Biomonitoring of Heavy Metals in the West Coastal Waters of Peninsular Malaysia Using the Green-lipped Mussel *Perna viridis*: Present Status and What Next?

*YAP, C. K, ISMAIL, A. & TAN, S. G.*
Department of Biology, Faculty of Science,
Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 UPM, Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia

Keywords: Green-lipped mussel *Perna viridis*, biomonitoring agent, heavy metals

INTRODUCTION

Since the Mussel Watch monitoring approach was initially proposed by Goldberg (1975), the use of the green-lipped mussel *Perna viridis* as a biomonitoring agent for heavy metal pollution studies in the Asia-Pacific coastal waters has been reported in the literature for over a quarter of a century. In the Southeast Asian region, perhaps the earliest reported study was conducted in Thailand’s coastal waters (Menasveta and Cheevaparanpiwat 1981). In Malaysia, the monitoring of contaminant levels in the coastal waters of Penang using Mussel Watch approach was reported in the 1980s (Sivalingam and Bhaskaran 1980; Sivalingam *et al.* 1982; Sivalingam 1985). However, there has been a long absence of reported data using this mussel species until Ismail (1993a) reported the general levels of heavy metals in *P. viridis* from the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia and Din and Jamaliah (1994) reported those from Penang Island. This paper aims to review the papers published in this region and particularly from Malaysia and to discuss the existing knowledge and potential research area for future studies. In this paper, most reported work on *P. viridis* particularly for biomonitoring of contaminants is reviewed from other regions and discussion is focused upon from those reported from Malaysia.

Overview of Biomonitoring Studies Using *Perna viridis* from this Region

The use of *P. viridis* for the biomonitoring studies in the coastal waters has been implemented in
Asia Pacific coastal waters since 1980s (Tanabe 2000; Tanabe et al. 2000; Nicholson and Lam 2005) such as in China (Klumpp et al. 2002), Singapore (Bayen et al. 2004), Hong Kong (Nicholson and Szefer 2003), Malaysia (Ismail et al. 2003; Yap et al. 2003a) and Thailand, Philippines and India (Tanabe et al. 2000). The mussel species has been shown to be a good biomonitoring agent for contaminants such as organochlorines (Klumpp et al. 2002; Monirith et al. 2003; Bayen et al. 2004), butyltin compounds (Kan-atireklap et al. 1997; Fung et al. 2004; Sudaryanto et al. 2004), heavy metals (Wong et al. 2000; Nicholson and Szefer 2003; Yap et al. 2003a; Wang et al. 2004) and polychlorinated biphenyls (Tanabe et al. 1987). Other ecotoxicological studies using *P. viridis* include the uptake and assimilation of metals (Pan and Wang 2004; Wang et al. 2004), feeding behaviors (Wong and Cheung 1999; 2001), DNA strand breakage (Siu et al. 2002), metal exposure studies (Yap et al. 2004a; Shi and Wang 2004) and other physiological studies on its cytological, lysosomal, ecocytological and cardiac responses to metals (Nicholson 1999a, 1999b, 2001, 2003) and biomarkers (Lau and Wong 2003). All the mentioned work implied the importance of biomonitoring studies and *P. viridis* will continue to be used and focused upon for biomonitoring purposes in future.

**WHY Perna Viridis?**

The state of metal pollution on the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia has been assessed by measuring metal levels in 1) sediments (Ismail 1993b; Ismail et al. 1993; Yap et al. 2002a, 2003b, 2003c) and 2) mussels as biomonitoring agents. Based on our work done since 1998, we tested the suitability of *P. viridis* as a biomonitoring agent of heavy metals for Peninsular Malaysia based on the recommended criteria for a good biomonitoring agent (Phillips and Rainbow 1993; Tanabe 2000; Monirith et al. 2003). The eight criteria recommended are given below and the studies done so far to test each criterion are reviewed.

