

**MODELLING OF MOTORCYCLE ACCIDENTS AT
NON-EXCLUSIVE MOTORCYCLE LANE JUNCTIONS IN MALAYSIA**

HARNEN SULISTIO

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA**

2004

DEDICATION

Especially dedicated to:

In memorial My father and My mother

H. Soerahman and Hj. Siti Aminas

Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment
of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**MODELLING OF MOTORCYCLE ACCIDENTS AT
NON-EXCLUSIVE MOTORCYCLE LANE JUNCTIONS IN MALAYSIA**

By

HARNEN SULISTIO

March 2004

Chairman: Professor Ir. Radin Umar Radin Sohadi, Ph.D

Faculty: Engineering

In Malaysia, motorcycles constitute more than half of the total registered vehicles and contribute to more than 60% of casualties (death, hospitalised and slight injury) to total traffic accidents. In the 1990-2000 period, almost 3,000 motorcyclists were killed every year in traffic accidents. To overcome such problems, the exclusive motorcycle lanes have been constructed along the major trunk roads in Malaysia. However, not much work has been done to address junction accidents involving motorcycles. As such, a detailed study on this area has been carried out to allow traffic engineers to establish appropriate junction treatment criteria specifically designed for non-exclusive motorcycle lane facilities.

A total of 104 junctions in Hulu Langat, Klang, Kuala Langat and Petaling districts with 1,095 injury related motorcycle accidents in the period 1997-2000 were included in the study. The generalised linear modelling with Poisson distribution was used to develop the model. The variables of the model were examined using univariate and multivariate analyses.

The final models revealed that traffic flow entering the junction, approach speed, lane width, number of lanes on major road, shoulder width, junction control and land use were significant in explaining motorcycle accidents. Meanwhile, pedestrian flow, number of lanes on minor road and number of intersecting legs were not significant in explaining motorcycle accidents. Non-motorcycle flow on major road had the highest effect on the probability of motorcycle accidents at junctions.

The final models allow traffic engineers to decide the appropriate intervention levels for junction treatment with respect to motorcycle accidents. Using the final models, design parameters for junctions may be changed to achieve the appropriate safety levels for them. The decision on whether to allow motorcycles to pass through a junction without treatment to it or the need for special end treatment to minimise motorcycle conflicts at junctions can be objectively carried out based on the model, and this can easily be done using the software developed in this study.

Apart from the software, a series of design curves relating major road and minor road flows at junctions with typical shoulder widths of 0.0 m, 1.0 m, 1.5 m, 2.0 m

and 2.5m have been established. The design curves were developed based on the number of Personal Injury Accidents (PIA) of 1-PIA per year. These design curves also enable traffic engineers to decide the need for special end treatment of the junctions.

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**MODEL KEMALANGAN MOTOSIKAL DI PERSIMPANGAN LORONG
MOTOSIKAL BUKAN EKSLUSIF DI MALAYSIA**

Oleh

HARNEN SULISTO

Mac 2004

Pengerusi: Professor Ir. Radin Umar Radin Sohadi, Ph.D

Fakulti: Kejuruteraan

Motosikal merupakan lebih separuh daripada jumlah kenderaan yang didaftarkan dan ini telah menyumbang kepada lebih 60% kecederaan (maut, cedera parah, dan cedera ringan) jalan raya di Malaysia. Dalam tempoh 1990-2000 sahaja, seramai lebih 3,000 penunggang motosikal terbunuh setiap tahun dalam nahas kemalangan jalan raya. Untuk mengatasi masalah tersebut, lorong motosikal eksklusif telah dibina di beberapa lebuh raya di Malaysia. Namun, masih kurang kajian dilakukan setakat ini untuk mengatasi masalah kemalangan jalan raya yang melibatkan motosikal di persimpangan-persimpangan jalan. Oleh yang demikian, kajian terperinci telah dijalankan untuk membolehkan jurutera trafik membangunkan kriteria rawatan untuk persimpangan-persimpangan di lorong motosikal bukan eksklusif.

