



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**PARTICIPATION IN DECISION-MAKING AMONG TRAINERS
AND RELATIONSHIPS WITH JOB SATISFACTION
AND PERFORMANCE**

MICHAEL DOSIM LUNJEW

FPP L 1994 3

**PARTICIPATION IN DECISION-MAKING AMONG TRAINERS
AND RELATIONSHIPS WITH JOB SATISFACTION
AND PERFORMANCE**

By

MICHAEL DOSIM LUNJEW

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the
Centre for Extension and Continuing Education
Universiti Pertanian Malaysia

February 1994



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my grateful acknowledgement and appreciation to Prof. Dr. Rahim Md. Sail, the Chairman of the supervisory committee, and the other committee members Dr. Abu Daud Silong and Dr. Alang Perang Zainuddin, for without their counsel, guidance and encouragement, this thesis would not have been completed successfully.

I also wish to acknowledge the contributions of my graduate colleagues and staff members at the Centre for Extension and Continuing Education in U.P.M. who had contributed towards this thesis in one way or another. My sincere thanks and appreciation also go to the respective heads and coordinators in the participating training institutions where this study was conducted for their very valuable cooperation and assistance in the completion of this thesis. Not forgotten also are the training officers in these institutions for their cooperation and support for participating in this study.

I am also very grateful to the Public Services Department of Malaysia, for giving the financial support to undertake this doctoral programme. Special thanks and appreciation also go to Universiti Pertanian Malaysia, particularly the Centre of Extension and Continuing Education for giving me the opportunity to embark on this enriching journey into the academic world.



I am also very thankful to many parties and institutions, who had helped me in one way or another, and particularly the National Institute of Public Administration (INTAN) for allowing me the use of their facilities while preparing this thesis.

Finally, and specially I am grateful to my wife, Christine, my two daughters Joleen and Edeleen and my son Raymond for their love, understanding, encouragement and patience throughout my graduate programme that made this work a success.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xi
ABSTRACT	xii
ABSTRAK	xv
 CHAPTER	
I INTRODUCTION	1
Background	1
Statement of the Problem	7
Objectives of the Study	12
Significance of the Study	13
Scope and Limitations of the Study	14
Definition of Terms	15
II REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	21
Introduction	21
Leadership and Participation	23
Motivation Theories and Participation	30
Need Theories of Motivation	32
Cognitive Theories	37
Reinforcement and Social Learning Approaches	47



	Page
Participation, Performance and Satisfaction	53
The concept of Employee Participation	53
Forms of Employee Participation	55
Benefits and Research Findings on Employee Participation	59
Participation Models of Satisfaction and Performance	65
Conceptual Framework of Predictors of Participation	68
Hypotheses	75
Summary	77
 III RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	 79
Conceptual Model of the Study of Participation in Decision-Making	80
Operational Model of the Study of Participation in Decision-Making	82
Operationalisation of Research Variables	84
Employee Participation, Performance and Job satisfaction	84
Predictor Variables	89
The Questionnaire Format	93
Procedures for Sample Selection	98
Procedures for Data Collection	106
Reliability Tests of the Scales	109
Statistical Techniques for Data Analysis ..	113
Tests of Significant Relationships	115



	Page
IV FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS	117
Characteristics of Respondents	117
Demographic Characteristics: Sex, Grade, and Highest Degree	118
Other Demographic Characteristics	122
Job Abilities, Traits and Motivation Characteristics	126
Perception on Selected Organisational Variables	129
Participation, Job Satisfaction and Performance	132
Participation Relationships with Research Variables	136
Relationships with Job Satisfaction and Performance	136
Relationships with Selected Predictor Variables	139
Discussions on Hypotheses Testings of Relationships	144
Predictors of Participation	146
Discriminant Variables of Participation ...	154
Participation and Motivational Needs	159
Predicting Motivation to Participate Using the Expectancy Theory	170
Model of Employee Participation: Adaptation of Porter & Lawler (1968)	171
Summary of Findings	173



	Page
V SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	175
Summary	175
Research Problem	175
Objectives of the Study	179
The Methodology	180
Summary of Findings	184
Conclusions	193
Implications	195
Recommendations	201
Recommendations for Managing Participation in Organisations	201
Recommendations for Additional Research	203
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 205
 APPENDICES	
A Questionnaire in English	220
B Questionnaire in Bahasa Malaysia	234
C Letters	249
D Additional Table	252
 BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH	 255



LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Number of Trainers in Federal Training Institutions in 1991	100
2. Estimated Number of Trainers in Training Institutions from Statutory Agencies	104
3. Sample Size and Response Rates from Selected Institutions	108
4. Pre-Tests and Final Reliability Statistics of Research Variables	112
5. Respondents' Characteristics: Grade by Sex	119
6. Respondents' Characteristics: Highest Degree by Sex	120
7. Respondents' Characteristics: Highest Educational Qualifications by Institutions	121
8. Distribution and Summary Statistics of Selected Demographic Variables	123
9. Summary Statistics: Job Abilities, Traits and Motivation	127
10. Summary Statistics: Perceptions on Organisational Variables	130
11. Distribution and Summary Statistics: Level of Participation, Satisfaction and Performance	133
12. Correlation Coefficients for Job Satisfaction and Performance with Participation	137
13. Correlation Coefficients Between Selected Individual Variables with Participation	141
14. Correlation Coefficients Between Organisational Variables and Participation	144



Table	Page
15. Simple Multiple Regression Analysis: Predictors of Participation	148
16. Stepwise Multiple Regression Analysis: Predictors of Participation	151
17. Discriminant Analysis: Standardised Cannonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Participation	156
18. Stepwise Discriminant Analysis: Standardised Cannonical Discriminant Function Coefficients of Participation	158
19. Importance of Intrinsic Participation Outcomes: Means and Standard Deviations ...	162
20. Importance of Extrinsic Participation Outcomes: Means and Standard Deviations	164
21. Perceived Probability of Realising Intrinsic Outcomes: Means and Standard Deviations	166
22. Perceived Probability of Realising Extrinsic Outcomes: Means and Standard Deviations	167
23. Correlation Matrix of Predictor Variables	252



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
1. Vroom's VIE Model of Job Motivation and Performance	38
2. Porter and Lawler's Model of Performance and Satisfaction	41
3. Conceptual Framework of Participation-Performance and Participation-Satisfaction Relationships	81
4. Operational Model of Predictors of Participation in Decision-Making	83



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

- FELDA** - Federal Land Development Authority.
- IAB** - Aminuddin Baki Institute, Ministry of Education, Pahang.
- IKU** - Institute of Public Health, Ministry of Health, Kuala Lumpur.
- ILPP** - Agricultural Extension Training Institute, Agricultural Department, Serdang, Selangor.
- INPUT** - FELDA Land Administration Institute, FELDA, Perak.
- INTAN** - National Institute of Public Administration, Public Services Department, Kuala Lumpur.
- NPC** - National Productivity Corporation (Centre previously).
- PULADA** - Army Training Centre, Ministry of Defence, Johor.
- PULAPOL** - Police Training Centre, Royal Malaysian Police Department, Kuala Lumpur.



Abstract of dissertation submitted to the Senate of Universiti Pertanian Malaysia in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

**PARTICIPATION IN DECISION-MAKING AMONG TRAINERS
AND RELATIONSHIPS WITH PERFORMANCE
AND JOB SATISFACTION**

By

MICHAEL DOSIM LUNJEW

February 1994

Chairman: Prof. Rahim Md. Sail, Ph. D.

Faculty: Centre for Extension and Continuing Education

This study was conducted to determine the nature of relationships between participation and job satisfaction and also with performance. It also sought to identify significant predictors, discriminant variables and valued outcomes from participation among trainers of public sector institutions in Malaysia. Finally, it attempted to determine whether or not Porter and Lawler's (1968) expectancy model could represent an appropriate framework for studying employee participation.

A total of 250 trainers from the managerial and supervisory levels in eight public sector training institutions were studied. The study used structured questionnaires as the research instrument. It discovered that level of perceived participation among trainers was



high and that employee participation was found to have a moderate and positive relationship with job satisfaction. However, its relationship with performance was slightly weaker. The findings appeared to match closely with some of such studies in the West, suggesting that these studies were not very much different across cultures.

Employee participation could be better managed if certain critical factors were present in an organisation. These include supportive superiors having lesser degree of authoritarianism in their management approach, while employees should have high need for independence and perceive that they face a moderate amount of work pressure. In selecting appropriate people for programme heads or as team members, high need for independence, high need for achievement, high level of job abilities and reasonably high level of education could represent appropriate selection criteria. On outcomes from participation, trainers were found to place greater importance on intrinsic than extrinsic outcomes. The study also suggested that the Porter and Lawler's (1968) expectancy model could be used as a suitable framework for studying employee participation.

The study recommended that future related studies should cover employees from other groups in the public sector and other trainers in the business sector.



Further, employee participation should be actively encouraged in the public sector so that it becomes an important part of its organisational culture.



Abstrak disertasi dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Pertanian Malaysia untuk memenuhi sebahagian daripada keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah.

**PENYERTAAN DALAM MEMBUAT KEPUTUSAN DI KALANGAN JURULATIH
DAN HUBUNGANNYA DENGAN PRESTASI
DAN KEPUASAN KERJA**

Oleh

MICHAEL DOSIM LUNJEW

February 1994

Pengerusi: Prof. Rahim Md. Sail, Ph. D.

