UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

EFFECTS OF TASK REASONING DEMAND, TASK CONDITION, TYPES OF NEGOTIATION AND REPAIR PRACTICES ON AFFECTIVE VARIABLES, LANGUAGE-RELATED EPISODES, AND WRITTEN OUTPUT

LILLIATI ISMAIL

FPP 2013 19

EFFECTS OF TASK REASONING DEMAND, TASK CONDITION, TYPES OF NEGOTIATION AND REPAIR PRACTICES ON AFFECTIVE VARIABLES, LANGUAGE-RELATED EPISODES, AND WRITTEN OUTPUT

By

LILLIATI ISMAIL

Thesis submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

April 2013

© COPYRIGHT UPM

COPYRIGHT

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia

© COPYRIGHT UPM

Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

EFFECTS OF TASK REASONING DEMAND, TASK CONDITION, TYPES OF NEGOTIATION, AND REPAIR PRACTICES ON AFFECTIVE VARIABLES, LANGUAGE-RELATED EPISODES, AND WRITTEN OUTPUT

By

LILLIATI ISMAIL

April 2013

Chairman: **Associate Professor Arshad Abd. Samad, PhD**

Faculty: **Educational Studies**

Considering the growing interest in task-based language teaching, research that investigates the effects of task complexity on second language (L2) development is needed. Currently, there is insufficient classroom-based research that investigates the language learning outcomes that may occur as a result of engaging in tasks of differing reasoning demands in a variety of task conditions. This study aims to fill in some of the gap by investigating the main and interaction effects of two levels of Task Reasoning Demand (TRD) and individual versus dyadic Task Conditions (TC) on learner perceptions of affective factors, as well as the accuracy and syntactic complexity of learner written output. Also, this study investigated the effects of TRD and types of negotiation (negotiation of form versus negotiation of meaning) on frequency of LREs. In addition, this study investigated the effects of TRD and repair practices (self-

© COPYRIGHT UPM

initiated repair versus other-initiated repair, and self-repair versus other-repair) on the repair outcomes (whether errors were correctly resolved, incorrectly resolved or abandoned).

The study draws on the Noticing Hypothesis (1990), the Output Hypothesis (1995), and the Interaction Hypothesis (1996) to rationalise the use of focus-on-form in a task-based context, while Robinson's Cognition Hypothesis (2007) for task-based language Teaching (TBLT) and Skehan's Trade-off Hypothesis (2009) underpin the use of task complexity variables to influence language production.

The participants were 76 Form six students in a public secondary school in Selangor, Malaysia. Using a quasi-experimental research design incorporating a repeated-measures Latin-square design, participants were randomly assigned to one of four groups. Each group was exposed to all four combinations of the two levels of TRD and two levels of TC, but in different orders. Data were gathered using an affective questionnaire administered after each session, audio-recordings of learner-learner interaction, and learner written output.

The data collected were analysed using descriptive statistics, repeated-measures MANOVA and repeated-measures factorial ANOVAs. Some of the main findings were that both TRD and TC had significant main effects on learner perceptions of affective factors. Also, the number of LREs during negotiation of form was significantly lower during the +TRD task

© COPYRIGHT UPM

compared to the –TRD task. Results also showed beneficial effects of learner repair practices in eliciting correct resolutions of errors during LREs. Finally, both TRD and TC had significant main effects on grammatical accuracy and syntactic complexity. TRD and TC also had a significant interaction effect on syntactic complexity.

The results provided some empirical and theoretical support for Robinson's Cognition Hypothesis (2007) and Skehan's Trade-off Hypothesis (2009). It also highlights the beneficial effects of using learner repair practices in a task-based context. The study also implies that educators should consider the effects of TRD on the frequency of LREs involving negotiation of meaning and negotiation of form when using tasks in the L2 classroom. Finally, the study suggests that, when using tasks in the classroom, educators should consider the effects of TRD and TC on learner affective factors, as well as their effects on grammatical accuracy and syntactic complexity in learner output.

