DISTRIBUTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN YINCHUAN, CHINA

ZHANG TAO

FEM 2012 21
DISTRIBUTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN YINCHUAN, CHINA

By

ZHANG TAO

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for Doctor of Philosophy

November 2012
Thesis Submitted to Universiti Putra Malaysia
in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

DEDICATION

Specially to

My Beloved wife Zhu Beiyu
for sacrifices and understanding

and

to my father and mother,
who gave me courage and support
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

DISTRIBUTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN YINCHUAN, CHINA

By

ZHANG TAO

November 2012

Chairmen: Associate Professor Ahmad Hariza Hashim, PhD

Faculty: Human Ecology

Affordable housing is built with public assistances and public land in Yinchuan. It aims to provide an accommodation with security and stability to the urban poor and help them overcome disadvantages and live as a human being with dignity. It is absolutely unacceptable that the ineligible occupy affordable housing and obtain welfare benefits. The affordable housing fraud deprives the people who are genuinely in need from accessing to the program.

Distinguished from the policy study about the affordable housing program, this research is conducted from law perspective to investigate drawbacks in the legal system of affordable housing distribution. Based on the Rawls’ theory of justice and the framework of legal
operating system of affordable housing distribution, the researcher conducts investigation from four perspectives, which are affordable housing legislation, enforcement, judiciary and sanction.

The aims of this study are to explore the general picture of affordable housing development in Yinchuan; to identify the problem in affordable housing distribution in Yinchuan; to investigate drawbacks in affordable housing distribution system in Yinchuan and to examine views and perceptions of low income respondents upon the affordable housing distribution system in Yinchuan. Data collection techniques involve documents, observation, interview and survey using questionnaire. The questionnaire is designed based on the findings of documents analysis, observation and interview. Data gathered from the survey are analyzed descriptively.

The findings reveal that there are some drawbacks in the affordable housing distribution system, which consists of legislation upon eligibility, distribution execution, judiciary and sanction. Each subsystem is not perfect to play its role in safeguarding fair distribution. Legislation upon eligibility criteria and required proof documents are not clear and adequate enough to ensure eligibility of applicants. The execution of distribution consists of four procedures in which each procedure does not function effectively due to its defects. The judiciary consists of three types, which are from civil, criminal and administrative procedures. There are also some drawbacks in the subsystem of sanction as well. The results of this study suggest that drawbacks in each subsystem make its operation very
ineffective and prevent the whole system functioning normally. All these drawbacks result in unfairness and injustice in the process of affordable housing distribution.
Abastrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai Memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

PENGAGIHAN BAGI KEADILAN RUMAH MAMPU MILIK DI YINCHUAN, CINA

Oleh

ZHANG TAO

November 2012

Pengerusi : Profesor Madya Ahmad Hariza Hashim, Phd

Fakulti: Ekologi Manusia

Perumahan mampu milik dibina dengan bantuan awam dan tanah awam di Yinchuan. Matlamatnya ialah untuk menyediakan kediaman di samping keselamatan, kestabilan kepada golongan miskin bandar dan membantu mereka mengatasi kekurangan ini dan dapat hidup sebagai manusia yang bermarang. Adalah sesuatu yang tidak dapat diterima sekiranya mereka yang tidak layak dapat memiliki rumah mampu milik dan memperoleh faedah kebajikan ini. Penipuan dalam pemilikan rumah mampu milik telah menafikan hak mereka yang memerlukan daripada mengakses kepada program ini.

Berbeza daripada kajian dasar mengenai program perumahan mampu milik, kajian ini dijalankan dari perspektif undang-undang untuk mengenalpasti kelemahan dalam sistem
undang-undang yang diamalkan dalam pengagihan rumah mampu milik. Berdasarkan teori keadilan dan kerangka sistem operasi undang-undang pengagihan rumah mampu milik Rawls, penyelidik menjalankan kajian daripada empat perspektif, iaitu perundangan, penguatkuasaan, kehakiman dan hukuman.


Kajian ini mendapati bahawa terdapat beberapa kelemahan dalam sistem pengagihan rumah mampu milik, iaitu undang-undang ke atas syarat kelayakan, pelaksanaan pengagihan, badan kehakiman, dan hukuman. Setiap subsistem tidak memainkan peranan yang berkesan dalam menjaga pengagihan yang adil. Perundangan ke atas kriteria syarat kelayakan dan dokumen yang diperlukan tidak jelas dan mencukupi untuk menentukan kelayakan pemohon. Pelaksanaan pengagihan terdiri daripada empat prosedur di mana setiap prosedur tidak berfungsi dengan berkesan disebabkan kelemahannya. Badan
kehakiman itu terdiri daripada tiga jenis iaitu prosedur sivil, jenayah dan pentadbiran.

Terdapat juga beberapa kelemahan dalam subsistem hukuman. Hasil kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa kelemahan dalam setiap subsistem menjadikan operasinya sangat tidak berkesan dan ianya juga menghalang keseluruhan sistem daripada berfungsi secara normal. Semua kelemahan ini berlaku akibat ketidakadilan dan ketidaksamaan dalam proses pengagihan rumah mampu dimilik.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The word “Gratitude” is always on my mind. But I have never had such a desire as strong as this moment to make an attempt to appreciate what it really is. Every time when I recollect the experiences I went through in UPM, in Malaysia, many people just show up in front of my eyes like a film which records each touching story. This PhD thesis can not be accomplished without generous contributions from them.

First, I would like to thank Malaysian government and UPM for giving me this chance to study here with Graduate Research Fellowship to support me to finish this research.

