

# UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

# CHARACTERISATION OF TEXTILE DYE-DEGRADING PROPERTIES OF LIGNINOLYTIC FUNGUS ISOLATE 5-UPM

ARIFF BIN KHALID.

FBSB 2005 21



### CHARACTERISATION OF TEXTILE DYE-DEGRADING PROPERTIES OF LIGNINOLYTIC FUNGUS ISOLATE 5-UPM



**ARIFF BIN KHALID** 

By

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Science

May 2005



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science

### CHARACTERISATION OF TEXTILE DYE-DEGRADING PROPERTIES OF LIGNINOLYTIC FUNGUS ISOLATE 5-UPM

By

#### **ARIFF BIN KHALID**

May 2005

### Chairman: Mohd. Yunus Abdul Shukor, PhD

Faculty : Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences

Local white-rot fungi isolated from soil and wood samples were screened for their ability to degrade textile azo dyes. Sixty three white-rot fungi cultures isolated from various Peninsular Malaysia locations in Selangor, Kelantan, Perak and Terengganu were screened for the ability to degrade four textile azo dyes; Ponceau 2R (C.I. 16450), Orange G (C.I. 16230), Direct Blue 71 (C.I. 34140) and Biebrich Scarlet (C.I. 26905). Forty isolates gave positive results with varying degrees of degradation. Based on these results, an unidentified white-rot fungus (Isolate 5-UPM) isolated from Universiti Putra Malaysia (UPM) Selangor campus was selected for further studies due to its ability to completely degrade all four azo dyes in the minimum amount of time. Nutritional studies on defined solid medium showed that Isolate 5-UPM was only able to degrade the four azo dyes under nitrogen-limiting conditions and an additional carbon source such as glucose was needed to provide sufficient



energy for the degradation to occur. When grown in two-stage liquid cultures, Isolate 5-UPM was able to degrade 93 to 99 % of 0.2 g/L azo dyes in two to eight days with each dye being degraded at different rates. Direct Blue 71 was degraded the fastest followed by Orange G, Ponceau 2R and Biebrich Scarlet. Generally, azo dye degradation rates were shown to be higher in agitated cultures compared to static cultures, with rates almost twice those in static cultures. Isolate 5-UPM degraded the four azo dyes optimally when incubated at 35 to 45 °C in static cultures. The initial degradation medium (pH 4.5 to 5.9) did not have any significant effects on the degradation rates except for Ponceau 2R cultures where the degradation rate was highest at pH 4.5. However, the final pH of all cultures dropped to approximately pH 4.0. Assays for lignin-modifying enzymes (LMEs) involved in azo dye degradation showed only the presence of laccase (E.C. 1.10.3.2) while lignin peroxidase (E.C. 1.11.1.14) and manganese peroxidase (E.C. 1.11.1.13) were not detected. Laccase activity profile in static liquid degradation cultures showed correlation to the azo dye degradation profile and was highest in cultures incubated at room temperatures except for Biebrich Scarlet cultures, which was highest at 30 °C. The initial pH of the degradation medium (pH 4.5 to 5.9) did not have any significant effect on laccase activity except in Direct Blue 71 culture where it is highest at pH 5.9. Laccase produced by Isolate 5-UPM during azo dye degradation was partially purified and when 2,2'-azinobis (3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonate) (ABTS) was used as the substrate, it was shown to have a K<sub>m</sub> value of 0.1 mM, optimum activity at 50 to 70 °C and pH 3.5 to 4.0 while being most stable at room temperature and pH 6.0 to 7.0. Laccase was proven to directly degrade the four azo dyes with the K<sub>m</sub> values of 1.5 x  $10^{-3}$  mM, 9.8 x 10<sup>-4</sup> mM, 1.8 x 10<sup>-4</sup> mM and 1.8 x 10<sup>-4</sup> mM for Ponceau 2R, Orange



G, Direct Blue 71 and Biebrich Scarlet, respectively although the latter azo dye inhibited laccase activity at concentrations higher than 0.8 mg/L.





Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Master Sains

### PENCIRIAN SIFAT PENDEGRADASI PEWARNA AZO OLEH KULAT LIGNINOLITIK ISOLATE 5-UPM

Oleh

### **ARIFF BIN KHALID**

Mei 2005

Pengerusi: Mohd. Yunus Abdul Shukor, PhD

Fakulti : Bioteknologi dan Sains Biomolekul

Kulat reput-putih tempatan yang di pencilkan dari sampel tanah dan kayu telah disaring untuk keupayaan mengurai pewarna tekstil azo. Enam puluh tiga kultur kulat reput-putih telah dipencilkan dari beberapa lokasi di Selangor, Kelantan, Perak dan Terengganu dan disaring untuk keupayaan mengurai empat pewarna tekstil azo; Ponceau 2R (C.I. 16450), Orange G (C.I. 16230), Direct Blue 71 (C.I. 34140) dan Biebrich Scarlet (C.I. 26905). Empat puluh kultur pencilan telah memberikan keputusan positif yang berbeza-beza tahap penguraiannya. Berdasarkan keputusan ini, satu kultur kulat reput-putih yang tidak dikenalpasti (Isolat 5-UPM) yang telah di pencilkan dari sampel di kampus Universiti Putra Malaysia (UPM) Selangor telah dipilih untuk kajian seterusnya kerana keupayaanya mengurai ke empat-empat pewarna azo yang digunakan dalam masa yang tersingkat. Kajian nutrisi menggunakan media kultur pejal terperinci menunjukkan Isolat 5-UPM hanya mampu mengurai ke empat-empat pewarna azo tersebut ketika berada di dalam keadaan kekurangan nitrogen dan sumber karbon tambahan seperti glukosa diperlukan untuk



membekalkan tenaga yang cukup bagi proses penguraian untuk berlaku. Apabila ditumbuhkan di dalam kultur cecair dua peringkat, Isolat 5-UPM mampu mengurai dari 93 hingga 99 % 0.2 g/L pewarna azo dalam dua hingga lapan hari dengan kadar penguraian yang berbeza. Direct Blue 71 telah diurai terpantas, diikuti oleh Orange G. Ponceau 2R dan Biebrich Scarlet. Secara amnya, kadar penguraian pewarna azo adalah lebih tinggi di dalam kultur goncang berbanding di dalam kultur pegun, dengan kadarnya hampir dua kali ganda di dalam kultur pegun. Isolat 5-UPM mengurai pewarna-pewarna azo tersebut secara optimum apabila dieramkan pada suhu 35 to 45 °C di dalam kultur pegun manakala pH awal media penguraian (pH 4.5 hingga 5.9) tidak mempunyai kesan yang bermakna ke atas kadar penguraian kecuali di dalam kultur Ponceau 2R di mana kadar penguraian yang tertinggi berlaku pada pH 4.5. Walaubagaimanapun, pH akhir kesemua kultur telah menurun ke sekitar pH 4.0. Pencerakinan untuk enzim-enzim pengubah lignin yang terlibat dengan penguraian pewarna azo hanya menunjukkan kehadiran laccase (E.C. 1.10.3.2) manakala lignin peroksidase (E.C. 1.11.1.14) dan mangan peroksidase (E.C. 1.11.1.13) tidak dikesan. Profil aktiviti laccase di dalam kultur cecair pegun menunjukkan korelasi dengan profil penguraian pewarna azo dan adalah tertinggi di dalam kultur yang dieram pada suhu bilik kecuali kultur Biebrich Scarlet (30 °C). pH awal media penguraian (pH 4.5 hingga 5.9) tidak mempunyai kesan yang bermakna ke atas aktiviti laccase kecuali di dalam kultur Direct Blue 71 di mana ia adalah tertinggi pada pH 5.9. Laccase yang telah dihasilkan oleh Isolat 5-UPM semasa penguraian pewarna azo telah di separatulenkan dan apabila 2,2'-azinobis (3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonate) (ABTS) digunakan sebagai substrat, didapati mempunyai nilai K<sub>m</sub> 0.1 mM, aktiviti optimum pada 50 hingga 70 °C dan pada pH 3.5 hingga 4.0 manakala ia adalah paling stabil



