

## **UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA**

# MICROBIAL GROWTH, ACIDIFICATION PROPERTIES AND FORMATION OF METABOLITES IN FERMENTED MILK PRODUCTS USING VARIOUS STARTER CULTURE COMBINATIONS

**AREZOU AGHLARA** 

FSTM 2008 2



#### MICROBIAL GROWTH, ACIDIFICATION PROPERTIES AND FORMATION OF METABOLITES IN FERMENTED MILK PRODUCTS USING VARIOUS STARTER CULTURE COMBINATIONS

By

AREZOU AGHLARA

Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, in Fulfilment of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

January 2008



#### Dedicated to

my parents and my two brothers,

who have always stayed beside me despite the distance,

who received less of my attention while this project was being done,

for their unwavering support and encouragement during this time.



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

#### MICROBIAL GROWTH, ACIDIFICATION PROPERTIES AND FORMATION OF METABOLITES IN FERMENTED MILK PRODUCTS USING VARIOUS STARTER CULTURE COMBINATIONS

By

#### **AREZOU AGHLARA**

January 2008

#### Chairman : Professor Mohd Yazid Abdul Manap, PhD

Faculty : Food Science and Technology

The present study investigated the microbial growth, acidification properties and changes in key metabolite compounds during fermentation of sterilized reconstituted skim milk. Fermentation was performed by using single and mixed cultures of *Lactobacillus acidophilus* LA5 (probiotic strain; A), *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 (B), *Streptococcus thermophilus* TH4 (T) and *Kluyveromyces marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4 (M). Fermentation time, lag time and final titratable acidity ranged from 225 to 721 min, 2 to 31 min and 0.76 to 1.25 % (w/v) lactic acid, respectively. At the end of fermentation, the highest counts of *L. acidophilus* LA5, *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12, *S. thermophilus* TH4 and *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4 were 8.42, 8.56, 8.91 and 8.69 log<sub>10</sub> cfu mL<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. In all single and mixed cultures containing *L. acidophilus* LA5, the viable probiotic cell count met the minimum proposed effective level required to observe a positive health effect.



In this study, product fermented with traditional yoghurt culture (mixed culture of *L*. *delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 and *S. thermophilus* TH4) showed the highest titratable acidity and the lowest pH during entire storage period. The most stable product in terms of the changing in titratable acidity during storage period was prepared with single culture of *S. thermophilus* TH4. However, this strain was found likely the responsible of post-acidification when incorporated into the mixed cultures. Viable counts of all lactic acid bacteria and yeast in single and mixed cultures always remained higher than  $7 \log_{10}$  cfu mL<sup>-1</sup>, however, fluctuation in their counts was observed during 4 weeks of refrigerated storage.

Changes in lactose and total glucose and galactose were monitored during fermentation and cold storage by using high performance liquid chromatography (HPLC) coupled to refractive index (RI) detector. Lactose was utilized by all starter culture combinations during fermentation and storage time. The consumption of lactose during fermentation and storage was significantly (P < 0.05) higher in single culture of *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4. The data obtained in this study showed that the changes in total content of glucose and galactose was not paralleled with the changes in lactose content during fermentation and storage.

Changes in concentration of citric, orotic, pyruvic, succinic, lactic, formic, acetic, uric, propionic, butyric and hippuric acids was carried out using HPLC coupled to ultraviolet (UV) detector. In general, variable amount of each organic acid was formed with different starter culture used in this study during fermentation process and storage.



However, lactic acid was found to be the most abundant organic acid in majority of the products at the end of fermentation and throughout the storage time. The final concentration of lactic acid at the end of fermentation was ranged between 1167 and 8895 mg L<sup>-1</sup>. The most prominent organic acid in products fermented with single culture of *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 and mixed culture of *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 and mixed culture of *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 and *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* was acetic and citric acid, respectively, followed by lactic acid.

Forty volatile compounds were detected using gas chromatography coupled to time-offlight mass spectrometer (GC-TOFMS). The representative of the alcohols (i.e. ethanol), ketones (i.e. ethyl acetate and ethyl butyrate), esters (i.e. 2-butanone, acetone, 3-hydroxy-2-butanone or acetoin and 2,3-butanedione or diacetyl) and aldehydes (i.e. acetaldehyde) were considered for further analysis. The release of the corresponding volatile flavor compounds into the headspace was monitored during fermentation and 4 weeks of refrigerate storage, using GC coupled to flame ionization detector (FID). In fermented products devoid of *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4, acetoin was seen to be the most prominent volatile flavor substance at the end of fermentation, ranging from 59.5 to 104.2 mg L<sup>-1</sup>. While, in those co-inoculated with the yeast strain ethanol was observed to be the most abundant volatile flavor compound ranged between 964 and 6522 mg L<sup>-1</sup>.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia Sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah

