



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**INSECTICIDE APPLICATION PRACTICES AMONG LOWLAND AND
HIGHLAND CRUCIFEROUS VEGETABLE FARMERS AND THEIR
RELATIONSHIP UPON PLUTELLA XYLOSTELLA L. RESISTANCE
DEVELOPMENT**

CHIA MEEI KEE

FP 2010 12



**INSECTICIDE APPLICATION PRACTICES AMONG LOWLAND AND
HIGHLAND CRUCIFEROUS VEGETABLE FARMERS AND THEIR
RELATIONSHIP UPON *PLUTELLA XYLOSTELLA* L. RESISTANCE
DEVELOPMENT**

By

CHIA MEEI KEE

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra
Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirement for the Degree of Master of
Science**

October 2010



To

My Parents with love



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia
in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science

**INSECTICIDE APPLICATION PRACTICES AMONG LOWLAND AND
HIGHLAND CRUCIFEROUS VEGETABLE FARMERS AND THEIR
RELATIONSHIP UPON *PLUTELLA XYLOSTELLA* L. RESISTANCE
DEVELOPMENT**

By

CHIA MEEI KEE

October 2010

Chairman: Professor Dzolkhifli Omar, PhD

Faculty: Agriculture

This study aimed to evaluate the insecticides resistance development of diamondback moth (DBM), *Plutella xylostella* L. in relation to insecticide application practices. A study was initiated with a survey to assess the current insecticides application practices for controlling DBM in the highland and lowland areas in Malaysia. Survey data were analyzed with SPSS statistical software using Independent-samples T-test and Pearson correlation where appropriate. The survey showed complete reliance on insecticide mixtures to control DBM. A total of 11 and 14 active ingredients of insecticides were found to be commonly used in the lowland and highland respectively. The percentage of highland farmers used indoxacarb, spinosad, pyridalyl and fipronil was higher than lowland farmers, while lowland farmers recorded higher usage of chlorfenapyr than highland farmers. Besides that, a comparative usage for emamectin benzoate was reported, with slight greater use in the lowland (53%) than highland (41%). Highland farmers were found to apply significantly higher spray volume at 3.8-fold greater than lowland farmers ($t = 7.361$;



$P < 0.05$). Majority of insecticides were applied at tank concentrations below recommended doses. Highland farmers were found to apply significantly lower doses of emamectin benzoate compared to lowland farmers.

A leaf-dip bioassay was conducted to investigate the susceptibilities of two DBM field strains to the six selected commonly used insecticides among the cruciferous vegetable farmers namely emamectin benzoate, spinosad, indoxacarb, fipronil, pyridalyl and chlorfenapyr. Results from the bioassays showed inter-population genetic variation in susceptibility between the two field strains of DBM. Higher LC values for all the insecticides except chlorfenapyr were reported on the Highland strain indicating that the Lowland strain is more susceptible to most of the insecticides tested. Comparison of LC_{50} values between the two strains showed that the Highland strain is significantly ($P < 0.05$) less susceptible to spinosad and pyridalyl than lowland strain. On the other hand, Lowland strain was significantly ($P < 0.05$) less susceptible to chlorfenapyr. The reported higher LC_{50} values were consistent with greater uses of the insecticides in respective location and the inter-population variation in susceptibility of DBM is due to local insecticide selection. With a lower usage but significantly higher LC_{90} for emamectin benzoate, the results suggested that reduced doses of emamectin benzoate practiced by the highland farmers accelerated the rate of resistance development in DBM.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia
sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Master Sains

**AMALAN PENGGUNAAN RACUN SERANGGA DI KALANGAN PETANI
SAYUR-SAYURAN KRUSIFER TANAH RENDAH DAN TANAH TINGGI
SERTA HUBUNG KAITNYA DENGAN PERKEMBANGAN
KERESISTENAN *PLUTELLA XYLOSTELLA* L.**

