UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

COMPONENTS OF TRAINING DESIGN MODELS: THE EXTENT OF PRACTICE BY SELECTED TRAINING INSTITUTIONS IN MALAYSIA

FARIDAH MOHAMMED

FPP L 1995 5

COMPONENTS OF TRAINING DESIGN MODELS : THE EXTENT OF PRACTICE BY SELECTED TRAINING INSTITUTIONS IN MALAYSIA

FARIDAH MOHAMMED

MASTERS OF SCIENCE

UNIVERSITI PERTANIAN MALAYSIA

1995

COMPONENTS OF TRAINING DESIGN MODELS : THE EXTENT OF PRACTICE BY SELECTED TRAINING INSTITUTIONS IN MALAYSIA

By

FARIDAH MOHAMMED

Project Submitted In Partial Fulfilment Of The Requirements
For The Degree Of Masters Of Science In The
Centre For Extension And Continuing Education,
Universiti Pertanian Malaysia

November 1995

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Indeed I have Allah (swt) to thank for all the opportunities He has given in paving the way towards achieving this masters programme. If not for the patience, the courage and the perseverence bestowed upon me, I may have given up half the way because indeed the challenges have been many; at many a times along the way, the burden was sometimes just too much for me to bear. Alhamdulillah and Subhanallah !

May I also take this opportunity to put on record and express my sincere and utmost gratitude and appreciations to the following whose assistance, encouragement and advise had kept me going and were especially of immeasurable value towards my educational pursuit. Thank you.

(a) Dr. Hj. Turiman Bin Suandi, my supervisor, who is also Head of Extension Services Unit, Center of Extension and Continuing Education (PPPL), Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (UPM). He has been exceptionally understanding especially towards the way I managed my project. He was particularly patient during the times when I was 'silent' about the progress of my project. But above all, I knew he would be there when I needed him to advise me about my project. And indeed, I am very grateful that he did not give up on me as his student. Thank you Dr. and I do not have enough of the right words to say to you for standing by me. May Allah bless you for all the good things that you have done and may He give you success all the way. Amin.

(b) Dr. Hj. Ezhar Bin Tamam, my second supervisor. He was there to help out especially with critical comments. Thank you.

(c) Dr. Hjh. Asma Binti Ahmad, my examiner, who had painstakingly read my project and given critical comments for further improvements. Thank you.

(c) The Panel of Experts for my instrument :-

i) Professor Madya Dato Dr. Mohd Nasir Ismail
- Director of PPPL

ii) Professor Madya Dr. Abu Daud Silong
- Deputy Director of PPPL

iii) Professor Madya Dr. Hj. Azahari Ismail
- Lecturer, PPPL

iv) Razaob Bin Hamat
- Currently, District Valuer of the Valuation and Property Services Department, Bangi. He did his Masters in Training Management at PPPL in 1991.

Thank you for your time in going through the research instrument and giving critical comments on it. It had been very useful indeed.

(d) All my lecturers at PPPL and Fakulti Ekonomi, UPM, right through all my four semesters. Thank you for sharing your knowledge, experiences and advice.

(e) En. Azmi Bin Mohd Noordin, 'Kak Jun', and all staff at the administration section of PPPL. Thank you for much assistance given. Thank you for the study room, En. Azmi. It had been handy to have one.

(f) My colleagues whom I have met and have got acquainted with at PPPL while pursuing the programme. Glad to have met you all and to have you all as my friends. Special thanks to my group study mates, Sohime and Zabidi. Get in touch. A special note of thanks also to 'Nunik' for being a constant girlfriend throughout and who has helped me much in my analysis.

(g) The Public Services Department and the Department of Valuation and Property Services, Ministry of Finance. Thank you for the scholarship and the study leave granted.

(h) My office colleague at INSPEN who had also lend me a helping hand with my analysis, Nasir Daud. I wish you success for your forthcoming Doctoral studies.

(i) All others whom I may have not mentioned but who have helped me in one way or another, in some small or big way.

Thank you.