#### PERTUMBUHAN MIKROORGANISMA, PENGASIDAN DAN PEMBENTUKAN METABOLISMA SEJUK PRODUK SUSU TERFERMENTASI MENGGUNAKAN KOMBINASI PELBAGAI KULTUR PEMULA

Oleh

#### **AREZOU AGHLARA**

Januari 2008

#### Pengerusi : Profesor Mohd Yazid Abdul Manap, PhD

Fakulti : Sains dan Teknologi Makanan

Penyelidikan ini mengkaji tentang pertumbuhan mikrob, sifat pengasidan, dan perubahan dalam penentuan hasil sebatian metabolisma semasa fermentasi susu skim terbentuk semula disterilkan. Fermentasi dijalankan menggunakan kultur tunggal dan kultur campuran *Lactobacilluc acidophilus* LA5 (strain probiotik; A), *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 (B), *Streptococcus thermophilus* TH4 (T) dan *Kluyveromyces marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4 (M). Masa fermentasi, masa adaptasi, dan julat keasidan terboleh titrat akhir, masing-masing adalah 225-721 min, 2-31 min dan 0.76-1.25 % (w/v) asid laktik. Di akhir fermentasi, pengiraan tertinggi bagi *L. acidophilus* LA5, *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12, *S. thermophilus* TH4 dan *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4, masing-masing adalah 8.42, 8.56, 8.91, dan 8.69 log<sub>10</sub> cfu mL<sup>-1</sup>. Dalam semua kultur tunggal dan kultur campuran yang mengandungi *L.acidophilus* LA5, pengiraan sel probiotik hidup telah mencapai tahap unjuran keberkesanan minimum yang diperlukan bagi memperlihatkan kesan positif keatas kesihatan.



Dalam kajian ini juga, produk terfermentasi dengan kultur yogurt tradisional (kultur campuran *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 and *S. thermophilus* TH4) telah menunjukkan keasidan terboleh titrat yang paling tinggi dan pH yang paling rendah semasa keselurahan tempoh penyimpanannya. Produk yang paling stabil dalam terma perubahan keasidan terboleh titrat semasa tempoh penyimpanan telah dicampurkan bersama kultur tunggal *S. thermophilus* TH4. Walaubagaimana pun, strain ini telah didapati berkemungkinan penyebab kepada post-pengasidan bila mana digabungkan dalam kultur campuran. Pengiraan sel hidup bagi LAB dan yis sentiasa kekal lebih tinggi dari 7 log<sub>10</sub> cfu mL<sup>-1</sup>, walaubagaimana pun, dalam beberapa produk yang lain, setiap perubahan dalam pengiraannya diperhatikan semasa 4 minggu dalam penyimpanan berhawa dingin.

Perubahan pada laktosa dan jumlah glukosa dan galaktosa dipantau semasa fermentasi dan penyimpanan berhawa dingin dengan menggunakan kromatografi cecair berprestasi tinggi (HPLC) yang digabungkan bersama pengesan indeks biasan (RI). Penggunaan laktosa diperhatikan dalam semua produk dan *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4 menunjukkan ia lebih tinggi secara signifikannya (P < 0.05) terhadap penggunaan laktosa dalam penyimpanan berhawa dingin. Ianya diperhatikan bahawa perubahan dalam jumlah kandungan glukosa dan galaktosa tidak berkait dengan asimilasi laktosa semasa fermentasi.

Penyaringan kepekatan asid sitrik, orotik, piruvik, suksinik, laktik, formik, asetik, urik, propionik, butirik dan hippurik, dijalankan menggunakan HPLC digabungkan bersama



pengesan ultraviolet (UV). Secara amnya, jumlah setiap asid organik yang terhasil adalah berbeza-beza mengikut kultur pemula semasa proses fermentasi dan penyimpanan. Walaubagaimana pun, didapati bahawa asid laktik adalah asid organik yang paling banyak didapati dalam majoriti produk-produk di akhir proses fermentasi dan keseluruhan masa penyimpanan. Kandungan akhir laktik asid adalah di antara 1167 dan 8895 mgL<sup>-1</sup>. Asid organic yang paling menonjol dalam produk yang defermentasikan oleh kultur tunggal *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 dan kultur campuran *L. delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* LB12 dan *K. marxianus* subsp. *marxianus* LAF4, masing-masing adalah asid asetik dan asid sitrik, diikuti oleh asid laktik.