Oleh

CHIA MEEI KEE

Oktober 2010

Pengerusi: Profesor Dzolkhifli Omar, PhD

Fakulti: Pertanian

Kajian ini bertujuan untuk menilai perkembangan keresistenan rama-rama intan (DBM), *Plutella xylostella* L. berhubungkait dengan amalan penggunaan racun serangga. Satu kajian dimulakan dengan soal selidik bagi meneliti amalan penggunaan semasa racun serangga untuk mengawal DBM di kawasan tanah tinggi dan tanah rendah di Malaysia. Data-data soal selidik dianalisis dengan perisian statistik SPSS menggunakan ujian T sampel bebas (*Independent-samples T-test*) dan korelasi Pearson (*Pearson correlation*) di mana yang sesuai. Kajian soal selidik memperlihatkan kebergantungan sepenuhnya pada campuran racun serangga untuk mengawal DBM. Sebanyak 11 dan 14 jenis perawis aktif racun serangga didapati kerap digunakan di tanah rendah dan tanah tinggi masing-masing. Peratusan petani tanah tinggi menggunakan indoxacarb, spinosad, fipronil dan pyridalyl adalah lebih tinggi daripada petani tanah rendah, sedangkan petani tanah rendah menunjukkan penggunaan yang lebih tinggi untuk chlorfenapyr. Di samping itu, penggunaan emamectin benzoate yang setanding juga dilaporkan, dengan penggunaan yang lebih

tinggi di tanah rendah (53%) berbanding tanah tinggi (41%). Petani tanah tinggi didapati menggunakan isi padu semburan yang nyata lebih tinggi, pada kadar 3.8-kali lebih tinggi daripada petani tanah rendah ($t = 7.361$; $P < 0.05$). Kebanyakan racun serangga disemur pada kepekatan tangki di bawah sukatan yang disyorkan. Petani tanah tinggi juga didapati menggunakan emamectin benzoate pada sukatan jauh lebih rendah daripada petani tanah rendah.

Satu teknik bioassai celup-daun dijalankan untuk mengkaji kepekaan kedua-dua strain ladang DBM terhadap enam jenis racun serangga terpilih yang kerap digunakan di kalangan petani sayur-sayuran krusifer iaitu emamectin benzoate, spinosad, indoxacarb, fipronil, pyridalyl dan chlorfenapyr. Keputusan bioassai menunjukkan variasi genetik inter-populasi dalam kepekaan antara dua strain ladang DBM. Nilai-nilai LC yang lebih tinggi untuk semua racun serangga, kecuali chlorfenapyr dilaporkan pada strain Tanah Tinggi menunjukkan strain Tanah Rendah adalah lebih peka kepada kebanyakan racun serangga yang diuji. Perbandingan nilai-nilai LC₅₀ antara kedua-dua strain menunjukkan strain Tanah Tinggi adalah nyata ($P < 0.05$) kurang peka kepada spinosad dan pyridalyl berbanding strain Tanah Rendah. Sebaliknya, strain Tanah Rendah pula jauh ($P < 0.05$) kurang peka kepada chlorfenapyr. Laporan nilai-nilai LC₅₀ yang tinggi adalah seiring dengan lebih penggunaan racun serangga di lokasi masing-masing dan variasi inter-populasi dalam kepekaan DBM adalah disebabkan pemilihan racun serangga setempat. Dengan penggunaan yang lebih rendah tetapi LC₉₀ yang jauh lebih tinggi bagi emamectin benzoate, keputusan menganjurkan bahawa pengaplikasian sukatan emamectin benzoate yang lebih rendah oleh petani tanah tinggi mempercepatkan kadar perkembangan koresistensi bagi DBM.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The completion of this study would not be possible without the helps and supports from various parties. I am deeply thankful to my employer, Brightonmax International Sdn. Bhd., for permission and support throughout the study.

With this opportunity, I would like to express my most sincere appreciation to the members of the supervisory committee, Prof. Dr. Dzolkhifli Omar and Dr. Norida Mazlan for their ideas, advices and guidance throughout the course of this study.

Profound gratitude is extended to Universiti Putra Malaysia, with the research facilities in Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture for conduct of the experiments.

I deeply appreciate the assistance of Mr. Eddie Chan and Ms. Tay Hui Ein in arranging the farmers' interviews in Cameron Highlands and Bukit Gambir, respectively. I am particularly thankful to all the farmers for their valuable time and close cooperation during the interviews.

Sincere thanks are extended to Mr. Chow Kim Keong from Cameron Highlands, also Mr. Kang Chong Siou and Mr. Kang Tai Hock from Bukit Gambir, for help in larvae collections of diamondback moth. Thank you for their willingness to spare the



unsprayed vegetable plots for the breeding sites of DBM. It's really a challenging task to obtain field strains for bioassays!

My gratitude is also due to Mr. Tan So Tiok (President of The Federation of Malaysian Vegetable Growers Association), Mr. Chay Ee Mong (Secretary of Cameron Highlands Vegetable Growers Association) and Mrs. Siti Aishah Bt. Maimoon (FAMA, Cameron Highlands) for providing background information about vegetable cultivation in Bukit Gambir and Cameron Highlands. I am also deeply grateful to the helps given by Mrs. Nik Haselina Nik Hassan from Pesticides Control Division, Department of Agriculture, particularly in confirming date of registration for the insecticides.

