

UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

PARTICIPATION OF VOCATIONAL TRAINEES IN A SUPERVISED WORK EXPERIENCE AND THE ACQUISITION OF EMPLOYABILITY SKILLS

SHARIFAH KAMALIAH SYED SOFIAN

FPP 2008 12



PARTICIPATION OF VOCATIONAL TRAINEES IN A SUPERVISED WORK EXPERIENCE AND THE ACQUISITION OF EMPLOYABILITY SKILLS

Ву

SHARIFAH KAMALIAH SYED SOFIAN

Thesis submitted in Fulfilment of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

May 2008



DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to my three lovely daughters; Nuha Nadiah, Nur Hannani and Imtiaz Amani, please remember this...

Today's impossibility becomes tomorrow's reality when human efforts are fueled by enthusiasm and passion.



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

PARTICIPATION OF VOCATIONAL TRAINEES IN A SUPERVISED WORK EXPERIENCE AND THE ACQUISITION OF EMPLOYABILITY SKILLS

By

SHARIFAH KAMALIAH SYED SOFIAN

May 2008

Chairman: Professor Ab. Rahim Bakar, PhD

Faculty: Educational Studies

The purpose of the study was to compare vocational trainees participating and not participating in a supervised work experience on the acquisition of employability skills. The population of the study was vocational trainees who had completed vocational programmes in various fields. They were compared on the basis of whether they had participated in a supervised work experience on the acquisition of employability skills. An equal-sized groups stratified sampling was administered as it was considered useful if one wants to compare the performance of different subgroups, besides, Cohen (1988) prescribed the desirability of equal-sized samples as it can be demonstrated that equal division yields greater power than unequal division does. The process of power analysis determined the sample size. The number of sample was 138. Items

comprising the translated version of SCANS foundation skills and work competencies measured acquisition of employability. The consent to use the translated version in the Malay language was officially given by the Planning and Research Unit of the Technical Department, Ministry of Education of Malaysia. The researcher developed items comprising the background characteristics of respondents based on appropriate literature. The dimensions of self-concept and achievement motivation were adopted from a study by Ab. Rahim (2001). The result showed that participating students achieved a moderately higher level of employability skills compared to students not participating in the supervised work experience. A significant difference in the acquisition of employability skills between participants and non-participants of the supervised work experience was observed at (t = 2.3, p < .05), although the magnitude of the differences in the means was moderately small (eta squared = .04). This result could be regarded as material with the said magnitude as it has the potential of changing the way others think about the phenomenon of having a supervised work experience as a feasible mode in nurturing such skills. Study indicated there were also other factors attributing to the acquisition of employability skills, and these include gender, age, previous work experience, self concept and achievement motivation. However, achievement motivation was found to be significantly related to the acquisition of employability skills. This psychological variable is also a well-known contributor in the development of entrepreneurial skills leading towards the development of successful entrepreneur. In addition, type of school to work transition was found to be significantly related to previous work experience and gender. Therefore, participation of vocational trainees in a supervised work experience influences the acquisition of employability skills, an important psychosocial construct. Evidently, employability skills also identified as career success skills could facilitate youth in negotiating from school to work transition as employers seek potential employees nurtured with such skills.

Abstrak tesis dibentang kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi syarat untuk memperolehi ijazah Doktor Falsafah

PENGLIBATAN PELATIH VOKASIONAL DALAM PENGALAMAN BEKERJA SECARA TERANCANG DAN PENERAPAN KEMAHIRAN KEPEKERJAAN

Oleh

SHARIFAH KAMALIAH SYED SOFIAN

Mei 2008

Pengerusi: Professor Ab. Rahim Bakar, PhD

Fakulti: Pengajian Pendidikan

Kajian ini memperihalkan penglibatan pelatih vokasional dalam pengalaman bekerja secara terancang mempengaruhi pembentukan kemahiran kepekerjaan. Kemahiran kepekerjaan, satu konstruk psikososial yang penting, dikenali juga sebagai kemahiran kejayaan dalam kerjaya. Di antara peranan penting yang dimainkan oleh kemahiran kepekerjaan termasuk; mempermudah proses transisi dari sekolah ke alam kerjaya, disamping itu majikan menghendaki bakal pekerja yang mempamirkan kemahiran tersebut. Isu kemahiran kepekerjaan hangat diperdebatkan bersabit pihak yang patut dipertanggungjawab untuk menerapkannya. Bukti jelas menunjukkan bahawa penglibatan yang berterusan di antara pihak majikan dan pendidik perlu diwujudkan. Peranan institusi keluarga, jaringan dan fisikal dipercayai menyumbang terhadap pembentukan

