



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**MICROBIAL RISK ASSESSMENT OF THERMOPHILIC
CAMPYLOBACTER SPP. IN RAW VEGETABLES FROM FARM TO
TABLE**

CHAI LAY CHING

T FSTM 2008 5



**MICROBIAL RISK ASSESSMENT OF THERMOPHILIC
CAMPYLOBACTER SPP. IN RAW VEGETABLES FROM FARM TO
TABLE**

By

CHAI LAY CHING

**Thesis submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra
Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of
Philosophy**

August 2008



**Dedicated to my late father and my beloved family for their endless love
and support**



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**MICROBIAL RISK ASSESSMENT OF THERMOPHILIC
CAMPYLOBACTER SPP. IN RAW VEGETABLES FROM FARM TO
TABLE**

By

CHAI LAY CHING

August 2008

Chairman: Associate Professor Fatimah Abu Bakar, PhD

Faculty: Food Science and Technology

The first aim of this study was to determine the prevalence and number of thermophilic *Campylobacter* spp. (*Campylobacter jejuni*, *Campylobacter coli* and *Campylobacter fetus*) in raw vegetables (ulam) at pre-harvest and retail level, soil and animal manure in an organic and a traditional vegetable farm. The biosafety of *Campylobacter jejuni* was assessed by phenotypic (antibiotic resistance) and genotypic (presence of virulent and toxin genes) as well as RAPD-PCR characteristics of the strains isolated from vegetables. A kitchen simulation study was conducted to provide decontamination and cross-contamination data and information for estimation of the risk of acquiring campylobacteriosis from consumption of ulam using a step-wise risk assessment.



The prevalence of thermophilic *Campylobacter* spp. in 309 (number of samples) raw vegetables purchased from two supermarkets and a wet market was relatively high, 29% to 68%. *Campylobacter jejuni* (25.5% to 67.7%) and *C. coli* (21.6% to 65.7%) were predominant species isolated; while *C. fetus* was only detected in two samples (1.9%) from one of the supermarkets. Only 18.3% of *Campylobacter*-MPN-PCR positive samples were recovered by enumeration-plating method indicating that routine enumeration-plating methods has very low recovery rate for *Campylobacter* spp. from vegetables.

The study was extended to investigate the level of contamination with *Campylobacter* spp. in vegetables farms. A total of 172 samples of animal manure (n=18), soil (n=60), irrigation water (n=45) and vegetables (n=49) samples were collected from both an organic and a conventional vegetable farm. The organic vegetable farm (20.5%) was found to have a higher prevalence of *Campylobacter* spp. compared to the vegetable farm practicing conventional farming (2%). The low contamination level in the conventional farm was most probably due to the bed-burning practice and the use of composted manure in the farm. *Campylobacter coli* was not detected in all the samples from both farms. Soil (30.4%) and animal manure (57.1%) sampled

from the organic vegetable farm were found to harbor *Campylobacter* spp. and *C. jejuni*. However, none of the irrigation water samples examined from both farms were positive for *Campylobacter* spp.

RAPD-PCR fingerprinting and antibiotic resistance profiling indicated that multi-resistant *Campylobacter* spp. might be wide-spread in the study area. Clustering of *C. jejuni* isolates based on RAPD-PCR profiles suggested that some isolates from different sources and locations were genotypically closely related. Clusters A2, A3, A5 and A6 comprised *C. jejuni* strains isolated from raw vegetables in the supermarkets and a wet market. All clusters including B1 and B3, which comprised strains only from supermarkets, were actually consisted of isolates from different sources. The isolates showed multi-resistance to as many as 10 antibiotics tested. All the isolates were detected to carry the virulent genes, *cadF*, *ceuE* and *flaA*. However, toxin genes detection indicated only 16.1% and 10.7% of the isolates carry *cdtB* and *cdtC* toxin genes, respectively; while none of the isolates carry *cdtA* gene.

The potential of raw salad vegetables as a vehicle in *C. jejuni* transmission was demonstrated by a step-wise risk assessment. Based on the

assumptions used in the step-wise risk assessment, the annual number of cases of campylobacteriosis acquired from the consumption of ulam is estimated to be 4992/100,000 of Malaysian population, assuming that 10% of *Campylobacter* spp. infection translates into illness. However, the risk estimate was predicted to reduce to 175/100,000 if an extra blanching step was incorporated into the model. In conclusion, there is an immediate need for further investigation to look into the wide-spread problem of *Campylobacter* spp. in ready-to-eat foods, such as salad and ulam, in Malaysia.