Last but by no means least; sincere thanks are dedicated to my dearest parents and family members for their supports and encouragement.



I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 7 October 2010 to conduct the final examination of Chia Meei Kee on her thesis entitled “Insecticide Application Practices among Lowland and Highland Cruciferous Vegetable Farmers and their Relationship upon *Plutella xylostella* L. Resistance Development” in accordance with the Universities and University College Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The committee recommends that the student be awarded the Master of Science.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Kamaruzaman b Sijam, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Agriculture
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Hafidzi b Mohd Noor, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Agriculture
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Nur Azura binti Adam, PhD

Lecturer
Faculty of Agriculture
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Idris Abd Ghani, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Science and Technology
Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia
(External Examiner)

SHAMSUDDIN SULAIMAN, PhD

Professor and Deputy Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 23 December 2010



This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Dzolkhifli Omar, PhD

Professor

Faculty of Agriculture

Universiti Putra Malaysia

(Chairman)

Norida Mazlan, PhD

Lecturer

Faculty of Agriculture

Universiti Putra Malaysia

(Member)

HASANAH MOHD GHAZALI, PhD

Professor and Dean

School of Graduate Studies

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 13 January 2011



DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or at any other institution.

CHIA MEEI KEE

Date: 7 October 2010



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT	iii
ABSTRAK	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
APPROVAL SHEETS	ix
DECLARATION FORM	xi
LIST OF TABLES	xiv
LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
LIST OF PLATES	xvii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xviii
CHAPTER	
1 INTRODUCTION	1
2 LITERATURE REVIEW	4
2.1 Vegetable Cultivation in Malaysia	4
2.2 Use of Pesticides in Malaysia	5
2.3 Biology, Ecology and Management of Diamondback Moth	6
2.4 Evolution of Resistance to Insecticides	9
2.4.1 Status of Resistance	13
2.4.2 Factors Influencing the Evolution of Resistance	14
2.5 Resistance of Insecticides with Novel Modes of Action	17
2.5.1 Fipronil	18
2.5.2 Chlorfenapyr	18
2.5.3 Spinosad	19
2.5.4 Indoxacarb	20
2.5.5 Emamectin benzoate	21
2.5.6 Pyridalyl	22
2.6 Insecticide Resistance Detection by Bioassay	22
2.7 Resistance Management in Arthropods	24
2.7.1 Management by Moderation – “Low-dose”	26
2.7.2 Management by Saturation – “High-dose”	26
2.7.3 Management by Multiple Attacks	29
3 SURVEY ON THE CURRENT INSECTICIDE APPLICATION PRACTICES TO CONTROL DIAMONDBACK MOTH IN THE LOWLAND AND HIGHLAND OF PENINSULAR MALAYSIA	30
3.1 Introduction	30
3.2 Materials and Methods	31



3.2.1	Study Locations	31
3.2.2	Farmers Interviews	32
3.2.3	Statistical Analysis	33
3.3	Results and Discussion	33
3.3.1	Background of the Study	33
3.3.2	Farmers' Knowledge and Perceptions of Pests and Diseases	39
3.3.3	Pest Management Practices	41
3.3.4	DBM Resistance Problem	60
3.4	Conclusion	62
4	SUSCEPTIBILITY OF DIAMONDBACK MOTHS TO SELECTED COMMONLY USED INSECTICIDES	65
4.1	Introduction	65
4.2	Materials and Methods	68
4.2.1	Insects	68
4.2.2	Chemicals	68
4.2.3	Leaf-dip Bioassays	69
4.2.4	Statistical Analysis	69
4.3	Results and Discussion	71
4.4	Conclusion	79
5	RESISTANCE DEVELOPMENT OF DIAMONDBACK MOTHS IN RELATION TO INSECTICIDE APPLICATION PRACTICES	81
5.1	Introduction	81
5.2	Insecticide Selection Pressure	83
5.3	Effective Application Doses	84
5.3.1	Ratio of Application Doses and LC ₉₀	85
5.3.2	Ratio of Recommended Doses and LC ₉₀	87
5.4	Conclusion	89
6	SUMMARY, GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	90
6.1	Summary and General Conclusion	90
6.2	Recommendations for Future Research	94
	REFERENCES	95
	APPENDIX	
A	Survey Questionnaire (English)	109
B	Survey Questionnaire (Bahasa Malaysia)	120
C	Survey Questionnaire (Chinese)	131
	BIODATA OF STUDENT	142

