UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

INFLUENCE OF CITIZEN-CENTRIC PERSPECTIVE ON THE EFFECTIVENESS OF E-GOVERNANCE SYSTEMS IN MALAYSIA

SEYED MOHAMMAD BAGHER JAFARI

GSM 2012 8
INFLUENCE OF CITIZEN-CENTRIC PERSPECTIVE
ON THE EFFECTIVENESS OF E-GOVERNANCE SYSTEMS
IN MALAYSIA

By
SEYED MOHAMMAD BAGHER JAFARI

Thesis submitted to the Graduate School of Management,
Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

July 2012
In dedication to:

My beloved wife Somayeh Sadat,
and my lovely son Seyed AmirAli

For all their encouragement, patience and support

With love and gratitude
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

INFLUENCE OF CITIZEN-CENTRIC PERSPECTIVE ON THE EFFECTIVENESS OF E-GOVERNANCE SYSTEMS IN MALAYSIA

By

SEYED MOHAMMADBAGHER JAFARI

July 2012

Chair: Associate Professor Noor Azman Ali, PhD
Faculty: Graduate School of Management

The rapid evolution of information and communication technologies (ICTs) has created challenges and opportunities for governments all over the world. Nowadays, many citizens are turning to electronic communities. On the other hand, the government costs too much, delivers too little, and is not sufficiently responsive or accountable. These are the push factors for every government to improve its relationship with citizens via advanced technologies. Today, e-government and e-governance are key issues on the agenda of various governments across the world. However, the effectiveness of e-governance systems is contingent upon designing these systems based on citizens’ values and needs. Nevertheless, the actual needs, values and objectives of citizens receive minor consideration in current e-governance literature. The current approach in e-governance design is more top-down view, techno-centric and focuses on efficiency (output). There is a strong need for change in e-governance design practice from top-down to bottom-up design. The new approach should be citizen-centric and focuses on effectiveness (outcome, impact) of the systems. Based on this perspective, the citizens’ needs and values on
e-governance have to be put first to make these systems effective. This study is an attempt to explore and propose the needs and values of citizens on e-governance systems based on the determinants of information system (IS) success in the DeLone and McLean 2003 (D&M 2003) model of IS success. After conducting a systematic and comprehensive literature review, this study identified new determinants of e-governance success and proposed the citizen-centric e-governance effectiveness model. Using a survey method, 356 valid questionnaires were collected from Malaysian citizens with prior experience on government online services. The structural equation modeling (SEM) technique has been used to evaluate the hypothesized model. The results stress the special importance of information quality, system quality (ease of use, presentation and functionality), service quality-citizen relationship management and public trust in determining citizens’ intention to use e-governance systems and their satisfaction with these systems. Moreover, the importance roles of service quality-security and policy environment and regulation as the antecedents of public trust in e-governance systems have been determined. The results also show that access to ICT has a mediating effect between intention to use and the actual use of e-governance systems by the citizens. In addition, the findings highlight the influential roles of actual use and citizens’ satisfaction with e-governance systems on their perceived net benefit from these systems. The empirical examination shows that the proposed model has high predictive power on the intention to use, the actual use and satisfaction with e-governance systems by citizens. This study adds to the body of knowledge on citizen-centric e-governance systems. Moreover, it sheds some new insights into D&M 2003 IS success model in e-governance context by finding the factors that represents the citizens’ needs and values on these systems and proposing a respecified and extended model. This
model gives a better understanding on the multidimensional and interdependent nature of citizens-centric e-governance systems success and demonstrates the dynamics of the relationships among the important constructs determining the effectiveness of these systems. With this understanding, governments, system developers and practitioners are in a better position not only to identify the needs and values of citizens toward e-governance systems but also to focus on the effectiveness in order to improve the overall success of e-governance systems.
Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi syarat untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

TERHADAP PENGARUH PERSPEKTIF BERPUSATKAN RAKYAT KE ATAS KEBERKESANAN SISTEM E-TADBIR URUS DI MALAYSIA

Oleh

SEYED MOHAMMAD BAGHER JAFARI

Julai 2012

Pengerusi: Profesor Madya Noor Azman Ali, PhD

Fakulti: Sekolah Pengajian Siswazah Pengurusan

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All the praise to God the Almighty for his blessing and benevolence

I wish to express my sincere gratitude and appreciation to the numerous individuals who have contributed towards the completion of this thesis:

- To my supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Noor Azman Ali and other members of the supervisory committee, Professor Dr. Murali Sambasivan and Dr. Mohd Fuaad Said, for all their invaluable advice, supervision and assistance during this research. Their encouragement, moral and technical support made this work possible.