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Falsafah Kedoktoran

BIO-KESELAMATAN TERMOFILIK *CAMPYLOBACTER* SPP. DALAM SAYURAN MENTAH DARI KEBUN KE PEMAKANAN

Oleh

CHAI LAY CHING

Ogos 2008

Chairman: Profesor Madya Fatimah Abu Bakar, PhD

Faculty: Sains dan Teknologi Makanan

Matlamat utama kajian ini adalah untuk menentukan prevalens dan kuantiti termofilik *Campylobacter* spp. (*Campylobacter jejuni*, *Campylobacter coli* dan *Campylobacter fetus*) dalam sayuran mentah (ulam) pada tahap pra-penuaian dan jualan, tanah dan baja haiwan dari sebuah kebun sayur organik dan sebuah kebun sayur tradisi. Bio-keselamatan *Campylobacter jejuni* juga dikaji dengan pencirian fenotipik (kerintang antibiotik) dan genotipik (kehadiran gen virulen dan toksin) dan juga pencirian RAPD-PCR bagi pencilan-pencilan yang diperolehi dari sayuran. Suatu kajian simulasi dalam dapur telah pun dijalankan untuk mendapat data dan informasi mengenai nyah-kontaminasi dan kontaminasi semula bagi anggaran risiko

dijangkiti kamylobakteriosis dengan makan ulam dengan menggunakan kajian risiko berperingkat (step-wise risk assessment).

Prevalens termofilik *Campylobacter* spp. dalam 309 (jumlah sampel) sayuran mentah yang dibeli dari dua pasar raya dan satu pasar borong tempatan adalah amat tinggi, 29% ke 68%. *Campylobacter jejuni* (25.5 ke 67.7%) dan *C. coli* (21.6% ke 65.7%) adalah spesies dominant yang dipencil, manakala *C. fetus* hanya dijumpai dalam dua sampel (1.9%) dari salah satu pasar raya sahaja. Hanya sebanyak 18.3% *Campylobacter* MPN-PCR positif sampel dapat dikesan positif bagi *Campylobacter* spp. dengan cara “enumeration-plating” dan ini menunjukkan bahawa kadar pengesanan *Campylobacter* spp. dalam sayuran dengan cara “enumeration-plating” adalah sangat rendah.

Kajian ini dilanjutkan untuk menyiasat tahap kontaminasi di kebun-kebun sayur dengan *Campylobacter* spp. Sebanyak 172 sampel yang terdiri daripada baja haiwan (n=18), tanah (n=60), pengairan (n=45) dan sayuran (n=49) telah dikutip dari sebuah kebun sayur organik dan sebuah kebun sayur tradisi. Kebun sayur organik (20.5%) telah didapati mempunyai prevalens *Campylobacter* spp. yang lebih tinggi berbanding dengan kebun sayur yang mempraktik perkebunan tradisi (2%). Tahap kontaminasi yang rendah di

kebun sayur tradisi kemungkinan besar disebabkan oleh pengamalan kaedah “bed-burning” dan penggunaan baja kompos di kebun. *C. coli* tidak dijumpai dalam sampel-sampel dari kedua-dua kebun sayur. Tanah (30.4%) dan baja haiwan (57.1%) dari kebun sayur organik telah didapati membawa *Campylobacter* spp. dan *C. jejuni*. Walaubagaimana pun, tiada satu pun sampel pengairan dari kedua-dua kebun yang dikaji didapati positif bagi *Campylobacter* spp.

RAPD-PCR dan profil kerintangan antibiotik menunjukkan bahawa multi-rintangan *Campylobacter* spp. kemungkinan mempunyai sebaran luas di kawasan kajian. Pencilan *C. jejuni* telah menunjukkan multi-rintangan kepada sebanyak 10 antibiotik yang diuji. Kelompokan *C. jejuni* berdasarkan RAPD-PCR profil mencadangkan bahawa sebahagian daripada pencilan dari pelbagai sumber and lokasi adalah genotipik berkait rapat. Kelompok A2, A3, A5 dan A6 terdiri daripada pencilan *C. jejuni* yang didapati dari pasar raya dan pasar borong. Semua kelompok termasuk B1 dan B3, yang mana terdiri daripada hanya pencilan dari pasar raya tetapi dari sumber yang lain. Semua pencilan-pencilan didapati membawa gen virulen, *cadF*, *ceuE* dan *flaA*. Walaupun demikian, pengesanan gen tosin hanya menunjukkan sebanyak 16.1% dan 10.7% daripada pencilan tersebut

masing-masing mengandung gen toksin *cdtB* dan *cdtC*. Tiada pencilan yang membawa gen *cdtA*.