**Criterion 1: Wide Geographical Distribution in the Coastal Waters**

Mussels can easily be found in the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia during our field trip from 1998 to 2004. Background levels of Cd, Cu, Hg, Pb and Zn in the soft tissues of *P. viridis* were found and reported in the literature (Ismail et al. 2000, Yap et al. 2003a, 2003d) and this baseline is very important for future reference.

In April 2004, a survey and sampling was conducted from Tumpat to Mersing off the east coast of Peninsular Malaysia and the green-lipped mussels were found in very small numbers from Tumpat (Kelantan) and Nenasi (Pahang) and relatively high abundance of natural mussel population at Kuala Pontian (Pahang) (Yap et al. 2004b). This confirmed the fact that the abundance of *P. viridis* along the east coast is not as high as that in the west coast of the peninsula. Thus, the geographical distribution of mussel populations in the coastal waters of Peninsular Malaysia is mainly in the west coast, including the Straits of Johore. Since the natural habitats of mussels are found at Kuala Pontian, this information is important for mussel transplantation purpose because the east coast is regarded less contaminated than in the west coast.

**Criterion 2: Sedentary Lifestyle after the Pelagic Lifespan**

The biology of *P. viridis* is interesting since they experience a short (2-3 weeks) period of mobile pelagic larvae in the beginning of their life stage and become non-mobile after their attachment to substrata.

**Criterion 3: Easy Sampling since They Can be Found in Abundance**

Since most mussels can be collected under buoys, nibong poles or hanging ropes by raft (for mariculture sites), they are relatively easy for sampling.

Criteria 2 and 3 can be easily justified based on our field samplings and from the literature.

**Criterion 4: Simple Correlations between the Metal Levels in the Mussels and Those in Their Environments**

For this criterion, Yap et al. (2002b) found that significant (P< 0.05) correlations were observed between Cd in *P. viridis* and Cd in the sediment (EFLE fraction and total Cd), Cu in *P. viridis* and Cu in the sediment (EFLE and 'acid-reducible' fractions and total Cu) and Pb in *P. viridis* and Pb in the sediment ('oxidisable-organic' fraction and total Pb). No significant correlation (P> 0.05) was found between Zn in *P. viridis* and all the sediment geochemical fractions of Zn and total Zn in the sediment.
This indicates that Zn is possibly 'partially regulated' by the soft tissue of *P. viridis*. The results support the use of *P. viridis* as a suitable biomonitoring agent for Cd, Cu and Pb.

**Criterion 5: Easy Identification of the Species due to Low Variability**

We identified *P. viridis* by using morphological characters such as the green colour found specifically on the periphery of the shell and the total absence of the anterior adductor muscle (Siddall 1980). However, the question is 'Are they genetically similar so that the various geographical populations of the mussels can be used as a biomonitoring agent?' By using the isozyme approach, Yap *et al.* (2002c) studied the genetic structures of *P. viridis* collected from the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia and found an interesting phenomenon. From the eight geographical populations studied, fourteen polymorphic loci were observed. The observed mean heterozygosity ranged from 0.108 to 0.334, while the expected mean heterozygosity ranged from 0.133 to 0.301. The populations studied could be divided into two groups by the UPGMA dendrogram based on Nei’s (1978) genetic similarities. The groupings seemed to indicate differentiation into local populations. These results suggested that *P. viridis* had a tendency to split into a number of geographical populations regardless of larval dispersal as a potential agent of gene flow. The mean Fst value of 0.149 indicated that the mussel populations showed a moderate degree of genetic differentiation. However, the mean genetic distance from the study (0.048 ± 0.004) fell within the range of genetic distances between conspecific populations of mussels (0.0-0.14). Therefore, the study supported the use of the local mussel *P. viridis* as a suitable biomonitoring agent for heavy metals (Yap *et al.* 2002d). The range of genetic distance values (0.004-0.091) that were obtained would also serve as baseline data with which results of similar studies in the future can be compared to determine whether genetic divergence of mussel populations from the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia is taking place. At the molecular level, Chua *et al.* (2003) reported that the population genetic structure of the green-lipped mussel *P. viridis* (L.) as indicated by Randomly Amplified Polymorphic (RAPD) molecular markers, was associated with the transplantation of mussels from Johore to Langkawi for mariculture purpose.

