



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

**MISCUE ANALYSIS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY
OF TWO GROUPS OF PUPILS IN A SECONDARY SCHOOL**

LEE POH LE

FPP 1995 9

**MISCUE ANALYSIS : A COMPARATIVE STUDY
OF TWO GROUPS OF PUPILS IN A SECONDARY SCHOOL**

By

LEE POH LE

**Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of Master of Science in the
Faculty of Educational Studies,
Universiti Pertanian Malaysia.**

June 1995



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to extend my sincere appreciation to all those who have kindly rendered me their assistance in one way or another in writing this thesis.

Special thanks go to Dr. Sali Zaliha Mustapha, the chairman of my supervisory committee, and Dr. Sharifah Mohd Nor and Puan Hajah Nora Mohamed Nor who have kindly devoted much time and patience to help in the writing of this thesis.

I would also like to thank the Education Ministry and the Federal Territory Education Department for granting me the permission to carry out my research in the school. Special thanks also go to the pupils of Sekolah Menengah Bandar Baru Seri Petaling and Mr Philip Loo Kim Seng (AMN), the Principal of Sekolah Menengah Bandar Baru Seri Petaling, who have not only granted me the permission to carry out the research in the school, but have also voluntarily helped me in much of my data collection work.

Of course, I do not leave out my coursemates, Mr Freddie Low and Miss Ting Su Hie in my expression of gratitude. They have been of tremendous help to me.



Thanks also go to Dr. Zain Mohd Ali for introducing me to this Master of Science (TESL) programme. Without him, this thesis would not have been written.

Finally, I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my two daughters, Evelyn and Joyce for their patience, encouragement and sacrifices to help write this thesis.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
ABSTRACT	ix
ABSTRAK	xi
CHAPTER	
I	
INTRODUCTION	1
Context of the Research Problem	1
Statement of the Problem	7
Objectives of the Study	9
Significance of the Study	11
Limitations of the Study	15
Operational Definitions	17
Average Readers	17
Second Language (L2) Learning ..	18
National Primary Schools	18
National-Type Primary Schools ..	18
Reading Strategies	19
Interlanguage Interference	20
II	
LITERATURE REVIEW	21
Reading :A Psycholinguistic Process .	21
Bottom-up Top-down Views	23
Miscues and Reading Strategies	26
Miscues and Contextual Cues	31
Language Cues and Reading	
Strategies	34
Miscues and the Process of	
Reading Acquisition	35
Proficient and Less Proficient	
Readers	36
Retelling	40
The Reading Process and	
Text Structure	42
III	
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	47
Sampling	47
The School	47
The Subjects	48
The Text	50
Preview	51



	Page
Instruments	51
Cloze Passage	52
Reading Passage	54
Data Gathering Procedure	59
Groundwork	59
The Investigation	60
IV ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS .	70
Results of the Miscue Analysis	70
Question 1	72
Question 2	75
Question 3	90
Question 4	94
Question 5	97
Examples of Two Readers	103
a) Yap	103
b) Khoo	116
Conclusion about the Two Readers	126
V SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	128
Pegagogical Implication	131
Suggestions for Further Research	135
Conclusions	136
BIBLIOGRAPHY	138
ADDITIONAL REFERENCES	144
APPENDIX	
A Cloze Passage	147
B Reading Selection	151
C Miscue Analysis: Questionnaire for Teachers	156
D Preview Exercise	158
E Reading Selection - Teacher's Copy	159



	Page
F Reading Miscue Inventory Questions	165
G Reading Selection - Marked Sample	167
H A Sample Analysis of Miscues - Affendi (NP)	173
I Classification of Miscues - in the Passage from <u>Maimunah</u>	174
J Reading Miscue Inventory Coding Sheet	175
H Additional Tables	176
VITA	181



LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1	Use of Syntactic and Semantic Cues as Strategies in Reading	32
2	Language Cues and Reading Strategies .	35
3	Pupils' Cloze Test Scores and Teachers' Rating	53
4	Teachers' Assessment of the Passage ..	58
5	Rating Scale for Retelling Scores	63
6	Mean Scores, Standard Deviations and t-values of Miscues	74
7	Summary of Quantitative Analysis	77
8	Retelling Scores	94
9	Mean Scores for Graphic and Grammatical Utilization, and Retelling According to Age Classification	98
10	Yap (NTP)- Analysis of Miscue Totals .	111
11	Yap's Strengths	111
12	Khoo (NP)- Analysis of Miscue Totals .	124
13	Khoo's Strengths	124
14	Types of Miscues Made by the NTP Pupils	176
15	Types of Miscues Made by the NP Pupils	177
16	Miscues Per Hundred Words (MPHW) and Percentage of Right Words (RW)	178
17	Graphic Similarity	178
18	Phonic Similarity	179
19	Grammatical Functions of Miscues	179
20	Meaning Change	180



LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure	
1 Miscue Totals of the National-Type Primary School (NTP) pupils and the National Primary School (NP) pupils ...	73
2 Retelling Scores of the National-Type Primary School (NTP) pupils and the National Primary (NP) pupils	92
3 Relationship between RW and Retelling Scores	95



An abstract of the thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Pertanian Malaysia as partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science

MISCUE ANALYSIS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF TWO GROUPS OF PUPILS IN A SECONDARY SCHOOL

by

LEE POH LE

June 1995

Chairman : Sali Zaliha Mustapha, Ph. D.

Faculty : Educational Studies

This study made use of Miscue Analysis as a psycholinguistic approach to investigate the reading strategies of a group of English as a Second Language pupils from the National-Type Primary Schools and National Primary Schools who are currently in Sekolah Menengah Bandar Baru Seri Petaling in Kuala Lumpur. The Reading Miscue Inventory by Yetta Goodman and Burke (1972) was modified for data collection in this study. The main question addressed here is whether the National-Type Primary and the National Primary pupils make the same miscues in oral reading and if they do,



to what extent do these miscues commensurate with their comprehension of the text as revealed in their retelling scores.

The findings show that both the National-Type Primary (NTP) and the National Primary (NP) pupils primarily made miscues in this order; substitutions, omissions and insertions. The NTP pupils made more miscues than the NP pupils. Both groups of pupils relied heavily on graphophonemic cues when they fail to break a code with the syntactic and semantic cues. Their omissions of inflected plural and past tense endings showed that they were conscious of word-economy in processing text. However the NTP pupils were less efficient than the NP pupils in the use of reading strategies and were therefore weaker readers resulting in poorer comprehension. Age had a negative effect on the NTP pupils.

Miscue Analysis could be further modified for use in schools as a research tool.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti
Pertanian Malaysia sebagai memenuhi sebahagian daripada
syarat keperluan ijazah Master Sains

**ANALISIS KESILAPAN KIU: KAJIAN PERBANDINGAN ANTARA DUA
KUMPULAN MURID DI SEBUAH SEKOLAH MENENGAH**

oleh

LEE POH LE

June 1995

Pengerusi : Sali Zaliha Mustapha, Ph. D.

Fakulti : Pengajian Pendidikan

Kajian ini menggunakan Analisis Kesilapan Kiu sebagai pendekatan psikolinguistik untuk menyelidik strategi-strategi pembacaan sekumpulan pembaca Bahasa Inggeris sebagai Bahasa Kedua. Mereka terdiri daripada murid-murid Sekolah Rendah Jenis Kebangsaan (SRJK) dan Sekolah Rendah Kebangsaan (SRK) yang menuntut di Sekolah Menengah Bandar Baru Seri Petaling, Kuala Lumpur. "Reading Miscue Inventory" (1972) oleh Yetta Goodman dan Burke diubahsuai untuk kegiatan pengumpulan data kajian ini.



Persoalan penyelidikan ini berarah kepada perbandingan kesilapan kiu di antara kedua-dua kumpulan murid kajian ini, dan juga perbandingan kesilapan kiu dengan tahap kefahaman teks yang mereka baca dalam sesi penceritaan semula teks yang dibaca.

Keputusan analisis menunjukkan bahawa kedua-dua kumpulan murid kajian ini melakukan kesilapan kiu semasa membaca. Penggantian perkataan yang tidak diketahui, ketinggalan perkataan serta penyisipan perkataan atau ayat yang dibaca dengan perkataan sendiri merupakan beberapa kesilapan kiu yang dilakukan oleh kedua-dua kumpulan murid.

Murid-murid SRJK melakukan lebih kesilapan kiu berbanding dengan murid-murid SRK. Kedua-dua kumpulan murid kajian ini amat bergantung kepada isyarat grafonemik apabila mereka gagal meneka sesuatu perkataan dengan menggunakan isyarat sintaktik ataupun isyarat semantik. Ketinggalan imbuhan akhir yang dilakukan oleh mereka menunjukkan bahawa mereka cuba mengurangkan penggunaan perkataan semasa memproses teks. Walau bagaimanapun murid-murid SRJK kurang mahir dari segi penggunaan strategi pembacaan berbanding dengan murid-murid SRK. Oleh itu, kumpulan murid ini

lebih lemah dalam kefahaman. Usia seseorang didapati memberi kesan negatif bagi murid-murid SRJK.

