



UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

***EFFECTS OF TEXTUAL GLOSSES ON TEXT COMPREHENSION,
VOCABULARY GAIN AND VOCABULARY RETENTION AMONG
TERTIARY LEVEL PERSIAN-SPEAKING ESL LEARNERS***

FOROOGH AZARI

FBMK 2013 22



**EFFECTS OF TEXTUAL GLOSSES ON TEXT COMPREHENSION,
VOCABULARY GAIN AND VOCABULARY RETENTION AMONG
TERTIARY LEVEL PERSIAN-SPEAKING ESL LEARNERS**

By

FOROOGH AZARI

**Thesis Submitted to the School of Graduate Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia,
in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy**

June 2013

COPYRIGHT

All material contained within the thesis, including without limitation text, logos, icons, photographs and all other artwork, is copyright material of Universiti Putra Malaysia unless otherwise stated. Use may be made of any material contained within the thesis for non-commercial purposes from the copyright holder. Commercial use of material may only be made with the express, prior, written permission of Universiti Putra Malaysia.

Copyright©Universiti Putra Malaysia



DEDICATION

To my husband, for his understanding, support, and patience in this long journey, my lovely son, Danial, who has traveled to Malaysia for me and for some time has missed part of the parental care he deserves, and to my mother and sister for their continuous moral support.



Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfillment
of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

**EFFECTS OF TEXTUAL GLOSSES ON TEXT COMPREHENSION,
VOCABULARY GAIN AND VOCABULARY RETENTION AMONG
TERTIARY LEVEL PERSIAN-SPEAKING ESL LEARNERS**

By

FOROOGH AZARI

June 2013

Chair: Assoc. Prof. Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah, PhD

Faculty: Modern Languages and Communication

The present study investigated the effects of textual glosses on reading comprehension and vocabulary learning among tertiary level Persian-speaking ESL learners. In the present quasi-experimental research, 76 postgraduate ESL students at UPM who had attained similar scores in a standardized reading test were divided into four groups randomly before they attempted a pre-test and read six authentic texts under one of four conditions: L1 gloss, L2 gloss, L1 and L2 gloss, and no gloss. After reading each text, the students were asked to write recall protocols based on what they remembered about the text. After a period of five weeks, an immediate post-test as well as a (subsequent) delayed post-test were administered to assess students' vocabulary gain and vocabulary retention in terms of the 30 target words.

The results revealed that participants in the experimental (L1 gloss, L2 gloss, and L1 and L2 gloss) groups outperformed those in the control (no gloss) group in text comprehension, but the recall protocol scores obtained by the gloss groups were not significantly different statistically. Furthermore, the results revealed that the combination of L1 and L2 gloss was the most effective gloss condition in enhancing vocabulary gain and vocabulary retention, followed by L1 gloss, and L2 gloss. However, exploratory attempts to correlate reading motivation type with text comprehension, vocabulary gain, and vocabulary retention produced a mixed bag of positive and negative relationships between these variables of interest under certain gloss conditions, thereby indicating a need for further study.

In the qualitative phase of the study, the analysis of online interviews revealed that the majority of the participants in experimental and control groups preferred to read glossed texts to non-glossed texts. Most of the participants declared that they preferred not to refer to a dictionary since it was time-consuming, difficult, and boring and they could not enjoy reading when they had to regularly look up words in this way. The participants who read the glossed texts had a positive attitude toward the reading activity. The participants in the experimental groups also reported that they preferred to read L1 and L2 glossed texts, L1 glossed texts, and L2 glossed texts, in that order of preference. Furthermore, the majority of participants in the experimental groups indicated that they tended to continue reading outside the English class while the subjects in control group were not motivated to do so.

Overall, the results of the present study were deemed to provide further support to the findings of previous studies in the area of incidental vocabulary acquisition through reading in addition to providing some validation to Schmidt's (1990)

noticing hypothesis, Anderson's (1984) schema theory, and Paivio's (1991) dual coding hypothesis. The study therefore concluded that the provision of textual glosses does indeed enhance reading comprehension and acquisition of vocabulary knowledge of second language learners. Furthermore, the results of this study revealed that even relatively complex reading passages enhanced by the provision of L1 gloss, L2 gloss, or L1 and L2 gloss can be assigned to tertiary level ESL/EFL learners to help them become efficient readers and motivate them to continue reading independently outside their English class.



Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

**KESAN GLOS TEKS TERHADAP PEMAHAMAN PEMBACAAN,
PERTAMBAHAN KOSA KATA, SERTA INGATAN KOSA KATA DALAM
KALANGAN PELAJAR PENDUR FARSI BAHASA INGGERIS SEBAGAI
BAHASA KEDUA DI PERINGKAT TINGGI**

Oleh

FOROOGH AZARI

June 2013

Pengerusi: Profesor Madya Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah, PhD

Faculti: Bahasa dan Moden Komunikasi

Kajian ini menyelidiki kesan glos teks terhadap pemahaman pembacaan dan pembelajaran kosa kata dalam kalangan pelajar Bahasa Inggeris Sebagai Bahasa Asing (yakni, English as a Second Language, atau ESL) diperingkat pengajian tinggi. Dalam penyelidikan bercorak kuasi-eksperimen ini, seramai 76 pelajar pascasiswazah ESL di UPM yang telah mencapai skor yang sama dalam ujian bacaan dibahagi kepada empat kumpulan secara rawak sebelum mereka menduduki praujian dan seterusnya membaca enam teks asli di bawah salah satu daripada empat keadaan: glos L1 (bahasa pertama) , glos L2 (bahasa kedua), glos L1 dan L2, dan tanpa glos. Selepas membaca setiap teks tersebut, mereka diminta untuk menulis protokol ingat kembali berdasarkan teks bacaan tadi. Selepas lima minggu, pelajar diberikan pula pascaujian serta merta dan (seterusnya) pascaujian terlewat untuk menilai

pertambahan kosa kata serta ingatan kosa kata pelajar daripada segi 30 perkataan sasaran.

Hasil kajian menunjukkan bahawa peserta dalam kumpulan eksperimen (glos L1, glos L2, dan glos L1 dan L2) mengatasi prestasi pelajar dalam kumpulan kawalan (tanpa glos) dalam pemahaman teks, tetapi skor protocol ingat kembali yang diperolehi oleh kumpulan-kumpulan glos tidak menunjukkan perbezaan signifikan secara statistik. Tambahan pula, keputusan menunjukkan bahawa gabungan glos L1 dan L2 merupakan keadaan glos yang paling berkesan dalam meningkatkan pemerolehan dan pengekalan kosa kata, diikuti oleh glos L1, dan glos L2. Namun begitu, usaha tinjauan untuk menghubungkaitkan jenis motivasi membaca dengan kefahaman pembacaan, pemerolehan kosa kata, serta ingatan kosa kata menghasilkan korelasi positif dan negative yang bercampuraduk antara pemboleh ubah berkenaan di bawah keadaan glos yang tertentu, dan seterusnya menunjukkan bahawa aspek ini perlu dikaji dengan lebih lanjut.

Dalam fasa kualitatif kajian ini, analisis transkrip temubual secara atas talian jelas menunjukkan bahawa majoriti peserta dalam kumpulan eksperimen dan kumpulan kawalan lebih suka untuk membaca teks yang mengandungi glos daripada teks tanpa glos. Kebanyakan peserta menyatakan bahawa mereka lebih suka untuk tidak merujuk kepada kamus kerana ia memakan masa, sukar dan membosankan di samping mereka tidak dapat memahami pembacaan kerana terpaksa mencari makna perkataan. Peserta yang membaca glos teks didapati mempunyai sikap yang positif terhadap aktiviti membaca. Peserta-peserta dalam kumpulan eksperimen juga menyatakan bahawa mereka lebih suka membaca teks dengan glos L1 dan L2, glos L1, dan glos L2, mengikut keutamaan seperti ini. Tambahan pula, majoriti peserta

dalam kumpulan eksperimen menunjukkan bahawa mereka cenderung untuk terus membaca di luar kelas bahasa Inggeris mereka manakala subjek dalam kumpulan kawalan tidak mendorong mereka untuk berbuat demikian.

Secara keseluruhan, hasil kajian ini dianggap menyokong lagi dapatan-dapatan kajian sebelum ini dalam bidang pemerolehan kosa kata secara sampingan melalui pembacaan dan juga memberi sedikit sebanyak validasi terhadap hipotesis *noticing* Schmidt (1990), teori skema Anderson (1984), dan hipotesis dwikod Paivio (1991). Oleh yang demikian, kajian ini memutuskan bahawa penyediaan glos pada teks bacaan memang meningkatkan kefahaman membaca serta pemerolehan pengetahuan kosa kata pelajar bahasa kedua. Tambahan, hasil kajian juga mendedahkan bahawa teks bacaan yang agak kompleks tetapi ditingkatkan dengan glos L1 dan L2, glos L1, dan los L2 boleh ditugaskan kepada pelajar ESL/EFL di peringkat tinggi untuk membantu mereka menjadi pembaca yang cekap serta memberi motivasi untuk terus membaca secara bebas di luar kelas bahasa Inggeris mereka.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

At the end of this rewarding process of preparing my dissertation, it is my responsibility to duly appreciate those people who helped me reach my goal. First and foremost, I am indebted to the members of my supervisory committee. I am extremely thankful to my supervisor, Associate Professor Dr. Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah who supported me with all inspiration and encouraged me to produce this academic dissertation. Dr. Faiz always provided me with enlightening comments and constructive advice. I would also like to appreciate Professor Dr. Chan Swee Heng and Associate Proferssor Dr. Tan Bee Hoon whose expertise and support motivated me to advance in this long process. Furthermore, Dr. Vijay Kumar, the coordinator of TEP classes helped me a lot in data collection procedure. My deepest appreciation for him and friendly TEP lecturers is beyond words.