kemahiran tersebut. Populasi kajian terdiri dari kalangan pelatih vokasional yang telah menamatkan program vokasional dalam pelbagai bidang. Pelatih dikategorikan kepada dua kumpulan; kumpulan yang telah mengalami pengalaman bekerja secara terancang serta kumpulan yang sebaliknya. Perbandingan dibuat untuk meninjau tahap penerapan kemahiran kepekerjaan. Hipotesis utama kajian menyatakan bahawa kumpulan yang mendapat pendedahan memperoleh tahap kemahiran kepekerjaan yang lebih tinggi dari kumpulan yang sebaliknya. Bilangan ahli kedua kumpulan diagihkan secara sama rata. Bentuk teknik persampelan berstrata dipilih kerana ia amat sesuai untuk membandingkan pencapaian dari pelbagai aspek. Menurut Cohen (1998), perbandingan antara kumpulan yang terdiri daripada bilangan ahli yang sama berkemungkinan besar untuk memperolehi kuasa yang lebih tinggi. Proses analisis kuasa diaplikasi untuk menentukan bilangan saiz sampel. Bilangan saiz sampel terdiri dari 138 orang pelatih. Kerangka SCANS terdiri dari kemahiran asas dan kompetensi kepekerjaan yang telah dialih bahasa mengukur tahap penerapan kemahiran kepekerjaan. Kebenaran untuk menggunakan alat ini telah diperoleh dari pihak Jabatan Teknikal, Kementerian Pelajaran Malaysia. Penyelidik membina item maklumat latar belakang responden. Manakala dimensi konsep kendiri dan motivasi pencapaian diadaptasi dari kajian Ab. Rahim (2001). Penemuan menunjukkan bahawa kumpulan yang mendapat pendedahan pengalaman bekerja secara terancang memperolehi tahap kemahiran kepekerjaan yang lebih tinggi daripada kumpulan yang disebaliknya. Terdapat hubungan yang signifikan di antara kumpulan dari segi kemahiran

kepekerjaan pada paras t=2.3, p<.05. Walaupun magnitud perbezaan bersaiz kecil pada tahap eta kuasa dua menunjukkan .04, namun keputusan boleh dianggap penting kerana ia mempunyai potensi untuk mempengaruhi persepsi masyarakat terhadap fenomena penglibatan dalam pengalaman bekerja secara terancang sebagai salah satu mod penting untuk penerapan kemahiran kepekerjaan. Dimensi yang tidak kurang pentingnya adalah kedudukan konstruk motivasi pencapaian sebagai satu penentu dalam pembentukan kemahiran kepekerjaan. Konstruk ini merupakan pembolehubah yang sangat penting dalam pembentukan usahawan. Sehubungan itu, model kajian perlu mengambil kira aspek penambahbaikan ini di dalam perancangan kajian masa depan.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the Name of Allah, The Most Beneficent, The Most Merciful

This thesis is an embodiment of an aspiration realized. It signifies a scholastic pursuit undertaken not in isolation but is affected by influences beyond the work itself. It denotes career as an intersection between the interest of the researcher and the context in which the research is embedded. Among the many 'significant others' to have impacted the crafting of the work includes my PhD supervisory committee comprising of Professor Dr. Othman Dato' Hj Mohamed, Dr. Samsilah Roslan and headed by Professor Dr. Ab. Rahim Bakar. The committee had exercised high degree of professionalism in addressing the researcher's split dream and turning it into fruition. My appreciation goes to the Ministry of Education and the Public Services Department of Malaysia for providing the opportunity to enhance my career development. I wish to extend my thanks to officials from the Ministry of Youth and Sport, Malaysia for making data administration possible. Colleagues at the workplace were morally supportive of my work. My love and affection go to members of my family; my parents, Syed Sofian and Tunku Fauziah, in-laws, Hj. Siraj (deceased) and Siti Musliha for having understood my career aspiration. Afandi Siraj, my husband for believing in me and my quest for excellence. My lovely daughters, Nuha Nadiah, Nur Hannani and Imtiaz Amani for having sacrificed precious moments of growing up enabling their mother to pursue this dream. Your untiring support and love energized me and made my quest seemed effortless. Most importantly you gave meaning to my work. THANK YOU SO MUCH.



