



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**EVALUATING TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY IN
TIOMAN ISLAND, MALAYSIA**

CHIA KEI WEI

FEP 2011 18

**EVALUATING TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY IN TIOMAN ISLAND,
MALAYSIA**

By

CHIA KEI WEI

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in
Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Science**

June 2011

Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science

EVALUATING TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY IN TIOMAN ISLAND, MALAYSIA

By

CHIA KEI WEI

June 2011

Chairman: Serine Ng Siew Imm, PhD

Faculty: Economics and Management

This thesis seeks to identify the sustainable island tourism problems faced by Tioman Island and to determine the sustainable status of the island from the perspectives of four stakeholder groups (residents, business operators, tourists, and government officers). A mixed methodology approach combining both quantitative and qualitative approach was adopted. The qualitative interviews uncovered 15 problems faced by the various stakeholder groups in the island. The 15 problems identified in the interviews were then used to construct questionnaire for further analysis. From the 320 returned questionnaire survey with four stakeholder groups, it was found that there was consensus among the 4 stakeholder groups for 8 of the problems faced by Tioman Island. In addition, the stakeholder cooperation percentage scores indicated that none of the stakeholder groups tried to escape from the responsibilities to help solving the problems. It was worth noted that government officers did not push the responsibility to other stakeholders. Finally, the

Sustainable Ecotourism Indicators System (SEIS) was used to assess the sustainability level of Tioman Island. The SEIS scores were revealed that the island is now at a “potential sustainable” stage which means that it is still potentially sustainable. This thesis broadens the literature on island tourism by adding additional two unique problems and also extends the spectrum of SEIS by incorporating additional 9 items in island destination. This thesis may help tourism planners, developers, and policy-makers to understand the current problems faced by the island so that strategies can be implemented accordingly to assess, to monitor, and to evaluate problems based on the cooperation percentage and consensus scores. Future study can be improved by conducting a longitudinal study, using Delphi technique to gain consensus opinions experts in that particular field, adding more stakeholder groups, and extending the SEIS beyond ecotourism context.

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senate Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Master Sains

**PENILAIAN KELESTARIAN PELANCONGAN DI PULAU TIOMAN,
MALAYSIA**

Oleh

CHIA KEI WEI

Jun 2011

Pengerusi: Serine Ng Siew Imm, PhD

Fakulti: Ekonomi dan Pengurusan

Tesis ini bertujuan untuk mengenalpasti masalah-masalah pelancongan pulau yang dihadapi oleh Pulau Tioman serta menilai kelestarian pulau dari perspektif empat kumpulan pemegang amanah (penduduk, peniaga, pelancong, dan pegawai kerajaan). Pendekatan 'mixed methodology' yang menggabungkan kedua-dua pendekatan kuantitatif dan kualitatif telah digunakan. Hasil keputusan temuduga mendapati 15 masalah sedang dihadapi oleh pelbagai pemegang amanah di pulau ini. Lima belas masalah-masalah yang dikenalpasti dari keputusan temuduga kemudian digunakan untuk membina soal-selidik bagi analisis yang selanjutnya. Borang soal selidik yang dikembalikan oleh 320 pemegang amanah menunjukkan kesepakatan keempat-empat pemegang amanah terhadap 8 masalah yang dihadapi oleh Pulau Tioman. Selain itu, peratusan skor kerjasama menunjukkan bahawa tidak ada pemegang amanah cuba melarikan diri dari

tanggungjawab untuk membantu menyelesaikan masalah-masalah. Salah satu daripada hasil penemuan yang menggalakkan merupakan gelagat pegawai kerajaan yang tidak menolak tanggungjawab kepada pemegang amanah yang lain. Akhirnya, Sistem Petunjuk Kelestarian Ekopelancongan (SEIS) telah digunakan untuk menilai tahap kelestarian Pulau Tioman. Skor SEIS menunjukkan bahawa pulau ini tergolong dalam tahap "berpotensi lestari" . Tesis ini memperkembangkan ulasan tentang pelancongan pulau dengan menambah dua masalah yang unik serta memperkembangkan spektrum SEIS dengan menambahkan 9 item dalam destinasi pelancongan pulau. Tesis ini dapat membantu perancang pelancongan, pemaaju, dan penggubal dasar untuk memahami masalah yang dihadapi oleh pulau supaya strategi boleh diterap untuk menilai, memantau, dan menilai masalah berdasarkan peratusan nilai kerjasama dan skor konsensus. Kajian pada masa depan boleh dipertingkatkan dengan menggunakan kajian 'longitudinal', dengan menggunakan teknik Delphi, iaitu untuk mendapatkan kesepakatan pendapat dari pihak pakar, menambahkan kumpulan pemegang amanah, dan memperluaskan penggunaan SEIS di luar konteks ekopelancongan.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The life of being a postgraduate student is like searching for light in the lost jungle. Luckily I found my 'light'. This research has led me to meet the best people I have ever met. I wish to express my sincere appreciation to the people who provided support, direction, and assistance toward the completion of this thesis. Without their words of encouragement and contributions, this thesis would not be finished.

