



**METABOLITE PROFILING, IDENTIFICATION AND QUANTIFICATION OF
PECTORALIS MAJOR AND SERUM FROM DIFFERENT CHICKEN BREEDS**

By

TAN CHENG KENG

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra
Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of
Science**

November 2022

IPTSM 2022 13

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in
fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science

METABOLITE PROFILING, IDENTIFICATION AND QUANTIFICATION OF PECTORALIS MAJOR AND SERUM FROM DIFFERENT CHICKEN BREEDS

By

TAN CHENG KENG

November 2022

Chair : Prof. Jinap Selamat, PhD
Institute : Tropical Agriculture and Food Security

In Malaysia, local village chicken, known as “Ayam kampung”, is a premium chicken meat sold at a higher price than other chicken breeds. Food fraud involving the sale of colored broiler chicken as village chicken is motivated by a three to four-fold increase in profit due to their similar appearances and size. A previous study of chicken and beef products in Malaysia's local markets reported that approximately 78% of these products were associated with meat substitution and mislabelling. The objectives of this study are to distinguish four chicken breeds and further identify potential distinguishing metabolites corresponding to each chicken breed using gas chromatography-mass spectrometry (GC-MS) and nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) spectroscopy with an untargeted metabolomics approach. Four types of chicken breeds were obtained from commercial farms, comprising of local village chicken, broiler chicken (Cobb), spent laying chicken (Dekalb), and colored broiler chicken (Hubbard). All pectoralis major and serum samples of four chicken breeds were analyzed using GC-MS and NMR. The multivariate analysis was applied through principal component analysis (PCA) and orthogonal partial least squares discriminant analysis (OPLS-DA) assessments for GC-MS and NMR results. For GC-MS, all four chicken breeds were successfully separated into three distinct groups, with 30 and 40 characteristic metabolites identified for the pectoralis major and serum, respectively. Similarly, for NMR, all four chicken breeds were separated into three main groups, with 14 and 14 characteristic metabolites identified for the pectoralis major and serum, respectively. Both pectoralis major and serum were characterized by an abundance of metabolites comprising amino acids (alanine, glutamic acid, glycine, threonine, serine), fatty acid (linoleic acid), nucleotides (inosine monophosphate, nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide), organic acids (lactic acid, succinic acid and 3-hydroxybutyric acid), peptide (anserine), sugars (allose and glucose), sugar alcohol (myo-inositol), and other compounds under both analytical platforms. From the multivariate analysis, local village chicken was successfully differentiated from other commercial breeds by pectoralis major and serum under GC-MS and NMR, respectively. The present

GC-MS results for pectoralis major showed that local village chicken was not separated from colored broiler (Hubbard). In conclusion, the present results proved that an untargeted metabolomics approach coupled with GC-MS and NMR is suitable for differentiating different chicken breeds from commercial farms. The identified potential metabolites characterized for respective chicken breeds derived from multivariate analysis provide basic information on discriminating metabolites and references in chicken meat authentication for related regulatory authorities.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia
sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Master Sains

PEMPROFILAN, IDENTIFIKASI DAN KUANTIFIKASI METABOLIT DALAM PEKTORALIS MAJOR DAN SERUM DARIPADA AYAM YANG BERBEZA BAKA

Oleh

TAN CHENG KENG

November 2022

Pengerusi : Prof. Jinap Selamat, PhD
Institut : Pertanian Tropika dan Sekuriti Makanan

Di Malaysia, ayam kampung tempatan yang dikenali sebagai “ayam kampung” merupakan daging ayam permium yang dijual pada harga yang lebih tinggi berbanding dengan baka ayam yang lain. Penipuan yang melibatkan penjualan ayam pedaging berwarna sebagai ayam kampung adalah didorong oleh peningkatan keuntungan dari tiga sehingga empat kali ganda disebabkan oleh rupa dan saiz yang sama. Satu kajian terdahulu bagi produk ayam dan daging yang terdapat dalam pasaran tempatan di Malaysia telah melaporkan bahawa kira-kira 78% daripada produk-produk ini adalah dikaitkan dengan penggantian daging dan perlabelan yang salah. Objektif kajian ini adalah untuk membezakan empat baka ayam dan seterusnya mengenalpasti metabolit pembezaan berpotensi yang sepadan dengan setiap baka ayam dengan menggunakan kromatografi gas spektrometri jisim (GC-MS) dan spektroskopi resonans magnetik nuklear (NMR) menerusi pendekatan metabolomik yang tidak bersasar. Empat jenis baka ayam telah diperolehi daripada ladang komersial, terdiri daripada ayam kampung tempatan, ayam pedaging (Cobb), ayam penelur tua (Dekalb) dan ayam pedaging berwarna (Hubbard). Semua sampel pektoralis major dan serum bagi empat jenis baka ayam telah dianalisa dengan menggunakan GC-MS dan NMR. Analisis multivariat telah digunakan menerusi penilaian analisis komponen utama (PCA) dan analisis diskriminasi kuasa dua terkecil separa ortogon (OPLS-DA) bagi keputusan GC-MS dan NMR. Untuk GC-MS, keempat-empat baka ayam telah berjaya diasingkan kepada tiga kumpulan yang berbeza, dengan pengenalpastian 30 dan 40 metabolit ciri masing-masing untuk pektoralis major dan serum. Begitu juga dengan NMR, keempat-empat baka ayam telah diasingkan kepada tiga kumpulan utama, dengan pengenalpastian 14 dan 14 metabolit ciri masing-masing dalam pektoralis major dan serum. Kedua-dua pektoralis major dan serum telah

dicirikan oleh banyak metabolit yang terdiri daripada asid amino (alanina, asid glutamat, glisina, treonina, serina), asid lemak (asid linoleik), nukleotida (inosin monofosfat, nikotinamida adenina dinukleotida), asid organik (asid laktik, asid suksinik dan asid 3-hidrosibutirik), peptida (anserin), gula (allosa dan glukosa), gula alkohol (myo-inositol), dan sebatian lain di bawah kedua-dua platform analisis. Berdasarkan analisis multivariat, ayam kampung tempatan berjaya dibezakan daripada baka komersial yang lain oleh pektoralis major dan serum masing-masing dengan menggunakan GC-MS and NMR. Keputusan GC-MS bagi pektoralis major dalam kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa ayam kampung tempatan tidak dapat dibezakan daripada ayam pedaging berwarna (Hubbard). Secara kesimpulan, keputusan dalam kajian ini telah membuktikan bahawa pendekatan metabolomik yang tidak bersasar berasaskan GC-MS dan NMR adalah sesuai digunakan untuk membezakan baka ayam yang berlainan daripada ladang komersial. Metabolit berpotensi yang dikenalpasti dan dicirikan dengan baka ayam berkenaan yang diperolehi daripada analisis multivariat telah memberikan maklumat asas terhadap metabolit yang membezakan baka ayam dan menjadi rujukan dalam pengesahan daging ayam bagi kegunaan agensi penguatkuasaan yang berkaitan.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank and express my sincere appreciation to Prof. Dr. Jinap Selamat for her guidances and supports throughout the completion of this master study journey. Besides, I would also like to thank Prof. Dr Alfi Khatib, Dr Nuzul and Dr Rashidah for their guidance and helps in this research work. Special thanks to Dr Suganya and Dr Azira for their comments and suggestions in this research work.

My thanks also go to my late father, who always supported and motivated me to be a better person. My warmest thanks to my mother and siblings for their love, support and prayers to me all the time.

I would like to thank the Ministry of Health (MOH), Malaysia, for granting me a scholarship for this master study. Special thanks for the facilities rendered by the National Public Health Laboratory, MOH, Malaysia and the Institute of Tropical Agriculture and Food Security, Universiti Putra Malaysia. Not forgetting my friends and colleagues, Ghanthimathi, Sharmili, Faizah, Mazliza, Sara, Eddy, Imah, Puteri Amirah, Haida, Rose Helda, Yugi, Ain Zakaria, Priscilla, Aniza, Hamizah, Janagi and Liyana for their kind helps and supports in this research study.

