



**UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA**

***TIME DIVISION MULTIPLE ACCESS-BASED SCHEDULING  
ALGORITHM FOR QUALITY OF SERVICE ENHANCEMENT IN IEEE  
802.11s WIRELESS MESH NETWORKS***

**ABDULNASSER AHMED MOHAMMED**

**FK 2022 36**



**TIME DIVISION MULTIPLE ACCESS-BASED SCHEDULING  
ALGORITHM FOR QUALITY OF SERVICE ENHANCEMENT IN IEEE  
802.11s WIRELESS MESH NETWORKS**

By

**ABDULNASSER AHMED MOHAMMED**

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia,  
in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

**January 2021**

## **COPYRIGHT**

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs, and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright © Universiti Putra Malaysia



## **DEDICATION**

*To my father,*

*To my mother, my brothers, my sisters, my lovely wife, and my Daughter Anwar.*

*Finally, To All whom I love.*



©

COPYRIGHT UPM

Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**TIME DIVISION MULTIPLE ACCESS-BASED SCHEDULING  
ALGORITHM FOR QUALITY OF SERVICE ENHANCEMENT IN IEEE  
802.11s WIRELESS MESH NETWORKS**

By

**ABDULNASSER AHMED MOHAMMED**

**January 2021**

**Chairman : Professor Borhanuddin bin Mohd Ali, PhD**  
**Faculty : Engineering**

Many challenges face the next generation of wireless communication systems that need to be bound to coexist with each other. The quality of service (QoS) and the performance restrictions are some of them which occur in TDMA in a multi-hop environment. There have been researches and standardization efforts to apply QoS at Media Access Control (MAC) layer. However, the significant performance parameters will directly impact the preparation of the information for the MAC layer before any schedule is run. The particular objective of this is the QoS and performance restrictions in wireless mesh networks based on IEEE 802.11s.

Consequently, the degradation of QoS in the network would occur in packet delay and packet loss. Packet delay occurs during the transmission process, where stations may release an Access Point (AP) through which they are connected and join another. Packet loss occurs when it has to wait for an excessive length of time and in the case of real-time streaming like video, where keeping them will not be useful and will only cause further delays to the subsequent packets, which adversely affects the QoS. Power consumption is another important metric that can be affected due to 'idle listening', which happens when a station is neither transmits nor receives ongoing communication through the shared medium. In particular, this thesis presents the scheduling of packets in multi-hop wireless mesh networks based on IEEE 802.11s. Two primary aspects are gathering the network information and how the information is used upon scheduling. This study introduces Enhanced Dynamic (ED-TDMA) to exchange the information between Stations (STAs) and Mesh Access Point (MAP), where the overlapping of the coverage area occurs. The utilization of this information follows this to support all the scheduling operations. During the first operation, information on the STAs in the neighboring network is provided from the MAPs. Next is, deciding the available STAs through the network side, followed by taking traffic

type into account. The first procedure is Optimum Dynamic Reservation (ODR-TDMA). It serves video users with packet delays higher than the threshold set in the network, thus maintaining its QoS. It reduces 15% of the packet loss and 17% of the average delay. It also increases throughput by 7%. The second procedure is High Priority Optimum Dynamic Reservation (HPODR-TDMA). It extends ODR-TDMA by giving STAs having higher delays than the higher delay threshold classified into three classes. Class I users experience a smaller packet loss and higher throughput compared to other classes. It succeeds in reducing the packet loss by 19% and increases throughput by 9%. The third Enhanced Peer Specific Power Saving Mode (E-PSPSM) focuses on power saving by switching between light sleep mode and deep sleep mode techniques. It decreases the power consumption in deep sleep mode by an average of 13%, the average delay by 16%, and increases throughput by 14%. All these are achieved by way of the enhancement of the information exchange between STAs and MAPs. Subsequently, ODR-TDMA has the best performance in minimizing the packet delay while HPODR-TDMA gives the best performance in reducing packet loss and increasing throughput, and finally, E-PSPSM is the best in reducing power consumption.

Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**ALGORITMA CAPAIAN BERBILANG PEMBAHAGI MASA BERASASKAN  
PENJADUALAN UNTUK PENINGKATAN KUALITI PERKHIDMATAN  
DALAM RANGKAIAN WAYARLES JEJARING IEEE802.11S**

Oleh

**ABDULNASSER AHMED MOHAMMED**

**Januari 2021**

**Pengerusi : Profesor Borhanuddin bin Mohd Ali, PhD**  
**Fakulti : Kejuruteraan**

Terdapat banyak cabaran yang dihadapi generasi komunikasi sistem tanpa wayar yang perlu diselesaikan untuk mencapai kesatuan antara satu sama lain. Kualiti perkhidmatan (QoS) dan sekatan prestasi adalah beberapa di antaranya yang berlaku di TDMA dalam persekitaran multi harapan. Sejumlah individu dan organisasi sedang melakukan beberapa penyelidikan dan berusaha melakukan standardisasi untuk menerapkan dan membanggunya dalam lapisan MAC. Walau bagaimanapun, parameter prestasi yang ketara akan menerima kesan langsung dari penyediaan maklumat untuk lapisan MAC sebelum penjadualan dijalankan. Objektif khusus ini adalah QoS dan sekatan prestasi dalam rangkaian mesh tanpa wayar berdasarkan IEEE 802.11s. Akibatnya, penurunan QoS dalam rangkaian akan berlaku iaitu, penundaan paket dan kehilangan paket. Kelewatan paket berlaku semasa proses penghantaran di mana stesen boleh melepaskan titik akses di mana mereka disambungkan, dan bergabung dengan yang lain. Kehilangan paket boleh berlaku apabila perlu menunggu jangka masa yang berlebihan dan dalam hal penstriman masa nyata seperti video, di mana menyimpannya tidak akan berguna dan hanya akan menyebabkan kelewatan lebih lanjut pada paket berikutnya, dan ini memberi kesan buruk kepada QoS. Penggunaan tenaga juga merupakan matrik penting lain yang dapat dilaksanakan kerana 'pendengaran terbiar' yang berlaku ketika stesen tidak menghantar atau menerima komunikasi berterusan melalui media bersama. Khususnya, tesis ini ditulis dengan tujuan untuk menggambarkan penjadualan dalam rangkaian mesh tanpa wayar multi-hop berdasarkan IEEE 802.11s dengan lebih terperinci. Ada dua aspek utama untuk ini, yaitu pengumpulan informasi rangkaian, diikuti dengan bagaimana informasi tersebut digunakan semasa penjadualan. Kajian ini memperkenalkan Enhanced Dynamic (ED-TDMA) untuk menukar maklumat antara STA dan Mesh Access Point (MAP), di mana pertindihan berlaku di kawasan liputan. Ini diikuti dengan memanfaatkan informasi ini untuk mendukung semua operasi penjadualan. Semasa operasi pertama, maklumat mengenai STA di rangkaian tetangga diberikan dari titik akses mesh. Sebaliknya,

