DEVELOPING CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS IN THE ARGUMENTATIVE WRITING OF TERTIARY LEVEL STUDENTS IN A BLENDED LEARNING ENVIRONMENT

ZAHRA SHAHSAVAR

FBMK 2012 21
DEVELOPING CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS IN THE ARGUMENTATIVE WRITING OF TERTIARY LEVEL STUDENTS IN A BLENDED LEARNING ENVIRONMENT

By

ZAHRA SHAHSAVAR

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

July 2012
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

DEVELOPING CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS IN THE ARGUMENTATIVE WRITING OF TERTIARY LEVEL STUDENTS IN A BLENDED LEARNING ENVIRONMENT

By

ZAHRA SHAHSAVAR

July 2012

Supervisory Chairperson: Assoc. Prof. Tan Bee Hoon, PhD

Faculty: Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication

Argumentative writing has been recognized as an essential skill expected of tertiary level students. However, many students do not display critical thinking in their language skills such as argumentative writing, and most instructors have yet to fully consider the major role of critical thinking in students’ writing. This study aimed to develop critical thinking skills in the argumentative writing of tertiary level students in a blended learning environment.

The study employs a mixed-method research design to integrate quantitative and qualitative data collection and analysis. Participants were an intact class of tertiary level students enrolled in an obligatory course. In the quantitative data collection and analysis, a quasi-experiment was conducted to investigate the effects of critical thinking skill training and field-dependency on the students’ extent of critical thinking shown in
argumentative writing on the blog and their perception of the course blog before and after the training. The Group Embedded Figure Test was used to identify and categorize the students into field-dependent or field-independent. The Cornell Critical Thinking Test Level X and the Course Blog Perception Questionnaire were used to assess students’ critical thinking ability and perception of the course blog respectively. Results showed that field dependency did not have a significant effect on students’ criticalness on their blogging; however, field independent students seemed to take more thought in asking critical questions. Moreover, the critical thinking skill training had a significant positive effect on students’ perception of the course blog. Besides, both field dependent and field independent students perceived that using the course blog was effective in improving their writing skill. In the qualitative data collection and analysis, a text analysis approach was employed. Students’ blog posts and comments were collected and analyzed by applying two critical thinking assessment models: Newman, Webb, and Cochrane’s (1996) critical thinking model, and Paul and Elder’s (2007) Universal Intellectual Standard model. The results revealed that the critical thinking skill training did cause the significant increase in students’ critical thinking ability in their blogging that might have led to their improved argumentative writing skill. The triangulation of the quantitative and qualitative analyses further supported the conclusion that critical thinking skills can be trained and the training can make a significant improvement on students’ critical thinking ability.

The study suggests a new method of training critical thinking skills in a blended learning environment to improve students’ argumentative writing. Critical thinking training applied in this study can be considered effective and educators may adopt it to promote
critical thinking among students. If students learn the skill and language of critical thinking, they can apply it not only in their argumentative writing, but also into every subject they take and every discussion they engage in.
Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

PEMBINAAN KEMAHIRAN BERFIKIR SECARA KRITIS DALAM PENULISAN ARGUMENTATIF DI KALANGAN PELAJAR UNIVERSITI DALAM SEKITARAN PEMBELAJARAN BERPADU

Oleh

ZAHRA SHAHSAVAR

Jun 2012

Pengerusi Penyeliaan: Prof Madya Tan Bee Hoon, PhD

Fakulti: Fakulti Bahasa Moden dan Komunikasi

Penulisan argumentatif telah diiktiraf sebagai kemahiran penting yang diharapkan daripada pelajar-pelajar pengajian tinggi. Walau bagaimanapun, sebilangan besar pelajar tidak memaparkan pemikiran kritis di dalam kemahiran bahasa mereka seperti di dalam penulisan argumentatif, dan kebanyakan pengajar masih belum mempertimbangkan sepenuhnya peranan utama pemikiran kritis di dalam penulisan mereka. Kajian ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji pembinaan kemahiran berfikir secara kritis dalam penulisan argumentatif di kalangan pelajar universiti dalam sekitaran pembelajaran berpadu.

Kajian ini menggunakan reka bentuk kuasi-eksperimen dengan menggabungkan kutipan data dan analisis data secara kuantitatif dan kualitatif. Peserta merupakan pelajar kelas utuh dari pengajian tinggi yang mendaftar di dalam kursus wajib. Di dalam kutipan data
dan latihan itu boleh memberi kesan yang ketara untuk meningkatkan lagi kemahiran pelajar untuk berfikiran kritis.