Analisis kesilapan kiu boleh diubahsuaikan lagi untuk digunakan sebagai alat penyelidikan di sekolah.



CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Context of the Research Problem

Reading is a vital skill that holds the key to the whole world of thoughts and imaginations. However, little attention has been paid to develop this important skill among children in schools. It is a known fallacy that children after being taught the rudiments and mechanics of reading will develop the skill of reading (Southgate, Arnold and Johnson, 1981). As English is taught as a Second Language in schools in Malaysia, the ability to read in English is made even more difficult. The lack of ability to read in English will be a drawback for learners who will pursue their education in institutions of higher learning as most reference materials are still in English. Therefore, the teaching of reading in English should not be treated lightly. A more in-depth knowledge of the reading process would be required in this case.

However, there are conflicting views about the reading process. Rosenblatt (1978) and Zamel (1992)



claim that people generate and organize their memories related to a topic, allow their thinking to be guided externally, assimilate new ideas, accommodate old ones and then re-organize them in reading. Therefore, there is a continuous interaction between the reader and the writer. It is this interaction which results in an interpretation of the writer's message.

On the other hand, there are also researchers and theorists, like Shannon and Rose (cited in Zamel, 1992) who have suggested that the reading process has been overly simplified by text writers. They feel that reading is not a receptive and static process, but rather, one that is active and participatory, which involves dynamic contributions of the reader. Bartholomae (1986) holds a similar view that reading has been overly simplified, citing evidence from the language used in reading instructions and test questions which call for predetermined answers. This model of reading has reduced the purpose of reading to merely answering questions that follow a text (Barnett, 1989). A reader would, therefore, feel that he has understood a text well if he can answer all the questions that follow it (Belanoff, 1987). Seen from these viewpoints, we would then be faced with these questions: What, then, is the reading process; and, how can we go about to learn more about this process?



Earlier attempts to analyse this reading process have not been able to trace the psychological aspect in reading. Huey (1908) fails to analyse what actually goes on in the mind of the reader when he interacts with the text. This view is supported by Southgate et al. (1981) who claim that silent reading enhances the problem of this investigation.

Goodman (1967, 1969, and 1981), a psycholinguist, finds that miscue analysis can be used to explain the reading process. This view is supported by Southgate et al. (1981). According to them, miscue analysis examines the errors made by readers in oral reading and attempts to explain what the readers do through these miscues. Thus, research using miscue analysis, will view reading from the psycholinguistic point of view (Goodman, 1967).

According to Goodman (1976) and Rumelhart (1977), three major cues are used by readers to interact with the text in reading: semantic, syntactic and graphophonemic. These three cues will give insight into the process of comprehending text as they will reveal:

- (1) what initiates the reading;
- (2) how readers process information; and
- (3) how readers organize information.



Applied linguistics has used oral reading to analyse this complex process. Kenneth Goodman and Yetta Goodman (1981) are of the opinion that errors in reading are not the result of failure to comprehend, but rather, the evidence of the effects of psycholinguistic processes that have taken unexpected turns resulting in miscues. The nature of these miscues reveals the underlying cognitive schema that guides a person's comprehension of the text.

Accuracy of visual and auditory strategies is then of prime importance. To arrive at the meaning, the reader must go through a language process that depends largely on sound equivalence for words.

Goodman (1967), however, views that reading begins with a hypothesis or prediction about the meaning of what is to be read. Readers must make initial use of their prior knowledge and language competence. The reader does not need to look at or pronounce every letter or word to get to the meaning. The reader samples and selects from the text only the most useful information with the intent of confirming expectations.

Rumelhart (1977), on the other hand, suggests that the reading process may be initiated either by the print or by the reader's expectations. The reader makes use of whatever strategies needed at that time. This view is further supported by Zamel (1992) who sees reading as an active engagement through which meaning is produced. Pehrson and Robinson (1985:5) sum up that "reading begins and ends with meaning". The outcome of reading then, will also depend on the reader's knowledge and experience of the world to create an affective proximity with the writer. However, reading selections in school textbooks do not usually cater for individual pupil's need or even individual school need. Therefore, the way reading is taught in schools, suggests to pupils that reading is a receptive and static process. It is an act of finding a particular idea in the text. Bartholomae (1986) points out that reading instructions support this approach to reading. Pupils need not have to understand the text well to be able to answer test questions given at the end of the reading text. They only need to look through the text progressively, following the questions as they go to answer them (Barnett, 1989). As such pupils see the purpose of reading as a process required prior to answering questions following a text (Belanoff, 1987). Pupils have come to



believe that 'reading is the attempt to memorize text which someone else selects so that one can reproduce factual information when questioned' (Shannon, 1989:91). In this context, meaning in a text is predetermined and the reader has to find this out. This has caused a general decline in the ability to read well among pupils today.

