EFFECTS OF A MEANING-BASED APPROACH IN TEACHING THE TENSE SYSTEM TO MALAY ESL COLLEGE STUDENTS

AGUS RIANTO

FPP 2003 8
EFFECTS OF A MEANING-BASED APPROACH IN TEACHING THE TENSE SYSTEM TO MALAY ESL COLLEGE STUDENTS

By
AGUS RIANTO

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

March 2003
DEDICATION

Sincere Love and Appreciation for

My Parents,
Wife and Little Jihan
And Brothers and Sisters
Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

EFFECTS OF A MEANING-BASED APPROACH IN TEACHING THE TENSE SYSTEM TO MALAY ESL COLLEGE STUDENTS

By

AGUS RIANTO

March 2003

Chairman: Dr. Arshad Abd Samad

Faculty: Educational Studies

It is not uncommon to see Malay students at college level face difficulty in communicating their ideas effectively in written English. Their difficulties indicate their lack of mastery of important grammatical systems of the English language. Their inability to effectively convey ideas in written English may be because during their time of learning English, they have been mostly presented with direct instruction in communicative strategies and/or grammatical instructions that emphasize a relation of formal determination.

In general, this study explored the effects of an instructional approach which integrated target formal features into meaning-based activities (termed Meaning-Based Approach—MBA) on the acquisition of the English tense system.
Specifically, this study investigated four issues: (1) the effect of MBA on learners' performance in understanding messages conveyed by verbs of the tense system; (2) the effect of MBA on learners' performance in using messages conveyed by verbs of the tense system in written production; (3) the effect of MBA on Lower and Higher Proficiency Students' (LPS and HPS) performance in understanding messages conveyed by verbs of the tense system; and (4) the effect of MBA on Lower and Higher Proficiency Students' (LPS and HPS) performance in using messages conveyed by verbs of the tense system.

A quasi-experimental between groups design was used in which a pretest, a six-week treatment on tense system, and a posttest were administered. This study was conducted at Kolej Legenda Langkawi (KLL)—a private Malaysian institute of higher learning located on Langkawi island, Kedah, Malaysia. The subjects of this study were Malay ESL students taking an English proficiency course. The treatment group was presented with the MBA and the control group received instruction which focused on target forms in isolation (termed Form-Based Approach—FBA). The collected data was tested for statistical significance by means of an analysis of covariance (ANCOVA) for the first and the second issues and t-test for the third and the fourth issues.

The results of the first issue indicated that subjects presented with the MBA performed better in understanding the messages conveyed by the verbs of the tense system than those presented with the FBA \( (F = 422.77, p = 0.00) \). Similar to the results of the first issue, the result of the second issue indicated that subjects
presented with the MBA performed better in using the messages conveyed by the verbs of the tense system than those presented with the FBA ($F = 2399.76, p = 0.00$).

The results of the third issue indicated that after presented with the meaning-based approach (MBA) the Lower Proficiency Students (LPS) performed just as well as the Higher Proficiency Students (HPS) in understanding the messages conveyed by the verbs of the tense system ($t = -0.97, p = 0.34$). Similar to the results of the third issue, the results of the fourth issue indicated that after presented with the meaning-based approach (MBA) the Lower Proficiency Students (LPS) performed just as well as the Higher Proficiency Students (HPS) in using the messages conveyed by the verbs of the tense system ($t = -2.37, p = 0.21$).

The results of the study offer evidence that the meaning-based approach does provide the learners with what they need to know in order to translate theoretical knowledge into practice. The results of the study also offer evidence that the meaning-based approach has similar effect in helping lower and higher proficiency learners understand and use the messages conveyed by the verbs of the tense system. The better performance made by the learners exposed to the meaning-based treatment clearly points to a strong relationship between the treatment and the quality of the learners' performance in translating their theoretical knowledge (understanding the messages) into practice (using the messages).
Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

KEBERKESANAN PENDEKATAN ERTI DALAM PENGAJARAN SISTEM TENSE TERHADAP PELAJAR-PELAJAR MELAYU YANG MENGAMBIL KURSUS BAHASA INGGERIS SEBAGAI BAHASA KEDUA DI PERINGKAT KOLEJ