© COPYRIGHT UPM

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

KESAN-KESAN KEPERLUAN KEBOLEHAN MENAAKUL TUGASAN, KONTEKS TUGASAN, JENIS RUNDINGAN, DAN AMALAN PEMBAIKAN TERHADAP PEMBOLEHUBAH AFEKTIF, EPISOD BERKAITAN PENGGUNAAN BAHASA, DAN HASIL PENULISAN

Oleh

LILLIATI ISMAIL

April 2013

Pengerusi: **Profesor Madya Arshad Abd. Samad, PhD**

Fakulti: **Pengajian Pendidikan**

Memandangkan terdapat peningkatan perhatian terhadap penggunaan pengajaran berasaskan tugasan (*task-based language teaching*), kajian tentang kesan-kesan kerumitan tugasan (*task complexity*) terhadap perkembangan penggunaan bahasa kedua diperlukan. Buat masa ini, terdapat kekurangan kajian yang menyelidik hasil pembelajaran apabila pelajar terlibat dalam tugasan-tugasan yang memerlukan tahap penaakulan yang berbeza di dalam konteks permbelajaran yang berbeza. Kajian ini bertujuan menyumbang kepada literatur dengan mengkaji kesan penggunaan dua tahap keperluan penggunaan kebolehan menaakul (TRD) dalam dua konteks iaitu melaksanakan tugasan secara individu atau perbincangan dengan rakan (TC) terhadap factor-faktor afektif. Kajian ini juga mengkaji kesan utama dan interaksi TRD dan TC terhadap hasil penulisan pelajar, khususnya dari segi ketepatan penggunaan tatabahasa dan tahap kerumitan sintaksis. Untuk mengkaji kesan-kesan TRD terhadap

© COPYRIGHT UPM

perbincangan pelajar yang boleh menjurus kepada peluang pembelajaran bahasa kedua, kesan utama dan interaksi TRD dan jenis rundingan terhadap kekerapan episod yang membincangkan penggunaan bahasa (LREs) juga dianalisis. Selain itu, kesan-kesan utama dan interaksi TRD dan praktis pembaikan bahasa (repair practice) terhadap hasil perbincangan LREs juga diukur.

Kajian ini menggunakan Hipotesis *Noticing* (Shmidt, 1990), Hipotesis *Output* (Swain, 1995), dan Hipotesis Interaksi (Long, 1996) sebagai rasional memberikan fokus terhadap tatabahasa (*focus-on-form*) di dalam konteks pengajaran berasaskan tugasan. Manakala, Hipotesis Kognitif (Robinson, 2007) untuk pengajaran berasaskan tugasan dan Hipotesis *Trade-off* (Skehan, 2009) menjadi asas kepada penggunaan pembolehubah kerumitan tugasan untuk mempengaruhi penggunaan bahasa.

Para peserta kajian adalah 76 orang pelajar tingkatan enam di sebuah sekolah menengah harian kerajaan di Selangor, Malaysia. Dengan menggunakan reka bentuk penyelidikan kuasi-eksperimen dengan ukuran berulang *latin-square*, peserta dibahagi secara rawak kepada salah satu daripada empat kumpulan. Setiap kumpulan telah didedahkan kepada kesemua empat kombinasi dua peringkat TRD dan dua peringkat TC, tetapi dalam turutan yang berbeza. Data dikumpul dengan menggunakan soal selidik afektif yang ditadbir selepas setiap sesi, audio-rakaman interaksi pelajar, dan hasil penulisan pelajar.

© COPYRIGHT UPM

Data dianalisis menggunakan statistik deskriptif, ukuran berulang MANOVA dan ukuran berulang faktorial ANOVA. Antara penemuan utama ialah kedua-dua TRD dan TC mempunyai kesan utama yang signifikan pada persepsi pelajar tentang faktor-faktor afektif. Juga, bilangan LREs semasa rundingan tatabahasa adalah jauh lebih rendah semasa tugasan yang mempunyai tahap TRD yang relatif tinggi berbanding dengan tugasan yang mempunyai tahap TRD yang relatif rendah. Keputusan juga menunjukkan kesan positif amalan pembaikan penggunaan bahasa untuk mencapai resolusi yang tepat bagi memperbaiki kesilapan tatabahasa yang berlaku semasa LREs. Akhir sekali, kedua-dua TRD dan TC mempunyai kesan utama yang signifikan terhadap ketepatan tatabahasa dan kerumitan sintaksis. TRD dan TC juga mempunyai kesan interaksi yang signifikan kepada kerumitan sintaksis.