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Jinap binti Selamat, PhD

Professor
Institute of Tropical Agriculture and Food Security
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Rashidah binti Sukor, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Nuzul Noorahya binti Jambari, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Alfi Khatib, PhD

Professor
Department of Pharmaceutical Chemistry, Kulliyyah of Pharmacy
International Islamic University Malaysia, Kuantan
(Member)

ZALILAH MOHD SHARIFF, PhD

Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 12 January 2023

Declaration by Graduate Student

I hereby confirm that:

- this thesis is my original work;
- quotations, illustrations and citations have been duly referenced;
- this thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any institutions;
- intellectual property from the thesis and the copyright of the thesis are fully-owned by Universiti Putra Malaysia, as stipulated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- written permission must be obtained from the supervisor and the office of the Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and innovation) before the thesis is published in any written, printed or electronic form (including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture notes, learning modules or any other materials) as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- there is no plagiarism or data falsification/fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld in accordance with the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2015-2016) and the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Name and Matric No.: Tan Cheng Keng

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	Page
ABSTRAK	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
APPROVAL	v
DECLARATION	vi
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	xii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xv
LIST OF APPENDICES	xvii
	xx

CHAPTER

1	INTRODUCTION	
1.1	Background of the study	1
1.2	Problem statements	1
1.3	Significant of the study	2
1.4	Hypothesis	2
1.5	Objectives of the study	3
2	LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1	Chicken	4
2.1.1	Broiler and colored broiler	5
2.1.2	Village chicken	6
2.1.3	Layer	6
2.1.4	Wild gallus species	7
2.2	Chemical composition of chicken	7
2.2.1	Meat composition	7
2.2.2	Protein	7
2.2.3	Fat	8
2.2.4	Vitamin and minerals	8
2.3	Metabolomics in food authentication	9
2.3.1	Sample part selection of chicken breeds in metabolomics study	18
2.4	Instrumentation in metabolomics study	18
2.5	Multivariate data analysis in metabolomics study	19
2.6	Method validation in chemical analysis	20
2.6.1	Limit of detection and limit of quantitation	20
2.6.2	Linearity and working range	20
2.6.3	Precision	24
2.6.4	Trueness	25
3	MATERIAL AND METHODS FOR UNTARGETED METABOLOMICS STUDY OF PECTORALIS MAJOR AND SERUM BY GC-MS AND NMR WITH METHOD VALIDATION OF GC-MS EXTRACTION PROTOCOLS	
3.1	Introduction	26
3.2	Materials and Methods	27
3.2.1	Chemicals, standards and reagents	27

3.2.2	Sample collection	27
3.2.3	Preparation of quality control samples	29
3.2.4	Proximate analysis for feed samples	29
3.2.5	Sample analysis for GC-MS	30
3.2.6	Sample analysis for NMR spectroscopy	34
3.2.7	Equipments	36
3.3	Results and discussion	36
3.3.1	Method validation of extraction methods by GC-MS	36
3.3.2	Proximate analysis of feed samples	48
3.4	Conclusion	49
4	METABOLITES PROFILING, IDENTIFICATION AND QUANTIFICATION FOR DIFFERENT CHICKEN BREEDS BY USING GC-MS AND NMR	
4.1	Introduction	50
4.2	Materials and methods	51
4.2.1	Chemicals, standards and reagents	51
4.2.2	Sample collection	51
4.2.3	Sample extraction method by GC-MS	51
4.2.4	Sample extraction method by NMR spectroscopy	52
4.2.5	Multivariate data analysis for GC-MS and NMR data	53
4.3	Results and discussions	53
4.3.1	Metabolites characterization and quantitation results by GC-MS	53
4.3.2	Metabolites characterization and quantitation results by NMR	64
4.4	Conclusion	78
5	SUMMARY, GENERAL CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	
5.1	Summary	79
5.2	General Conclusion	80
5.3	Recommendation for future research	81
	REFERENCES	82
	APPENDICES	97
	BIODATA OF STUDENT	132
	LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	133

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
2.1 Live animal numbers, top five (2017) (thousand heads)	4
2.2 Information of four different chicken breeds	5
2.3 List of essential and non-essential amino acids in broiler meat	8
2.4 Vitamins and Minerals content (per 100 g) in raw chicken meat	9
2.5 Potential biomarkers for food authenticity, quality and safety monitoring	11
2.6 Content of metabolites in chicken meat and blood samples	16
2.7 Parameters calculated for linearity assessment	22
2.8 Analysis of variance (ANOVA) table for linearity assessment	23
2.9 Concentration and mass fraction for PRSD _r and PRSD _R	24
2.10 The acceptable range of recovery based on the analyte concentration	25
3.1 Market age and size of chicken breeds	28
3.2 Test method number for proximate analysis	29
3.3 Three concentration levels of compounds applied in the precision study for pectoralis major	33
3.4 Three concentration levels of compounds applied in the precision study for serum	33
3.5 The concentration level of internal standards for pectoralis major (µg/mg) and serum (µg/mL)	34
3.6 LOD and LOQ for pectoralis major by GC-MS	39
3.7 LOD and LOQ for chicken serum by GC-MS	39
3.8 Calibration curve equation, linearity range, and R ² for pectoralis major by GC-MS	40

3.9	Calibration curve equation, linearity range, and R^2 for chicken serum by GC-MS	41
3.10	RSD_r , $PRSD_r$ and ratio RSD_r : $PRSD_r$ of each concentration level for pectoralis major by GC-MS	42
3.11	RSD_r , $PRSD_r$ and ratio RSD_r : $PRSD_r$ of each concentration level for chicken serum by GC-MS	43
3.12	RSD_R , $PRSD_R$ and ratio RSD_R : $PRSD_R$ of each concentration level for pectoralis major by GC-MS	44
3.13	RSD_R , $PRSD_R$ and ratio RSD_R : $PRSD_R$ of each concentration level for chicken serum by GC-MS	45
3.14	Recovery study of 3 concentration levels for pectoralis major by GC-MS	46
3.15	Recovery study of 3 concentration levels for chicken serum by GC-MS	47
3.16	Recovery study of internal standards	48
3.17	Proximate analysis for feed sample of four chicken breeds	49
4.1	The annotated metabolites identified in pectoralis major for four chicken breeds by GC-MS	54
4.2	The annotated metabolites identified in serum for four chicken breeds by GC-MS	54
4.3	Tentative untargeted metabolites by GC-MS for pectoralis major contributed to the group clustering in PCA score plot	58
4.4	Tentative untargeted metabolites by GC-MS for chicken serum contributed to the group clustering in PCA score plot	59
4.5	The quantitation results of selected metabolites in pectoralis major by GC-MS	61
4.6	The quantitation results of selected metabolites in chicken serum by GC-MS	62
4.7	1H NMR characteristic signals of tentative metabolites identified in pectoralis major	65
4.8	1H NMR characteristic signals of tentative metabolites identified in chicken serum	66

4.9	Variable in projection (VIP) values of major metabolites identified in pectoralis major by NMR	76
4.10	Variable in projection (VIP) values of major metabolites identified in serum by NMR	76



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
2.1 Pictures of four chicken breeds	5
2.2 Metabolomics study workflow	9
3.1 Four chicken breeds purchased from commercial farms	28
3.2 Pectoralis major and chicken serum used in the study	29
3.3 Total ion chromatogram of GC-MS for twelve reference standards	37
3.4 Total ion chromatogram of GC-MS for internal standards	38
4.1 Principal component analysis score plots of four different chicken breeds for pectoralis major (a) and serum (b)	55
4.2 Principal component analysis loading plots of four different chicken breeds for pectoralis major (a) and serum (b)	56
4.3 Loading column plots for 30 characteristic metabolites in pectoralis major (a,b) based on principal components 1 and 2. Loading column plots for 40 characteristic metabolites in serum (c,d) based on principal components 1 and 2	60
4.4 Chemical structure of characteristic metabolites in pectoralis major	67
4.5 Chemical structure of characteristic metabolites in serum	68
4.6 OPLS-DA score plots of four different chicken breeds for pectoralis major (a) and serum (b)	69
4.7 Permutation tests of OPLS-DA model for pectoralis major of village chicken (a), broiler-Cobb (b), colored broiler-Hubbard (c) and spent laying chicken-Dekalb (d)	71
4.8 Permutation tests of OPLS-DA model for serum of village chicken (a), broiler-Cobb (b), colored broiler-Hubbard (c) and spent laying chicken-Dekalb (d)	72
4.9 OPLS-DA loading plots of pectoralis major (a) and serum (b) for four different chicken breeds	73

4.10	OPLS-DA loading column plots based on principal components 1 (a) and 2 (b) in OPLS-DA model for pectoralis major	74
4.11	OPLS-DA loading column plots based on principal components 1 (a) and 2 (b) in OPLS-DA model for serum	75