**Criterion 6: Capacity to Accumulate Pollutants in the Tissues of the Mussels**

The bioaccumulative properties of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn were investigated. Although marine mussels are generally used as biomonitoring agents of heavy metals, regulative mechanisms of essential metals in the soft tissues of mussels have been reported (Phillips and Rainbow 1993). Earlier, Phillips (1985) and Chan (1988, 1989) studied the potential of *P. viridis* collected from Hong Kong coastal waters as a biomonitor of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn. In Malaysia, Yap *et al.* (2002a, 2003e, 2003f) used similar mussel species for the same purpose but those mussels were collected from the coastal waters of Peninsular Malaysia and they used different methodology to find evidences to prove the suitability of *P. viridis* as a biomonitoring agent of heavy metals.

Yap *et al.* (2003e, 2003f) did ecotoxicological tests on *P. viridis* under laboratory conditions. Different rates of accumulation and depuration of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn in the soft tissues were found and this might be due to different mechanisms for metal binding and regulation. At the end of depuration, Cd levels in the soft tissues of *P. viridis* were 10-30 times higher than those before exposure, while Zn levels in the soft tissues were almost similar to the levels before exposure (Yap *et al.* 2003e). These results indicate that *P. viridis* is a good biomonitoring organism for Cd but Zn levels may be actively regulated. It remains uncertain whether or not *P. viridis* is a good biomonitoring organism of environmental Zn contamination (Yap *et al.* 2003e). The high ratio of maximum to minimum Pb and Cu levels and the similar patterns (although at different rates) of accumulation and depuration in the different soft tissues for Pb and Cu indicate that *P. viridis* is a good biomonitoring organism for Cu and Pb (Yap *et al.* 2003f, 2004a). The conclusion on Cu and Pb was also supported by analysis of field samples collected from contaminated and uncontaminated sites (Yap *et al.* 2003f; Yap *et al.* 2004a). Recently, Yap *et al.* (2005) suggested that crystalline style and metal redistribution in the different soft tissues of *P. viridis* can be used as indicators of Cu and Pb bioavailabilities and contamination in coastal waters.
Criterion 7: They are Tolerant but Relatively Sensitive to Chemical Pollutants

To prove that they are tolerant but sensitive to heavy metal stress, studies on toxicities and tolerances of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn in *P. viridis* were conducted by short-term bioassays using endpoint mortality (Yap *et al.* 2004c). The LC$_{50}$ values for the mussels were 1.53 mg/L for Cd, 0.25 mg/L for Cu, 4.12 mg/L for Pb and 3.20 mg/L for Zn. These LC$_{50}$ values were within the concentration ranges that were reported by other authors who used *P. viridis* as the test organism. Based on these LC$_{50}$ values, the mussel seems to be most sensitive to Cu, followed by Cd, Zn and Pb.

In addition to endpoint mortality, toxicity tests of the effects of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn based on the endpoint filtration rate (FR) of *P. viridis* were also conducted (Yap *et al.* 2003g). Probit analysis was used to calculate the metal concentrations that inhibited 50% of the FR (EC$_{50}$) of the experimental samples when compared to the control samples. For mussels with size ranging from 6.8 cm shell length (at salinity: 26 ppt, temperature: 28°C, pH: 7.87 and dissolved oxygen: 7.10 mg/L), the EC$_{50}$ values were: 0.43 mg/L for Cd, 0.31 mg/L for Cu, 2.81 mg/L for Pb and 1.67 mg/L for Zn. The results suggest that the mussels are most sensitive to Cu, followed by Cd, Zn and Pb. This result agrees well with those that were obtained from the experiment which used mortality as an endpoint as has been mentioned earlier. Yap *et al.* (2004d) found that the smaller size group *P. viridis* is more sensitive, based on lower LC$_{50}$ values, than those of the larger size group mussel.

