EFFECTS OF ACCOUNTING AND CORPORATE GOVERNANCE REFORMS ON INCOME SMOOTHING PRACTICES BY INDONESIA LISTED FIRMS

THERESIA TRISANTI

GSM 2012 20
EFFECTS OF ACCOUNTING AND CORPORATE GOVERNANCE REFORMS ON INCOME SMOOTHING PRACTICES BY INDONESIA LISTED FIRMS

THERESIA TRISANTI

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA
2012
EFFECTS OF ACCOUNTING AND CORPORATE GOVERNANCE REFORMS ON INCOME SMOOTHING PRACTICES BY INDONESIA LISTED FIRMS

By THERESIA TRISANTI

Thesis Submitted to the Graduate School of Management, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in the fulfillment of the requirements of the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

2012
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

EFFECTS OF ACCOUNTING AND CORPORATE GOVERNANCE REFORMS ON INCOME SMOOTHING PRACTICES BY INDONESIA LISTED FIRMS

By

THERESIA TRISANTI

June 2012

Chair : Prof. Dr. Zulkarnain Muhamad Sori
Faculty : Graduate School of Management

Recent accounting research reveals that income smoothing (IS) practices in developing and emerging economies are higher than in developed-country. As an emerging market, Indonesia has a high occurrence of IS practices since around 65% of Indonesian listed firms have committed to it (Damayanthi, 2002; Prasetyo & Astuti, 2002). Motivated by these facts, this study seeks an empirical investigation on the effectiveness of the accounting and corporate governance (CG) reforms from the perspective of IS practices in Indonesia.

Accordingly, four research objectives have been established. First is to investigate the effect of CG and accounting standard reforms on IS practices by Indonesian listed firms in the period from 1995 to 2009. Second is to verify the effect of two IS instruments: discretionary accounting changes (DAC) and non-recurring items to the IS practices. Third is to study the effects of selected Indonesian listed company
CG attributes to the IS practices and fourth is to investigate the effect of company’s specific characteristic attributes on the IS practices.

The IS practice was measured with two models: the coefficient variation of sales to income index by Eckel (1981) and the smoothing behavior index by Moses (1987). A review of the Indonesian CG Codes revealed that there were two attributes that was expected to have impact on IS practices, the independent boards and the independent audit committee. Six company’s specific characteristic attributes were also used to assess their impact to IS practices, institutional ownerships, company size, type of industry, debt financing, external auditor quality, and profitability.

The research sample was drawn from the DataStream and Indonesian Capital Market Directory (ICMD) database for the years of 1995 to 2009 and divided into three different periods. The first period was during the financial crisis (1995-1999), the second was when the various corporate governance initiatives took place (2000-2004), and the third was when Indonesian general accounting principles converged to IFRS (2005-2009).

For the first research objective, the study concluded there was a significant difference of IS practices before and after the introduction CG codes and IFRS respectively. For the second research objective, the study found that Indonesian listed firms tend to use DAC and nonrecurring items to smooth their income figures.

For the third and fourth research objectives, the findings did not support the proposition that a higher proportion of independent directors and independent audit
committee would provide more effective monitoring mechanism in constraining IS practices. Type of industry was also negatively associated with the IS practices for three different periods. Meanwhile, institutional ownership and company size had also no significant relationship to IS practices during financial crisis period (1995-1999), but they were after the introduction of CG codes (2000-2004) and after the convergence to IFRS (2005-2009). For debt financing, profitability and external audit quality there were significant relationship to IS practices for all three different period.