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

^1H NMR	Proton Nuclear Magnetic Resonance
1D	One dimensional
2D	Two dimensional
AOAC	Association Officials of Analytical Chemistry
ANOVA	Analysis of variance
ATP	Adenosine monophosphate
CE-MS	Capillary electrophoresis mass spectrometry
CRM	Certified reference material
CV	Coefficient of variation
DVS	Department of Veterinary Services, Malaysia
dd	Double of doublet
d	Doublet
EC	European Commission
EFSA	European Food Safety Authority
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
FAOSTAT	Food and Agriculture Organization Statistical Database
FTIR	Fourier-transform infrared spectrometry
FSA	Food Standards Agency
GC-MS	Gas chromatography mass spectrometry
g	Gravity
HMDB	Human Metabolome Database
ICH	International Council of Harmonization
IMP	Inosine monophosphate

ISO	International Organization for Standardization
ISTD	Internal standard
IUPAC	International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry
LOD	Limit of detection
LOQ	Limit of quantitation
MeCN	Acetonitrile
MeOH	Methanol
MVA	Multivariate data analysis
ms	Mass spectrometry
m	Multiplet
NAD ⁺	Nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide
NIST	National Institute of Standards and Technology
NMR	Nuclear magnetic resonance
OLS	Ordinary least square
OPLS-DA	Orthogonal partial least squares discriminant analysis
PCA	Principal component analysis
PCC	Per capita consumption
PC	Principal component
PLS-DA	Partial least squares discriminant analysis
pH	Negative logarithmic scale value of hydrogen ion concentration
PRSD _r	Predicted relative standard deviation of repeatability
PRSD _R	Predicted Relative standard deviation of reproducibility
RSD _r	Relative standard deviation of repeatability
RSD _R	Relative standard deviation of reproducibility
R ²	Correlation of coefficient

rpm	Revolutions per minute
SD	Standard deviation
SSR	Self-sufficiency ratio
s	Singlet
TIC	Total ion chromatogram
TSP	Sodium-3-trimethylsilylpropanoic acid
t	Triplet
QC	Quality control
VIP	Variable in projection value
α	Alpha
β	Beta
$^{\circ}\text{C}$	Degree Celsius
et al.	And other authors
Σ	Sum

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix		Page
1	Summary information of four chicken breeds from commercial farms	97
2	Method performance for precision and retention time of GC-MS method, RSD (%)	98
3	List of equipment, apparatus and glassware used	99
4	Calibration curve of metabolites for pectoralis major and serum	100
5	Y-residual plot for data points in calibration curve	103
6	ANOVA table of regression and lack of fit test for pectoralis major and serum	106
7	Student t-test of y-intercept confirmation for pectoralis major and serum	112
8	Total ion chromatogram for pectoralis major of (a) local village chicken, (b) broiler-Cobb, (c) colored broiler-Hubbard, and (d) spent laying chicken-Dekalb	113
9	Total ion chromatogram for serum of (a) local village chicken, (b) broiler-Cobb, (c) colored broiler-Hubbard, and (d) spent laying chicken-Dekalb	114
10	Summary of fit test for principal component analysis of pectoralis major and serum by GC-MS	115
11	Semi-quantitation of different metabolites for pectoralis major of four chicken breeds by GC-MS	116
12	Semi-quantitation of different metabolites for serum of four chicken breeds by GC-MS	118
13	Fold intensity comparison of metabolites of 2 different chicken breeds from different cluster groups of pectoralis major by GC-MS	120
14	Fold intensity comparison of metabolites 2 different chicken breeds from different cluster groups of serum by GC-MS	121
15	Representative of 700 MHz ¹ H NMR spectra for pectoralis major (a) and serum (b)	122

16	700 MHz 2D J-resolved NMR spectra for metabolites identified in pectoralis major	123
17	700 MHz 2D J-resolved NMR spectra for metabolites identified in serum	125
18	Principal component analysis score plots for pectoralis major (a) and serum (b) analyzed by NMR	127
19	Semi-quantitation results (mM) for metabolites identified in pectoralis major by NMR	128
20	Semi-quantitation results (mM) for metabolites identified in serum by NMR	129
21	Two sample t-test on the relative content of metabolites by NMR for pectoralis major of two chicken breeds from different cluster groups in the OPLS-DA model	130
22	Two sample t-test on the relative content of metabolites by NMR for serum of two chicken breeds from different cluster groups in the OPLS-DA model	131

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the study

Poultry meat is considered one of the most efficient sources of protein. Due to the lower cost and healthy choice compared to red meat, readiness for further processing, and no religious or cultural prohibitions, the demand for poultry meat has increased worldwide in the past few decades (Boerboom et al., 2018). According to the Department of Statistics Malaysia (2020), poultry meat production in Malaysia has increased steadily from 2013-2019. The highest production of poultry meat was 1,611.1 million metric tonnes in 2016, followed by an estimation of 1,576.1 million metric tonnes in 2019. Besides that, the Self Sufficiency Ratio (SSR) and Per Capita Consumption (PCC) for poultry meat were recorded as 98.1% and 51.0 kg/year, respectively, in 2018. According to the Department of Veterinary Services (DVS), Malaysia (2020), the poultry population in Malaysia can be divided into four categories, including broiler, layer, breeder, and local fowl. The highest number of productions is broiler (171,980,685) followed by layer (62,162,143), breeder (15,473,432) and local fowl (11,210,061). Village chickens have shown a significant demand for the past few decades in the global poultry sector. In Malaysia, the demand for the village chicken is notably high due to its uniqueness of taste and better meat quality (Hakimi et al., 2019).

A reliable and exact detail regarding the foods we consume represents a significant demand for consumers, governments, and industries (Böhme et al., 2019). Food products are adulterated to maximize the volume and weight, masking inferior quality, and replacing authentic components with cheaper ones (Medina et al., 2019). For instance, a replacement with a comparable cheaper one of an original ingredient that is difficult for consumers to distinguish is the most common food fraud reported in publications (Abbas et al., 2018). Adulteration tends to occur in meat products due to unfair practices by the manufacturers and the high cost of animal protein to achieve economic benefits (Soares, 2013). Several studies in food authentication have been conducted to differentiate different species, breeds, and types of meats, including chicken, pork and beef (Ueda et al., 2018), different native chicken breeds in China (Xiao et al., 2019) and different muscle types (Mabuchi et al., 2018).

1.2 Problem statements

Food safety authorities and trade partners have significant concerns about the ability to demonstrate the authenticity of food products due to the increase in food fraud cases. In Malaysia, underage colored broiler has been claimed as

village chicken to deceive consumers due to its lower cost for economic gain, with approximately three to four times higher in price. A study by Chuah et al. (2016) found that approximately 78% of poultry and beef products in Malaysia's local markets were associated with meat substitution and mislabelling. Almost 100% of chicken, including marinated cut pieces of poultry meat sold as a village chicken in the Klang valley market, is a colored broiler (Azhar, 2019a; 2019b). There is no universal international standard for producing and labelling different types of chicken meat available in markets. Besides, local authorities have no regulation or affiliation with village chickens' claims. In chicken meat production, the commercial feeds fed to the chickens are closely related to metabolism changes and animal health conditions. The potential risks of misuse or excessive dosage of antimicrobial and feed additives in animal feed and also the cross-contamination of animal feeds during production and storage to public health and food safety issues in chicken meat production are unknown. The metabolites in chicken meat and serum associated with the commercial feeds which contain feed additives and antimicrobial are unknown.

1.3 Significance of the study

Up to this date, there have been very little data on the metabolite fingerprinting and profiling of the Malaysian indigenous chickens documented elsewhere. To the best of our knowledge, no such comparison using an untargeted metabolomics approach on different breeds of chicken available in the Malaysian market has been performed. According to the National Health and Morbidity Survey: Malaysian Adult Nutrition survey 2014, Volume III, Food Consumption Statistics of Total Population in Malaysia, the prevalence exposure for chicken is 94.46% and is considerably high (Institute for Public Health, 2014). However, there is a lack of established methods or systems for authentication of the safety and quality of chicken meat. Moreover, there is still no strategy to authenticate different chicken breeds in Malaysia. Hence, this study is designed to distinguish 4 chicken breeds in the market and identify the distinguishing metabolites affected mainly by commercial feeds using gas chromatography-mass spectrometry (GC-MS) and nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) based metabolomic approach.