I certify that an Examination Committee met on 15 May 2008 to conduct the final examination of Sharifah Kamaliah Syed Sofian on her Doctor of Philosophy thesis entitled "Participation of Vocational Trainees in a Supervised Work Experience and the Acquisition of Employability Skills" in accordance with Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) Act 1980 and Universiti Pertanian Malaysia (Higher Degree) regulations 1981. The Committee recommends that the candidate be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Examination Committee were as follows:

Rahim Md Sail, PhD

Professor Faculty of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

Mohd. Ibrahim b. Nazri, PhD

Associate Professor Faculty of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia (Internal Examiner)

Zakaria b. Abd. Rahman, PhD

Associate Professor Faculty of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia (Internal Examiner)

Matt Baker, PhD

Professor Texas Tech University United States of America (External Examiner)

HASANAH MOHD. GHAZALI, PhD

Professor and Deputy Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 22 July 2008



This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. Members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Ab. Rahim Bakar, PhD

Professor Faculty of Educational Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

Othman b. Dato' Hj. Mohamed, PhD

Professor Faculty of Educational Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia (Member)

Samsilah bt. Roslan, PhD

Lecturer Faculty of Educational Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia (Member)

AINI IDERIS, PhD

Professor and Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date: 14 August 2008



DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at UPM or other institutions.

SHARIFAH KAMALIAH SYED SOFIAN

Date: 16 July 2008



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DEDICATION ABSTRACT ABSTRAK ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS APPROVAL DECLARATION FORM LIST OF TABLES LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	ii vi ix x xii xviii xxi
CHAPTER	
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Nature of the study	1
1.1.1 The acquisition of employability skills	3
1.1.2 The importance of employability skills in an adapti	
transition	5
1.1.3 Skilled career	6
1.1.4 Workplace and the acquisition of employability ski	
1.1.5 The debilitative effects of participation in work	
experience	8
1.1.6 Confounded factors in the acquisition of employate	_
skills	8
1.2 Statement of the Problem	11
1.3 Purpose and Objectives of the study	13
1.4 Hypotheses	14
1.4.1 Major hypothesis	14
1.4.2 Alternative or control hypotheses	15
1.5 Significance of the study	16
1.6 Definitions of terms	18
1.7 Limitation of the study	24
1.8 Delimitation of the study	25



2	REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	27
	2.1 Introduction 2.1.1 Global economy and the preparation of the new workforce	27
	28	
	2.1.2 Career landscape and beyond2.1.3 Global changes and challenges to youths' career	30
	development	35
	2.2 Theoretical Framework	38
	2.3 Vocational and technical education at a glance	41
	2.4 Career development theories and school to work transition	43 44
	2.4.1 Theories relevant to the study2.4.2 The transition model Schlossberg (2004)	44 49
	2.4.2 The transition model Schlossberg (2004) 2.4.3 A model of adaptive transition – Blustein (2000)	4 9
	2.5 Summary and implications	52
	2.6 Studies in school to work transition	5 <u>4</u>
	2.6.1 Summary on studies on school to work transition	70
	2.7 Studies on participation in work experience among	
	71	•
	2.7.1 Perspectives on work experience	73
	2.7.2 Workplace and acquisition of employability skills	81
	2.7.3 Effect of participating in work experience by youths	86
	2.8 Characteristics of post secondary technical and	400
	vocational students	109
	2.9 Summary on the participation of students in work experience	110
	2.10Summary on the relationship between participation in	110
	work experience and acquisition of employability skills	
	111	
	2.11 A glimpse of skill training in Malaysia	113
	2.12 Does a blue-collared career exist?	117
	2.13 Studies on employability	124
	2.13.1 Introduction - the nature of employability	124
	2.13.2 Perspectives on employability skills	136
	2.14 Summary on studies on the discourse of employability	151
	2.15 Employers' perspectives on employability skills – the	151
	discourse of policy of employability 2.16 Factors associated with acquisition of employability	151
		61
	2.17 Other factors facilitating acquisition of employability skills	164
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	164
		166
	<u> </u>	169
		172
	·	174



	2.18 Analyzing and measuring employability2.19 Identification of research gap	176 179
3	RESEARCH METHOD	181
	3.1 Introduction	181
	3.2 The conceptual framework	181
	3.3 Design	183
	3.4 Population	186
	3.5 Sample	189
	3.5.1 Sample size and power analysis	190
	3.6 Instrumentation	193
	3.6.1 Dependent variable	193
	3.6.2 Independent variable	
	197 3.6.3 Extraneous independent variable	
	3.7 Pilot testing	198
	3.8 Data collection	200
	3.9 Data analysis	200
	3.10 Hypotheses	202
	3.10.1 Major hypothesis	202
	3.10.2 Controlled hypotheses	203
4	RESULTS	207
	4.1 Introduction	207
	4.2 The characteristics of vocational trainees	208
	4.2.1 Gender	209
	4.2.2 Age	209
	4.2.3 Parents' occupation	210
	4.2.4 Vocational programmes undertaken by vocational	
	trainees	212
	4.2.5 Reasons for enrolling into current vocation	
	courses	213
	4.2.6 Previous work experience	215
	4.2.7 Career aspirations of vocational trainees	215
	4.2.8 Type of school to work transition	217
	4.2.9 Perception of vocational trainees participating	
	in a supervised work experience on the quality of the	
	work experience	217
	4.2.10 Reasons for perceiving work experience positively	218
	4.2.11 Reasons for perceiving work experience negatively	219
	4.2.12 Self-concept scores of vocational trainees	221
	4.2.13 Achievement motivation scores of vocational trainees	222
	4.3 The acquisition of employability skills among vocational trainees	222
	แลเทษ	444



