



**EFFECT OF MECHANICAL WORK AND SELECTED PLANT PROTEASES
IN THE PRODUCTION OF BUFFALO MEAT PATTIES**

By

MOHAMAD AFIFI ISMAIL

**Thesis submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra
Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Science**

July 2021

FSTM 2021 30

COPYRIGHT

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs, and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the Degree of Master of Science

EFFECT OF MECHANICAL WORK AND SELECTED PLANT PROTEASES IN THE PRODUCTION OF BUFFALO MEAT PATTIES

By

MOHAMAD AFIFI ISMAIL

July 2021

Chairman : Ismail Fitry Mohammad Rashedi, PhD
Faculty : Food Science and Technology

Buffalo meat has been used widely in meat processing due to its good binding properties with high protein and low-fat content. However, the major problem rise in the industry is associate with the toughness of the buffalo meat. Therefore, several attempts had been done to improve the palatability of the tough meat by using physical and enzymatic treatment. The lack of studies that explain the relationship of mechanical process and plant protease incorporation on the physicochemical and sensory of buffalo meat patties has led to this study. The objectives of the present work were (i) to evaluate the physicochemical, sensorial properties and microstructural of buffalo meat patties produced using different mixing equipment (bowl cutter, universal mixer, and meat mixer), (ii) to determine the protease activities in selected plant extracts (ambarella, candlenut, carambola, ginger, jujube, kiwifruit and lemon) and their marination effects on the buffalo meats, and (iii) to evaluate the effects of mechanical work of mixing using the universal mixer and selected plant proteases (kiwifruit and candlenut) on the physicochemical, sensorial and microstructural properties of buffalo meat patties. In the first objective, the textural and sensorial properties of patties produced using the universal mixer were in between the patties produced using the bowl cutter and meat mixer. Besides that, scanning electron microscopy revealed slightly less homogeneity with a large number of pores, and less disruption of patties using the universal mixer. Therefore, the universal mixer was selected to be used for the third objective based on the results obtained. In the second objective, candlenut possessed the highest protease activities at 8.19 U/mL while kiwifruit and ginger showed similar protease activity in the range between 1.41 to 1.67 U/mL. The treatment using plant extract had decreased the water holding capacity of buffalo meat except for ginger. All treatments had increased the Trichloroacetic acid (TCA) soluble peptides content except carambola. Candlenut and jujube treatment had increased the

total soluble protein by 38.08% and 32.11%, and salt soluble protein by 7.16% and 8.07%, meanwhile kiwifruit treated meats had the highest collagen solubility at 31.74%. A significant improvement in Warner-Bratzler shear force value was observed in kiwifruit, candlenut and lemon treated samples by 59.74%, 28.07% and 18.95%, respectively. Overall, kiwifruit showed a higher tenderizing effect while candlenut possessed higher protease activity; therefore, both kiwifruit and candlenut were selected to be used for the third objective. In the third objective, marinating buffalo meat with kiwifruit and candlenut extract resulted in increases in the gel strength by 56.81% and 48.13%, and a significant improvement in binding properties. Meanwhile, the addition of kiwifruit and candlenut extract had increased cooking loss by 22.43% and 24.32%, as well as a higher total soluble protein at 79.09 mg/g and 79.40 mg/g raw meat, respectively. The buffalo meat patties added with kiwifruit extract had the lowest hardness value at 46.64, gumminess value at 32.27 and chewiness value at 27.60. The addition of kiwifruit also produced the highest score for tenderness at 7.56. Treatment of protease regardless by addition or marination had disintegrated the protein structure which was revealed by scanning electron microscopy. Overall, using the universal mixer was found to be the most effective in providing a good binding effect, improved sensorial properties and less disruption in microstructural of buffalo meat patties. In enzymatic treatment, kiwifruit and candlenut gave a high tenderizing effect and higher protease activity, respectively. Lastly, the application of the universal mixer together with kiwifruit and candlenut plant protease have led to an improved microstructural, physicochemical properties and palatability of buffalo meat patties. Hence, the present study shows that the application of protease combined with mechanical work of mixing can be a new potential method in producing meat products such as patties.

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia
sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk Ijazah Master Sains

KESAN PENGGUNAAN KAEDAH MEKANIKAL DAN PROTEASE TERPILIH DALAM MENGHASILKAN BURGER DAGING KERBAU

Oleh

MOHAMAD AFIFI ISMAIL

Julai 2021

Pengerusi : Ismail Fitry Mohammad Rashedi, PhD
Fakulti : Sains dan Teknologi Makanan

Daging kerbau telah digunakan secara meluas dalam pemrosesan daging kerana ciri pengikatnya yang baik dengan kandungan protein yang tinggi dan rendah lemak. Walau bagaimanapun, terdapat masalah utama yang berlaku dalam industri iaitu disebabkan oleh daging kerbau yang keras. Oleh itu, beberapa usaha telah dilakukan bagi menambahbaik ciri daging yang keras tersebut melalui kaedah fizikal dan enzimatik. Kurangnya kajian yang menjelaskan hubungkait proses mekanikal dan penggunaan protease tumbuhan terhadap fizikokimia dan sensori burger daging kerbau telah mendorong kepada kajian ini. Objektif kajian ini adalah (i) untuk menilai ciri fizikokimia, sensori dan mikrostruktur burger daging kerbau yang dihasilkan menggunakan mesin pengadun yang berbeza (mangkuk pengadun pemotong daging, pengadun serbaguna, dan pengadun daging), (ii) untuk menentukan aktiviti protease dalam ekstrak tumbuhan terpilih (kedondong, buah keras, belimbing, halia, kurma merah, buah kiwi dan lemon) dan kesan perapannya terhadap daging kerbau, dan (iii) untuk menilai kesan penggunaan kaedah pengadunan mekanikal (mesin pengadun serbaguna) dan protease tumbuhan yang terpilih (buah kiwi dan buah keras) terhadap ciri fizikokimia, sensori dan mikrostruktur burger daging kerbau. Untuk objektif pertama, ciri tekstur dan sensori burger yang dihasilkan menggunakan mesin pengadun serbaguna berada pada pertengahan antara burger yang dihasilkan menggunakan mangkuk pengadun pemotong daging dan mesin pengadun daging. Selain itu, melalui pengimbasan elektron mikroskopi menunjukkan kurang keseragaman serta terdapat banyak rongga, dan kurang kehancuran pada burger yang dihasilkan menggunakan mesin pengadun serbaguna. Oleh itu, mesin pengadun serbaguna telah dipilih untuk digunakan pada objektif ketiga berdasarkan hasil yang diperolehi. Untuk objektif kedua, buah keras memiliki aktiviti protease paling tinggi pada nilai 8.19 U/mL manakala buah kiwi dan halia