Oleh

AGUS RIANTO

Mac 2003

Pengerusi: Dr. Arshad Abd Samad

Fakulti: Pengajian Pendidikan

Pelajar-pelajar Melayu di peringkat kolej sering menghadapi kesukaran dalam menyampaikan gagasan mereka secara berkesan di dalam bentuk tulisan yang menggunakan bahasa Inggeris. Kesukaran tersebut mungkin diakibatkan oleh kurangnya penguasaan sistem nahu dalam bahasa Inggeris. Kurangnya penguasaan dalam sistem nahu bahasa Inggeris kemungkinan besar disebabkan oleh pendekatan pengajaran bahasa tersebut yang diterima oleh pelajar-pelajar Melayu sebelum memasuki kolej. Pelajar-pelajar tersebut mungkin telah didedahkan oleh pendekatan pengajaran bahasa Inggeris yang hanya memberikan penekanan pada cara-cara berkomunikasi ataupun pendekatan pengajaran yang hanya menekankan bentuk-bentuk nahu sahaja.
Secara amnya, penyelidikan ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji keberkesanan suatu pendekatan pengajaran bahasa Inggeris yang menggabungkan pendekatan yang memberikan penekanan pada bentuk-bentuk nahu bahasa sasaran dengan aktiviti-aktiviti yang memberi penekanan pada erti dan fungsi bentuk-bentuk nahu sasaran (seterusnya dipanggil pendekatan erti) dalam penguasaan sistem kata kerja yang mempunyai kaitan dengan waktu di dalam bahasa Inggeris (seterusnya dipanggil sistem tense). Secara khususnya, penyelidikan ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji empat jenis isu (1) kesan pendekatan erti dalam membantu pelajar memahami pesanan atau erti yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense yang dikaji; (2) kesan pendekatan erti dalam membantu pelajar menggunakan pesanan atau erti dalam tulisan yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense yang dikaji, (3) kesan pendekatan erti dalam membantu pelajar-pelajar dari golongan yang mempunyai tahap lebih rendah dan tahap lebih tinggi dalam penguasaan bahasa Inggeris memahami pesanan atau erti yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense yang dikaji; (4) kesan pendekatan erti dalam membantu pelajar-pelajar dari golongan yang mempunyai tahap lebih rendah dan tahap lebih tinggi dalam penguasaan bahasa Inggeris menggunakan pesanan atau erti dalam tulisan yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense yang dikaji

Penyelidikan ini menggunakan rekabentuk quasi-eksperimen yang melibatkan subjek melakukan praujian, menerima olahan selama enam minggu, dan melakukan pasca ujian Penyelidikan ini dilakukan di Kolej Legenda Langkawi

Hasil kajian yang melibatkan isu pertama mendapati bahawa kumpulan yang diajar dengan kaedah erti mempunyai pencapaian yang lebih tinggi secara statistik dalam memahami pesanan atau erti yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense yang dikaji berbanding dengan kumpulan yang diajar dengan pendekatan bentuk (F = 422.77, p = 0.00). Hasil kajian yang melibatkan isu kedua juga mendapati bahawa kumpulan yang diajar dengan kaedah erti mempunyai pencapaian yang lebih tinggi secara statistik dalam menggunakan pesanan atau erti dalam tulisan yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam enam sistem tense yang dikaji
berbanding dengan kumpulan yang diajar dengan pendekatan bentuk \( F = 2399.76, p = 0.00 \).

Hasil kajian yang membabitkan isu ketiga mendapati bahawa pelajar-pelajar yang mempunyai tahap lebih rendah dalam penguasaan bahasa Inggeris mempunyai pencapaian yang sama secara statistik dengan pelajar-pelajar yang mempunyai tahap penguasaan lebih tinggi dalam memahami pesan atau erti yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense terbabit (\( t = -0.97, p = 0.34 \)). Seperti hasil kajian isu ketiga, hasil kajian yang membabitkan isu keempat mendapati bahawa pelajar-pelajar yang mempunyai tahap lebih rendah dalam penguasaan bahasa Inggeris mempunyai pencapaian yang sama secara statistik dengan pelajar-pelajar yang mempunyai tahap penguasaan lebih tinggi dalam menggunakan pesan atau erti dalam tulisan yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk kata kerja yang terkandung dalam sistem tense terbabit (\( t = -2.37, p = 0.21 \)).

Hasil-hasil penyelidikan ini membuktikan bahawa kaedah erti membantu pelajar-pelajar untuk menterjemahkan pengetahuan teori ke dalam pengetahuan praktikal. Hasil-hasil penyelidikan tersebut juga membuktikan bahawa kaedah erti mempunyai kesan yang sama dalam membantu pelajar-pelajar dari golongan yang mempunyai tahap penguasaan bahasa Inggeris yang berbeza untuk memahami dan menggunakan bentuk-bentuk nahu sasaran. Pencapaian lebih baik yang dibuat oleh kumpulan olahan secara jelas menunjukkan adanya hubungan yang kuat antara olahan dengan kualiti pencapaian pelajar dalam memahami dan
menggunakan pesan atau erti yang disampaikan oleh bentuk-bentuk nahu bahasa sasaran.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Praise and thanks to almighty Allah for giving me the strength and patience to cope with the problems and difficulties that I faced in completing this study.