4.3.1 Acquisition of employability skills among vocati	onal
trainees participating and not participating in a	
supervised work experience	223
4.3.2 Dimensions of employability skills	224
4.4 Dimensions of employability skills acquired by vocations trainees	al 226
4.5 Acquisition of employability skills and types of school to	_
transition	233
4.6 Description of the relationships between acquisition of	
employability skills of vocational trainees and extraneou	s
variables.	235
4.6.1 Acquisition of employability skills by gender	236
4.6.2 Acquisition of employability skills by age	236
4.6.3 Acquisition of employability skills by previous wor	k
experience	x 237
4.6.4 The relationship between acquisition of employab	
skills of vocational trainees and self-concept	238 238
4.6.5 The relationship between acquisition of employab skills of vocational trainees and achievement	ility
motivation	239
	239
4.6.6 Summary of relationships between acquisition of	ondont
employability skills and the extraneous indepo	endent
variables 240	
	nt
4.7 Determining the relationship between major independe	
variables (types of school to work transition) and back variables	_
	241
4.7.1 The relationship between type of school to work	
transition and gender	242
4.7.2 The relationship between type of school to wor	
transition and age	243
4.7.3 The relationship between type of school to wor	
transition and previous work experience	244
4.7.4 The relationship between type of school to wor	
transition and self-concept	246
4.7.5 The relationship between type of school to wor	
transition and achievement motivation	247
4.8 Summary of relationships between extraneous variable	
and type of school to work transition	249
4.9 Controlling for extraneous variable	250
5 SUMMARY, DISCUSSION, AND RECOMMENDATIONS	253
5.1 Rationale and background to the study	253



5.2	Stateme	ent of the problem	256
5.3	Purpose	es and Objectives	258
	Hypothe		259
	<i>-</i> .	Major hypothesis	259
		Control hypotheses	259
5.5		ons of the study	261
		ch method	261
0.0		Population and sample	261
		Design and Procedures	262
5.7	Data An	•	264
			265
5.6		ry of the Findings	203
	5.8.1	To describe vocational trainees on the following	
		characteristics, gender, age, previous work	
		experience, type of school to work transition,	
		self-concept, achievement motivation and acquisition	
		of employability skills.	265
	5.8.2	To compare the level of employability skills acquisition	1
		of vocational trainees participating in a supervised	
		work experience programme with trainees not	
		participating in such a programme	271
	5.8.3	To determine the relationships between vocational	
		trainees' acquisition of employability skills with the	
		following characteristics, gender, age, previous work	
		experience, self-concept and achievement motivation	271
	5.8.4	To determine the relationships between type of	
		school to work transition with the following	
		characteristics, gender, age, previous work	
		experience, self-concept and achievement motivation	272
	5.8.5	Controlling for achievement motivation	274
5.9		ion of findings	275
0.0		School to work transition	275
		Participation of vocational trainees in a supervised	
	0.0.2	work experience	278
	503	The effect of participation in a supervised work	210
	0.0.0	experience and the acquisition of employability skills	282
	501	The acquisition of sub skills within employability skills	285
	5.9.5		203
	5.9.5	·	202
	E 0 6	employability skills	292
	5.9.6	Achievement motivation and its relationship with	204
5 4	0 0	acquisition of employability skill	294
	0 Conclu		295
	1 Implica		297
		nmendation	299
5.13	3 Recom	mendation for future research	304
DIDL IOC	A DUNA		000
BIBLIOGF	KAPHY		306