menentukan STA yang tersedia melalui sisi rangkaian, diikuti dengan mengambil kira jenis lalu lintas adalah operasi kedua. Tempahan Dinamik Optimum (ODR-TDMA) adalah prosedur pertama kajian ini. Ia melayani pengguna video dengan kelewatan paket yang lebih tinggi daripada ambang yang ditetapkan dalam rangkaian, sehingga mempertahankan QoSnya. Ini mencapai kejayaan dalam mengurangkan peratusan 15% kehilangan paket dan 17% dari kelewatan purata. Ia juga berjaya meningkatkan throughput dengan 7%. Prosedur kedua kajian ini adalah Tempahan Dinamik Optimum Prioriti Tinggi (HPODR-TDMA). Ini memperluas mekanisme ODR-TDMA dengan memberi lebih keutamaan untuk melayani STA yang mempunyai kelewatan lebih tinggi daripada ambang penundaan yang lebih tinggi di mana mereka diklasifikasikan menjadi tiga kelas. Pengguna Kelas I mengalami jumlah kehilangan paket yang lebih kecil dan throughput yang lebih tinggi berbanding kelas yang lain. Ia mencapai kejayaan dalam mengurangkan kehilangan paket untuk Kelas I dengan peratusan 19%. Sebaliknya ia meningkatkan throughput untuk Kelas I dengan peratusan 9%. Prosedur ketiga kajian ini yang dipusatkan adalah Enhanced Peer Specific Power Saving Mode (E-PSPSM) datang untuk menjimatkan penggunaan kuasa rangkaian dengan menggunakan mod tidur ringan dan teknik mod tidur nyenyak. Ini mengurangkan daya penggunaan dalam mod tidur ringan dengan rata-rata 13%. Dan 14% dalam mod tidur nyenyak. Ia berjaya mengurangkan kelewatan purata dalam mod tidur nyenyak 18%. Dan ini meningkatkan throughput dengan peratusan 19% dalam mod tidur ringan dan 14% dalam mod tidur nyenyak. Berdasarkan hasil kajian ini, kelebihan kaedah ODR-TDMA, HPODR-TDMA dan E-PSPSM yang dilaksanakan di sini telah dibuktikan melalui peningkatan jangka masa pertukaran maklumat antara STA dan titik akses jaringan. Selepas itu, ODR-TDMA mempunyai prestasi terbaik dalam aspek meminimumkan penundaan paket sementara HPODR-TDMA mempunyai prestasi terbaik dalam aspek meminimumkan kehilangan paket dan meningkatkan throughput dan E-PSPSM mempunyai prestasi terbaik dalam aspek meminimumkan penggunaan kuasa .



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, praise is for Allah Subhanahu Wa Taala for giving me the strength, guidance, and patience to complete this thesis. May blessing and peace be upon Prophet Muhammad Sallallahu Alaihi Wasallam, who was sent for mercy to the world.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor Prof. Borhanuddin Bin Mohad Ali for the continuous support of my study and research, for his patience, motivation, enthusiasm, and immense knowledge. His guidance helped me in all the time of research and writing of this thesis. I could not have imagined having a better supervisor and mentor for my PhD study.

I would like to thank the supervisory committee members, Prof. Shamala Subramaniam and Prof. Sabira Khatun for their encouragement and insightful comments.

I am very grateful to the Faculty of Engineering and the staff of Postgraduate Study, Library, and University Putra Malaysia, for providing the research environment. Thanks to every person who has supported me to produce my thesis.

I am very grateful to my family: my father, Ahmed , my mother, Zinab, my brothers and my sisters for their unflagging love and support throughout my life. I have no suitable words that can fully describe my everlasting love to them except, I love you all.

Words fail me to express my appreciation to my lovely wife whose dedication, love and persistent confidence in me, has taken the load off my shoulder. I owe her for being unselfishly let her intelligence, passions, and ambitions collide with mine.

Special thanks goes to my daughter Anwar my joy and my guiding lights. Thanks for giving me your valuable time through all this long process. I promise I will never let you alone anymore.

Last but by no means least, it gives me immense pleasure to express my deepest gratitude to my sisters Nada, Noha and Arwa and, and my all brothers for their constant support and encouragement.

Finally, I would like to thank everybody who was important to the successful realization of thesis, as well as expressing my apology that I could not mention personally one by one.

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

**Borhanuddin bin Mohd Ali, PhD**

Professor  
Faculty of Engineering  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Chairman)

**Shamala a/p K. Subramaniam, PhD**

Professor. Dato  
Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
(Member)

**Sabira Katun, PhD**

Professor  
Faculty of Electrical and Electronics Engineering  
Universiti Malaysia Pahang  
(Member)

---

**ZALILAH MOHD SHARIFF, PhD**

Professor and Dean  
School of Graduate Studies  
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 10 February 2022

## Declaration by Members of Supervisory Committee

This is to confirm that:

- the research conducted and the writing of this thesis was under our supervision;
- supervision responsibilities as stated in the Universiti Putra Malaysia (Graduate Studies) Rules 2003 (Revision 2012-2013) were adhered to.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Chairman  
of Supervisory  
Committee: Professor Dr. Borhanuddin bin Mohd Ali

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Member  
of Supervisory  
Committee: Professor Dr. Shamala a/p K. Subramaniam

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_  
Name of Member  
of Supervisory  
Committee: Professor Dr. Sabira Katun