Keputusan memberi sokongan empirik dan teori bagi Hipotesis Kognitif (Robinson, 2007) dan Hipotesis *Trade-off* (Skehan, 2009). Ia juga menunjukkan kesan positif menggunakan amalan pembaikan penggunaan bahasa dalam konteks pengajaran berasaskan tugas. Kajian ini juga menunjukkan bahawa pendidik harus mempertimbangkan kesan TRD pada kekerapan LREs melibatkan rundingan makna dan rundingan tatabahasa apabila menggunakan tugasan-tugasan di dalam kelas. Akhir sekali, kajian ini mencadangkan bahawa, apabila menggunakan tugasan di dalam kelas, pendidik harus mempertimbangkan kesan-kesan TRD dan TC ke atas faktor afektif diri pelajar, serta kesan TRD dan TC terhadap ketepatan tatabahasa dan kerumitan sintaktik dalam hasil penulisan pelajar.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I am grateful to the Almighty Allah for bestowing His blessings upon me and allowing for the completion of this dissertation.

It has been a challenging yet gratifying journey, and I will forever be indebted to the individuals who have helped me reach my destination. My special thanks and appreciation go to the chairman of my supervisory committee, Associate Professor Dr. Arshad Abd. Samad, whose insights and intellectual support have helped me from the early stages of the research until its completion. Without his comments, encouragement and contributions, this research might still be a work in progress. I would also like to express my heartfelt gratitude to the other members of my supervisory committee, Associate Professor Dr. Wong Bee Eng and Dr. Nooreen Noordin. I truly appreciate all their insightful comments, intellectual input, encouragement and guidance. Without their help, I might still be struggling with various issues in the research.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my husband, Encik Mat Rosani bin Hashim, for being so understanding and supportive. Also, I would like to express my appreciation to my parents, En. Ismail bin Bujang and Puan Hadijah bt. Busu, for their encouragement and unwavering support. Thank you so much for believing in me and instilling in me the strength and tenacity to achieve my goals. Also, my thanks go to my wonderful children, Aiman Najmi, Arif Fahmi and Sarah Hanim,

© COPYRIGHT UPM

whose smiles give me all the strength that I need to face life's challenges. They are my true inspiration. My appreciation also goes to my sister and brother, Kak Syafini and Abang Bel, for always being there for me.

My sincere gratitude goes to the Ministry of Education for awarding me a scholarship to pursue my doctoral study. I am also thankful to the Educational Planning and Research Department, Ministry of Education and the Selangor State Education Department for allowing me to conduct this study. My appreciation also goes to the principal, teachers and students of SMK Kepong, Selangor for their support and cooperation during the data collection stage of the study. Last but not least, my heartfelt thanks go to my circle of friends who have helped me, directly or indirectly, throughout the course of this study.

© COPYRIGHT UPM

I certify that an Examination Committee has met on 30 April 2013 to conduct the final examination of Lilliati Ismail on her Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled "Effects of Task Reasoning Demand, Task Condition, Negotiation and Repair Practices on Affective Variables, Language-related Episodes, and Written Output" in accordance with Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Act 1980 and Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Regulations 1981. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Examination Committee were as follows:

Rosnaini binti Mahmud, PhD
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Ain Nadzimah binti Abdullah, PhD
Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Jayakaran a/l A.P. Mukundan, PhD
Professor
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Shawn Loewen, PhD
Associate Professor
College of Arts and Letters
Michigan State University
The United States of America
(External Examiner)

_____

NORITAH OMAR, PhD
Assoc. Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

© COPYRIGHT UPM

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Arshad Abd. Samad, PhD
Associate Professor
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Wong Bee Eng, PhD
Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Nooreen Noordin, PhD
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

_____

BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD
Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

© COPYRIGHT UPM

DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia, or at any other institution.