APPENDICES	343
BIODATA OF STUDENT	380

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
2.1	Developments in work and workplaces	30
2.2	Competencies: Learning objectives for youth apprenticeship	40
2.3	The principles and recommendations for effective/quality work experience	80
2.4	Enrolment of students in skill training institution in Malaysia:2000	114
2.5	Career opportunities in relation to skill level, organization type, and labour market structure	121
2.6	Generic skills schemes by country and over time	137
2.7	Workplace skills SCANS framework	138
2.8	An employability framework (with examples)	150
2.9	Summary of generic skills assessment models	178
3.1	Profile of participants of a supervised work experience by type of course and gender	188
3.2	Profile of non-participants of a supervised work experience by type of course and gender	188
3.3	Profile of vocational trainees	192
3.4	Profile of participants of work experience	192
3.5	Profile of non-participants of work experience	192

3.6	Reliability analysis report	199
3.7	Hypothesis and statistical analysis	205
4.1	Gender of vocational trainees	209
4.2	The mean age and standard deviation of vocational trainees	210
4.3	Fathers' occupations	211
4.4	Mothers' occupation	212
4.5	Vocational courses undertaken by vocational trainees	213
4.6	Reasons for enrolling into current vocational programmes	214
4.7	Reasons stated in the other category by vocational trainees participating in work experience for having enrolled into the current programmes	214
4.8	Frequency distribution of trainees with/without previous work experience	215
4.9	Career aspirations of vocational trainees	216
4.10	Type of school to work transition	217
4.11	Perception of participants on the work experience	218
4.12	Reasons for perceiving work experience positively	219
4.13	Reasons for perceiving work experience negatively	220
4.14	Self-concept scores of vocational trainees	221
4.15	Achievement motivation scores of vocational trainees	222
4.16	Acquisition of employability skills scores of vocational trainees	223
4.17	Acquisition of employability skills among vocational trainees participating and not participating in a supervised work experience	224
4.18	The mean scores for the elements of employability skills acquisition scores of vocational trainees	225



4.19	Comparison of means for the acquisition of employability skills between vocational trainees participating and not participating in a supervised work experience	229
4.20	Acquisition of employability skills by type of school-to-work transition	235
4.21	Acquisition of employability skills by gender	236
4.22	Acquisition of employability skills by age group	237
4.23	Acquisition of employability skills by previous work experience	238
4.24	The relationship between acquisition of employability skills and self-concept of vocational trainees	239
4.25	The relationship between acquisition of employability skills and achievement motivation of vocational trainees	240
4.26	Summary of relationships between acquisition of employability skills and extraneous independent variables	241
4.27	The relationship between type of school-to-work transition and gender of vocational trainees	243
4.28	The relationship between type of school-to-work transition and age of vocational trainees	244
4.29	The relationship between type of school-to-work transition and previous work experience	245
4.30	The relationship between type of school-to-work transition and self-concept scores	247
4.31	The relationship between type of school-to-work transition and achievement motivation scores	248
4.32	Summary of relationships between extraneous variables and type of school-to-work transition	249
4.33	Analysis of covariance summary table	252
4.34	Means of school to work transition groups for acquisition of employability skills	252



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure		Page
1	Barker and Kellen's career development model of developing employability and job readiness	47
2	Schematic diagram of multi-dimensional framework of blue-collar career (Thomas, 1993)	119
3	A model of factors related to acquisition of employability skills of vocational trainees	183

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ILO The International Labour Organization

MOE Ministry of Education

ICT Integrated Computer Technology

STWOA School to Work Opportunities Act

SCANS Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills

SPM Sijil Pelajaran Malaysia (Malaysia Certificate of Education)

MPT Maktab Perguruan Teknik

GPA Grade Point Average

LSWEP Learning through School Supervised Work Experience

Programme

JCI Job Characteristics Inventory

NEL National Educational Longitudinal Study

TIMSS Third International Mathematics and Science Study

MARA Majlis Amanah Rakyat (Council of the Indigenous Group)

NOSS National Occupational Skills Standard

NDTS National Dual Training System

VET Vocational Education and Training

ESP Employability Skills Profile

HRDC Human Resources Development of Canada

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Nature of the study

This study attempted to determine whether participation in a supervised work experience by vocational trainees was a stronger basis for the acquisition of a greater level of employability skills compared to vocational trainees that had not participated in such an experience. According to Wentling and Waight (2001), participation in supervised work experience, an aspect of work-based learning, not only provides students with a sense of career direction, but also sets the stage for subsequent workplace experiences. Students could enter potential workplaces with greater awareness hence adjusting to company's culture more readily. Through work experience, students come into contacts with real workplaces issues such as the application of various interpersonal skills in addressing workplace problems.

In a related case, designed to understand students' involvement in an apprenticeship scheme in Australia, Velde and Cooper (2000) discovered that students participated for exposure to greater career options when they were less inclined academically. The scheme provided them with hands-on