EFFECTS OF TEXTUAL GLOSSES ON TEXT COMPREHENSION, VOCABULARY GAIN AND VOCABULARY RETENTION AMONG TERTIARY LEVEL PERSIAN-SPEAKING ESL LEARNERS

FOROOGH AZARI

FBMK 2013 22
EFFECTS OF TEXTUAL GLOSSES ON TEXT COMPREHENSION, VOCABULARY GAIN AND VOCABULARY RETENTION AMONG TERTIARY LEVEL PERSIAN-SPEAKING ESL LEARNERS

By

FOROOGH AZARI

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

June 2013
COPYRIGHT

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright©Universiti Putra Malaysia
DEDICATION

To my husband, for his understanding, support, and patience in this long journey, my lovely son, Danial, who has traveled to Malaysia for me and for some time has missed part of the parental care he deserves, and to my mother and sister for their continuous moral support.
EFFECTS OF TEXTUAL GLOSSES ON TEXT COMPREHENSION, VOCABULARY GAIN AND VOCABULARY RETENTION AMONG TERTIARY LEVEL PERSIAN-SPEAKING ESL LEARNERS

By

FOROOGH AZARI

June 2013

Chair: Assoc. Prof. Mohd Faiz Sathivelu Abdullah, PhD

Faculty: Modern Languages and Communication

The present study investigated the effects of textual glosses on reading comprehension and vocabulary learning among tertiary level Persian-speaking ESL learners. In the present quasi-experimental research, 76 postgraduate ESL students at UPM who had attained similar scores in a standardized reading test were divided into four groups randomly before they attempted a pre-test and read six authentic texts under one of four conditions: L1 gloss, L2 gloss, L1 and L2 gloss, and no gloss. After reading each text, the students were asked to write recall protocols based on what they remembered about the text. After a period of five weeks, an immediate post-test as well as a (subsequent) delayed post-test were administered to assess students’ vocabulary gain and vocabulary retention in terms of the 30 target words.
The results revealed that participants in the experimental (L1 gloss, L2 gloss, and L1 and L2 gloss) groups outperformed those in the control (no gloss) group in text comprehension, but the recall protocol scores obtained by the gloss groups were not significantly different statistically. Furthermore, the results revealed that the combination of L1 and L2 gloss was the most effective gloss condition in enhancing vocabulary gain and vocabulary retention, followed by L1 gloss, and L2 gloss. However, exploratory attempts to correlate reading motivation type with text comprehension, vocabulary gain, and vocabulary retention produced a mixed bag of positive and negative relationships between these variables of interest under certain gloss conditions, thereby indicating a need for further study.

In the qualitative phase of the study, the analysis of online interviews revealed that the majority of the participants in experimental and control groups preferred to read glossed texts to non-glossed texts. Most of the participants declared that they preferred not to refer to a dictionary since it was time-consuming, difficult, and boring and they could not enjoy reading when they had to regularly look up words in this way. The participants who read the glossed texts had a positive attitude toward the reading activity. The participants in the experimental groups also reported that they preferred to read L1 and L2 glossed texts, L1 glossed texts, and L2 glossed texts, in that order of preference. Furthermore, the majority of participants in the experimental groups indicated that they tended to continue reading outside the English class while the subjects in control group were not motivated to do so.

Overall, the results of the present study were deemed to provide further support to the findings of previous studies in the area of incidental vocabulary acquisition through reading in addition to providing some validation to Schmidt’s (1990)
noticing hypothesis, Anderson’s (1984) schema theory, and Paivio’s (1991) dual coding hypothesis. The study therefore concluded that the provision of textual glosses does indeed enhance reading comprehension and acquisition of vocabulary knowledge of second language learners. Furthermore, the results of this study revealed that even relatively complex reading passages enhanced by the provision of L1 gloss, L2 gloss, or L1 and L2 gloss can be assigned to tertiary level ESL/EFL learners to help them become efficient readers and motivate them to continue reading independently outside their English class.
Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

KESAN GLOS TEKS TERHADAP PEMAHAMAN PEMBACAAAN, PERTAMBAHAN KOSA KATA, SERTA INGATAN KOSA KATA DALAM KALANGAN PELAJAR PENDUR FARSI BAHASA INGERIS SEBAGAI BAHASA KEDUA DI PERINGKAT TINGGI

