UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

EVALUATING TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY IN TIOMAN ISLAND, MALAYSIA

CHIA KEI WEI

FEP 2011 18
EVALUATING TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY IN TIOMAN ISLAND, MALAYSIA

By

CHIA KEI WEI

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Science

June 2011
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science

EVALUATING TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY IN TIOMAN ISLAND, MALAYSIA

By

CHIA KEI WEI

June 2011

Chairman: Serine Ng Siew Imm, PhD

Faculty: Economics and Management

This thesis seeks to identify the sustainable island tourism problems faced by Tioman Island and to determine the sustainable status of the island from the perspectives of four stakeholder groups (residents, business operators, tourists, and government officers). A mixed methodology approach combining both quantitative and qualitative approach was adopted. The qualitative interviews uncovered 15 problems faced by the various stakeholder groups in the island. The 15 problems identified in the interviews were then used to construct questionnaire for further analysis. From the 320 returned questionnaire survey with four stakeholder groups, it was found that there was consensus among the 4 stakeholder groups for 8 of the problems faced by Tioman Island. In addition, the stakeholder cooperation percentage scores indicated that none of the stakeholder groups tried to escape from the responsibilities to help solving the problems. It was worth noted that government officers did not push the responsibility to other stakeholders. Finally, the
Sustainable Ecotourism Indicators System (SEIS) was used to assess the sustainability level of Tioman Island. The SEIS scores were revealed that the island is now at a ‘‘potential sustainable’’ stage which means that it is still potentially sustainable. This thesis broadens the literature on island tourism by adding additional two unique problems and also extends the spectrum of SEIS by incorporating additional 9 items in island destination. This thesis may help tourism planners, developers, and policy-makers to understand the current problems faced by the island so that strategies can be implemented accordingly to assess, to monitor, and to evaluate problems based on the cooperation percentage and consensus scores. Future study can be improved by conducting a longitudinal study, using Delphi technique to gain consensus opinions experts in that particular field, adding more stakeholder groups, and extending the SEIS beyond ecotourism context.
PENILAIAN KELESTARIAN PELANCONGAN DI PULAU TIOMAN, MALAYSIA

Oleh

CHIA KEI WEI

Jun 2011

Pengerusi: Serine Ng Siew Imm, PhD

Fakulti: Ekonomi dan Pengurusan

Tesis ini bertujuan untuk mengenalpasti masalah-masalah pelancongan pulau yang dihadapi oleh Pulau Tioman serta menilai kelestarian pulau dari perspektif empat kumpulan pemegang amanah (penduduk, peniaga, pelancong, dan pegawai kerajaan). Pendekatan ‘mixed methodology’ yang menggabung kedua-dua pendekatan kuantitatif dan kualitatif telah digunakan. Hasil keputusan temuduga mendapati 15 masalah sedang dihadapi oleh pelbagai pemegang amanah di pulau ini. Lima belas masalah-masalah yang dikenalpasti dari keputusan temuduga kemudian digunakan untuk membina soal-selidik bagi analisis yang selanjutnya. Borang soal selidik yang dikembalikan oleh 320 pemegang amanah menunjukkan kesepakatan keempat-empat pemegang amanah terhadap 8 masalah yang dihadapi oleh Pulau Tioman. Selain itu, peratusan skor kerjasama menunjukkan bahawa tidak ada pemegang amanah cuba melarikan diri dari
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The life of being a postgraduate student is like searching for light in the lost jungle. Luckily I found my ‘light’. This research has led me to meet the best people I have ever met. I wish to express my sincere appreciation to the people who provided support, direction, and assistance toward the completion of this thesis. Without their words of encouragement and contributions, this thesis would not be finished.

First and foremost, this thesis is dedicated to my entire supervisor committee for their guidance and support. I am grateful and record my gratitude to my thesis advisor, Dr. Serene Ng Siew Imm for her endless patience, wisdom, guidance, ongoing support, great advice and being there when I needed help. Her door has always been opened to me when I encountered difficulties to discuss my thesis. I am privileged to have worked with you.