Fakulti: Pusat Pengembangan dan Pendidikan Lanjutan

Kajian ini bertujuan untuk menentukan corak kaitan di antara penyertaan dengan prestasi dan kepuasan kerja. Kajian ini juga bertujuan untuk mengenalpasti beberapa penentu penyertaan, variabel diskriminan dan ganjaran yang boleh diperolehi daripada penyertaan di kalangan tenaga pengajar sektor awam Malaysia. Akhir sekali, kajian ini cuba menentukan sama ada model ekspektansi Porter dan Lawler (1968) sesuai digunakan sebagai satu rangka untuk mengkaji penyertaan.

Seramai 250 orang tenaga pengajar daripada kumpulan pengurusan dan penyeliaan dalam lapan institusi latihan sektor awam telah dikaji. Kajian tersebut menggunakan soal selidik jenis berstruktur sebagai instrumen kajian. Kajian telah mendapati bahawa tahap penyertaan (perceived participation) di kalangan tenaga

pengajar adalah tinggi. Penyertaan kakitangan didapati mempunyai kaitan (sederhana dan positif) dengan kepuasan kerja. Kaitan penyertaan kakitangan dengan prestasi kerja pula adalah signifikan tetapi lemah. Hasil kajian ini adalah hampir sama dengan kajian-kajian yang dibuat di dalam budaya Barat. Ini menunjukkan bahawa penemuan kajian mengenai penyertaan kakitangan tidak banyak berbeza di antara silang budaya.

Kajian juga menunjukkan bahawa penyertaan kakitangan boleh ditingkatkan melalui beberapa faktor seperti kesedian pengurus dan penyelia menyokong kakitangan mereka di samping mengamalkan corak pengurusan yang kurang 'authoritarian'. Kakitangan pula sepatutnya berhasrat untuk membebaskan diri dari segala kongkongan serta merasai bahawa beban kerja mereka adalah sederhana sahaja. Individu yang mempunyai hasrat pembebasan diri serta hasrat pencapaian yang tinggi disamping mempunyai kebolehan kerja, akan lebih berjaya dalam melaksanakan tugas masing-masing sebagai ketua program penyertaan ataupun anggota pasukannya.

Ganjaran dalaman (intrinsic) adalah lebih penting daripada ganjaran luaran (extrinsic) di kalangan tenaga pengajar. Akhir sekali, kajian ini mendapati bahawa model ekspektansi Porter dan Lawler (1968) adalah sesuai sebagai satu rangka untuk mengkaji penyertaan kakitangan di dalam membuat keputusan.



Kajian ini telah mencadangkan supaya kajian tambahan dijalankan di kalangan kakitangan kerajaan di peringkat bawahan di sektor awam dan tenaga pengajar di sektor perniagaan. Juga, penyertaan kakitangan harus diperluaskan di sektor awam supaya penyertaan kakitangan dapat jadi satu aspek budaya organisasi yang penting.



CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Background

The subject of employee participation in the decision-making process of an organisation has attracted a great deal of interest in the current literature as evidenced by many writings and research carried out on this subject. In recent years, practicing managers in business and public sectors have begun to show similar interest in the subject as well. Some of the Malaysian Government policies, like the Look East Policy, encouraging quality control circles, and more recently, the launching of the Quality Management and Improvement Programme in the Public Sector in 1990, are examples of efforts to introduce different forms of formal participative programmes in the public sector.

These programmes are generally aimed at improving the quality and productivity of the public sector services through greater participation of employees in work decisions affecting their jobs. Similar participative programmes in the forms of total quality management (TQM), quality control circles (QCC), quality of work life programmes, joint consultative councils or groups and so forth have also been introduced in private sector organisations.



Many organisations are interested in employee participation because it is related to many potential benefits such as improved morale, increased performance, and higher job satisfaction. It is also believed that these techniques could also be instrumental in creating satisfied and highly committed employees (Anthony, 1978; Erez et al., 1985; and Guest and Fatchett, 1974; Guest and Knight, 1977; and Lawler, 1986).

These benefits have been recognised by Japanese organisations as early as the 1970s. For example, Odaka (1975) strongly recommended that these practices be institutionalised in modern Japanese companies. As a result, participative management that encourages employee participation has become one of the major characteristics of Japanese management (Ouchi, 1981; Pascale and Athos, 1981; and Keys and Miller, 1984). Subsequently, the Japanese have shown that by adopting this management technique or philosophy, they can achieve increased productivity. Through high productivity, they have been able to compete very successfully in the world markets.

A highly productive and efficient public sector have also been one of the cherished goals as well as a strategy of the Malaysian government in achieving the nation's long term economic goal of economic growth and development. The achievement of this goal will no doubt depend substantially on the quality of public sector employees, among other factors. One of the shortcomings that the

government has recognised in this area however is related to the attitudes of these employees. In its efforts to address this shortcoming, the government has introduced a number of policies. These policies include the Look East Policy, Clean-Efficient-and-Trustworthy Policy, Inculcation of the universal Islamic Values and the Malaysia Incorporated Policy.