I am deeply indebted to my supervisors, Dr. Arshad Abd Samad, Dr. Ghazali Mustapha, and Dr. Mohd. Majid Konting who have guided me all throughout the project. The valuable suggestions they had offered had helped me complete my dissertation. My thanks are also to them for their impressive editing skills from which I have learnt a lot about academic writing.

I must also express my gratitude to the Rector, the Dean of Graduate School and the Dean of Faculty of Educational Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, for offering me a place and scholarship. Without the funding it would not have been possible for me to complete the study. I also wish to record my sincere appreciation to all the staff of Faculty of Educational studies and the Graduate School Office for their assistance during my study period.

My thanks are also due to the Rector, the staff and the students of Kolej Legenda Langkawi (KLL) for their help during the data collection stage of this study.

I am also grateful to my wife, Iffi Fitriah for her assistance in the field of statistical analysis which enabled me to complete this dissertation.
Finally, I owe a personal debt of gratitude to the members of my family in Indonesia: their love and prayers gave me the determination to complete my study.
I certify that an Examination Committee met on 25\textsuperscript{th} March 2003 to conduct the final examination of Agus Rianto on his Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled “Effects of a Meaning-Based Approach in Teaching the Tense System to Malay ESL College Students” in accordance with Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Act 1980 and Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Regulations 1981. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the relevant degree. Members of the Examination Committee are as follows:

**Mohd Ibrahim Nazri, Ph.D.**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Educational Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Arshad Abd Samad, Ph.D.**  
Faculty of Educational Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Ghazali Mustapha, Ph.D.**  
Faculty of Educational Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Mohd. Majid Konting, Ph.D.**  
Associate Professor  
Faculty of Educational Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Ratnawati Mohd Asraf, Ph.D.**  
Associate Professor  
Kulliyyah of Education  
International Islamic University Malaysia  
(Independent Examiner)

\[Signature\]

**SHAMSHER MOHAMAD RAMADILI, Ph.D.**  
Professor/Deputy Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  

Date: 21 March 2003
This thesis submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee are as follows:

Arshad Abd Samad, Ph.D.
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Ghazali Mustapha, Ph.D.
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

Mohd. Majid Konting, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Member)

AINI IDRIS, Ph.D.
Professor/Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 10 JUL 2003
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at UPM or other institutions.

AGUS RIANTO

Date: 21 May 2003
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>INTRODUCTION</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Background of the Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Objectives and Hypotheses of the Study</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The First Specific Objective and Hypothesis</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Second Specific Objective and Hypothesis</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Third Specific Objective and Hypothesis</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Fourth Specific Objective and Hypothesis</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Limitations of the Study</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Importance of the Study</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Definition of Terms</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>REVIEW OF LITERATURE</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Theoretical Perspectives on Second Language Grammar</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teaching</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Form-Based Approach</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication-Based Approach</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Meaning-Based Approach</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Effectiveness of Meaning-Based Approach on Teaching Tense System</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Meaning-Based Approach towards Proficiency Levels</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III METHODOLOGY.

Design of the Study 75
The Setting 75
Subjects of the Study 76
Description of Tests 77
Focused-Cloze Test 81
Test of Production Activities 82
Instructional Treatments 83
Features of Instructional Treatments 83
Instruction for Treatment Group: A Meaning-Based Approach 86
Instruction for Control Group: A Form-Based Approach 90
Comparison of A Meaning-Based Approach and A Form-Based Approach 93
Data Collection 99
Data Analysis and Scoring Procedures 102
Statistical Procedures 109
Statistical Significance 115
Methodological Limitations 115