_____

LILLIATI ISMAIL

Date: 30 APRIL 2013

© COPYRIGHT UPM

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
ABSTRACT		ii
ABSTRAK		v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS		viii
APPROVAL		x
DECLARATION		xii
LIST OF TABLES		xvi
LIST OF FIGURES		xviii
LIST OF APPENDICES		xix
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS		xx
CHAPTER		
1	**INTRODUCTION**	1
	Background of the Study	1
	Task-based Interaction in the L2	4
	The Interactionist and Information-processing Perspectives of L2 Learning	5
	Statement of The Problem	8
	Objectives	10
	Research Questions	12
	Hypotheses	13
	Significance of The Study	15
	Limitations Of The Study	18
	Operational Definitions	22
	Tasks	22
	Focus-on-form Instruction	22
	Language-related Episodes (LREs) and Metatalk	23
	Corrective Feedback	23
	Interlanguage	24
	Task Complexity	25
	Task Reasoning Demand (TRD)	25
	Task Condition (TC)	26
	Dictogloss Task	27
	Opinion-gap Task	27
	Negotiation of Meaning	28
	Negotiation of Form	29
	Self-repair and Other-repair	29
	Self-initiated and Other-initiated Repair	30
	LRE Repair Outcome	30
	Summary	30
2	**REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE**	32
	Introduction	32
	The Place of Grammar in Earlier ESL Teaching	34
	Communicative Language Teaching (CLT)	37
	Definitions of Tasks	42

© COPYRIGHT UPM

Task Complexity: Theoretical Underpinnings 45
Robinson's Cognition Hypothesis and Task Complexity Dimensions 47
Skehan's Trade-off Hypothesis and Task Difficulty Model 50
Focus-On-Form in Task-Based Language Teaching (TBLT) 54
Repair Practices in Learner-Learner Interaction 66
Input, Noticing and Interaction: Theoretical Underpinnings 69
Swain's Output Hypothesis 69
Schmidt's Noticing Hypothesis 71
Long's Interaction Hypothesis 75
Recent Studies on the Relationship between LREs and L2 Learning 77
Recent Studies on the Relationship between Task Complexity and L2 Learning 85
The Dictogloss Task and L2 Learning 96
The Opinion-Gap Task and L2 Learning 99
Conceptual Framework 101
Summary 104

3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 105
Introduction 105
Operationalisation of Task Complexity as Task Reasoning Demand (TRD), the Opinion-gap Task as +TRD, and the Dictogloss Task as -TRD 106
Operationalisation of Task Condition (TC) as Individual versus Dyadic TC 111
Individual versus Dyadic (Two-way) 111
Open versus Closed Tasks 113
Convergent versus Divergent Goals 114
The Quasi-experimental Research Design 115
The Repeated-measures Latin-square Design 116
Interaction-based Research 119
Participants 122
Instrumentation and Scoring 124
Tasks 125
The Dictogloss Task (-TRD) 127
The Opinion-gap Task (+TRD) 128
Questionnaire 130
Validity 132
Internal Validity 134
Pilot Study 136
Procedure for Data Collection 138
Data Analysis 138
Research Question 1 138
Research Question 2 141
Research Question 3 142
Research Question 4 144

© COPYRIGHT UPM

	Research Questions 5 and 6	145
	Preliminary Examination of Data	150
	Inter-rater Reliability	150
	Data Screening and Cleaning	154
	Summary	163
4	**DATA ANALYSIS**	164
	Introduction	164
	The Effects of TRD and Dyadic versus Individual TC on Learner Affective Perceptions	165
	The Effects of TRD and Types Of Negotiation on Frequency of LREs	173
	The Effects of TRD and Repair Practices on LRE Outcomes	176
	TRD and Grammatical Focus	185
	The Effects of TRD and Dyadic versus Individual TC on Grammatical Accuracy	192
	The Effects of TRD and Dyadic versus Individual TC on Syntactic Complexity	196
	Summary	199
5	**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**	202
	Introduction	202
	Hypotheses Testing	203
	Hypothesis 1	203
	Hypothesis 2	207
	Hypothesis 3	210
	Hypothesis 4	212
	Hypothesis 5	213
	Hypothesis 6	217
	Theoretical Implications	223
	Pedagogical Implications	227
	Suggestions for Future Research	240
	Conclusion	244
REFERENCES		249
APPENDICES		264
BIODATA OF STUDENT		287

© COPYRIGHT UPM