Potensi sayuran mentah sebagai pembawa *C. jejuni* dalam penyebaran penyakit telah ditunjukkan dengan menggunakan kajian risiko berperingkat (step-wise risk assessment). Dengan merujuk kepada andaian yang digunakan dalam kajian risiko berperingkat (step-wise risk assessment) ini, jumlah kes kamylobakteriosis akibat memakan ulam dianggar sebanyak 4992/100,000 daripada populasi Malaysia, jika hanya 10% daripada jangkitan *Campylobacter* spp. terjemah kepada penyakit. Walaubagaimana pun, anggaran risiko ini dapat diturunkan kepada 175/100,000 jika langkah merebus ditambah kepada model. Sebagai kesimpulan, penyasatan lanjutan adalah amat diperlukan untuk meneliti masalah penyebaran luas *Campylobacter* spp. dalam makanan-sedia-dimakan, seperti salad dan ulam, di Malaysia.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to dedicate my heartfelt thanks to Associate Professor Dr. Fatimah Abu Bakar, the chairman of my supervisory committee for the continuous support and guidance throughout my study. Thank you very much for the advice and encouragement, which help me to finish my study.

My deepest appreciation goes to Professor Dr. Son Radu. I always feel lucky to have you as my co-supervisor. I have never felt so grateful. Your encouragement, advice and cares have supported me to go through all the difficulties during my study. I have learnt from you not only on how to become a good scientist, but also on how to become a better person! No words in this world could express my gratefulness to you. Thank you so much!

A million thanks to Dr. Farinazleen Mohamad Ghazali, my co-supervisor. She is a very nice person who is always willing to listen to students and give appropriate advice, which I found really helpful. Thank you so much for your trust, love and kindness. It will remain forever in my heart.



My gratitude also goes to Dr. Pradeep Kumar Malakar as my co-supervisor, who has given me endless advice and support in my study. Thank you so much for your guidance and patience.

I would also like to say thank you to all of my dearest friends and lab mates (Natasha, Tunung, Sam, Chui Mei, Abbie, Margaret, John, Zarrul, Zach and Indah). Thank you Natasha, especially, for being such a good friend of mine. You wouldn't know how grateful I am to get to know all of you. All of you have enlightened my life. Without you, I think the days during my study would be very dull and boring. I will always remember the laughters, jokes and sweet memories with all of you!!!

A thousand heartfelt thanks to my late father. Although you are not with us anymore, I know that you are still watching us from the heaven. I can still feel your love for us. Dad, thank you so much for your advice and teaching when I was young. I always hold strong to your philosophy of life "Nothing is impossible in life and never give up until you solve the problem". I will never forget what I have promised you before you left and I will achieve it very soon!



Also, to my mother, without your support and understanding, I will never have moved this far in my life. Thank you for your endless love and support for me. I love you so much! Special thanks to my sisters too, for supporting me morally, for listening to my problems, for accompanying me burning the midnight oil, and for everything. I love you all!



I certify that an Examination Committee has met on 22th August 2008 to conduct the final examination of Chai Lay Ching on her Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled "Microbial Risk Assessment of Thermophilic *Campylobacter* spp. in Raw Vegetables from Farm to Table" in accordance with Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Act 1980 and Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Regulations 1981. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Examination Committee were as follows:

Jinap Selamat, PhD

Professor
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Saleha Abdul Aziz, PhD

Professor
Faculty of Veterinary Medicine
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Noorjahan Banu Mohamed Alitheen, PhD

Lecturer
Faculty of Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Indrani Karunasagar, PhD

Professor
Department of Microbiology
Karnataka Veterinary, Animal and Fisheries Sciences University
(External Examiner)

HASANAH MOHD. GHAZALI, PhD

Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 23 October 2008



This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Fatimah Abu Bakar, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chaiman)

Son Radu, PhD

Professor
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Farinazleen Mohamad Ghazali, PhD

Lecturer
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Pradeep Kumar Malakar, PhD

Risk and Consumer Science
Institute of Food Research
United Kingdom
(Member)

AINI IDERIS, PhD

Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 13 November 2008



DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is nor concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or any other institution.