Kajian ini mencadangkan kaedah baru dalam melatih kemahiran pemikiran kritis pelajar dalam persekitaran “blended learning” untuk mempertingkatkan penulisan argumentatif pelajar. Kesan positif latihan pemikiran kritis ke atas penulisan argumentatif pelajar boleh dianggap sebagai efektif dan para pendidik boleh menerima pakai latihan ini untuk menggalakan lagi pemikiran kritis di kalangan pelajar. Jika pelajar mempelajari bahasa pemikiran kritis, mereka boleh mengaplikasinya bukan sahaja untuk menulis hujah-hujah, tetapi juga di dalam setiap mata pelajaran yang diambil dan juga di dalam setiap perbincangan mereka.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It would have been impossible to write this doctoral thesis without the assistance and support of the kind people around me, to whom I am truly indebted and thankful.

First, I wish to express my gratitude to my main supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Tan Bee Hoon, for the invaluable support, patience, and guidance she gave me. She was unfailingly available for my questions and concerns, large or small, and always ready with thoughtful suggestions and valuable insights.

My gratitude also goes to the other members of my supervisory committee, Dr. Yap Ngee Thai, who had given me invaluable advice, encouragement, and careful guidance. I also wish to thank Associate Professor Dr. Bahaman Abu Samah for clarifying statistical procedures and answering questions.

I would like to acknowledge that this research study is privileged to be partly funded by the Research University Grant Scheme (RUGS) Initiative One awarded by the Ministry of Higher Education, Malaysia. The grant has helped to offset some financial constraint in conducting the research.

I also wish to express my deepest appreciation to Dr. Qiyun Wang of the National Institute of Education (NIE) of Singapore who always had the right answers for all my questions.
Last but not least, I am grateful to the unending support of my family. Although they were physically far from me, their constant support made this learning journey possible. I appreciate them more than words can express. To them I dedicate this thesis.
I certify that an Examination Committee has met on 11 June 2012 to conduct the final examination of Zahra Shahsavar on her Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled “Developing Critical Thinking Skills in the Argumentative Writing of Tertiary Level Students in a Blended Learning Environment” in accordance with Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Act 1980 and Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Regulations 1981. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Examination Committee are as follows:

**Faiz Sathi Abdullah, PhD**
Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairperson)

**Chan Swee Heng, PhD**
Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

**Wong Bee Eng, PhD**
Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

**Timothy James Newby, PhD**
Professor
Learning Design and Technology Faculty
Purdue University, Indiana, U.S.
(External Examiner)

**Seow Heng Fong, PhD**
Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Tan Bee Hoon, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairperson)

**Yap Ngee Thai, PhD**  
Senior lecturer  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Bahaman Abu Samah, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Institute for Social Science Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

---

**BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD**  
Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations, which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or other institutions.

ZAHRA SHAHSAVAR

Date: 11 June 2012
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

| ABSTRACT | ii |
| ABSTRAK  | v  |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | viii |
| APPROVAL   | x  |
| DECLARATION | xii |
| LIST OF TABLES  | xvi |
| LIST OF FIGURES   | xviii |
| LIST OF APPENDICES | xix |
| LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS | xx |

## CHAPTER

### 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study  
1.2 Problem Statement  
1.3 Purpose of the Study  
1.4 Theoretical Framework of the Study  
1.4.1 Constructivist Learning Theory  
1.4.2 Connectivist Learning Theory  
1.4.3 Theoretical Models  
1.5 Conceptual Framework of the Study  
1.6 Scope of the Study  
1.7 Significance of the Study  
1.8 Definition of Key Terms  
1.9 Summary  

### 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction  
2.2 Argumentative Writing  
2.3 Critical Thinking  
2.3.1 Defining Critical Thinking  
2.3.2 Studies on Critical Thinking and Argumentative Writing  
2.3.3 Multiple Aspects of Critical Thinking  
2.3.4 Socratic Questioning  
2.3.5 Critical Thinking Evaluation  
2.3.6 Critical Thinking Training in a Blended Learning Environment  
2.4 Blogs  
2.4.1 Blog Features  
2.4.2 Blog Applications  
2.4.3 Blog Effects in Education  
2.4.4 Blogs and Critical Thinking  

xiii