1.4 Hypothesis

The GC-MS and NMR-based metabolomics distinguishes four chicken breeds and identifies distinguishing metabolites that contributed to the respective chicken breeds.

1.5 Objectives of the study

The objectives of this study were as follows:

- i) To distinguish four chicken breeds using GC-MS and NMR-based metabolomics.
- ii) To identify the potential distinguishing metabolites of different chicken breeds using GC-MS and NMR-based metabolomics.
- iii) To quantify / semi-quantify identified distinguishing metabolites that contributed to chicken breeds' separation using GC-MS and NMR-based metabolomics.

REFERENCES

- Abbas, O., Zadavec, M., Baeten, V., Mikuš, T., Lešić, T., Vulić, A., Prpić, J., Jemeršić, L., & Pleadin, J. (2018). Analytical methods used for the authentication of food of animal origin. *Food Chemistry*, 246, 6–17. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.11.007>
- Akhtar, M. T., Samar, M., Shami, A. A., Mumtaz, M. W., Mukhtar, H., Tahir, A., Shahzad-ul-hussan, S., Chaudhary, S. U., & Kaka, U. (2021). ¹H-NMR-Based Metabolomics: An Integrated Approach for the Detection of the Adulteration in Chicken, Chevron, Beef and Donkey Meat. *Molecules*, 26(15), 4643.
- Al-Nasser, A., Al-Khalifa, H., Al-Saffar, A., Khalil, F., Al-Bahouh, M., Ragheb, G., Al-Haddad, A., & Mashaly, M. (2007). Overview of chicken taxonomy and domestication. *World's Poultry Science Journal*, 63(2), 285–300. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S004393390700147X>
- Ali, M., Lee, S. Y., Park, J. Y., Jung, S., Jo, C., & Nam, K. C. (2019). Comparison of functional compounds and micronutrients of chicken breast meat by breeds. *Food Science of Animal Resources*, 39(4), 632–642. <https://doi.org/10.5851/kosfa.2019.e54>
- AOAC. (2016). Guidelines for Standard Method Performance Requirements. In *Journal of AOAC International and Official Method of Analysis*.
- Arvanitoyannis, I. S., & Houwelingen-koukaliaroglou, M. Van. (2003). Implementation of Chemometrics for Quality Control and Authentication of Meat and Meat Products. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 43(2), 173–218.
- Ayu Okarini, I., Purnomo, H., Aulanni'am, & Eka Radiati, L. (2013). Proximate, total phenolic, antioxidant activity and amino acids profile of Bali indigenous chicken, spent laying hen and broiler breast fillet. *International Journal of Poultry Science*, 12(7), 415–420.
- Azhar, K. (2019a). Beware of 'coloured' chicken. *The Star*. <https://www.thestar.com.my/news/nation/2019/07/15/beware-of-coloured-chicken/>
- Azhar, K. (2019b). Buyers beware: Ahead of Raya, breeders warn of fake kampung chicken in market. *Malay Mail*. <https://www.malaymail.com/news/malaysia/2019/05/27/buyers-beware-ahead-of-raya-breeders-warn-of-fake-kampung-chicken-in-market/1756703>

- Ballin, N. Z., & Laursen, K. H. (2019). To target or not to target? Definitions and nomenclature for targeted versus non-targeted analytical food authentication. *Trends in Food Science and Technology*, 86(September 2018), 537–543. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2018.09.025>
- Beauclercq, S., Nadal-Desbarats, L., Hennequet-Antier, C., Collin, A., Tesseraud, S., Bourin, M., Le Bihan-Duval, E., & Berri, C. (2016). Serum and Muscle Metabolomics for the Prediction of Ultimate pH, a Key Factor for Chicken-Meat Quality. *Journal of Proteome Research*, 15(4), 1168–1178. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jproteome.5b01050>
- Bhanja, S. K., & Mandal, A. B. (2007). Validating the current amino acid and energy requirements of coloured broiler chickens. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 87(11), 2131–2140. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa>
- Bin, P., Huang, R., & Zhou, X. (2017). Oxidation resistance of the sulfur amino acids: Methionine and cysteine. *BioMed Research International*, 2017(9584932). <https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/9584932>
- Boerboom, G., Van Kempen, T., Navarro-Villa, A., & Pérez-Bonilla, A. (2018). Unraveling the cause of white striping in broilers using metabolomics. *Poultry Science*, 97(11), 3977–3986. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps/pey266>
- Böhme, K., Calo-Mata, P., Barros-Velázquez, J., & Ortea, I. (2019). Recent applications of omics-based technologies to main topics in food authentication. *TrAC - Trends in Analytical Chemistry*, 110, 221–232. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trac.2018.11.005>
- Brennan, L. (2014). NMR-based metabolomics: From sample preparation to applications in nutrition research. *Progress in Nuclear Magnetic Resonance Spectroscopy*, 83, 42–49. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pnmrs.2014.09.001>
- Çavuşoglu, E., & Petek, M. (2019). Effects of different floor materials on the welfare and behaviour of slow- and fast-growing broilers. *Archives Animal Breeding*, 62(1), 335–344. <https://doi.org/10.5194/aab-62-335-2019>
- Cevallos-Cevallos, J. M., Reyes-De-Corcuera, J. I., Etxeberria, E., Danyluk, M. D., & Rodrick, G. E. (2009). Metabolomic analysis in food science: a review. *Trends in Food Science and Technology*, 20(11–12), 557–566. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2009.07.002>
- Charoensin, S., Laopaiboon, B., Boonkum, W., Phetcharaburanin, J., Villareal, M. O., Isoda, H., & Duangjinda, M. (2021). Thai native chicken as a potential functional meat source rich in anserine, anserine/carnosine, and antioxidant substances. *Animals*, 11(3), 902. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani11030902>
- Chuah, L. O., He, X. Bin, Effarizah, M. E., Syahariza, Z. A., Shamila-Syuhada, A. K., & Rusul, G. (2016). Mislabelling of beef and poultry products sold in Malaysia. *Food Control*, 62, 157–164. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2015.10.030>

- da Silva, D. C. F., de Arruda, A. M. V., & Gonçalves, A. A. (2017). Quality characteristics of broiler chicken meat from free-range and industrial poultry system for the consumers. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 54(7), 1818–1826. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-017-2612-x>
- Demir, E., Sarica, S., Sekeroglu, A., Ozean, M. A., & Seker, Y. (2004). Effects of early and late feed restriction or feed withdrawal on growth performance, ascites and blood constituents of broiler chickens. *Acta Agriculturae Scandinavica - Section A: Animal Science*, 54(3), 152–158. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09064700410004852>
- Department of Statistics Malaysia. (2020). *Department of Statistics Press Release Supply and Utilization Accounts Selected Agricultural Commodities , 2015-2019*.
- Department of Veterinary Services Malaysia, D. (2013). *the Broiler Chicken Industry in Peninsular Malaysia Status of the Industry in 2012 and Prospects for 2013*. [http://flfam.org.my/files/The Broiler Chicken Industry in Peninsular Malaysia 2012-2013.pdf](http://flfam.org.my/files/The%20Broiler%20Chicken%20Industry%20in%20Peninsular%20Malaysia%202012-2013.pdf)
- Department of Veterinary Services Malaysia, D. (2014). *THE LAYER CHICKEN INDUSTRY IN PENINSULAR MALAYSIA STATUS OF THE INDUSTRY IN 2014 AND PROSPECTS FOR 2015*. [http://flfam.org.my/files/The Layer Chicken Industry in Peninsular Malaysia 2014-2015.pdf](http://flfam.org.my/files/The%20Layer%20Chicken%20Industry%20in%20Peninsular%20Malaysia%202014-2015.pdf)
- Devatkal, S. K., Naveena, B. M., & Kotaiah, T. (2019). Quality, composition, and consumer evaluation of meat from slow-growing broilers relative to commercial broilers. *Poultry Science*, 98(11), 6177–6186. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps/pez344>
- Donsbough, A. L., Powell, S., Waguespack, A., Bidner, T. D., & Southern, L. L. (2010). Uric acid, urea, and ammonia concentrations in serum and uric acid concentration in excreta as indicators of amino acid utilization in diets for broilers. *Poultry Science*, 89(2), 287–294. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps.2009-00401>
- Dunn, W. B., Broadhurst, D., Ellis, D. I., Brown, M., Halsall, A., O'Hagan, S., Spasic, I., Tseng, A., & Kell, D. B. (2008). A GC-TOF-MS study of the stability of serum and urine metabolomes during the UK Biobank sample collection and preparation protocols. *International Journal of Epidemiology*, 37, 23–30. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dym281>
- Elhefny, D. E., Monir, H. H., & M.A.helmy, R. (2021). Validation using QuEChERS method, risk assessment and preharvest intermission using GC-MS for determination of azoxystrobin in tomato and cucumber. *Egyptian Journal of Chemistry*, 64(12), 7321–7329. <https://doi.org/10.21608/EJCHEM.2021.76725.3756>