menunjukkan aktiviti protease yang sama dalam lingkungan antara 1.41 hingga 1.67 U/mL. Perapan menggunakan ekstrak tumbuhan telah mengurangkan keupayaan mengekalkan air bagi sampel daging kerbau kecuali ekstrak halia. Kesemua perapan telah meningkatkan kandungan peptida larut asid Trichloroacetic (TCA) kecuali ekstrak belimbing. Perapan buah keras dan kurma merah telah meningkatkan jumlah kelarutan protein sebanyak 38.08% dan 32.11%, dan kelarutan protein yang larut dalam garam sebanyak 7.16% dan 8.07%, sementara itu sampel daging yang diperap dengan ekstrak buah kiwi memiliki kelarutan kolagen paling tinggi sebanyak 31.74%. Peningkatan yang ketara pada nilai daya ricih Warner-Bratzler telah dicatatkan bagi sampel daging yang diperap dengan buah kiwi, buah keras dan lemon masing-masing sebanyak 59.74%, 28.07% dan 18.95%. Secara keseluruhan, buah kiwi menunjukkan kesan melembutkan daging yang lebih tinggi manakala buah keras mempunyai aktiviti protease yang lebih tinggi; oleh itu, buah kiwi dan buah keras dipilih untuk digunakan dalam objektif ketiga. Untuk objektif ketiga, perapan daging kerbau dengan ekstrak buah kiwi dan buah keras telah meningkatkan kekuatan gel sebanyak 56.81% dan 48.13%, dan mencatatkan peningkatan yang ketara dari segi daya pengikat. Manakala penambahan ekstrak buah kiwi dan buah keras telah meningkatkan kadar penurunan berat selepas masak sebanyak 22.43% dan 24.32%, serta jumlah kelarutan protein yang lebih tinggi masing-masing pada 79.09 mg/g dan 79.40 mg/g daging mentah. Burger daging kerbau yang ditambahkan dengan ekstrak buah kiwi mempunyai nilai kekerasan terendah pada 46.64, nilai keanjalan pada 32.27 dan nilai kekenyalan pada 27.60. Penambahan ekstrak buah kiwi juga menghasilkan skor kelembutan tertinggi iaitu 7.56. Rawatan protease samada melalui kaedah penambahan atau perapan telah menjejaskan struktur protein yang terbukti melalui pengimbasan elektron mikroskopi. Secara keseluruhan, penggunaan mesin pengadun serbaguna didapati paling berkesan dalam memberikan kesan daya pengikat yang baik, meningkatkan nilai sensori dan mengurangkan kehancuran pada mikrostruktur burger daging kerbau. Dalam rawatan enzimatik, buah kiwi dan buah keras memberikan kesan kelembutan yang tinggi dan aktiviti protease yang lebih tinggi. Akhir sekali, penggunaan mesin pengadun serbaguna bersama dengan protease buah kiwi dan buah keras telah menghasilkan peningkatan dari segi ciri mikrostruktur, fizikokimia dan sensori burger daging kerbau. Oleh itu, kajian ini menunjukkan bahawa penggunaan protease yang digabungkan dengan pengadunan mekanikal mampu menjadi satu kaedah terbaru yang berpotensi dalam menghasilkan produk daging seperti burger.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Glory and Praise be to Allah, the most gracious and merciful.

First and foremost, praises and thank be to Allah S.W.T. the Almighty and the All-knowing, for His showers of blessings throughout my MSc journey. This journey was long, so long that I thought it will never end. If not for the help and guidance of my supervisory committee and the faculty members, and the spiritual and emotional support of my beloved family and friends, I would not be able to finish it.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor; Dr Ismail Fitry Mohammad Rashedi for his encouragement, suggestion, guidance and support throughout the period of study. He has been a great supervisor. He always listens to the problems I had in whatever aspect, either in the study or personal life. He has been like a teacher, a and a friend at the same time. His knowledge is abundant and he is willing to share his idea anytime I need. He has guided me to the very detail of my work making sure that I produced a well-presented thesis.

A special thanks to my supervisor committee; Assoc. Dr Chong Gun Hean for his supervision as well. A big thank you to all the staff in the Department of Food Technology; En Safwan, Pn Asmawati, En Syawal, En Amran for their continuous assistance. Also, a big thank you to Science Officer; Pn Suraya. They were always by my side passionately helping me to go through my study. I could not thank them enough for their guidance. Thank you to all my lab mates for their friendship and company. Thank you to all postgraduates in FSTM for all the great moments we shared. Special thanks to the special one that always by my sides through thick and thin.

Thank you, School of Graduate Study (UPM) for the financial assistance through the Graduate Research Fellowship (GRF). Thank you to all the lecturers and staff in FSTM, UPM who have been supporting me.

Special thanks to my mother and father, and all the siblings for their patience when I was away from home.

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Master of Science. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Ismail Fitry bin Mohammad Rashedi, PhD

Senior Lecturer
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Chong Gun Hean, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Food Science and Technology
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

ZALILAH MOHD SHARIFF, PhD

Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 11 November 2021

Declaration by graduate student

I hereby confirm that:

- this thesis is my original work;
- quotations, illustrations and citations have been duly referenced;
- This thesis has not been submitted previously or concurrently for any other degree at any other institutions;
- intellectual property from the thesis and copyright of thesis are fully-owned by Universiti Putra Malaysia, as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- written permission must be obtained from supervisor and the office of Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and Innovation) before thesis is published (in the form of written, printed or in electronic form) including books, journals, modules, proceedings, popular writings, seminar papers, manuscripts, posters, reports, lecture notes, learning modules or any other materials as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012;
- there is no plagiarism or data falsification/fabrication in the thesis, and scholarly integrity is upheld as according to the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) and the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Research) Rules 2012. The thesis has undergone plagiarism detection software.

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Name and Matric Number: Mohamad Afifi Ismail

Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee

This is to confirm that:

- the research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervision;
- supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) are adhered to.

Signature: _____

Name of Chairman
of Supervisory
Committee:

Dr. Ismail Fitry Mohammad Rashedi

Signature: _____

Name of Member
of Supervisory
Committee:

Associate Professor
Dr. Chong Gun Hean

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT	i
ABSTRAK	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
APPROVAL	vi
DECLARATION	viii
LIST OF TABLES	xiii
LIST OF FIGURES	xv
LIST OF APPENDICES	xvii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xviii
CHAPTER	
1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION, PROBLEM STATEMENT AND RESEARCH OBJECTIVES	
1.1 General introduction	1
1.2 Problem statement	2
1.3 Research objectives	3
2 LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1 Buffalo meat	4
2.1.1 Physicochemical and functional properties of buffalo	4
2.1.2 Toughness in buffalo meat	7
2.1.2.1 Method to determine meat toughness	8
2.1.2.2 Processing techniques in improving palatability of buffalo meat	8
2.2 Muscle structure	9
2.3 Chemical and biochemical constituent of muscle	10
2.3.1 Myofibrillar protein	12
2.3.2 Sarcoplasmic protein	13
2.3.3 Connective tissue	14
2.4 Mechanical work in meat processing	14
2.5 Meat tenderization	15
2.5.1 Exogenous proteases for meat tenderization	17
2.5.2 Method of applying protease on meat	18
2.5.2.1 Used of natural plant protease in marinating treatment	18
2.6 Presence of protease in plant sources	19
2.6.1 Extraction of plant protease	19
2.6.2 Detection and measurement of proteases activity	20

2.6.3	Advantages and disadvantages of plant proteases	20
2.6.4	Application of plant protease in meat and meat products	21
2.6.5	Factor affecting emulsion stability	25
3	PHYSICOCHEMICAL, SENSORIAL AND MICROSTRUCTURAL PROPERTIES OF BUFFALO MEAT PATTIES PREPARED USING BOWL CUTTER, UNIVERSAL MIXER AND MEAT MIXER	
3.1	Introduction	26
3.2	Materials and methods	27
3.2.1	Processing of buffalo meat patties	27
3.2.2	Binding properties and gel strength	27
3.2.3	Cooking characteristics	28
3.2.4	Colour properties	29
3.2.5	Textural properties	29
3.2.6	Sensorial properties	30
3.2.7	Microstructural properties	30
3.2.8	Statistical analysis	30
3.3	Results and Discussion	31
3.3.1	Binding properties, gel strength and cooking characteristics	31
3.3.2	Colour properties	34
3.3.3	Textural properties	35
3.3.4	Sensorial properties	37
3.3.5	Microstructural properties	38
3.4	Conclusions	40
4	THE COMPARISON OF PROTEASE CONTENT IN SELECTED PLANT EXTRACT AND THEIR TENDERIZING EFFECT ON BUFFALO MEAT	
4.1	Introduction	41
4.2	Materials and methods	42
4.2.1	Materials	42
4.2.2	Plant materials	42
4.2.3	Plant protease extraction	42
4.2.4	pH and protein concentration	43
4.2.5	Quantitative estimation of protease and specific activity	43
4.2.6	Marination of samples	43
4.2.7	Analysis of meat samples	44
4.2.7.1	pH and water holding capacity	44
4.2.7.2	Moisture content and moisture retention	44
4.2.7.3	Cooking loss and Warner-Bratzler shear force	45
4.2.7.4	TCA-soluble peptides content	45