Empat puluh sebatian mudah meruap telah dikesan pada mulanya menggunakan kromatografi gas dan digabungkan bersama spektrometer jisim 'time-of-flight' (GC-TOFMS). Beberapa kumpulan sebatian mudah merup yang berbeza iaitu, alcohol (etanol), keton (etil asetat dan etil butirat), ester (2-butanol, aseton, 3-hidroksil-2butanol 2,3-butanedion atau diasetil) dan aldehid atau asetoin dan (asetaldehid) dipartimbangkan untuk analisis selanjutnya. Pembebasan sebatian perasa mudah meruap yang setara ke kawasan "headspace" dipantau semasa fermentasi dan penyimpanan sejuk selama 4 minggu, menggunakan kromatografi gas (GC) yang digandingkan bersama pengesan pengionan nyalaan (FID). Dalam produk fermentasi yang tidak menggunakan K. marxianus subsp. marxianus LAF4, asetoin dilihat sebagai bahan perasa mudah meruap yang paling menonjol sekali, di antara 59.5 dan 104.2 mg L<sup>-1</sup>. Walaubagaimana pun, bagi produk fermentasi yang menggunakan strain yis sebagai



inokulat utama, etanol dilihat sebagai sebatian perasa mudah meruap yang paling banyak sekali, di antara 964 dan 6522 mg  $L^{-1}$ .



#### **AKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First, I wish to thank God for all the opportunities given me and for allowing me to complete this thesis.

My deep sense of gratitude and respect to Prof. Mohd Yazid Abd Manap (Faculty of Food Science and Technology, Department of Food Service and Management) as a main supervisor of this thesis for his continuous guidance, support and advice.

I would like to say my deepest appreciation to Associate Prof. Dr. Shuhaimi Mustafa (Faculty of Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences, Department of Microbiology) as a co-supervisor of this project for his invaluable advice, suggestion, guidance and encouragement to complete this research.

Many thanks to Dr. Rosfarizan Mohamad (Faculty of Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences, Department of Bioprocess Technology), the other co-supervisor, for all she has done for this work.

My sincere gratitude and respect to my beloved parents and my two brothers for their immense love, patience, support, and understanding during not only this project but also my entire life.



I also wish to acknowledge to Ms. Tneh Yen Kiaw from Chr-Hansen (Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia) for donation of bacteria and yeast cultures. My special thanks to Mr. Halim (Faculty of Food Science and Technology) for his kindness and great advice while I was doing HPLC work. Many thanks to the staff of Faculty of Food Science and Technology, especially Mr. Azman and Ms. Raunah for their help.

Lastly, I would like to thank friends and Probiotic Laboratory members, especially Stephenie, Ruzaina, Barka and Anas for their assistance.





This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

#### Mohd Yazid Abdul Manap, PhD

Professor Faculty of Food Science and Technology Universiti Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

#### Shuhaimi Mustafa, PhD

Associate Professor Faculty of Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences Universiti Putra Malaysia (Member)

#### Rosfarizan Mohamad, PhD

Lecturer Faculty of Biotechnology and Biomolecular Sciences Universiti Putra Malaysia (Member)

> **AINI IDERIS, PhD** Professor and Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:



#### **DECLARATION**

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at UPM or at any other institution.

AREZOU AGHLARA

Date:



## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

DEDICATION	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ABSTRAK	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	Х
APPROVAL	xii
DECLARATIONS	xiv
LIST OF TABLES	xviii
LIST OF FIGURES	XX
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XXV

### CHAPTER

1	INT	RODUCTION	1				
2	LITI	LITERATURE REVIEW					
	2.1	Starter Culture	6				
		2.1.1 Lactic Starter Culture	8				
		2.1.2 Lactic-yeast Starter Culture	11				
		2.1.3 Lactic-mold Starter Culture	12				
	2.2	Fermented Milk	13				
		2.2.1 Lactic Fermented Milk	14				
		2.2.2 Lactic-alcoholic Fermented Milk	15				
	2.3	Metabolism of LAB in Milk	18				
		2.3.1 Carbohydrate Uptake in LAB	18				
		2.3.2 Citrate Uptake in LAB	20				
		2.3.3 Formation of Secondary Metabolites in LAB	22				
	2.4	Metabolism of Yeasts in Milk	27				
	2.5	Microbial Interaction	31				
		2.5.1 Microbial Interaction in Dairy Products	32				
3	MAT	FERIALS AND METHODS	43				
	3.1	Preparation of Concentrated Starter Culture	43				
		3.1.1 Microorganisms	43				
		3.1.2 Media	43				
		3.1.3 Method of Preparation	44				
	3.2	Production of Fermented Milk and Sampling	45				
		3.2.1 Material	45				
		3.2.2 Fermentation Process	46				
	3.3	Enumeration of LAB and Yeast	47				
		3.3.1 Materials	47				
		3.3.2 Method of Enumeration	47				