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
<b>ABSTRACT</b>	i
<b>ABSTRAK</b>	iii
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	v
<b>APPROVAL</b>	vi
<b>DECLARATION</b>	viii
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	xii
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xiii
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b>	xv
<b>CHAPTER</b>	
<b>1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background and Motivation	2
1.3 Problem Statement	2
1.4 Aim and Objectives	3
1.5 Research Scope	4
1.6 Thesis Contribution	4
1.7 Thesis Organization	5
<b>2 LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>6</b>
2.1 Introduction	6
2.2 Wireless Mesh Network (WMN)	6
2.2.1 Evaluation of IEEE 802.11 Standards	7
2.2.2 WLAN Modes of Operation and MAC layer	9
2.2.3 WiFi Topologies	10
2.2.4 IEEE 802.11s Structure	11
2.3 Multiple Access Techniques	12
2.4 Time Division Multiplexing Access (TDMA) Scheduling	13
2.4.1 Centralized TDMA Scheduling	14
2.4.2 Decentralized TDMA Scheduling	15
2.5 Dynamic Slot Reservation TDMA	16
2.5.1 Contention-Free and Contention-Based Schemes	17
2.5.2 Guaranteed and Best-Effort Slots	18
2.6 Scheduling MAC TDMA Multi-hop	19
2.6.1 Effect of Scheduling in throughput and delay	20
2.6.2 Power Consumption over TDMA MAC Multi-hop Networks	20
2.7 Conclusion	24

<b>3</b>	<b>METHODOLOGY</b>	25
3.1	Introduction	25
3.2	Research Framework	25
3.2.1	Implementation of Previous Schemes	28
3.2.2	The system model	28
3.3	The Proposed Schemes	29
3.3.1	Optimum Dynamic Reservation – Time Division Multiple Access (ODR-TDMA)	30
3.3.2	High Priority Optimum Dynamic Reservation – Time Division Multiple Access (HPODR-TDMA)	32
3.3.3	Enhanced Peer Specific Power Saving Mode (E-PSPSM)	34
3.4	The Mathematical Model	36
3.5	Network Topologies Overview	37
3.6	Simulation Setup	38
3.7	Performance Metrics	39
3.7.1	Packet Delay	39
3.7.2	Packet loss	39
3.7.3	Throughput	40
3.7.4	Power Consumptions	40
3.8	Conclusion	40
<b>4</b>	<b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS</b>	41
4.1	Introduction	41
4.2	ODR-TDMA Results and Discussion	41
4.2.1	Effect of increasing $N_v$ while $\mu$ in the range of {1:1.04}	41
4.2.2	Comparison between ODR-TDMA and previous protocols	45
4.2.3	ODR-TDMA Fairness Analysis	48
4.3	HPODR-TDMA Results and Discussion	50
4.3.1	Effect of increasing $\mu$ in packet loss ratio and Throughput	50
4.3.2	Comparison with previous work	55
4.4	E-PSPSM Results and Discussion	57
4.4.1	Power Consumption	58
4.4.2	Delay and Throughput	60
4.5	Calculation of the Complexity	64
4.6	Conclusion	66
<b>5</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE WORKS</b>	67
5.1	Conclusions	67
5.2	Suggestion for Future Works	68
	<b>REFERENCES</b>	69
	<b>BIODATA OF STUDENT</b>	77
	<b>LIST OF PUBLICATIONS</b>	78

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table</b>		<b>Page</b>
2.1	Specifications of IEEE802.11 WLAN Standards [17]	8
2.2	Advantages and disadvantages of the existing approaches of centralized and decentralized TDMA scheduling	16
2.3	Advantages and disadvantages of some proposed methods	19
2.4	The effect of packet delay and power consumptions over TDMA MAC multi-hop network	22
3.1	Simulation Parameters	38
4.1	Throughput and Fairness Index Parameters	49
4.2	Values of throughput against a number of STAs in light sleep mode	61
4.3	Delay for the proposed protocol comparing with PSM and PPSM-SimQPN	63

## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>Figure</b>		<b>Page</b>
2.1	WLAN Architecture (a) Infrastructure Mode, (b) Ad-Hoc Mode	9
2.2	Wireless network topologies: (a) centralized network; (b) distributed network; (c) multi-hop meshed network. Circles denote wireless terminals, and lines denote communication paths	10
2.3	IEEE 802.11s Hierarchical Structure	11
2.4	Classification of Multiple Access Techniques [21]	12
3.1	The Research Framework	27
3.2	The system model	29
3.3	ODR-TDMA Pseudocode	32
3.4	HPODR-TDMA Pseudocode	34
3.5	E-PSPSM Pseudocode	35
3.6	The Network Topology [59]	38
4.1	Packet loss ratio of video packets against a number of video users	42
4.2	Packet Loss Ratio of Video Packets against Weighting Factor	43
4.3	Average delay of video packets against a number of video users	44
4.4	Throughput against a number of video users	45
4.5	Packet loss comparison between ODR-TDMA with DR-TDMA and FDR-TDMA	46
4.6	Average delay comparison between ODR-TDMA with DR-TDMA and FDR-TDMA	47
4.7	Throughput against a number of video users	48
4.8	The normal distribution	50
4.9(a)	Packet loss ratio against a number of video users for ODR-TDMA	51
4.9(b)	Packet loss ratio achieved by HPODR-TDMA class III	51

4.9(c)	Packet loss ratio achieved by HPODR-TDMA class II	52
4.9(d)	Packet loss ratio achieved by HPODR-TDMA class I	52
4.10(a)	Throughput achieved by ODR-TDMA	53
4.10(b)	Throughput class I achieved by HPODR-TDMA	54
4.10(c)	Throughput class II achieved by HPODR-TDMA	54
4.10(d)	Throughput class III achieved by HPODR-TDMA	55
4.11	Packet Loss Ratio comparison between HPODR-TDMA DR-TDMA and FDR-TDMA	56
4.12	Throughput comparison between HPODR-TDMA with DR-TDMA and FDR-TDMA	57
4.13	Average power consumption in light sleep mode against a number of mesh STAs	58
4.14	Average Power Consumption based on a number of Mesh STAs in deep sleep mode	59
4.15	Delay against a number of mesh STAs in light sleep mode	60
4.16	Throughput against a number of mesh STAs in light sleep mode	61
4.17	Delay comparison between E-PSPSM with PSPSM-SimQPN against a number of mesh STAs in deep sleep mode	62
4.18	Throughput comparison between E-PSPSM with PSPSM-SimQPN against a number of mesh STAs in deep sleep mode	63
4.19	Main ED-TDMA algorithm function	64
4.20	Relationship between a number of operations via a number of neighbor nodes	65



## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AP	Access Point
BS	Base Station
BSS	Basic Service Set
TDMA	Time-Division Multiple Access
FDMA	Frequency Division Multiple Access
CDMA	Code Division Multiple Access
CSMA/CA	Carrier Sense Multiple Access/ Collision avoidance
CRC	Cyclic Redundancy Check
DR-TDMA	Dynamic Reservation Time Division Multiple Access
ODR-TDMA	Optimum Dynamic Reservation Time Division Multiple Access
HPODR-TDMA	High Priority Optimum Dynamic Reservation – Time Division Multiple Access
E-PSPSM	Enhanced Peer Specific Power Saving Mode
ESS	Extended Service Set
FDMA	Frequency Division Multiple Access
FDR-TDMA	Fair Dynamic Reservation Time Division Multiple Access
GHZ	Giga Hertz
HWMP	Hybrid Wireless Mesh Protocol
IBSS	Independent Basic Service Set
IEEE	Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers
WLAN	Wireless local Area Network
LMDS	Local Multipoint Distribution Service
LTE	Long Term Evaluation

MAC	Media Access Control
MAP	Mesh Access Point
MBWA	Mobile Broadband Wireless Access
MCCA	Mandatory Controlled Channel Access
MP	Mesh Point
MPP	Mesh Point plus Portal
$N_v$	Number of Video Users
OFDM	Orthogonal Frequency Division Multiplexing
PSM	Power Save Mode
PSPSM	Peer Specific Power Saving Mode
PSPSM-SimQPN	Peer Specific Power Saving Mode with Simulation of Queuing Petri Nets
QPN	Queuing Petri Nets
QoS	Quality of Service
RF	Radio Frequency
RAM	Random Access Memory
Rslot	Bit Rate Per Slot
RV	Average Bit Rate Per Video User
STAs	Stations
WiMAX	Worldwide Interoperability for Microwave Access
WLAN	Wireless Local Area Network
WMN	Wireless Mesh Network
WPAN	Wireless Personal Area Network
WSN	Wireless Sensor Networks

# CHAPTER 1

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Introduction

The integration between all communications networks is considered one of the main challenges in the communication world. Many protocols have been established for each kind of network to deal with different networks. Many issues have been considered: Quality of Service (QoS) and power-saving are just two of them. Enhancing the QoS to meet the communications requirements and meet user satisfactions with minor power consumption is one of the main challenges in wireless communications.

One of the exciting wireless communications technologies is Wireless Mesh Networks (WMNs) [1]. WMN can integrate many types of communications networks, one of which is WiFi, the commercial name for IEEE802.11 standards. WiFi enables wireless access for wireless devices to the internet within 100 m indoor and 300 m outdoor. Several standards and drafts function with WiFi are available; they are IEEE 802.11a, 802.11 b/g, 802.11n, 802.11e, and 802.11i. Each of them has its unique properties since they are constructed to support various criteria.

IEEE 802.11s encompasses all of the modifications made to the specification of earlier protocols. It was constructed based on the improvement of 802.11a/b/g/n for physical interface; 802.11e for access to the medium; and 802.11i for security [2]. IEEE 802.11s assimilates mesh networking services and protocols with 802.11 at the Media Access Control (MAC) Layer. Accordingly, it is expected to broaden the utilization of mesh networks just as the 802.11a, b, and g standards enlarged wireless Local Area Networks (WLANs). The IEEE 802.11s-based WMN technology comprises (i) Mesh Point (MP), which serves as the fundamental entity in the network. It shares the same characteristics with the legacy 802.11 stations and is utilized to set up and support multi-hop paths to relay traffic. (ii) Mesh Access Point (MAP), which provides wireless access to wireless stations. (iii) Mesh Points Plus Portal (MPP) serves as a gateway to different networks such as the internet. (iv) User devices, or generically referred to as stations (STAs), can function with the legacy 802.11 interfaces. However, information regarding the mesh network might not be available to them [3].

IEEE 802.11s working group crafted standards that render the network more adaptable and tolerant to drawbacks vis-a-vis centralized infrastructure networks. The network should be able to sustain temporary congestions, single-node failures, and limited interference. It has an embedded capacity to detect adjacent nodes, establish connections, and locate optimal traffic paths [4]. The IEEE 802.11s deals with several addendums in its standard, i.e., topology learning, routing and forwarding, security,

measurement, discovery and association, medium-access coordination, compatibility to 802.11 services, interworking, configuration and management. The standard is constructed to boost, consolidate and provide an efficient standard for WMNs, eliminate the constraints of preceding WLAN standards and integrate everything in one standard.

## **1.2 Background and Motivation**

As has been alluded to above, a wireless mesh network integrates also integrates WLAN in the mesh network. WLAN mesh consists of WLAN devices with relay functions that communicate directly with each other instead of communicating via Base Stations (BSs) or Access Points (APs). The WLAN mesh network has many features, such as flexible broadband network configuration independent of the fixed network. WLAN has widespread use as a means of achieving broadband wireless communication. It is an area of ongoing technical innovation such as on the QoS and high-speed technology, where researchers have used many techniques to achieve these objectives. Maintaining them using the weighting factor is a commonly used approach where the weight given to data plays a significant enhancement in getting better QoS, less power consumption and fair scheduling [5-8]. Other features include higher data transmissions rate due to shortened communication distance, expanded network capacity through spatial frequency reuse, automatic network configuration, and improved robustness due to route recovery mechanism. The IEEE 802.11s standard envisions a small-to-medium scale WLAN mesh network configured with a maximum of 32 Mesh Points (MPs), including MAPs where each MAP can be connected to many STAs, enabling the entire network to accommodate several hundred terminals [9].

This chapter briefly introduces WMNs, problem statement, aim, objectives, research scope, thesis contributions, and thesis organization.

## **1.3 Problem Statement**

A wireless mesh network (WMN) is a communication network that integrates different networks into one network. In WMN based on IEEE 802.11s, mobile mesh stations can establish a new mesh link and release others through mesh points. Each one of them runs its specific protocols to communicate with each other. However, there are some limitations when doing releasing and establishing new connections. These limitations can be addressed and summarized as follows:

- Packet delay can occur during the transmission process because of the dynamic environment in IEEE 802.11s, where stations may release an AP through which they are connected and join another.
- Packet drops can occur when it has to wait for an excessive length of time, and in the case of real-time streaming like videos, keeping them will not be

useful and will only cause further delays to the subsequent packets, which adversely affects the QoS.

