

UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

ALIGNMENT CHECKPOINTS MODEL FOR EVALUATING STRATEGIC INFORMATION SYSTEMS PLANNING IN A FINANCIAL ORGANIZATION IN MALAYSIA

AZMAN ADNAN

FSKTM 2011 10

ALIGNMENT CHECKPOINTS MODEL FOR EVALUATING STRATEGIC INFORMATION SYSTEMS PLANNING IN A FINANCIAL ORGANIZATION IN MALAYSIA



AZMAN ADNAN

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY UNIVERSITI PUTRA MALAYSIA

2011

DEDICATION

The achievement that ensues from this thesis is dedicated to my late grandmother who had left us in 1998 and had been my guardian since the day I was born into this world. She is ultimately my idol of a very determined person in seeking success in life. Since I was in Kindergarten, she had wanted me to complete school up to the highest level of degree that any educational institution could offer i.e. the Ph.D.

From the morale support that she had given me through the years, I have acquired my Diploma in 1981, Bachelor's Degree in 1985, Master's Degree in 2000 and finally this achievement.

I have finally reached the level of education that she had coveted me to achieve but unfortunately, she is not here to witness the achievement.....

May God bless her soul....

"Innovative technological ideas to increase productivity internally and gain competitive advantage externally"

Abstract of thesis presented to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia in fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

ALIGNMENT CHECKPOINTS MODEL FOR EVALUATING STRATEGIC INFORMATION SYSTEMS PLANNING IN A FINANCIAL ORGANIZATION IN MALAYSIA

By

AZMAN BIN ADNAN

September 2011

Chairman: Professor Abdul Azim Bin Abd Ghani, PhD

Faculty: Computer Science and Information Technology

Since the past few decades, business organizations have leveraged on the improving technology to achieve their corporate goal for higher profitability by maximizing the utilization of Information Technology (IT). Eventually, numerous models and frameworks of strategic alignment (SA) between the IT and Business strategies have been proposed by many researchers that had resulted in various opinions and arguments about the complexity of the situation due to certain factors involved and such predicament is known as the IT Productivity Paradox.

Based on these arguments, this research has created a new model that functions as an instrument to evaluate the SA between the strategies. The concentration of this study is within the IT and Business strategies, evaluating the attributes involved at each process level to reach the state of SA. These attributes are derived from six selected renowned SA models i.e. the MIT90s (Morton, 1991), Strategic Alignment Model - SAM (Henderson

& Venkatraman, 1993), The Alignment Model (Maes et. al., 2000), Co-variation Model of Strategic Alignment (Bergeron et. al., 2002), Organizational Systems Integration (OSI) model (Pollalis, 2003) and Dimensions of Strategic Alignment Model (Tallon & Kraemer, 2003) which were compared and evaluated to form the proposed model of this research known as the Alignment Checkpoints Model or ACM. What differs the ACM from other models is that the main strategy of a particular domain is further divided into sub-strategies known as the Component Strategy (CS). Subsequently, each and every process level involved in the CS will be evaluated at ground-level to detect compliance and discrepancies to achieve the objective of the main strategy.

Unlike the research that requires statistical information about the users' satisfaction on a particular application software that is being implemented that may lead to factors of biasness, the expectation of this research is an actual success in IT implementations and support towards the Business strategy. Fundamentally, through a test conducted at a selected financial institution, the ACM aims and has succeeded at checking the process levels of IT support and implementations in the Systems Development Life Cycle (SDLC) process guided by the Strategic Information Systems Planning (SISP) that materializes the Business plans and objectives.

Other value-added features of the ACM are its ability to also identify the compliance and discrepancies between other domains as well. With such holistic evaluation over all processes involved at every CS of a main strategy in an organization will result in

equilibrium among these processes involved. Therefore, this allows for continuing research to those with interest in evaluating the alignment of other areas of concern.