- Emwas, A. H., Roy, R., McKay, R. T., Tenori, L., Saccenti, E., Nagana Gowda, G. A., Raftery, D., Alahmari, F., Jaremko, L., Jaremko, M., & Wishart, D. S. (2019). Nmr spectroscopy for metabolomics research. *Metabolites*, 9(7). <https://doi.org/10.3390/metabo9070123>
- Eriksson, L., Byrne, T., Johansson, E., Trygg, J., & Vikström, C. (2006). Multi- and Megavariate Data Analysis Basic Principles and Applications. In *Umetrics Academy: Umeå, Sweden* (2nd ed.). <https://doi.org/10.1002/cem.692>
- Esteki, M., Simal-Gandara, J., Shahsavari, Z., Zandbaaf, S., Dashtaki, E., & Vander Heyden, Y. (2018). A review on the application of chromatographic methods, coupled to chemometrics, for food authentication. *Food Control*, 93, 165–182. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2018.06.015>
- EU. (2002). EC 657/2002 of 12 August 2002 implementing Council Directive 96/23/EC concerning the performance of analytical. In *Official Journal of The European Union*.
- Fanatico, A. C., Pillai, P. B., Emmert, J. L., & Owens, C. M. (2007). Meat quality of slow- and fast-growing chicken genotypes fed low-nutrient or standard diets and raised indoors or with outdoor access. *Poultry Science*, 86(10), 2245–2255. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ps/86.10.2245>
- FAO. (2019). World Food and Agriculture - Statistical Pocketbook 2019. In *World Food and Agriculture - Statistical Pocketbook 2018*. <https://doi.org/10.4060/ca1796en>
- FDA. (2019). Guidelines for the Validation of Chemical Methods in Food, Feed, Cosmetics, and Veterinary Products. In *U.S. Food and Drug Administration, Foods Program*.
- Fernandes, T. S. M., Alcântara, D. B., Barbosa, P. G. A., Paz, M. S. de O., Zocolo, G. J., & Nascimento, R. F. do. (2020). Matrix effect evaluation and method validation of organophosphorus pesticide residues in bell peppers (*Capsicum annuum* L.) by GC–MS determination. *International Journal of Environmental Analytical Chemistry*, 100(15), 1691–1706. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03067319.2019.1657854>
- Fiehn, O. (2002). Metabolomics — the link between genotypes and phenotypes. *Functional Genomics*, 48, 155–171. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-010-0448-0_11
- Fiehn, O. (2016). Metabolomics by gas chromatography-mass spectrometry: Combined targeted and untargeted profiling. *Current Protocols in Molecular Biology*, 114, 30.4.1–30.4.32. <https://doi.org/10.1002/0471142727.mb3004s114>
- Fontanesi, L. (2017). Meat Authenticity and Traceability. In *Lawrie's Meat Science* (Eighth Edi, pp. 585–633). Woodhead Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-100694-8.00013-3>

- Fontanesi, Luca. (2017). Meat Authenticity and Traceability. In *Lawrie's Meat Science: Eighth Edition*. Elsevier Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-100694-8.00019-4>
- FSA, (Food Standards Agency). (2002). McCance and Widdowson's The Composition of Foods Sixth summary edition. In *Royal Society of Chemistry, Cambridge, UK*. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.2.4465.160-a>
- Gonzalez-Riano, C., Sanz-Rodríguez, M., Escudero-Ramirez, J., Lorenzo, M. P., Barbas, C., Cubelos, B., & Garcia, A. (2018). Target and untargeted GC-MS based metabolomic study of mouse optic nerve and its potential in the study of neurological visual diseases. *Journal of Pharmaceutical and Biomedical Analysis*, 153, 44–56. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpba.2018.02.015>
- Gould, O., Drabińska, N., Ratcliffe, N., & de Lacy Costello, B. (2021). Hyphenated mass spectrometry versus real-time mass spectrometry techniques for the detection of volatile compounds from the human body. *Molecules*, 26(23). <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules26237185>
- Grabež, V., Bjelanović, M., Rohloff, J., Martinović, A., Berg, P., Tomović, V., Rogić, B., & Egelanddal, B. (2019). The relationship between volatile compounds, metabolites and sensory attributes: A case study using lamb and sheep meat. *Small Ruminant Research*, 181, 12–20. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.smallrumres.2019.09.022>
- Grabež, V., Egelanddal, B., Cruz, A., Hallenstvedt, E., Mydland, L. T., Alvseike, O., Kåsin, K., Ruud, L., Karlsen, V., & Øverland, M. (2022). Understanding metabolic phenomena accompanying high levels of yeast in broiler chicken diets and resulting carcass weight and meat quality changes. *Poultry Science*, 101(5), 101749. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psj.2022.101749>
- Hafez, H. M., & Attia, Y. A. (2020). Challenges to the Poultry Industry: Current Perspectives and Strategic Future After the COVID-19 Outbreak. *Frontiers in Veterinary Science*, 7(August), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fvets.2020.00516>
- Hamano, Y. (2007). Continuous infusion of lipoic acid rapidly reduces plasma β -hydroxybutyrate with elevation of non-esterified fatty acids in broiler chickens. *British Journal of Nutrition*, 97(3), 495–501. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007114507381312>
- Harms, R. H., & Nelson, D. S. (1992). Research note: a lack of response to pantothenic acid supplementation to a corn and soybean meal broiler diet. *Poultry Science*, 71(11), 1952–1954. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps.0711952>
- He, W., Li, P., & Wu, G. (2021). Amino Acid Nutrition and Metabolism in Chickens. *Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology*, 1285, 109–131. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-54462-1_7

- Horwitz, W., & Albert, R. (2006). The Horwitz ratio (HorRat): A useful index of method performance with respect to precision. *Journal of AOAC International*, 89(4), 1095–1109. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jaoac/89.4.1095>
- Hu, C., & Xu, G. (2013). Mass-spectrometry-based metabolomics analysis for foodomics. *TrAC - Trends in Analytical Chemistry*, 52, 36–46. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trac.2013.09.005>
- ICH. (2005). *Validation of Analytical Procedures: Text and Methodology Q2(R1)*. ICH Secretariat. <https://doi.org/10.1590/s1984-82502011000100012>
- Institute for Public Health (IPH). (2014). National Health and Morbidity Survey 2014 : Malaysia Adult Nutrition Survey (MANS) : Vol. III : Food Consumption Statistics of Malaysia. In *Igarss 2014*.
- Jakes, W., Gerdova, A., Defernez, M., Watson, A. D., McCallum, C., Limer, E., Colquhoun, I. J., Williamson, D. C., & Kemsley, E. K. (2015). Authentication of beef versus horse meat using 60 MHz ¹H NMR spectroscopy. *Food Chemistry*, 175, 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2014.11.110>
- Jayasena, D. D., Jung, S., Bae, Y. S., Park, H. B., Lee, J. H., & Jo, C. (2015). Comparison of the amounts of endogenous bioactive compounds in raw and cooked meats from commercial broilers and indigenous chickens. *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 37, 20–24. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfca.2014.06.016>
- Jayasena, D. D., Jung, S., Kim, H. J., Yong, H. I., Nam, K. C., & Jo, C. (2015). Taste-active compound levels in Korean native chicken meat: The effects of bird age and the cooking process. *Poultry Science*, 94(8), 1964–1972. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps/pev154>
- Jeong, S. B., Kim, Y. B., Lee, J. W., Kim, D. H., Moon, B. H., Chang, H. H., Choi, Y. H., & Lee, K. W. (2020). Role of dietary gamma-aminobutyric acid in broiler chickens raised under high stocking density. *Animal Nutrition*, 6(3), 293–304. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aninu.2020.03.008>
- Jin, S. K., Choi, J. S., & Kim, G. D. (2017). Effects of bundle type and substitution with spent laying hen surimi on quality characteristics of imitation crabsticks. *Korean Journal for Food Science of Animal Resources*, 37(2), 200–209. <https://doi.org/10.5851/kosfa.2017.37.2.200>
- Jin, S. K., Park, J. H., & Hur, S. J. (2014). Effect of Substituting Surimi with Spent Laying Hen Meat on the Physicochemical Characteristics of Fried Fish Paste. *Food and Bioprocess Technology*, 7(3), 901–908. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11947-013-1137-1>
- Johanningsmeier, S. D., Harris, G. K., & Klevorn, C. M. (2016). Metabolomic Technologies for Improving the Quality of Food: Practice and Promise. *Annual Review of Food Science and Technology*, 7(1), 413–438. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-food-022814-015721>