And last but not the least, thank you Mak, Fuzie, Abang, Faisal, Fatehah, Fareez and Imah for being there when I needed you most. Allah bless us all. Amin.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PAGE

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ii

LIST OF TABLES x

ABSTRACT xi

ABSTRAK xiv

CHAPTER

I INTRODUCTION

Background to the Problem 1

Challenges facing Malaysia 1

Strategy Shift in HRD of Organisations. 3

Designing Training Programmes.......... 5

Effective Training Programmes.......... 7

The Agencies Studied 9

Institut Penilaian Negara 9

Institut Kerja Raya Malaysia 10

Institut Tadbiran Awam Negara 10

Institut Diplomasi dan Hubungan Luar Negara 11

Petronas Management Training Sdn Bhd .. 11

Institut Kejuruteraan Teknologi Tenaga Nasional 12

Pusat Latihan Bank Bumiputra 13

Statement of Problem 13

Objectives of the Study 15

Significance of the Study 16

Assumptions Underlying the Study 17

Scope and Limitations of the Study 18

Definition of Terms 19

II LITERATURE REVIEW

Education, Training, and Development : The Dividing Line 23

Concept of Education, Training and Development 24

Concept of Design 30

What is Design 30

Characteristics of Design 31

What Makes an Effective Design 32

Key Features of a training Design 32

Theories For Design 35

Pre-requisites for Learning Design 42

Training Models or Designs 43

Definition 44

Types of Training Models 44

Benefits of Using Training Models 45

Variables in the Application of Training Models 46

Analysis of Selected Training Models .. 47

Common Components in Training Design Models 55

Concluding Observations and Remarks 67

III METHODOLOGY

Population 70

Sampling 70

Data Collection 72

Written Instrument 73

Pre-testing of Written Instrument 75

Analysis 75

IV FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

General Profile of the Training Institutions 76

Organisational Structure/ Establishment 76

Qualification of Training Personnel ... 77

Training Policy 77

Annual Training Plan 77

Financial Support 78

In-house Training 78

Extent of Practices of the Coponents of Instructional Designs by by Selected Training Institutions 79

Training or Situation Analysis 79

Identification of Training Needs 81

Assessment of Training Needs 85

Determination or Formulation of Training Objectives 86

Curriculum Development 88

Instructional Strategies 89

Instructional Resources 92

Evaluation and feedback 95

Transfer of Training 98

Cost-benefit Analysis of Training Programmes 99

Implementation or Management of Training Programmes 101

Degree of Difficulty in the Practices of the Training Model Components 103

The First Approach 104

The Second Approach 105

V SUMMARY, CONCLUSION, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Statement of Problem 107

Objectives of the Study 109

Methodology 110

Summary of Findings 112

Training Analysis 112

Identification of Training Needs 113

Assessment of Training Needs 114

Formulation of Training Objectives 115

Curriculum Development 115

Instructional Strategies 116

Instructional Resources 117

Evaluation and Feedback 118

Transfer of Training 119

Cost-benefit Analysis of Training Programes 119

Implementation and Management of the Training Programmes 120

Degree of Difficulty in the Practices of the Training Model Components 121

Conclusions from Findings 122

Recommendations 133

BIBLIOGRAPHY 136
ADDITIONAL REFERENCES 140
APPENDIX 143
        Cover Letter and Questionnaire 140

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1	Training or Situational Analysis	80
2	Identification of Training Needs	82
3	Assessment of Training Needs	85
4	Determination/Formulation of Training Objectives	87
5	Curriculum Development	88
6a	Considerations in Determining Training Methods	90
6b	Other Considerations in Determining Training Methods	90
6c	Training Methods	91
7a	Sources of Input	93
7b	Determining Instructional Resources	94
7c	Resources Provided by Institutions	95
8	Evaluation and Feedback	96
9	Transfer of Training	98
10	Cost-benefit Analysis of Training Programme	100
11	Implementation/management of Training Programme	102
12	Level of Difficulty for the Practice of the Components Independent of Each Other	104
13	Level of Difficulty for the Practice of the Components Dependent of Each Other	106

Abstract of project paper submitted to the Senate
of Universiti Pertanian Malaysia in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science