In this study, it has been found that well-aligned strategies of the IT and Business domains complemented by the SISP had resulted in a tremendous improvement and progress at organizational level. Therefore, the ACM is proven to be a very useful tool that may be used by other business organizations to ensure that every sector or domain in the organization is supporting each other to achieve a common goal. Abstrak tesis yang dikemukakan kepada Senat Universiti Putra Malaysia sebagai memenuhi keperluan untuk ijazah Doktor Falsafah

MODEL TITIK-SEMAKAN PENJAJARAN UNTUK MENILAI PERANCANGAN STRATEGIK SISTEM MAKLUMAT DALAM SESEBUAH ORGANISASI KEWANGAN DI MALAYSIA

Oleh

AZMAN BIN ADNAN

September 2011

Pengerusi: Profesor Abdul Azim Bin Abd Ghani, PhD

Fakulti: Sains Komputer dan Teknologi Maklumat

Sejak beberapa dekad yang lalu, organisasi perniagaan telah menggunakan kesempatan ke atas teknologi yang semakin canggih untuk mencapai matlamat korporat mereka iaitu peningkatan dari segi keuntungan. Justeru itu, banyak model dan rangka penyelidikan tentang penjajaran strategik (PS) diantara strategi Teknologi Maklumat (TM) dan Perniagaan telah dicadangakn oleh para penyelidik ini yang telah menghasilkan pelbagai pendapat dan alasan mengenai kerumitan situasi yang dihadapi akibat dari beberapa faktor tertentu yang terlibat dan keadaan ini dikenali sebagai Paradoks Daya Pengeluaran TM.

Berdasarkan pandangan para penyelidik ini, penyelidikan ini telah mencipta suatu model baru yang dapat berfungsi sebagai satu alat untuk menilai PS. Walau bagaimanapun, tumpuan kajian ini adalah terhadap strategi TM dan Perniagaan, serta menilai atributatribut atau sifat-sifat yang berkaitan bagi mencapai keadaan penjajaran yang diharapkan. Atribut-atribut ini telah diperolehi dari enam model penjajaran strategik yang terkenal yang telah dipilih iaitu; "MIT90s" (Scott Morton, 1991), "Strategic Alignment Model" (Henderson & Venkatraman, 1993), "The Alignment Model" (Maes et. al, 2000), "Covariation Model of Strategic Alignment" (Bergeron et. al., 2002), "Organizational Systems Integration (OSI) model" (Pollalis, 2003) dan "Dimensions of Strategic Alignment Model" (Tallon & Kraemer, 2003) yang telah dibandingkan dan dinilai untuk membentuk model yang telah dicadangkan di dalam penyelidikan ini yang dikenali sebagai "Alignment Checkpoints Model" atau ACM. Apa yang membezakan ACM dengan model yang lain adalah strategi utama sesuatu bidang seterusnya dibahagikan lagi dan dikenali sebagai strategi komponen (SK). Seterusnya, setiap process yang terlibat di dalam usaha untuk matlamat strategi utama.

Berbeza dengan penyelidikan yang ingin mendapatkan maklumat statistik tentang tahap penerimaan pengguna terhadap sesuatu perisian aplikasi yang sedang dilancarkan dan berkemungkinan menjurus kepada faktor berat sebelah, harapan dari penyelidikan ini adalah kejayaan yang nyata hasil dari sokongan dan perlaksanaan TM terhadap strategi Perniagaan. Berdasarkan suatu ujian yang telah dilaksanakan di sebuah institusi kewangan, ACM mensasarkan dan telah berjaya untuk menyemak peringkat-peringkat sokongan dan perlaksanaan TM di dalam proses Kitaran Hayat Pembangunan Sistem (KHPS) yang berpandukan Perancangan Strategik Sistem Maklumat (PSSM) supaya objektif dan perancangan Perniagaan menjadi suatu kenyataan.

Ciri-ciri lain ACM yang membawa nilai adalah keupayaannya untuk mengesan pematuhan dan kepincangan di dalam sokongan dan perlaksanaan di antara bidang yang lain. Melalui penilaian yang menyeluruh terhadap setiap peringkat SK yang menyokong strategi utama di dalam sesebuah organisasi akan menghasilkan suatu situasi yang seimbang diantara setiap proses yang terlibat. Oleh itu, ini memberi laluan dari segi kesinambungan penyelidikan bagi para penyeledik yang ingin menilai penjajaran strategik dalam bidang yang menarik minat mereka.