4.2.7.5	Protein extractability	45
4.2.7.6	Collagen solubility	46
4.2.8	Statistical analysis	46
4.3	Results and Discussion	47
4.3.1	Physicochemical properties of plant extracts	47
4.3.1.1	pH and protein concentration	47
4.3.1.2	Protease	49
4.3.1.3	Specific activity	49
4.3.2	Physicochemical properties of the marinated meats	50
4.3.2.1	pH and water holding capacity	50
4.3.2.2	Moisture content and moisture retention	52
4.3.2.3	Cooking loss and protein concentration in cooking loss	53
4.3.2.4	TCA-soluble peptides	54
4.3.2.5	Protein extractability	55
4.3.2.6	Collagen solubility	57
4.3.2.7	Warner-Bratzler shear force	58
4.4	Conclusions	59
5	APPLICATION OF PLANT PROTEASE IN PROCESSING OF BUFFALO MEAT PATTIES	
5.1	Introduction	60
5.2	Materials and methods	61
5.2.1	Processing of buffalo meat patties	61
5.2.2	Analysis of buffalo meat patties	62
5.3	Results and Discussion	62
5.3.1	Binding properties and gel strength	62
5.3.2	Cooking characteristics	65
5.3.3	pH and water holding capacity	66
5.3.4	Protein extractability	67
5.3.5	TCA-soluble peptides	68
5.3.6	Colour properties	69
5.3.7	Textural properties	70
5.3.8	Sensorial properties	71
5.3.9	Microstructural properties	72
5.4	Conclusions	74
6	GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	
6.1	General conclusions	75
6.2	Recommendations for future research	76
	REFERENCES	77
	APPENDICES	90
	BIODATA OF STUDENT	93
	LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	94

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
2.1	Proximate composition of buffalo meats summarized from previous studies	5
2.2	Component and chemical composition of typical adult mammalian muscle	11
2.3	Application of plant protease and their tenderizing effect on meats	22
3.1	Binding properties, gel strength and cooking characteristics of buffalo meat patties prepared using different equipment	31
3.2	Pearson correlation matrix between variables of buffalo meat patties	33
3.3	Colour of raw buffalo meat patties prepared using different equipment	35
3.4	Texture profile analysis of buffalo meat patties prepared from different equipment	36
3.5	Sensorial properties of buffalo meat patties prepared using different equipment	37
4.1	Protein, protease, specific activity and pH values of plant extracts	48
4.2	Physicochemical properties of buffalo meat marinated with plant extracts	51
5.1	Plant extracts treatment prior to the processing of buffalo meat patties	61
5.2	Binding properties, gel strength and cooking characteristics of buffalo meat patties prepared from different plant extract treatment	64
5.3	Colour of cooked buffalo meat patties prepared from different plant extract treatment	69

5.4	Texture profile analysis of buffalo meat patties prepared from different plant extract treatment	70
5.5	Sensorial properties of buffalo meat patties prepared from different plant extract treatment	71



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
2.1	Buffalo population in Malaysia	6
2.2	Frozen beef/buffalo imports by country of origin	7
2.3	Schematic diagram showing structure of the skeletal muscles	10
3.1	Scanning electron micrographs (1,000 × magnification) of buffalo meat patties prepared using different equipment; (a) bowl cutter, (b) universal mixer, and (c) meat mixer.	39
4.1	Effect of plant extract treatment on TCA-soluble peptides content of raw buffalo meat	54
4.2	Effect of plant extract treatment on protein extractability of raw buffalo meat. WSP, water-soluble proteins; SSP, salt soluble proteins; TSP, total soluble proteins	56
4.3	Effect of plant extract treatment on collagen solubility	57
4.4	Effect of plant extract treatment on Warner-Bratzler shear force	58
5.1	Effect of addition and marination of plant extract on the pH and water holding capacity of buffalo meat patties	66
5.2	Effect of addition and marination of plant extract on protein extractability of buffalo meat patties. WSP, water-soluble proteins; SSP, salt soluble proteins; TSP, total soluble proteins	67
5.3	Effect of addition and marination of plant extract treatment on TCA-soluble peptides content of buffalo meat patties	68
5.4	Scanning electron micrographs (1000 × magnification) of buffalo meat patties prepared from different treatment; (a) control, (b) addition of kiwifruit extract, (c) addition of candlenut extract, (d)	73

marination with kiwifruit extract, (e) marination with candlenut extract and (f) buffalo meat patties produced using universal mixer without protease treatment (from Chapter 3)



LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix		Page
4.1	Standard curve of BSA	90
4.2	Standard curve of tyrosine	91
4.3	Sample of cooked buffalo meat treated with different plant extract	92



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

°C	Degree celsius
kg	Kilogram
g	Gram
U	Enzyme unit
μmol	Micromole
ppm	Part per million
rpm	Revolution per minute
kDa	Kilo Dalton
L	Litre
mL	Millilitre
M	Molar
mm	Millimetre
cm	Centimetre
mm/s	Millimetre per second
min	Minutes
%	Per cent
GRAS	Generally recognized as safe
DMAB	Dimethylamino-benzaldehyde
LNPE	Na-CBZ-L-lysine <i>p</i> -nitrophenyl ester
HCl	Hydrochloric acid
TCA	Trichloroacetic acid
SPP	Sodium pyrophosphate
STPP	Sodium tripolyphosphate
CaCl ₂	Calcium chloride
NaCl	Sodium chloride
BSA	Bovine serum albumin
WBSF	Warner-Bratzler shear force
CSA	Cross-sectional area
SEM	Scanning electron microscopy

MFI	Myofibrillar fragmentation index
SDS-PAGE	Sodium dodecyl sulphate polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis
WHC	Water holding capacity
TFR	Total fluid release
WR	Water release
FR	Fat release
IMCT	Intermuscular connective tissues
TSP	Total soluble protein
SSP	Salt soluble protein
WSP	Water-soluble protein

CHAPTER 1

GENERAL INTRODUCTION, PROBLEM STATEMENT AND RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

1.1 General Introduction

Consumption of meat products particularly patties had increased over the years. This kind of processed meat product is usually composed of a certain amount of meat protein and fat, and other non-meat ingredients (Heydari et al., 2016; Tornberg, 2013). Processing of patties requires meat protein with good binding properties to form a stable meat emulsion. In terms of good binding properties, buffalo meat was proven to have good emulsifying and water holding capacity (Devadason et al., 2014). Besides that, buffalo meat is also high in protein and low in fat content (Tateo et al., 2007). Therefore, buffalo meat is used widely in meat processing such as burgers, sausages and nuggets (Sachindra et al., 2005; Modiet al., 2004).