Sejumlah 104 buah persimpangan di daerah Hulu Langat, Klang, Kuala Langat dan Petaling dengan jumlah kemalangan 1,095 yang melibatkan kecederaan

penunggang motosikal yang berlaku di antara tahun 1997 – 2000 telah digunakan dalam kajian ini. Model generalisasi linier dengan taburan Poisson telah digunakan dalam pembentukan model ini. Pembolehubah model telah dianalisis dengan menggunakan kaedah analisis univariat dan multivariat.

Model yang dibentuk menunjukkan bahawa aliran trafik yang memasuki persimpangan jalan, laju setempat, lebar lorong, bilangan lorong di jalan utama, lebar bahu jalan, kawalan persimpangan dan guna tanah merupakan faktor penting dalam mempengaruhi kemalangan motosikal. Sementara itu, aliran pejalan kaki, bilangan lorong di jalan kecil, dan bilangan cabang persimpangan didapati tidak mempengaruhi kemalangan motosikal di persimpangan jalan. Aliran kenderaan bukan motosikal di jalan utama didapati mempunyai pengaruh yang paling tinggi dalam kebarangkalian berlakunya kemalangan motosikal di persimpangan jalan.

Model yang dibentuk membolehkan jurutera trafik memutuskan paras intervensi bagi merawat sesuatu persimpangan berpandukan kadar kemalangan motosikal yang ditetapkan. Melalui model ini, parameter rekabentuk persimpangan boleh diubahsuai untuk mencapai tahap keselamatan sesuatu persimpangan. Keputusan sama ada membenarkan motosikal melalui persimpangan tanpa rawatan atau perlunya rawatan khas untuk meminimumkan konflik di persimpangan boleh dilakukan berpandukan pada model ini. Ini mudah dilakukan dengan menggunakan perisian yang diterbitkan dalam kajian ini.

Selain daripada perisian, beberapa siri lengkung rekabentuk telah diterbitkan untuk menghubungkan aliran trafik dan lebar bahu jalan 0.0 m, 1.0 m, 1.5 m, 2.0 m dan 2.5m. Lengkung rekabentuk ini adalah berdasarkan paras kecederaan 1.0 kemalangan cedera (PIA) penunggang motosikal setahun. Dengan menggunakan lengkung rekabentuk ini, jurutera trafik juga boleh memutuskan keperluan untuk rawatan khas terhadap persimpangan-persimpangan.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A research study of this kind could not have been carried out without the help, assistance and co-operation of many parties. I am deeply grateful to my supervisor, Professor Ir. Dr. Radin Umar Radin Sohadi for his guidance, encouragement, constructive criticisms and invaluable advices throughout the course of this study. During the course of this study, I have learned much from him especially from his wisdom and professionalism. I would like to express my grateful thanks to my co-supervisors, Dr. Wong Shaw Voon and Associate Professor Dr. Wan Hashim Wan Ibrahim, for guiding, advising and encouraging me during the course of this study.

This research is part of a study conducted under an IRPA Project entitled *Development of Design Criteria and Standards for Malaysian Motorcycle Lanes*. The financial support from the Ministry of Science, Technology and Environment Malaysia is gratefully acknowledged.

I would like to take this opportunity to especially thank Ir. Shabri Shahrom and Mr. Ruslan (Highway Planning Unit, Ministry of Works, Malaysia) for their help in providing traffic data of the permanent count station and traffic census. I am also indebted to A.S.P. Roslan and the staff of Traffic Branch, Royal Malaysia Police,

Bukit Aman for their advice and guidance in the customisation of CARS 2000 database. I am also indebted to Mr. Goh Boo Hoe for guiding and assisting me in the customisation of MAAP 5 database. Special thanks are also due to Mr. Djamal A.M. of the Road Safety Research Centre, for supporting and helping me in providing maps during the preparation of field studies. I would like also to acknowledge the assistance of Mr. Lee Pak Cheng, Mr. Eng Ah Kuang and Mr. Ahmad Zamri for their help in the preparation of fieldwork and the collection of field data.