- Jung, Y., Jeon, H. J., Jung, S., Choe, J. H., Lee, J. H., Heo, K. N., Kang, B. S., & Jo, C. (2011). Comparison of quality traits of thigh meat from Korean native chickens and broilers. *Korean Journal for Food Science of Animal Resources*, 31(5), 684–692. <https://doi.org/10.5851/kosfa.2011.31.5.684>
- Kim, H. J., Kim, H. J., Jeon, J. J., Nam, K. C., Shim, K. S., Jung, J. H., Kim, K. S., Choi, Y., Kim, S. H., & Jang, A. (2020). Comparison of the quality characteristics of chicken breast meat from conventional and animal welfare farms under refrigerated storage. *Poultry Science*, 99(3), 1788–1796. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psj.2019.12.009>
- Koek, M. M., Jellema, R. H., van der Greef, J., Tas, A. C., & Hankemeier, T. (2011). Quantitative metabolomics based on gas chromatography mass spectrometry: Status and perspectives. *Metabolomics*, 7(3), 307–328. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11306-010-0254-3>
- Kopec, W., Jamroz, D., Wiliczekiewicz, A., Biazik, E., Pudlo, A., Korzeniowska, M., Hikawczuk, T., & Skiba, T. (2020). Antioxidative characteristics of chicken breast meat and blood after diet supplementation with carnosine, l-histidine, and β -alanine. *Antioxidants*, 9(11), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.3390/antiox9111093>
- Lengkidworraphiphat, P., Wongpoomchai, R., Bunmee, T., Chariyakornkul, A., Chaiwang, N., & Jaturasitha, S. (2021). Taste-active and nutritional components of thai native chicken meat: A perspective of consumer satisfaction. *Food Science of Animal Resources*, 41(2), 237–246. <https://doi.org/10.5851/kosfa.2020.e94>
- Li, G., Fu, Y., Han, X., Li, X., & Li, C. (2016). Metabolomic investigation of porcine muscle and fatty tissue after Clenbuterol treatment using gas chromatography/mass spectrometry. *Journal of Chromatography A*, 1456, 242–248. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chroma.2016.06.017>
- Liao, Y., Hu, R., Wang, Z., Peng, Q., Dong, X., Zhang, X., Zou, H., Pu, Q., Xue, B., & Wang, L. (2018). Metabolomics Profiling of Serum and Urine in Three Beef Cattle Breeds Revealed Different Levels of Tolerance to Heat Stress. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 66(26), 6926–6935. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.8b01794>
- Liu, Y., Wu, S., Sun, W., Chen, S., Yang, X., & Yang, X. (2018). Variation in proteomics and metabolomics of chicken hepatocytes exposed to medium with or without folic acid. *Journal of Cellular Biochemistry*, 119(7), 6113–6124. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jcb.26810>
- Livestock Statistics 2019/2020. (2020). In *Department of Veterinary Services Malaysia*. http://www.dvs.gov.my/dvs/resources/user_1/2020/BP/Perangkaan/Perangkaan_Ternakan_2019_2020_keseluruhan.pdf

- Llano, S. M., Muñoz-Jiménez, A. M., Jiménez-Cartagena, C., Londoño-Londoño, J., & Medina, S. (2018). Untargeted metabolomics reveals specific withanolides and fatty acyl glycoside as tentative metabolites to differentiate organic and conventional *Physalis peruviana* fruits. *Food Chemistry*, 244, 120–127. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.10.026>
- Lu, Z., He, X., Ma, B., Zhang, L., Li, J., Jiang, Y., Zhou, G., & Gao, F. (2018). Serum metabolomics study of nutrient metabolic variations in chronic heat-stressed broilers. *British Journal of Nutrition*, 119(7), 771–781. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0007114518000247>
- Łukasiewicz, M., Puppel, K., Kuczyńska, B., Kamaszewski, M., & Niemiec, J. (2015). β -Alanine as a factor influencing the content of bioactive dipeptides in muscles of Hubbard Flex chickens. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 95(12), 2562–2565. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.6970>
- Mabuchi, R., Adachi, M., Kikutani, H., & Tanimoto, S. (2018). Discriminant analysis of muscle tissue type in yellowtail *seriola quinqueradiata* muscle based on metabolic component profiles. *Food Science and Technology Research*, 24(5), 883–891. <https://doi.org/10.3136/fstr.24.883>
- Mabuchi, R., Ishimaru, A., Tanaka, M., Kawaguchi, O., & Tanimoto, S. (2019). Metabolic profiling of fish meat by gc-ms analysis, and correlations with taste attributes obtained using an electronic tongue. *Metabolites*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.3390/metabo9010001>
- Magnusson, B., & Örnemark, U. (2014). *Eurachem Guide: The Fitness for Purpose of Analytical Methods - A Laboratory Guide to Method Validation and Related Topics* (2nd ed.). www.eurachem.org
- Man, K. Y., Chan, C. O., Tang, H. H., Dong, N. ping, Capozzi, F., Wong, K. H., Kwok, K. W. H., Chan, H. M., & Mok, D. K. W. (2021). Mass spectrometry-based untargeted metabolomics approach for differentiation of beef of different geographic origins. *Food Chemistry*, 338(August 2020), 127847. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2020.127847>
- Marangoni, F., Corsello, G., Cricelli, C., Ferrara, N., Ghiselli, A., Lucchin, L., & Poli, A. (2015). Role of poultry meat in a balanced diet aimed at maintaining health and wellbeing: An Italian consensus document. *Food and Nutrition Research*, 59(27606), 1–11.
- Marcone, M. F., Wang, S., Albabish, W., Nie, S., Somnarain, D., & Hill, A. (2013). Diverse food-based applications of nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) technology. *Food Research International*, 51(2), 729–747. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2012.12.046>
- Markley, J. L., Brüschweiler, R., Edison, A. S., Eghbalian, H. R., Powers, R., Raftery, D., & Wishart, D. S. (2017). The future of NMR-based metabolomics. *Current Opinion in Biotechnology*, 43, 34–40. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2016.08.001>

- Matera, J. A., Cruz, A. G., Raices, R. S. L., Silva, M. C., Nogueira, L. C., Quitério, S. L., Cavalcanti, R. N., Freiras, M. Q., & Conte Júnior, C. A. (2014). Discrimination of Brazilian artisanal and inspected pork sausages: Application of unsupervised, linear and non-linear supervised chemometric methods. *Food Research International*, 64, 380–386. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2014.07.003>
- Maulidiani, Abas, F., Khatib, A., Perumal, V., Suppaiah, V., Ismail, A., Hamid, M., Shaari, K., & Lajis, N. H. (2016). Metabolic alteration in obese diabetes rats upon treatment with *Centella asiatica* extract. *Journal of Ethnopharmacology*, 180, 60–69. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jep.2016.01.001>
- Medina, S., Pereira, J. A., Silva, P., Perestrelo, R., & Câmara, J. S. (2019). Food fingerprints – A valuable tool to monitor food authenticity and safety. *Food Chemistry*, 278(July 2018), 144–162. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2018.11.046>
- Mohammed, H. H. H., He, L., Nawaz, A., Jin, G., Huang, X., Ma, M., Abdegadir, W. S., Elgasim, E. A., & Khalifa, I. (2021). Effect of frozen and refrozen storage of beef and chicken meats on inoculated microorganisms and meat quality. *Meat Science*, 175(108453). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2021.108453>
- Mohd Shahmi Hakimi, M., Alias, Z., Wan Khadijah, W. E., Abdullah, R. B., & Rahman, M. M. (2019). Effect of Diet Containing Palm Kernel Cake and Coconut Meal Cake on Growth Performance and Carcass Quality of Free-Range Chicken in Malaysia. *Sains Malaysiana*, 48(5), 991–998. <https://doi.org/10.17576/jsm-2019-4805-07>
- Mohd Shahmi Hakimi, M., Alias, Z., Wan Syahidah, H., Wan Khadijah, W. E., & Abdullah, R. B. (2018). Effect of palm kernel cake and coconut-based formulated diet on Malaysia village chicken growth performances and meat quality. *Pertanika Journal of Tropical Agricultural Science*, 41(4), 1703–1716.
- Mueller, S., Taddei, L., Albiker, D., Kreuzer, M., Siegrist, M., Messikommer, R. E., & Gangnat, I. D. M. (2020). Growth, carcass, and meat quality of 2 dual-purpose chickens and a layer hybrid grown for 67 or 84 D compared with slow-growing broilers. *Journal of Applied Poultry Research*, 29(1), 185–196. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.japr.2019.10.005>
- Murugesu, S., Ibrahim, Z., Ahmed, Q. U., Yusoff, N. I. N., Uzir, B. F., Perumal, V., Abas, F., Saari, K., El-Seedi, H., & Khatib, A. (2018). Characterization of α -glucosidase inhibitors from *clinacanthus nutans* lindau leaves by gas chromatography-mass spectrometry-based metabolomics and molecular docking simulation. *Molecules*, 23(9), 2402. <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules23092402>