- To MAMPU and all Malaysian citizens that contributed directly or indirectly in this research.

- To all staff in Graduate School of Management, Universiti Putra Malaysia who made my whole doctoral journey such a rewarding and fulfilling experience.

- To all my friends in Graduate School of Management and Universiti Putra Malaysia and in Malaysia for all their moral support.

- To my beloved wife, my lovely son and my dear parents and all family members whose continued prayers, constant support and understanding enabled me to complete this work.

Thank you all for your contributions.
May God bless you all.
I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on **09 July 2012** to conduct the final examination of Seyed Mohammadbagher Jafari on his thesis entitled **“Influence of Citizen-centric Perspective on the Effectiveness of e-Governance Systems in Malaysia”** in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges act 1971 and the constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A)106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

**Azmawani Ab Rahman, PhD**  
Senior Lecturer  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairperson)

**Ainin Sulaiman, PhD**  
Professor  
Faculty of Business and Accountancy  
University of Malaya  
(Internal Examiner)

**Rusli Abdullah, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Sushil Sharma, PhD**  
Professor  
Department of Information Systems and Operations Management  
Ball State University  
(External Examiner)

---

**FOONG SOON YAU, PhD**  
Professor/Deputy Dean  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
This thesis submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee are as follows:

**Noor Azman Ali, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Murali Sambasivan, PhD**  
Professor  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Mohd Fuaad Said, PhD**  
Senior Lecturer  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

---

**ARFAH SALLEH, PhD, FCPA (Aust)**  
Professor/Dean  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or any other institution.

SEYED MOHAMMAD BAGHER JAFARI
Date:
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPROVAL</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>xxiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTERS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1  INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Background of the Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Current Situation of e-Government and e-Governance in Malaysia</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 e-Governance Implementation Issues and Citizen-Centric Perspective</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Problem Statement</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Research Questions</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Research Objectives</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Scope of the Study</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Significance of the Study</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9 Definition of Terms</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10 Organization of the Thesis</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2  LITERATURE REVIEW</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 e-Governance Notion and Definition</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Differences between e-Governance and e-Government</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 e-Governance Models</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 e-Governance Maturity Models</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 e-Governance Implementation Issues</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Citizen-centric Perspective on e-Governance Effectiveness</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Theoretical Background of the Study</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.1 D&amp;M IS Success Model</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8.2 D&amp;M IS Success Model and e-Governance</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9 Reviewing the Recent Literature for Citizens’ Needs on e-Governance</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9.1 Selecting the Recent Literature</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9.2 Analyzing the Selected Literature</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xiii
2.10 Determinants of e-Governance Effectiveness  
   2.10.1 Information Quality Construct  
   2.10.2 System Quality Construct  
   2.10.3 Service Quality Construct  
   2.10.4 New Determinants on e-Governance Success  
   2.10.5 New Measures for Intention to Use, Use, User Satisfaction and Perceived Net Benefit in e-Governance Context  

2.11 Summary  

3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND HYPOTHESES DEVELOPMENT  

3.1 Introduction  

3.2 The Antecedents of Public Trust in e-Governance  
   3.2.1 Service Quality-Security and Public Trust  
   3.2.2 Access to Information and Public Trust  
   3.2.3 Policy Environment and Regulation and Public Trust  

3.3 The Determinants of Citizens Intention to Use and Satisfaction with e-Governance Systems  
   3.3.1 Information Quality, System Quality, Service Quality and Intention to Use e-Governance Systems  
   3.3.2 e-Interaction with Government and Intention to Use e-Governance Systems  
   3.3.3 Public Trust and Intention to Use e-Governance Systems  
   3.3.4 Information Quality, System Quality and Service Quality and User Satisfaction with e-Governance Systems  
   3.3.5 e-Interaction with Government and User Satisfaction With e-Governance Systems  
   3.3.6 Public Trust and User Satisfaction with e-Governance Systems  

