UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

IMPACT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE AND EARNINGS MANAGEMENT ON VALUE RELEVANCE OF ACCOUNTING METRICS

CHANG CHEE FEI

GSM 2011 7
IMPACT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE AND EARNINGS MANAGEMENT ON VALUE RELEVANCE OF ACCOUNTING METRICS

By

CHANG CHEE FEI

Thesis Submitted to the Graduate School of Management, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

July 2011
The growing incidence of corporate failures has significantly reduced shareholder wealth and pension funds, and caused financial crisis in many economic powerhouses and the emerging markets. Regulators point out that these failures are attributed to accounting scandals and mismanagement driven by managerial opportunism. Besides fraud and conspiracy, the causes of such failures are not exceptional; misinvestments, breaches in governance control and creative (or even imaginative) accounting which threatens the reliability and usefulness of accounting information in controlling and monitoring management efficacy and safeguarding shareholder interest. Following these corporate failures, relevant authorities have implemented a series of radical reforms to restore investors’ confidence. For instance, the development of corporate governance codes and practices, amendments to the securities law and convergence of international accounting standards in Malaysia after the 1997-1998 economic crisis. This study examines the impact of corporate governance and income smoothing incident on the reliability of accounting metrics available from the published financial reports and how the equity market prices these attributes. In addition this study also examines the overall effectiveness of the governance and financial reporting reforms
implemented after crisis by the authorities to improve transparency, financial integrity and value relevance of accounting information.

This study deploys the regression-variation and dynamic portfolio-return models modified from well established theoretical and applied research frameworks in the prior literature. Inferences are drawn from the panel data empirical models as to assess the informativeness of accounting metrics under different specifications (e.g., economic conditioned-governance/ earnings management extended regressions and factor loading approaches). The sample size of this study covers 323 (317 for return models) firms listed on Bursa Malaysia with complete and continuous 15-year accounting and corporate governance data, and 168-month stock prices (for dynamic portfolio-return model) beginning from 1993 to 2007.

In overall, the inferences from the governance extended specifications and the dynamic portfolio-return model reveal that corporate governance attributes are value-relevant in general. The test results show that governance interacted-accounting metrics are informative, and the association between these metrics and firms’ market prices and returns is statistically significant (price model: summed coefficient = 0.475, p= 0.008; return model: earnings response coefficient = 1.427, p = 0.001). In addition, the test statistics generated from the governance-controlled accounting based portfolio-return model reveal that after the economic crisis, governance control mechanism is empirically relevant to firms’ market risk premium which subsequently determines their market value (coefficient = 0.344, p = 0.000). Likewise, the information content of the accounting metrics produced by firms’ with prevalence earnings management sign is significantly negative after the crisis (price model:
summed coefficient = -0.729, \ p = 0.002; return model: summed coefficient = -0.790, \ p = 0.000), implying that investors are becoming more cautious of accounting fraud in ‘managed earnings’ firms. Similar results are observed in the economic conditioned-earnings management extended dynamic accounting based portfolio-return regression specification.

In many instances, the results from the earnings management extended specifications cohere harmoniously with the inferences from the corporate governance extended value relevance models. These outcomes are perhaps attributable to increased investors’ awareness on the negative impact of managerial opportunistic behaviour, and improved investors’ confidence after the crisis due to the regulatory reform in corporate governance and financial reporting environment. Interestingly, the explanatory power of firm’s book value is gaining more significance after the crisis (economic conditioned-extended price model: coefficient = 0.172, \ p= 0.003). Besides, inferences drawn from firms with low governance control show that accounting earnings relevancy has significantly decreased after the crisis period. This implies that earnings performance is perceived to be less reliable due to potential accounting manipulation, and thus book value is a more prudent alternative measure of firm’s performance.