The processing of patties involves several steps starting from cutting, mincing, mixing and forming. Notably, these processing steps had a great influence on the properties of the final product, especially the mixing step. Lachowicz et al. (2003) found that mechanical work involves during the mixing could loose and disrupt the muscle fibres, thus improve the palatability. Besides that, the mixing also facilitated the extraction of myofibrillar protein, thus induced gelation and binding properties of processed meat products (Zhou et al., 2018; Xiong, 2005). Equipment such as bowl cutter, universal mixer or meat mixer are normally used for the mixing process. The mechanical work of the bowl cutter that consist of high-speed rotating knives produces very fine particles that is essential for protein solubilisation and the formation of stable emulsion (Zhou et al., 2018; Ducept et al., 2012). In contrast, a universal mixer operates based on the blade rotation that creates frictions between meat particles and other ingredients which had facilitate the protein solubilisation thus produce homogenised emulsion (Allais, 2010). Meanwhile, meat mixer provides gentler mixing process with vertical rotation of the mixing paddle, which eventually provided adequate time for protein solubilisation (Heinz & Hautzinger, 2007).

Over the years, the processing methods have been regularly modified to improve the quality attributes of meat products. One of the recent technique is the incorporation of exogenous protease to improve the palatability of tough meats. Abdel-Naeem and Mohamed (2016) found that the addition of ginger in camel meat burgers resulted in extensive fragmentation of myofibrils, increases collagen solubility and sensory properties. Meanwhile, Habib et al., (2018) reported that the incorporation of pomegranate rind powder in buffalo nuggets

had improved the emulsion stability and sensory attributes. Thus, the application of protease during processing could allow thorough distribution and maximize the tenderizing effect.

1.2 Problem Statement

- 1) Even though buffalo meat is used widely in meat processing, there is a problem associated with buffalo meat which is its toughness. The tough and coarse texture of buffalo meat is due to the collagen in connective tissue that becomes more complex and stronger when the animal age progresses (Kandeepan et al., 2009). In that case, several attempts had been done to improve the palatability of the tough meat mostly by using physical and enzymatic treatment. The mechanical work involves in meat processing such as cutting and grinding help to break down and reduce the connective tissue structure thus make it less intact (Zochowska-Kujawska et al., 2007). Meanwhile, mechanical work of mixing help to loosen the muscle fibers which subsequently facilitate protein solubilization (Lachowicz et al., 2003). Mixing equipment such as bowl cutter, universal and meat mixer provide different mechanical approaches. Therefore, various mechanical work of mixing using different equipment could lead to different patties attributes, however, the comparison in terms of quality and characteristics are yet to be tested scientifically.
- 2) Another technique used to reduce meat toughness is the treatment with exogenous protease which is also known as tenderizer (Pietrasik & Shand, 2011; Sullivan & Calkins, 2010). The meat is treated with exogenous protease either by infusion, injection or marination (Liu et al., 2011). The application of exogenous protease had improved meat tenderness by degrading myofibrillar protein and hydrolyzing connective tissue (Maqsood et al., 2018; Moon, 2018). Plant proteases such as papain, bromelain and ficin are widely available in the markets which had been used commercially in households and industries. Apart from these well-known proteases, several other plants show potential to be used for meat tenderization. Traditionally, plants such as ambarella, candlenut, carambola and jujube had been used as cooking ingredients of meat intentionally for flavouring as well as tenderizing the meat. The use of this plant in meat had been practiced for many years in some parts of the world, but not many reports were found. Thus, it is important to study the potential of these plants as meat tenderizers as a means of providing scientific evidence.

- 3) Most of the previous studies conducted were focusing on the utilization of proteolytic enzymes to tenderize the fresh meat as a pre-treatment. However, there are very limited studies on the use of these enzymes when incorporated as one of the raw ingredients in meat products during the processing. Until now, there are lack of studies that explain the relationship of mechanical process and plant protease incorporation on the physicochemical and sensory of buffalo meat patties.

1.3 Research Objectives

Therefore, the objectives of the present work were as follows:

- 1) To evaluate the physicochemical, sensorial and microstructural properties of buffalo meat patties produced using different mixing equipment (bowl cutter, universal mixer, and meat mixer)
- 2) To determine the protease activities in selected plant extracts (ambarella, candlenut, carambola, ginger, jujube kiwifruit and lemon) and their marination effects on the buffalo meats.
- 3) To evaluate the effects of mechanical work of mixing using the universal mixer and plant protease (kiwifruit and candlenut) application on the physicochemical, sensorial and microstructural properties of buffalo meat patties.

REFERENCES

- Abdel-Naeem, H. H. S., & Mohamed, H. M. H. (2016). Improving the physico-chemical and sensory characteristics of camel meat burger patties using ginger extract and papain. *Meat Science*, *118*, 52–60.
- Afshar-Mohammadian, M., Rahimi-Koldeh, J., & Sajedi, R. H. (2011). The comparison of protease activity and total protein in three cultivars of kiwifruit of Northern Iran during fruit development. *Acta Physiologiae Plantarum*, *33*(2), 343–348.
- Ahmad, M. N., Mat Noh, N. A., Abdullah, E. N., Yarmo, M. A., Mat Piah, M. B., & Ku Bulat, K. H. (2019). Optimization of a protease extraction using a statistical approach for the production of an alternative meat tenderizer from *Spondias cytherea* roots. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, *43*(11), 1–14.
- Ahmad, S., Rizawi, J. A., & Srivastava, P. K. (2010). Effect of soy protein isolate incorporation on quality characteristics and shelf-life of buffalo meat emulsion sausage. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, *47*(3), 290–294.
- Akoglu, H. (2018). User's guide to correlation coefficients. *Turkish journal of emergency medicine*, *18*(3), 91-93.
- Allais, I. (2010). Emulsification. In F. Toldrá (Ed.), *Handbook of Meat Processing* (1st ed., pp. 143–168). Wiley-Blackwell.
- Amid, A., Ismail, N. A., Yusof, F., & Salleh, H. M. (2011). Expression, purification, and characterization of a recombinant stem bromelain from *Ananas comosus*. *Process Biochemistry*, *46*(12), 2232–2239.
- Aminlari, M., Shekarfroush, S. S., Gheisari, H. R., & Golestan, L. (2009). Effect of actinidin on the protein solubility, water holding capacity, texture, electrophoretic pattern of beef, and on the quality attributes of a sausage product. *Journal of Food Science*, *74*(3).
- Anjaneyulu, A. S. R., Sharma, N., & Kondaiah, N. (1989). Evaluation of salt, polyphosphates and their blends at different levels on physicochemical properties of buffalo meat and patties. *Meat Science*, *25*(4), 293–306.
- AOAC. (2000). The Association of Official Analytical Chemists. *Official Methods of Analysis (17th Ed.)*.
- Asghar, A., Samejima, K., Yasui, T., & Henrickson, R. L. (1985). Functionality of muscle proteins in gelation mechanisms of structured meat products. *C R C Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, *22*(1), 27–106.