- Mykhailenko, O., Ivanauskas, L., Bezruk, I., Lesyk, R., & Georgiyants, V. (2020). Comparative investigation of amino acids content in the dry extracts of *Juno Bucharica*, *Gladiolus hybrid Zefir*, *Iris Hungarica*, *Iris Variegata* and *crocus sativus* raw materials of Ukrainian Flora. *Scientia Pharmaceutica*, 88(1), 8. <https://doi.org/10.3390/scipharm88010008>
- Panel on additives and products or substances used in animal feed EFSA. (2015). Scientific Opinion on the safety and efficacy of AviMatrix® (benzoic acid , calcium formate and fumaric acid) for chickens for fattening , chickens reared for laying , minor avian species for fattening and minor avian species reared to point of lay. *EFSA Journal*, 13(5), 3794. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2015.3794>
- Perini, M., Strojnik, L., Paolini, M., & Camin, F. (2020). Gas Chromatography Combustion Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometry for Improving the Detection of Authenticity of Grape Must. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 68(11), 3322–3329. <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.9b05952>
- Polizer Rocha, Y. J., Lorenzo, J. M., Barros, J. C., Baldin, J. C., & Trindade, M. A. (2019). Effect of chicken meat replacement by spent laying hen meat on physicochemical properties and sensorial characteristics of fresh sausage. *British Poultry Science*, 60(2), 139–145. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00071668.2019.1568392>
- Qaid, M. M., & Al-garadi, M. A. (2021). Protein and Amino Acid Metabolism in Poultry during and after Heat Stress : A Review. *Animals*, 11(4), 1167.
- Qanbari, S., Rubin, C. J., Maqbool, K., Weigend, S., Weigend, A., Geibel, J., Kerje, S., Wurmser, C., Peterson, A. T., Lehr Brisbin, I., Preisinger, R., Fries, R., Simianer, H., & Andersson, L. (2019). Genetics of adaptation in modern chicken. *PLoS Genetics*, 15(4), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgen.1007989>
- Quan, J., Cai, Y., Yang, T., Ge, Q., Jiao, T., & Zhao, S. (2020). Phylogeny and conservation priority assessment of Asian domestic chicken genetic resources. *Global Ecology and Conservation*, 22(1), e00944. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gecco.2020.e00944>
- Ramautar, R., Somsen, G. W., & de Jong, G. J. (2019). CE-MS for metabolomics: Developments and applications in the period 2016–2018. *Electrophoresis*, 40(1), 165–179. <https://doi.org/10.1002/elps.201800323>
- Ramlah, A. H. (1996). Performance of village fowl in Malaysia. *World's Poultry Science Journal*, 52(1), 75–79. <https://doi.org/10.1079/wps19960009>
- Razali, M. T. A., Zainal, Z. A., Maulidiani, M., Shaari, K., Zamri, Z., Idrus, M. Z. M., Khatib, A., Abas, F., Ling, Y. S., Rui, L. L., & Ismail, I. S. (2018). Classification of raw stingless bee honeys by bee species origins using the NMR- and LC-MS-based metabolomics approach. *Molecules*, 23(9), 2160. <https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules23092160>

- Righi, F., Pitino, R., Manuelian, C. L., Simoni, M., Quarantelli, A., De Marchi, M., & Tsiplakou, E. (2021). Plant feed additives as natural alternatives to the use of synthetic antioxidant vitamins on poultry performances, health, and oxidative status: A review of the literature in the last 20 years. *Antioxidants*, 10(5), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.3390/antiox10050659>
- Rikimaru, K., & Takahashi, H. (2010). Evaluation of the meat from Hinai-jidori chickens and broilers: Analysis of general biochemical components, free amino acids, inosine 5'-monophosphate, and fatty acids. *Journal of Applied Poultry Research*, 19(4), 327–333. <https://doi.org/10.3382/japr.2010-00157>
- Rochfort, S. J., Ezernieks, V., Maher, A. D., Ingram, B. A., & Olsen, L. (2013). Mussel metabolomics - Species discrimination and provenance determination. *Food Research International*, 54(1), 1302–1312. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2013.03.004>
- Samsuddin, N. S., Sharaai, A. H., & Ismail, M. M. (2015). Sustainability of chicken meat production in achieving food security in Malaysia. *Advances in Environmental Biology*, 9(23), 1–6.
- Sanagi, M. M., Nasir, Z., Ling, L. S., Hernawan, D., Ibrahim, W. A. W., & Naim, A. A. (2010). A Practical Approach for Linearity Assessment of Calibration Curves Under the International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry (IUPAC) Guidelines for an In-House Validation of Method of Analysis. *Journal of AOAC International*, 93(4), 1322–1330.
- Sanagi, M. Marsin, Ling, S. L., Nasir, Z., Hermawan, D., Wan Ibrahim, W. A., & Naim, A. A. (2009). Comparison of signal-to-noise, blank determination, and linear regression methods for the estimation of detection and quantification limits for volatile organic compounds by gas chromatography. *Journal of AOAC International*, 92(6), 1833–1838. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jaoac/92.6.1833>
- Semwogerere, F., Neethling, J., Muchenje, V., & Hoffman, L. C. (2019). Meat quality, fatty acid profile, and sensory attributes of spent laying hens fed expeller press canola meal or a conventional diet. *Poultry Science*, 98(9), 3557–3570. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps/pez092>
- Shi, S., Yi, L., Yun, Y., Zhang, X., & Liang, Y. (2015). A combination of GC-MS and chemometrics reveals metabolic differences between serum and plasma. *Analytical Methods*, 7(5), 1751–1757. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c4ay02477j>
- Shi, Y., Li, X., & Huang, A. (2019). A metabolomics-based approach investigates volatile flavor formation and characteristic compounds of the Dahe black pig dry-cured ham. *Meat Science*, 158, 107904. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2019.107904>