3.4 Assessing the Role of Access to ICT and Connectivity between Intention to Use and the Actual Use of e-Governance Systems  

3.5 The Relationships among Use, User Satisfaction and Perceived Net Benefit from e-Governance Systems  

3.6 Citizens-Centric e-Governance Effectiveness Model  

3.7 Summary  

4 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY  

4.1 Introduction  

4.2 Research Design  
   4.2.1 Research Paradigm  
   4.2.2 Research Approach  
   4.2.3 Research Methodology  

4.3 Research Setting  

4.4 Sampling Design  
   4.4.1 Target Population  

xiv
4.4.2 Unit of Analysis 135
4.4.3 Sample Size 136
4.4.4 Sampling Frame and Sampling Method 138

4.5 Data Collection Method 140

4.6 Research Instrument and Questionnaire Design 141
4.6.1 Survey Items 141
4.6.2 Questionnaire Development 142
4.6.3 Positive and Negative Wording in the Questionnaire 143

4.7 Pre-Testing the Instrument 143
4.8 Pilot Study 144
4.9 Analytic Strategy for Assessing the Model 144
4.10 Summary 145

5 DATA ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS 147

5.1 Introduction 147

5.2 Questionnaire Administration 149
5.2.1 Pre-Testing the Survey Instrument 149
5.2.2 Pilot Test 150
5.2.3 Survey Administration and Sample 152
5.2.4 Survey Response Rate 153

5.3 Respondents’ Descriptive Statistics 153
5.3.1 e-Government Experience 153
5.3.2 Working Background 154
5.3.3 Respondents’ Location 155
5.3.4 Education Level 156
5.3.5 Respondents’ Age 157
5.3.6 Respondents’ Gender 157
5.3.7 Government Online Services Used Before 158

5.4 Descriptive Statistics of Constructs 160

5.5 Examining the Data for SEM (Data Screening) 161
5.5.1 Identifying Outliers 161
5.5.2 Test of Normality 162
5.5.3 Issue of Multicollinearity 163
5.5.4 Test of Common Method Bias 166

5.6 Construct Validity and Reliability 168
5.6.1 Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) 168
5.6.2 Convergent and Discriminant Validity 169
5.6.3 Reliability 171

5.7 First Order CFA 171
5.7.1 Information Quality 171
5.7.2 System Quality–Ease of Use 174
5.7.3 System Quality–Presentation 175
5.7.4 System Quality–Functionality 178
5.7.5 Service Quality–Citizen Relationship Management 182
5.7.6 e-Interaction with Government 184
5.7.7 Service Quality–Security 188
5.7.8 Intention to Use 189
5.7.9 User Satisfaction 192
5.7.10 Public Trust 194
5.7.11 Perceived Net Benefit 197
5.7.12 Policy Environment and Regulation, Access to Information, Access to ICT and Connectivity and Use 201

5.8 Measurement Model 205
5.9 Structural Model 212
  5.9.1 Model Fit Indices 212
  5.9.2 Path Analysis 219

5.10 Summary 232

6 DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION 234
6.1 Introduction 234
6.2 Theoretical Framework 236
6.3 Discussion and Conclusion Concerning the Hypotheses 237
  6.3.1 Roles of Service Quality–Security, Access to Information and Policy Environment and Regulation as Antecedents of Public Trust 238
  6.3.2 Roles of Information Quality, System Quality, Service Quality–Citizen Relationship Management, e–Interaction with Government and Public Trust in Intention to Use e-Governance Systems 243
  6.3.4 The Mediating Effect of Access to ICT in the Relationship between Intention to Use and Use of e-Governance Systems 266
  6.3.5 Relationship between Use, Citizens’ Satisfaction and Perceived Net Benefit of e-Governance Systems 267

6.4 Implications of the Study 271
  6.4.1 Theoretical Contribution 272
  6.4.2 Practical Contribution 274

6.5 Limitations of the Study 279
6.6 Recommendations for Future Studies 282
6.7 Summary 285

REFERENCES 286

APPENDIXES 310