pada suhu bilik atau kebawah dan pada pH 6.0 dan 7.0. Laccase ini telah dibuktikan mampu mengurai pewarna azo secara langsung dengan nilai-nilai  $K_m$  1.5 x 10<sup>-3</sup> mM, 9.8 x 10<sup>-4</sup> mM, 1.8 x 10<sup>-4</sup> mM dan 1.8 x 10<sup>-4</sup> mM untuk Ponceau 2R, Orange G, Direct Blue 71 dan Biebrich Scarlet mengikut turutan. Walaubagaimanapun, Biebrich Scarlet didapati menyekat aktiviti laccase pada kepekatan yang lebih tinggi dari 0.8 g/L.





### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My sincerest gratitude to Dr. Mohd. Yunus Abdul Shukor, Prof. Dr. Mohd. Arif Syed and Dr. Shuhaimi Mustafa for their supervision and kind advice during the course of this research. I would also like to acknowledge the assistance provided by many laboratory assistants from the Faculty of Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences, my lab mates, Sim, Kak Su, Kak Ilah, Fazu and Surini and countless undergraduates. I'm also thankful to my wife for putting up with myself being a weekend husband. Finally, I would like to express my gratitude to the Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation for sponsoring my Masters degree.

"Research is the act of going up alleys to see if they are blind".

Plutarch



# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

			Page
ABS ABS ACK APP DEC LIST LIST LIST	TRACT TRAK NOWLI ROVAL CLARAT F OF TA F OF FIC F OF AB	EDGEMENTS ION BLES JURES BREVIATIONS	ii v viii ix xii xv xvii xv
CHA	APTER		
1	INTR	RODUCTION	1
2	LITE	CRATURE REVIEW	3
	2.1	Production of Synthetic and Azo Dyes by Global and Malaysian Industries	3
	2.2	Structure and Synthesis of Azo Dyes	4
	2.3	Azo Dye Nomenclature	6
	2.4	Azo Dye Environmental Recalcitrance	7
	2.5	Azo Dye Contamination of Industrial Effluents and its Effects	8
	2.6	Aromatic Amines from the Partial Degradation of Azo Dyes	10
		2.6.1 Definition, Structure and Sources of Aromatic Amines	10
		2.6.2 A Historical Perspective on Aromatic Amines Carcinogenicity and Toxicity	11
		2.6.3 Conditions and Mechanisms for the Formation of Aromatic Amines from Azo Dyes	13
	2.7	Current Legislations Involving the Use of Azo Dyes	15
	2.8	Current Examples of Conventional Technologies for Azo Dye Removal From Wastewater	16
	2.9	Bioremediation as a Viable Alternative Technology for Pollution	19
		Treatment	
		2.9.1 Definition and Basic Concepts of Bioremediation	19
		2.9.2 Fundamental Approaches in Bioremediation	20
		2.9.3 Factors Affecting Bioremediation	21
	2.10	White-rot Fungi in Azo Dye Bioremediation	24
		2.10.1 White-rot Fungi and Basidiomycetes	24
		2.10.2 Summary of Previous Published Research of Azo Dye	26
		Biodegradation by White-rot Fungi	
		2.10.3 Advantages of White-rot Fungi Over Other	28
		Microorganisms in Azo Dye Biodegradation	