Oleh

FOROOGH AZARI

June 2013

Pengerusi: Profesor Madya Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah, PhD
Faculti: Bahasa dan Moden Communikasi

Kajian ini menyelidiki kesan glos teks terhadap pemahaman pembacaan dan pembelajaran kosa kata dalam kalangan pelajar Bahasa Inggeris Sebagai Bahasa Asing (yakni, English as a Second Language, atau ESL) diperingkat pengajian tinggi. Dalam penyelidikan bercorak kuasi-eksperimen ini, seramai 76 pelajar pascasiswa ESL di UPM yang telah mencapai skor yang sama dalam ujian bacaan dibahagi kepada empat kumpulan secara rawak sebelum mereka menduduki praujian dan seterusnya membaca enam teks asli di bawah salah satu daripada empat keadaan: glos L1 (bahasa pertama) , glos L2 (bahasa kedua), glos L1 dan L2, dan tanpa glos. Selepas membaca setiap teks tersebut, mereka diminta untuk menulis protokol ingat kembali berdasarkan teks bacaan tadi. Selepas lima minggu, pelajar diberikan pula pascaujian serta merta dan (seterusnya) pascaujian terlewat untuk menilai
pertambahan kosa kata serta ingatan kosa kata pelajar daripada segi 30 perkataan sasaran.

Hasil kajian menunjukkan bahawa peserta dalam kumpulan eksperimen (glos L1, glos L2, dan glos L1 dan L2) mengatasi prestasi pelajar dalam kumpulan kawalan (tanpa glos) dalam pemahaman teks, tetapi skor protocol ingat kembali yang diperolehi oleh kumpulan-kumpulan glos tidak menunjukkan perbezaan signifikan secara statistik. Tambahan pula, keputusan menunjukkan bahawa gabungan glos L1 dan L2 merupakan keadaan glos yang paling berkesan dalam meningkatkan pemerolehan dan pengekalan kosa kata, diikuti oleh glos L1, dan glos L2. Namun begitu, usaha tinjauan untuk menghubungkaitkan jenis motivasi membaca dengan kefahaman pembacaan, pemerolehan kosa kata, serta ingatan kosa kata menghasilkan korelasi positif dan negative yang bercampuraduk antara pemboleh ubah berkenaan di bawah keadaan glos yang tertentu, dan seterusnya menunjukkan bahawa aspek ini perlu dikaji dengan lebih lanjut.

Dalam fasa kualitatif kajian ini, analisis transkrip temubual secara atas talian jelas menunjukkan bahawa majoriti peserta dalam kumpulan eksperimen dan kumpulan kawalan lebih suka untuk membaca teks yang mengandungi glos daripada teks tanpa gloss. Kebanyakan peserta menyatakan bahawa mereka lebih suka untuk tidak merujuk kepada kamus kerana ia memakan masa, sukar dan membosankan di samping mereka tidak dapat memahami pembacaan kerana terpaksa mencari makna perkataan. Peserta yang membaca glos teks didapati mempunyai sikap yang positif terhadap aktiviti membaca. Peserta-peserta dalam kumpulan eksperimen juga menyatakan bahawa mereka lebih suka membaca teks dengan glos L1 dan L2, glos L1, dan glos L2, mengikut keutamaan seperti ini. Tambahan pula, majoriti peserta
dalam kumpulan eksperimen menunjukkan bahawa mereka cenderung untuk terus membaca di luar kelas bahasa Inggeris mereka manakala subjek dalam kumpulan kawalan tidak mendorong mereka untuk berbuat demikian.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

At the end of this rewarding process of preparing my dissertation, it is my responsibility to duly appreciate those people who helped me reach my goal. First and foremost, I am indebted to the members of my supervisory committee. I am extremely thankful to my supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah who supported me with all inspiration and encouraged me to produce this academic dissertation. Dr. Faiz always provided me with enlightening comments and constructive advice. I would also like to appreciate Professor Dr. Chan Swee Heng and Associate Professor Dr. Tan Bee Hoon whose expertise and support motivated me to advance in this long process. Furthermore, Dr. Vijay Kumar, the coordinator of TEP classes helped me a lot in data collection procedure. My deepest appreciation for him and friendly TEP lecturers is beyond words.
I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 4th June 2013 to conduct the final examination of Foroogh Azari on her thesis entitled “Effects of Textual Glosses on Text Comprehension, Vocabulary Gain and Vocabulary Retention Among Tertiary Level Persian-Speaking ESL Learners” in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U. (A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Member of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

**Wan Roselezam Binti Wan Yahya, PhD**
Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

**Ain Nadzimah Abdullah, PhD**
Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

**Rosli Talif, PhD**
 Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

**Tahereh Sima Paribakht, PhD**
Professor
Faculty of Arts Official Languages and Bilingualism Institute
University of Ottawa
Canada
(External Examiner)

---

**BUJANG KIM HUAT, PhD**
Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

**Date:**
This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Chan Swee Heng, PhD**  
Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Tan Bee Hoon, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

______________________________  
BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD  
Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  

Date:
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declared that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or at any other institution.