Kajian ini telah mendapati bahawa penjajaran yang sempurna diantara strategi TM dan Perniagaan yang dilengkapkan dengan PSSM telah menghasilkan kemajuan yang sangat baik diperingkat organisasi. Oleh itu, ACM telah terbukti sebagai suatu alat yang memberi manfaat yang boleh digunakan oleh organisasi perniagaan lain dalam memastikan bahawa setiap sektor atau bidang di dalam organisasi berkenaan menyokong di antara satu sama lain bagi mencapai matlamat yang sama.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My utmost appreciation to Prof. Dr. Abdul Azim Abd Ghani as the Chairman of the Supervisory Committee who has given me the courage, guidance and morale support to complete this study. Assoc. Prof. Hj. Hasan Selamat, who has advised and guided me all the way through the study and completion of the thesis and last but not least, Prof. Dr. Mokhtar Mohd. Yusof, a very committed person who has also given me the support and guidance throughout the duration of this research. These are the gentlemen who have understood what I have gone through, reasons for the delay and the tough times that I had to go through in pursuing this Ph.D. Only God can repay their deeds.

Dedications to my late mother Fatimah Mohd Jaman, who left us in September 2009 and has given me all the support that I need, my late father Adnan Hj. Omar, who left us in 2005 and has always wanted me to achieve the highest level of education. Not forgetting, my aunty Izar Mohd Jaman, who has been my guardian since childhood and played the role of a mother, supporter, motivator, mentor and everything that one would need to succeed in life. Subsequently, my uncle Dzulkifli Mohd Jaman and my aunties, Zainon Mohd Jaman and Zaida Mohd Jaman who have been my guardian and providing me with the morale support that I needed, throughout the years.

Eventually, my appreciation to the beloved ones, my wife, Laili Norihan Abas and my children, Muhammad Syukri Azman, Muhammad Fiqri Azman and Sarah Hazraty Azman who have not only given me all the support that I need, but also the courage to complete the study and eventually earn myself...a Ph.D.

I certify that a Thesis Examination Committee has met on 5th. September 2011 to conduct the final examination of Azman Bin Adnan on his thesis entitled "Alignment Checkpoints Model for Evaluating Strategic Information Systems Planning in a Financial Organization in Malaysia" in accordance with the Universities and University Colleges Act 1971 and the Constitution of the Universiti Putra Malaysia [P.U.(A) 106] 15 March 1998. The Committee recommends that the student be awarded the Doctor of Philosophy.

Members of the Thesis Examination Committee were as follows:

Hamidah Binti Ibrahim, PhD

Associate Professor Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology Universiti Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

Rodziah Binti Atan, PhD

Associate Professor Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology Universiti Putra Malaysia (Internal Examiner)

Rusli Bin Abdullah, PhD

Associate Professor Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology Universiti Putra Malaysia (Internal Examiner)

Christian Wagner, PhD

Professor Information Systems Department City University of Hong Kong Hong Kong (External Examiner)

SEOW HENG FONG, PhD

Professor and Deputy Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

This thesis was submitted to the Senate of Universiti Putra Malaysia and has been accepted as fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. The members of the Supervisory Committee were as follows:

Abdul Azim Abd Ghani, PhD

Professor Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology Universiti Putra Malaysia (Chairman)

Mohd Hasan Selamat

Associate Professor Faculty of Computer Science and Information Technology Universiti Putra Malaysia (Member)

Mokhtar Mohd Yusof, PhD

Professor MAMPU Prime Minister's Department The Malaysian Government (Member)

BUJANG BIN KIM HUAT, PhD

Professor and Dean School of Graduate Studies Universiti Putra Malaysia

Date:

DECLARATION

I declare that the thesis is my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously and is not concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Putra Malaysia or other institutions.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