COMPONENTS OF TRAINING DESIGN MODELS : THE EXTENT OF PRACTICE BY SELECTED TRAINING INSTITUTIONS IN MALAYSIA

by

FARIDAH BINTI MOHAMMED

November 1995

First Supervisor : Dr. Hj. Turiman Bin Suandi
Second Supervisor : Dr. Hj. Ezhar Bin Tamam
Faculty : Centre for Extension and Continuing Education

An organisation can be defined as a group of people who work together to achieve a set of common goals. This brings us to the fact that organisations cannot exist without people: if they are not at executive or managerial positions, they are definitely down there lower the line and further. These people are employed to be efficient and effective and are expected to contribute significantly towards productivity and quality of the products or services offered by their organisations. Perhaps the most significant investment made by any employer in the present scenario is in training. Therefore it is essential that a systematic approach to training design be emphasized.

The broad objective of this study was to explore the instructional designs practiced by selected training institutions in Malaysia. More specifically, the study entails to determine : (a) the general profile of the training institutions under study, (b) the current practices of components of training design models by selected training institutions in Malaysia, and, (c) the degree of difficulty experienced by the institutions with regards to the practice of the identified components. The study focused on the following identified components: (i) training or situation analysis, (ii) identification of training needs, (iii) assessment of training needs, (iv) formulation of training objectives, (v) curriculum development, (vi) determination of instructional strategies, (vii) determination of the instructional resources, (viii) evaluation and feedback, (ix) transfer of training, (x) cost-benefit analysis, and, (xi) the implementation or management of programmes.

The initial stage of this study involved a review of selected instructional designs or training models for purposes of identifying the common components of the models. These components were subsequently incorporated into the questionnaire which were then put forward to seven respondent organisations comprising selected training institutions in Malaysia. Data collecected were analysed using a Statistical Package for Social Sciences, the SPSS-PC+.

The findings revealed that all the selected training institutions practised all the above eleven common components to instructional design models. They differred only in the depth of practice. Little emphasis was given to the components 'Transfer of Training' and 'Cost-benefit

Analysis'. It also revealed the three components which were ranked at a higher level of difficulty in its implementation and they are : (1) assessment of training needs, (2) transfer of training and, (3) cost-benefit analysis. The rest of the components were at a lower level of difficulty. Another approach resulted in findings whereby the same components, that is, (1) assessment of training needs, (2) transfer of training and, (3) cost-benefit analysis, achieved the same perfect ranking placed also at the higher level of difficulty.

Abstrak projek penyelidikan yang dikemukakan kepada
Senat Universiti Pertanian Malaysia
sebagai memenuhi sebahagian daripada keperluan untuk
mendapatkan Ijazah Sarjana Sains

KOMPONEN REKABENTUK LATIHAN : SEJAUH MANA AMALAN OLEH INSTITUSI LATIHAN TERPILIH DI MALAYSIA

oleh

FARIDAH BINTI MOHAMMED

November 1995

Penyelia Utama : Dr. Hj. Turiman Bin Suandi
Penyelia Kedua : Dr. Hj. Ezhar Bin Tamam
Fakulti : Pusat Pengembangan dan Pendidikan Lanjutan

Sebuah organisasi boleh ditakrifkan sebagai sekumpulan individu yang berusaha bersama-sama ke arah pencapaian matlamat organisasi. Ini bermakna bahawa organisasi tidak dapat wujud tanpa sumber manusia. Jika mereka tidak memegang jawatan eksekutif atau pengurusan, maka mereka mungkin memegang jawatan di peringkat bawahan. Mereka di ambil bekerja supaya dapat bekerja dengan lebih efisien dan berkesan serta diharap dapat memberikan sumbangan yang signifikan ke arah produktiviti dan kualiti produk dan perkhidmatan yang di tawarkan oleh organisasi. Mungkin, pelaburan yang terbesar yang dibuat oleh sesebuah organisasi masa kini ialah terhadap latihan kakitangan. Oleh yang demikian, adalah penting supaya penekanan diberikan terhadap satu pendekatan yang lebih sistematik dalam usaha-usaha merekabentuk program-program latihan.