		2.10.4	Lignin-Modifying Enzymes	30
3	МАТ	TERIALS	AND METHODS	40
	3.1	General	Overview	40
	3.2	Chemica	ils and Equipments Used	40
	3.3	Isolation	and Screening of Ligninolytic Fungi	40
		3.3.1	White-Rot Fungi Sampling	40
		3.3.2	Cleaning and Disinfection of White-rot Fungi Samples	41
		3.3.3	Growth and Isolation	42
		3.3.4	Maintenance of White-Rot Fungi Isolates	44
		3.3.5	Screening of White-Rot Cultures for Azo Dye Degrading Ability	46
	3.4	Azo Dye	e Degradation Studies	48
		3.4.1	Effects of Carbon Limitation and Nitrogen Limitation on	48
			Azo Dye Degradation by Isolate 5-UPM	
		3.4.2	Azo Dyes Degradation Profiles in Static and Agitated	50
			Liquid Cultures	20
		3.4.3	Effects of Different Environmental Conditions on Azo	56
			Dye Degradation in Static Liquid Cultures	
	3.5	Enzyma	tic Studies on Azo Dye Degradation	58
		3.5.1	Detection of LMEs Produced by Isolate 5-UPM in	58
			Degradation Cultures and the Effects of Different	
			Environmental Conditions on LMEs Activity	
		3.5.2	Azo Dye Degradation and LMEs Profile in 1 L Stirred	61
			Degradation Cultures	
		3.5.3	Fungus Growth and Harvesting of Laccase from 1 L	63
			Stirred Cultures for Enzymatic Studies	
		3.5.4	Partial Purification of Laccase	64
		3.5.5	Laccase Characterization Studies	71
4	RES	ULTS AN	ID DISCUSSIONS	76
	4.1	Ligninol	ytic Fungi Isolated from Sites in Peninsular Malaysia	76
	4.2	Screenin	ng of White-Rot Cultures for Azo Dye Degrading Ability	78
	4.3	Azo Dye	e Degradation Studies	83
		4.3.1	Effects of Carbon Limitation and Nitrogen Limitation on	83
			Azo Dye Degradation by Isolate 5-UPM	
		4.3.2	Azo Dyes Degradation Profiles in Static and Agitated	86
			Liquid Cultures	
		4.3.3	Effects of Different Environmental Conditions on Azo	92
			Dye Degradation	
	4.4	Enzyma	tic Studies on Azo Dye Degradation	105
		4.4.1	Detection and Studies on the Effects of Environmental	105
			Conditions on LMEs Activity by Isolate 5-UPM in	
			Degradation Cultures	
		4.4.2	Azo Dye Degradation and LMEs Profile in 1 L Stirred	117
			Degradation Cultures	



	4.4.3	Partial Purification of Laccase	119
	4.4.4	Laccase Characterization Studies	126
5	CONCLUSIO	DNS	139
REFER	RENCES		142
APPEN	DICES		149
Ι	List of	Chemicals and Equipments	149
II	Formul activitie	a for the calculations of the enzyme activity and specific es of LMEs	151
III	Control	Culture Profiles	152
IV	ANOV	A Tables	157
BIODATA OF THE AUTHOR			160



G

### LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1	Colour Index (C.I.) classification of azo dyes	6
2	Azo dye classification according to method of application	7
3	List of other white-rot fungi capable of azo dye biodegradation	27
4	Modified Kirk's basal medium compositions for investigating the effects of nitrogen and carbon limitation on azo dye degradation by Isolate 5-UPM	49
5	Growth and degradation media composition	51
6	Absorption maxima of the four azo dyes used	54
7	Buffers used and their respective pH	73
8	Azo dye dilutions for the determination of laccase $K_{m (app)}$ and $V_{max}$	74
9	List of successfully isolated ligninolytic fungi	76
10	Days required for white-rot fungi to fully decolourise azo dyes on solid screening medium	79
11	Degradation by Isolate 5-UPM in carbon-limiting conditions	84
12	Degradation by Isolate 5-UPM in nitrogen-limiting conditions	84
13	Final degradation, initial adsorption percentages and $DT_{50}$ (days) values of azo dyes in static and agitated cultures	90
14	$DT_{50}$ (hours) values of azo dye cultures incubated at different temperatures	93
15	Initial and final degradation medium pH	100
16	$DT_{50}$ (hours) values of azo dye cultures incubated at different initial pH	100
17	Laccase purification table	123
18	Laccase half-life (minutes) when pre-incubated at different temperatures	132



- 19Laccase half-life (minutes) when pre-incubated at different pH133
- 20 Laccase  $K_{m (app)}$  and  $V_{max (app)}$  values with azo dyes as substrates 136