These policies are aimed not only at creating positive work ethics, but also to inculcate a more supportive and cooperative attitude among public sector employees towards the private sector, as this sector has been recognised in the Sixth Malaysia Plan to be the main machinery of growth in the next decade. Through these policies the government hopes that its employees will perceive the private sector not as competitors but as partners in the national development efforts (Ambrin, 1990).

The introduction of policies by themselves may not produce the required attitudinal change on the part of the employees who are the target group. Other institutional measures need to be taken to supplement them. In this aspect the training institutions of the public sector are expected to play an important role.

In realising this fact, the government has established training units or divisions in most of the large departments, and some even have their own training institutes to cater for the training needs of their

employees. One of the largest of these institutes is the National Institute of Public Administration or more popularly known as INTAN. According to its 1988 annual report for example, INTAN has trained 22,403 and 21,198 public sector employees in 1987 and 1988 respectively (INTAN, 1988).

Although the training emphasis of most of these institutions in the past, had been directed mainly towards the provision of skills and knowledge, recent emphasis has moved towards the attitudinal aspect of employee training. For example, INTAN as one of the leading institutes in the public sector started an attitudinal development programme for the public sector employees in 1986. In 1988, this programme was developed further to meet the needs of the staff and officers of the institute itself. From 1988 onwards, it has been made compulsory for all INTAN staff and officers to attend the programme (INTAN Annual Report 1988).

The shift in emphasis by these training institutes towards attitudinal development training seems an inevitable development. This is because these institutes are gearing themselves to meet the training needs that result from the shift in government emphasis on upgrading not only the skills and knowledge but also the attitudinal aspect of the modern public sector employees. The new sets of policies introduced in the eighties to meet the challenges of the nineties and beyond appear to demand

such development in the training strategies of these institutes.

The effectiveness of such attitudinal development programmes on the trainees however, does not depend solely on the specifically designed programme itself. Much of the intended impact of such programmes also depends on the trainers who conduct these training programmes. In particular, the nature of their perceptions, attitudes and values can have a strong influence on the trainees. In the process of carrying out their training duties, they may inevitably play the role of a model from whom the participants or trainees may emulate or imitate. Bandura (1969) suggested that such modeling represents one of the fundamental means by which new modes of behaviour are acquired or new attitudes developed. It is important therefore for the trainers in the public sector training departments and institutes to portray the appropriate attitude and perception if they were to facilitate effectively in attitudinal change among the government employees as required by the new government policies.

Since many of the programmes introduced by the government are programmes that encourage employee participation, surely any change in attitude required of them should be focused on this area. Since trainers are expected to play an important role in helping public sector employees to be more positive towards the various participative programmes introduced by the government, it

is imperative that they must themselves have a positive attitude towards participation of employees in the decision-making process in their organisations. A proper means of discovering whether such a phenomenon does exist would be through a study of their perceived level of participation in the decision-making process in their respective organisations.

Generally it is not enough to understand only the level of employee participation. Of equal importance also would be to study what factors or predictors that could influence these trainers to be more involved in the decision-making process that affect them, so that management would be able to design appropriate policies that could increase such level if it is desired.

Another pertinent question would be to study the factors that can discriminate between the high and the low participative employees. This would be useful for determining appropriate leadership selection criteria should the organisation be interested to select appropriate leaders to implement its formal participative programmes to ensure that these programmes could be managed more successfully.

Researchers on employee participation are not only interested in the factors that influence participation. They are also interested in the relationship between employee participation and other effects that are particularly of interest to organisations. Thus there have

been many studies that attempted to determine the relationship between employee participation with job performance of workers or employees, as well as its relationship with employees' job satisfaction as contained in some of the study reviews conducted in the past (Locke and Schweiger, 1979; Sashkin, 1984; Miller and Monge, 1986; Pollock and Colwill, 1987; and (Cotton et al., 1988).

Statement of the Problem

The relationships between employee participation in decision-making and performance as well as with employee satisfaction have been fairly well researched in the developed countries such as the United States and Europe. Early researchers on this subject include Kurt Lewin and his associates (1939), Coch and French (1948) and Rensis Likert (1961). More recent researchers on this topic include Marchington (1980), Neider (1980), Latham and Steele (1983), Erez et al. (1985), Rubenowitz et al. (1983), Steel and Mento (1987), Cotton et al. (1988), and Schwarz (1989).

The findings of these studies generally indicated that employee participation in decision-making was positively related to employee performance and satisfaction. In other words, the higher the level of employee participation in decision-making, the higher would be their performance and satisfaction in their jobs.