First and foremost, this thesis is dedicated to my entire supervisor committee for their guidance and support. I am grateful and record my gratitude to my thesis advisor, Dr. Serene Ng Siew Imm for her endless patience, wisdom, guidance, ongoing support, great advice and being there when I needed help. Her door has always been opened to me when I encountered difficulties to discuss my thesis. I am privileged to have worked with you.

My sincere expression of gratitude is also extended to my thesis committee members for all of their helps, suggestions, and comments that have improved the finished work. I would like to express my sincere appreciation to Dr. Ho Jo Ann and Dr. Sridar a/l Ramachandran for taking the time to read and review this thesis and for their invaluable comments and suggestions, guidance and support. Their nurturing of my academic and professional development is highly valued and gratefully acknowledged.

My sincere appreciation also goes out to the Ministry of Higher Education, for kindly providing the ‘Mini Bajet’ scholarship throughout my study period. The Research University Grant Scheme (RUGS) provided by the Research Management Centre (RMC) was my financial support in the past two years at Universiti Putra Malaysia. The opportunities provided to graduate students through the provision of this support is priceless.

In addition, I want to acknowledge all the people who answered the surveys and interview. Without their contribution this thesis would not have been possible. I owe much gratitude to the local people and tourists in Tioman Island. I would also like to thank the wonderful people I met during my stay in Tioman Island. They shared with me their lives and experiences, which not only provided research material, but also enriched me as a person rather than a researcher. I was lucky to have had the chance to stay and spend the time in such a beautiful, exotic location for my research, the friendly people there made my stay such a successful and lovely, memorable experience. I am indebted to my friends’ for being there for me and for listening to my rants, complaints, and for always wanting to celebrate my successes.

Finally, I want to express gratitude to my family for their unconditional support. I would like to thank them for unconditional love, teachings, understanding and patience. I can’t tell you just how blessed and lucky I am to be part of such wonderful family. I want to share this happy moment with my mother, Lim Sai Choo. Her endless support and love are highly appreciated. Thank you for being my foundation. *I love you, mummy!*

I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 16 June, 2011 to conduct the final examination of Chia Kei Wei on his thesis entitled “**Evaluating Tourism Sustainability in Tioman Island, Malaysia**” in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded Master of Science (with thesis).

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Law Siong Hook, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Mohd Rusli Yacob, PhD

Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Yuhanis Ab. Aziz, PhD

Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Ahmad Puad Mat Som, PhD

School of Housing, Building & Planning
Universiti Sains Malaysia
(External Examiner)

SHAMSUDDIN SULAIMAN, PhD

Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Serine Ng Siew Imm, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Ho Jo Ann, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Graduate School of Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Sridar A/I Ramacharan, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Economics and Management
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

HASNAH MOHD.GHAZALI, PhD

Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or other institutions.

The logo of Universiti Putra Malaysia (UPM) is a shield-shaped emblem. It features a red and white geometric design with a central vertical element and a book icon at the top right. The letters 'UPM' are prominently displayed in a red box at the top left of the shield.

CHIA KEI WEI

Date: 16 June 2011

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	Page i
ABSTRAK	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
APPROVAL	vii
DECLARATION	ix
LIST OF TABLES	xiv
LIST OF FIGURES	xvii
LIST OF PICTURES	xviii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xix

CHAPTER

1	INTRODUCTION	
	1.1 Introduction	1
	1.2 Research Background	3
	1.2.1 Study Area	8
	1.2.2 Tourism Administration	14
	1.2.3 Tourism in Tioman Island	15
	1.3 Problem Statements	18
	1.4 Research Objectives	21
	1.5 Research Questions	22
	1.6 Significance of the Study	22
	1.7 Definition of Terms	24
	1.8 Organization of The Thesis	25
2	LITERATURE REVIEW	
	2.1 Introduction	27
	2.2 Stakeholder Theory	27
	2.2.1 Stakeholder in Tourism Industry	29
	2.3 Social Exchange Theory	33
	2.4 Ecotourism – Definitions, Concepts, Subsectors and Benefits	36
	2.5 Ecotourism and Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) in Malaysia	41
	2.6 Island Tourism Problems	46
	2.6.1 Island Tourism Problem in Malaysia	53
	2.7 Sustainable Tourism	56
	2.8 Sustainable Tourism Development	61
	2.9 Sustainable Tourism Indicators	66
	2.9.1 Criteria of Good Sustainability Indicators	66
	2.10 Conclusions	71