In an ESL situation, this problem is further compounded. Emphasis on determining and identifying the meaning in a text will give rise to ineffective reading strategy like word for word reading. Hirsch (1987) agrees that this form of reading denies the reader his own transactions with a text and the understanding that reading involves such transactions (Rosenblatt, 1978; Freire, 1983; Bartholomae and Petrosky, 1987).

Reading theory and research in second language (Carell, Devine and Eskey, 1988; Barnett, 1989; Mikulecky, 1990; Grabe, 1991) also stress the importance of recognizing that readers bring meaning to the text while interacting with it. However, reading selections for classroom use do not give enough room for teachers to interact with them in a meaningful

way. The teacher's role is reduced to only monitoring and managing students (Shannon, 1989). But, if reading is affected by purpose and goal, it should involve recursiveness which then makes the text malleable and open to interpretations.

On the other hand, if reading ends with meaning, that is, a developed meaning arising from readers' comprehension of the text, it is then imperative that a device be used to gauge this comprehension. Guszak (1972) states that retelling of the material by the readers will demonstrate their understanding of it. Gershon (1985), however, cautions that retelling is a weak instrument to assess comprehension as this requires the reader to recall in order to retell. Thus, probing questions and prompts need to be used to help readers retell when necessary during the retelling session to evaluate their comprehension of the text read.

Statement of the Problem

The reading process is difficult to understand. Yet reading plays an important role in the ESL



curriculum. Therefore, the reading process should be further investigated so that the teaching of reading strategies can be improved.

Lee Su Kim (1983) and Spykerman (1988) carried out researches on the reading process among Malaysian pupils. They found that miscues made in oral reading can be analysed quantitatively and qualitatively to investigate the reading process (Goodman and Burke, 1972 and Spykerman, 1988). It is the aim of this study to investigate the effect of miscues on the comprehension of a text among Form Two pupils in a secondary school.

The purpose of this study gives rise to two primary questions:

- (i) Do readers who were formerly from the National-Type Primary Schools (NTP) and the National Primary Schools (NP) differ in using miscues as strategies in oral reading ?
- (ii) If they do, to what extent do these miscues in oral reading affect retelling which would be used as a comprehension measure ?

It is hoped that the implications from the results of the analysis would help educators plan and evaluate their reading programmes.

Objectives of the Study

It is within the context of these propositions that this study attempts to analyse the reading process of two groups of ESL readers, that is, pupils from the National-Type Primary Schools (NTP) and pupils from the National Primary Schools (NP). Both groups of pupils are in Form Two and are following the English Language programme at the "intermediate" level. This intermediacy is determined by the Curriculum and Development Centre of the Ministry of Education (English Language Syllabus for Secondary Schools, 1989).

The NP pupils have completed six years of primary education where English is introduced as a Second Language from year one. The NTP pupils have completed six years of primary education where English is introduced only in the third year of their primary education. These NTP pupils do a year of intensive

course to equip them with sufficient skills in the English Language to meet the requirement of the Form One English Language programme. Both groups of pupils are taught English as a Second Language.

Specifically, this study seeks answers to the following questions:

- (1) Is there a significant difference in the total number of miscues used between the NTP pupils and the NP pupils ?
- (2) Is there a marked difference in the type of miscues (substitution, omission, insertion, repetition, pause and reversal) used by the NTP pupils and the NP pupils in reading ?
- (3) Is there a significant difference in comprehension between the two groups based on retelling ?
- (4) Is there a relationship between their miscue scores and retelling scores ?
- (5) Does a difference in age affect the strategies used in reading?

Significance of the Study

Reading is an important skill in any language teaching and learning context. As a teacher, one ought to have a more in-depth understanding of the reading process. This understanding will make it possible for the teacher to place the pupils at the correct level in the reading programme, supply appropriate reading material, and, at the same time recommend recreational reading for them (Burns and Roe, 1989). Thus, we need to know the strategies the readers use in comprehending text.

This understanding of the reading process will also help learners build up confidence in reading. Therefore, a research into the reading process is important so that one can understand what the average learners at the intermediate level do while reading.

An unpublished earlier study was done by the researcher on three hundred and sixty-four pupils to verify the achievement of the NTP pupils and the NP pupils based on their English Language mid-year examination results. It was found that more NP pupils (26% NP as opposed to 4% NTP) were placed at the top