- Soares, S., Amaral, J. S., Oliveira, M. B. P. P., & Mafra, I. (2013). A SYBR Green real-time PCR assay to detect and quantify pork meat in processed poultry meat products. *Meat Science*, 94(1), 115–120. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2012.12.012>
- Suckeveris, D., Burin, J. A., Oliveira, A. B., Nascimento, F. M., Pereira, R., Luvizotto, J. J., Bittencourt, L., Hermes, R. G., & Menten, J. F. M. (2020). Supra-nutritional Levels of Selected B Vitamins in Animal or Vegetable Diets for Broiler Chicken. *Revista Brasileira de Ciência Avícola*, 22(3), eRBCA-2019-1024, pp. 1–10.
- Suriani, N. W., Purnomo, H., Estiasih, T., & Suwetja, I. K. (2014). Physicochemical Properties , Fatty Acids Profile and Cholesterol Content of Indigenous Manado Chicken , Broiler and Spent Hen Meat. *International Journal of ChemTech Research*, 6(7), 3896–3902.
- Surowiec, I., Fraser, P. D., Patel, R., Halket, J., & Bramley, P. M. (2011). Metabolomic approach for the detection of mechanically recovered meat in food products. *Food Chemistry*, 125(4), 1468–1475. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2010.10.064>
- Thompson, M., Ellison, S. L. R., & Wood, R. (2002). Harmonized guidelines for single-laboratory validation of methods of analysis. *Journal of Pure and Applied Chemistry*, 74(5), 835–855. <https://doi.org/10.1351/pac200274050835>
- Tixier-Boichard, M., Bed'Hom, B., & Rognon, X. (2011). Chicken domestication: From archeology to genomics. *Comptes Rendus - Biologies*, 334(3), 197–204. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.crv.2010.12.012>
- Triki, M., Herrero, A. M., Jiménez-Colmenero, F., & Ruiz-Capillas, C. (2018). Quality assessment of fresh meat from several species based on free amino acid and biogenic amine contents during chilled storage. *Foods*, 7(9), 132. <https://doi.org/10.3390/foods7090132>
- Trimigno, A., Münger, L., Picone, G., Freiburghaus, C., Pimentel, G., Vionnet, N., Pralong, F., Capozzi, F., Badertscher, R., & Vergères, G. (2018). GC-MS based metabolomics and NMR spectroscopy investigation of food intake biomarkers for milk and cheese in serum of healthy humans. *Metabolites*, 8(2), 26. <https://doi.org/10.3390/metabo8020026>
- Trivedi, D. K., Hollywood, K. A., Rattray, N. J. W., Ward, H., Trivedi, D. K., Greenwood, J., Ellis, D. I., & Goodacre, R. (2016). Meat, the metabolites: An integrated metabolite profiling and lipidomics approach for the detection of the adulteration of beef with pork. *Analyst*, 141(7), 2155–2164. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c6an00108d>
- Trygg, J., Holmes, E., & Lundstedt, T. (2007). Chemometrics in metabonomics. *Journal of Proteome Research*, 6(2), 469–479. <https://doi.org/10.1021/pr060594q>

- Ueda, S., Iwamoto, E., Kato, Y., Shinohara, M., Shirai, Y., & Yamanoue, M. (2018). Comparative metabolomics of Japanese Black cattle beef and other meats using gas chromatography–mass spectrometry. *Bioscience, Biotechnology and Biochemistry*, 83(1), 137–147. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09168451.2018.1528139>
- Van, D. N., Moula, N., Moyse, E., Duc, L. Do, Dinh, T. V., & Farnir, F. (2020). Productive performance and egg and meat quality of two indigenous poultry breeds in vietnam, ho and dong tao, fed on commercial feed. *Animals*, 10(3). <https://doi.org/10.3390/ani10030408>
- Verlinden, M., Pasmans, F., Garmyn, A., De Zutter, L., Haesebrouck, F., & Martel, A. (2012). Occurrence of viable *Brachyspira* spp. on carcasses of spent laying hens from supermarkets. *Food Microbiology*, 32(2), 321–324. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2012.07.005>
- Wang, L.-H., Qiao, K.-N., Ding, Q., Zhang, Y.-Y., Sun, B.-G., & Chen, H.-T. (2018). Effects of two cooking methods on the taste components of Sanhuang chicken and Black-bone silky fowl meat. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, 42(11), e13772. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpp.13772>
- Wang, X., Fang, C., He, J., Dai, Q., & Fang, R. (2016). Comparison of the meat metabolite composition of Linwu and Pekin ducks using 600 MHz ¹H nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy. *Poultry Science*, 96(1), 192–199. <https://doi.org/10.3382/ps/pew279>
- Wang, Y., Yang, Y., Pan, D., He, J., Cao, J., Wang, H., & Ertbjerg, P. (2020). Metabolite profile based on ¹H NMR of broiler chicken breasts affected by wooden breast myodegeneration. *Food Chemistry*, 310(125852). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2019.125852>
- Warhadpande, R. M., Dutta, K. K., Mahanta, J. D., & Hazarika, M. (2010). Effect of incorporation of chicken blood plasma on physico-chemical properties of cakes. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 47(6), 693–696. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-010-0122-1>
- Wattanachant, S., Benjakul, S., & Ledward, D. A. (2004). Composition, color, and texture of thai indigenous and broiler chicken muscles. *Poultry Science*, 83(1), 123–128. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ps/83.1.123>
- Wen, D., Liu, Y., & Yu, Q. (2020). Metabolomic approach to measuring quality of chilled chicken meat during storage. *Poultry Science*, 99(5), 2543–2554. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psj.2019.11.070>
- Westerhuis, J. A., Hoefsloot, H. C. J., Smit, S., Vis, D. J., Smilde, A. K., Velzen, E. J. J. van, Duijnhoven, J. P. M. van, & Dorsten, F. A. van. (2008). Assessment of PLSDA cross validation. *Metabolomics*, 4, 81–89. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11306-007-0099-6>

- Wheelock, A. M., & Wheelock, C. E. (2013). Trials and tribulations of 'omics data analysis: Assessing quality of SIMCA-based multivariate models using examples from pulmonary medicine. *Molecular BioSystems*, 9(11), 2589–2596. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c3mb70194h>
- Wishart, D. S. (2019). NMR metabolomics: A look ahead. *Journal of Magnetic Resonance*, 306, 155–161. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmr.2019.07.013>
- Wu, G. (2009). Amino acids: Metabolism, functions, and nutrition. *Amino Acids*, 37(1), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00726-009-0269-0>
- Xiao, Z., Ge, C., Zhou, G., Zhang, W., & Liao, G. (2019). ¹H NMR-based metabolic characterization of Chinese Wuding chicken meat. *Food Chemistry*, 274, 574–582. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2018.09.008>
- Xiao, Z., Zhang, W., Yang, H., Yan, Z., Ge, C., Liao, G., & Su, H. (2021). ¹H NMR-based water-soluble lower molecule characterization and fatty acid composition of Chinese native chickens and commercial broiler. *Food Research International*, 140(110008), 110008. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2020.110008>
- Yang, L., Dai, B., Ayed, C., & Liu, Y. (2019). Comparing the metabolic profiles of raw and cooked pufferfish (*Takifugu flavidus*) meat by NMR assessment. *Food Chemistry*, 290, 107–113. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2019.03.128>
- Yi, L., Dong, N., Yun, Y., Deng, B., Ren, D., Liu, S., & Liang, Y. (2016). Chemometric methods in data processing of mass spectrometry-based metabolomics: A review. *Analytica Chimica Acta*, 914, 17–34. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aca.2016.02.001>
- Yu, Z., Kastenmüller, G., He, Y., Belcredi, P., Möller, G., Prehn, C., Mendes, J., Wahl, S., Roemisch-Margl, W., Ceglarek, U., Polonikov, A., Dahmen, N., Prokisch, H., Xie, L., Li, Y., Wichmann, H. E., Peters, A., Kronenberg, F., Suhre, K., ... Wang-Sattler, R. (2011). Differences between human plasma and serum metabolite profiles. *PLoS ONE*, 6(7), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0021230>
- Zampiga, M., Laghi, L., Zhu, C., Cartoni Mancinelli, A., Mattioli, S., & Sirri, F. (2021). Breast muscle and plasma metabolomics profile of broiler chickens exposed to chronic heat stress conditions. *Animal*, 15(7), 100275. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.animal.2021.100275>
- Zawadzki, A., Alloo, C., Grossi, A. B., do Nascimento, E. S. P., Almeida, L. C., Bogusz Junior, S., Skibsted, L. H., & Cardoso, D. R. (2018). Effect of hop β -acids as dietary supplement for broiler chickens on meat composition and redox stability. *Food Research International*, 105(October 2017), 210–220. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2017.10.072>

- Zhan, H., Hayat, K., Cui, H., Hussain, S., Ho, C. T., & Zhang, X. (2020). Characterization of flavor active non-volatile compounds in chicken broth and correlated contributing constituent compounds in muscle through sensory evaluation and partial least square regression analysis. *Lwt*, 118, 108786. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2019.108786>
- Zhang, T., Lu, H., Wang, L., Yin, M., & Yang, L. (2018). Specific expression pattern of IMP metabolism related-genes in chicken muscle between cage and free range conditions. *PLoS ONE*, 13(8), e0201736. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0201736>
- Zotte, A. D., Gleeson, E., Franco, D., Cullere, M., & Lorenzo, M. (2020). Proximate Composition, Amino Acid Profile, and Oxidative Stability of Slow-Growing Indigenous Chickens Compared with Commercial Broiler Chickens. *Foods*, 9(546), foods9050546.