Objektif umum kajian ini ialah untuk meninjau rekabentuk program latihan yang di amalkan oleh institusi-institusi latihan di Malaysia. Secara terperinci, kajian ini berusaha untuk mengkaji : (a) profil am institusi-institusi latihan dalam kajian, (b) sejauh mana amalan institusi-institusi latihan dalam mempraktikkan komponen-komponen rekabentuk latihan, dan (c) darjah kesukaran pengamalan komponen-komponen berkenaan. Fokas kajian ini tertumpu kepada :- (i) analisis persekitaran atau analisis latihan, (ii) kajian keperluan latihan, (iii) analisis kajian keperluan latihan, (iv) pembentukan objektif latihan, (v) pembangunan kurikulum, (vi) penentuan strategi pembelajaran, (vii) penentuan sumbér-sumber pembelajaran, (viii) penilaian dan maklumbalas, (ix) pemindahan latihan, (x) analisis kos-faedah program latihan, dan (xi) pengurusan program latihan;

Di peringkat awal kajian ini, satu kajian semula penulisan telah dijalankan bagi maksud mengenalpasti komponen-komponen bersama dari beberapa rekabentuk latihan yang dikaji. Komponen-komponen ini kemudiannya dimasukkan ke dalam soal selidik, yang selepas itu diberikan kepada tujuh responden terdiri daripada institusi-institusi latihan di Malaysia. Data yang diperolehi diproses dengan menggunakan Pakej Statistik untuk Sosial Sains, SPSS-PC+.

Penemuan kajian menunjukkan bahawa kesemua sebelas komponen rekebentuk latihan adalah diamalkan oleh institusi-institusi latihan walaupun tahap amalan terhadap tiap komponen berbeza antara satu sama lain. Adalah didapati bahawa kurang penekanan diberikan kepada komponen atau amalan 'pemindahan latihan' dan 'analisis kos-faedah'. Penemuan selanjutnya menunjukkan terdapat tiga komponen berada pada tahap amalan yang sukar iaitu : (1) analisis keperluan latihan (2) pemindahan latihan dan (3) analisis kos-faedah. Pendekatan kedua juga menunjukkan ketiga-tiga komponen yang sama seperti di atas berada di ranking yang sama pada paras amalan yang sukar.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background To The Problem

Challenges facing Malaysia

Development in Malaysia, has reached a stage where it has become more critical for organisations to continuously deploy and manage, not only their capital but also their human resources with greater efficiency to increase productivity and to ensure sustainable economic growth (NST,21/9/94).

In facing this situation, the article reported six serious challenges facing Malaysia today, primarily:-

i] a tight labour market situation and consequent over-dependence on foreign workers,

ii] insufficient skilled workers and a gap in the skill delivery system accompanied by a general reluctance to undertake retraining and skills upgrading of the existing workforce,

iii] rising labour costs and lower levels of productivity,

iv] inflationary pressure,

v] slow shift to automation, robotics and capital-intensive production processes, and,

vi] infrastructure bottlenecks which are being addressed, example, power supply, new roads, industrial sites.

The underlying message here then evolves around the vital and urgent need for organisations, to have not only a systematic, but also a strategic long-term Human Resource Development Plan (HRD Plan) to ultimately produce a workforce that is highly skilled and knowlegeable, and possessing positive attitudes, right values and commitment.

The Government, realising the challenges and more so, of the reluctance of organisations to retrain their human resource, have instituted a ruling under Bank Negara, requiring the financial and services sector, that is, the banks and insurance companies, to spend 2.5 percent of their annual payroll on training. A bolder step has led the Government to embark on creating a Human Resource Development Fund (HRDF) under the Human Resouce Development Fund Act, 1993. This Act requires manufacturing companies to contribute one percent of their annual payroll to the Fund; the Fund in turn reimburses the companies for money spent on training. As of today, a total of 3,294 manufacturers have contributed a total of RM61.1 million to the Fund (NST, 17.7.1994). Tenaga Nasional Bhd. alone in 1994 had spent RM43.6 million on training, which according to its Executive Chairman, Tan Sri Dr Ani Arope, is equivalent to one per cent of its capital expenditure. This has actually created a huge interest in training activities especially with companies which previously did not bother to train their staff. This move has consequently led a new trend in training where companies are becoming more training-driven because, with shorter product life-cycles and businesses changing rapidly, companies find themselves needing a continuous training cycle (BT, 25.8.94).