To enhance our understanding of the sensitivity of *P. viridis* toward heavy metals (Cd and Pb), the relationships between condition index (CI) and accumulated concentrations of Cd and Pb were determined in field samples of *P. viridis* and those under experimental conditions. The field samples included those from uncontaminated and contaminated sites (Yap *et al.* 2002e). In the field samples, significant (P< 0.05) negative relationships between CI and metal concentrations were found. However, the results could also have been due to variations in nutritional state and reproductive status of the mussels. To clarify these uncertainties, an experimental study was conducted and the results agreed with that found in the field samples. Therefore, the results indicated that if the heavy metal levels of the field collected mussels were significantly (P< 0.001) different, the influences caused by the nutritional and reproductive states would be masked by the ecotoxicological effects of heavy metal contamination, provided that mussels with similar size range were selected for the CI determination. The CI can be used to show that *P. viridis* is a sensitive organism to Cd and Pb. This work also showed that the sensitivity of *P. viridis* to Cd and Pb when CI was used as a physiological index. Recently, Al-Barwani *et al.* (2004) found that CI can be used as a physiological index for the reproductive status of *P. viridis*.

Criterion 8: Public Concern from the Health Point of View Since They are a Commercially Important Protein Source

This criterion is important from the public health standpoint. The mussels collected between 1999 and 2001 from the wild and from aquacultural sites, off the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia were analysed for Cd, Cu, Hg, Pb and Zn concentrations and these values were compared to permissible limits from established guidelines for food safety in US, UK, Hong Kong, Australia, China and maximum permissible limits established by Malaysian Food Regulations 1985 (Yap *et al.* 2004e). The concentrations of these heavy metals should result in no acute toxicities of the metals since they were lower than the permissible limits for human consumption. In addition, these metal concentrations were also considered to be low when compared with regional data based on *P. viridis* as a biomonitoring agent. However, the risk would depend on the amount of mussels being consumed daily and weekly.

*Other Studies on Perna viridis*

Apart from the above criteria, related work that can enhance our understanding of the use of *P. viridis* as a biomonitoring agent includes the potential use of the occurrence of shell deformities (Yap *et al.* 2002f) as an indicator, and byssus (Yap *et al.* 2003h) and shell (Yap *et al.* 2003i, 2004f) as better biomonitoring materials of heavy metal contamination in coastal waters. Yap *et al.* (2003h) found that when compared to the soft tissues, the byssus was a more sensitive biomonitoring organ for Zn while it could be a complementary organ for Cd and Pb in the total soft tissues. The potential of the byssus of *P.
viridis to monitor the metal pollution in the coastal waters was shown by Sivalingam et al. (1983). Since the total soft tissue of P. viridis had been reported to have a regulatory mechanism for Zn, the byssus can be used as a biomonitoring organ for the identification of coastal areas exposed to Zn pollution. Our suggestion is supported by the data reported by Nicholson and Szefer (2003) in which the byssus of P. viridis collected from a contaminated site at Kennedy Town of Hong Kong coastal waters accumulated about 3 times higher Zn concentration than that of an uncontaminated site at Kat O.

Apart from the soft tissues and byssus, the hard tissue, the shell of P. viridis, is also shown to be potential as a biomonitoring material of heavy metals (Yap et al. 2003i; Yap et al. 2004f). Yap et al. (2003i) found that the depuration of heavy metals in the shell was not affected by the physiological condition of the mussels. Although Zn could be regulated by the soft tissues, the incorporated Cd, Pb and Zn remained in the shell matrices. The present results supported the use of the total shell of P. viridis as a potential biomonitoring material for long-term contamination by Cd, Pb and Zn. By using correlation analysis between Zn levels in the soft tissue of P. viridis and those in the geochemical fractions of sediments, Yap et al. (2004f) found a higher correlation coefficient of Zn between shells-sediment than those of soft tissues-sediments. Therefore, the mussel shells can be used to monitor Zn pollution in the coastal waters more effectively than the soft tissue of P. viridis. Yap et al. (2004g) also suggested that allozyme polymorphism in P. viridis was a potential biomonitoring tool for heavy metal contamination.