- A significant amount of power is wasted due to ‘idle listening’, which happens when a station neither transmits nor receives ongoing communications through the shared medium; it is just listening.

This thesis addresses these issues through adaptive scheduling algorithms, which will be shown to achieve the QoS requirements and keep power usage at acceptable levels. The algorithms depend on two main parameters; the number of video users and the decision weighting factor for choosing the number of users. This weighting factor lies between 1 and 1.04, as will be explained in Chapter 3. The main algorithm works by finding the corresponding weighting factor for each video user, which guarantees that it achieves the QoS and reduces the power consumption of the network.

#### **1.4 Aim and Objectives**

The main objectives of this thesis are to propose an algorithm that aims to serve users who have higher delay than others to be done first. With a priority to those users, more emphasis is given to those who have higher delay than others, and classified into three classes is considered the second objective. On the other hand, saving power consumption is considered to be the third objective of this research.

The detailed objectives of this thesis are as follows:

1. To propose a method called Optimum Dynamic Reservation Time Division Multiple Access (ODR-TDMA) reduces packet delay occurring in multi-hop environments where stations may release an access point (AP) which they are connected to and join another.
2. To propose an algorithm that reduces packet loss and maintains high throughput when the number of stations is high by way of a dynamic scheduling method called High Priority Optimum Dynamic Reservation – Time Division Multiple Access (HPODR-TDMA). It classifies video streams having packet delays higher than a set threshold and then allocates extra slots according to their respective classifications.
3. To propose an algorithm called Enhance Peer Specific Power Saving Mode (E-PSPSM) that reduces the power consumption in WMN by putting the STAs into light or deep sleep mode, respectively, when not active.

## 1.5 Research Scope

This thesis focuses on the MAC Layer scheduling based on TDMA multi-hop as a critical enhancement in the 802.11s standard. It concentrates on packet delay when it propagates from the sender nodes to the MAP. Packet delay can occur during the transmission process because of the dynamic environment of IEEE 802.11s, where stations may release an AP and join another. As a result of that delay, packets may be dropped as late packets are no longer time in a real-time communication scenario. Additionally, power consumption for those delayed users increases while waiting to be served due to 'idle listening' where an STA is neither a transmitter nor a receiver on the shared medium.

## 1.6 Thesis Contribution

The main contributions of this thesis are as follows:

1. A method called Optimum Dynamic Reservation Time Division Multiple Access (ODR-TDMA) serves video users with packet delays that are higher than the threshold set in the network, thus maintaining its QoS,
2. An algorithm named High Priority Optimum Dynamic Reservation – Time Division Multiple Access (HPODR-TDMA) that classifies video streams having packet delays that are higher than a set threshold and then allocate extra slots according to their respective classifications,
3. An algorithm called Enhance Peer Specific Power Saving Mode (E-PSPSM) reduces power consumptions in the WMN by putting the STAs into light or deep sleep mode, respectively, when not active. It contributes to the improvement in packet delay, throughput and power consumption.

## 1.7 Thesis Organization

This thesis is organized as follows:

**Chapter 1** presents the background, problem statement, objectives, research scope, thesis contribution, and thesis structure.

**Chapter 2** elucidates the background of the subjects related to the methodology employed in the thesis. It presents the literature review concerning several scheduling algorithms relevant to WMNs using the TDMA scheduling technique.

**Chapter 3** presents the framework of the thesis and describes the stages in detail. Simulation experimental setup and topologies, and performance metrics and their evaluation methods are also presented. It describes the design and implementation of the QoS enhancement by using ODR-TDMA in wireless mesh networks based on IEEE 802.11s. It offers the new algorithm HPODR-TDMA for serving users with high priority. It shows a detailed description of dynamic scheduling for WMNs based on IEEE 802.11s. The procedure and implementation of the HPODR-TDMA algorithm are based on the ODR-TDMA method. The simulations are described in some detail. Finally, it presents E-PSPSM to reduce the power consumptions in WMNs based on IEEE 802.11s.

**Chapter 4** presents and discusses the results for ODR-TDMA and HPODR-TDMA. It discusses the performance of ODR-TDMA, HPODR-TDMA and their impact on Dynamic Reservation TDMA and Fair Dynamic Reservation TDMA in terms of packet loss, packet delay and throughput. It also discusses the results for E-PSPSM and its impact on PSM and PSPSM-SimQPN in terms of power consumption, delay and throughput in light sleep mode and deep sleep mode, respectively.

**Chapter 5** concludes the work and recommends directions for future research.



## REFERENCES

- [1] Akyildiz I.F., X. Wang and W. Wang, Wireless Mesh Networks: a survey, *Computer Networks*, 47(4): pp.445-487, 2005.
- [2] Hiertz, G.R., et al, IEEE 802.11s-mesh deterministic access, 14th European Wireless Conference, 2008.
- [3] Pursley, M. and T. Royster, Properties and performance of the IEEE 802.11 b complementary-code-key signal sets, *Communications, IEEE Transactions*, pp. 440-449, 2009.
- [4] Wang, X. and A.O. Lim, IEEE 802.11 s wireless mesh networks: Framework and challenges, *Ad Hoc Networks* vol. 6: pp. 970-984, 2008.
- [5] Garroppo, R.G., et al., Notes on implementing a IEEE 802.11 s mesh point, in *Wireless Systems and Mobility in Next Generation Internet*, Springer, pp. 60-72, 2008.
- [6] Mamechaoui, Sarra, Sidi Mohammed Senouci, Fedoua Didi, and Guy Pujolle. "Energy efficient management for wireless mesh networks with green routers." *Mobile Networks and Applications* 20, no. 5 (2015): 567-582.
- [7] Hui, Suk Yu, Kai Hau Yeung, and Kin Yeung Wong. "Design Issues in Infrastructure WiFi Mesh Networks." *International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics* 42, no. 2 (2008): 255.
- [8] Kala, Srikant Manas, M. Pavan Kumar Reddy, Ranadheer Musham, and Bheemarjuna Reddy Tamma. "Interference mitigation in wireless mesh networks through radio co-location aware conflict graphs." *Wireless Networks* 22, no. 2 (2016): 679-702.
- [9] Chien HC, Lee BH, Wu HK, Hsu WP, Hsieh HH. A dynamic adjustable contention period mechanism and adaptive backoff process to improve the performance for multichannel mesh deterministic access in wireless mesh LAN. *EURASIP Journal on Wireless Communications and Networking*. 2014 Dec 1;2014(1):149.
- [10] Hou W, Ning Z, Guo L. Green survivable collaborative edge computing in smart cities. *IEEE Transactions on Industrial informatics*. 2018 Jan 25;14(4):1594-605.
- [11] Masip-Bruin X, Verchere D, Tsaoussidis V, Yannuzzi M, editors. *Wired/Wireless Internet Communications: 9th IFIP TC 6 International Conference, WWIC 2011, Vilanova i la Geltrú, Spain, June 15-17, 2011, Proceedings*. Springer; 2011 Jun 27.