Overall, the study concludes that IS practices decreased significantly among Indonesian listed firms after the introduction of CG Codes and IFRS but its percentage was still high. This suggests that although Public Interest Theory (PIT) lays foundation to government to introduce CG and IFRS but from Positive Accounting Theory (PAT) perspective, such initiative will constraint management to choose standards on accounting and governance that may contradict to maximize their benefits. Therefore, using Agency Theory perspective, the introduction of CG and accounting reforms should be equipped with a new model and framework to better manage the relationship among agents and principals that involve government, stakeholders and companies through some policies and regulations.
Penyelidikan perakaunan terkini mendedahkan bahawa berbanding negara-negara maju, amalan perataan pendapatan (IS) dikalangan negara-negara ekonomi baru muncul adalah secara puratanya lebih tinggi. Sebagai satu pasaran baru muncul, Indonesia didapati mempunyai amalan IS yang sangat tinggi kerana dianggarkan sekitar 65% firma-firma tersenarai Indonesia telah mengamalkan amalan IS tersebut (Damayanthi, 2002; Prasetyo & Astuti, 2002). Dimotivasikan oleh fakta tersebut, kajian ini merupakan satu penyelidikan empirikal terhadap keberkesanan reformasi perakaunan dan tadbir urus korporat (CG) dari perspektif amalan IS di Indonesia.


v
perakaunan budi-bicara (DAC) dan item tidak berulang bagi amalan-amalan IS.

Ketiga ialah untuk menyiasat kesan ciri-ciri urus tadbir korporat syarikat tersenarai Indonesia terpilih terhadap amalan-amalan IS dan objektif keempat ialah untuk menyiasat kesan ciri-ciri khusus syarikat terhadap amalan-amalan IS.


Bagi objektif penyelidikan pertama, kajian menyimpulkan bahawa terdapat perbezaan ketara bagi amalan-amalan IS selepas pengenalan kod CG dan penumpuan kepada IFRS berbanding dengan tempoh sebelumnya. Bagi objektif

Secara keseluruhan, kajian menyimpulkan bahawa walaupun amalan IS dikalangkan firma-firma tersenarai Indonesia telah berkurang secara ketara selepas pengenalan kod CG dan penumpuan GAAP Indonesia kepada IFRS, peratusannya masih tinggi berbanding dengan negara-negara lain. Ini mencadangkan bahawa walaupun Teori Kepentingan Awam (PIT) meletakkan asas kepada kerajaan untuk memperkenalkan reformasi ke atas CG dan piawaian perakaunan, tetapi Teori Perakaunan Positif (PAT) mencadangkan bahawa inisiatif-inisiatif tersebut akan mengekang pihak pengurusan untuk memilih piawaian perakaunan dan tadbir urus yang mungkin bercanggah bagi tujuan memaksimumkan manfaat peribadi mereka. Oleh itu, berdasarkan perspektif Teori Agensi, pengenalan reformasi CG dan piawaian perakaunan perlu dilengkapi dengan model baru dan rangka kerja untuk
menguruskan dengan lebih baik hubungan dikalangan ejen dan prinsipal yang melibatkan kerajaan, pihak-pihak berkepentingan dan syarikat melalui beberapa dasar dan peraturan-peraturan.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have spent five challenging years working on my PhD thesis, thanks to Almighty God. Writing my thesis was really arduous at time but it was also a great joy because of the involvement of some great people to whom I am forever grateful. First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor Prof. Dr. Zulkarnain Mohammad Sori for his wise counsel and tireless helps shown in his professional assessments of my work. I would particularly like to thank him for his great patience and courage in providing comments and feedback for many inappropriate expressions of my writing despite his busy schedule. His detailed and thorough feedback that reflected his mission for providing high-quality work has made a deep impression on me. I am also especially grateful to all supervisory committee members Prof. Dr. Shamsher Mohamad Ramadili and Dr. Taufiq Hassan, who have given their generous encouragement and attention.

Thanks go also to all my friends at the Graduate School of Management (GSM) of Universiti Putra Malaysia, especially to Hairul Nahar, who has been a generous help to this challenging journey. I am grateful to my husband Eko Priyatmo, who has always been on my side all the time. Last but not least, I am indebted to my son Andreas and my daughter Bernadeta because they had to join their mother’s uneasy journey. I am indebted to them for the so-much time which they should have deserved but which I could not provide enough while I was finishing this thesis.
I certify that an Examination Committee met on 21 June 2012 to conduct the final examination of Theresia Trisanti on her Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled “Effect of Accounting and Corporate Governance Reform on Income Smoothing Practices by Indonesia Listed Firms” in accordance with Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U. (A) 106] 15 March 2008. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy degree. Members of the Examination Committee are as follows:

**Prof. Dr. Foong Soon Yau**  
Deputy Dean  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
43400 UPM Serdang, Selangor  
(Chairman)