3	METHODOLOGY	
3.1	Introduction	73
3.2	Research Methodology	73
3.3.1	Quantitative Methodology	73
3.3.2	Qualitative Methodology	75
3.3.3	Mixed Methodology	77
3.3	Research Design	80
3.4	Sustainability Indicator Selection	83
3.4.1	Problem Classification	86
3.5	Data Collection Process and Measures	87
3.6	Sampling Technique	87
3.7	Qualitative Analysis	89
3.8	Quantitative Analysis	89
3.9	Overall Evaluation of Tourism Sustainability	90
3.10	Validity and Reliability	91
3.11	Conclusion	93
4	EXPLORATORY FINDINGS FOR TIOMAN ISLAND'S TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY	
4.1	Introduction	94
4.2	The Process of Qualitative Data Collection	94
4.3	Qualitative Findings	95
4.3.1	Demographic Profile for Stakeholder Groups	97
4.4	Qualitative findings: Problems Faced on Tioman Island	99
4.4.1	Shortage of Water Supply	102
4.4.2	Interruption of electricity supply	105
4.4.3	Ferry Problems	106
4.4.4	Limited Phone and Internet Access	109
4.4.5	Dirty Beaches	110
4.4.6	Poor Personal Safety and security	113
4.4.7	Unattractive Duty Free Shop	114
4.4.8	Expensive Food and Beverage	115
4.4.9	Distrust between Government (TDA) and Resident	115
4.4.10	Overdevelopment Issues	117
4.4.11	Poor Marine Park Management	119
4.4.12	Neglect of Local Community's Welfare	120
4.4.13	Limited Road Access	121
4.4.14	Economic Leakages	122
4.4.15	Airport Issues	123

4.5 Conclusion	125
5 DESCRIPTIVE AND ANOVA ANALYSIS	
5.1 Introduction	126
5.2 The Process of Quantitative Data Collection	126
5.3 Background of Respondents	128
5.4 Demographic Profile of Respondents	130
5.5 Problem Consensus Analysis Using AVOVA	133
5.5.1 Shortage of Water Supply	136
5.5.2 Interruption of Electricity Supply	137
5.5.3 Ferry Problems	137
5.5.4 Limited Phone and Internet Access	138
5.5.5 Dirty Beaches	138
5.5.6 Poor Personal Safety and Security	139
5.5.7 Unattractive Duty Free Shop	139
5.5.8 Expensive Food and Beverage	140
5.5.9 Distrust Between Government (TDA) and Resident	140
5.5.10 Overdevelopment Issues	141
5.5.11 Poor Marine Park Management	141
5.5.12 Neglect of Local Community's Welfare	142
5.5.13 Limited Road Access	142
5.5.14 Economic Leakages	142
5.5.15 Airport Issues	143
5.6 Stakeholder Group to Jointly Responsible in Solving Each of the Problems	146
5.7 Conclusion	152
6 SUSTAINABLE INDICATOR ANALYSIS	
6.1 Introduction	153
6.2 The Sustainable Ecotourism Indicators System (SEIS)	153
6.3 Evaluation Results	154
6.3.1 Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA)	155
6.3.2 Influence of Community on Resource	158
6.3.3 Influence of Community on Tourism	159
6.3.4 Influence of Resource on Community	160
6.3.5 Influence of Tourism on Community	161
6.3.6 Influence of Resource on Tourism	162
6.3.7 Influence of Tourism on Resource	163
6.4 Developing Sustainable Ecotourism Indicators System for Tioman Island	164
6.4.1 Calculation of Indicator Weights	164

6.5 Conclusion	172
7 SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	
7.1 Introduction	174
7.2 A Summary of Findings and Discussion of Results	174
7.3 Research Contributions	178
7.4 Practical Contributions	180
7.5 Theoretical Contributions	183
7.6 Limitations	184
7.7 Suggestions for Future Research	184
7.8 Conclusion	186
REFERENCES	187
APPENDICES	
Appendix A	223
Appendix B	225
Appendix C	230
Appendix D	240
Appendix E	247
Appendix F	255
BIODATA OF STUDENT	258