3.4	Measu	uring of Acidification Properties	48
	3.4.1	Chemicals and Reagents	49
	3.4.2	Fermentation Time and Lag Time	49
	3.4.3	Measuring of the pH and Titratable Acidity	49
3.5	Measu	uring of Carbohydrates	50
		Chemicals and Reagents	50
		Extraction and Separation of Carbohydrates	50
3.6		uring of Organic Acids	51
		Chemicals and Reagents	51
		Extraction and Separation of Organic Acids	52
3.7	Devel	opment of HS-SPME Procedure for Semi Quantification	
	of Vol	latile Flavor Compounds in Fermented Milks	53
	3.7.1	Chemicals and Reagents	53
	3.7.2	HS-SPME Procedure	53
	3.7.3	Gas Chromatographic Conditions (GC-FID and GC-	
		MS)	54
	3.7.4	Experimental Design and Statistical Analysis	55
3.8	Chara	cterization of Volatile Flavor Compounds	59
3.9	Statist	tical Analysis	59
		ND DISCUSSION	60
4.1		fication Properties of the Starter Cultures	60
	4.1.1	Fermentation Time and Lag Time	60
	4.1.2	1 5 6	64
	4.1.3	1 0	
		Storage	67
4.2		th and Survival of the LAB and Yeast during	
		entation and Cold Storage	73
		L. acidophilus LA5	73
		L. delbrueckii subsp. bulgaricus LB12	79
		S. thermophilus TH4	83
	4.2.4	1	87
4.3		ges in Carbohydrates during Fermentation and Cold	
	Storag		91
	4.3.1	Glucose and Galactose	91
	4.3.2	Lactose	97
4.4		ation of Organic Acids during Fermentation and Cold	
	Storag		104
		Citric Acid	104
		Orotic Acid	109
	4.4.3	5	110
	4.4.4		115
	4.4.5		120
	4.4.6		125
	4.4.7		125
	4.4.8	Uric Acid	131



		4.4.9 Propionic Acid	135	
		4.4.10 Butyric Acid	140	
		4.4.11 Hippuric Acid	143	
	4.5	Formation of Volatile Compounds during Fermentation and		
		Cold Storage	144	
		4.5.1 Development of the HS-SPME-GC-FID Method for		
		Semi Quantification of Volatile Flavor Compounds in		
		Fermented Milk	144	
		4.5.2 Monitoring of the Volatile Flavor Compounds during		
		Fermentaion and Cold Storage	171	
4	CC	ONCLUSION	213	
<b>REF</b>	ERENC	CES	218 234	
	APPENDICES			
-	BIODATA OF THE AUTHOR			
LIST	LIST OF PUBLICATIONS 2:			





# Table Starter cultures used in different types of fermented milk

2.1

3.1	Codes for LAB and yeast strains combinations used for production of single and mixed DVS cultures and fermented milks	45
3.2	Factors and their levels used in $2^{5-1}$ fractional factorial design	56
3.3	Design matrix in the $2^{5-1}$ fractional factorial design	56
3.4	Factors and their levels used for the optimization of experimental conditions	57
3.5	Design matrix for optimization of experimental conditions	58
4.1	Lag time (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) of DVS cultures used for manufacture of fermented milks	63
4.2	Changes in count of <i>L. acidophilus</i> LA5 (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) during fermentation of milk with different DVS cultures	75
4.3	Changes in count of <i>L. acidophilus</i> LA5 (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) in milk fermented with different DVS starter culture during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	78
4.4	Changes in count of <i>L. delbrueckii</i> subsp. <i>bulgaricus</i> LB12 (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) during fermentation of milk with different DVS cultures	80
4.5	Changes in count of <i>L. delbrueckii</i> subsp. <i>bulgaricus</i> LB12 (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) in milk fermented with different DVS starter culture during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	82
4.6	Changes in count of <i>S. thermophilus</i> TH4 (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) during fermentation of milk with different DVS cultures	84
4.7	Changes in count of <i>S. thermophilus</i> TH4 (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) in milk fermented with different DVS starter culture during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	86
4.8	Changes in count of <i>K. marxianus</i> subsp. <i>marxianus</i> (mean $\pm$ SD, n = 3) during fermentation of milk with different DVS cultures	88
4.9	Changes in count of K. marxianus subsp. marxianus LAF4 (mean $\pm$	