Also my supervisory committee members were vital to the process of the research, who are Associate Professor Ahmad Hariza, Professor Jayum and Professor Norizan. They contributed a great deal of time and knowledge to accomplishment of thesis. Especially, I would like to thank Dr. Ahmad Hariza for his great patience and enormous help with my research. He is such a friendly and kind person. His instructions always remind me that how lucky I am to be his student. I even can not find a word to express my gratitude for what he has done for me.

I also want to thank my wife, I owe her too much. The sacrifices she made, the courage she gave and the love she dedicated deserve my whole life to cherish her and keep her accompany. And, I want to say “thank you” to my parents. They are always there when I went through ups and downs. Their generosity and kindness make me feel that they are the permanent haven whenever I come across difficulties.
There are others in Yinchuan who put me on this track. I want to thank my university colleagues who helped me with the design and correction of the survey. I also want to thank the officials from various bureaus, lawyers and a judge from the Supreme Court for their cooperation. I really appreciate their time to sit there for interviews. Their thoughtful reflection made data collection reliable.
I certify that an Examination Committee has met on 2nd November 2012 to conduct the final examination of Zhang Tao on his thesis entitled “Affordable Housing Distribution in Yinchuan, China” in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A)106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends the student be awarded Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Examination Committee were as follows:

Nobaya binti Ahmad, PhD
Associate Professor
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Elistina binti Abu Bakar, PhD
Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Human Ecology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Ar Azizah Salim binti Syed Salim
Associate Professor
Faculty of Architecture and Design
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Heather Campbell
Professor
Department of Town and Regional Planning
University of Sheffield, United Kindom
(External Examiner)

____________________________________
SEOW HENG FONG, PhD
Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 22 NOVEMBER 2012
This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Ahmad Hariza Hashim, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Human Ecology  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Jayum Anak Jawan, PhD**  
Professor  
Faculty of Human Ecology  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Nurizan Yahaya, PhD**  
Professor  
Faculty of Human Ecology  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

__________________________________________________________

**BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD**  
Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for the quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or at any other institution.

ZHANG TAO
Date: 2 November 2012
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABASTRAK</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPROVAL</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABRREVIATIONS</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF OPERATIONAL DEFINITIONS</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER

1 **INTRODUCTION**  
1.1 Overview  
1.2 Background  
1.3 Problem Statement  
1.4 Research Questions  
1.5 Research Objectives  
1.6 Significance of Study  
1.7 Scope of Study  
1.8 Limitations  
1.9 Structure of Study  

2 **THEORIES ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING DISTRIBUTION**  
2.1 Introduction  
2.2 Theories on Distributive Justice  
   2.2.1 Aristotle’s Theory of Distributive Justice  
   2.2.2 Rawls’ Theory of Distributive Justice  
2.3 Extend Rawls’ Theory to Affordable Housing Program  
   2.3.1 A Right to Housing  
   2.3.2 Benefit to the Least Advantaged People  
2.4 Implementation Strategies to Achieve Justice  
2.5 Conceptual Framework of Affordable Housing Distribution System  
   2.5.1 Affordable Housing Distribution Legislation  
   2.5.2 Affordable Housing Distribution Enforcement  
   2.5.3 Judiciary System in Affordable Housing Distribution  
   2.5.4 Sanction System in Affordable Housing Distribution
6.1.1 Eligibility Requirements in Yinchuan 140
6.1.2 Eligibility Requirements in U.S 144
6.1.3 Eligibility Requirements in U.K 158
6.1.4 Eligibility Requirements in Australia 163

7 DRAWBACKS IN ENFORCEMENT, JUDICIARY AND SANCTION ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING DISTRIBUTION 177
7.1 Drawbacks in Enforcement of Affordable Housing Distribution 177
  7.1.1 Drawbacks in Process of Application and Acceptance 178
  7.1.2 Drawbacks in Process of Preliminary Examination 183
  7.1.3 Drawbacks in Process of Review 189
  7.1.4 Drawbacks in Process of Approval 192
  7.1.5 Drawbacks in Process of Supervision 194
  7.1.6 Drawbacks in Process of Administration 197
7.2 Drawbacks in Judiciary System 199
7.3 Drawbacks in Sanction System 206

8 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE'S PERCEPTIONS ABOUT AFFORDABLE HOUSING DISTRIBUTION AND ITS OPERATION SYSTEM IN YINCHUAN 214
8.1 Demographic Profiles of Respondents 214
8.2 Perceptions towards the Operational System 215
  8.2.1 Perceptions towards Eligibility Criteria 216
  8.2.2 Perceptions towards Implementation 219
  8.2.3 Perceptions towards Judiciary Protection 221
  8.2.4 Perceptions towards Sanctions 222
  8.2.5 Perceptions towards Fairness of Distribution 223

9 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 226
9.1 Summary of Findings 227
9.2 Recommendations 230
9.3 Contributions 232
9.4 Directions for Future Study 233

BIBLIOGRAPHY 235
APPENDIX A CONSENT OF CONDUCTING RESEARCH 249
APPENDIX B MAP OF EIGHT MAJOR CITIES IN CHINA 250
APPENDIX C LIST OF PROVINCE-LEVEL SUBDIVISIONS IN CHINA 251
APPENDIX D MAP OF CHINA 252
APPENDIX E RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE 253
APPENDIX F EIGHT TYPES OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING LAYOUT IN YINCHUAN 259
BIODATA OF STUDENT 260
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS 261