- [12] Yu FR, Zhang X, Leung VC. Green communications and networking. CRC Press; 2016 Apr 19.
- [13] L. Chen, Wireless Mesh Networks (WMNs), Technical Report UIUCDCS-R2006-2874, Dept. of Computer Science, UIUC, 2006.
- [14] IEEE Standard for Air Interface for Broadband Wireless Access Systems LAN/MAN Standards Committee — IEEE Computer Society — Jonathan Goldberg -2017
- [15] Talwar, Meenu, and Sandeep Singh Kang. "Study of Wireless Mesh Network over Medium Access Control Layer." International Journal of Advance Innovations, Thoughts & Ideas 2, no. 1 (2013): 1.
- [16] Xin, Qin, Yan Zhang, and Laurence T. Yang. "Optimal fault- tolerant broadcasting in wireless mesh networks." Wireless Communications and Mobile Computing 11, no. 5 (2011): 610-620.
- [17] Wei, Hung-Yu, Jarogniew Rykowski, and Sudhir Dixit. WiFi, WiMAX, and LTE Multi-hop Mesh Networks: Basic Communication Protocols and Application Areas. Vol. 96. John Wiley & Sons, 2013.
- [18] Lan, Y.-W. and J.-C. Chen, Asymptotic weighted fair queuing (AWFQ) for IEEE 802.11 point coordination function (PCF), IEEE Consumer Communications and Networking Conference, (CCNC'05), 2006.
- [19] IEEE Standard for Information Technology—Telecommunications and Information Exchange Between Systems Local and Metropolitan Area Networks—Specific Requirements—Part 11: Wireless LAN Medium Access Control (MAC) and Physical Layer (PHY) Specifications, IEEE Standard 802.11-2012, Revision of IEEE Standard 802.11-2007, Mar. 2012, pp. 1–2793
- [20] I. F. Akyildiz and X. Wang, "A survey on wireless mesh networks," IEEE Commun. Mag., vol. 43, no. 9, pp. S23–S30, Sep. 2005.
- [21] Wireless Communications Fundamental & Advanced Concepts: Design Planning and Applications, Sanjay Kumar River Publishers, 31 Mar 2015 - Technology & Engineering
- [22] Rahdar A, Khalily-Dermany M. A schedule based MAC in wireless Ad-hoc Network by utilizing Fuzzy TOPSIS. Procedia computer science. 2017 Jan 1;116:301-8.
- [23] Gholami, Ehsan, Amir Masoud Rahmani, and Mehdi Dehghan Takht Fooladi. "Adaptive and distributed TDMA scheduling protocol for wireless sensor networks." Wireless Personal Communications 80, no. 3 (2015): 947-969.

- [24] Chippa MK, Elamin MA, Sastry S, Tran NH. Dynamic TDMA for Networked Embedded Systems. Information Science and Applications (ICISA) 2016 (pp. 259-267). Springer, Singapore.
- [25] Rhee I, Warrier A, Min J, Xu L. DRAND: Distributed randomized TDMA scheduling for wireless ad hoc networks. IEEE Transactions on Mobile Computing. 2009 Mar 21;8(10):1384-96.
- [26] Sheikh, Sajid M., Riaan Wolhuter, and Herman A. Engelbrecht. "A survey of cross-layer protocols for IEEE 802.11 wireless multi-hop mesh networks." International Journal of Communication Systems 30, no. 6 (2017): e3129.
- [27] Siraj, M. and Bakar, K.A., 2012. To minimize interference in multi hop wireless mesh networks using load balancing interference aware protocol. World Applied Sciences Journal, 18(9), pp.1271-1278.
- [28] Yang X, Wang L, Xie J, Zhang Z. Energy efficiency TDMA/CSMA hybrid protocol with power control for WSN. Wireless Communications and Mobile Computing. 2018.
- [29] Shu, Minglei, Dongfeng Yuan, Chongqing Zhang, Yinglong Wang, and Changfang Chen. "A MAC protocol for medical monitoring applications of wireless body area networks." Sensors 15, no. 6 (2015): 12906-12931.
- [30] Marinkovic, Stevan Jovica, Emanuel Mihai Popovici, Christian Spagnol, Stephen Faul, and William Peter Marnane. "Energy-efficient low duty cycle MAC protocol for wireless body area networks." IEEE Transactions on Information Technology in Biomedicine 13, no. 6 (2009): 915-925.
- [31] Xu Y, Chin KW, Soh S. A Novel Distributed Pseudo-TDMA Channel Access Protocol for Multi-Transmit-Receive Wireless Mesh Networks. IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology. 2017 Oct 17;67(3):2531-42.
- [32] Zhang R, Cheng X, Yang L, Shen X, Jiao B. A novel centralized TDMA-based scheduling protocol for vehicular networks. IEEE Transactions on Intelligent Transportation Systems. 2014 Aug 6;16(1):411-6.
- [33] Deruyck M, Hoebeke J, De Poorter E, Tanghe E, Moerman I, Demeester P, Martens L, Joseph W. Intelligent TDMA heuristic scheduling by taking into account physical layer interference for an industrial IoT environment. Telecommunication Systems. 2018 Apr 1;67(4):605-17.
- [34] Osamy, Walid, Ahmed A. El-Sawy, and Ahmed M. Khedr. "Effective TDMA scheduling for tree-based data collection using genetic algorithm in wireless sensor networks." Peer-to-Peer Networking and Applications (2019): 1-20.