The results of this study provide reasonable evidence on the effectiveness of the post-crisis reforms in corporate governance and reporting environment implemented by the regulators to improve the reliability and investors’ reliance on firms’ financial performance indicators, and thus might provide insights for regulation and standard setting in the future. Besides, this study reveals the meaningful valuation effect of
managerial opportunism and the importance of ex-ante efficient contracting and ex-post governance control to firms’ reliability of accounting information content and market pricing decision. This study also substantiates empirical procedures to check the robustness of governance and earnings management attributes against accounting metrics reliability and modifications to the regression-variation and dynamic portfolio-return models for corporate governance and earnings management specifications.
Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**IMPAK AMALAN TADBIR URUS KORPORAT DAN PENGURUSAN PEROLEHAN KEPADA KERELEVANAN NILAI METRIK PERAKAUNAN**

Oleh

**CHANG CHEE FEI**

**Julai 2011**

Pengerusi: Profesor Madya Taufiq Hassan Shah Chowdury, PhD

Fakulti: Sekolah Pengajian Siswazah Pengurusan

ini, serta mengukur keberkesanan reformasi yang dilaksanakan oleh pihak berkuasa untuk meningkatkan ketelusan, integriti kewangan dan relevansi maklumat perakaunan selepas krisis tersebut.

Kajian ini menggunakan kaedah regresi-variasi dan juga model pulangan portfolio dinamik yang diubahsuai berlandaskan teori and rangka kerja penyelidikan yang berasal daripada karya lepas. Kesimpulan kajian ini adalah menurut hasil ujian empirik yang diperolehi daripada model-model data panel berasaskan spesifikasi yang berbeza (contohnya, model regresi pengawasan korporat/ pengurusan perolehan lanjutan and muatan faktor). Saiz sampel kajian ini meliputi 323 (317 untuk model pulangan) firma-firma tersenarai di Bursa Malaysia yang dikenal pasti mempunyai maklumat perakaunan dan tadbir urus korporat yang lengkap untuk tempoh 15 tahun, serta data pasaran ekuiti bulanan (untuk model portfolio pulangan dinamik) dari tahun 1993 hingga 2007.

Secara keseluruhannya, hasil-hasil kajian dari spesifikasi model tadbir urus lanjutan dan pulangan portfolio dinamik menunjukkan bahawa ciri-ciri tadbir urus korporat adalah relevan nilai. Keputusan dari model regresi lanjutan menunjukkan bahawa wujudnya kesar interaksi tadbir urus korporat yang signifikan ke atas hubunagan diantara metrik-metrik perakaunan dan nilai pasaran serta pulangan firma (model harga: gubahangan koefisien = 0,475, p = 0.008; model pulangan: koefisien respons perolehan = 1,427 , p = 0.001). Hasil ujian dari model pulangan portfolio dinamik yang berasaskan maklumat perakaunan dan kawalan tadbir urus korporat menunjukkan bahawa selepas krisis ekonomi, mekanisme pengawasan urus tadbir adalah relevan terhadap premium risiko ekuiti sesubah firma yang seterusnya
menentukan nilai pasaran firma tersebut (koefisien = 0,344, p = 0,000). Di samping itu, selepas krisis ekonomi, maklumat perakaunan dipaparkan oleh firma-firma yang mempunyai petanda pengurusan perolehan ketara telah mencatatkan hubungan negatif yang signifikan dengan nilai pasaran firma-firma tersebut (model harga: gabungan koefisien = -0,729, p = 0,002; model pulangan: gabungan koefisien = -0,790 p = 0,000). Ini menunjukkan bahawa pelabur-pelabur menjadi lebih berwaspadanya terhadap kejadian pergurusan perolehan. Hasil-hasil ujian seumpama juga diperolehi dari model pulangan portfolio dinamik yang berspesifikasikan portfolio perakaunan dengan kawalan pengurusan perolehan.