# LIST OF FIGURES

Figu	ire	Page
1	General azo dye chemical structure	4
2	Azo dye synthesis via a two-reaction process	5
3	Aniline chemical structure	11
4	Reduction of azo dyes and formation of aromatic amines	13
5	Proposed mechanism for laccase degradation of azo dyes	34
6	Procedure for cutting the stipe tissue	43
7	Chemical structures of the four azo dyes used in this study. From	47
8	Apparatus setup for 1 L stirred cultures	61
9	Modified HPLC setup for Mono-Q <sup>TM</sup> anion exchange	67
10	Decolourised zones by Isolate 5-UPM (day 7). (a) Biebrich Scarlet, (b) Orange G, (c) Direct Blue 71 and (d) Ponceau 2R plate cultures	81
11	Azo dyes (0.2 g/L) degradation profiles by Isolate 5-UPM in 40 ml static liquid cultures	88
12	Azo dyes (0.2 g/L) degradation profiles by Isolate 5-UPM in 40 ml agitated liquid cultures incubated in orbital shakers (115 rpm)	89
13	Effects of incubation temperatures on Ponceau 2R (0.2 g/L) degradation in static cultures	95
14	Effects of incubation temperatures on Orange G (0.2 g/L) degradation in static cultures	96
15	Effects of incubation temperatures on Direct Blue 71 (0.2 g/L) degradation in static cultures	97
16	Effects of incubation temperatures on Biebrich Scarlet (0.2 g/L) degradation in static cultures	98



17	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on Ponceau 2R (0.2 g/L) degradation	101
18	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on Orange G (0.2 g/L) degradation	102
19	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on Direct Blue 71 (0.2 g/L) degradation	103
20	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on Biebrich Scarlet (0.2 g/L) degradation	104
21	Effects of incubation temperatures on laccase activity in Ponceau 2R (0.2 g/L) degradation cultures	108
22	Effects of incubation temperatures on laccase activity in Orange G (0.2 g/L) degradation cultures	109
23	Effects of incubation temperatures on laccase activity in Direct Blue 71 (0.2 g/L) degradation cultures	110
24	Effects of incubation temperatures on laccase activity in Biebrich Scarlet (0.2 g/L) degradation cultures	111
25	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on laccase activity in Ponceau 2R (0.2 g/L) static cultures	113
26	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on laccase activity in Orange G (0.2 g/L) static cultures	114
27	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on laccase activity in Direct Blue 71 (0.2 g/L) static cultures	115
28	Effects of initial degradation medium pH on laccase activity in Biebrich Scarlet (0.2 g/L) static culture	116
29	Orange G degradation and laccase activity profile in 1 L stirred cultures	118
30	Laccase elution profile using Macro-Prep High-Q <sup>TM</sup> anion exchanger column	120
31	Laccase elution profile using Mono-Q <sup>TM</sup> strong-anion exchanger column	121
32	Laccase elution profile using Superose <sup>TM</sup> gel filtration column	122



33	Non-denaturing SDS-PAGE of crude and ultrafiltrated culture fluid of Isolate 5-UPM azo dye degradation culture	125
34	Lineweaver-Burke graph for laccase with ABTS as the substrate	127
35	Michaelis-Menten curve for laccase with ABTS as the substrate	128
36	Effects of assay temperatures on laccase activity with ABTS as the substrate	130
37	Effects of incubation pH and buffers on laccase activity with ABTS as the substrate	131
38	Effects of different pre-incubation temperatures on laccase stability	134
39	Effects of different pre-incubation pH and buffers on laccase stability	135
40	Effects of increasing Biebrich Scarlet concentrations on laccase	137



C

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

	2,6-DMP	2,6-dimethoxyphenol
	ABTS	2,2'- azinobis (3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonate)
	BS	Biebrich Scarlet
	C.I.	Colour Index
	CAS	Chemical Abstracts Service
	COD	Chemical Oxygen Demand
	DB71	Direct Blue 71
	DNA	Deoxyribonucleic acid
	E.C.	Enzyme Commission
	EDTA	Ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid
	GPS	Global Positioning System
	HPLC	High Performance Liquid Chromatography
	IUPAC	International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry
	K <sub>m (app)</sub>	Apparent Michaelis-Menten Constant
	LME	Lignin Modifying Enzyme
	OG	Orange G
	PDA	Potato Dextrose Agar
	P2R	Ponceau 2R
	SAAA	Sodium acetate-acetic acid buffer
	TE	Trace Elements



V<sub>max (app)</sub>





### **CHAPTER 1**

### **INTRODUCTION**

The modern world will be a drab and colourless place without the use of synthetic dyes. Indeed, synthetic dyes have largely replaced natural dyes, especially in the textile industry due to their generally superior qualities such as range of colours, colour intensity, ease of manufacture, fastness, and resistance to fading by physical, chemical and microbial agents (Wesenberg *et al.*, 2003).