	SD, n = 3) in milk fermented with different DVS starter culture during 4 weeks of storage at 4 $^{\circ}$ C	90
4.10	Linear retention indices, similarity and FID peak area (%) of the representative volatile flavor compounds in kefir sample	145
4.11	ANOVA results obtained for central composite design: (a) P-value and (b) F-ratio	160
4.12	Performance characteristic of target volatile flavor compounds in fermented milk sample	167
4.13	RSD% of target volatile flavor compounds in fermented milk sample	168
4.14	Concentrations of target volatile flavor compounds in seven commercial fermented milk products in Malaysia	170

## LIST OF FIGURES



## Figure

2.1	Carbohydrate uptake and metabolism by homofermentative lactic acid bacteria	19
2.2	Generalized scheme for the fermentation of glucose in lactic acid bacteria	20
2.3	Generalized scheme for the formation of important metabolic products from pyruvate in lactic acid bacteria	22
4.1	The time corresponding to the pH of sampling during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures and (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	62
4.2	Development in titratable acidity during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	66
4.3	pH reduction in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 $^{\circ}$ C	69
4.4	Post-acidification in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at $4  ^{\circ}C$	72
4.5	Changes in total glucose and galactose content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	94
4.6	Changes in total glucose and glucose content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	96
4.7	Changes in lactose content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	100
4.8	Changes in lactose content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	103
4.9	Changes in citric acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and	



4.10

4.11

4.12

4.13

4.14

4.15

4.16

4.17

4.18

4.19

Changes in citric acid content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	108
Changes in pyruvic acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	112
Changes in pyruvic content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at $4 ^{\circ}C$	114
Changes in succinic acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	117
Changes in succinic content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at $4 ^{\circ}C$	119
Changes in lactic acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	122
Changes in lactic acid content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	124
Changes in acetic acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	128
Changes in acetic acid content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	130
Changes in uric acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	132

4.20 Changes in uric acid content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter



	cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	134
4.21	Changes in propionic acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	137
4.22	Changes in propionic content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	139
4.23	Changes in butyric acid content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	141
4.24	Changes in butyric content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at $4 ^{\circ}C$	142
4.25	Peak area of (a) each volatile flavor compound and (b) total peak area, in stirring and static conditions	147
4.26	Effect of salt type on (a) peak area of each volatile flavor compound and (b) the total peak area	149
4.27	Effect of different SPME fiber coating on (a) peak area of each volatile flavor compound and (b) total peak area	151
4.28	Pareto chart of the main effects in the factorial design for the volatile compounds in fermented milk	155
4.29	Fitted response surfaces: peak area of volatile compounds vs. statistically significant interaction effects	165
4.30	Changes in acetaldehyde content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	174
4.31	Changes in acetaldehyde content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	176
4.32	Changes in acetone content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	179
4.33	Changes in acetone content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter	117



	cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	181
4.34	Changes in ethyl acetate content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	183
4.35	Changes in ethyl acetate content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	185
4.36	Changes in 2-butanone content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	187
4.37	Changes in 2-butanone content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C	188
4.38	Changes in ethanol content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures of LAB, (b) single starter culture of the yeast, (c) double starter cultures of LAB, (d) double starter culture of LAB and the yeast, (e) triple and quadruple starter cultures	193
4.39	Changes in ethanol content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures of LAB, (b) single starter culture of the yeast, (c) double starter cultures of LAB, (d) double starter culture of LAB and the yeast, (e) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at $4 ^{\circ}\text{C}$	196
4.40	Changes in 2,3-butanedione content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	200
4.41	Changes in 2,3-butanedione content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at $4 ^{\circ}C$	202
4.42	Changes in ethyl butyrate content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures	204
4.43 4.44	Changes in ethyl butyrate content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 $^{\circ}$ C Changes in 3-hydroxy-2-butanone content during fermentation of milk with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c)	206



trii	ble	and	quadru	ple	starter	cultures
	~					

4.45 Changes in 3-hydroxy-2-butanone content in milk fermented with (a) single starter cultures, (b) double starter cultures, (c) triple and quadruple starter cultures during 4 weeks of storage at 4 °C 211

## LIST OF ABBRIVIATIONS