My sincere expression of gratitude is also extended to my thesis committee members for all of their helps, suggestions, and comments that have improved the finished work. I would like to express my sincere appreciation to Dr. Ho Jo Ann and Dr. Sridar a/l Ramachandran for taking the time to read and review this thesis and for their invaluable comments and suggestions, guidance and support. Their nurturing of my academic and professional development is highly valued and gratefully acknowledged.
My sincere appreciation also goes out to the Ministry of Higher Education, for kindly providing the ‘Mini Bajet’ scholarship throughout my study period. The Research University Grant Scheme (RUGS) provided by the Research Management Centre (RMC) was my financial support in the past two years at Universiti Putra Malaysia. The opportunities provided to graduate students through the provision of this support is priceless.

In addition, I want to acknowledge all the people who answered the surveys and interview. Without their contribution this thesis would not have been possible. I owe much gratitude to the local people and tourists in Tioman Island. I would also like to thank the wonderful people I met during my stay in Tioman Island. They shared with me their lives and experiences, which not only provided research material, but also enriched me as a person rather than a researcher. I was lucky to have had the chance to stay and spend the time in such a beautiful, exotic location for my research, the friendly people there made my stay such a successful and lovely, memorable experience. I am indebted to my friends’ for being there for me and for listening to my rants, complaints, and for always wanting to celebrate my successes.

Finally, I want to express gratitude to my family for their unconditional support. I would like to thank them for unconditional love, teachings, understanding and patience. I can’t tell you just how blessed and lucky I am to be part of such wonderful family. I want to share this happy moment with my mother, Lim Sai Choo. Her endless support and love are highly appreciated. Thank you for being my foundation. I love you, mummy!
I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 16 June, 2011 to conduct the final examination of Chia Kei Wei on his thesis entitled “Evaluating Tourism Sustainability in Tioman Island, Malaysia” in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded Master of Science (with thesis).

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

**Law Siong Hook, PhD**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Mohd Rusli Yacob, PhD**  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Yuhanis Ab. Aziz, PhD**  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Internal Examiner)

**Ahmad Puad Mat Som, PhD**  
School of Housing, Building & Planning  
Universiti Sains Malaysia  
(External Examiner)

______  
**SHAMSUDDIN SULAIMAN, PhD**  
Professor and Deputy Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  

Date:
This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Serine Ng Siew Imm, PhD**  
Senior Lecturer  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Ho Jo Ann, PhD**  
Senior Lecturer  
Graduate School of Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Sridar A/l Ramacharan, PhD**  
Senior Lecturer  
Faculty of Economics and Management  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

---

**HASNAH MOHD.GHAZALI, PhD**  
Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:
DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or other institutions.

__________________
CHIA KEI WEI

Date: 16 June 2011
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRAK</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPROVAL</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF PICTURES</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER

### 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction                                      1  
1.2 Research Background                              3  
   1.2.1 Study Area                                    8  
   1.2.2 Tourism Administration                        14 
   1.2.3 Tourism in Tioman Island                       15 
1.3 Problem Statements                               18  
1.4 Research Objectives                               21  
1.5 Research Questions                                22  
1.6 Significance of the Study                         22  
1.7 Definition of Terms                               24  
1.8 Organization of The Thesis                        25  

### 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction                                     27  
2.2 Stakeholder Theory                               27  
   2.2.1 Stakeholder in Tourism Industry               29  
2.3 Social Exchange Theory                            33  
2.4 Ecotourism – Definitions, Concepts, Subsectors and Benefits 36  
2.5 Ecotourism and Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) in Malaysia 41  
2.6 Island Tourism Problems                          46  
   2.6.1 Island Tourism Problem in Malaysia            53  
2.7 Sustainable Tourism                              56  
2.8 Sustainable Tourism Development                  61  
2.9 Sustainable Tourism Indicators                   66  
   2.9.1 Criteria of Good Sustainability Indicators   66  
2.10 Conclusions                                     71  

x
3 METHODOLOGY
3.1 Introduction 73
3.2 Research Methodology 73
  3.3.1 Quantitative Methodology 73
  3.3.2 Qualitative Methodology 75
  3.3.3 Mixed Methodology 77
3.3 Research Design 80
3.4 Sustainability Indicator Selection 83
  3.4.1 Problem Classification 86
3.5 Data Collection Process and Measures 87
3.6 Sampling Technique 87
3.7 Qualitative Analysis 89
3.8 Quantitative Analysis 89
3.9 Overall Evaluation of Tourism Sustainability 90
3.10 Validity and Reliability 91
3.11 Conclusion 93