I would like to express my sincere thanks to Mr. Law Teik Hwa (UPM) for his guidance in the customisation of MAAP 5, his help in the process of the procurement of GLIM 4 software, and his advice in statistical modelling for traffic accidents. To Dr. John Fletcher of the Transport Research Laboratory who gave time for discussions on traffic accident modelling, and advised me especially in the use of error distribution in statistical modelling, I extend my sincere thanks. Special thanks also due to Dr. Anthony Ockwell, the secretary of OECD, for his attention on this research area, and time spent for mailing valuable information regarding motorcycle accidents investigation in OECD member countries. I am indebted to Dr. Robert Esberger of the Institute of Traffic Engineering and Accident Statistics, KfV, Austrian Road Safety Board for his time spent for mailing valuable materials of the International Seminar on Road Traffic and Accident Data Needs For the New Century. The preparation of the draft script is indebted much to Mr. Brian O'Flaherty who spent his invaluable time to proof read the draft.

Special thanks also due to Dr. Kulanthayan S. for his advising and guiding the right format for the dissertation, to graduate students Ibitoye A. Billyamin, Ibrahim Sheikh, F.M Shuaeib and members of Research Associate and Graduate Research Assistance of Road Safety Research Centre (RSRC), UPM who through their support and friendship made my research work a very enjoyable experience, not forgetting Mrs. Khatijah and Mrs. Lailawati for providing much assistance.

I would like to thank the Department of Civil Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia, for the support during the course of the study.

Lastly, I should thanks to my wife, Cahyani Anggorowati, my children, Yan A. Utama and Bunga Aditya SP. for being patient, understanding and their support during the course of this study.

I certify that an Examination Committee met on 19 February 2004 to conduct the final examination of Harnen Sulistio on his Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled “Modelling of Motorcycle Accidents at Non-exclusive Motorcycle Lane Junctions in Malaysia” in accordance with Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Act 1980 and Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Regulations 1981. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the relevant degree. Members of the Examination Committee are as follows:

Ir. DADANG MOHAMAD MA’SOEM, Ph.D.

Faculty of Engineering,
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Ir. RADIN UMAR RADIN SOHADI, Ph.D.

Professor
Faculty of Engineering,
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

WONG SHAW VOON, Ph.D.

Faculty of Engineering,
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

WAN HASHIM WAN IBRAHIM, Ph.D.

Associate Professor
School of Civil Engineering,
Universiti Sains Malaysia,
Engineering Campus
(Member)

MURRAY MACKAY, Ph.D, D.Sc.

Professor

Accident Research Centre
Faculty of Engineering,
University of Birmingham, United Kingdom
(Independent Examiner)

GULAM RUSUL RAHMAT ALI, Ph.D.
Professor / Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

This thesis submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee are as follows:

Ir. RADIN UMAR RADIN SOHADI, Ph.D.
Professor / Dean
Faculty of Engineering
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

WONG SHAW VOON, Ph.D.
Faculty of Engineering
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

WAN HASHIM WAN IBRAHIM, Ph.D.
Associate Professor / Dean
School of Civil Engineering
Universiti Sains Malaysia
Engineering Campus
(Member)

AINI IDERIS, Ph.D.
Professor / Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations, which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at UPM or other institutions.

HARNEN SULISTIO

Date: 4 March 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DEDICATION	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ABSTRAK	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ix
APPROVAL	xii
DECLARATION	xiv
LIST OF TABLES	xix
LIST OF FIGURES	xxi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxiv
CHAPTER	
I	
INTRODUCTION	1
Overview of Traffic Accidents in Malaysia	2
Background of the Study	4
Motorcycle Accidents	4
Traffic Accidents at Junctions	10
Agenda for Junction Safety	13
The Exclusive and Non-exclusive Motorcycle Lanes	16
The Need for Studies	18
Objective of the Study	19
Hypotheses	20
Scope of the Study	21
Organisation of the Thesis	22
II	
LITERATURE REVIEW	23
Introduction	23
Generalised Linear Modelling	24
Model Fitting and Parameter Estimates	26
The Form of Accident Model	27
Error Distribution	29
Over Dispersion	30
Significant Testing	31
Earlier Studies on Traffic Accidents at Junctions	32
Studies on Accidents at Roundabouts and Junctions	32
A Study on Accidents at Junctions in Finland	34
A Study on Accidents at Roads with Minor Junctions	36
A Study on the Effect of Trend on Accidents at Junctions	37