Kebanyakannya hasil ujian dari pelbagai model relevan nilai lanjutan berspesifikasikan pengurusan perolehan dan pengawasan urus tadbir korporat adalah konsisten. Ini mungkin disebabkan oleh peningkatan kesedaran pelabur-pelabur terhadap kesan negatif perilaku oportunistik pihak pengurusan firma, dan keyakinan pelabur-pelabur yang kian puleh akibat reformasi ke atas sistem pengawalseliaan urus tadbir korporat yang seterusnya meningkatkan kesahihan laporan kewangan selepas krisis ekonomi. Selain itu, perhatian harus diberi kepada peningkatan kuasa penjelasan nilai buku firma yang ketara selepas krisis (model harga rentas bahagian berlandaskan keadaan ekonomi: koefisien = 0,172, p = 0,003). Seumpamanya, kerelevanan nilai perolehan perakauan bagi firma-firma yang berkawalan urus tadbir lemah telah menyusut dengan ketara selepas tempoh krisis. Ini menunjukkan bahawa kesahihan aras perolehan berfungsi sebagai pengukur prestasi firma adalah rendah kerana kemungkinan berlakunya manipulasi perakaunan, oleh demikian, nilai buku firma adalah dianggap pengukur alternatif yang lebih tepat dan menyakinkan.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank the Members of my Supervisory Committee, Associate Professor Dr. Taufiq Hassan Shah Chowdury, Associate Professor Dr. Zulkarnain Muhamad Sori and Professor Dr. Shamsher Mohamad Ramadilli Mohd for their invaluable guidance and assistance; especially to Professor Dr. Shamsher Mohamad Ramadilli Mohd who had spent tremendous amount of time reading and correcting my numerous drafts. The completion of this thesis would not have been possible without the suggestions and the help from my Supervisors; thank you again.

Also, I would like to take this opportunity to thank the Members of the Thesis Examination Committee, Professor Dr. Foong Soon Yau, Associate Professor Dr. Cheng Fan Fah, Associate Professor Dr. Wan Nordin Wan-Hussin and Professor Dr. Pamela Kent for their valuable comments, suggestions and advice given to me.

Lastly, I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my wife, Ng May Yee, who is also about to complete her PhD, and my beloved mother, Hee Choi Wai, for their love, understanding, encouragement and moral support.
I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 18 July 2011 to conduct the final examination of Chang Chee Fei on his Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled "Impact of Corporate Governance and Earnings Management on Value Relevance of Accounting Metrics” in accordance with Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy degree. Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Foong Soon Yau, PhD  
Professor  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

Pamela Kent, PhD  
Professor  
Faculty of Business  
Bond University, Australia  
(External Examiner)

Wan Nordin Wan Hussin, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Research and Innovation Management Centre  
Universiti Utara Malaysia  
(External Examiner)

Cheng Fan Fah, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

Taufiq Hassan Shah Chowdury, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Representative of the Supervisory Committee/ Observer)

FOONG SOON YAU, PhD  
Professor/ Deputy Dean  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: x
This thesis submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Taufiq Hassan Shah Chowdury, PhD**
Associate Professor
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

**Shamsher Mohamad Ramadilli Mohd, PhD**
Professor/ Dean
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

**Zulkarnain Muhamad Sori, Phd-D**
Associate Professor
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

---

**ARFAH SALLEH, PhD, FCPA (Aust)**
Professor/ Dean
Graduate School of Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or any other institutions.