			Page
DI	EDICA	ATION	ii
A	BSTRA	АСТ	iii
Al	BSTRA	AK	vi
A	CKNO	WLEDGEMENTS	ix
A	PPRO	VAL	x
DI	ECLAI	RATION	xii
LI	ST OF	TABLES	xviii
LI	ST OF	FIGURES	xix
LI	ST OF	ABBREVIATIONS	xxiv
CI	HAPTI	ER	
1	INT	RODUCTION	
1	10	Introduction	1
	1.0	Strategic Alignment	1
	1.2	The Impact of Alignment between the IT and Business Strategies	3
		1.2.1 Performance metrics based on the organizational input.	3
		output and revenue	
		1.2.2 Influence of the decision-making process	4
		1.2.3 The influential role of the IT champions	5
		1.2.4 The IT investments and the process-level of IT support on	6
		business activities	
		1.2.5 Management of the change process	7
		1.2.6 Co-alignment through integration strategies	8
	1.3	Facts about the Existence of Misalignment and the Influencing	10
		Factors	
	1.4	The Problem with the Existing Models	12
		1.4.1 The statement of the problem	12
	1.5	The Objectives of the Research	15
	1.6	The Research Expectation	17
	1.7	The Assumptions	18
	1.8	The Delimitations	19
		1.8.1 The scope of the study	19
		1.8.2 An instrument to evaluation Strategic Alignment	21
	1.9	Organization of the Thesis	22

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

	2.0	Introduction	26
	2.1	Strategic Alignment between the IT and Business Strategies	26
		2.1.1 IT as a 'support tool' towards the business objectives	27
		2.1.2 Influence of the 'internal' and 'external' factors	28
		2.1.3 In-depth participation of IT for better impact in business	29
		performance	
		2.1.4 IT for competitive advantage	30
		2.1.5 Management characteristics towards environmental	31
		change	
	2.2	Models of Strategic Alignment	32
		2.2.1 The MIT90s model (Scott Morton, 1991)	32
		2.2.2 The Strategic Alignment Model (Henderson and	34
		Venkatraman, 1999)	
		2.2.3 The Alignment Model (Maes et. Al, 2000)	34
		2.2.4 The Co-variation Model of Strategic Alignment (Bergeron	35
		et. al, 2002)	
		2.2.5 The OSI Model (Y. A. Pollalis, 2003)	37
		2.2.6 The Dimensions of Strategic Alignment Model (Tallon &	38
		Kraemer, 2003)	
	2.3	The Comparison between Models of Strategic Alignment	40
		2.3.1 The tabular comparison of the common attributes	40
		2.3.2 Conclusion of the tabular comparison between the models	42
	2.4	Misalignment between the IT and Business Strategies	47
		2.4.1 Co-existence of the automation and manual operations	48
		2.4.2 Work-process redundancy	49
		2.4.3 The user acceptance	49
		2.4.4 The Human-Computer Interaction (HCI)	50
		2.4.5 Issue of IT investment and the impact on productivity	50
		2.4.6 Return on investment through the automation	51
	2.5	IT Paradox versus Reality	51
	2.6	Conclusion	53
	2.7	Chapter Summary	53
3	RESI	EARCH METHODOLOGY	
	3.0	Introduction	57
	3.1	The Research Objectives	58
	3.2	The Research Propositions	58
		3.2.1 Research proposition 1	59
		3.2.2 Research proposition 2	59
		3.2.3 Research proposition 3	60
		3.2.4 Research proposition 4	61
	3.3	The Strategic Alignment Models	61
		3.3.1 The Strategic Information Systems Planning (SISP)	61
		3.3.2 The attributes concerned	62
		3.3.3 The attributes selected	63