4 EXPLORATORY FINDINGS FOR TIOMAN ISLAND’S TOURISM SUSTAINABILITY
4.1 Introduction 94
4.2 The Process of Qualitative Data Collection 94
4.3 Qualitative Findings 95
  4.3.1 Demographic Profile for Stakeholder Groups 97
4.4 Qualitative findings: Problems Faced on Tioman Island 99
  4.4.1 Shortage of Water Supply 102
  4.4.2 Interruption of electricity supply 105
  4.4.3 Ferry Problems 106
  4.4.4 Limited Phone and Internet Access 109
  4.4.5 Dirty Beaches 110
  4.4.6 Poor Personal Safety and security 113
  4.4.7 Unattractive Duty Free Shop 114
  4.4.8 Expensive Food and Beverage 115
  4.4.9 Distrust between Government (TDA) and Resident 115
  4.4.10 Overdevelopment Issues 117
  4.4.11 Poor Marine Park Management 119
  4.4.12 Neglect of Local Community’s Welfare 120
  4.4.13 Limited Road Access 121
  4.4.14 Economic Leakages 122
  4.4.15 Airport Issues 123
4.5 Conclusion

5 DESCRIPTIVE AND ANOVA ANALYSIS

5.1 Introduction 126
5.2 The Process of Quantitative Data Collection 126
5.3 Background of Respondents 128
5.4 Demographic Profile of Respondents 130
5.5 Problem Consensus Analysis Using AVOVA 133
  5.5.1 Shortage of Water Supply 136
  5.5.2 Interruption of Electricity Supply 137
  5.5.3 Ferry Problems 137
  5.5.4 Limited Phone and Internet Access 138
  5.5.5 Dirty Beaches 138
  5.5.6 Poor Personal Safety and Security 139
  5.5.7 Unattractive Duty Free Shop 139
  5.5.8 Expensive Food and Beverage 140
  5.5.9 Distrust Between Government (TDA) and Resident 140
  5.5.10 Overdevelopment Issues 141
  5.5.11 Poor Marine Park Management 141
  5.5.12 Neglect of Local Community’s Welfare 142
  5.5.13 Limited Road Access 142
  5.5.14 Economic Leakages 142
  5.5.15 Airport Issues 143
5.6 Stakeholder Group to Jointly Responsible in Solving Each of the Problems 146
5.7 Conclusion 152

6 SUSTAINABLE INDICATOR ANALYSIS

6.1 Introduction 153
6.2 The Sustainable Ecotourism Indicators System (SEIS) 153
6.3 Evaluation Results 154
  6.3.1 Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) 155
  6.3.2 Influence of Community on Resource 158
  6.3.3 Influence of Community on Tourism 159
  6.3.4 Influence of Resource on Community 160
  6.3.5 Influence of Tourism on Community 161
  6.3.6 Influence of Resource on Tourism 162
  6.3.7 Influence of Tourism on Resource 163
6.4 Developing Sustainable Ecotourism Indicators System for Tioman Island
  6.4.1 Calculation of Indicator Weights 164
7 SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

7.1 Introduction 174
7.2 A Summary of Findings and Discussion of Results 174
7.3 Research Contributions 178
7.4 Practical Contributions 180
7.5 Theoretical Contributions 183
7.6 Limitations 184
7.7 Suggestions for Future Research 184
7.8 Conclusion 186

REFERENCES 187

APPENDICES

Appendix A 223
Appendix B 225
Appendix C 230
Appendix D 240
Appendix E 247
Appendix F 255

BIODATA OF STUDENT 258