross-Sectional Area (m ²)
V _m	Volume of Material (m ³)
ρ	Mass Density of Structure (kg/m ³)
Vs	Volume of Structure (m ³)
Aı	Cross-Sectional Area of Material (m ²)
A ₂	Cross-Sectional Area of Structure (m ²)
Es	Specific Energy Absorption (kJ/kg)
Ev	Energy Absorption per Unit Volume (kJ/m ³)
Pi	Instant Crush Failure Load (kN)
W _p	The Total Work Done (kJ)
S	Instantaneous Displacement (mm)
P _m	Mean Crush Failure Load (kN)
P _{cr}	Critical Crush Failure Loads (kN)
P ₁	First Peak Crush Failure Load (kN)
IFI	Initial Failure Indicator
CFE	Crush Force Efficiency
CS	Crushed Strain



CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

In recent years there is an increasing demand in the use of composite materials for the automotive, aerospace and rail industry. The automotive and aerospace applications over the past quarter-century have been primarily in special areas such as energy absorber devices. As the automotive manufacturers have to take environmental issues into consideration, the composite space-frame concept has become more and more attractive in the design of vehicles. When using composite in the body structure of a vehicle, considerable weight reductions can be achieved compared to conventional isotropic structures, which leads to reduced fuel consumption and consequently lower carbon dioxide emissions.

The high efficiency of any energy absorber device may be defined as its ability to decelerate smoothly the occupant compartment to the rest within the allowable limit [1]. It is well-known that responses of axially crushed non-trigger tubes (i.e. tube with constant thickness and squared ends) are characterized by recording very high resistances till reach their full load carrying capacity after which definite different degrees of unstable behaviours take place [2]. Therefore, it is strongly believed that for core-less tubular energy absorber devices stable load-deformation curve could only be obtained by steering the failure initiation to occur in a designed



region along the shell meridional direction. In that manner, two approaches based on material and geometry properties have been suggested to avoid the Eulerbuckling failure mechanism or any mechanism leads to catastrophic failure. These approaches can be classified in two categories. The first Category based on material properties employs core thin-walled structures filled with crushable medium (i.e. synthesised or natural cellular materials filler). It has been extensively shown that tubes with filled cores achieved high and stable load carrying capacity along the gross deformation with very high total energy absorbed and very specific energy absorption compared with the core-less tubes [3]. This Category is being criticised because of apparent weight increasing, despite the specific filler density. More over researchers in composite structures introduces hybrid structures using different fibres types [4]. The hybridisation relatively improved the load-carrying capacity without a profound enhancement in the specific energy absorbed. A designed beneficial imperfection in the structure introduced by Hui [5] was introduced to enhance the energy absorption. This method resulted in a combination of instable and stable failure mode. The second Category based on geometry properties are also categorized in many groups. According to Farley [6] and Farley & Jones [7] reported that energy absorption capability is a non-linear function of inside diameter to wall thickness ratio (D/t) for tubular specimens. They stated that specific energy absorption was found to fall as D/t increased. Mamalis, et al [8] and Mahdi, et al. [9] reported that the crushing behaviour is dominated by increasing the cone vertex angle.



1.1 Problem Statement

The main objective to manufacturers and materials community is to produce vehicles with lightweight; therefore, using composite material for automotive and aerospace industry it is very attractive to be the main materials for many car components. One of these components is crash energy devices. Energy absorbs devices should be designed to meet the requirements and standards for the protections of the occupants or passengers in vehicles accident. However, behaviour of the composite energy absorber devices is often unstable in absorbing crash event and most probably leads to catastrophic failure mechanism. This instability is one of the more critical problems in using fibre composites for crash energy management. This is the main factor behind this present project. Accordingly this project introduces many aspects to improve the energy absorption capability of composite circular tubes under quasi-static axial compressive load.

1.2 Objectives

The purpose of this study is to optimise the structure of composite tubular energy absorber device in order to maximize its specific energy absorption capability. The only known quantities in this problem are the loading, support conditions and the structure domain. The detail objectives of this study can be summarised as follows:

1. To study the effect of triggering on the crushing behaviour of composite



circular tubes.

- 2. To examine the effect of the triggered wall position on the energy absorption of composite circular tubes.
- 3. To determine the effect of the triggered wall aspect ratio on the energy absorption of composite circular tubes.
- 4. To examine the effect of material distribution and shape optimisation on the energy absorption of composite circular tubes.

1.2 Significance of the Study

This work is important because of the following:

- 1. Any generic technology or structural system in the various engineering fields offers safety and provide enhanced levels of protection ought to be of considerable interest, that composite materials based structures is one such technology is not in doubt.
- 2. The efficient use of composite tubes as energy absorber depends on the understanding of their crushing behaviour.
- The results of this study and the produced data can be helpful in the design stage of energy absorber elements made from composite material.