__________________________________________________________
FOROOGH AZARI

Date: 4 June 2013
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPROVAL</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>xxii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER

1 **INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Background to the Study 1
1.2 Statement of the Problem 3
1.3 Purpose and Scope of the Study 7
1.4 Research Questions 8
1.5 Research Hypotheses 12
1.6 Theoretical Framework 14
1.7 Conceptual Framework 22
1.8 Definition of Key Terms 25
1.9 Limitations of the Study 28
1.10 Significance of the Study 29

2 **LITERATURE REVIEW**

2.1 Introduction 33
2.2 Malaysia as an ESL Setting 33
2.3 Models of the EFL/ESL Reading Process 34
2.4 Psycholinguistic Effects of Bilingualized Representation of Word Definitions and Meaning 37
2.5 Different Ways of Vocabulary Learning 40
2.6 Problems of EFL Learners in Vocabulary Learning 48
2.7 Text Glosses in Reading 49
  2.7.1 Glossing and Text Enhancement 49
  2.7.2 Rationale for Using Glosses in Reading Texts 51
  2.7.3 Advantages and Benefits of Glossing 53
  2.7.4 Different Types of Glossing 54
  2.7.5 Roby’s Taxonomy of Glosses 56
  2.7.6 Effects of Glossing on Text Comprehension 58
  2.7.7 Effects of Glossing on Vocabulary Learning 79

xiv
2.8 Second Language Reading, Motivation, and Attitude
   2.8.1 Second Language Learner’s Motivation Types
   2.8.2 Previous Studies on ESL/EFL Learners’ Reading Motivation, Attitudes, and Preferences

3 METHODOLOGY
  3.1 Research Approach and Design
     3.1.1 Experimental Design
     3.1.2 Variables of the Study
  3.2 Participants of the Study
  3.3 Informed Consent Form
  3.4 Research Questions
  3.5 Materials
     3.5.1 Selection of Reading
     3.5.2 Text Readability Scores
     3.5.3 Selection of Target Words
     3.5.4 Reading Glosses
  3.6 Measurement Instruments
     3.6.1 Reading Test
     3.6.2 Vocabulary Pre-Test
     3.6.3 Immediate Post-Test
     3.6.4 Delayed Post-Test
     3.6.5 Recall Protocols
     3.6.6 Background Questionnaire
     3.6.7 Post-Reading Questionnaire
     3.6.8 Exit Questionnaire
     3.6.9 Post-Reading and Exit Questionnaire for the Control Group
     3.6.10 Interviews
  3.7 Rationale and Treatment
  3.8 Data Collection
  3.9 Data Analysis
  3.10 Reliability and Validity
  3.11 Pilot Study

4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
  4.1 Introduction
  4.2 Participants’ Demographic Information
  4.3 Quantitative Phase of Study
     4.3.1 Performance Differences in Text Comprehension
     4.3.2 Performance Differences in Vocabulary Gain
     4.3.3 Performance Differences in Vocabulary Retention
     4.3.4 Performance Differences across Motivation Types in Text
  4.4 Synoptic Discussion on Quantitative Results
     4.4.1 Effect of Textual Glosses on Text Comprehension
     4.4.2 Effect of Textual Glosses on Vocabulary Gain
     4.4.3 Effect of Textual Glosses on Vocabulary Retention
     4.4.4 Relationship between Motivation Type and Performance
4.5 Qualitative Phase of Study  212
4.6 Synoptic Discussion on Qualitative Results  224

5 CONCLUSION  227
5.1 Summary of the Project  227
5.2 Major Findings  229
5.3 Implications of the Study  234
5.4 Recommendations for Further Studies  236

REFERENCES  238
APPENDICES  257
BIODATA OF STUDENT  358
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS  359