- Ashie, I. N. A., Sorensen, T. L., & Nielsen, P. M. (2002). Effects of Papain and a Microbial Enzyme on Meat Proteins and Beef Tenderness. *Food Chemistry and Toxicology*, 67(6), 2138–2142.
- Aslinah, L. N. F., Mat Yusoff, M., & Ismail-Fitry, M. R. (2018). Simultaneous use of adzuki beans (*Vigna angularis*) flour as meat extender and fat replacer in reduced-fat beef meatballs (bebola daging). *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 55(8), 3241–3248.
- Barekat, S., & Soltanizadeh, N. (2017). Improvement of meat tenderness by simultaneous application of high-intensity ultrasonic radiation and papain treatment. *Innovative Food Science and Emerging Technologies*, 39, 223–229.
- Bekhit, A. A., Hopkins, D. L., Geesink, G., Bekhit, A. A., & Franks, P. (2014). Exogenous Proteases for Meat Tenderization Exogenous Proteases for Meat. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 54(8), 1012–1031.
- Benjakul, S., Visessanguan, W., Riebroy, S., Ishizaki, S., & Tanaka, M. (2002). Gel-forming properties of surimi produced from bigeye snapper, *Priacanthus tayenus* and *P. macracanthus*, stored in ice. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 82(13), 1442–1451. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.1207>
- Berry, B. W., Bigner-George, M. E., & Eastridge, J. S. (1999). Hot processing and grind size affect properties of cooked beef patties. *Meat Science*, 53(1), 37–43.
- Bowker, B. C., Eastridge, J. S., Paroczay, E. W., Callahan, J. A., & Solomon, M. B. (2010). Tenderization Mechanism. In F. Toldrá (Ed.), *Handbook of Meat Processing* (1st ed., pp. 87–104). Wiley-Blackwell.
- Bowker, B. C., Eastridge, J. S., & Solomon, M. B. (2014). Measurement of Muscle Exudate Protein Composition as an Indicator of Beef Tenderness. *Journal of Food Science*, 79(7), 1292–1297.
- Bradford, M. M. (1976). A rapid and sensitive method for the quantitation of microgram quantities of protein utilizing the principle of protein-dye binding. *Analytical Biochemistry*, 72, 248–254.
- Brennan, J. G. (2012). Mixing, Emulsification and Size Reduction. In J. G. Brennan & A. S. Grandison (Eds.), *Food Processing Handbook* (2nd ed., pp. 513–558).
- Bublin, M., Radauer, C., Knulst, A., Wagner, S., Scheiner, O., Mackie, A. R., Mills, E. N., & Breiteneder, H. (2008). Effects of gastrointestinal digestion and heating on the allergenicity of the kiwi allergens Act d 1, actinidin, and Act d 2, a thaumatin-like protein. *Molecular nutrition & food*

research, 52(10), 1130-1139.

- Burke, R. M., & Monahan, F. J. (2003). The tenderisation of shin beef using a citrus juice marinade. *Meat Science*, 63(2), 161–168.
- Chalabi, M., Khademi, F., Yarani, R., & Mostafaie, A. (2014). Proteolytic activities of kiwifruit actinidin (*Actinidia deliciosa* cv. Hayward) on different fibrous and globular proteins: A comparative study of actinidin with papain. *Applied Biochemistry and Biotechnology*, 172(8), 4025–4037.
- Chang, H. J., Xu, X. L., Li, C. B., Huang, M., Liu, D. Y., & Zhou, G. H. (2011). A comparison of heat-induced changes of intramuscular connective tissue and collagen of beef semitendinosus muscle during water bath and microwave heating. *Journal of Food Process Engineering*, 34(6), 2233–2250.
- Chaurasiya, R. S., Sakhare, P. Z., Bhaskar, N., & Hebbar, H. U. (2015). Efficacy of reverse micellar extracted fruit bromelain in meat tenderization. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 52(6), 3870–3880.
- Cheng, Q., & Sun, D. W. (2008). Factors affecting the water holding capacity of red meat products: A review of recent research advances. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 48(2), 137–159.
- Christensen, M., Tørngren, M. A., Gunvig, A., Rozlosnik, N., Lametsch, R., Karlsson, A. H., & Ertbjerg, P. (2009). Injection of marinade with actinidin increases tenderness of porcine M. biceps femoris and affects myofibrils and connective tissue. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 89(9), 1607–1614.
- Cofrades, S., López-López, I., Solas, M. T., Bravo, L., & Jiménez-Colmenero, F. (2008). Influence of different types and proportions of added edible seaweeds on characteristics of low-salt gel/emulsion meat systems. *Meat Science*, 79(4), 767–776.
- Costa, H. B., Fernandes, P. M. B., Romão, W., & Ventura, J. A. (2014). A new procedure based on column chromatography to purify bromelain by ion exchange plus gel filtration chromatographies. *Industrial Crops and Products*, 59, 163–168.
- Cruz, P. L., Panno, P. H. C., Giannotti, J. D. G., Carvalho, R. V. de, & Roberto, C. D. (2020). Effect of proteases from ginger rhizome on the fragmentation of myofibrils and tenderness of chicken breast. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 120(November 2019), 3–8.
- Devadason, I. P., Anjaneyulu, A. S. R., Mendiratta, S. K., & Murthy, T. R. K. (2014). Quality and shelf life of buffalo meat blocks processed in retort pouches. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 51(12), 3991–3997.

- Devatkal, S. K., Manjunatha, M., Narsaiah, K., & Patil, R. T. (2014). Evaluation of quality characteristics of chicken meat emulsion/nuggets prepared by using different equipment. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 51(3), 511–518.
- Dhital, S., & Vangnai, K. (2019). Meat tenderisation effect of protease from mango peel crude extract. *International Food Research Journal*, 26(3), 991–998.
- Ducept, F., De Broucker, T., Souli, J. M., Trystram, G., & Cuvelier, G. (2012). Influence of the mixing process on surimi seafood paste properties and structure. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 108(4), 557–562.
- El-Magoli, S. B., Laroia, S., & Hansen, P. M. T. (1996). Flavor and texture characteristics of low fat ground beef patties formulated with whey protein concentrate. *Meat Science*, 42(2), 179–193.
- Feijoo-Siota, L., & Villa, T. G. (2011). Native and Biotechnologically Engineered Plant Proteases with Industrial Applications. *Food and Bioprocess Technology*, 4(6), 1066–1088.
- Feiner, G. (2006). *Meat products handbook: practical science and technology* (G. Feiner (ed.)). Woodhead Publishing.
- Focke, M., Hemmer, W., Wohrl, S., Gotz, M. and Jarisch, R. (2003). Cross-reactivity between *Ficus benjamina* latex and fig fruit in patients with clinical fig allergy. *Clin. Exp. Allergy*, 33, 971–977.
- Gagaoua, M., Hoggas, N., & Hafid, K. (2015). Data in support of three phase partitioning of zingibain, a milk-clotting enzyme from *Zingiber officinale* Roscoe rhizomes. *International Journal of Biological Macromolecules*, 6, 245–252.
- Gao, Q. H., Wu, P. T., Liu, J. R., Wu, C. S., Parry, J. W., & Wang, M. (2011). Physico-chemical properties and antioxidant capacity of different jujube (*Ziziphus jujuba* Mill.) cultivars grown in loess plateau of China. *Scientia Horticulturae*, 130(1), 67–72.
- Gao, T., Li, J., Zhang, L., Jiang, Y., Song, L., Ma, R., Gao, F., & Zhou, G. (2015). Effect of different tumbling marinade treatments on the water status and protein properties of prepared pork chops. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 95(12), 2494–2500.
- Gerelt, B., Ikeuchi, Y., Nishiumi, T., & Suzuki, A. (2002). Meat tenderization by calcium chloride after osmotic dehydration. *Meat Science*, 60(3), 237–244.
- Gerelt, B., Ikeuchi, Y., & Suzuki, A. (2000). Meat tenderization by proteolytic enzymes after osmotic dehydration. *Meat Science*, 56, 311–318.