- [35] MalekpourShahraki M, Barghi H, Azhari SV, Asaiyan S. Distributed and Energy Efficient Scheduling for IEEE802. 11s Wireless EDCA Networks. *Wireless Personal Communications*. 2016 Sep 1;90(1):301-23.
- [36] Buratti C, Verdone R. Joint scheduling and routing with power control for centralized wireless sensor networks. *Wireless Networks*. 2018 Jul 1;24(5):1699-714.
- [37] Ahmad A, Hanzálek Z. Distributed real time TDMA scheduling algorithm for tree topology WSNs. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*. 2017 Jul 1;50(1):5926-33.
- [38] Lei L, Cai S, Luo C, Cai W, Zhou J. A dynamic TDMA-based MAC protocol with QoS guarantees for fully connected ad hoc networks. *Telecommunication Systems*. 2015 Sep 1;60(1):43-53.
- [39] Liu L, Liu Y, Wang Z, Liu C. Design of Dynamic TDMA Protocols for Tactical Data Link. In *International Conference on Communicatins and Networking in China 2017* Oct 10 (pp. 166-175). Springer, Cham.
- [40] J.F. Frigon, H.C.B. Chan, V.C.M. leung, Dynamic reservation TDMA protocol for wireless ATM networks, *IEEE Journal of Selected Areas in Communication* 19 (2) (2001) 370–383.
- [41] Centenaro M, Vangelista L, Saur S, Weber A, Braun V. Comparison of collision-free and contention-based radio access protocols for the Internet of Things. *IEEE Transactions on Communications*. 2017 May 23;65(9):3832-46.
- [42] Feng L. A Novel Pure Limited Queueing Model for IEEE 802.11 Contention-Free Networks. *Wireless Personal Communications*. 2015 Aug 1;83(3):2347-57
- [43] Lakshmi LR, Ribeiro VJ, Jain BN. A Dynamic Backup Path Management Method for TDMA Based WiMAX Client WMNs. *Wireless Personal Communications*. 2016 Jun 1;88(4):731-47.
- [44] Ahmed Z, Hamma S, Nasir Z. An optimal bandwidth allocation algorithm for improving QoS in WiMAX. *Multimedia Tools and Applications*. 2019 Sep 30;78(18):25937-76.
- [45] Rizk MR, Dessouky MI, El-Dolil SA, Abd-Elnaby M. Fair delay optimization-based resource allocation algorithm for video traffic over wireless multimedia system. *Wireless personal communications*. 2009 Mar 1;48(4):551-68.
- [46] Gokbayrak K, Yıldırım EA. Exact and heuristic approaches based on noninterfering transmissions for joint gateway selection, time slot

allocation, routing and power control for wireless mesh networks. *Computers & Operations Research*. 2017 May 1;81:102-18.

- [47] Chang CL, Chang CY, Chen ST, Tu SY, Ho KY. Optimisation-based time slot assignment and synchronisation for TDMA MAC in industrial wireless sensor network. *IET Communications*. 2019 Aug 9;13(18):2932-40.
- [48] Sugihara M. Dynamic Slot Multiplexing Under Operating Modes for TDMA-Based Real-Time Networking Systems. *Electronics*. 2020 Feb;9(2):224.
- [49] Cheng Y, Yang D, Zhou H. Det-WiFi: A Multihop TDMA MAC implementation for industrial deterministic applications based on commodity 802.11 hardware. *Wireless Communications and Mobile Computing*. 2017;2017.
- [50] Ketshabetswe, Lucia Keleadile, Adamu Murtala Zungeru, Mmoloki Mangwala, Joseph M. Chuma, and Boyce Sigweni. "Communication protocols for wireless sensor networks: A survey and comparison." *Heliyon* 5, no. 5 (2019): e01591
- [51] Zheng C, Huang S, Wei J, Dong Q. MD-MAC: A Distributed TDMA Protocol Based on Desynchronization for Multi-Hop Topologies. *Sensors*. 2019 Jan;19(23):5102.
- [52] Hussain MI, Ahmed ZI, Sarma N, Saikia DK. An efficient TDMA MAC protocol for multi-hop WiFi-based long distance networks. *Wireless Personal Communications*. 2016 Feb 1;86(4):1971-94.
- [53] Capone, Antonio, Yuan Li, Michał Pióro, and Di Yuan. "Minimizing end-to-end delay in multi-hop wireless networks with optimized transmission scheduling." *Ad Hoc Networks* 89 (2019): 236-248.
- [54] Li Y, Pióro M, Yuan D, Su J. Optimizing link rate assignment and transmission scheduling in WMN through compatible set generation. *Telecommunication Systems*. 2016 Feb 1;61(2):325-35.
- [55] Pinto LR, Almeida L, Rowe A. Balancing Packet Delivery to Improve End-to-End Multihop Aerial Video Streaming. In *Iberian Robotics conference 2017* Nov 22 (pp. 807-819). Springer, Cham.
- [56] Le-Dang Q, McManis J, Muntean GM. A location coordinate-based video delivery scheme over wireless mesh networks. *Wireless Networks*. 2015 Jul 1;21(5):1591-602.

- [57] Zhao M, Kumar A, Ristaniemi T, Chong PH. Machine-to-machine communication and research challenges: A survey. *Wireless Personal Communications*. 2017 Dec 1;97(3):3569-85.
- [58] Zou, J., & Zhao, D. (2009). Real-time CBR traffic scheduling in IEEE 802.16-based wireless mesh networks. *Wireless Networks*, 15(1), 65–72.
- [59] Chakraborty S. Analyzing peer specific power saving in IEEE 802.11 s through queuing petri nets: Some insights and future research directions. *IEEE Transactions on Wireless Communications*. 2016 Feb 11;15(5):3746-54.
- [60] Afzal B, Alvi SA, Shah GA. Adaptive duty cycling based multi-hop PSMP for internet of multimedia things. In 2016 13th IEEE Annual Consumer Communications & Networking Conference (CCNC) 2016 Jan 9 (pp. 895-900).
- [61] MalekpourShahraki, M., Barghi, H., Azhari, S. V., & Asaiyan, S. (2016). Distributed and Energy Efficient Scheduling for IEEE802.11s Wireless EDCA Networks. *Wireless Personal Communications*, 90(1), 301–323.
- [62] Li Y, Zhang X, Qiu T, Zeng J, Hu P. A Distributed TDMA Scheduling Algorithm Based on Exponential Backoff Rule and Energy-Topology Factor in Internet of Things. *IEEE Access*. 2017 Sep 29;5:20866-79.
- [63] Andrews JG, Ghosh A, Muhamed R. *Fundamentals of WiMAX: understanding broadband wireless networking*. Pearson Education; 2007 Feb 27.
- [64] Buratti C, Verdone R. Joint scheduling and routing with power control for centralized wireless sensor networks. *Wireless Networks*. 2018 Jul 1;24(5):1699-714.
- [65] Li X, Shi Y, Wang X, Xu C, Sheng M. Efficient link scheduling with joint power control and successive interference cancellation in wireless networks. *Science China Information Sciences*. 2016 Dec 1;59(12):122301.
- [66] A. Kamerman and L. Monteban, "WaveLAN-II: A high-performance wireless LAN for the unlicensed band," *Bell Labs Technical Journal*, vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 118–133, Aug. 1997.
- [67] B. Alawieh, Y. Zhang, C. Assi, and H. T. Mouftah, "An efficient rate adaptation scheme for multihop wireless networks using Kalman Filter," in *Proceedings of ISCC'08*, pp. 124–129, July 2008.