	A Study on Accidents at Junctions in British Columbia	38
	Studies on Accidents at Junctions in the United State of America	39
	A Study on Accidents at Junctions in Denmark	42
	A Study on Accidents at Signalised Junctions in Japan	44
	Earlier Studies on Motorcycle Accident Modelling	45
	A Study on Motorcycle Accident Modelling in the United Kingdom	45
	A Study on Motorcycle Accident Modelling in Malaysia	46
	Summary	49
III	MATERIALS AND METHODS	51
	Introduction	51
	Framework of the Study	52
	Data Collection	53
	The Location and Junction Selection	55
	Motorcycle Accidents	60
	Traffic Flow	64
	Pedestrian Flow	70
	Approach Speeds	72
	Junction Geometry	73
	Number of Intersecting Legs, Junction Control and Land Use	75
	Data Limitations	76
	Development of Motorcycle Accident Model	77
	Univariate and Multivariate Analyses	79
	The Proposed Models	80
	Traffic Flow Criteria for Junction Treatment	84
	Summary	86
IV	DATA ANALYSIS AND RESULTS	87
	Introduction	87
	Analysis of Error Distribution	87
	Univariate Analysis	90
	Multivariate Analysis	93
	The Full Model	93
	The Simplified Model	101
	Actual and Modelled Accidents	103
	The Application of the Models	105
	Summary	108

V	THE ESTABLISHMENT OF TRAFFIC FLOW CRITERIA FOR JUNCTION TREATMENT	110
	Introduction	110
	Analysis	111
	Effect of Traffic Flow on Motorcycle Accidents	112
	The Relationship of Major Road and Minor Road Flows and Accidents	114
	Acceptable Limit for Motorcycle Accidents	115
	Establishing Traffic Flow Criteria	117
	Motorcycle Safety Among Junction Groups	120
	Summary	122
VI	DISCUSSION	124
	Introduction	124
	The Final Models	124
	Traffic Flow	126
	Pedestrian Flow	129
	Approach Speed	129
	Lane Width	131
	Number of Lanes	132
	Shoulder Width	134
	Number of Intersecting Legs	137
	Junction Control	138
	Land Use	139
	Junction Treatment Criteria	141
	Traffic Flow Criteria	141
	The Priority for Non-exclusive Motorcycle Lane Facilities	142
	Three-legged Signalised Junctions of the “Sea gull” Type	145
VII	CONCLUSION	147
	Recommendations	151
	Further Study	154
	REFERENCES	158
	APPENDIX	
A	Typical POL 27 Reports for Motorcycle Accident at Junction	163
	Typical Output of CARS-2000 Database	171
	Motorcycle Accidents, Node Number and Description of Junction Location	174
	Data for A Typical Selected Junction	178
	Location and Description of Traffic Census	181
	Typical Traffic Census Data	183

	Hourly, Daily and Monthly Factors	187
	Estimated Annual Average Daily Traffic (AADT) for Selected Junctions	197
	The Data and the Model Variables for the Selected Junctions	205
B	Observed and Expected Accident Frequencies for Respective Group of Junctions	209
	The Results of Univariate Analysis of Full Model for Respective Group of Junctions	216
	The Software for Final Models	223
	The Effect of Traffic Flow on Motorcycle Accidents for Respective Group of Junctions	227
	The Relationship of Major Road and Minor Road Flows for Junctions with and without Shoulder and Various Numbers of Motorcycle Accidents	230
	The Relationship of Major Road and Minor Road Flows for Junction with Differing Shoulder Widths for Respective Group of Junctions	233
	Typical Traffic Flow Criteria for Respective Group of Junctions	236
C	Statistical Output of Analysis of Error Distribution	242
	Statistical Output of Univariate Analysis of Full Model	246
	Statistical Output of Multivariate Analysis of Full Model	286
	Statistical Output of Multivariate Analysis of Simplified Model	330
	Statistical Output of Correlation between Parameter Estimates for Respective Group of Junctions	344
	BIODATA OF THE AUTHOR	348