CHANG CHEE FEI

Date:
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1.1. The Study of Accounting Informativeness</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.2. The Effect of Governance and Earnings Management Practices on Accounting Value Relevance</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.3. Governance, Income Smoothing Practices and Value Relevance of Accounting Information in Malaysia</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.5. Post-Crisis Reforms in Malaysia</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.6. Problem Statement</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.7. Objectives of the Study</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.8. Justifications of the Study</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.9. Significance of the Study</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.10. Conceptual Framework</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.11. Organisation of the Thesis</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK</td>
<td>2.1. The Value Relevance Literature</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.1.1. Earnings Relevance</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.1.2. Book Value Relevance</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2. Theoretical Framework of Value Relevance Studies</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.1. Explanatory Power of Book Value and Earnings</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.2. Incremental Explanatory Power of Book Value and Earnings</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.3. Short Windows Marginal Information Content Studies</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.4. Price Model versus Return Model of Value Relevance Study</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.4.1 Price Model</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.4.2 Return Model</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2.4.3 Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.3. The Value Relevance of Dirty Vs Clean Surplus Accounting</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.4. The Impacts of Earnings Management and Corporate Governance on Accounting Metrics Value Relevance</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.4.1. The Operationalisation of Corporate Governance Extended Accounting Metrics Value Relevance Study</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.4.1.1 Free Cash Flow</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.4.1.2 Abnormal Capital Expenditures</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.4.1.3 Bonus Plan 65
2.4.1.4 Distress Sign 66
2.4.1.5 Financial Leverage 67
2.4.1.6 Firm Size 68
2.4.1.7 Ownership Concentration and Managerial Ownership 68
2.4.1.8 Board Size 69
2.4.1.9 Audit Committee and Independence of the Committee Members 70

2.4.2 The Operationalisation of Earnings Management Extended Accounting Metrics Value Relevance Study 73
2.4.2.1 Short Term Accounting Accruals 75
2.4.2.2 Non Current Provisions 76
2.4.2.3 Property, Plant and Equipment, and Intangible Assets 78

2.4.3 The Robustness Check on Corporate Governance and Earnings Management Attributes 81

Chapter 3: RESEARCH DESIGN

3.1 Research Design for Accounting Metrics Informativeness 84
3.1.1 The Measure of Accounting Metrics Informativeness 84
3.1.1.1 Regression-Variation: Price Model 86
3.1.1.2 Regression-Variation: Return Model 90
3.1.1.3 Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 94
3.1.2 The Measure of Accounting Reliability – The Estimate of Governance and Earnings Management Attributes Robustness 100

3.2 Corporate Governance-Accounting Metrics Value Relevance Model 106
3.2.1 Robustness Check on Corporate Governance Attributes 107
3.2.2 Validity of Firms’ Governance Strength Classification and Relevance of Governance Attributes – Regression-Variation Model 111
3.2.3 Relevance of Governance Attributes – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 124

3.3 Earnings Management-Accounting Metrics Value Relevance Model 127
3.3.1 Robustness Check on Earnings Management Attributes 133
3.3.2 Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes – Regression-Variation Model 140
3.3.3 Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 143

3.4 The Impacts of Corporate Governance and Earnings Management on Accounting Metrics Value Relevance in Pre and Post ASEAN Financial Crisis 146
3.4.1 Relevance of Governance Attributes Pre, During and Post ASEAN Financial Crisis – Regression-Variation Model 148
3.4.2 Relevance of Governance Attributes Pre, During and Post ASEAN Financial Crisis – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 152
3.4.3 Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes Pre, During and Post ASEAN Financial Crisis – Regression-Variation Model 152
3.4.4 Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes Pre, During and Post ASEAN Financial Crisis – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 156

3.5 Overview of Empirical Tests Procedures 156
3.5.1 Period of Study 157
3.5.2. Sample Selection Process 157
3.5.3. Data Collection 161
3.5.4. Clean Surplus Conversion 161
3.5.5. Diagnostic Tests 163
3.5.6. Balanced Panel Data versus Cross-Sectional or Firm Specific Time-Series 165
3.5.7. Generalised Least Square Regression (GLS) versus Ordinary Least Square Regression (OLS) 166