CHAI LAY CHING

Date: 22 August 2008



TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ABSTRAK	vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	xi
APPROVAL	xiv
DECLARATION	xvi
LIST OF TABLES	xxi
LIST OF FIGURES	xxiv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxvii
CHAPTER	
1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Objectives	4
2 LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 <i>Campylobacter</i>	6
2.1.1 History background	6
2.1.2 Characteristics of <i>Campylobacter</i> species	8
2.1.3 VBNC state of <i>Campylobacter</i>	14
2.1.4 Clinical Manifestation	16
2.1.5 <i>Campylobacter</i> Epidemiology	18
2.1.6 Antibiotic resistance in <i>Campylobacter</i> species	25
2.2 Isolation and identification of <i>Campylobacter</i>	28
2.2.1 Sample Preparation	31
2.2.2 Enumeration protocols	35
2.2.3 Methods for species identification	38
2.2.4 Rapid methods	41
2.3 Typing of <i>Campylobacter</i>	45
2.3.1 Typing methods	49
2.3.2 Molecular typing methods	50
2.4 Microbial contamination in fresh vegetables	52
2.4.1 Ulam (Malaysian Style Salad)	55
2.5 Biosafety	55
2.6 Food safety	56
2.7 Quantitative microbial risk assessment	59



3	PRE-HARVEST EVALUATION OF THERMOPHILIC CAMPYLOBACTER SPP. IN VEGETABLES, SOIL, ANIMAL MANURE AND IRRIGATION WATER	
3.1	Introduction	68
3.2	Materials and methods	72
3.2.1	Sample collection	72
3.2.2	Sample preparation for culturing method	74
3.2.3	Culture method	74
3.2.4	Direct-PCR detection of <i>Campylobacter</i>	76
3.2.5	Most probable number- Polymerase chain reaction (MPN-PCR)	78
3.2.6	Polymerase chain reaction (PCR)	79
3.3	Results	84
3.4	Discussion	89
3.5	Conclusion	95
4	PREVALENCE AND NUMBER OF THERMOPHILIC CAMPYLOBACTER SPP. IN RAW VEGETABLES (ULAM) FROM RETAIL MARKETS	
4.1	Introduction	96
4.2	Materials and methods	99
4.2.1	Sample collection	99
4.2.2	Detection and enumeration of <i>Campylobacter</i>	100
4.2.3	Culture methods	104
4.3	Results	106
4.4	Discussion	114
4.5	Conclusion	117
5	SIMULATION STUDY ON CROSS-CONTAMINATION AND DECONTAMINATION OF <i>CAMPYLOBACTER JEJUNI</i> DURING HANDLING OF CONTAMINATED RAW VEGETABLES IN A DOMESTIC KITCHEN	
5.1	Introduction	118
5.2	Materials and methods	121
5.2.1	Sampling	121
5.2.2	Kitchen simulation	122
5.2.3	Quantification of <i>C. jejuni</i>	125
5.2.4	Data analysis	127
5.3	Results	129



5.4	Discussion	139
5.5	Conclusion	145
6	BIOSAFETY OF <i>CAMPYLOBACTER JEJUNI</i> ISOLATED FROM ULAM BASED ON ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE PROFILING	
6.1	Introduction	147
6.2	Materials and methods	150
6.2.1	<i>Campylobacter jejuni</i> isolates	150
6.2.2	Antimicrobial susceptibility testing	151
6.2.3	Statistical analysis	153
6.3	Results	153
6.4	Discussion	159
6.5	Conclusion	165
7	BIOSAFETY OF <i>CAMPYLOBACTER JEJUNI</i> BASED ON VIRULENT AND TOXIN CHARACTERIZATION AND GENOTYPING	
7.1	Introduction	168
7.2	Materials and methods	172
7.2.1	<i>Campylobacter</i> isolates	172
7.2.2	DNA extraction	172
7.2.3	RAPD reaction	173
7.2.4	Profile analysis	174
7.2.5	Virulent and toxin genes detection	175
7.3	Results	178
7.4	Discussion	183
7.5	Conclusion	186
8	DEMONSTRATION OF THE BIOSAFETY OF <i>CAMPYLOBACTER JEJUNI</i> IN ULAM BY USING A STEP-WISE RISK ASSESSMENT	
8.1	Introduction	187
8.2	Materials and methods	192
8.2.1	Hazard identification	192
8.2.2	Exposure assessment	194
8.2.3	Hazard characterization	196
8.2.4	Risk characterization	199
8.3	Results	200



8.4	Discussion	208
8.5	Conclusion	212
9	GENERAL CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION	213
	REFERENCES	216
	APPENDICES	254
	BIODATA OF STUDENT	264



LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
2.1 Present members of the family <i>Campylobacteraceae</i> (A-D) ^a and related organisms (E).	9
2.2 Typical biochemical reactions of commonly isolated species of thermotolerant campylobacters	39
2.3 Bacterial pathogens isolated from raw vegetables	64
2.4 Examples of pathogens associated with fruits and vegetables involved in outbreaks of foodborne disease	67
3.1 Primer sequences for the amplification of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. and PCR assay conditions	83
3.2 The prevalence (%) of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. in various types of risk factors in an organic vegetables farm determined by using four types of enumerative assays.	86
3.3 The prevalence (%) of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. in various types of risk factors in a traditional vegetables farm determined by using four types of enumerative assays.	87
3.4 Maximum and median most probable number (MPN/g or *MPN/mL) of <i>Campylobacter</i> determined by <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. positive samples of risk factors from an organic and a traditional vegetables farm.	88
4.1 Type of samples tested for the prevalence and counts of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp.	100
4.2 Primer sequences for the amplification of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. and PCR assay conditions	102



4.3	Numbers and percent fractions of samples of raw vegetables obtained from three retail outlets that were positive for <i>Campylobacter</i> spp., <i>C. jejuni</i> , <i>C. coli</i> and/or <i>C. fetus</i> .	109
4.4	Maximum and median most probable numbers (MPN/g) of campylobacters determined for campylobacter positive samples of raw vegetables from three retail outlets.	111
4.5	Numbers and percent fractions of MPN-positive samples from which <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. were recovered by plating on a selective agar.	113
5.1	Decontamination and transfer rates of <i>C. jejuni</i> from naturally contaminated mung bean sprouts during simulated handling of vegetables in domestic kitchen.	135
5.2	Decontamination and transfer rates of <i>C. jejuni</i> from naturally contaminated Indian Pennywort (pegaga) during simulated handling of vegetables in domestic kitchen.	136
5.3	Decontamination and transfer rates of <i>C. jejuni</i> from naturally contaminated winged bean during simulated handling of vegetables in domestic kitchen	137
5.4	Decontamination of <i>C. jejuni</i> on mung bean sprout, Indian Pennywort (pegaga) and winged bean by blanching at 85°C for different duration.	138
6.1	Characterization of <i>Campylobacter jejuni</i> clusters defined in the hierarchic analysis performed with antibiotic resistant profile	157
7.1	Base sequence of oligonucleotide primers	171
7.2	Primer sequences for the amplification of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. and PCR assay conditions	177
7.3	PCR detection of putative virulent and toxin genes in <i>Campylobacter jejuni</i> isolates	179



8.1	Summary of frequency of ulam consumption (per week) and serving size (g) for Malay, Chinese, Indian students and students of other races collected from a simple survey using a questionnaire.	196
8.2	Summary calculations for <i>C. jejuni</i> in raw salad vegetables (ulam) with washing step incorporated	204
8.3	Summary calculations of <i>C. jejuni</i> in raw salad vegetables (ulam) showing the impacts of different vegetable handling practices on the risk estimate.	205
8.4	Scenario for <i>C. jejuni</i> in raw salad vegetables	206



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
2.1 Scanning electron micrograph of <i>Campylobacter jejuni</i> retain on a 0.2 µm membrane filter (Source: Donnison, 2003)	13
2.2 Laboratory confirmed cases of <i>Campylobacter</i> infections in England and Wales were reported to the CDSC (Source: Advisory Committee on the Microbiological Safety of Food, 2005)	20
2.3 Trends in quinolone resistance (in percentage) among <i>Campylobacter</i> from humans (Source: Engberg et al., 2006)	28
2.4 Model food chain indicating the position of a food safety objectives and derived performance objectives (Source: ICMSF, 2005)	63
3.1 Representative electrophoretic gel pictures of <i>Campylobacter jejuni</i> (a), <i>Campylobacter coli</i> (b) and <i>Campylobacter</i> genus detection by PCR (c). Lane M: 100 bp DNA ladder (Vivantis); Lane pos: positive control from WHO; Lane neg: negative control without DNA template; Lane 1 – 5: amplification from positive samples.	82
4.1 Representative amplification of the <i>16S rRNA</i> and <i>hip</i> genes for identification of <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. (genus) and <i>C. jejuni</i> , respectively (a) lanes 1-3: PCR amplicons specific for <i>Campylobacter</i> spp. at 816 bp; Lanes 4-6: PCR amplicons specific for <i>C. jejuni</i> at 735 bp; Lane M: 100-bp DNA ladder. Amplification of the <i>ceuE</i> genes and 16S rRNA for identification of <i>C. coli</i> and <i>C. fetus</i> (b) lanes 1-5: PCR amplicons specific for <i>C. coli</i> at 894 bp; Lanes 7-11: PCR amplicons specific for <i>C. fetus</i> at 554 bp; Lane M: 100-bp DNA ladder; lane 6 and 12: negative control.	108