**Prof. Mike Page**  
Professor Emeritus, Accounting and Finance  
Portsmouth Building, Portland Street  
Portsmouth. PO1 3DE  
(External Examiner)

**Prof. Dr. Norman Saleh**  
School of Accountancy  
Faculty of Economic & Management  
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia  
43600 UKM Bangi, Selangor  
(Internal Examiner)

**Prof. Dr. Zubaidah Zainal Abidin**  
Faculty of Accountancy  
Level 12, Menara SAAS  
Universiti Teknologi MARA  
40450, Shah Alam, Selangor  
(Internal Examiner)

**Prof. Dr. Zulkarnain Muhammad Sori**  
Faculty of Entrepreneurship & Business  
Universiti Malaysia Kelantan  
Kampus KL. Kuala Lumpur  
(Representative of Supervisory Committee/Observer)

---

_Foong Soon Yau, PhD_  
Professor / Director, Thesis Based Program  
Putra Business School  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
Date:
This thesis submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee are as follows:

**Prof. Dr. Zulkarnain Muhammad Sori**  
Professor  
Faculty of Entrepreneurship & Business  
Universiti Malaysia Kelantan  
Kampus KL. Kuala Lumpur  
(Chairman)

**Prof. Dr. Shamsher Mohamad Ramadili Mohd.**  
Professor  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Dr. Taufiq Hassan**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

______________________  
ARFAH SALLEH, PhD  
Professor/President  
Putra Business School  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
Date:
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at UPM or any other institutions.

THERESIA TRISANTI
Date:
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at UPM or any other institutions.

THERESIA TRISANTI

Date:
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT
ABSTRAK
AKNOWLEDGEMENT
APPROVAL
DECLARATION
LIST OF TABLES
LIST OF FIGURES
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CHAPTER

1 INTRODUCTION
  1.1 Background of the Study
  1.2 Problem Statement
  1.3 Research Objectives
  1.4 Research Contributions
  1.5 Organization of the Study

2 AN OVERVIEW OF ACCOUNTING SYSTEMS, CAPITAL MARKET AND CORPORATE GOVERNANCE IN INDONESIA
  2.1 Introduction
  2.2 An Overview of Indonesian Accounting System: Legal and Institutional Framework
  2.3 An Overview of the Development of Accounting Standards and Accounting Reforms in Indonesia
  2.4 Indonesian Institute of Accountants
  2.5 Financial Accounting Standards Board
  2.6 An Overview of Capital Market and Public Listed Companies in Indonesia
  2.7 An Overview of the Indonesian Codes of Corporate Governance
    2.7.1 Shareholders Protection
    2.7.2 The Equitable Treatment of Shareholders
    2.7.3 The Role of Stakeholders in Corporate Governance
    2.7.4 Disclosures and Transparency
    2.7.5 The Responsibilities of the Board
    2.7.6 Corporate Secretary
  2.8 Listing Requirements on the Jakarta Stock Exchange (JSX)
    2.8.1 Board of Commissioner
    2.8.2 Audit Committee
  2.9 Summary of the Chapter

3 LITERATURE REVIEW
  3.1 Introduction
### 3.2 Theoretical Foundation for Income Smoothing Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.2.1</th>
<th>Agency Theory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>The Relationship of IS Practices and Agency Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>Positive Accounting Theory (PAT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>The Relationship of IS Practices and PAT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5</td>
<td>Public Interest Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.6</td>
<td>The Relationship of IS Practices and Public Interest Theory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.3 Approaches to Detect IS Practices

### 3.4 Type of IS Practices

### 3.5 The IS Objects, Instruments and Dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.5.1</th>
<th>The Smoothing Objects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2</td>
<td>The Smoothing Instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3</td>
<td>The Smoothing Dimensions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.6 Motivation for IS Practices

### 3.7 The Effects of Accounting Reform and IS Practices

### 3.8 Research on CG Mechanisms and IS Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.8.1</th>
<th>Independent Board Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.8.2</td>
<td>Independent Audit Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.9 Company Factors Affecting IS Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.9.1</th>
<th>Institutional Ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.9.2</td>
<td>Company Size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.3</td>
<td>Profitability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.4</td>
<td>Type of Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.5</td>
<td>Debt Financing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.6</td>
<td>External Auditor Quality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.10 Research on Factors Affecting IS Practices in Indonesia