In agreement with Boyden’s formula (1977), Yap et al. (2003j) showed that the plotting of metal content against dry body flesh weight on a double logarithmic basis gave good positive straight lines. It was found that the smaller mussels (lower total soft tissue dry weight) had higher concentrations of Cd, Pb and Zn than the larger ones. Since shell thickness could be considered to be an estimate of the age of the mussel (Yap et al. 2003k), it was also found that the younger mussels accumulated more Cd, Pb and Zn than the older ones. This indicated that P. viridis has a different metabolic strategy for each of the studied metals which may be related to age. Nonetheless, the physiological conditions of the mussels, as indicated by the CI, was found not to be a significant factor affecting the accumulations of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn in the mussel.

What are the Next Endeavors?

All the previous studies have contributed towards the use of P. viridis as a suitable biomonitoring agent of trace toxic contaminant levels in the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia. However, there are still a lot of unknowns to be looked into in the future. A lot of questions arise. We will again look into the previously mentioned criteria one after another and discuss what is still lacking in our knowledge of P. viridis.

For criterion 1, although P. viridis is widely found and distributed in the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia, the decline in spatfalls in certain areas has prompted massive transplantations from high spatfall coastal areas to low spatfall sites. This phenomenon needs further attention. Another question that arises is a) Why are there hardly (although they can still be found) any mussels found naturally in the east coast of Peninsular Malaysia although there have been reports in the literature that they are found in the Gulf of Thailand (Hungspreugs et al. 1984; Sukasem and Tabucanon 1993; Ruangwises and Ruangwises 1998) which is located just above the east coast of the peninsula.

Generally, we think that the topography, water quality, attachment substrates and the big waves of the east coast are factors that limit the growth of P. viridis on the peninsula’s east coast. Therefore, detailed studies to find out the exact reasons for the rarity there should be undertaken.

For criterion 2, its sedentary adulthood is the determinant for the successful survival of P. viridis in coastal waters. This is much related to the attachment properties of the mussel byssus. a) What are the chemicals responsible for the detachment of byssus that would ultimately affect the abundance of mussels in coastal waters? b) What attachment substrates in spat collectors are more suitable to collect spats in the high spatfall waters? c) What is the composition in the byssus responsible for the attachment on hard substrates and d) Can the attachment plaque properties of the mussel byssus be applied for the benefit of humans?

For criterion 3, the occurrence in abundance of mussels in the west coastal waters of Peninsular
Malaysia is localized although they are widely found along this coast. This abundance is much related to the spatfalls in certain areas during transplantation. Even in the west coast, a) Is the spatfall density related to the attachment substrates? b) What are the reasons for the low spatfall in certain areas? c) What are the peak seasons of reproductive cycles in the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia (the Straits of Malacca)? d) How can we maintain the spatfalls of the high reproduction sites? e) How can we enhance high spat collection at a less productive spat area? and f) Could the low spatfall area be a result of pollution?

The success of mussel farming depends heavily on spatfalls in the natural environment. The origin of the spats is unknown and the supply is highly variable. Apart from the problem of insufficient supply of spats for seeding, genetic problems can arise from the use of wild stocks of unknown origins. Therefore, selection and improvement of cultured mussels may be hindered by the limited amount of genetic information available (Yap et al. 2002c, 2002d). Based on this aspect, information about the population genetic structure of *P. viridis* collected along the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia is undoubtedly very important. This particular aspect is now being looked into, using single-locus codominant microsatellite markers.