- [68] Bozkurt A. Optimal delay analysis for real-time traffics over IEEE 802.11 wireless LANs. *EURASIP Journal on Wireless Communications and Networking*. 2016 Dec;2016(1):52.
- [69] Hussain I, Ahmed ZI, Saikia DK, Sarma N. A QoS-aware dynamic bandwidth allocation scheme for multi-hop WiFi-based long distance networks. *EURASIP Journal on Wireless Communications and Networking*. 2015 Dec;2015(1):160.
- [70] Halloush R, Liu H, Dong L, Wu M, Radha H. Hop-by-hop content distribution with network coding in multihop wireless networks. *Digital Communications and Networks*. 2017 Feb 1;3(1):47-54.
- [71] Rezaei S, Gharib M, Movaghar A. Throughput Analysis of IEEE 802.11 Multi-Hop Wireless Networks With Routing Consideration: A General Framework. *IEEE Transactions on Communications*. 2018 Jun 19;66(11):5430-43.
- [72] F. Y. Li, A. Hafslund, M. Hauge, P. Engelstad, ivind Kure, and P. Spilling, "Does higher datarate perform better in IEEE 802.11-based multihop ad hoc networks?," *Communications and Networks*, vol. 9, no. 3, pp. 282–295, Sept. 2007.
- [73] G. Kuriakose, S. Harsha, A. Kumar, and V. Sharma, "Analytical models for capacity estimation of IEEE 802.11 WLANs using DCF for internet applications," *Wireless Networks*, vol. 15, no. 2, pp. 259–277, Feb. 2009.
- [74] Ko SW, Kim SL. Delay-constrained capacity of the IEEE 802.11 DCF in wireless multihop networks. *IEEE Transactions on Mobile Computing*. 2015 Jul 17;15(5):1105-15.
- [75] Lei L, Zhang T, Song X, Cai S, Chen X, Zhou J. Achieving weighted fairness in WLANmesh networks: An analytical model. *Ad Hoc Networks*. 2015 Feb 1;25:117-29.
- [76] Feng L, Yang J. A novel analysis of delay and power consumption for polling with PHY-assisted power management. *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics*. 2017 Sep 8;65(4):3610-20.
- [77] Barghi H, Azhari SV. A practical sleep coordination and management scheme with duty cycle control for energy sustainable IEEE 802.11 s wireless mesh networks. *Wireless Networks*. 2019 Jul 1;25(5):2511-36.
- [78] Riasudheen H, Selvamani K, Mukherjee S, Divyasree IR. An Efficient Energy-Aware Routing Scheme for Cloud-Assisted MANETs in 5G. *Ad Hoc Networks*. 2019 Oct 7:102021.



- [79] Karmel A, Vijayakumar V, Kapilan R. Ant-based efficient energy and balanced load routing approach for optimal path convergence in MANET. *Wireless Networks*.:1-3.
- [80] Demir MÖ, Karaca M, Kurt GK. On Reducing Power Consumption of Transmitting Stations in 802.11 MIMO Networks. *IEEE Communications Letters*. 2015 Nov 12;20(2):332-5.
- [81] Santos MA, Villalón JM, Orozco-Barbosa L. Dyn-ARF: a rate adaptation mechanism sensitive to the network load over 802.11 WLANs. *Telecommunication Systems*. 2016 Jan 1;61(1):5-19.
- [82] Pack S, Min S, Song T, Kim W, Choi N, Park H. RA-PSM: a rate-aware power saving mechanism in multi-rate wireless LANs. *Wireless Networks*. 2016 Aug 1;22(6):1767-77
- [83] Qulanet Simulator 5.1, <http://web.scalable-networks.com/qualnet-network-simulator-software>
- [84] K. Fall and K. Varadhan. The ns Manual, The VINT Project A Collaboration between researchers at UC Berkeley, November 2011.
- [85] Danna, Emilie, Subhasree Mandal, and Arjun Singh. "A practical algorithm for balancing the max-min fairness and throughput objectives in traffic engineering." In 2012 Proceedings IEEE INFOCOM, pp. 846-854. IEEE, 2012.
- [86] Tsang, Estella CM, and Rocky KC Chang. "A simulation study on the throughput fairness of TCP Vegas." In Proceedings. Ninth IEEE International Conference on Networks, ICON 2001., pp. 469-474. IEEE, 2001.
- [87] Hartaman, Aris, and Basuki Rahmat. "Performance and Fairness Analysis (using Jain's Index) of AODV and DSDV based on ACO in MANETs." In 2015 4th International Conference on Interactive Digital Media (ICIDM), pp. 1-7. IEEE, 2015.
- [88] Ahmed, A., M. T. Beg, and S.N. Ahmed, Fairness Issues and Measures in Wireless Networks: A Survey, *Electronics and Communication Engineering*, 11(6), PP 20-24, 2016.
- [89] Eiza, Mahmoud Hashem, Thomas Owens, Qiang Ni, and Qi Shi. "Situation-aware QoS routing algorithm for vehicular ad hoc networks." *IEEE Transactions on vehicular technology* 64, no. 12 (2015): 5520-5535.
- [90] Bartalos, Peter. "Complexity analysis of routing algorithms in computer networks." In IIT. SRC 2005: Student Research Conference, p. 69. 2004.