### 3.11 Summary of the Chapter

### 4 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4.1</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Research Theoretical Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Identification of IS Sample</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1</td>
<td>Stage 1: Computing Smoothing Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2</td>
<td>Stage 2: Analysis to Determine the Direct Smoothing Instrument</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.1</td>
<td>Observations on the Financial Reporting Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.2</td>
<td>Changes in Accounting Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.3</td>
<td>Nonrecurring Items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.4</td>
<td>Expected Earnings and Smoothing Measure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Hypothesis Development and Identifying Factors Affecting Income Smoothing Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1</td>
<td>The Adoption of CG Codes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2</td>
<td>The Convergence to IFRS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3</td>
<td>Company Size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.4</td>
<td>Debt Financing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.5</td>
<td>Institutional Ownership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.6</td>
<td>Profitability</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4.7 Independent Board Committee 120
4.4.8 Independent Audit Committee 121
4.4.9 External Auditor Quality 122
4.4.10 Type of Industry 123
4.5 Measurement of Variables 124
4.6 Research Instruments 130
4.7 Source of Data 132
4.8 Sample Selection 132

5 FINDING AND DISCUSSION
5.1 Introduction 134
5.2 Descriptive Analysis 134
5.2.1 The Result of IS Sampling 136
5.2.2 The IS Instruments 138
5.2.3 Smoother and Non-Smoother Firms According to Smoothing Behavior Index 140
5.3 Research Objective 1: The Effect of CG and IFRS Reform to IS Practices 142
5.3.1 CG Reform and IS Practices 142
5.3.2 Convergence to IFRS and IS Practices 145
5.4 Research Objective 2: The Effect of IS Instrument (Discretionary Accounting Changes and Non Recurring Items) to IS Practices 147
5.5 Research Objective 3 and 4: The Effect of Selected CG Attributes and Companies Specific Characteristic to IS Practices 150
5.5.1 Correlation Analysis 151
5.5.2 Logistic Regression Analysis- Moses’ Model 151
5.5.2.1 Classification Table 152
5.5.2.2 Determinant of IS Practices 153
5.6 Factors Affecting IS Practices 155
5.6.1 Firm Size and IS Practices 157
5.6.2 Debt Financing and IS Practices 158
5.6.3 Institutional Ownership and IS Practices 160
5.6.4 Profitability and IS Practices 163
5.6.5 Independent Board Committee and IS Practices 164
5.6.6 Independent Audit Committee and IS Practices 166
5.6.7 External Audit Quality and IS Practices 168
5.6.8 Type of Industry and IS Practices 171
5.7 Robustness Test 172
5.7.1 Logistic Regression Analysis- Eckel’s Model 173
5.7.1.1 Classification Table 173
5.7.1.2 Determinant of IS Practices 174
5.8 Factors Affecting IS Practices 177
5.8.1 Firm Size and IS Practices 177
5.8.2 Debt Financing and IS Practices 177
5.8.3 Institutional Ownership and IS Practices 178
5.8.4 Profitability and IS Practices 179
5.8.5 Independent Board Committee and IS Practices 179
5.8.6 Independent Audit Committee and IS Practices 180
5.8.7 External Audit Quality and IS Practices 180
5.8.8 Type of Industry and IS Practices 181
5.9 Summary of the Hypothesis Result 182
5.10 Summary of the Chapter 184

6 SUMMARY, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
6.1 Introduction 185
6.2 Summary of Research Findings 185
6.3 Research Contribution and Implication 190
6.3.1 Practical Contribution 190
6.3.2 Theoretical Contribution 192
6.4 Limitation of the Research 194
6.5 Suggestion for Future Research 195
6.6 Summary of the Chapter 196

REFERENCES 197

APPENDIX A : List of Companies in the Sample of T Test 220
APPENDIX B : Timeline of Convergence to IFRS 224
APPENDIX C : Correlation Analysis 226

BIOATA OF THE CANDIDATE 228