- Girard, I., Bruce, H. L., Basarab, J. A., Larsen, I. L., & Aalhus, J. L. (2012). Contribution of myofibrillar and connective tissue components to the Warner-Bratzler shear force of cooked beef. *Meat Science*, 92(4), 775–782.
- Giuffrida-Mendoza, M., de Moreno, L. A., Huerta-Leidenz, N., Uzcátegui-Bracho, S., Valero-Leal, K., Romero, S., & Rodas-González, A. (2015). Cholesterol and fatty acid composition of longissimus thoracis from water buffalo (*Bubalus bubalis*) and Brahman-influenced cattle raised under savannah conditions. *Meat Science*, 106, 44–49.
- Goli, T., Ricci, J., Bohuon, P., Marchesseau, S., & Collignan, A. (2014). Influence of sodium chloride and pH during acidic marination on water retention and mechanical properties of turkey breast meat. *Meat Science*, 96(3), 1133–1140.
- González-Rábade, N., Badillo-Corona, J. A., Aranda-Barradas, J. S., & Oliver-Salvador, M. del C. (2011). Production of plant proteases in vivo and in vitro - A review. *Biotechnology Advances*, 29(6), 983–996.
- Grudkowska, M., & Zagdańska, B. (2004). Multifunctional role of plant cysteine proteinases. *Acta Biochimica Polonica*, 51(3), 609–624.
- Gurikar, A. M., Lakshmanan, V., Gadekar, Y. P., Sharma, B. D., & Anjaneyulu, A. S. R. (2014). Effect of meat chunk size, massaging time and cooking time on quality of restructured pork blocks. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 51(7), 1363–1369.
- Ha, M., Bekhit, A. E. D. A., Carne, A., & Hopkins, D. L. (2012). Characterisation of commercial papain, bromelain, actinidin and zingibain protease preparations and their activities toward meat proteins. *Food Chemistry*, 134(1), 95–105.
- Ha, M., Bekhit, A. E. D., Carne, A., & Hopkins, D. L. (2013). Characterisation of kiwifruit and asparagus enzyme extracts, and their activities toward meat proteins. *Food Chemistry*, 136(2), 989–998.
- Habib, H., Siddiqi, R. A., Dar, A. H., Dar, M. A., Gul, K., Rashid, N., & Siddiqi, U. S. (2018). Quality characteristics of carabeef nuggets as affected by pomegranate rind powder. *Journal of Food Measurement and Characterization*, 12(3), 2164–2173.
- Han, J., Morton, J. D., Bekhit, A. E. D., & Sedcole, J. R. (2009). Pre-rigor infusion with kiwifruit juice improves lamb tenderness. *Meat Science*, 82(3), 324–330.
- Hazra, S., Biswas, S., Bhattacharyya, D., Das, S. K., & Khan, A. (2012). Quality of cooked ground buffalo meat treated with the crude extracts of Moringa

oleifera (Lam.) leaves. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 49(2), 240–245.

Heinz, G., & Hautzinger, P. (2007). *Meat processing technology for small to medium-scale producers*. FAO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific.

Heydari, F., Varidi, M. J., Varidi, M., & Mohebbi, M. (2016). Study on quality characteristics of camel burger and evaluating its stability during frozen storage. *Journal of Food Measurement and Characterization*, 10(1), 148–155.

Hollenbeck, J. J., Apple, J. K., Yancey, J. W. S., Johnson, T. M., Kerns, K. N., & Young, A. N. (2019). Cooked color of precooked ground beef patties manufactured with mature bull trimmings. *Meat Science*, 148(September 2018), 41–49.

Hopkins, D. L., & Thompson, J. M. (2001). The relationship between tenderness, proteolysis, muscle contraction and dissociation of actomyosin. *Meat Science*, 57(1), 1–12.

Huff-Loneragan, E. (2010). Chemistry and Biochemistry of Meat. In F. Toldrá (Ed.), *Handbook of Meat Processing* (1st ed., pp. 5–24). Wiley-Blackwell.

Huff-Loneragan, E., & Lonergan, S. M. (2005). Mechanisms of water-holding capacity of meat: The role of postmortem biochemical and structural changes. *Meat Science*, 71, 194–204.

Huff-Loneragan, E., Zhang, W., & Lonergan, S. M. (2010). Biochemistry of postmortem muscle - Lessons on mechanisms of meat tenderization. *Meat Science*, 86(1), 184–195.

Hughes, J. M., Oiseth, S. K., Purslow, P. P., & Warner, R. D. (2014). A structural approach to understanding the interactions between colour, water-holding capacity and tenderness. *Meat Science*, 98(3), 520–532.

Humberto, A., Minervino, H., Zava, M., Vecchio, D., & Borghese, A. (2020). *Bubalus bubalis: A Short Story*. 7(December), 1–15.

Hwang, I. H., Park, B. Y., Cho, S. H., & Lee, J. M. (2004). Effects of muscle shortening and proteolysis on Warner-Bratzler shear force in beef longissimus and semitendinosus. *Meat Science*, 68(3), 497–505.

Ishak, S. A., Ismail, N., Mohd Noor, M. A., & Ahmad, H. (2005). Some physical and chemical properties of ambarella (*Spondias cytherea* Sonn.) at three different stages of maturity. *Journal of Food Composition and Analysis*, 18(8), 819–827.

Jamil, S. H. (2015). *Consumer Preference for Specific Beef Attributes in*

Peninsular Malaysia. Universiti Putra Malaysia, Malaysia.

- Joo, S. T., Kauffman, R. G., Kim, B. C., & Park, G. B. (1999). The relationship of sarcoplasmic and myofibrillar protein solubility to colour and water-holding capacity in porcine longissimus muscle. *Meat Science*, 52, 291–297.
- Juárez, M., Failla, S., Ficco, A., Peña, F., Avilés, C., & Polvillo, O. (2010). Buffalo meat composition as affected by different cooking methods. *Food and Bioproducts Processing*, 88(2–3), 145–148.
- Kandeeban, G., Anjaneyulu, A. S. R., Kondaiah, N., Mendiratta, S. K., & Lakshmanan, V. (2009). Effect of age and gender on the processing characteristics of buffalo meat. *Meat Science*, 83(1), 10–14.
- Kemp, C. M., Sensky, P. L., Bardsley, R. G., Buttery, P. J., & Parr, T. (2010). Tenderness - An enzymatic view. *Meat Science*, 84(2), 248–256.
- Ketnawa, S., & Rawdkuen, S. (2011). Application of Bromelain Extract for Muscle Foods Tenderization. *Food and Nutrition Sciences*, 2(5), 393–401.
- Ketnawa, S., Rawdkuen, S., & Chaiwut, P. (2010). Two phase partitioning and collagen hydrolysis of bromelain from pineapple peel Nang Lae cultivar. *Biochemical Engineering Journal*, 52(2–3), 205–211.
- Koak, J. H., Kim, H. S., Choi, Y. J., Baik, M. Y., & Kim, B. Y. (2011). Characterization of a protease from over-matured fruits and development of a tenderizer using an optimization technique. *Food Science and Biotechnology*, 20(2), 485–490.
- Krzywdzińska-Bartkowiak, M., Piątek, M., & Dolata, W. (2014). A comparative quality appraisal of finely comminuted batters produced using three types of knives. *Meat Science*, 96(1), 429–435.
- Lachowicz, K., Sobczak, M., Gajowiecki, L., & Zych, A. (2003). Effects of massaging time on texture, rheological properties, and structure of three pork ham muscles. *Meat Science*, 63(2), 225–233.
- Lawrie, R. A., & Ledward, D. A. (2006). *Lawrie's meat science* (7th ed.). Woodhead Publishing.
- Li, C., Wang, D., Xu, W., Gao, F., & Zhou, G. (2013). Effect of final cooked temperature on tenderness, protein solubility and microstructure of duck breast muscle. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 51(1), 266–274.
- Li, Z., Scott, K., Hemar, Y., Zhang, H., & Otter, D. (2018). Purification and characterisation of a protease (tamarillin) from tamarillo fruit. *Food Chemistry*, 256(October 2017), 228–234.