Looking at the 1994 figures, the United States of America showed a spending of US$4 billion (about RM10.4 billion) on human resources development (NST, 9.4.94). In Malaysia, the Chairman for the Cabinet Committee on Training, the honourable Dato' Seri Anwar Ibrahim quoted a RM20 billion investment in training, a 1990 figure said over the TV3 programme on " Money Matters ". The 1993 spending was in the region of RM16.3 million, with RM79.3 million in 1994 and as high as RM10.031 billion allocated for the year 1995 (Jabátan Penerangan, 1993, 1994, 1995). It is thus interesting to note that the figures have multiplied over the years in a short space of time. In other words, Malaysia too have joined the circle of investors in HRD; thereby integrating training and development as part and parcel of the business of the organisations.

Strategy Shift in HRD of Organisations

The legislation on the HRD Fund and Bank Negara's ruling offers much incentive for organisations to continuously train and retrain their staff. This will slowly but gradually and ultimately put organisations in a position to strategically plan their HRD either on a short-term or long-term basis. On one hand, this shift in the HRD strategy of many organisations seems a healthy effort as it will fulfill the

Government's objective of reducing foreign labour, bridging the knowledge and skills gap, as well as bringing about positive attitudes, right values, and commitments among workers. On the other hand, there lies a feeling of apprehension with regards to the quality of training. Following are statements reported which reflected this internal fear :-

i) NST of July 17, 1994 reported that much money had been wasted on training that was not needs-based; that there were more of 'needless' training rather than 'needed training';

ii) NST of April 4, 1994 mentioned of some companies which pursued an ad-hoc approach to training which is purely reactive rather than proactive or needs-based. Employees were either sent for overseas training programme on grounds that their sales have declined; or a safety training programme was conducted due to an accident in the plant; or they have a course because the general manager wanted it;

iii) NST of April 4, 1994 reported an organisation which sent ten thousand people on courses in 1994 with the next target being increased to 120,000;

iv) NST of April 4, 1994 reported a local organisation which boasted of its packaged American training programme.This organisation only found that after spending RM2 million, the programme was a failure.

UNIVERS [illegible]

Thus, grasping the underlying problem of none-quality programmes that may appear when training programmes are being implemented by organisations, the training designers now need to carefully design training programmes which will match or meet as close as possible to the organisationals goals and objectives which in turn, will have effect on the national and global output.

Designing Training Programmes

The pace for technological changes have been very rapid in the market. This is why the process of designing training programmes is never static, and is always dynamic in its design. It is an on-going process in which things are tried out, perhaps even making revisions as feedbacks are obtained from participants and performance evaluations carried out (Silberman, 1990).

This had, in fact, earlier been emphasized by Sedlik, Magnus and Rakow (1980: 11-12) who believed that corporate training is a dynamic process designed to achieve specific business objectives. Any training programme should not be considered successful if the objectives were accomplished only in training and not in the real world. The key to effective training then is, implementation. They further believed that there are many approaches to developing training programmes, where even among systematic approaches to training development, there are many models to choose. If the task of developing training programmes were left to competent and experienced instructional developers, each of these models is capable of producing a quality instructional programme.

Thus, training designs or models, adopted and adapted with care to suit to the practical world and matching organisational goals and objectives, are and can be a useful tool in helping any organisation design effective training programmess which can churn results the way they want to.

As adult training and continuing education programmes become more popular, their bottom-line success in the future may not depend on their content alone but on how well-planned and well-designed they are. Whether it is a retraining workshop or a professional conference, a training programme for adult learners and professionals must be meaningful for the respective individuals and have the flexibility to accomodate changing conditions and needs. As a programme planner or training coordinator, one must have a clear, systematic planning model to develop and conduct programmes that result in real participation and measurable learning (Murk & Wells, 1988: 45-47).

Therefore, based on the foregoing, it is observed that content alone may not do justice to learning; in fact, the initial groundwork of planning can make the training more practical in considering the varied and complex needs of the individual learners or group. For this, a training model is