		3.3.4 The concept	64
	3.4	Selection of the Site	64
	3.5	The Research Approach	65
	3.6	Testing of the Proposed New Model	66
	3.7	The Ethnographic Study Adapted	67
	3.8	The Data Analysis	72
	3.9	Chapter Summary	73
4	EXP SELI	LORATORY STUDY ON STRATEGIC ALIGNMENT IN A ECTED LOCAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTION	
	4.0	Introduction	75
	4.1	An Exploratory Study	76
	4.2	A Brief History of the Selected Organization	77
	4.3	Background of the Bank's IT Infrastructure	79
		4.3.1 History of the automation process	79
		4.3.2 Implementation of the SISP	79
	4.4	The Objectives of the Bank's SISP	80
	4.5	The Vision and Mission of the Bank's IT Organization	80
		4.5.1 The Vision	80
		4.5.2 The Mission	81
	4.6	The Bank's IT Infrastructure	81
		4.6.1 The manpower	81
		4.6.2 The IT infrastructure topology	81
		4.6.3 The hardware and operating system (OS)	83
		4.6.4 The Database	84
		4.6.5 The Wide Area Network (WAN)	84
		4.6.6 The Main Software Applications	85
	4.7	Technology Trend Surveys and the Bank's IT Infrastructure	87
		4.7.1 Desktop and Mobile Devices	87
		4.7.2 The Operating Systems (OS)	88
		4.7.3 The Host Machine	88
		4.7.4 The Database	89
		4.7.5 The Network Systems	89
		4.7.6 The Application Software	90
		4.7.7 The IT infrastructure management	90
		4.7.8 The comparison on IT development of the banks in	91
	1.0	Malaysia Starte die Information Spateme Planning (SISP)	02
	4.8	Strategic information Systems Planning (SISP)	92
		4.8.1 The Applications Strategy	92
		4.8.2 The Data Strategy	99
		4.0.5 rechnology Strategy	101
		4.0.4 The IT Project Management Strategy	114
	4.0	4.8.5 The II Organization Strategy	115
	4.9 4 10	Chapter Summers	118
	4.10	Chapter Summary	120

5	THE	DEVELOPMENT OF A NEW MODEL	
	5.0	Introduction	122
	5.1	The Construction and Development of a New Model	122
		5.1.1 The Origination of a New Model (from the attributes of	122
		the selected earlier renowned models)	
		5.1.2 Elaboration of the model components	124
	5.2	The benefits of the proposed New Model	134
	5.3	The checkpoints in the ACM	135
	5.4	The scope of study within the ACM	135
	5.5	Matching the IT and Business strategies with the ACM	135
	5.6	Analysis of the strength and strategies of the IT domain	137
	5.7	The research approach within the ACM	138
	5.8	Chapter Summary	143
6	RES	ULTS, ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION	
	6.0	Introduction	144
	6.1	Results of Analysis on the Selected Organization	145
	6.2	Results and Discussion of the Findings	145
	6.3	The Selected Organization's Investment on Technological	146
		Infrastructure	
	6.4	The Bank's IT Strategy and the Alignment with the Business	153
		Strategy	
	6.5	The IT Strategy and Its Component Strategies	154
	6.6	Analysis of the IT Component Strategies	161
		6.6.1 The Applications Software Strategy	161
		6.6.2 The Data and Database Strategy	182
		6.6.3 The Hardware Strategy	184
		6.6.4 The OS Strategy	186
		6.6.5 The Network Strategy	187
		6.6.6 The IT Security Strategy	189
	6.7	The Achievements and Awards as Evidence of Strategic	197
		Alignment between the IT and Business Strategies in the Bank	
	6.8	The Benefits of the Alignment Checkpoints Model (ACM)	203
	6.9	The Answers to the Research Propositions	207
	6.10	Discrepancies and Issues Detected in the IT Support Process	213
	6.11	Chapter Summary	221
_			
		EMERGING FACTORS	222
	/.1	Introduction	223
	/.1	The Need for Sub-Strategies within the Main Strategy	223
		7.1.2 The Detahase Strategy	224
		7.1.2 The Database Strategy	226
		7.1.4 The Organization Stategy	226
		7.1.4 The Operating System (OS) Strategy	227
		1.1.5 The Network Strategy	227

7.1.6 The IT Security Strategy228

7.2	The Emerging Factors as a Result of the Development and	229
	Construction of the Proposed New Model – ACM	
7.3	Chapter Summary	230

8 CONCLUSION

REFERENCES

APPENDICES

C

BIODATA OF STUDENT

8.0	Introduction	233
8.1	The Alignment Checkpoints Model (ACM)	235
8.2	The Strategic Information Systems Planning (SISP)	236
8.3	The IT Strategy and Its Sub-Strategies that Support the Business	237
	Strategy and Requirements	
8.4	Conclusion	238

239

251

289