IV RESULTS OF THE STUDY 118

Frequency Distribution and Descriptive Statistics Related to the First and the Second Specific Objectives of the Study 118
Age and Gender 119
The Total Performance According to Entire Subjects: Data Screening 122
The Total Performance According to MBA and FBA 123
Results of Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) 126
Homogeneity Test of Regression Slopes 126
The Strength of the Association 127
The First Specific Objective: Understanding of Messages Conveyed by Verbs of the Tense System 128
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Title of Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Types of Language Instructional Approaches</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Grades and Their Corresponding Marks, Proficiency Levels and Status for English Subject according to Universiti Teknologi Malaysia</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Comparison of Characteristics between Treatment and Control Groups</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Basic Features of Meaning-Based Approach and Form-Based Approach</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Comparison of the First Stage between Meaning-Based Instruction and Form-Based Instruction</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Comparison of the Second Stage between Meaning-Based Instruction and Form-Based Instruction</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Comparison of the Third Stage between Meaning-Based Instruction and Form-Based Instruction</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Comparison of the Fourth Stage between Meaning-Based Instruction and Form-Based Instruction</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Comparison of the Fifth Stage between Meaning-Based Instruction and Form-Based Instruction</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Sequence of the Study’s Procedures</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Description, Duration and Location of Procedures of the Study</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Sample Computation of Total and Ratio Score on the Focused-Cloze Test for a Single Student (Student 1)</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Example of Proportionate Scores of the Test of Production Activities</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Sample computation of Total Score and Overall Ratio Score on the Test of Production Activities for a Single Student (Student 1)</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
15. Inter-rater Reliability of the Test on Production Activities
16. Frequency Distribution of Age for the Entire Subjects
17. Frequency Distribution of Age according to Meaning-Based Approach (MBA) and Form-Based Approach (FBA)
18. Mean of Age according to Entire Subjects, MBA and FBA
19. Frequency Distribution of Gender for the Entire Subjects
20. Frequency Distribution of Gender according to Meaning-Based Approach (MBA) and Form-Based Approach (FBA)
21. Descriptive Statistics of the Pretest and Posttest Total Performance on the FCT and the TPA according to Entire Subjects
22. Descriptive Statistics of the Pretest and Posttest Total Performance on the Focused-Cloze Test (FCT) according to MBA and FBA
23. Descriptive Statistics of the Pretest and Posttest Total Performance on the Test of Production Activities (TPA) according to MBA and FBA
24. Analysis of Covariance of the Posttest Total Performance on the Focused-Cloze Test of the Tense System
25. Analysis of Covariance of the Posttest Total Performance on the Focused-Cloze Test of the Tense System
26. Analysis of Covariance of the Posttest Total Performance on the Test of Production Activities of the Tense System
27. Observed and Adjusted Mean of the Posttest Total Performance on the Test of Production Activities of the Tense System according to MBA and FBA
28. Frequency Distribution of Language Proficiency Levels for the MBA
29. Frequency Distribution of Age for subjects in the MBA According to Language Proficiency Levels
30. Mean of Age for Subjects in the MBA According to Language Proficiency Levels
31. Frequency Distribution of Gender for Subjects in the MBA According to Language Proficiency Level
32. Descriptive Statistics of the Total Performance on the FCT for Subjects in the MBA according to Language Proficiency Levels 137

33. Descriptive Statistics of the Total Performance on the TPA for subjects in the MBA according to Language Proficiency Levels 139

34. Result of Independent t-Test of Mean of Gain Scores on the Total Performance of the Focused-Cloze Test (FCT) between HPS and LPS in the MBA 142

35. Result of Independent t-Test of Mean of Gain Scores on the Total Performance of the Test of Production Activities (TPA) between HPS and LPS in the MBA 144
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Background of the Problem

Every year, tens of thousands of successful Malay students who graduate from upper secondary school seek tertiary education. While a small number is sent abroad, the majority enroll in local universities for undergraduate studies. This latter group of students has to face the reality that most of the local universities use the English language as the main medium of instruction. They have to handle academic tasks and assignments in English. They need to adapt to this new demand as well as a new environment in their academic world. While their adaptation to these new conditions is facilitated by exposure to English, their proficiency may not be at the level necessary to process the content area knowledge offered in academic courses (Cooper, 1984).

Undergraduates who are considered successful learners are those who have a high level of control of the English language particularly where reading skills are concerned since most of the resource materials are in English (Nambiar & Sargunan, 1989). In institutions of higher learning where English is used as the main medium of instruction, the problems faced by the students are more serious. Learners are expected to demonstrate good writing skills in their term papers, project papers and other assignments in English. This involves an ability to look at resource materials more carefully, to extract and verify information, to rephrase
and finally to revise. In fact, this expectation of the academic community becomes a problem for most Malay college students in an ESL environment as they are underprepared for the academic situation.

This existing problem among ESL learners in Malaysian colleges could be a result of the approaches to language instruction at secondary school level. Govindasamy (1994) states that there are at least two types of instructional approaches mostly used in second language classrooms in the Malaysian context which can cause difficulties for learners to cope with higher academic settings. One approach related to language instruction spends an enormous amount of time on acquiring communication skills. Another approach sensitizes learners with the traditional way of learning English: the form (rule)-governed approach.

On gaining entrance to an institution of higher learning, learners are expected to enroll in a preparatory course in English, in order to acquire the needed academic language proficiency. Unfortunately, however, this preparation is frequently less than successful for two reasons—a curriculum which again overemphasizes ‘block’ communication skills and strategies; and a grammar instruction that is traditional in orientation.

The first reason for learners’ poor skills is related to the emphasis on communication skills and strategies. Spending an enormous amount of time on acquiring communication skills and strategies leads to a reduction in the time allocated for grammar (Govindasamy, 1994). Also a focus on direct instruction in