- Liu, C., Xiong, Y. L., & Rentfrow, G. K. (2011). Kiwifruit protease extract injection reduces toughness of pork loin muscle induced by freeze-thaw abuse. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 44(10), 2026–2031.
- Luo, H., Lin, S., Ren, F., Wu, L., Chen, L., & Sun, Y. (2007). Antioxidant and antimicrobial capacity of Chinese medicinal herb extracts in raw sheep meat. *Journal of Food Protection*, 70(6), 1440–1445.
- Lytras, G. N., King, R. D., & Ledward, D. A. (2000). Prediction of the soluble myoglobin content of cooked burgers. *Meat Science*, 55(2), 247–250.
- Maqsood, S., Manheem, K., Gani, A., & Abushelaibi, A. (2018). Degradation of myofibrillar, sarcoplasmic and connective tissue proteins by plant proteolytic enzymes and their impact on camel meat tenderness. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 55(9), 3427–3438.
- Marino, R., Albenzio, M., della Malva, A., Santillo, A., Loizzo, P., & Sevi, A. (2013). Proteolytic pattern of myofibrillar protein and meat tenderness as affected by breed and aging time. *Meat Science*, 95(2), 281–287.
- Mazaheri Kalahrodi, M., Baghaei, H., Emadzadeh, B., & Bolandi, M. (2021). Degradation of myofibrillar and sarcoplasmic proteins as a function of marinating time and marinade type and their impact on textural quality and sensory attributes of m. semitendinosus beefsteak. *Journal of Food Processing and Preservation*, e15691.
- Modi, V. K., Mahendrakar, N. S., Narasimha Rao, D., & Sachindra, N. M. (2004). Quality of buffalo meat burger containing legume flours as binders. *Meat Science*, 66(1), 143–149.
- Modzelewska-Kapituła, M., Kwiatkowska, A., Jankowska, B., & Dąbrowska, E. (2015). Water holding capacity and collagen profile of bovine m. infraspinatus during postmortem ageing. *Meat Science*, 100, 209–216.
- Moon, S. S. (2018). Effect of proteolytic enzymes and ginger extract on tenderization of *M. pectoralis profundus* from holstein steer. *Korean Journal for Food Science of Animal Resources*, 38(1), 143–151.
- Nadzirah, K. Z., Zainal, S., Noriham, A., & Normah, I. (2016). Application of bromelain powder produced from pineapple crowns in tenderising beef round cuts. *International Food Research Journal*, 23(4), 1590–1599.
- Nafi, A., Ling, F. H., Bakar, J., & Ghazali, H. M. (2014). Partial characterization of an enzymatic extract from Bentong ginger (*Zingiber officinale* var. Bentong). *Molecules*, 19(8), 12336–12348.
- Nam, S. H., Walsh, M. K., & Yang, K. Y. (2016). Comparison of four purification methods to purify cysteine protease from Asian pear fruit (*Pyrus pyrifolia*).

- Narsaiah, K., Jha, S. N., Devatkal, S. K., Borah, A., Singh, D. B., & Sahoo, J. (2011). Tenderizing effect of blade tenderizer and pomegranate fruit products in goat meat. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 48(1), 61–68.
- Naveena, B. M., & Kiran, M. (2014). Buffalo meat quality, composition, and processing characteristics: Contribution to the global economy and nutritional security. *Animal Frontiers*, 4(4), 18–24.
- Naveena, B. M., Kiran, M., Reddy, K. S., Ramakrishna, C., Vaithyanathan, S., & Devatkal, S. K. (2011). Effect of ammonium hydroxide on ultrastructure and tenderness of buffalo meat. *Meat Science*, 88(4), 727–732.
- Naveena, B. M., Mendiratta, S. K., & Anjaneyulu, A. S. R. (2004). Tenderization of buffalo meat using plant proteases from *Cucumis trigonus* Roxb (Kachri) and *Zingiber officinale* roscoe (Ginger rhizome). *Meat Science*, 68(3), 363–369.
- Neath, K. E., Del Barrio, A. N., Lapitan, R. M., Herrera, J. R. V., Cruz, L. C., Fujihara, T., Muroya, S., Chikuni, K., Hirabayashi, M., & Kanai, Y. (2007). Difference in tenderness and pH decline between water buffalo meat and beef during postmortem aging. *Meat Science*, 75(3), 499–505.
- Nettis, E., Napoli, G., Ferrannini, A. and Tursi, A. (2001). IgE-mediated allergy to Bromelain. *Allergy*. 56, 257–258.
- Nishimura, T. (2010). The role of intramuscular connective tissue in meat texture. *Animal Science Journal*, 81(1), 21–27.
- Nor, M. Z. M., Ramchandran, L., Duke, M., & Vasiljevic, T. (2015). Characteristic properties of crude pineapple waste extract for bromelain purification by membrane processing. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 52(11), 7103–7112.
- Obuz, E., Akkaya, L., Gök, V., & Dikeman, M. E. (2014). Effects of blade tenderization, aging method and aging time on meat quality characteristics of *Longissimus lumborum* steaks from cull Holstein cows. *Meat Science*, 96(3), 1227–1232.
- Önenç, A., Serdaroğlu, M., & Abdraimov, K. (2004). Effect of various additives to marinating baths on some properties of cattle meat. *European Food Research and Technology*, 218(2), 114–117.
- Palka, K. (1999). Changes in intramuscular connective tissue and collagen solubility of bovine m. semitendinosus during retorting. *Meat Science*, 53(3), 189–194.

- Pantaleón-Velasco, M. D. R., Ruiz-López, I. I., Pérez-Silva, A., Bravo-Clemente, L., Mateos, R., Ruiz-Espinosa, H., & Angeles Vivar-Vera, M. D. L. (2014). Antioxidant and functional properties of a high dietary fibre powder from carambola (*Averrhoa carambola* L.) pomace. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 49(9), 2101–2110.
- Payne, T. C. (2009). Enzymes in Meat Systems. In R. Tarté (Ed.), *Ingredients in Meat Products: Properties, Functionality and Applications* (4th ed., pp. 173–189). Springer.
- Pietrasik, Z., & Shand, P. J. (2011). Effects of moisture enhancement, enzyme treatment, and blade tenderization on the processing characteristics and tenderness of beef semimembranosus steaks. *Meat Science*, 88(1), 8–13.
- Purslow, P. P. (2005). Intramuscular connective tissue and its role in meat quality. *Meat Science*, 70, 435–447.
- Raskovic, B., Bozovic, O., Prodanovic, R., Niketic, V., & Polovic, N. (2014). Identification, purification and characterization of a novel collagenolytic serine protease from fig (*Ficus carica* var. Brown Turkey) latex. *Journal of Bioscience and Bioengineering*, 118(6), 622–627.
- Rawdkuen, S., Jaimakreu, M., & Benjakul, S. (2013). Physicochemical properties and tenderness of meat samples using proteolytic extract from *Calotropis procera* latex. *Food Chemistry*, 136(2), 909–916.
- Reche, J., Hernández, F., Almansa, M. S., Carbonell-Barrachina, A., Legua, P., & Amorós, A. (2018). Physicochemical and nutritional composition, volatile profile and antioxidant activity differences in Spanish jujube fruits. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 98, 1–8.
- Roslan, N. F., Aghwan, Z. A., Ab Aziz, M. F., & Sazili, A. Q. (2019). Meat quality and sensory attributes of Pectoralis major muscle in spent chicken subjected to different marination methods. *International Food Research Journal*, 26(4), 1173–1179.
- Sachindra, N. M., Sakhare, P. Z., Yashoda, K. P., & Narasimha Rao, D. (2005). Microbial profile of buffalo sausage during processing and storage. *Food Control*, 16(1), 31–35.
- Serdaroğlu, M., Öztürk, B., & Urgu, M. (2016). Emulsion characteristics, chemical and textural properties of meat systems produced with double emulsions as beef fat replacers. *Meat Science*, 117, 187–195.
- Sharedeh, D., Gatellier, P., Astruc, T., & Daudin, J. D. (2015). Effects of pH and NaCl levels in a beef marinade on physicochemical states of lipids and proteins and on tissue microstructure. *Meat Science*, 110, 24–31.