I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 4th June 2013 to conduct the final examination of Foroogh Azari on her thesis entitled “Effects of Textual Glosses on Text Comprehension, Vocabulary Gain and Vocabulary Retention Among Tertiary Level Persian-Speaking ESL Learners” in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U. (A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Member of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Wan Roselezam Binti Wan Yahya, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Chairman)

Ain Nadzimah Abdullah, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Rosli Talif, PhD

Associate Professor
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
(Internal Examiner)

Tahereh Sima Paribakht, PhD

Professor
Faculty of Arts Official Languages and Bilingualism Institute
University of Ottawa
Canada
(External Examiner)

BUJANG KIM HUAT, PhD

Professor and Dean
School of Graduate Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Mohd Faiz Sathivellu Abdullah, PhD

Associate Professor

Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication

Universiti Putra Malaysia

(Chairman)

Chan Swee Heng, PhD

Professor

Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication

Universiti Putra Malaysia

(Member)

Tan Bee Hoon, PhD

Associate Professor

Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication

Universiti Putra Malaysia

(Member)

BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD

Professor and Dean

School of Graduate Studies

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declared that it has not been previously, and is not concurrently, submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or at any other institution.



FOROOGH AZARI

Date: 4 June 2013

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DEDICATION	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
ABSTRAK	vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	x
APPROVAL	xi
DECLARATION	xiii
LIST OF TABLES	xvii
LIST OF FIGURES	xx
LIST OF APPENDICES	xxi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xxii
CHAPTER	
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem	3
1.3 Purpose and Scope of the Study	7
1.4 Research Questions	8
1.5 Research Hypotheses	12
1.6 Theoretical Framework	14
1.7 Conceptual Framework	22
1.8 Definition of Key Terms	25
1.9 Limitations of the Study	28
1.10 Significance of the Study	29
2 LITERATURE REVIEW	33
2.1 Introduction	33
2.2 Malaysia as an ESL Setting	33
2.3 Models of the EFL/ESL Reading Process	34
2.4 Psycholinguistic Effects of Bilingualized Representation of Word Definitions and Meaning	37
2.5 Different Ways of Vocabulary Learning	40
2.6 Problems of EFL Learners in Vocabulary Learning	48
2.7 Text Glosses in Reading	49
2.7.1 Glossing and Text Enhancement	49
2.7.2 Rationale for Using Glosses in Reading Texts	51
2.7.3 Advantages and Benefits of Glossing	53
2.7.4 Different Types of Glossing	54
2.7.5 Roby's Taxonomy of Glosses	56
2.7.6 Effects of Glossing on Text Comprehension	58
2.7.7 Effects of Glossing on Vocabulary Learning	79

2.8	.Second Language Reading, Motivation, and Attitude	96
2.8.1	Second Language Learner's Motivation Types	97
2.8.2	Previous Studies on ESL/EFL Learners' Reading Motivation, Attitudes, and Preferences	99
3	METHODOLOGY	105
3.1	Research Approach and Design	105
3.1.1	Experimental Design	105
3.1.2	Variables of the Study	106
3.2	Participants of the Study	108
3.3	Informed Consent Form	111
3.4	Research Questions	111
3.5	Materials	112
3.5.1	Selection of Reading	112
3.5.2	Text Readability Scores	116
3.5.3	Selection of Target Words	119
3.5.4	Reading Glosses	122
3.6	Measurement Instruments	123
3.6.1	Reading Test	123
3.6.2	Vocabulary Pre-Test	128
3.6.3	Immediate Post-Test	130
3.6.4	Delayed Post-Test	131
3.6.5	Recall Protocols	132
3.6.6	Background Questionnaire	134
3.6.7	Post-Reading Questionnaire	137
3.6.8	Exit Questionnaire	138
3.6.9	Post-Reading and Exit Questionnaire for the Control Group	139
3.6.10	Interviews	140
3.7	Rationale and Treatment	145
3.8	Data Collection	147
3.9	Data Analysis	150
3.10	Reliability and Validity	152
3.11	Pilot Study	154
4	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	157
4.1	Introduction	157
4.2	Participants' Demographic Information	157
4.3	Quantitative Phase of Study	162
4.3.1	Performance Differences in Text Comprehension	164
4.3.2	Performance Differences in Vocabulary Gain	172
4.3.3	Performance Differences in Vocabulary Retention	182
4.3.4	Performance Differences across Motivation Types in Text	193
4.4	Synoptic Discussion on Quantitative Results	205
4.4.1	Effect of Textual Glosses on Text Comprehension	206
4.4.2	Effect of Textual Glosses on Vocabulary Gain	208
4.4.3	Effect of Textual Glosses on Vocabulary Retention	210
4.4.4	Relationship between Motivation Type and Performance	211

4.5	Qualitative Phase of Study	212
4.6	Synoptic Discussion on Qualitative Results	224
5	CONCLUSION	227
5.1	Summary of the Project	227
5.2	Major Findings	229
5.3	Implications of the Study	234
5.4	Recommendations for Further Studies	236
	REFERENCES	238
	APPENDICES	257
	BIODATA OF STUDENT	358
	LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	359