For criterion 4, simple correlations between the biomonitoring agent and its environment could only be found for certain metals such as Cd, Cu and Pb but not for Zn (Yap et al. 2002b, 2003h). This was due to the fact that not all metals are effectively accumulated in the soft tissues of *P. viridis*. 'Partial regulation' of Zn in the soft tissues of *P. viridis* was reported (Phillips 1985, Yap et al. 2003h) and this could affect the accuracy of the estimation of Zn pollution levels in coastal waters. Still, a lot of information on Zn levels in mussel soft tissues had been obtained from Hong Kong, Thailand, India and recently Malaysia. Perhaps, the question should be 'At what degree of metal regulation should the mussel be rejected as a biomonitoring agent of a particular metal?'

For criterion 5, low variability in morphological features and genetic variations need further validation. So far, only studies using isozyme markers have been reported to investigate levels of genetic variations of this species collected along the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia (Yap et al. 2002c). However, isozyme based studies are limited by low polymorphisms and the neutrality of isozymes is still doubtful (Jarne and Lagoda 1996). Therefore, hypervariable markers should be obtained at the DNA level. Polymorphisms detected at the DNA level are higher and give more information. Several questions could arise here; a) What are the DNA patterns of the local populations or indigenous species of *P. viridis*? b) What are the genetic variations of *P. viridis* collected along the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia, based on DNA markers (microsatellites)? c) How can the genetic information be used in maintaining the brookstocks of *P. viridis*? d) What are the useful genetic markers to distinguish between male and female mussels? e) What are the DNA level diagnostic markers to distinguish between contaminated and uncontaminated mussel populations?

For criterion 6, we found *P. viridis* is accumulative of Cd, Cu, Hg, Pb and Zn but we are lacking the knowledge and understanding on the chemical interactions among these metals in affecting the accumulation of metals in the mussel tissues. Also, other anthropogenic hazardous trace metals like As, Co, Ni, Fe and Se in the soft and hard tissues of *P. viridis* collected from Malaysia have not been studied yet to our knowledge.

For criterion 7, to further test the tolerances and sensitivities of *P. viridis* to heavy metals, other physiological indices should be tried and used. Also, the effects of single and multiple metals in affecting the tolerances and toxicities of metals that could cause 'synergistic' or 'additive' phenomenon are interesting research topics for future studies when this criterion is being focused upon.

For criterion 8, our risk assessment of heavy metal consumption through shellfish in Malaysia by comparison with established guidelines for food products from other countries should be improved. This could be done by establishing Malaysian guidelines based on our data spanning at least 10 years. To achieve this, the heavy metal concentrations in the soft tissues of *P. viridis* along the west coast of the peninsula should be studied yearly. 'What are the Malaysian hazardous indices/guidelines for shellfish consumption (rather than fish product in general)?' is also a question that should prompt further studies.
CONCLUSION

To establish an organism to be a good biomonitoring agent needs a lot of scientific research. Although workers from other regions have studied similar mussel species for the biomonitoring purpose, relatively similar studies should be conducted to test the local species and the existing information should be considered for comparison rather than extrapolation of the same phenomenon and results if the local similar species is used for biomonitoring studies. Our experience using the mussel *P. viridis* is interesting and by reviewing all the work, there is still a lot of interesting research areas to be investigated. Therefore, we suggest some of the potential work to be carried out in future studies but that would be greatly dependent on the numbers of researchers and the research funding available to study them. The work in establishing *P. viridis* for the biomonitoring of heavy metals, which is fundamentally based on the recommended criteria for a good biomonitoring agent, can be applied in other mollusks species such as the popular cockles and fish tilapia.

REFERENCES


ISMAIL, A. 1993a. Heavy metals Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn in green mussel (*Perna viridis* L.) from the west coast of Peninsular Malaysia. 9th – 12th December. IRPA/UKM Workshop and Seminar, Alisson Kelana, Seremban Malaysia.


YAP, C.K., ISMAIL, A. & TAN, S.G.


RUANGWISES, N. and S. RUANGWISES. 1998. Heavy metals in green mussels (Perna viridis) from


Yap, C.K., A. Ismail, S.G. Tan and H. Omar. 2002d. Genetic structures of populations of the green-lipped mussel *Perna viridis* (Linnaeus): A biomonitoring agent for the...