- Shin, H. G., Choi, Y. M., Kim, H. K., Ryu, Y. C., Lee, S. H., & Kim, B. C. (2008). Tenderization and fragmentation of myofibrillar proteins in bovine longissimus dorsi muscle using proteolytic extract from *Sarcodon aspratus*. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, *41*(8), 1389–1395.
- Siar, E. H., Zaak, H., Kornecki, J. F., Zidoune, M. N., Barbosa, O., & Fernandez-Lafuente, R. (2017). Stabilization of ficin extract by immobilization on glyoxyl agarose. Preliminary characterization of the biocatalyst performance in hydrolysis of proteins. *Process Biochemistry*, *58*(February), 98–104.
- Simpson, B. K., Rui, X., & Klomkiao, S. (2012). Enzyme in Food Processing. In B. K. Simpson, L. M. L. Nolle, F. Toldrá, S. Benjakul, G. Paliyath, & Y. Hui (Eds.), *Food Biochemistry and Food Processing* (2nd ed., pp. 181–206). John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Siti Balqis, Z., & Rosma, A. (2011). Artocarpus integer leaf protease: Purification and characterisation. *Food Chemistry*, *129*(4), 1523–1529.
- Sullivan, G. A., & Calkins, C. R. (2010). Application of exogenous enzymes to beef muscle of high and low-connective tissue. *Meat Science*, *85*(4), 730–734.
- Suman, S. P., & Sharma, B. D. (2003). Effect of grind size and fat levels on the physico-chemical and sensory characteristics of low-fat ground buffalo meat patties. *Meat Science*, *65*(3), 973–976.
- Sun, Q., Zhang, B., Yan, Q. J., & Jiang, Z. Q. (2016). Comparative analysis on the distribution of protease activities among fruits and vegetable resources. *Food Chemistry*, *213*, 708–713.
- Sun, X. D., & Holley, R. A. (2011). Factors Influencing Gel Formation by Myofibrillar Proteins in Muscle Foods. *Comprehensive Reviews in Food Science and Food Safety*.
- Tarigan, E., Prateepchaikul, G., Yamsaengsung, R., Sirichote, A., & Tekasakul, P. (2007). Drying characteristics of unshelled kernels of candle nuts. *Journal of Food Engineering*, *79*(3), 828–833.
- Tateo, A., De Palo, P., Quaglia, N. C., & Centoducati, P. (2007). Some qualitative and chromatic aspects of thawed buffalo (*Bubalus bubalis*) meat. *Meat Science*, *76*(2), 352–358.
- Thomás, G. E., Rodolfo, H. G., Juan, M. D., Georgina, S. F., Luis, C. G., Ingrid, R. B., & Santiago, G. T. (2009). Proteolytic activity in enzymatic extracts from *Carica papaya* L. cv. Maradol harvest by-products. *Process Biochemistry*, *44*(1), 77–82.

- Thomas, R., Anjaneyulu, A. S. R., & Kondaiah, N. (2006). Quality and shelf life evaluation of emulsion and restructured buffalo meat nuggets at cold storage (4 ± 1 °C). *Meat Science*, *72*(3), 373–379.
- Toldrá, F., & Reig, M. (2012). Biochemistry of Raw Meat and Poultry. In B. K. Simpson, L. M. L. Nollet, F. Toldrá, S. Benjakul, G. Paliyath, & Y. Hui (Eds.), *Food Biochemistry and Food Processing* (2nd ed., pp. 287–302). John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Toohy, E. S., Kerr, M. J., van de Ven, R., & Hopkins, D. L. (2011). The effect of a kiwifruit based solution on meat traits in beef m. semimembranosus (topside). *Meat Science*, *88*(3), 468–471.
- Tornberg, E. (2013). Engineering processes in meat products and how they influence their biophysical properties. *Meat Science*, *95*(4), 871–878.
- Tornberg, E. (2005). Effects of heat on meat proteins - Implications on structure and quality of meat products. *Meat Science*, *70*(3 SPEC. ISS.), 493–508.
- Vasanthi, C., Venkataramanujam, V., & Dushyanthan, K. (2007). Effect of cooking temperature and time on the physico-chemical, histological and sensory properties of female carabeef (buffalo) meat. *Meat Science*, *76*(2), 274–280.
- Wada, M., Suzuki, T., Yaguti, Y., & Hasegawa, T. (2002). The effects of pressure treatments with kiwi fruit protease on adult cattle semitendinosus muscle. *Food Chemistry*, *78*(2), 167–171.
- Wahid, H., & Rosnina, Y. (2016). Buffalo : Asia. *Reference Module in Food Science*, September, 772–779.
- Wardlaw, F. B., McCaskill, L. H., & Acton, J. C. (1973). Effect of postmortem muscle changes on poultry meat loaf properties. *Journal of Food Science*, *38*(3), 421–424.
- Warriss, P. D. (2000). *Meat science: an introductory text* (P. D. Warriss (ed.)). CABI Pub.
- Xiong, Y. L. (2005). Role of myofibrillar proteins in water-binding in brine-enhanced meats. *Food Research International*, *38*(3), 281–287.
- Youssef, M. K., & Barbut, S. (2009). Effects of protein level and fat/oil on emulsion stability, texture, microstructure and color of meat batters. *Meat Science*, *82*(2), 228–233.
- Youssef, M. K., Barbut, S., & Smith, A. (2011). Effects of pre-emulsifying fat/oil on meat batter stability, texture and microstructure. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, *46*(6), 1216–1224.

- Zamri-Saad, M., Azhar, K., Zuki, A. B., Punimin, A., & Hassim, H. A. (2017). Enhancement of Performance of Farmed Buffaloes Pasture Management and Feed Supplementation in Sabah , Malaysia. *Partanika Journal of Tropical Agricultural Science*, 40(4), 553–564.
- Zhou, F., Dong, H., Shao, J. H., Zhang, J. L., & Liu, D. Y. (2018). Effect of chopping time and heating on ¹H nuclear magnetic resonance and rheological behavior of meat batter matrix. *Animal Science Journal*, 89(4), 695–702.
- Zochowska-Kujawska, J., Lachowicz, K., & Sobczak, M. (2012). Effects of fibre type and kefir, wine lemon, and pineapple marinades on texture and sensory properties of wild boar and deer longissimus muscle. *Meat Science*, 92(4), 675–680.
- Zochowska-Kujawska, J., Lachowicz, K., Sobczak, M., Gajowiecki, L., Kotowicz, M., Zych, A., & Medrala, D. (2007). Effects of massaging on hardness, rheological properties, and structure of four wild boar muscles of different fibre type content and age. *Meat Science*, 75(4), 595–602.