Despite the advantages of synthetic dyes over natural dyes, synthetic dyes present their own new set of problems. The most obvious problem is aesthetic pollution of waterways caused by the presence of dyes leached from textile factories since they are visible even at low concentrations (Banat *et al.*, 1996). In addition, the presence of dyes could also potentially reduce the amount of sunlight reaching the bottom of rivers and lakes and thus affects the ability of aquatic plants to carry out photosynthesis (Banat *et al.*, 1996; Torres *et al.*, 2003; Wesenberg *et al.*, 2003). This will have the net effect of reducing the availability of oxygen in the water to other aquatic animals (Yesilada *et al.*, 2003). Another more insidious problem is production of potentially carcinogenic aromatic amine compounds from the partial cleavage of synthetic dyes, especially from the azoic dye group, so called because of the presence of (-N=N-) azo bond by anaerobic bacteria found in wastewater treatment plants.



Current azo dye removal methods usually involve physical and/or chemical treatments. Conventional wastewater treatment such as activated sludge and trickling filters generally fail to decolourise these dye effluents (Kasinath *et al.*, 2003; Wesenberg *et al.*, 2003) and as stated above, they might actually worsen the problem. These methods have many disadvantages. Chemical treatments produce large amounts of chemical sludge with the attendant disposal problems while ozone is very expensive to produce (Supaka *et al.*, 2004). Physical treatments are also very expensive due to the high operating expenses to produce and regenerate activated carbon (Shen *et al.*, 1992). For these reasons, biological treatments such as utilizing the biodegradative ability of bacteria and ligninolytic fungi are being investigated as a viable and cost effective alternative.

Research into bioremediation, or the use of microorganisms or their enzymes to biotransform the contaminated environments to their original state (Thassitou and Arvanitoyannis, 2001) are currently still in the early stages. In our case, many investigators have isolated fungi from the environment for the biodegradation of textile dyes for the past 20 years or so. Fungi such as *Phanerochaete chrysoporium* and *Tinctporia sp.*, both belonging to the ligninolytic white-rot group, are among the first to have been shown to have the ability to degrade azo dyes (Awaluddin *et al.*, 2001). Until recently however, most published research, including those that have been done in Malaysia have focused on these temperate species (Awaluddin *et al.*, 2001; Levin *et al.*, 2004) while ignoring the rich biodiversity available in our tropical country.



#### **CHAPTER 2**

#### LITERATURE REVIEW

### 2.1 Production of Synthetic and Azo Dyes by Global and Malaysian Industries

A dye is a chemical that is used to impart colour onto a material and is soluble in some stages during the application process (World Bank Group, 1999). There are more than ten thousand different types of synthetic dyes that are being used by the textile industry throughout the world (Levin *et al.*, 2004) with production exceeding 700 000 metric tones annually (Toh *et al.*, 2003).

The main synthetic dye producers of the world are China, India, Russia, Eastern Europe, South Korea and Taiwan with China producing the largest amount of dyes at 200 000 metric tones annually (Wesenberg *et al.*, 2003). In 1999, the total global dye production is valued at USD 6.6 billion with Asia as the largest dyestuff market at 42 % of the total market (Wesenberg *et al.*, 2003). Out of this percentage, 60 to 70 % of the total dyes produced globally are from the azo dyes group (Pinhiero *et al.*, 2004), thus making this class of dye environmentally significant. Azo dyes are used by the textile, printing, leather, papermaking, drug and food industries due to its ease of manufacture, relatively non-toxic in their original chemical form, stability to degradation by light, temperature, detergents, oxidizers and microbial attack (Torres *et al.*, 2003; Wesenberg *et al.*, 2003).