Chapter 4: THE VALUE RELEVANCE OF ACCOUNTING METRICS - DIRTY VERSUS CLEAN SURPLUS ACCOUNTING

4.1. The Value Relevance of Dirty Versus Clean Surplus Accounting 169
  4.1.1. Dirty Versus Clean Surplus Accounting – Exploratory Statistics 169
  4.1.2. Dirty Versus Clean Surplus Accounting - Hausman’s Test 173
  4.1.3. Dirty Versus Clean Surplus Accounting – Regression-Variation Model 174
  4.1.4. Dirty Versus Clean Surplus Accounting – Summary 177

Chapter 5: THE IMPACT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE ON VALUE RELEVANCE OF ACCOUNTING METRICS

5.1. The Measure of Accounting Reliability – The Estimate of Governance Attributes Robustness 182
  5.1.1. Corporate Governance Attributes – Exploratory Statistics 182
  5.1.2. Corporate Governance Attributes - Hausman’s Test 187
  5.1.3. Robustness Check on Corporate Governance Attributes 189
  5.1.4. Robustness Check on Corporate Governance Attributes – Validity Check on Governance Strength Classification 207
5.2. The Impact of Governance Attributes on Value relevance – Regression-Variation Model 214
5.3. The Impact of Governance Attributes on Value Relevance – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 222
5.4. The Impact of Governance Attributes on Value Relevance – Summary 230

Chapter 6: THE IMPACT OF EARNINGS MANAGEMENT ON VALUE RELEVANCE OF ACCOUNTING METRICS

6.1. The Measure of Accounting Reliability – The Estimate of Earning Management Attributes Robustness 233
  6.1.1. Earnings Management Attributes – Exploratory Statistics 234
  6.1.2. Earnings Management Attributes - Hausman’s Test 236
  6.1.3. Robustness Check on Earnings Management Attributes 238
  6.1.4. Robustness Check on Earnings Management Attributes - Summary 245
6.2. The Impact of Earnings Management Attributes on Value Relevance – Regression-Variation Model 246
6.3. The Impact of Earnings Management Attributes on Value Relevance – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 253
6.4. The Impact of Earnings Management Attributes on Value Relevance – Summary 261
Chapter 7: THE IMPACT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE AND EARNINGS MANAGEMENT ON VALUE RELEVANCE OF ACCOUNTING METRICS IN PRE AND POST ASEAN FINANCIAL CRISIS

7.1. The Value Relevance of Accounting Metrics in Different Economic Conditions 264
7.1.1. The Value Relevance of Corporate Governance Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Price Model 264
7.1.2. The Value Relevance of Corporate Governance Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Return Model 269
7.1.3. The Value Relevance of Corporate Governance Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 274
7.1.4. The Value Relevance of Corporate Governance Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Summary 276
7.1.5. The Value Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Price Model 278
7.1.6. The Value Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Return Model 283
7.1.7. The Value Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes in Different Economic Conditions – Dynamic Portfolio-Return Model 287
7.1.8. The Value Relevance of Earnings Management Attributes in Different Economic Conditions - Summary 289

Chapter 8: CONCLUSION, RECOMMENDATION AND IMPLICATIONS

8.1. Research Objectives 292
8.2. Research Methods 293
8.3. Summary of Hypotheses 296
8.4. Samples Selection 297
8.5. Conclusion 298
8.5.1. The Impact of Governance Attributes on Value Relevance of Accounting Metrics 298
8.5.2. The Impact of Earnings Management Attributes on Value Relevance of Accounting Metrics 301
8.5.3. The Impact of Corporate Governance and Earnings Management Attributes on Value Relevance of Accounting Metrics in Pre, During and Post Crisis Period 304
8.6. Limitations of The Study 313
8.6.1. Internal Validity 314
8.6.2. Construct Validity 319
8.6.3. External Validity 321
8.7. Reliability of Data Collection and Analysis 322
8.8. Recommendation for Further Study 324
8.9. Implications of the Findings 326
8.9.1. Policy Implications 326
8.9.2. Academic Research Implications 329
8.9.3. Practical Implications 330

REFERENCES 332
BIODATA OF CANDIDATE 359